

The Power of the Space Club

Deganit Paikowsky



Why do nation-states choose to develop national space programs? How can they justify national efforts to acquire capabilities by arguing for membership of the space club? This book presents a unique and insightful perspective on the factors that drive states to indigenously develop world-class space technology in the past, present, and future of space exploration and technological development in world politics. Based on a rich and detailed analysis of a range of space programs in states that are not usually at the focus of world politics and its research, the author shows that joining the space club is a legitimate and rational decision. A country that sees itself as a power deserving of a seat at the table of world governance is expected to race for space. The book provides a different way of looking at international relations through a relatively understudied area of policy – the space club.

“Advanced space capabilities provide a nation state with both tangible and symbolic geopolitical, strategic, and security benefits. By using the concept of a ‘space club’ as a way to analyze a state’s decision to acquire those capabilities and competition and cooperation among space faring countries, Degani Paikowsky provides fresh insights and a productive way of understanding global space activity.”

John Logsdon, *Professor Emeritus, George Washington University and Founder of GW’s Space Policy Institute.*

“A fresh look at the international politics of space activity with well-researched case studies. Paikowky’s book is a valuable addition to the field.”

James Clay Moltz, *Naval Postgraduate School*

Cover image: An artist’s depiction of a probe investigating a heavily cratered moon in deep space © Marc Ward/Stocktrek Images

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS
www.cambridge.org

ISBN 978-1-107-19449-6



Paikowsky

The Power of the Space Club

CAMBRIDGE

The Power of the Space Club

Deganit Paikowsky

Tel Aviv University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107194496

DOI: 10.1017/9781108159883

© Deganit Paikowsky 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19449-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

The Power of the Space Club

Why do nation-states choose to develop national space programs? How can they justify national efforts to acquire capabilities by arguing for membership of the space club? This book presents a unique and insightful perspective on the factors that drive states to indigenously develop world-class space technology in the past, present, and future of space exploration and technological development in world politics. Based on a rich and detailed analysis of a range of space programs in states that are not usually at the focus of world politics and its research, the author shows that joining the space club is a legitimate and rational decision. A country that sees itself as a power deserving of a seat at the table of world governance is expected to race for space. This book provides a different way of looking at international relations through a relatively understudied area of policy – the space club.

Deganit Paikowsky holds a Ph.D. in political science from Tel Aviv University. She is a senior researcher at the Yuval Neeman Workshop for Science, Technology and Security at Tel Aviv University as well as a non-resident scholar at the George Washington University Space Policy Institute.

To my grandparents, Holocaust survivors who rebuilt their lives in Israel and were a source of inspiration for their will to overcome, live, and do, precisely because it is hard; and to my sons, the shining stars of my life.

I sent the club a wire stating, PLEASE ACCEPT MY RESIGNATION.
I DON'T WANT TO BELONG TO ANY CLUB THAT WILL
ACCEPT ME AS A MEMBER.

Groucho Marx, 1959

Acknowledgments

My greatest debt in writing this book is to Isaac Ben Israel and Yossi Shain, who patiently guided me through the “waters” of conducting this research. Their invaluable help, dedication, and support got me through this and made it as enjoyable and painless as possible.

I am very grateful to the Space Policy Institute at George Washington University, to the History of Space Department at the National Air and Space Museum of the Smithsonian Institution, and to their staff members for their generous hospitality and cooperation. The time I spent in each of them, at different stages of my research, provided a stimulating environment and invaluable friendships. John Logsdon has been an endless source of knowledge and support, providing useful and thoughtful feedback. Scott Pace, Michael Neufeld, David DeVorkin, Valerie Neal, and Monique Laney were always good partners for discussion and consultation. Special thanks to Roger Launius for playing devil’s advocate; no doubt, this allowed me to provide a better product. I am also grateful to the heads of the Leonard Davis Institute of International Relations at the Hebrew University, Dan Miodownik and Piki Ish-Shalom, for awarding me a fellowship and for their friendship. The time I spent there was utilized to expand, refine, and finalize the manuscript. I also want to express my gratitude to Israel’s Ministry of Science and Technology for its support for my research in its early stages, through the Eshkol Doctoral Scholarship.

The NASA Headquarters History Office as well as the NASA Library and their dedicated staffs opened their doors and allowed me to search through invaluable, seemingly endless collections. Jane Odom, Richard Spencer, Colin Fries, and John Hargenrader enthusiastically shared their knowledge in locating documents and records.

In Israel, Chaim Eshed and his dedicated staff at the Israeli Ministry of Defense made innumerable efforts to assist in any possible way. Zvi Kaplan and his staff at the Israel Space Agency provided access to records and collections. Israel Aerospace Industries Ltd. allowed me to search for treasures in their archives.

My colleagues and friends deserve my gratitude and appreciation for their thoughtful comments, attention, and encouragement, especially Ethel Solingen, who was a source of inspiration as well as a role model; Azar Gat and Stephen Biddle for their good advice and encouragement, ensuring that I didn't give up; Glen Asner, who was always eager to assist in any possible way; Peter Hays for his thoughtful comments and attention; Dima Adamsky, Daniel Barok, Ofer Lapid, Keren Shachar, Deane Peter-Baker, Daniel Levine, Ehud Eiran, Cameron Brown, Elisabetta Brighi, Sergio Catignani, Shain Smith, Brett Biddington, Emanuel Adler, Barry Posen, Ariel (Eli) Levite, Galia Peres Bar-Nathan, Patrick Jackson, Larry Martinez, Yael Shomer, Or Honig, Gil Baram, and Ram Levi. All the interviewees and interlocutors, who patiently answered my questions, deserve my gratefulness. I am also deeply appreciative to Marsha Brown who did so much more than copyediting.

This is also an opportunity to sincerely thank those who helped along the way: The Yuval Neeman Workshop for Science, Technology and Security at Tel Aviv University for being a professional home for so many years; the Goldberg Family for their generosity in bringing me to Canada; Sheldon Lerman, whose knowledge and curiosity were of great help; Guy Ben Ari and Ayala Peled for providing me a home away from home; and the Piver family for their love and attention while I was in D.C.

I am deeply grateful to the editor John Haslam and to the staff of Cambridge University Press for their interest and faith in this project, as well as their guidance at all stages of the work. I appreciate the anonymous reviewers, whose thoughtful and considerate comments and suggestions were very helpful.

Finally, this mission would not have come to a happy end without the love and endless support of my family. My parents, Zeev and Yael Paikowsky, who taught me the value of knowledge, encouraged me to excel, and did everything in their power to allow me the needed time to write; my brother Nir, who was a source of encouragement; and Shuly and Eitan Haberman, with whom I had endless talks.

Finally, all of those mentioned here deserve my appreciation and gratitude, but above all, I owe the most to Uri, who was a constant source of advice, emotional support, and motivation. Without you, this would never have come to an end.

Deganit
Tel Aviv, 2017

Contents

	<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
	<i>List of tables</i>	ix
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
1	Introduction	1
2	Nation-State Clubs in World Politics	28
3	The Evolution of the Space Club	48
4	A Multilateral Race for Space Club Membership	74
5	France and Britain	92
6	Canada and Australia	115
7	India and Israel	145
8	The Space Club in the Post–Cold War Era	178
9	Conclusions and Future Directions	210
	<i>Bibliography</i>	230
	<i>Index</i>	248

Figures

1.1. The Space Club Pyramid in the Cold War	<i>page</i> 23
1.2. The Space Club Pyramid in the Post–Cold War Period	24
1.3. A Potential Future Structure of the Space Club Pyramid	24
2.1. The Life Cycle of Clubs	41

Tables

1.1 Nuclear Programs and Space Programs	<i>page</i> 12
2.1 Types of Clubs and Their Characteristics	35
2.2 Comparison of International Regimes, Security Communities, and Nation-State Clubs	39
3.1 US Investment of Resources in Military and Civilian Activity in Space, 1959–1969	62
5.1 Comparison of France and Great Britain, Selected Parameters	93
6.1 Comparison of Canada and Australia, Selected Parameters	116
7.1 Comparison of India and Israel, Selected Parameters	146

1 Introduction

The exploration of space will go ahead, whether we join in it or not, and it is one of the great adventures of all time, and no nation which expects to be the leader of other nations can expect to stay behind in the race for space.

John F. Kennedy, September 12, 1962

In different eras in history, certain qualities or areas of expertise are identified as indicators of power and symbols of high standing. Usually, acquiring and developing these qualities require massive investments of resources and large-scale national efforts. Despite the difficulties, risks, and high costs, or because of them, nations that aspire to power and high standing often invest valuable resources and efforts in acquiring expertise in these areas. The nations that have succeeded in this task are recognized by many as an elite group – a club. In line with this reality, decision-makers and state officials often choose to emphasize the political aspect of their country's accomplishments and justify national efforts to acquire such qualities by arguing for membership in the club.

Historically, we can identify several nation-state clubs. At the end of the nineteenth century and into the early twentieth century, acquisition of battleships was an indicator of power and high standing. Each country that had battleships, or dreadnoughts (as they were later referred to), was considered a world power, and as a group, they were perceived as a superior club. After World War I, the dreadnought club declined. Total mechanization of air and ground warfare became an indicator of power and a symbol of high standing. The introduction of nuclear weapons at the end of World War II changed the rules of the game again. As of the 1950s, the group of countries that possessed nuclear weapons was recognized as the nuclear club. In the 1960s, the status of this superior group was somewhat formalized with the signing of the Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT), by which means the international community formally accepted the N5, i.e. the five nuclear nations, as a legitimate, superior, and elite group – the nuclear club. At the same time, the countries

reaching outer space were also recognized as a superior and exclusive group under the axiom developed in the Cold War space race: "Control of space means control of the world."¹

This reality raises a number of questions: What are nation-state clubs? What role do they play in world politics? What is their life cycle? And what distinguishes a nation-state club from other models organizing the international system? Journalistic and historiography references to a "club" of nation-states when discussing expertise in areas of space technology, nuclear weapons, and other fields are frequent. Despite that, for the most part, the concept of such a "club" has been neglected or discounted by the vast majority of contemporary international relations (IR) scholars. IR scholars have not developed a comprehensive analytical or theoretical foundation to identify the behavioral and theoretical implications of states' activities in clubs. This book is designed to respond to this neglect by providing a systematic overview of the role of nation-state clubs in world politics. It explores the aforementioned questions using the case study of the space club.

This book focuses on the space club and on the national logic to join it, because space affects our terrestrial life far more than we often realize. A large diversity of applications and services are useful and sometimes even crucial for daily military, civil, and commercial functioning on Earth. The world space industry is an evolving international business. Space capability helps states to develop areas of commercial expertise, which diversifies their economies and enhances their global competitiveness.² Advanced space technologies, especially when used for spreading information, are believed to be the means for a quick transition from a traditional undeveloped society to an industrial and post-industrial nation.³ Communication satellites today are like the railroads of the nineteenth century, enabling desolate parts of a country to be settled and connecting them with the center of the country.⁴ Data that come from space or pass through space enable us to run a global and modern economy. We communicate with each other from every point on Earth, use financial systems throughout the world, and continuously access news from around the world via communications satellites.

¹ Johnson, Lyndon B., Summary Statement, Hearings of the Preparedness Subcommittee, Senate Armed Services Committee, Senate Inquiry on Missiles, January 8, 1958.

² Pace, S., "Emerging Challenges: National Security Requirements and Economic/Commercial Interests," in D. Johnson and E. Levite, (eds.), *Toward Fusion of Air and Space: Surveying Developments and Assessing Choices for Small and Middle Powers*. (Washington, DC: RAND & Fisher Institute, 2003), 48.

³ Mistry, D., "The Geo-Strategic Implications of India's Space Program," *Asian Survey*, 41:6, (2001), 1034.

⁴ Pacey, A., *Technology in World Civilization*. (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1990), 141.