



Wayne Durham
Kenneth A. Bordignon
Roger Beck

Aircraft Control Allocation

Aerospace Series

Editors Peter Belobaba, Jonathan Cooper
and Allan Seabridge

with website



WILEY

AIRCRAFT CONTROL ALLOCATION

Wayne Durham

Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA

Kenneth A. Bordignon

Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University, USA

Roger Beck

Dynamic Concepts, Inc., USA

WILEY

This edition first published 2017
© 2017 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

Registered office John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, United Kingdom

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com.

The right of the author to be identified as the author of this work has been asserted in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and author have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Durham, Wayne, 1941- author. | Bordignon, Kenneth A., author. | Beck, Roger, 1977- author.

Title: Aircraft control allocation / Wayne Durham, Kenneth A. Bordignon, Roger Beck.

Description: Chichester, West Sussex, United Kingdom : John Wiley & Sons, Inc., [2017] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016024806 | ISBN 9781118827796 (cloth) | ISBN 9781118827772 (epub) | ISBN 9781118827765 (Adobe PDF)

Subjects: LCSH: Airplanes--Control systems--Mathematics. | Airplanes--Control systems--Design and construction.

Classification: LCC TL678 .D87 2017 | DDC 629.135--dc23 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2016024806>

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Cover photo: NASA's NF-15B research aircraft is shown during an early yaw-vectoring mission in the ACTIVE flight research project. Credits: NASA Photo

Typeset in 10/12pt TimesLTStd by SPi Global, Chennai, India

Printed and bound in Malaysia by Vivar Printing Sdn Bhd

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

AIRCRAFT CONTROL ALLOCATION

Aerospace Series

The aerospace sector draws upon many specialist areas of expertise; mechanical, electrical/electronic design, systems and computer engineering, planning, logistics, psychology (the human-machine interface), communications, risk analysis, and economics. Each title in the Aerospace Series explores a different aspect or cohesive topic that those working in or aspiring to work in the aerospace sector will find useful and informative. Books in the series range from high level student texts, explanation and dissemination of technology and good practice, through to interesting and important research that is immediately relevant to industrial development or practice.

UAS Integration into Civil Airspace: Policy, Regulations and Strategy by Douglas M. Marshall

Aircraft Systems: A Development Guide by Craig Lawson, Dieter Scholz

Aircraft Control Allocation by Wayne Durham, Kenneth A. Bordignon, Roger Beck

Remotely Piloted Aircraft Systems: A Human Systems Integration Perspective by Nancy J. Cooke, Leah J. Rowe, Winston Bennett, Jr.

Theory and Practice of Aircraft Performance by Ajoy Kumar Kundu, Mark Price, David Riordan

Adaptive Aeroservoelastic Control by Ashish Tewari

The Global Airline Industry, 2nd Edition by Peter Belobaba (Editor), Amedeo Odoni (Editor), Cynthia Barnhart (Editor)

Modeling the Effect of Damage in Composite Structures: Simplified Approaches by Christos Kassapoglou

Introduction to Aircraft Aeroelasticity and Loads, 2nd Edition by Jan R. Wright, Jonathan E. Cooper

Aircraft Aerodynamic Design: Geometry and Optimization by András Sóbester, Alexander I J Forrester

Theoretical and Computational Aerodynamics by Tapan K. Sengupta

Aerospace Propulsion by T. W. Lee

Civil Avionics Systems, 2nd Edition by Ian Moir, Allan Seabridge, Malcolm Jukes

Aircraft Flight Dynamics and Control by Wayne Durham

Modelling and Managing Airport Performance by Konstantinos Zografos (Editor), Giovanni Andreatta (Editor), Amedeo Odoni (Editor)

Advanced Aircraft Design: Conceptual Design, Technology and Optimization of Subsonic Civil Airplanes by Egbert Torenbeek

Design and Analysis of Composite Structures: With Applications to Aerospace Structures, 2nd Edition by Christos Kassapoglou

Aircraft Systems Integration of Air-Launched Weapons by Keith A. Rigby

Design and Development of Aircraft Systems, 2nd Edition by Ian Moir, Allan Seabridge

Understanding Aerodynamics: Arguing from the Real Physics by Doug McLean

Aircraft Design: A Systems Engineering Approach by Mohammad H. Sadraey

Introduction to UAV Systems, 4th Edition by Paul Fahlstrom, Thomas Gleason

Theory of Lift: Introductory Computational Aerodynamics in MATLAB/Octave by G. D. McBain

Sense and Avoid in UAS: Research and Applications by Plamen Angelov (Editor)

Morphing Aerospace Vehicles and Structures by John Valasek (Editor)

Spacecraft Systems Engineering, 4th Edition by Peter Fortescue (Editor), Graham Swinerd (Editor), John Stark (Editor)

Basic Helicopter Aerodynamics, 3rd Edition by John M. Seddon, Simon Newman

Gas Turbine Propulsion Systems by Bernie MacIsaac, Roy Langton

System Health Management: with Aerospace Applications by Stephen B Johnson (Editor), Thomas Gormley (Co-Editor), Seth Kessler (Co-Editor), Charles Mott (Co-Editor), Ann Patterson-Hine (Co-Editor), Karl Reichard (Co-Editor), Philip Scandura, Jr. (Co-Editor)

Advanced Control of Aircraft, Spacecraft and Rockets by Ashish Tewari

Cooperative Path Planning of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles by Antonios Tsourdos, Brian White, Madhavan Shanmugavel

Principles of Flight for Pilots by Peter J. Swatton

Air Travel and Health: A Systems Perspective by Allan Seabridge, Shirley Morgan

Unmanned Aircraft Systems: UAVS Design, Development and Deployment by Reg Austin

Introduction to Antenna Placement and Installation by Thereza Macnamara

Principles of Flight Simulation by David Allerton

Aircraft Fuel Systems by Roy Langton, Chuck Clark, Martin Hewitt, Lonnie Richards

Computational Modelling and Simulation of Aircraft and the Environment, Volume 1: Platform Kinematics and Synthetic Environment by Dominic J. Diston

Handbook of Space Technology by Wilfried Ley (Editor), Klaus Wittmann (Editor), Willi Hallmann (Editor)

Aircraft Performance Theory and Practice for Pilots, 2nd Edition by Peter J. Swatton

Aircraft Systems: Mechanical, Electrical and Avionics Subsystems Integration, 3rd Edition by Ian Moir, Allan Seabridge

Stability and Control of Aircraft Systems: Introduction to Classical Feedback Control by Roy Langton

Military Avionics Systems by Ian Moir, Allan Seabridge, Malcolm Jukes (Contributions by)

Aircraft Loading and Structural Layout by Denis Howe

Aircraft Display Systems by Malcolm Jukes

Aircraft Conceptual Design Synthesis by Denis Howe

Dedication

For Craig Steidle, Bob Hanley, and John Foster. Thanks guys.

Series Preface

The field of aerospace is multi-disciplinary and wide ranging, covering a large variety of products, disciplines and domains, not merely in engineering but in many related supporting activities. These combine to enable the aerospace industry to produce innovative and technologically advanced vehicles. The wealth of knowledge and experience that has been gained by expert practitioners in the various aerospace fields needs to be passed onto others working in the industry and also researchers, teachers and the student body in universities.

The *Aerospace Series* aims to be a practical, topical and relevant series of books aimed at people working in the aerospace industry, including engineering professionals and operators, engineers in academia, and allied professions such commercial and legal executives. The range of topics is intended to be wide ranging, covering design and development, manufacture, operation and support of aircraft, as well as topics such as infrastructure operations and current advances in research and technology.

Modern aircraft are designed with multiple control surfaces, and possibly other control effectors e.g. thrust vectoring, and therefore problems can arise as to how to combine these control devices in an optimal manner, particularly in low-speed flight regimes where the aerodynamic surfaces lose their effectiveness.

This book, *Aircraft Control Allocation*, provides a detailed explanation of some selected topics relating to the aircraft control allocation problem. After providing some background material in aircraft control and control laws, a number of approaches that can be used to solve the control allocation problem are illustrated and the influence that they have on control law design discussed. Of particular note is the chapter describing some of the lessons learnt whilst designing the X-35 Flight Control System.

Peter Belobaba, Jonathan Cooper and Alan Seabridge

Glossary

- ($\dot{}$) Dot over quantity: the derivative with respect to time of the contents of the parentheses ().
- ($\hat{}$) Hat over quantity: the contents of the parentheses () are approximate.
- α Angle-of-attack: the aerodynamic angle between the projection of the relative wind onto the airplane's plane of symmetry and a suitably defined body fixed x -axis.
- β Sideslip angle: The aerodynamic angle between the velocity vector and the airplane's plane of symmetry.
- $\ell_1, \ell_2, \ell_\infty$ Vector norms: ℓ_2 is the square root of the sum of the squares of the entries in the vector. It appears everywhere. ℓ_1 is the sum of the absolute values of the entries and ℓ_∞ is the greatest absolute value. ℓ_1 and ℓ_∞ frequently appear in linear programming problems.
- Ω Either:
1. Every combination of control effector deflections that are admissible; in other words, that are within the limits of travel or deflection.
 2. A normally diagonal matrix used to specify the dynamics in a dynamic-inversion control law.
- Φ The effects, usually body-axis moments, moment coefficients, or angular accelerations, of every combination of control effector deflections in Ω , q.v. (sense 1). Sometimes called the AMS, for 'attainable moment set' or subset.
- ϕ Bank angle: one of three angles that define a 3-2-1 (z - y - x) rotation from inertial to body-fixed reference frames.
- Π Either:
1. (Primarily) A subset of the attainable moments (Φ) consisting of all the moments that are generated by a particular control allocation method.
 2. A plane surface that arises in Banks' method of allocation for the three-moment problem.
- ψ Heading angle: one of three angles that define a 3-2-1 (z - y - x) rotation from inertial to body-fixed reference frames.
- Θ A subset of Ω : all admissible controls that a particular control-allocation method can return as solutions to a control-allocation problem.
- θ Pitch attitude: one of three angles that define a 3-2-1 (z - y - x) rotation from inertial to body-fixed reference frames.

- B* One of the matrices of the linearized equations of motion: *A* is the system matrix, *B* is control effectiveness matrix, and *C* is the output matrix.
- C_{x_y} The non-dimensional stability or control derivative of *x* with respect to *y*: it is the non-dimensional form of X_y .
- Comp* Complementary: a superscript to certain dynamic responses.
- Cont* Controllable: a superscript to certain dynamic responses.
- d, des* Desired: a subscript to a dynamic response, or any other quantity.
- F_B* Body-fixed reference frames. The origin is at the airplane's center of mass. The axes x_B and z_B lie in the airplane's plane of symmetry. y_B completes the right-hand system. Once defined, a body-fixed reference system's orientation with respect to the body does not change. Two frequently used body-fixed reference frames are the principal axes and the stability-axis system.
- F_H* Local-horizontal reference frame. The axes x_H , y_H , and z_H are oriented north, east, and down, respectively. The earth is flat.
- F_W* Wind-axis system. The axis x_W lies in the direction of flight, opposite the relative wind. z_W is in the plane of symmetry, oriented downward.
- g* Either:
1. Acceleration of gravity, or
 2. The non-dimensional units of load factor *n*, q.v.
- I* With subscripts; moment of inertia.
- Kine* Kinematic: a superscript to certain dynamic responses.
- L, C, D* Lift, side force, and drag: wind-axis forces in the x_W -, y_W - and z_W -directions, respectively.
- L, M, N* Body-axis moments about the x_B axis (rolling), y_B axis (pitching), and z_B axis (yawing), respectively.
- L* Either:
1. Lift, or
 2. Rolling moment, depending on context.
- LD* Lateral-directional, meaning all motions, accelerations, forces, and so on, that are not longitudinal, q.v. Sometimes *lat-dir*.
- Long* Longitudinal, meaning all motions, accelerations, forces, and so on, that take place in the airplane's plane of symmetry. Pitching moments, velocities, and accelerations are about the airplane's y_B -axis but the motion is in the x_B - z_B plane.
- m* The mass of the airplane.
- n* Load factor, the ratio of lift to weight, $n = L/W$. Measured in *gs*.
- p, q, r* Body-axis roll rate, pitch rate, and yaw rate, respectively.
- P* A generalized inverse of a matrix *B*: $BPB = B$ and $PBP = P$, with appropriate dimensions.
- Ref* Subscript, 'evaluated in reference conditions'.

\mathbf{u} Vector of control effector variables.

$\mathbf{u}_{\min}, \mathbf{u}_{\max}$ Vector of control effector limits, minimum or maximum.

$\mathbf{u}_l, \mathbf{u}_u$ Vector of control effector limits, lower or upper. This notation seems preferred by linear programmers over $\mathbf{u}_{\min}, \mathbf{u}_{\max}$, q.v.

x_B, y_B, z_B Names of body-axes.

W A weighting matrix, generally diagonal and positive.

x_W, y_W, z_W Names of wind axes.

X_y Where X is a force or moment and y is a state or control, a dimensional derivative, $\partial X / \partial y$. It is the dimensional form of C_{X_y} , q.v. The definition does *not* include division by mass or moment of inertia. If y is a control effector the result is called a control derivative, otherwise it is called a stability derivative.

X, Y, Z Body-axis forces in the x -, y - and z -directions, respectively.

x, y, z Names of axes. With no subscripts usually taken to be body-axes.

ACTIVE Advanced Control Technology for Integrated Vehicles. A research F-15 with differential canards, axisymmetric thrust vectoring, and other novel features.

ADMIRE Aero-Data Model In a Research Environment, simulation code. See Appendix B.

Admissible Of a control effector or suite of control effectors, those deflections that are within the physical limits of employment.

AMS Attainable moment subset or set, Φ .

Angular accelerations See Objectives.

ARI Aileron-rudder interconnect. Normally used to reduce adverse yaw due to aileron deflection.

Attainable Of moments or accelerations; that which can be generated by some admissible combination of control effectors. The term may be applied globally, meaning there is some theoretical combination, or locally, to a particular control allocation method, meaning those combinations of control effectors that the method will generate using its rules.

Basic feasible solution Of linear programs, a basic solution to the equality constraints in a linear program that also solves the inequality constraints.

Basic solution Of linear programs, a solution to the l linear equality constraints of a linear program in 'standard form' with $k - l$ of the decision variables at their bound.

CAS Control augmentation system.

Control effectiveness A measure of the effect of utilizing a control effector, either moment, moment coefficient, or angular acceleration.

Control authority The aggregate effect of the effectiveness of all the control effectors in whatever combination.

Control power Angular acceleration per unit of control deflection.

CHR Cooper-Harper rating; sometimes HQR.

Constraint Of a control effector, a limiting position, usually imposed by the hardware. It may also refer to a limit on the rate of travel. In linear programming, a constraint may refer to the position limits, but also of an equality that must be satisfied. Thus $\mathbf{u} \leq \mathbf{u}_{\max}$ is an inequality constraint, and $B\mathbf{u} = \mathbf{m}_{des}$ is an equality constraint.

Control effector The devices that directly effect control by changing forces or moments, such as ailerons or rudders. When we say ‘the controls’ with no qualification, we usually mean the control effectors. The sign convention for conventional flapping control effectors follows a right-hand rule, with the thumb along the axis about which the effector is designed to generate moments, and the curled fingers denoting the positive deflection of the trailing edge.

Control inceptor Cockpit devices that control, through direct linkage or a flight-control system or computer, the control effectors. Positive control inceptor deflections correspond to positive deflections of the effectors they are connected to, barring such things as aileron–rudder interconnects (ARI, q.v.).

Cycling Of a linear program, a condition in which a sequence of vertices is visited by a solver for which the objective function does not decrease, eventually returning to the starting point in the cycle. Cycling represents a failure to converge and must be addressed by choosing an exchange rule designed to prevent it.

Degenerate basic solution Of linear programs, a basic solution to a linear program in which one of the l decision variables in the basis is at its bound in addition to the non-basic variables.

Decision variables The set of unknown parameters being optimized in a linear program.

FBW Fly by wire. The pilot flies the computer, the computer flies the airplane.

FQ Flying qualities.

Ganged Said of mechanical devices that are linked so that they move in fixed relation to each other, such as ailerons.

HARV High angle-of-attack research vehicle.

HQ Handling qualities.

HQR Handling qualities rating.

Interior point method One of a family of numerical methods that seek to find the optimal solution to a linear program by moving through the interior of the feasible set.

Intersection Of two objects (q.v.), an object that is wholly contained in each of the two.

Lat-Dir Lateral-directional.

LEU, LED Leading-edge up, down. Terms used to describe the deflection of leading-edge control surfaces.

Linear programming A problem, or the method of solving that problem, of optimization of an objective subject to linear equality and inequality constraints. To the purpose of this book, a method of allocating controls subject to position constraints.

Moments See Objectives.

Moment coefficients See Objectives.

Object A generalization of any of the several polytopes that describe sets of admissible controls and attainable moments.

Objectives Those which control effectors are intended to generate. Originally control allocation sought to find the control effectors that generated specified moments, or moment coefficients. Subsequently researchers have tended toward using angular accelerations as the objectives. We will generally speak of the objectives as being moments.

Object notation A method of identifying objects (q.v.) using a 0 for a control at its lower limit, a 1 at its upper limit, and a 2 if it can be anywhere in between.

OBM On-board model. A set of aerodynamic data for an aircraft stored in the aircraft's flight control computer.

Over-actuated control system See Redundant controls.

Phase one/two program Phase one of a linear programming solver solves a modified problem in order to locate an initial feasible solution for the phase two solver that will optimize the original problem.

PIO Pilot-induced oscillation. There's a more politically correct term that removes the onus from the pilot.

PR Pilot rating; sometimes HQR, q.v.

Preferred Of a solution to the control allocation problem, a control effector configuration that is as close as possible to one that is preferred. Minimum norm solutions are used as preferred solutions often.

Pseudo control A combination of control effectors intended to create a certain effect, such as the excitation of a particular dynamic response mode of the airplane.

Redundant controls Control effectors are seldom *redundant*, in the sense that the designer had no use for them in mind. The control effectors that are redundant in higher-speed flight may be critical in slow-speed flight. The term just means that there are more control effectors than objectives, q.v. As used in this book, it means there are more than three control effectors to generate the three moments or angular accelerations.

SAS Stability augmentation system.

Simplex An extension of a triangle (two-dimensional), or tetrahedron (three-dimensional), to an arbitrary number of dimensions. An n -dimensional simplex is defined by the convex hull of $n + 1$ vertices.

Simplex method Either:

1. (Dantzig) Algorithms based on Dantzig's original numerical algorithm for the solution of linear programs, introduced in 1947. The simplex method moves between neighboring vertices, basic solutions, of the feasible set, decreasing the cost function until the optimum is found.
2. (Nelder Mead) Also known as downhill simplex. Numerical solution algorithm that iterates an n -dimensional simplex to minimize n -dimensional, non-linear, unconstrained optimization problems. Heuristic rules at each step govern how to modify the simplex.

Slack variable Variables augmenting the decision variables in a linear program so that inequality constraints can be converted to equality constraints.

TEU, TED, TEL, TER Trailing-edge up, down, left, right. Terms used to describe the deflection of flapping control surfaces.

Union Of two objects (q.v.), the smallest object of which the two given objects are both members.

Warm start A heuristic method for initializing a linear program solver given a pre-existing optimal solution to a similar problem.

About the Companion Website

Don't forget to visit the companion website for this book:

www.wiley.com/go/durham/aircraft_control_allocation



There you will find valuable material designed to enhance your learning, including:

- **Simulation quick start guide**

Scan this QR code to visit the companion website



Contents

Dedication	xiii
Series Preface	xv
Glossary	xvii
About the Companion Website	xxiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Redundant Control Effectors	1
1.2 Overview	3
References	5
2 Aircraft Control	6
2.1 Flight Dynamics	6
2.1.1 <i>Equations of Motion</i>	6
2.1.2 <i>Linearized Equations of Motion</i>	10
2.2 Control	12
2.2.1 <i>General</i>	12
2.2.2 <i>Aircraft Control Effectors</i>	13
2.2.3 <i>Aircraft Control Inceptors</i>	17
2.3 Afterword	18
References	19
3 Control Laws	20
3.1 Flying Qualities	20
3.1.1 <i>Requirements</i>	21
3.1.2 <i>Control Law Design to Satisfy Flying Qualities Requirements</i>	21
3.2 Dynamic-inversion Control Laws	21
3.2.1 <i>Basics</i>	21
3.2.2 <i>Types of Equations</i>	22
3.2.3 <i>The Controlled Equations</i>	23
3.2.4 <i>The Kinematic and Complementary Equations</i>	25
3.3 Model-following Control Laws	27
3.4 ‘Conventional’ Control Laws	27
3.5 Afterword	28
References	29

4	The Problem	30
4.1	Control Effectiveness	30
4.2	Constraints	31
4.3	Control Allocation	31
	4.3.1 <i>The Control Allocation Problem</i>	32
4.4	Afterword	32
	References	33
5	The Geometry of Control Allocation	34
5.1	Admissible Controls	34
	5.1.1 <i>General</i>	34
	5.1.2 <i>Objects</i>	34
	5.1.3 <i>Intersection and Union</i>	37
	5.1.4 <i>Convex Hull</i>	39
5.2	Attainable Moments	39
5.3	The Two-moment Problem	43
	5.3.1 <i>Area Calculations</i>	48
5.4	The Three-moment Problem	49
	5.4.1 <i>Determination of Φ_3</i>	49
	5.4.2 <i>Volume Calculations</i>	56
5.5	Significance of the Maximum Set	58
	5.5.1 <i>As a Standard of Comparison of Different Methods</i>	59
	5.5.2 <i>Maneuver Requirements</i>	60
	5.5.3 <i>Control Failure Reconfiguration</i>	62
5.6	Afterword	62
	References	64
6	Solutions	65
6.1	On-line vs. Off-line Solutions	65
	6.1.1 <i>On-line Solutions</i>	65
	6.1.2 <i>Off-line Solutions</i>	65
6.2	Optimal vs. Non-optimal Solutions	66
	6.2.1 <i>Maximum Capabilities</i>	66
	6.2.2 <i>Maximum Volume</i>	66
	6.2.3 <i>Nearest to Preferred</i>	66
	6.2.4 <i>Unattainable Moments</i>	67
6.3	Preferred Solutions	68
6.4	Ganging	68
6.5	Generalized Inverses	70
	6.5.1 <i>The General Case, and the Significance of P_2</i>	70
	6.5.2 <i>Tailored Generalized Inverses</i>	73
	6.5.3 <i>'Best' Generalized Inverse</i>	74
	6.5.4 <i>Pseudo-inverses</i>	75
	6.5.5 <i>Methods that Incorporate Generalized Inverses</i>	77
6.6	Direct Allocation	80
	6.6.1 <i>The Direct Method for the Two-moment Problem</i>	81
	6.6.2 <i>The Direct Method for the Three-moment Problem</i>	82