



# PUTTING LABOUR IN ITS PLACE

## Labour Process Analysis and Global Value Chains

EDITED BY KIRSTY NEWSOME, PHIL TAYLOR, JENNIFER BAIR AND AL RAINNIE

Series Editors: Irena Grugulis, Caroline Lloyd, Chris Smith and Chris Warhurst

CRITICAL  
PERSPECTIVES  
ON WORK AND  
EMPLOYMENT



# Putting Labour in its Place

## Labour Process Analysis and Global Value Chains

*Edited by*

**Kirsty Newsome**

*Reader, University of Sheffield, UK*

**Phil Taylor**

*Professor, University of Strathclyde, UK*

**Jennifer Bair**

*Associate Professor, University of Colorado, USA*

*and*

**Al Rainnie**

*Honorary Senior Research Fellow, Business School,  
University of York*



palgrave

Selection and editorial matter © Kirsty Newsome, Phil Taylor, Jennifer Bair  
and Al Rainnie 2015  
Individual chapters © Contributors 2015

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2015 by  
PALGRAVE

Palgrave in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of 4 Crinan Street, London, N1 9XW.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC,  
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave is a global imprint of the above companies and is represented throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978–1–137–41038–2 hardback  
ISBN 978–1–137–41035–1 paperback

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Typeset by MPS Limited, Chennai, India.  
Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

## **CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON WORK AND EMPLOYMENT**

Series editors

**Irena Grugulis**, Durham University Business School, UK

**Caroline Lloyd**, School of Social Sciences, Cardiff University, UK

**Chris Smith**, Royal Holloway University of London School of Management, UK

**Chris Warhurst**, University of Warwick, UK

Critical Perspectives on Work and Employment combine the best empirical research with leading edge, critical debate on key issues and developments in the field of work and employment. Extremely well regarded and popular, the series has links to the highly successful International Labour Process Conference.

Formerly edited by David Knights, Hugh Willmott, Chris Smith and Paul Thompson, each edited volume in the series includes contributions from a range of disciplines, including the sociology of work and employment, business and management studies, human resources management, industrial relations and organizational analysis.

Further details of the International Labour Process Conference can be found at [www.ilpc.org.uk](http://www.ilpc.org.uk).

### *Published:*

Kirsty Newsome, Phil Taylor, Jennifer Bair and Al Rainnie  
**PUTTING LABOUR IN ITS PLACE**

Marco Hauptmeier and Matt Vidal  
**COMPARATIVE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF WORK**

Carol Wolkowitz, Rachel Lara Cohen, Teela Sanders and Kate Hardy  
**BODY/SEX/WORK**

Chris Warhurst, Françoise Carré, Patricia Findlay and Chris Tilly  
**ARE BAD JOBS INEVITABLE?**

Irena Grugulis and Ödül Bozkurt  
**RETAIL WORK**

Paul Thompson and Chris Smith  
**WORKING LIFE**

Alan McKinlay and Chris Smith  
**CREATIVE LABOUR**

Maeve Houlihan and Sharon Bolton  
**WORK MATTERS**

Chris Warhurst, Doris Ruth Eikhof and Axel Haunschild  
**WORK LESS, LIVE MORE?**

Bill Harley, Jeff Hyman and Paul Thompson  
**PARTICIPATION AND DEMOCRACY AT WORK**

Chris Warhurst, Irena Grugulis and Ewart Keep  
**THE SKILLS THAT MATTER**

Andrew Sturdy, Irena Grugulis and Hugh Willmott  
**CUSTOMER SERVICE**

Craig Prichard, Richard Hull, Mike Chumer and Hugh Willmott  
MANAGING KNOWLEDGE

Alan Felstead and Nick Jewson  
GLOBAL TRENDS IN FLEXIBLE LABOUR

Paul Thompson and Chris Warhurst  
WORKPLACES OF THE FUTURE

More details of the publications in this series can be found at [www.palgrave.com/business/cpwe](http://www.palgrave.com/business/cpwe)

---

**Critical Perspectives on Work and Employment Series**

**Series Standing Order ISBN 978-0-230-23017-0 (pb); 978-0-230-23016-3 (hb)**

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in the case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and one of the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, RG21 6XS, UK

---

# List of Illustrations

## Tables

2.1	Case-study organizations	35
9.1	GDP, apparel and remittances (USD millions)	159
10.1	Types of transnational labour regulation	183
10.2	Intersections of transnational and 'local' labour regulatory contexts	184
13.1	Number and type of interviews	236
15.1	Call centre growth in Scotland (1997–2011)	275

## Figures

3.1	A post-GVC framework	51
6.1	E-waste circuit of capital	104
9.1	Apparel, value added	158
15.1	Call centre employment (2002–2013)	273

## Acknowledgements

The editors are greatly indebted to the editors of the *Critical Perspectives on Work and Employment* series for the opportunity to compile this book and for their constructive support throughout the publication process. Additional thanks are extended to Paul Thompson for his encouragement throughout the long preparatory period and to the organizers of the International Labour Process Conference at Rutgers University in 2013, who permitted us to organize the stream on global value chains, labour and the labour process from which the chapters derived. The blindingly obvious debt of gratitude must go to the authors of the chapters, without whom there would have been no book! We hope that we have undertaken our editorial duties effectively in relation to your excellent contributions. The editors would also like to extend a sincere thank you to Jessica Bair for her work in compiling the index.

Finally, our appreciation must be extended to the many, many millions of workers who perform surplus generating labour at various nodes of the global value chains. We hope that we have been able to analyse the conditions of their working lives, revealing the hidden abode of labour. After all, behind the shirts we wear is a chain that may link to a Rana Plaza in Bangladesh and behind our shiny mobile devices might lie a Foxconn suicide in Shenzhen. The editors hope that this volume can contribute, however modestly, to improving our understanding of the world in order to change it.

The editors and publishers would like to thank the following for their permission to use copyright material: Escarpment Press for Table 10.1 reprinted from Pries, L. and Seeliger, M. (2013) 'Work and employment relations in a globalized world: the emerging texture of transnational labour regulation', *Global Labor Journal*, 4(1): 26–47.

## Notes on Contributors

**Mark Anner** is Associate Professor of Labour and Employment Relations, and Political Science, and he is Director of the Center for Global Workers' Rights at the Pennsylvania State University. He holds a PhD in Government from Cornell University and a Master's Degree in Latin American Studies from Stanford University. His research examines freedom of association and corporate social responsibility, labour law reform and enforcement, and workers' rights in apparel global value chains with a focus on Central America and Vietnam. He lived in El Salvador for eight years where he worked with labour unions and a labour research centre, and studied economics at the Universidad Centroamérica (UCA).

**Jennifer Bair** is Associate Professor of Sociology at the University of Colorado at Boulder. Her research interests lie at the intersection of political economy and development studies, with a regional focus on Latin America and the Caribbean. She is the editor of *Frontiers of Commodity Chains Research* (2009) and co-editor of *Free Trade and Uneven Development: The North American Apparel Industry after NAFTA* (2002) and *Workers' Rights and Labor Compliance in Global Supply Chains: Is a Social Label the Answer?* (2013). Her publications include articles in the journals *Social Problems*, *World Development*, *Global Networks*, *Economy and Society*, *Signs* and *Environment and Planning A*. Together with Marion Werner, she is currently working on a project examining the emergence, development and diffusion of the Global Value Chain Framework as a new development paradigm. She is also studying issues of labour regulation in supply chains, with a particular focus on the concept of joint liability in subcontracting networks.



**Birgitta Bergvall-Kåreborn** is Professor of Social Informatics at Lulea University of Technology. Her current research interests concern participatory design in distributed and open environments; human-centric and appreciative methodologies for design and learning; as well as the relationship between IT use and IT design.

**Neil M. Coe** is Professor of Economic Geography at the National University of Singapore. His research interests are in the areas of global production networks and local economic development; the geographies of local and transnational labour markets; the geographies of innovation; and institutional and network approaches to economic development. These concerns have been explored through research into computer services, temporary staffing and logistics in the UK, Europe and Asia Pacific, the film and television industry in the UK and Canada, and retailing in the UK, East Asia and Eastern Europe. He has published over 75 articles and book chapters on these topics, and is a co-author of *Spaces of Work: Global Capitalism and the Geographies of Labour* (2003) and *Economic Geography: A Contemporary Introduction* (2013, second edition).

**Stephen Cox** is Director of Higher Degree Research Studies at Queensland University of Technology Business School. He undertakes research examining the development and consequences of power imbalances within global value chains. He has published in leading journals including *Regional Studies* and *Environment and Planning A*.

**Andrew Cumbers** is Professor of Urban and Regional Political Economy in the Adam Smith Business School at the University of Glasgow. He has published widely on urban and regional economic development, employment relations and economic democracy. He is the author of *Reclaiming Public Ownership: Making Space for Economic Democracy* (2012). He is also editor in chief of the international journal *Urban Studies*.

**Jörg Flecker** is Professor of Sociology at the University of Vienna and Chair of the Board of the Working Life Research Centre (FORBA). His main research interests focus on economic internationalization and restructuring, labour process analysis, industrial relations, and work and employment in the public services. Most recent publications include *Privatization of Public Services* (2012, together with Christoph Hermann) and *Im Dienste öffentlicher Güter* (2014, together with Franz Schultheis and Berthold Vogel).

**Bettina Haidinger** is a senior researcher at the Working Life Research Centre (FORBA) in Vienna and an external lecturer for economic policy and sociology of work and migration at the Universities of Vienna and

Linz. Her research includes migration, work and gender relations, industrial relations and employment policy. Recently, she published together with Käthe Knittler the book *Feministische Ökonomie* (2014).

**Nikolaus Hammer** is Lecturer in Employment Studies, School of Management and a member of the Centre for Sustainable Work and Employment Futures, University of Leicester. His research interests centre on work and employment in global value chains, labour process and labour market analysis in emerging economies. He has published in leading journals such as the *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, *European Journal of Industrial Relations* and *Transfer* and is currently the co-editor of *Work, Employment and Society* as part of a team based at the University of Leicester. His current research investigates supply chain relations and working conditions in UK garment manufacturing.

**Andrew Herod** is Distinguished Research Professor of Geography and Adjunct Professor of International Affairs and of Anthropology at the University of Georgia, Athens, GA, USA. He writes frequently on the topic of labour and globalization. He is the author of *Scale* (2010) for the Routledge 'Key Ideas in Geography' Series, *Geographies of Globalization: A Critical Introduction* (2009), and *Labor Geographies: Workers and the Landscapes of Capitalism* (2001). He has edited or co-edited the *Handbook of Employment and Society: Working Space* (2010), *The Dirty Work of Neoliberalism: Cleaners in the Global Economy* (2006), *Geographies of Power: Placing Scale* (2002), *Organizing the Landscape: Geographical Perspectives on Labor Unionism* (1998), and *An Unruly World? Globalization, Governance and Geography* (1998). He is also an elected official, serving as a member of the Unified Government of Athens-Clarke County, Georgia.

**Debra Howcroft** is Professor of Technology and Organization at Manchester Business School and is a member of FairWRC (Fairness at Work Research Centre). She is the co-editor of *New Technology, Work and Employment* and also serves on a number of editorial boards. Her research interests are centred on how technology is influencing and shaping working practices, changing skills and reframing occupational identities. This includes a particular focus on IT workers and their response to workplace change and sectoral trends and developments.

**Jean Jenkins** is Senior Lecturer in Employment Relations at Cardiff Business School, Cardiff University. Her research interests originated in employment relations in manufacturing industry, and she has published on aspects of union strategy. She has a longstanding interest in the British garment sector, and among her publications (with her co-author on that project, Paul Blyton) are several on the Burberry workers'

campaign against factory closure in the UK. In addition to her interests in mobilization theory and the effects of involuntary part-time working in mature economies, that grew out of the Burberry study, her recent research has adopted a wider, international perspective, to reflect the dynamics of the global value chain in garment production. She currently focuses in the main on labour conditions and worker organizing in the Indian garment sector.

**Susan McGrath-Champ** is Associate Professor in the Work and Organisational Studies Discipline at the University of Sydney Business School. Her research interests include the geographical aspects of the world of work, employment relations and international human resource management. Recent research projects include organizations' emergency evacuation policies for international assignees in the not-for-profit and corporate sectors and gender pay equity. Susan was awarded jointly a Swedish-funded International Collaboration Grant (2014–2018) for research concerning the effects of competition and privatization on school teachers' work and working conditions. She is first editor of the *Handbook of Employment and Society: Working Space* (with Andrew Herod and Al Rainnie, 2010). Her work has been published in *Work, Employment and Society*, *Journal of Economic Geography* and *Construction Management and Economics*.

**Kirsty Newsome** is Reader in Employment Relations at the University of Sheffield and Visiting Fellow at the Centre for Sustainable Work and Employment Futures at the University of Leicester. Her research interests are focused around three interconnected themes: the changing character of employment regulation; the shifts and transformations in the politics of production; and the dynamic interplay of global value chains and the labour process. The empirical focus of her research has been concerned with exploring labour process change in the UK supermarket supply chain. Most recently her research has examined the interplay of internal and external forces in the restructuring of the labour process and value chains in retail distribution and logistics. She is a member the research network 'The Changing Nature of Employment in Europe', an international comparative European FP7 Marie Curie Initial Training Network (ITN) coordinated by the University of Strathclyde.

**Rachel Parker** is Professor in the Business School at the Queensland University of Technology, Australia. Her research focuses on the institutional foundations of innovation and industrial competitiveness and power relations in global production networks. Her work has contributed to understandings of the way in which political-institutional environments affect firm and industry behaviour and therefore industrial

development and transformation. Recent projects focus on power relations in global value chains and how they affect the ability of firms to negotiate value for their products and services and to compete in global markets.

**Lee Pegler** is a lecturer (Work, Organisation and Labour Rights) within the Social Policy for Development (SPD) Major at the ISS, The Hague. He spent a large proportion of his early career working as an economic advisor to the Australian Labour Movement. He has a keen interest in labour and developing countries, and more recent times have seen him researching and publishing on the labour implications of 'new' management strategies of Trans National Companies (TNCs) in Latin America. This interest has expanded to a broader focus on the implications of value chain insertion on labour/industrial relations, both for formal and informal workers, in countries such as Brazil, Colombia and Vietnam. He was joint convenor of a national, CERES, cross-institution network on 'Value Chains, Local Economic Development and Social Inclusion'. Most recently he has developed and coordinates an international project (GOLLS) concerning sustainable value chains – one which links ports, logistics and advanced services (in the Netherlands) with production, employment, livelihoods and development questions in Brazil.

**Graham Pickren** is currently Postdoctoral Teaching and Learning Fellow with Vantage College and the Department of Geography at the University of British Columbia. His past research included work on the development of labelling schemes in the electronics recycling industry. He is currently working on a new project examining the labour processes and organization of 'makerspaces', which are technology sharing- and skill-building hubs.

**Al Rainnie** is Honorary Senior Research Fellow, Business School, University of Western Australia, Australia. He has worked at the University of Hertfordshire, Monash University, the University of Leicester and Curtin University. He has written and researched on small firms, industrial relations, regional development, labour process analysis and state restructuring. More recently he has been working on spatiality, work and employment, Global Production Networks, Global Destruction Networks and the role of labour. This work is a joint project with Andrew Herod and Graham Pickren (University of Georgia, US) and Susan McGrath-Champ (Sydney University, Australia).

**Lone Riisgaard** is Assistant Professor in International Development Studies at the Department of Society and Globalisation, Roskilde University. She has researched on sustainability standards, labour rights

issues and global value chain analysis with focus on the cut flower value chain originating in Kenya and Tanzania and published in prominent journals such as *World Development*, *Journal of Agrarian Change* and *Industrial Relations*. She has led research projects for the Fairtrade Labelling Organisation, UNIDO, IFAD, the Danish Foreign Ministry and Traidcraft. Current research interests focus on labour management systems in large-scale agriculture.

**Phil Taylor** is Professor of Work and Employment Studies in the Department of Human Resource Management and also Vice Dean International in Strathclyde Business School at the University of Strathclyde. He has researched and published extensively on employment relations and work organization in call centres for two decades. Other research areas include the globalization of business services, offshoring to India, occupational health and safety, lean working, performance management, trade union organizing and industrial conflict and privatization. He was editor of *Work, Employment and Society* between 2008 and 2011 and is currently co-editor of *New Technology, Work and Employment*. He was a lead member of the groundbreaking project 'The Meaning of Work in the New Economy' in the Economic Research Council's Future of Work Programme.

**Paul Thompson** is Professor of Organisational Analysis at the University of Strathclyde. Informed by labour process theory, his research interests focus on skill and work organization; creative industries and labour; control, resistance and organizational misbehaviour; financialization, value chains and the changing political economy of capitalism. He has published 11 books and over 50 refereed journal articles, and is currently convenor of the International Labour Process Conference and co-editor of the Palgrave Series 'Management, Work and Organization'.

**Marion Werner** is Assistant Professor in the Department of Geography at the University at Buffalo, SUNY. Her research is located at the nexus of critical development studies, feminist theory and political economy with a focus on Latin America and the Caribbean. She brings these theoretical perspectives to her work on the economic restructuring of export industries, the gender and racial politics of labour value, and, more recently, development policy and politics. Her book, *Global Displacements: The Making of Uneven Development in the Caribbean* (2015), unpacks processes of restructuring in the export garment industry to reveal how uneven geographies of capitalist development shape – and are shaped by – the aspirations and everyday struggles of people in the Global South. Her

work has appeared in several academic journals including *Gender, Place and Culture*, *Antipode: A Journal of Radical Geography*, *Economic Geography*, *Environment and Planning A* and *New West Indian Guide*. Marion's current research explores development policy interventions into global supply chains, together with Jennifer Bair, and contemporary food politics and policy in the Dominican Republic.

**Aidan M. Wong** is a post-doctoral fellow at the Department of Geography, National University of Singapore. He recently obtained his PhD from the School of Geography and the School of Business and Management at Queen Mary University of London, and is interested in global value chains, global production networks, the geographies of waste, labour geographies and radical political economy.

# Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	viii
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	ix

<b>1 Putting Labour in its Place: Labour Process Analysis and Global Value Chains</b>	<b>1</b>
Phil Taylor, Kirsty Newsome, Jennifer Bair and Al Rainnie	

## **Part I Integrating Labour Process and Global Value Chains**

<b>2 Value in Motion: Labour and Logistics in the Contemporary Political Economy</b>	<b>29</b>
Kirsty Newsome	
<b>3 Labour and Asymmetric Power Relations in Global Value Chains: The Digital Entertainment Industries and Beyond</b>	<b>45</b>
Paul Thompson, Rachel Parker and Stephen Cox	
<b>4 Positioning Labour in Service Value Chains and Networks: The Case of Parcel Delivery</b>	<b>64</b>
Bettina Haidinger and Jörg Flecker	
<b>5 Labour and Segmentation in Value Chains</b>	<b>83</b>
Nikolaus Hammer and Lone Riisgaard	

- 6 **Articulation of Informal Labour: Interrogating the E-waste Value Chain in Singapore and Malaysia** 100  
Aidan M. Wong

## Part II Unpacking Labour: Power, Agency and Standards

- 7 **Global Production and Uneven Development: When Bringing Labour in isn't Enough** 119  
Jennifer Bair and Marion Werner
- 8 **Understanding Labour's Agency under Globalization: Embedding GPNs within an Open Political Economy** 135  
Andrew Cumbers
- 9 **Social Downgrading and Worker Resistance in Apparel Global Value Chains** 152  
Mark Anner
- 10 **Labour and Global Production Networks: Mapping Variegated Landscapes of Agency** 171  
Neil M. Coe

## Part III Sector Studies

- 11 **The Significance of Grass-Roots Organizing in the Garment and Electrical Value Chains of Southern India** 195  
Jean Jenkins
- 12 **Human Security in Evolving Global Value Chains: Reconsidering Labour Agency in a Livelihoods Context** 213  
Lee Pegler
- 13 **The Apple Ecosystem and App Developers: A GPN Analysis** 231  
Birgitta Bergvall-Kåreborn and Debra Howcroft
- 14 **Wasted Commodities, Wasted Labour? Global Production and Destruction Networks and the Nature of Contemporary Capitalism** 249  
Al Rainnie, Andrew Herod, Susan McGrath-Champ and Graham Pickren
- 15 **Labour and the Changing Landscapes of the Call Centre** 266  
Phil Taylor



# Putting Labour in its Place: Labour Process Analysis and Global Value Chains

Phil Taylor, Kirsty Newsome,  
Jennifer Bair and Al Rainnie

The objective of this edited volume in the *Critical Perspectives on Work and Employment* series is to explore the interrelationships – theoretically and empirically – between the labour process and labour process theory (LPT), on the one hand, and global value chains (GVC) and related frameworks, such as global commodity chains (GCC) and global production networks (GPN), on the other. Until relatively recently the extent of convergence between these two bodies of work had been quite undeveloped. In summary, GCC, GVC and GPN theorizing and research, notwithstanding significant distinctions between them (Bair, 2008), neglected or *generally* understated labour as an analytical category (Smith *et al.*, 2002; Cumbers *et al.*, 2008), while conversely LPT *generally* eschewed the significance of these various global frameworks.

It is no longer legitimate to claim the categorical omission of labour in studies of global production networks. This objection remained largely valid in terms of GVC research, which, following Gereffi *et al.*'s (2005) influential theory of GVC governance, has tended to concentrate on inter-sectoral and firm linkages in ways that minimize the concerns of labour (Gibbon *et al.*, 2008). Yet with the emergence of the 'Manchester school' and the development of an alternative GPN more attention was given to the importance of labour within the matrix of factors that help to explain global geographies of production and exchange (Henderson *et al.*, 2002; Coe *et al.*, 2004). When Henderson *et al.* (2002: 448) stated that GPNs should acknowledge the 'conditions under which labour power is converted into actual labour through the labour process', they hinted not merely at the general inclusion of