

Including Applications in Science and Technology

M. GRANGER MORGAN





Many books instruct readers on how to use the tools of policy analysis. This book is different. Its primary focus is on helping readers to look critically at the strengths, limitations, and the underlying assumptions analysts make when they use standard tools or problem framings. Using examples, many of which involve issues in science and technology, the book exposes readers to some of the critical issues of taste, professional responsibility, ethics, and values that are associated with policy analysis and research.

Topics covered include policy problems formulated in terms of utility maximization such as benefit-cost, decision, and multi-attribute analysis, issues in the valuation of intangibles, uncertainty in policy analysis, selected topics in risk analysis and communication, limitations and alternatives to the paradigm of utility maximization, issues in behavioral decision theory, issues related to organizations and multiple agents, and selected topics in policy advice and policy analysis for government.

"Professor Morgan deftly and methodically unravels the intricacies of public policymaking, illustrating its intersection with science and technology with precision. Moreover, he equips readers with the tools necessary to understand today's complex global challenges and work toward their solutions."

Dr. Pradeep K. Khosla, Chancellor, University of California, San Diego

Cover image: Two Paths © andykazie / iStock / Getty Images

COVER DESIGNED BY HART McLEOD LTD





MORGAN

Theory and Practice in

CAMB

S

CAMBRIDGE

Theory and Practice in Policy Analysis

Including Applications in Science and Technology

M. GRANGER MORGAN

Carnegie Mellon University



CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryagani, Delhi – 110002, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107184893 DOI: 10.1017/9781316882665

© M. Granger Morgan 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-18489-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-63620-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Theory and Practice in Policy Analysis

Many books instruct readers on how to use the tools of policy analysis. This book is different. Its primary focus is on helping readers to look critically at the strengths, limitations, and the underlying assumptions analysts make when they use standard tools or problem framings. Using examples, many of which involve issues in science and technology, the book exposes readers to some of the critical issues of taste, professional responsibility, ethics, and values that are associated with policy analysis and research. Topics covered include policy problems formulated in terms of utility maximization such as benefit-cost, decision, and multi-attribute analysis, issues in the valuation of intangibles, uncertainty in policy analysis, selected topics in risk analysis and communication, limitations and alternatives to the paradigm of utility maximization, issues in behavioral decision theory, issues related to organizations and multiple agents, and selected topics in policy advice and policy analysis for government.

M. Granger Morgan is the Hamerschlag University Professor of Engineering at Carnegie Mellon University where he was the founding Head of the Department of Engineering and Public Policy. He also holds appointments in Electrical and Computer Engineering and in the H. John Heinz III College of Public Policy and Management. He has worked extensively on policy problems that involve issues in science and technology. Much of his work has focused on the characterization and treatment of uncertainty, especially as applied to environmental issues, that involve energy and electric power, and many aspects of the problem of climate change. Morgan's formal academic training is in applied physics. He is a member of the U.S. National Academy of Sciences and of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. He is the author of many papers and five books, including two with Cambridge University Press: Uncertainty: A Guide to Dealing with Uncertainty in Quantitative Risk and Policy Analysis and Risk Communication: A Mental Models Approach.



Preface

As the title indicates, this is a book about the theory and practice of policy analysis. It is not a book designed to make readers expert in the use of specific analytical tools. That is something that can be gained through more specialized books, courses, and practice. Rather, this is a book designed to help readers to develop their own independent understanding and critical assessment of the strengths, limitations, and underlying assumptions of key policy research and analysis tools and problem framings. Hence my focus is on:

- the underlying assumptions and implications of various analytical techniques;
- the strengths and limitations of these techniques;
- the role and objective of policy-related studies, especially those that involve technology and public policy;
- the behavioral, institutional, organizational, political, and historical contexts in which issues of technology and public policy play out and the role of analysis in the broader process of policy development and implementation.

The book grew out of a course that I have taught for many years as one of the core courses in the Ph.D. program in the Department of Engineering and Public Policy at Carnegie Mellon University. That course has revolved around intensive classroom discussion of a large number of readings. In writing this book I have faced the problem of trying to figure out how to preserve at least some elements of the process of self-discovery and learning that has occurred through those classroom discussions.

Because I believe it is important for readers to be exposed to some of the more important writings in the primary literature, I have used more direct quotations from the literature than are found in many books, and in many sections I have included recommended readings and a number of discussion questions. I have tried to limit my summary of many of the readings, since the point of this book is not to supply Granger Morgan's "CliffsNotes" but rather to help

xiv

readers to develop and refine their own views. This is of course an explicitly normative process.

While I have not been reluctant to express my views about specific methods or literatures, I have tried to do so in a way that encourages readers to consider, and perhaps disagree with, those views. When I have taught the course at Carnegie Mellon, it has always been most successful when students in the class were prepared to disagree vigorously with some of the views I expressed.

In order to avoid the awkward use of "his or her" in sentences such as "the decision maker must consider his or her preferences," I have sometimes adopted the (grammatically incorrect) phrasing, "the decision maker must consider their preferences." In discussing decision making, I have also sometimes adopted the convention, widely used in the decision analysis literature, of referring to "your" decision.

While the book should be accessible to readers from a wide variety of backgrounds, most of the examples I have used involve issues in science and technology. A significant number are drawn from the domain of climate change because policy analysis in this domain often stretches the boundaries of conventional tools and analysis strategies – and because I have been fortunate to help lead three large NSF-supported centers that have focused on a variety of decision-making issues related to climate change. However, in most cases, the issues being illustrated with these climate examples generalize to a variety of other problems in technology and public policy.

During the first week of the course from which this book has grown, I include a brief discussion of some topics in the philosophy of science. Our faculty in Engineering and Public Policy asked me to add this material when it became apparent that a number of our Ph.D. students could not state a "falsifiable proposition." Because I think it is valuable for practitioners in science, technology, and public policy to have some familiarity with the ideas of philosophers such as Popper and Kuhn, I have included a brief discussion in Appendix 1.

There are many important topics related to science, technology, and public policy that this book does *not* address. Two especially important excluded topics are issues related to technological innovation and R&D policy, and issues that are often termed science and technology studies. A few suggested readings on these topics can be found in Appendix 2 and Appendix 3.

Acknowledgments

Carnegie Mellon and the Department of Engineering and Public Policy (EPP) have provided me, and my graduate students, with a uniquely supportive inter-disciplinary environment in which to tackle problems in science, technology, and public policy. Indeed, there is no other more attractive academic setting anywhere in the world in which to address such problems. Many people have been responsible for creating the environment that has made EPP possible. Especially notable among them have been Dick Cyert, Herb Simon, Herb Toor, and Bob Dunlap, all of whom are sadly now gone.

Over the course of more than forty years of teaching, doing research, and making practical applications of the ideas that are the focus of this book, I have benefited from associations with many wonderful graduate students and colleagues. None have been more important to my intellectual development than Baruch Fischhoff, Max Henrion, and Lester Lave. I have also benefited greatly from years of collaboration with Jay Apt, Inês Azevedo, Ann Bostrom, Liz Casman, Hadi Dowlatabadi, Greg Fischer, Keith Florig, David Keith, Sam Morris, Indira Nair, Ed Rubin, and Henry Willis. Jerry Cohon made valuable suggestions on my treatment of utility in Chapter 2 and then kindly co-authored Chapter 6 on multiobjective methods.

Additional thanks for assistance, collaboration, critiques, and ideas go to Ahmed Abdulla, Peter Adams, Myles Allen, Deborah Amaral, V.S. Arunachalam, Cindy Atman, Jesse Ausubel, Barbara Barkovich, João Barros, Anshu Bharadwaj, Wändi Bruine de Bruin, Bill Clark, Aimee Curtright, Mike DeKay, Michael Dworkin, Kerry Emanuel, Scott Farrow, Paul Fischbeck, Lauren Fleishman, Marie-Valentine Florin, David Frame, Erica Fuchs, John Graham, Mike Griffin, Iris Grossmann, Ümit Güvenc, Bob Hahn, Manuel Heitor, Gordon Hester, Alex Hills, Paul Hines, David Hounshell, Harald Ibrekk, Paulina Jaramillo, Karen Jenni, Milind Kandlikar, Doug King, Kelly Klima, David Lincoln, Ragnar Löfstedt, Scott Matthews, Sean McCoy, Tim McDaniels,

Fran McMichael, Alan Meier, Kara Morgan, Anu Narayanan, Bob Nordhaus, Warner North, Claire Palmgren, Paul Parfomak, Elisabeth Paté-Cornell, Dalia Patiño-Echeverri, Jon Peha, Lou Pitelka, Stefan Rahmstorf, Anand Rao, Daniel Read, Ortwin Renn, Kate Ricke, Bill Rish, Emilie Roth, Costa Samaras, Steve Schneider, Vanessa Schweizer, Debra Shenk, Elena Shevliakova, Kyle Siler-Evans, Marvin Sirbu, Paul Slovic, Bill Strauss, Jun Suzuki, Sarosh Talukdar, Parth Vaishnav, Francisco Veloso, David Victor, Charlie Wiecha, Elizabeth Wilson, Xue Lan, Kirsten Zickfeld, and many others. Debbie Scappatura assisted in securing figure approvals and helping with the index. Jenni Miller, a remarkably careful proofreader, provided valuable editorial assistance.

My views on many of the topics discussed in this book have been shaped by the research I have done with my students and colleagues with support from many agencies and foundations. I am especially thankful for many years of generous support from the National Science Foundation. Thanks, too, for support from Carnegie Mellon University, the Doris Duke Charitable Foundation, the Department of Energy, the Electric Power Research Institute, the Exxon Education Foundation, the International Risk Governance Council, the MacArthur Foundation, the R.K. Mellon Foundation, the Sloan Foundation, and others.

My original training was in experimental applied physics. Ken Bowles, Henry Booker, and my father, Millett Morgan, imbued me with a set of perspectives on research and professional activity that have been central to all of my subsequent work.

Much of this book was written during stays in the family home in which I grew up, located on 120 acres of New Hampshire countryside five miles east of Hanover, New Hampshire. Interspersing work on the book with work on the house and the land has been an enjoyable way to pass many days.

In my professional life, I have been fortunate to have 37 years of outstanding support from my assistant and very good friend, Patti Steranchak.

In my private life, my best friend, biggest critic, and the love of my life for over fifty years has been my wife, Betty. To her go my greatest thanks of all.

Contents

Fre	face		page xiii
Ack	enowle	edgments	xv
1.	Policy Analysis: An Overview		1
	1.1	What Is Public Policy?	1
	1.2	What Is Policy Analysis?	3
	1.3	What Is Good Policy Analysis and What Should Be	
		Its Objective?	5
	1.4	How Is Doing Policy Analysis Different from Doing Science?	8
	1.5	What Role Does Analysis Play in Making and	
		Implementing Policy?	11
PAF	RT I:	MAKING DECISIONS THAT MAXIMIZE UTILITY	15
2.	Preferences and the Idea of Utility		17
	2.1	Historical Development of the Idea of Utility	18
	2.2	Utility in Modern Microeconomics	19
	2.3	Is Utility the Same Thing as Happiness?	24
	2.4	Measurement Scales for Utility (and Other Things)	30
	2.5	The Utility of Chance Outcomes	35
	2.6	Can Different People's Utilities Be Compared?	40
	2.7	Combining Individual Utilities and the Concept of a	
		Social Welfare Function	42
	2.8	Preferences that Are Not Well Defined, Change over	
		Time, or Are Inconsistent	44
	2.9	Back to the Basic Question: "What Is Utility?"	46
	2.10	Limits to the Strategy of Utility Maximization	47
3.	Benefit-Cost Analysis		51
	3.1	B–C Basics	52

vi Contents

	3.2	Pareto Optimality	58
	3.3	B-C versus B/C	60
	3.4	Simple in Theory, but Often Complicated in Practice	60
	3.5	The Rise of B-C Analysis in Government Decision Making	61
	3.6	Examples of B-C Analysis Applied to Public Decision Making	67
	3.7	Limitations of B–C	73
	3.8	Efficiency versus Equity	76
	3.9	Going off the Deep End with B-C Analysis	77
	3.10	B-C versus Precaution	86
	3.11	Final Thoughts on B–C	88
4.	Decis	ion Analysis	93
	4.1	DA Basics	93
	4.2	A Simple Worked Example	96
	4.3	Stages in a Decision Analysis	96
	4.4	The Axioms of Decision Analysis	98
	4.5	A More Detailed Worked Example	100
	4.6	Other Examples of Decision Analysis	108
	4.7	Influence Diagrams and Decision Trees	111
	4.8	Strengths and Limitations of Decision Analysis	112
	4.9	A Note on the History of Decision Analysis	114
5.	Valui	ng Intangibles and Other Non-Market Outcomes	118
	5.1	Inferring People's Values from the Choices They Make	119
	5.2	The "Value of a Statistical Life" or VSL	120
	5.3	A Decision-Analytic Approach to Valuing One's Own Life	122
	5.4	Evolution of Approaches to the Economic Valuation	
		of Lost Lives	124
	5.5	Use of VSL and Similar Measures in Public Policy	126
	5.6	Contingent Valuation (CV)	131
	5.7	Computing the Costs of Externalities	134
	5.8	Ecosystem Services	135
	5.9	What If People Don't Have Well-Articulated Utility	
		Functions for Everything?	141
	5.10	Variations in Basic Values across Different Cultures	143
	5.11	Are There Some Values that Should Not Be Quantified?	145
6.	Multi	i-Attribute Utility Theory and Multi-Criteria Decision Making	155
	With Jared L. Cohon		
	6.1	MAUT Basics	156
	6.2	Constructing MAU Functions Using Independence Assumptions	158
	6.3	Do People Have Multi-Attribute Utility Functions	
		in Their Heads?	160
	6.4	Other Multiple Criteria Decision Making (MCDM) Methods	162
	6.5	Figuring out What You Care About	165

Contents

	6.6	Example Applications of MAUT and MCDM	167
	6.7	Limitations to the Use of MAUT and MCDM	171
	6.8	Multiobjective Programming	173
7.	Prefe	rences over Time and across Space	185
	7.1	A Simple Example of When Time Differences Do and	
		Do Not Matter	185
	7.2	Exponential Discounting in the Evaluation of Projects	
		and Investment Opportunities	189
	7.3	The Orthodoxy of Exponential Discounting	192
	7.4	The Use of Real Options as an Alternative to Net	
		Present Value	192
	7.5	The Pure Rate of Time Preference (PRTP) and the	
		Consumption Discount Rate (CDR)	194
	7.6	Discount Rates that Decline over Time	195
	7.7	Empirical Studies of the Time Preferences that People	
		Display: A Look Ahead to Part III	198
	7.8	Hyperbolic Discounting	200
	7.9	Preferences that Change over Time	201
	7.10	How Different Are Space and Time?	202
PART II: SOME WI		SOME WIDELY USED ANALYSIS TOOLS AND TOPICS	207
8.	Char	acterizing, Analyzing, and Communicating Uncertainty	209
	8.1	Describing Uncertainty	210
	8.2	The Importance of Quantifying Uncertainty	217
	8.3	Cognitive Challenges in Estimating Uncertainty	222
	8.4	Methods and Tools for Propagating and Analyzing Uncertainty	222
	8.5	Making Decisions in the Face of Uncertainty	224
	8.6	Scenario Analysis	228
	8.7	Precaution	230
	8.8	Communicating Uncertainty	231
	8.9	Some Simple Guidance on Characterizing and Dealing with	
		Uncertainty	235
9.	Expe	rt Elicitation	244
	9.1	Are There Any Experts?	245
	9.2	The Interpretation of Probability	245
	9.3	Qualitative Uncertainty Words Are Not Sufficient	246
	9.4	Cognitive Heuristics and Bias	247
	9.5	Ubiquitous Overconfidence	248
	9.6	Developing a Protocol	251
	9.7	Computer Tools to Support or Perform Elicitation	254
	9.8	Uncertainty about Model Functional Form	255
	9.9	Confidence, Second-Order Uncertainty, and Pedigree	256
	9.10	Diversity in Expert Opinion	257

viii Contents

	9.11	Combining Expert Judgments	260
	9.12	Concluding Thoughts and Advice	263
10.	Risk A	Analysis	274
		A Framework for Thinking about Risk	275
		Risk Is Inherently Uncertain	276
		Risk Is a Multi-Attribute Concept	279
		Models of Exposure and Effects Process	281
	10.5	Causes of Death	289
	10.6	Managing Risk	291
	10.7	The Risk of Worrying (Too Much) about Risk	303
11.	The U	Ise of Models in Policy Analysis	309
	11.1	Types of Models Commonly Used in Technically Focused Policy	
		Analysis	311
	11.2	Simple Engineering, Economic, and Policy Models	312
	11.3	Models for Environmental Impact Assessment	314
	11.4	Life Cycle Methods	315
	11.5	Models of the Economy	316
	11.6	Models of Energy Supply and Use	319
	11.7	Integrated Assessment Models	323
	11.8	Limits of Standard Analytical Tools	331
	11.9	Using Large Research and Scientific Models in Policy	
		Applications	332
	11.10	Some Thoughts on "Large" and "Complex" Models	335
	11.11	Model Complexity Should Match the Analyst's Level of	
		Understanding	337
PAF	T III:	HOW INDIVIDUALS AND ORGANIZATIONS ACTUALLY	
	MAKE	DECISIONS	343
12	Huma	an Mental Processes for Perception, Memory, and Decision	
12.	Maki		345
	12.1	Two Kinds of Thinking	346
		Framing Effects and Prospect Theory	347
		Ubiquitous Overconfidence	351
		Cognitive Heuristics and Biases	353
	12.5	Hindsight Bias	358
	12.6	Scenarios and Scenario Thinking	360
		(Not) Honoring Sunk Costs	363
		Order Effects in Search	365
		The Power of Simple Linear Models	367
		Individual and Social Dilemmas	368
	12.11	Wrapping Up	369
13		Perception and Risk Ranking	373
10.	13.1	Starr on Acceptable Risk	374
		Public Assessment of Causes of Death	376

Contents

13.3	Factors that Shape Risk Judgments	377
13.4	Comparing and Ranking Risks	383
13.5	Recent Summaries of Work on Risk Perception	386
14. Risk	Communication	389
14.1	What Information Do People Need to Know about a Risk?	391
14.2		394
14.3	Structured Interviews Followed by Closed-Form Surveys	400
14.4	Development and Evaluation of Communication Materials	401
14.5	Are the Results Any Better?	402
14.6	Communication to What End?	405
15. Orga	nizational Behavior and Decision Making	409
15.1	Different Views through Different Windows	411
15.2	The Carnegie School of Organizational Decision Making	416
15.3	Garbage Can Models of Organizational Decision Making	422
15.4	The Importance of Negotiation	424
15.5	Exit, Voice, and Loyalty	424
15.6	9 , 0	428
15.7	Agent-Based Models of Social Processes and Organizations	430
15.8	Studies of the Behavior of Individuals within Commercial	
	Organizations	433
15.9	Wrapping Up	437
PART IV:	THE POLICY PROCESS AND S&T POLICY (MAINLY) IN THE	
UNIT	ED STATES	441
16. Anal	ysis and the Policy Process	443
	Policy Windows	443
16.2	Policy Making as a Process of Punctured Equilibrium	446
16.3	Adaptive Policy and Learning	450
16.4	Diversification as a Policy Strategy	451
16.5	Social Control through Norms, Legal Prohibitions,	
	Command, and Markets	453
16.6	The Science of "Muddling Through"	457
16.7	We Can't Always Just Muddle Through	460
16.8	The Technology of Foolishness	461
16.9	Implementation	462
17. The	Period Prior to World War II	469
17.1	Thomas Jefferson and the Lewis and Clark Expedition	472
17.2	Creation of the Coastal Survey	474
17.3	The Smithson Will and the Creation of the Smithsonian	
	Institution	476
17.4	Appropriation of Federal Funds for Technology Demonstration	478
17.5	The Extended Saga of Regulations to Prevent Steam Boiler	
	Explosions	479
17.6	The United States Exploring Expedition, 1838–1842	482

		483 486 488 489 491
U.S. S 18.1	cience and Technology Policy from World War II to 1960 Vannevar Bush and U.S. Defense Research and	497
18.2	Development during World War II Science the Endless Frontier and the Creation of the	498
18.3	The Office of Naval Research: Filling the Gap between OSRD	508
	and NSF	514
18.4	Civilian Control of Atomic Energy and Weapons	516
18.5	IGY, Sputnik, the Space Race, and the (Phantom) Missile Gap	517
Science	te and Technology Advice to Government	521
	e.	521
	0,	526
19.3		
		529
19.4	The NRC and the National Academies	532
19.5	Think Tanks and Consulting Firms	535
		536
		543
19.8		
	Governments	545
19.9	Science and Technology Advice to European Governments	
		547
19.10		
	Jun Suzuki	556
19.11	Science and Technology Advice to Government in China	
	Xue Lan	559
19.12	Science and Technology Advice to Government in India	
	Anshu Bharadwaj and V.S. Arunachalam	562
pendice	?S	567
A1.	A Few Key Ideas from the History and Philosophy of Science	567
	A1.1 Francis Bacon and the Empirical or Scientific Method	567
	Induction	569
	17.8 17.9 17.10 17.11 U.S. S 18.1 18.2 18.3 18.4 18.5 Science 19.1 19.2 19.3 19.4 19.5 19.6 19.7 19.8 19.9 19.10 19.11 19.12	 17.8 The Great Western Exploring Expeditions 17.9 The Creation of the U.S. Geological Survey 17.10 World War I and the Creation of the National Research Council 17.11 Herbert Hoover as Secretary of Commerce U.S. Science and Technology Policy from World War II to 1960 18.1 Vannevar Bush and U.S. Defense Research and Development during World War II 18.2 Science the Endless Frontier and the Creation of the National Science Foundation 18.3 The Office of Naval Research: Filling the Gap between OSRD and NSF 18.4 Civilian Control of Atomic Energy and Weapons 18.5 IGY, Sputnik, the Space Race, and the (Phantom) Missile Gap Science and Technology Advice to Government 19.1 Science and Technology Advice to the President 19.2 The Administrative Procedure Act 19.3 Examples of Science and Technology Advice to Executive Branch Agencies 19.4 The NRC and the National Academies 19.5 Think Tanks and Consulting Firms 19.6 The Congressional Office of Technology Assessment 19.7 Science and Technology Advice to the Judiciary 19.8 Science and Technology Advice to the Iudiciary 19.9 Science and Technology Advice to European Governments and to the European Union, with Inês Azevedo 19.10 Science and Technology Advice to Government in Japan Jun Suzuki 19.11 Science and Technology Advice to Government in India Anshu Bharadwaj and V.S. Arunachalam 19.12 Science and Technology Advice to Government in India Anshu Bharadwaj and V.S. Arunachalam 19.11 Science Science Science Filling Experiment in Science and Technology Advice to Government in India Anshu Bharadwaj and V.S. Arunachalam 19.12 Science Science Science Filling Experiment in Science Al.1 Francis Bacon and the Empirical or Scientific Method Al.2 Karl Popper: "Falsifiability," and Deduction versus