THE MODERN LAW OF MARINE INSURANCE VOLUME 4

EDITED BY
PROFID RHIDIAN THOMAS

informa law from Routledge

THE MODERN LAW OF MARINE INSURANCE

VOLUME FOUR

EDITED BY

PROFESSOR D. RHIDIAN THOMAS

informa law from Routledge First published 2016 by Informa Law from Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Informa Law from Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Informa Law from Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an Informa business

© 2016 selection and editorial matter, Professor D. Rhidian Thomas; individual chapters, the contributors

The right of the editor to be identified as the author of the editorial material, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data Library of Congress Control Number: 2010288227

ISBN: 978-1-138-89139-5 eISBN: 978-1-315-68963-0

Typeset in Plantin By Apex CoVantage, LLC



THE MODERN LAW OF MARINE INSURANCE VOLUME FOUR

MARITIME AND TRANSPORT LAW LIBRARY

The Modern Law of Marine Insurance Volume Four edited by D. Rhidian Thomas (2016)

Ship Building, Sale and Finance edited by Bariş Soyer and Andrew Tettenborn (2016)

> International Maritime Conventions Volume Three Protection of the Marine Environment by Francesco Berlingieri (2016)

International Maritime Conventions
Volume Two
Navigation, Securities, Limitation of Liability
and Jurisdiction
by Francesco Berlingieri
(2015)

Maritime Law
3rd edition
edited by Yvonne Baatz
(2015)

Offshore Contracts and Liabilities by Bariş Soyer and Andrew Tettenborn (2015)

> Marine Insurance Fraud by Bariş Soyer (2015)

International Maritime Conventions
Volume One
The Carriage of Goods and Passengers by Sea
by Francesco Berlingieri
(2014)

International Carriage of Goods by Road: CMR
6th Edition
by Malcolm A. Clarke
(2014)

The Maritime Labour Convention 2006: International Labour Law Redefined edited by Jennifer Lavelle (2014)

Modern Maritime Law:
Volume 2: Managing Risks and Liabilities
3rd Edition
by Aleka Mandaraka-Sheppard
(2014)

Modern Maritime Law: Volume 1: Jurisdiction and Risks 3rd Edition by Aleka Mandaraka-Sheppard (2014)

Carriage of Goods by Sea, Land and Air: Uni-Modal and Multi- Modal Transport in the 21st Century edited by Bariş Soyer and Andrew Tettenborn (2014)

The Law of Yachts and Yachting by Filippo Lorenzon and Richard Coles (2013)

> Freight Forwarding and Multimodal Transport Contracts 2nd edition by David A. Glass (2013)

Marine Insurance Clauses
5th Edition
by N. Geoffrey Hudson, Tim Madge
and Keith Sturges
(2013)

Pollution at Sea: Law and Liability edited by Bariş Soyer and Andrew Tettenborn (2013)

> Contracts of Carriage by Air 2nd Edition by Malcolm A. Clarke (2011)

Places of Refuge: International Law and the CMI Draft Convention by Eric Van Hooydonk (2011)

> Maritime Fraud and Piracy 2nd Edition by Paul Todd (2011)

The Carriage of Goods by Sea under the Rotterdam Rules edited by D. Rhidian Thomas (2011)

The International Law of the Shipmaster by John A. C. Cartner, Richard P. Fiske and Tara L. Leiter (2010) The Modern Law of Marine Insurance: Volume 3 edited by D. Rhidian Thomas (2010)

The Rotterdam Rules: A Practical Annotation by Yvonne Baatz, Charles Debattista, Filippo Lorenzon, Andrew Serdy, Hilton Staniland and Michael Tsimplis (2010)

> Risk and Liability in Air Law by George Leloudas (2010)

The Evolving Law and Practice of Voyage Charters
Edited by D. Rhidian Thomas
(2009)

Legal Issues Relating to Time Charterparties edited by D. Rhidian Thomas (2008)

Contracts of Carriage by Land and Air 2nd Edition by Malcolm A. Clarke and David Yates (2008)

Bills of Lading and Bankers' Documentary Credits 4th Edition by Paul Todd (2008)

Liability Regimes in Contemporary Maritime Law edited by D. Rhidian Thomas (2007)

Marine Insurance: The Law in Transition edited by D. Rhidian Thomas (2007) Commencement of Laytime 4th Edition edited by Donald Davies (2006)

General Average: Law and Practice 2nd Edition by F. D. Rose (2005)

War, Terror and Carriage by Sea by Keith Michel (2005)

> Port State Control 2nd Edition by Oya Ozcayir (2005)

Modern Law of Marine Insurance: Volume Two edited by D. Rhidian Thomas (2003)

Commercial and Maritime Statutes edited by Peter Macdonald Eggers and Simon Picken (2001)

Bills of Lading: Law and Contracts by Nicholas Gaskell, Regina Asariotis and Yvonne Baatz (2001)

> Shipbrokers and the Law by Andrew Jamieson (1997)

PREFACE

This volume continues the overarching objective of the series which is to identify and analyse evolving strands in the law and practice relating to marine insurance, and to provide a source of knowledge and understanding which supplements that provided by works of reference and traditional textbooks. The evolutionary momentum of the subject continues tirelessly, placing an ever growing challenge in the path of anyone who out of necessity or interest is driven to keep abreast of developments. In the field of marine insurance there has always existed an intimate relation between law, practice and the markets, and these various dimensions continue to find expression in the wide-ranging content of this fourth volume, which comprises ten contributions written by acknowledged experts, drawn from practice and academia.

The new century has witnessed major developments in both market practice and the law. Commencing with the publication of the London Market Principles in 2001, and thereafter sustained by amendments and numerous related initiatives, the ethos and practice of the London market have been radically reformulated, establishing a new and welcomed emphasis on contractual certainty, fair dealing and the raising of professional standards. This movement has also been responsible for the emergence of new placement documentation.

Concurrently with these market developments, the Law Commissions for England and Wales, and for Scotland, have been industriously employed identifying areas of the law which have attracted criticism or concern, or which may now be regarded as archaic, and subjecting them to detailed scrutiny. This review was not expressly directed at marine insurance, rather to business insurance generally, but since the basic legal principles set out in the Marine Insurance Act 1906 reflect the general legal position, it was inevitable that crucial aspects of the 1906 Act would be critically reassessed. It is also the case that over the course of the review certain specific matters relating to marine insurance came to be identified.

Of greatest significance to date, the deliberations of the Commissions were responsible for the enactment of the Insurance Act 2015, which applies throughout the UK and relates to non-consumer insurance contracts. The main provisions of the Act are of significant relevance to marine insurance but do not come into force until August 2016. This, presumably, is to give the markets time to digest and adjust to the amendments it makes. These relate to the duty of good faith, pre-contract duties in placing the risk, and warranties and analogous policy conditions. The Act also for the first time enacts a statutory provision relating to fraudulent claims. Although this volume is not expressly directed to an exposition of the 2015 Act,

some contributions relate to or touch upon areas of the law covered by the Act and when this is the case the opportunity has been taken to comment on the prospective impact of the new legislation.

The topics addressed in this volume range significantly beyond those covered by the 2015 Act. In their entirety they focus on many of the principal and diverse issues extant in the contemporary law and practice, ranging from a broad assessment of the Marine Insurance Act 1906 to the doctrine of subrogation and the impact of the recast EC Regulation 2015. Between these extremes the focus is directed at the construction of policies, litigation against brokers, leading underwriter clauses, the duty of good faith of insurers and reinsurers, fraudulent claims, assured's right to interest under an avoided policy, and cargo insurance. All of which ensures that this volume continues to fulfil the policy underlying the Modern Law of Marine Insurance series.

FOREWORD

. THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FLAUX

The latest volume of *The Modern Law of Marine Insurance* brings together a number of eminent academic lawyers and practitioners who are experts in this somewhat arcane area of English commercial law. They have contributed a series of chapters which consider a number of problems of marine insurance law many of which can be described as "old chestnuts" for those who seek to argue and resolve these disputes. The topics covered are the continuing impact of the Marine Insurance Act 1906 in the light of the new legislative regime, the effect of that regime on the insurer's duty of good faith, the effect of the modern approach to contract construction on marine insurance contracts, leading underwriter clauses, the problems of assessment of damages recoverable from negligent brokers, the effect of fraud on an otherwise valid claim, the insured's right to interest on returned premium when the contract of insurance is avoided, the scope of the defence of inherent vice, the place of the doctrine of subrogation in insurance law and the effectiveness of English jurisdiction agreements in insurance contracts.

Without exception the authors have provided a thought-provoking analysis of many of the difficult problems of marine insurance with which commercial lawyers have to grapple. This volume provides a valuable addition to the corpus of academic writing on marine insurance law. The editor and contributors are to be commended for their choice of topics and the fresh light they cast on the problems addressed. This excellent volume will be welcomed by all lawyers who have to steer a course through the sometimes choppy waters of the law of marine insurance.

Julian Flaux September 2015

Professor Emeritus D. Rhidian Thomas

Professor Emeritus of Maritime Law, Founding Director of the Institute of International Shipping and Trade Law Swansea University

Professor Thomas is Professor Emeritus of Maritime Law and Founder Director of the Institute of International Shipping and Trade Law, College of Law, Swansea University, Wales, UK. Previously he taught at Cardiff University and the University of East Anglia in the UK, and has held visiting professorships at universities in Europe, Scandinavia, Far East and North America. In 2011–2012 he held the Francqui Chair at the University of Leuven, Belgium and is currently visiting professor at the University of Gothenburg, Sweden.

He is Editor-in-Chief of the Journal of International Maritime Law, and a member of the editorial board of Shipping & Trade Law. He is also a member of the Comite Maritime International (and of the International Working Group on marine insurance), British Maritime Law Association, Chartered Institute of Arbitrators and British Insurance Law Association.

His principal teaching and research interests are in the fields of maritime and shipping law, marine insurance law, international trade law and commercial arbitration. He has written, edited and contributed to many books and published widely in academic and professional journals. He edited and contributed to the preceding volumes in the Modern Law of Marine Insurance series.

He is a frequent speaker at conferences and seminars, and also acts as an expert witness and consultant.

Contributors

Professor Yvonne Baatz

Institute of Maritime Law University of Southampton

PROFESSOR YVONNE BAATZ qualified as a solicitor in 1981. She practised with two leading firms of solicitors in the City of London, specialising in shipping litigation. In 1991 she moved to the University of Southampton where she is

Professor of Maritime Law. She was Director of the Institute of Maritime Law at the University of Southampton from 2003 until 2006 and remains a Member. Her interests include carriage of goods by sea, conflict of laws and marine insurance, and she has published widely in these areas.

Claire Blanchard QC

Essex Court Chambers

CLAIRE BLANCHARD QC, of Essex Court Chambers, London, has a specialist commercial practice and is an experienced advocate, both in court and in international arbitration, and has appeared at all levels in the English courts. She has experience across a broad range of commercial disputes, as well as particular expertise in matters relating to energy and natural resources, insurance and reinsurance, international trade and shipping. Her cases include Metall Market OOO v Vitorio Shipping, The "Lehmann Timber"; Global Process Systems v Syarikat Takaful Malaysia, The "Cendor MOPU"; Agapitos v Agnew, The "Aegeon"; Commercial Court actions and arbitrations relating to the petrochemical industry, including offshore construction and the litigation arising from the Buncefield tank farm explosion; shipbuilding, ship finance and ship sale disputes; shipping and commodities cases, raising a diverse range of issues relating to contracts of sale, bills of lading and charterparties; and Arbitration Act 1996 applications.

Claire is one of the editors of Arnould: Law of Marine Insurance and Average 17th ed (2008) and 18th ed (2013). She is also an experienced advocacy trainer.

Professor Sarah Derrington

Quadrant Chambers

PROFESSOR SARAH DERRINGTON is a Barrister in Brisbane, specialising in maritime and shipping law, and is the Co-Editor of the Queensland Reports, published by the Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for the State of Queensland. Formerly Professor of Admiralty Law at The University of Queensland and Director of the Marine and Shipping Law Unit (MASLU), she re-joined The University of Queensland as Head of School and Dean of Law in July 2013.

John Dunt

Clyde & Co LLP; University of Southampton

JOHN DUNT is a Senior Research Fellow at the Institute of Maritime Law and a Consultant with the international law firm Clyde & Co LLP.

John is author of Marine Cargo Insurance (winner of the 2010 British Insurance Law Association prize) published by Informa in August 2009 as part of the Lloyd's Shipping Law Library. He is also author and editor of International Cargo Insurance, published in 2012 by Informa as a companion volume to Marine Cargo Insurance. His other publications include the chapter on the revised Institute Cargo Clauses 2009 (with William Melbourne, Consultant, Clyde & Co LLP, London) published in 2009 in Volume 3 of The Modern Law of Marine Insurance and the chapter on

Double Insurance (with Wayne Jones, Partner, Clyde & Co LLP, Dubai) in *Insurance Disputes*, Informa, 3rd ed (2011).

David Foxton QC

Essex Court Chambers

DAVID FOXTON QC practises in commercial law in both court and arbitration from Essex Court Chambers. His practice includes all forms of insurance disputes. He is a Visiting Professor at the University of Nottingham.

Christopher Hancock QC

20 Essex Street Chambers

CHRISTOPHER HANCOCK QC took silk in 2000. He was appointed as a Recorder in 2004, and a deputy high court judge in 2008. He has appeared before courts at all levels, including the High Court, Court of Appeal, House of Lords and Privy Council. He is a CEDR accredited mediator and a Fellow of the Chartered Institute of Arbitrators. He is the former Chairman of COMBAR, having been vice chairman from 2007 to 2009, and is a member of the BMLA (having sat on its Carriage of Goods by Sea Committee for many years) and a supporting member of the LMAA.

Thomas Leary

20 Essex Street Chambers

THOMAS LEARY is a barrister specialising in commercial litigation and arbitration at 20 Essex Street. He studied law at Christ Church, Oxford, Leiden University and the University of Toronto before being called to the Bar in 2012. He was editor of the law reports for the Cayman Islands, Gibraltar and Guernsey from 2013 to 2014 and worked at the Supreme Court as the Judicial Assistant to Lord Mance from 2014 to 2015.

Peter MacDonald Eggers QC 7KBW

PETER MACDONALD EGGERS QC is a barrister practising at 7 King's Bench Walk, specialising in all aspects of commercial law, with a particular emphasis on insurance and reinsurance, shipping, energy, commodities, international trade and international arbitration. Educated at the University of Sydney and the University of Cambridge, Peter practised as a solicitor before being called to the Bar by the Middle Temple in 1999. He was appointed a Queen's Counsel in 2011. He is co-author of Good Faith and Insurance Contracts, a contributor to Marine Insurance: The Law in Transition and Reforming Marine and Commercial Insurance Law, author of Deceit: The Lie of the Law, a contributor to Modern Piracy: Legal Challenges and Responses, and a Contributing Editor of Chitty on Contracts. He is a Visiting Professor at University College, London and a Visiting Fellow at the Institute of International Shipping and Trade Law.

William Melbourne

Clyde & Co LLP

WILLIAM MELBOURNE is a Consultant with the international law firm Clyde & Co LLP. He specialises in marine and trade-related insurance, in particular marine cargo insurance, and also including hull, marine liability and political and credit risk insurance and related litigation and dispute resolution, including arbitration (ICC, LCIA and UNCITRAL) and mediation. He has written articles and lectures on marine insurance topics. William was a member of the London Market Joint Cargo Committee's Cargo Clauses Working Party responsible for producing the Institute Cargo Clauses 2009.

Professor Robert Merkin QC

Lloyd's Professor of Commercial Law Exeter University

PROFESSOR ROBERT MERKIN QC is Professor of Commercial Law at the University of Exeter, Honorary Professor of Law at the University of Auckland, Visiting Professor at the University of Hong Kong and The University of Queensland, and consultant to DLA Phillips Piper. He is past president of the British Insurance Law Association, vice-president of the International Association of Insurance Law (AIDA) and was a consultant to the English and Scottish Law Commissions for their project on the reform of insurance law. In 2009 he was Distinguished Visitor for the Singapore Academy of Law, in 2010 he was awarded a prize by the Australian Insurance Law Association for his contribution to insurance law, and in 2012 he was appointed to the Hotung Fellowship by the University of Canterbury, Christchurch, to deliver a series of lectures on earthquake insurance. In 2014 he was awarded a higher doctorate (LLD) by Cardiff University and acted as Special Adviser to the House of Lords Special Public Bills Committee on the Insurance Bill (now Act). In 2015 he was made a QC honoris causa by the Crown.

Professor Barış Soyer

Director Institute of International Shipping and Trade Law Swansea University

PROFESSOR SOYER is the Director of the Institute of International Shipping and Trade Law at Swansea University. He is a member of the British Maritime Law Association and British Insurance Law Association. He is the author of Warranties in Marine Insurance published by Cavendish Publishing (2001) and Marine Insurance Fraud published by Informa Law from Routledge in 2014, and of an extensive list of journal articles published in elite journals such as Lloyd's Maritime and Commercial Law Quarterly, Journal of Business Law, Torts Law Journal, Berkeley Journal of International Law, and Journal of Contract Law. His book on Warranties in Marine Insurance was the joint winner of the Cavendish Book Prize 2001 and was awarded the British Insurance Law Association Charitable Trust Book Prize in 2002 for its

contribution to insurance literature. A new edition of this book was published in 2006. He is also the general editor of the Reforming Marine and Commercial Insurance Law published by Informa in 2008 and joint editor of Pollution at Sea: Law and Liability published by Informa Law in 2012, Carriage of Goods by Sea, Land and Air published by Informa Law from Routledge in 2013, and Offshore Contracts and Liabilities published by Informa Law from Routledge in 2014. He has also contributed to various books including Modern Law of Marine Insurance volumes 2 and 3, Marine Insurance: The Law in Transition, Liability Regimes in Contemporary Maritime Law and Legal Issues relating to Time Charterparties. He is one of the editors of the Journal of International Maritime Law and is also on the editorial board of Shipping and Trade Law and Baltic Maritime Law Quarterly. He currently teaches Admiralty Law, Oil and Gas Law, and Marine Insurance on the LLM Programme and also is the Head of the Postgraduate Legal Studies Department.

Professor Andrew Tettenborn

Professor in Law Institute of International Shipping and Trade Law Swansea University

PROFESSOR ANDREW TETTENBORN has been attached to the IISTL at Swansea Law School since 2010.

He has also taught at the universities of Cambridge, Exeter and Geneva, has written extensively on widespread aspects of private, shipping and commercial law, and sits on the editorial board of Lloyd's Maritime & Commercial Law Quarterly. He has held visiting positions at Melbourne University, the University of Connecticut and at Case Law School, Cleveland, Ohio. He is author and co-author of books on torts, damages, and maritime law, and of numerous articles and chapters on aspects of common law, commercial aw and restitution.

OUTLINE CONTENTS

Authors' Biograf Table of Cases Table of Legislati		xvii xxiii xli
CHAPTER 1	MARINE INSURANCE ACT 1906: MAGNIFICENT ACHIEVEMENT OR MONSTROUS ABERRATION Professor Robert Merkin QC and Professor Sarah Derrington	-1
CHAPTER 2	NEW PARAMETERS IN CONSTRUING INSURANCE CONTRACTS Professor Barış Soyer	43
CHAPTER 3	THE NEGLIGENT BROKER: THREE PROBLEMS IN THE ASSESSMENT OF DAMAGES Professor Andrew Tettenborn	67
CHAPTER 4	CO-INSURANCE AND LEADING UNDERWRITER CLAUSES Professor Emeritus D. Rhidian Thomas	79
CHAPTER 5	THE INSURER'S OBLIGATIONS OF GOOD FAITH AND THE INSURANCE ACT 2015 Christopher Hancock QC and Thomas Leary	109
CHAPTER 6	THE FRAUDULENT CLAIMS PRINCIPLE: THE MENTAL ELEMENT Claire Blanchard QC	131
CHAPTER 7	THE INSURED'S RIGHT TO INTEREST WHEN THE PREMIUM IS TENDERED FOLLOWING THE AVOIDANCE OF AN	
	INSURANCE CONTRACT David Foxton QC	151

OUTLINE CONTENTS

CHAPTER 8	THE IMPACT OF THE CENDOR MOPU ON THE	
	INSTITUTE CARGO CLAUSES	161
	John Dunt and William Melbourne	_ &
CHAPTER 9	THE PLACE OF SUBROGATION IN	
	INSURANCE LAW: THE DECEPTIVE DEPTHS	
	OF A DIFFICULT DOCTRINE	191
	Peter MacDonald Eggers QC	
		5.
CHAPTER 10	THE EFFECTIVENESS OF AN ENGLISH	
	JURISDICTION AGREEMENT IN A MARINE	
	INSURANCE POLICY AND SETTLEMENT	
	AGREEMENT OF CLAIMS UNDER	
	THAT POLICY	219
	Professor Yvonne Baatz	
Appendices		241
Insurance Act 2015		243
An Annotated Vers	tion of the Marine Insurance Act 1906 as amended	
by Insurance Act 2015		
Consumer Insurance (Disclosure and Representations) Act 2012		
Index		

DETAILED CONTENTS

Authors' Biogra	phies	xvii	
Table of Cases		xxiii	
Table of Legislan	tion	xli	
CHAPTER 1	MARINE INSURANCE ACT 1906: MAGN	IFICENT	
	ACHIEVEMENT OR MONSTROUS ABER	RRATION 1	
	Professor Robert Merkin QC and Professor Sarah	Derrington	
Introduction		1	
The Marine	Insurance Act 1906	1	
The legacy o	f Lloyd's	3	
Issues with c		4	
Scope of the le	gislation and formation issues	6	
	of the "marine adventure"	6	
_	of the policy document	8	
The "insural	ole interest" requirement	- 11	
Utmost good faith			
Structure of	the legislation	14	
	of "utmost good faith"	15	
The assured	's pre-contractual duty	16	
	s of the assured	25	
Warranties		25	
Coverage		31	
Proximate ca	ause	31	
"Perils of the	e sea"	32	
Collision liab	pility	34	
The Inchma	ree Clause	34	
Loss and inder	nnity	35	
Measure of indemnity			
Constructive	e total loss	36	
Abandonment and notice of abandonment			
Suing and la	bouring	38	
Concluding re	marks	39	