DYCUS BERNEY BANKS RAVEN-HANSEN VLADECK

NATIONAL SECURITY LAW

Sixth Edition



NATIONAL SECURITY LAW

Sixth Edition

Stephen Dycus

Professor of Law Vermont Law School

Arthur L. Berney

Professor Emeritus Boston College

William C. Banks

Director, Institute for National Security and Counterterrorism (INSCT) Board of Advisors Distinguished Professor Syracuse University

Peter Raven-Hansen

Glen Earl Weston Research Professor of Law Co-director, National Security and U.S. Foreign Relations Law Program George Washington University

Stephen I. Vladeck

Professor of Law University of Texas School of Law Copyright © 2016 Stephen Dycus, Arthur L. Berney, William C. Banks, Peter Raven-Hansen and Stephen I. Vladeck.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory US serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.WKLegaledu.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.WKLegaledu.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer Attn: Order Department PO Box 990 Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1234567890

ISBN 978-1-4548-6832-3

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Dycus, Stephen, author.

Title: National security law / Stephen Dycus, Professor of Law, Vermont Law School, Arthur L. Berney, Professor Emeritus, Boston College, William C. Banks, Director, Institute for National Security and Counterterrorism (INSCT) Board of Advisors Distinguished Professor, Syracuse University, Peter Raven-Hansen, Glen Earl Weston Research Professor of Law, Co-director, National Security and U.S. Foreign Relations Law Program George Washington University, Stephen I. Vladeck, Professor of Law, University of Texas School of Law.

Description: Sixth edition. | New York : Wolters Kluwer, 2016. | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016010333 | ISBN 9781454868323

Subjects: LCSH: National security-Law and legislation-United States. Classification: LCC KF4651 .N377 2016 | DDC 343.73/01-dc23

LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2016010333



About Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory US

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory US delivers expert content and solutions in the areas of law, corporate compliance, health compliance, reimbursement, and legal education. Its practical solutions help customers successfully navigate the demands of a changing environment to drive their daily activities, enhance decision quality and inspire confident outcomes.

Serving customers worldwide, its legal and regulatory portfolio includes products under the Aspen Publishers, CCH Incorporated, Kluwer Law International, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs names. They are regarded as exceptional and trusted resources for general legal and practice-specific knowledge, compliance and risk management, dynamic workflow solutions, and expert commentary.

To our teachers

In the last edition of this casebook, we noted that, since the terrorist attacks of 9/11, judicial challenges, legislative initiatives, and executive reforms had produced more durable structures, processes, and institutions for counterterrorism, if not for the national security field generally. These trends continue. In this edition we expand and deepen our treatment of some subjects (especially electronic surveillance, military detention, and military trials), shorten others in which controversies have been at least partly mitigated through reforms (interrogation), and add new ones to keep abreast of change (cyber operations) or to improve comprehension (extraterritoriality).

The Framework chapters in Part I remain the core of the book, with materials on the President, Congress, and the courts sharpened and updated. The chapter on the judicial role in national security now treats not only what the late Judge Harold Greene used to call "the usual suspects" (as in, "The Justice Department has rounded up the usual suspects on the government's motion to dismiss"), but also two other recurring obstacles to judicial review of national security activities: the unavailability of *Bivens* actions and the defense of qualified immunity.

The courts' sometimes crabbed view of the extraterritorial reach of U.S. law has posed another barrier to judicial intervention. Thus, in Part II, International Law and "Our Law," we have added a new chapter collecting key cases on extraterritoriality to give readers an early understanding of the basic principles. In addition to Reid v. Covert and United States v. Verdugo-Urquidez, the principal cases include Kiobel v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co. and the Fifth Circuit's controversial 2015 cross-border shooting decision, Hernandez v. United States.

In Part III, Using Force Abroad, we have streamlined chapters on the Vietnam War and the War Powers Resolution, and on the collective and unilateral uses of force abroad, adding ripped-from-the-headlines coverage of the ongoing fight in Syria and Iraq against the Islamic State. The chapter on Targeting Terrorists has also been revised to incorporate Department of Justice analyses. The most significant change, however, is the addition of a new chapter on Cyber Operations, including excerpts of the 2015 Department of Defense *Law of War Manual*.

In Part IV, Intelligence Operations and Collection, we have reorganized the chapters to make them more nearly comprehensible and easier to teach, especially in light of developments since the last edition. Chapter 16 now describes what the intelligence community does: collection and covert operations. Chapter 17 collects the relevant legal authorities in one place and describes the organization of the community. Chapters 18 and 19 then address covert operations and a range of secret

XXXİV

activities that may escape effective oversight. Chapters 20-23 focus on searches and surveillance. Given the controversy and litigation accompanying the disclosure of the NSA's bulk collection programs (in large part by the Edward Snowden leaks), we now have devoted a separate chapter to that subject. Finally, Chapter 24, on screening and profiling, has been enriched by the inclusion of recent cases that suggest a growing judicial willingness to tackle issues posed by watch listing, no-fly decisions, and profiling.

Part V, Detaining Terrorist Suspects, has also been reorganized. The importance of habeas corpus — and the typical unfamiliarity of our students with its origin, scope, and operation — justified separating treatment of the structure of the Suspension Clause from its scope, and separating both from the substantive law of military detention. We have also separated the treatment of military detention of U.S. persons and of non-U.S. persons, and re-framed the chapter on "preventive" detention to include a broader overview of *all* non-criminal detention authorities within the civilian law enforcement paradigm.

Part VI, Interrogating Terrorist Suspects, has been streamlined, and a case study

of coercive interrogation is presented in a separate chapter.

The march of case law has also caused us to reorganize Part VII, Prosecuting Threats to National Security. We now treat separately the procedural path to terrorism trials (including the debate over *Miranda* warnings and the application of speedy trial protections) and the evidentiary issues that arise from the prevalence of classified information in such cases, before turning to trial by military commission—a subject that has also evolved dramatically in recent years.

Part VIII, Homeland Security, details in two chapters the legal components of the homeland security apparatus that has grown rapidly in the years since 9/11, as

well as the domestic role of the military.

Finally, Part IX, Obtaining and Protecting National Security Information, continues to treat subjects ranging from citizens' access to government records, to the punishment of unauthorized leaks, to censorship. This material has taken on new importance with recent Espionage Act prosecutions of suspected leakers and related threats to freedom of the press.

* * *

The rapid growth of the field and, therefore, of these materials, underscores one of the main challenges to teaching and learning national security law. The original sources included here—judicial opinions, statutes, executive orders, and the like—often lack clarity or coherence, and they typically raise as many questions as they answer. We nevertheless rely on such materials because they are the stock in trade of lawyers working in the field and of political decision makers. They reflect the state of the law, such as it is, and they illustrate the law's very dynamic character.

A mastery of this subject necessarily requires considerable patience and devotion. In this edition of the casebook we have redoubled our efforts to guide students and faculty alike in their study. Each principal judicial opinion (and some other primary material) is now preceded by a visually distinct "read-in" box that identifies key issues raised by the opinion that follows. Notes and Questions have been reorganized and streamlined to address many of these same issues. Finally, we have provided a boxed "Summary of Basic Principles" at the end of each chapter. These are *not* intended and should *not* be used as "black letter law." Instead, they provide an opportunity to rehearse and put into perspective what we believe to be

Preface

the core concepts in each chapter. They also serve as a reminder that in this complex, rapidly evolving field, there still are more questions than answers.

Even a book as up to date as this one is, however, unavoidably incomplete. Courts continue to write opinions at a rapid clip, new sausage is being made (if at a somewhat slower pace) up on the Hill, and officials in the defense and intelligence communities scramble to respond to a bewildering variety of new security threats. Constant attention to these developments is essential. We therefore urge our students to read a national newspaper, and in most classes a discussion of current events lends a special sense of urgency to our assigned readings. Further updates are provided by annual published supplements to this casebook and by additional edited original materials that will be made available to teachers on the book's web site throughout each year.

Perhaps because of the importance of the subject matter, hardly any course in the curriculum is likely to provoke stronger feelings or more spirited debate. In our classrooms we encourage that debate, while at the same time demanding respect for everyone's opinions. So in this casebook we have tried to fuel that debate by fairly presenting both sides of the most contentious issues. We also have repeatedly stressed the strong interdependence of law and policy, and of the critical role of politics in shaping and implementing law. We have opinions, too, however, and we dare not hope that we have always been politically or ideologically neutral. We only wish to emphasize that national security is too important to be left to either "conservative" or "liberal" characterizations. Good legal analysis and the nation's future security depend on a careful consideration of all points of view.

In spite of—and perhaps because of—its inherent difficulty and political sensitivity, we believe that teaching and learning National Security Law will be more fun and more rewarding than ever in the years to come. And we hope that this book contributes to the indispensable work that lawyers do in keeping this nation safe

and free. As always, we welcome your feedback and suggestions.

Stephen Dycus William C. Banks Peter Raven-Hansen Stephen I. Vladeck

February 2016

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Stephen Dycus owes a special debt of gratitude to Alan B. Sherr and the late Reverend William Sloane Coffin Jr., whose independent, nearly simultaneous suggestions provided the genesis for this book. I am also especially grateful to my wife Elizabeth for her many sacrifices during its preparation. Thanks are due to Dean Jesse H. Choper and the faculty at Boalt Hall and to the late William A. Brockett for their hospitality during a sabbatical leave, to Colonel Dennis R. Hunt and the faculty of the Law Department at the U.S. Military Academy, West Point, and to my colleagues at Vermont Law School. I also want to recognize the contributions of a long succession of bright, energetic research assistants, now too numerous to list here individually. Finally, I am grateful for the opportunity to undertake this work with four wonderful coauthors, who have become best friends in the process.

William Banks dedicates this edition to the memory of Brady Howell, a former National Security Law student and victim of the September 11 attack on the Pentagon. Thanks to the law and graduate students at Syracuse who have helped test drive many of these materials over the years, through successive editions. Thanks, too, to a group of fine research assistants who supported my work on this and earlier editions. The best part of this project has always been working with the finest co-authors and best friends any of us could ask for. We are so happy to have Steve Vladeck on our team, and all of us know that Steve Dycus makes everything we write a little better.

Peter Raven-Hansen thanks my able and careful research assistants, George Washington University Law School students Ann Daniels and Uma Richardson, for their invaluable assistance. Thank you, too, to my friends and co-authors for keeping this project fun and challenging (and to Steve Vladeck for joining this hardy band, thus raising its average national security IQ by double digits). Special thanks and respect to our commander in chief, Steve Dycus, who led this time from multiple locations. Without him, there would be no book. Finally, thank you, as always, to my wife Winnie for enduring (but encouraging) yet another edition.

Steve Vladeck thanks his co-authors, colleagues, and friends, Bill Banks, Steve Dycus, and Peter Raven-Hansen, for their camaraderie, collegiality, and tutelage—and for providing a model of scholarly engagement and pedagogical thoughtfulness to which we all can and should aspire. He also thanks Claudio Grossman for his unwavering support of this project (and many others) during his tenure as Dean of the Washington College of Law; students in his Fall 2015 National Security Law class, who patiently and thoughtfully served as guinea pigs for much of the new

material in this edition; and, most importantly, his family — Karen, Madeleine, and

Roxy—for everything that can't be put into words.

This work would not have been started and could not have been completed without the efforts of our esteemed original coauthor, Arthur Berney. Arthur thinks and writes with piercing clarity. His brilliant case study on the *Pentagon Papers* case, which appears in a somewhat modified form at the end of the book, is a perennial favorite of students and of ours. Arthur provided inspiration and moral leadership for the book. He is kind to a fault, yet stubborn when it comes to speaking the truth. In the Preface to the First Edition he wrote, "I did what little I could" to promote understanding of the work of lawyers as peacemakers. He was far too modest. We remain enormously grateful to Arthur for his original contributions and for his continuing friendship.

Together, the authors deeply appreciate the support and encouragement of the staff at Little, Brown and WoltersKluwer, especially our long-time Publisher and friend, Carol McGeehan, and Senior Managing Editor John Devins, and our outside editors, Lori Wood, Patrick Cline, and Troy Froebe. We would also like to thank Kyle Lundin, Syracuse University College of Law, J.D. 2016, for excellent work in

compiling the Index and Table of Cases.

The authors also gratefully acknowledge permission to reprint excerpts or to reproduce images from the following:

Abrams, Floyd. Telegram from John Mitchell. Reprinted by permission.

Associate Justice Robert H. Jackson. Photograph. Courtesy of the Collection of the Supreme Court of the United States.

Borosage, Robert L., *Para-Legal Authority and Its Perils*, 40 Law & Contemp. Probs. 166 (1976). Copyright © 1976 by Duke University School of Law. Reprinted by permission of the author and Law and Contemporary Problems.

Elvis Presley and President Nixon, 1970. Photograph. Courtesy of the National Security Archive from the National Archives and Records Administration.

Inglesby, Thomas, Rita Grossman & Tara O'Toole, *A Plague on Your City: Observations from TOPOFF*, 32 Clinical Infectious Diseases 436 (2001). Copyright © 2001 Oxford University Press. Reprinted by permission.

Japanese American families, San Francisco, 1942. Photograph. Courtesy of the National Archives.

Lewis, Anthony, *The Constitution and the Press* (unpublished course materials, Harvard Law School). Copyright © 1974 by Anthony Lewis. Reprinted by permission of the author.

U.S. Navy sailor carries earthquake victim, Port-au-Prince, Haiti, 2010. Photograph. Courtesy of the Department of Defense/Jim Garamone.

Vietnam Veterans Memorial Wall, Washington, DC. Copyright © WashingtonDCS tockImages.com. Reprinted by permission.

United Nations Security Council. Photograph. Copyright © UN Photo/Devra Berkowitz. Reprinted by permission.

Worldatlas.com. CIA maps of Afghanistan, Iraq, Libya, and Syria.

EDITORS' NOTE

In general we have adhered to the rules for citation of authority followed by most lawyers and courts. They are set out in *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (20th ed. 2015). For reasons of economy we have omitted without notation many citations within excerpted materials, and we have removed almost all parallel citations. We have, on the other hand, sought to provide citations that will enable readers to locate and review original sources. We have included URLs for many materials available online, but not for those easily located by a Google search.

To make it easier to refer back to materials where they were originally published, we have preserved original footnote numbers in all excerpted materials. Editors' footnotes are numbered consecutively throughout each chapter. Additions to quoted

or excerpted materials are enclosed in brackets.

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

Contents Preface Acknowledgmer Editors' Note	nts	xi xxxiii xxxvii xxxix
Chapter 1.	Introduction	1
PART I. FR	AMEWORK	5
Chapter 2. Chapter 3.	Providing for the "Common Defence": The Original Understanding The Gloss of History: An Introduction to the Separation	7
Chapter 5.	of National Security Powers	25
Chapter 4.	The President's National Security Powers	53
Chapter 5.	Congress's National Security Powers	105
Chapter 6.	The Courts' National Security Powers	135
PART II. IN	ITERNATIONAL LAW AND "OUR LAW"	175
Chapter 7. Chapter 8. Chapter 9. Chapter 10.	The Domestic Effect of International Law The Extraterritorial Reach of U.S. Law The Right to Wage War (jus ad bellum) International Humanitarian Law (jus in bello)	177 221 253 277
PART III. U	JSING FORCE ABROAD	315
Chapter 11. Chapter 12. Chapter 13. Chapter 14. Chapter 15. Chapter 16.		317 363 385 417 445 467
PART IV. I	NTELLIGENCE OPERATIONS AND COLLECTION	487
Chapter 17. Chapter 18.	Organization of and Authority for the Intelligence	489
	Community	503
Chapter 19.	Covert Actions in Principle and Practice	545

1	Shadow War The Fourth Amendment and National Security Congressional Authority for Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Programmatic Electronic Surveillance for Foreign Intelligence Third-Party Records—Targeted Collection Bulk Collection and Data Mining Screening for Security	575 591 633 667 707 743 775
PART V. D	ETAINING TERRORIST SUSPECTS	829
Chapter 27. Chapter 28. Chapter 29. Chapter 30. Chapter 31.	Habeas Corpus: The Structure of the Suspension Clause Habeas Corpus: The Scope of the Suspension Clause Military Detention of U.S. Persons Military Detention of Non-U.S. Persons Preventive Detention	831 857 887 923 955
PART VI. II	NTERROGATING TERRORIST SUSPECTS	991
Chapter 32. Chapter 33.	Interrogating Terrorist Suspects Case Study of Coercive Interrogation of Detainees in U.S. Custody After 9/11	993 1019
PART VII. I	PROSECUTING THREATS TO NATIONAL SECURITY	1055
Chapter 34. Chapter 35. Chapter 36. Chapter 37.	Criminalizing Terrorism and Material Support The Procedural Path to Terrorism Trials Secret Evidence in Criminal Trials Trial by Military Commission	1057 1095 1123 1161
PART VIII.	HOMELAND SECURITY	1199
	Homeland Security The Military's Domestic Role	1201 1229
	OBTAINING AND PROTECTING NATIONAL INFORMATION	1261
	Regulating Access to National Security Information Statutory Access to National Security Information Other Grounds for Access to National Security Information	1263 1285 1323
Chapter 44.		1383
Appendix — C Table of Case Index	Constitution of the United States s	1419 1427 1435

CONTENTS

Preface Acknowledgments Editors' Note	xxxvii xxxvii xxxix
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
A. Purposes	1
B. Organization	4
PART I FRAMEWORK	5
CHAPTER 2 PROVIDING FOR THE "COMMON DEFENCE": THE ORIGINAL UNDERSTANDING	7
A. The Constitutional Text	7
B. Pre-Constitutional History and Political Theory in Europe	10
C. The American Experience Prior to 1787	14
D. The Framers' View 1. The Convention 2. Ratification Notes and Questions	16 17 20 22
CHAPTER 3 THE GLOSS OF HISTORY: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE SEPARATION OF NATIONAL SECURITY POWERS	N 25
A. The Steel Seizure Case and Its Theories of Presidential Power Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer (The Steel Seizure Case) Notes and Questions a. The President's Claim of Lawmaking Authority b. The Claim of War Powers as Commander in Chief	26 27 41 42 43

c. The Claim of Inherent Emergency Powers d. The Claim of Customary Authority e. The Claim of Aggregate Executive Authority to Execute <i>All</i> the Laws	44 45 45
 B. Analyzing Power in Justice Jackson's Groupings 1. When the President Acts Pursuant to Delegated Authority 2. When the President Acts in the "Zone of Twilight" 3. When the President Takes Measures Incompatible with the Expressed or Implied Will of Congress 	46 46 47 48
C. The Role of the Courts	50
CHARTER 4 = THE PRESIDENT'S NATIONAL SECURITY	
CHAPTER 4 THE PRESIDENT'S NATIONAL SECURITY POWERS	53
A. The President's Foreign Relations Powers United States v. Curtiss-Wright Export Corp. Notes and Questions Dames & Moore v. Regan Notes and Questions Zivotofsky ex rel. Zivotofsky v. Kerry (Zivotofsky II) Notes and Questions B. The Commander in Chief's War Powers 1. Defensive War Power The Prize Cases Notes and Questions	54 55 60 62 68 71 80 81 82 82 85
2. Customary War Power Notes and Questions 3. "Core" Presidential War Power and Statutory Limits Little v. Barreme Notes and Questions	87 87 89 90 92
C. The President's Emergency Powers In re Neagle Notes and Questions	95 96 99
CHAPTER 5 CONGRESS'S NATIONAL SECURITY POWERS	105
A. Congressional Authorizations for War 1. Declaration of War Joint Resolution Declaring That a State of War Exists Between the Government of Germany and the Government and the People of the United States and Making Provisions	105 106
to Prosecute the Same Notes and Questions	106 106

Contents	xiii
 Statutory Authorization for the Use of Military Force Bas v. Tingy Notes and Questions Authorizing the Use of Military Force by "Partial Congressional Declaration" or Congressional Silence Notes and Questions 	108 109 111 113 113
B. Delegations and Appropriations for National Security Greene v. McElroy Notes and Questions a. Delegations of National Security Authority b. Implied Authorization by Defense Appropriation c. Limitation by Defense Appropriation	114 116 118 118 120 121
C. Statutory Emergency Powers Proclamation No. 7463, Declaration of National Emergency by Reason of Certain Terrorist Attacks Notes and Questions	123 124 124
 D. Limitations on Congressional War Powers 1. Substantive Limits on Congressional National Security Powers a. The Nondelegation Principle b. The Lovett Principle Notes and Questions 2. Procedural Limits on Congressional National Security Powers: 	126 126 126 126 127
Chadha Notes and Questions	130 131
CHAPTER 6 ■ THE COURTS' NATIONAL SECURITY POWERS	135
A. The Federal Judicial Power Generally	136
 B. A Self-Defining Role for Courts: The Justiciability Doctrines 1. The Political Question Doctrine Dellums v. Bush Notes and Questions 2. Standing to Sue Clapper v. Amnesty International USA American Civil Liberties Union v. Clapper Notes and Questions 3. Ripeness 	136 137 139 142 144 145 152 154
C. Substantive Hurdles: <i>Bivens</i> and Qualified Immunity 1. A Cause of Action? 2. Qualified Immunity	158 158 160
D. Evidentiary Hurdles: The State Secrets Privilege El-Masri v. United States Notes and Questions	161 162 170

PART II	INTERNATIONAL	LAW AND	"OUR LAW"	175
01 -07 35 07 30 30 10 10 10			THE RESERVE OF THE RE	

CHAPTER 7 THE DOMESTIC EFFECT OF INTERNATIONAL LAW	177
A. The Making and Interpretation of Treaties Notes and Questions	178 179
B. Executive and Other Agreements Dames & Moore v. Regan Notes and Questions	183 183 183
C. The Domestic Legal Effect of Treaties and Executive Agreements Reid v. Covert Committee of U.S. Citizens Living in Nicaragua v. Reagan Notes and Questions	186 186 189 193
D. Statutory Incorporation of International Law Al-Bihani v. Obama Notes and Questions	197 197 199
 E. The Domestic Legal Effect of Customary International Law and Jus Cogens Committee of U.S. Citizens Living in Nicaragua v. Reagan Notes and Questions a. The Making and Incorporation of Customary International Law b. "Controlling" Executive and Legislative Acts and Judicial Decisions c. Jus Cogens F. The Continuing Incorporation Debate Al-Bihani v. Obama Notes and Questions 	199 200 204 204 205 207 208 208 217
CHAPTER 8 ■ THE EXTRATERRITORIAL REACH OF U.S. LAW	221
A. Extraterritorial Reach of Constitutional Rights Reid v. Covert United States v. Verdugo-Urquidez Notes and Questions Hernandez v. United States Notes and Questions B. Extraterritorial Effect of U.S. Statutes	221 222 225 231 234 239
Kiobel v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co. Notes and Questions	240 247