



DEMOCRATIC  
SOUTH AFRICA'S  
FOREIGN POLICY

*Voting Behaviour in the  
United Nations*

SUZANNE GRAHAM



Suzanne Graham

# Democratic South Africa's Foreign Policy

Voting Behaviour in the United Nations

palgrave  
macmillan

Suzanne Graham  
Department of Politics and International Relations  
University of Johannesburg  
South Africa

ISBN 978-1-137-59380-1      ISBN 978-1-137-59381-8 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1057/978-1-137-59381-8

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016940602

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2016

The author(s) has/have asserted their right(s) to be identified as the author(s) of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Cover illustration: © World History Archive / Alamy Stock Photo

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature  
The registered company is Macmillan Publishers Ltd. London

# Democratic South Africa's Foreign Policy

## FOREWORD

The Republic of South Africa's international relations continue to intrigue scholars and foreign policy practitioners 20 years into the existence of the not so 'new' South Africa. This is entirely understandable considering that the country has since its democratic rebirth in 1994 aspired to international leadership. Whether this role is attributable to a self-assigned status of a good international citizen or to duties associated with a middle power or regional hegemon or emerging power, the fact is that South Africa's foreign relations matter to a host of other international actors and this has in turn spawned a steady stream of academic publications on the subject.

The United Nations is the principal multilateral forum in which South Africa pursues its grand international agenda. Yet, remarkably, South Africa's conduct in the various organs of the world body has not attracted the scholarly scrutiny it deserves. With her seminal study of South Africa's voting behaviour in the UN, Dr Suzanne Graham is plugging this gap. What she offers is far more than a ream of voting statistics à la Nations on Record.

The scope of Dr Graham's inquiry is singularly impressive. It covers a period of 20 years, from South Africa's return to the UN in 1994 to the end of 2014. No fewer than 1700 UN votes cast by South Africa in the Security Council, General Assembly, committees of the Assembly, and the Human Rights Commission/Council are analysed. In addition to hundreds of resolutions, she also consulted over 120 other UN documents and reports and nearly 130 speeches made by South African delegates to the UN. This wealth of material is grouped into four categories representing the main issue areas on which South Africa has voted in the UN over

the past two decades: human rights; disarmament and non-proliferation; the 'African agenda'; and reform of the UN. In providing a compendium of South Africa's position on these major global issues and its UN votes thereon, this book is already making a ground-breaking contribution to the study of South African foreign policy. Policymakers, diplomats, and academic researchers will find this an invaluable source book on contemporary South African foreign policy.

There is, however, even more to this work. Dr Graham has also developed an original 'three-step' model to analyse voting behaviour at the UN. First, South Africa's declared foreign policy on each of the four key issues is set out. The second step involves capturing each of the Republic's actual votes on these issues. Finally, the voting actions are measured against South Africa's publicly stated positions to determine whether the votes were consistent with its declaratory foreign policy. The model is strikingly simple, logical, and user-friendly. Having proven its utility in the South African case, the model may well be applied to other UN member states individually or comparatively.

The core finding of the study will surprise many observers of South Africa's foreign relations: the country's voting in UN organs on the four selected issues—including human rights—over a period of 20 years has been remarkably consistent with its stated foreign policy. This flies in the face of a widely held perception that the Republic's lofty foreign policy pronouncements are often contradicted by its voting in the UN, especially with regard to human rights issues. The author bases her conclusions on meticulous and empirically solid research.

This exemplary piece of qualitative research deserves a place of honour among the books on democratic South Africa's foreign policy.

Department of Politics and International Relations  
University of Johannesburg

Deon Geldenhuys

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the following people for their support, encouragement, and friendship:

Chris Alden, Jim Chadwick, Claudia Forster-Towne, Pieter Fourie, Deon Geldenhuys, Zelda Geldenhuys, Rae Israel, Chris Landsberg, Ronel Johl, Craig Mackenzie, Auriel Niemack, Lionel Posthumus, Yolanda Spies, Justin van der Merwe, Jack Spence, the University of Johannesburg's Faculty of Humanities, Antony and Ilonka Graham, Richard and Robyn Graham, and Lucian, Miska, Isadora, Rachel, and Michael Graham. I would also like to thank the United Nations Bibliographic Information System and online library, and the dedicated and wonderful editorial team at Palgrave Macmillan, especially Sarah and Hannah.

A special thank you goes to Carole, my mom, and my twin sister, Victoria Graham, who keep me sane.

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ABM Treaty	Anti-Ballistic Missile Treaty
ACABQ	Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AEC	Atomic Energy Corporation
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
AMIS	African Mission in Sudan
ANC	African National Congress
ANWFZ	African Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone
APRM	African Peer Review Mechanism
Armcor	Armaments Corporation of South Africa
AU	African Union
AUPSC	AU Peace and Security Council
Awav	Adopted without a vote
BAPA	Buenos Aires Plan of Action
BASIC	Brazil, South Africa, India, and China
BRIC	Brazil, Russia, India, China
BTWC	Biological and Toxin Weapons Convention (Full Title: Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production and Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin Weapons and on their Destruction)
BWI	Bretton Woods Institution(s)
CAB	Conventional Arms Branch
CBW	Chemical and Biological Weapons
CCW	Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons (Full Title: Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which May Be Deemed to Be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects)

CD	Conference on Disarmament
CMP	Capital Master Plan
COPUOS	Committee on the Peaceful Uses of Outer Space (UN)
CPA	Comprehensive Peace Agreement
CPC	Committee for Programme and Coordination (UN)
CSD	Commission on Sustainable Development
CTBT	Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty
CTBTO PrepCom	Preparatory Commission for the Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty Organization
CWC	Chemical Weapons Convention (Full Title: Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production, Stockpiling and Use of Chemical Weapons and on their Destruction)
DFA	Department of Foreign Affairs
DIRCO	Department of International Relations and Cooperation
DPI	Department of Public Information (UN)
DPKO	Department of Peacekeeping Operations (UN)
DPRK	Democratic People's Republic of Korea
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
DTI	Department of Trade and Industry
ECESA	Executive Committee on Economic and Social Affairs
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
EMG	Environmental Monitoring Group
EPTA	Expanded Programme of Technical Assistance
EU	European Union
FMT	Fissile Material Treaty
G-4	Group of 4
G-5	Group of 5
G-7	Group of 7
G-8	Group of 8
G-20	Group of 20
G-77	Group of 77
HCOC	Hague Code of Conduct against Ballistic Missile Proliferation
HLPTCC	High-Level Panel on Threats, Challenges and Change
HRC	Human Rights Council
IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
IBSA	India-Brazil-South Africa
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

ICJ	International Court of Justice
IGO	Intergovernmental Organisation
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INPRO	International Project on Innovative Nuclear Reactors and Fuel Cycles
INVO	Iraq Nuclear Verification Office
JIU	Joint Inspection Unit (UN)
LDC	Least Developed Country
MAP	Millennium Africa Recovery Programme
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MINURSO	United Nations Mission for the Referendum in Western Sahara
MINUSTAH	United Nations Stabilisation Mission in Haiti
MONUC	United Nations Organization Mission in the DRC
MTCR	Missile Technology Control Regime
NAC	New Agenda Coalition
NAI	New African Initiative
NAM	Non-Aligned Movement
NAP	South Africa's National Action Plan for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights
NCACC	National Conventional Arms Control Committee
NECSA	Nuclear Energy Corporation of South Africa
NEPAD	New Partnership for Africa's Development
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NIEO	New International Economic Order
NNWS	Non-Nuclear Weapons States
NPC	South African Council for the Non-Proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction
NPT	Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty
NSG	Nuclear Suppliers Group
NV	Non-Voting
NWS	Nuclear Weapons States
O5	Outreach-5
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OEWG	Open-Ended Working Group
OFF	Oil-For-Food
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (UN)
OIC	Organisation of Islamic Cooperation
OIOS	Office of Internal Oversight Services (UN)
ONUB	United Nations Operation in Burundi
OPCW	Organisation for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons
OSAA	Office of the Special Advisor on Africa
P5	Permanent Five

PAP	Pan-African Parliament
PBC	Peacebuilding Commission
POCDATARA	Protection of Constitutional Democracy Against Terrorist and Related Activities Act
POLISARIO Front	Popular Front for the Liberation of Saguia el-Hamra and Río de Oro
SACBL	South African Campaign to Ban Landmines
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAIIA	South African Institute of International Affairs
SANAE	South African National Antarctic Expedition
SIPRI	Stockholm International Peace Research Institute
SUNFED	Special United Nations Fund for Economic Development
SU/SSC	Special Unit for South-South Cooperation
TCDC	Technical Cooperation among Developing Countries
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UFC	Uniting for Consensus
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNAMID	AU/UN Hybrid Operation in Darfur
UNAT	United Nations Appeals Tribunal
UNBISnet	United Nations Bibliographic Information System
UNCCD	United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification in those Countries Experiencing Serious Drought and/or Desertification Particularly in Africa
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCHR	United Nations Commission on Human Rights
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDC	United Nations Disarmament Commission
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNDT	United Nations Dispute Tribunal
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNIDIR	United Nations Institute for Disarmament Research
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
UNIFIL	United Nations Interim Force in Lebanon
UNMIS	United Nations Mission in the Sudan
UNMIT	United Nations Integrated Mission in Timor-Leste
UNMOVIC	UN Monitoring, Verification and Inspection Commission
UN-NADAF	United Nations New Agenda for the Development of Africa

UNOCI	United Nations Operation in Côte d'Ivoire
UNODA	United Nations Office for Disarmament Affairs
UNPAAERD	United Nations Programme of Action for African Economic Recovery and Development
UNROCA	United Nations Register of Conventional Arms
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UPR	Universal Periodic Review
US	United States
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
VDPA	Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action
WB	World Bank
WMD	Weapons of Mass Destruction
WSOD	World Summit Outcome Document
WSSD	World Summit on Sustainable Development
WTO	World Trade Organization
ZC	Zangger Committee

## LIST OF FIGURES

Fig. 7.1	South Africa's UN votes in summary (1994–2014)	290
Fig. 7.2	South Africa's votes on human rights issues (in clustered sub-themes)	293
Fig. 7.3	South Africa's votes on disarmament issues (in clustered sub-themes)	295
Fig. 7.4	South Africa's votes on promoting the interests of Africa and the Global South (in clustered sub-themes)	296
Fig. 7.5	South Africa's votes on UN reform issues (in clustered sub-themes)	297

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	South African foreign policy areas of focus in multilateral institutions	35
Table 3.1	UNGA Third Committee: country-specific resolutions on human rights—South Africa's vote	67
Table 3.2	UNCHR/HRC: country-specific resolutions on human rights—South Africa's vote	68
Table 7.1	South Africa's 'consistency' rating between 1994 and 2014 expressed as averages	299

# CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
	<i>Background</i>	1
	<i>The Purpose of This Book</i>	3
	<i>Analytical Framework</i>	4
	<i>Step 1: Declared Foreign Policy</i>	6
	<i>Step 2: Voting Action</i>	7
	<i>Step 3: Interpretations of Voting Action:</i> <i>Government Views and Observers' Views</i>	8
	<i>The Organisation of This Book</i>	9
	<i>Conceptualisation for Contextual Relevance</i>	10
	<i>Acting in the UN</i>	12
	<i>State Roles at the UN</i>	12
	<i>Permanent Missions and Delegations</i>	14
	<i>UN Voting</i>	16
	<i>Conclusion</i>	20
	<i>Notes</i>	20
<b>2</b>	<b>Foreign Policy: Pinpointing Principles and Themes</b>	<b>27</b>
	<i>Shining a Light on Foreign Policy</i>	28
	<i>South Africa's Foreign Policy, 1994–2014</i>	30
	<i>Principles</i>	32
	<i>Themes</i>	36

<i>The Promotion of Human Rights and Democracy</i>	36
<i>Disarmament and Related Non-Proliferation Issues</i>	39
<i>The Advancement of African Interests Within the Context of North-South Relations</i>	43
<i>Reform of the UN and the Promotion of Equitable Global Governance</i>	45
<i>Conclusion</i>	50
<i>Notes</i>	50
<b>3 Voting on Human Rights and Democracy Issues</b>	59
<i>Introduction</i>	59
<i>Human Rights at the UN: A Background Review</i>	60
<i>South Africa and Human Rights at the UN</i>	62
<i>South Africa's Voting Actions</i>	65
<i>Votes on Country-Specific Situations</i>	66
<i>Voting at the UNSC</i>	71
<i>Votes on Thematic Issues in the UNGA and UNCHR/HRC</i>	73
<i>Resolutions Linked to Civil and Political Rights</i>	73
<i>Resolutions Falling Under Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights</i>	78
<i>Resolutions Pertaining to the Rights to Development, Self-Determination, Peace, and a Protected Environment</i>	81
<i>Resolutions Related to the Promotion of Democracy and its Consolidation the World Over</i>	84
<i>Interpretations of Voting Actions on Human Rights Issues</i>	89
<i>Explanations of South Africa's Votes on Country-Specific Situations</i>	93
<i>Libya, Cuba, China, and Indonesia</i>	94
<i>Belarus, Uzbekistan, and the Middle East</i>	96
<i>Burma/Myanmar</i>	98
<i>Nigeria, Sudan, and Zimbabwe</i>	101
<i>Explanations of South Africa's Votes on Thematic Issues</i>	105
<i>Conclusion</i>	108
<i>Note</i>	110

<b>4</b>	<b>Disarmament and Non-Proliferation Issues</b>	<b>121</b>
	<i>Introduction</i>	121
	<i>Disarmament and Non-Proliferation at the UN</i>	123
	<i>South Africa's Disarmament Policy and Voting on</i>	
	<i>Nuclear Controls at the UN</i>	126
	<i>Voting Actions at the UN</i>	130
	<i>Votes on Nuclear Disarmament and</i>	
	<i>Non-Proliferation Issues</i>	131
	<i>Biological and Chemical Weapons</i>	139
	<i>Conventional Weapons Issues</i>	140
	<i>Conventional Arms Transfers</i>	142
	<i>Regional Disarmament and Security</i>	144
	<i>Related Disarmament Measures and</i>	
	<i>International Security</i>	146
	<i>Outer Space</i>	149
	<i>Institutional Aspects of Disarmament</i>	150
	<i>Voting Action at the UNSC</i>	154
	<i>Interpretations of Voting Actions on</i>	
	<i>Disarmament and Non-Proliferation Issues</i>	156
	<i>Nuclear Non-Proliferation</i>	156
	<i>Anti-Personnel Landmines</i>	159
	<i>Arms Sales</i>	161
	<i>The UNSC</i>	163
	<i>Conclusion</i>	168
 <b>5</b>	 <b>Advancing African Interests</b>	 <b>183</b>
	<i>Introduction</i>	183
	<i>The Emergence of a Southern Bloc at the UN</i>	184
	<i>South Africa at the UN: Champion of</i>	
	<i>Africa and the South?</i>	190
	<i>Voting at the UNGA</i>	196
	<i>UNGA Second Committee Votes</i>	196
	<i>Development</i>	197
	<i>New International Economic Order</i>	198
	<i>Environmental Concerns in Africa and</i>	
	<i>the Developing World</i>	199
	<i>UNGA Fourth Committee Votes</i>	201
	<i>UNGA Plenary Votes</i>	203