Gender and Neoliberalism

The All India Democratic Women's Association and Globalization Politics

Elisabeth Armstrong



Gender and Neoliberalism

The All India Democratic Women's Association and Globalization Politics

Elisabeth Armstrong



First published 2014 by Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Simultaneously published in the UK by Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group. an informa business

© 2014 Taylor & Francis

The right of Elisabeth Armstrong to be identified as author of this work has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark Notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Armstrong, Elisabeth, 1967-

Gender and neoliberalism: the All India Democratic Women's Association and globalization politics / by Elisabeth Armstrong.

pages cm. — (Routledge research in gender and society; 39)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. AIDWA (Organization) 2. Women—Political

activity—India. 3. Women's rights—India. 4. Feminism— India. 5. Neoliberalism-India. 6. India-Economic

policy. 7. India—Politics and government. I. Title.

HQ1236.5.I4A76 2014 305.420954-dc23

2013026821

ISBN13: 978-0-415-96158-5 (hbk) ISBN13: 978-1-305-84995-9 (ebk)

Typeset in Sabon by IBT Global.



Gender and Neoliberalism

This book describes the changing landscape of women's politics for equality and liberation during the rise of neoliberalism in India. Between 1991 and 2006, the doctrine of liberalization guided Indian politics and economic policy. These neoliberal measures vastly reduced poverty alleviation schemes, price supports for poor farmers, and opened India's economy to the unpredictability of global financial fluctuations. During this same period, the All India Democratic Women's Association, which directly opposed the ascendance of neoliberal economics and policies, as well as the simultaneous rise of violent casteism and anti-Muslim communalism, grew from roughly three million members to over ten million. Beginning in the late 1980s, AIDWA turned its attention to women's lives in rural India. Using a method that began with activist research, the organization developed a sectoral analysis of groups of women who were hardest hit in the new neoliberal order, including Muslim women, and Dalit (oppressed caste) women. AIDWA developed what leaders called inter-sectoral organizing, that centered the demands of the most vulnerable women into the heart of its campaigns and its ideology for social change. Through long-term ethnographic research, predominantly in the northern state of Haryana and the southern state of Tamil Nadu, this book shows how a socialist women's organization built its oppositional strength by organizing the women most marginalized by neoliberal policies and economics.

Elisabeth Armstrong is an Associate Professor in the Program for the Study of Women and Gender at Smith College.

Routledge Research in Gender and Society

For a full list of titles in this series, please visit www.routledge.com

- 7 Women and the Labour-Market Self-employment as a Route to Economic Independence Vani Borooah and Mark Hart
- 8 Victoria's Daughters
 The Schooling of Girls in Britain
 and Ireland 1850–1914
 Jane McDermid and Paula
 Coonerty
- 9 Homosexuality, Law and Resistance Derek McGhee
- 10 Sex Differences in Labor Markets David Neumark
- 11 Women, Activism and Social Change Edited by Maja Mikula
- 12 The Gender of Democracy Citizenship and Gendered Subjectivity Maro Pantelidou Maloutas
- 13 Female Homosexuality in the Middle East
 Histories and Representations

Samar Habib.

14 Global Empowerment of Women Responses to Globalization and Politicized Religions Edited by Carolyn M. Elliott

- 15 Child Abuse, Gender and Society Jackie Turton
- 16 Gendering Global
 Transformations
 Gender, Culture, Race, and
 Identity
 Edited by Chima J Korieh and
 Philomina Ihejirika-Okeke
- 17 Gender, Race and National Identity
 Nations of Flesh and Blood
 Jackie Hogan
- 18 Intimate Citizenships Gender, Sexualities, Politics Elżbieta H. Oleksy
- 19 A Philosophical Investigation of Rape
 The Making and Unmaking of the Feminine Self
 Louise du Toit
- 20 Migrant Men
 Critical Studies of Masculinities
 and the Migration Experience
 Edited by Mike Donaldson,
 Raymond Hibbins, Richard
 Howson and Bob Pease
- 21 Theorizing Sexual Violence Edited by Renée J. Heberle and Victoria Grace

22 Inclusive Masculinity

The Changing Nature of Masculinities Eric Anderson

23 Understanding Non-Monogamies

Edited by Meg Barker and Darren Langdridge

24 Transgender Identities

Towards a Social Analysis of Gender Diversity Edited by Sally Hines and Tam Sanger

25 The Cultural Politics of Female Sexuality in South Africa

Henriette Gunkel

26 Migration, Domestic Work and Affect

A Decolonial Approach on Value and the Feminization of Labor Encarnación Gutiérrez-Rodriguez

27 Overcoming Objectification

A Carnal Ethics Ann J. Cahill

28 Intimate Partner Violence in LGBTQ Lives

Edited by Janice L. Ristock

29 Contesting the Politics of Genocidal Rape

Affirming the Dignity of the Vulnerable Body Debra B. Bergoffen

30 Transnational Migration, Media and Identity of Asian Women

Diasporic Daughters Young Kim

31 Feminist Solidarity at the Crossroads

Intersectional Women's Studies for Transracial Alliance Edited by Kim Marie Vaz and Gary L. Lemons

32 Victims, Gender and Jouissance Victoria Grace

33 Gender, Development and Environmental Governance Theorizing Connections

Seema Arora-Jonsson

34 Street Sex Workers' Discourse

Realizing Material Change Through Agential Choice

Jill McCracken

35 Gender, Ethnicity, and Political Agency

South Asian Women Organizing Shaminder Takhar

36 Ecofeminism and Systems Thinking

Anne Stephens

37 Queer Women in Urban China

An Ethnography Elisabeth L. Engebretsen

38 Gender and Rural Migration

Realities, Conflict and Change Edited by Glenda Tibe Bonifacio

39 Gender and Neoliberalism

The All India Democratic Women's Association and Globalization Politics Elisabeth Armstrong For Vijay, Zalia and Rosa

Acknowledgments

Open doors and open hearts made the research for this book possible. The Indian women's movement has an inspirational and (to this researcher) a daunting breadth of vision and history. I am grateful to all of the people who welcomed me as a witness of and participant in the movement's ongoing activism. My gratitude to the women in the All India Democratic Women's Association began at the first protest I joined in India late in 1991, after the U.S. invasion of the Gulf, and it continues to this day. Women who were members of AIDWA, and men who actively supported AIDWA's campaigns in Harvana, Uttar Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, New Delhi, and West Bengal, as well as Karnataka and Maharashtra, gave freely of their time, and I will never forget our conversations, disputes, jokes, and stories. My core writing group combined support with critique, advice with empathy, and nurtured a vision of uncompromising justice that carried this project from its first pen-to-paper version to its completion: Daphne Lamothe, Jennifer Guglielmo, Michelle Ioffroy, Ginetta Candelario, and Adrienne Lentz-Smith here's to another stir of the pot. I am also grateful to Sujani Reddy, Dawn Peterson, and Donna Riley, who spilled into the writing group as mentors, guides, and unshakeable friends.

My students and colleagues at Smith College have provided inspiration and (I trust) a willing audience over the years. For their academic contributions to this book, Annum Khan stood out in her independent research about the cross-border connections between North India and Pakistan, as did Indus Chadha for her tireless enthusiasm and stellar interviews, and Aryn Bowman for transcribing long interviews while navigating unfamiliar languages. Also, Pete Oyler gave his summer to ransack archived periodicals, and Liz Mincer and Anne Watanabe provided valuable research assistance. For their inspiring archival support, I give my deep and respectful thanks to the women of the Sophia Smith Archives at Smith College who chart new paths for feminist archival activism: Joyce Folett, Sherrill Redmon, Kelly Anderson, Karen Kukil, Maida Goodwin, and the archival legacy of Kate Weigand. Also, Francisca de Haan helped to winkle out important materials from the Aletta Institute for Women's History in Amsterdam, and archivists at the Teen Murti Archives in New Delhi and

the P.C. Joshi Archives in JNU guided my opening requests for materials with skill and generosity. Early in the process of research, discussions with Zaira O. Rivera Casseles, Barbara Sicherman, Joan Hedrick, Laura Lovett, and Rob Corber shaped my research decisions in important ways. Revan Schendler read through an early draft of the manuscript and gave sage advice about revisions. My editors at Tulika Books, Indu Chandrasekhar and Rakhi Sehgal, provided their creative and careful thinking and firm belief in the project, while Vikas Rawal created maps just in time. Also, my editors at Routledge, Benjamin Holtzman and Max Novick, backed the project early and didn't give up hope.

My colleagues in the Study of Women and Gender Program, the Five College Women's Studies Research Center, the Environmental Science and Policy Program, and the concentrations in Community Engagement and Social Change, South Asia, and Sustainable Food push to make even administrative details creative and farsighted. Especially, I'd like to thank my co-conspirators for all the work we've done together: Payal Baneriee, Riché Barnes, Carrie Baker, Lucy Mule, Bosilika Glumac, Lester Tomé, Ambreen Hai, Susannah Howe, Arlene Avakian, Daniel Rivers, Liz Prvor, Eeva Sointu, Hye-Kyung Kang, Paula Giddings, Margaret Hunt, Laura Lovett, Shisuka Hsieh, Al Mosley, Kim Kono, Kevin Ouashie, Javne Mercier, Mariorie Senechal, Rick Fantasia, Vicky Spelman, Elliot Fratkin, Crystal Jones, Alex Keller, Darcy Buerkle, Nadya Shaiti, Abdelkader Berrahmoun, Lorna Peterson, Nancy Sternbach, Gary Lehring, Nancy Whittier, Susan Van Dyne, Marilyn Schuster, Joanne Corbin, Yoosun Park, Joanne Benkley, Greg White, Drew Guswa, Byron Zamboanga, Marsha Pruett, and David Smith.

The Five College Inter-Asian Political Cultures writing workshop and the Asian American writing workshop were valuable resources over all the years I've lived in the Pioneer Valley. Miliann Kang, Diana Yoon, Floyd Cheung, Richard Chu, Kavita Datla, Paula Chakravartty, Amrita Basu, Srirupa Roy, Svati Shah, and Krupa Shandilya were among the many inspiring people who fueled these vibrant working groups. Also, Kasturi Ray and Gautam Premnath formed the backbone of my first writing group very many years ago, setting the standard for generous and critical readings of numerous drafts of this project. Across time and space, close friends and comrades often made all the difference, especially Marilyn Filley, Arabella Holzbog, Erin Keesey, Sorayya Khan, Naeem Inayatullah, April Flowers, Durba Ghosh, Brian Steinberg, Amitava Kumar, Mona Ali, Libero della Piana, Edmund Campos, Polly Moran, Raza and Ali Mir, Alisa Gallo, Kehaulani Kauanui, Sunaina Maira, and Rupal Oza.

The infrastructure for long-term research is daily and reproductive: my family in its many, ever-widening circles gave me immeasurable support over the years. My aunts, Radha and Brinda, and my uncles, Prannoy and Prakash, with their sense of fun, commitment, and willingness to start an adventure and foster a debate spurred me to write this book. For new

venues in which to write and think, my parents, Margaret and Peter, fully indulged the necessity of digging clams and dropping baited hooks into the ocean alongside writing. My mother-in-law, Soni, who always sees the possibilities of the future, was generous with her encouragement throughout. And Rosy gave fresh perspective and a visionary eye to the project. For everyone in my family who asked about the project and listened actively to long answers, I can only marvel at your patience. I want to thank especially my sister and brother, who are also my best friends, Katharine and Phil, and my closest cousins, whom I couldn't live without: Ativa, Tara, Shonali, Mimi, Riku, Arjun, Tinku, Karuna, Mandakini, Surojit, Lulu, Rohini, Emily, Corey, Nick, Eleanor, Tim, Liz, Melissa, Ahmed, Nasik, Yasin, Mike, and Margie. I send love to the next generation, who provide hope for the future: Sebastian, Simone, Vivan, Gautam, Gaurav, Ayesha, Saira, Ahilya, Jack, Margot, Sahil, Diya, Piya, Max, Finley, Sonita, Salig, Sameer, John, Louise, and Alex. Also, my sisters- and brothers-in-law, Leela, Meera, Jojo, Harish, and Rani, opened their homes to me more times than I can count. For carrying alongside me an enduring vision of what should and can be, for imagining time as an ever-open vista, and for providing unvielding intellectual support as well as sustaining meals and clean floors, no one surpasses Vijay Prashad. His unwavering support, including reading countless drafts, made the book possible. My daughters, Zalia and Rosa Maya, make every day worth getting up for at the break of dawn; I give my deepest appreciation to a family that never tires of turning our next corner together.

I honor the memory of my nephew Ishan Bose-Pyne, born in the years I began my research on AIDWA. His laughter and unstinting love for this world are on every page of this book.

Contents

	List of Figures	X1
	Acknowledgments	xiii
	Introduction	1
1	Origins	16
2	Catalysts	44
3	Inter-Sectoral Praxis	69
4	Activist Research in Haryana	98
5	Anti-Casteism in Tamil Nadu	125
6	Anti-Violence in New Delhi and Chennai	152
7	AIDWA in the World	178
	Conclusion	216
	Notes Bibliography	221 253
	Index	271

Figures

1.1	State map of India.	14
1.2	Map of India with AIDWA membership numbers.	15
4.1	Map of Haryana.	97
5.1	Man of Tamil Nadu	124

Introduction

In 1991, the Indian government publically mandated a new agenda known as liberalization. The agenda was the domestic variant of neoliberalism, namely the giving over of large areas of the state and social life to the private business sector. In every aspect of their lives, people experienced the impact of liberalization. Survival in agricultural areas was damaged, cultural imaginations of people were foreshortened, and the well-being of the most vulnerable people became more precarious. Liberalization produced a churning of Indian society, with grotesque social consequences. Religious and communal violence increased; in 1992, the tearing down of the Babri Masjid in Avodhya during the anti-Muslim riots in India signaled future carnage. Caste conflict intensified. The Mandal Commission recommendations to reserve more seats for lower caste students, among other policy suggestions, were enacted in 1989. The vociferous protests in response to these new reservation policies revealed the hardening of caste hierarchies across the country, Landlordism gained new weapons. The blatant theft of common lands and the loss of political will around land reform matched the private property dogma of the new world order. Conspicuous consumption spiraled upwards, putting pressure on gendered traditions of accruing capital. Dowry harassment became an epidemic, with the overt violence against and murder of daughters-in-law often linked to demands for ongoing payments and goods from the woman's natal family. The precarious social value of women eroded further in these patriarchal economic regimes. Older forms of social, religious, and class fissures took on incendiary new forms with liberalization, and social justice movements were caught in the crossfire.

The Indian women's movement, with its amalgamation of non-governmental organizations (NGOs), autonomous feminist groups, and national mass women's organizations, was knocked sideways by the rapid changes in India's political terrain. Groups across the movement saw the weaknesses in their organizing strategies and reassessed their goals. While some retreated, others found ways to carve their own place in the upheaval of old certainties. This book follows the response of one national mass organization, the All India Democratic Women's Association (AIDWA), which

chose to directly oppose liberalization and the combustible forces it fueled. As a left-wing women's organization, AIDWA did not blink. The bulk of its membership was among rural and urban working poor women, and its strength in numbers was bolstered by its ideological tenets that sought to combat feudal and capitalist forms of women's oppression and exploitation. For the first ten years of its existence, AIDWA had operated with a theory that working women could unite with middle class women on common issues such as high commodity prices and anti-woman violence. After 1991, this theory of women's solidarity was seen to be insufficient.

AIDWA formed in 1981 as a federal women's organization with state-based units located across India. Socialist women's mass organizations in states like Maharashtra, Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, and Tripura, as well as Kerala and West Bengal, coalesced into one national federation with a founding membership of 590,000 women. By 2006, its membership grew to ten million women. These membership numbers are striking for a few reasons. First, AIDWA became one of the largest women's organizations in the world. Second, rural poor women alongside working poor urban women formed the largest base of its membership. Even more salient is that AIDWA accomplished its steady growth during the high point of neoliberalism, a doctrine composed of economic and social policies that typically works to render mass organizing ineffective if not almost impossible.

A central question of this book is how AIDWA managed to grow so rapidly across India, with its strength built from among the women most severely disenfranchised by neoliberal policies and governance. My contention is that during the 1990s, AIDWA pivoted away from its earlier strategy of organizing women around what were primarily common issues that crossed class and community locations toward a new praxis of intersectoralism that enabled its success. As it grew to become a large mass organization for women, activists at local levels developed methods that successfully organized people within and outside of their workplaces, inside their communities and beyond the norms of those community affiliations. In the process, inter-sectoral organizing created a stronger organizational fabric to resist the hallmarks of neoliberalism: the fragmentation of and competition between peoples and interests.

During the late 1980s, state and national leaders of AIDWA began to develop a sectoral theory of women's gendered lives. A sectoral theory of women's lives embeds an understanding of those social groupings in a systemic and historical class analysis. The term sectoral is not a new one: sectors or sections are words used interchangeably by members to describe the particular social groupings (such as those around religion, caste, class, language, location, and work status) that structure a polity and define people's lives within that polity. Early on in their organizing, AIDWA members defined sectoral issues nominally more than analytically. That is, sectoral issues denoted the specific needs of a subcategory of particularly oppressed women that demanded greater knowledge and targeted political attention.

After the anti-Sikh riots in Delhi in 1984, the visibility and political mobilization of anti-Muslim and other communal tensions rose. In the early 1990s, liberalization policies had infiltrated into Indian governance itself. In this context, AIDWA members' identification and analysis of particularly vulnerable sectors of women facilitated the emergence of the more integrated inter-sectoral method of organizing in the mid 1990s.

Inter-sectoral organizing refers to how this sectoral analysis of women in neoliberal India produced specific strategies, tactics, and even goals in AID-WA's political practices. I first heard the term 'inter-sectoral organizing' from Brinda Karat, the general secretary who led the organization from 1993 until 2004. Inter-sectoral organizing methods paid heed to the overlapping rather than discrete or bounded facets of women's lives. AIDWA members at the state and national levels combined their attention to specific women's issues with inter-sectoral organizing between these often porous and inter-related issues. As an organizing method, inter-sectoral organizing sought to create bridges of solidarity between distinct and seemingly conflicting groups of women. I use the term inter-sectoralism to describe these connections between AIDWA's ongoing conceptualization of women's sectoral issues and its inter-sectoral organizing.

Inter-sectoralism took the lived conflicts around women's differences as the daily stuff of women's inequality. To know and then effectively challenge rural Dalit women's oppression, for example, demanded a class analysis of agricultural day laborers, bonded workers, and landholders with very small plots of land. It required an understanding of the sexual politics of power and the gendered untouchability practices in rural localities. In addition, it had to take into account the sites where overlapping structures of casteist and feudal hierarchies met class exploitation and time-honed patriarchal systems of gender oppression. Campaigns fought Dalit women's oppression through methods like the public exposure and condemnation of atrocities. These campaigns sought to dismantle accepted caste norms through laws on the books alongside careful ideological work within the organization itself so that anti-casteist activism became every AIDWA member's struggle, not just a Dalit women's issue.

The organization's sectoral analysis sought to understand the specificities of an increasingly competitive and fragmented social polity. Its intersectoral organizing efforts attempted to knit anew the solidarities between women that could reach across these exclusionary, if not violent, divisions. Sectoral analyses and inter-sectoral organizing sought to foster movement leaders from precisely these oppressed and marginalized sectors of women. They also sought to build a stronger unity against divisions of caste, class, and religious bigotry, but it was a unity reconceived. Karat described this method as "inter-sectoral, inter-class and crossing" to explain their seemingly risky campaigns, which linked women's political activism across class, religious, and caste lines within the organization's membership and beyond. Sectoral analyses and inter-sectoral organizing methods lived

and breathed along the grain of neoliberalism and communalism to better derail their logics of fragmentation and their momentum toward antagonistic competition.

Attention to AIDWA's activism during the 1990s and early 2000s reveals what might seem obvious. It shows that organizing large numbers of women is tremendously difficult. The daily tasks for local, unpaid activists are sometimes tedious, such as ongoing communication, the logistics of membership, and the details of campaigns. At the core of this book are the stories of many women who worked at all levels of the organization, from local unit members to national leaders, who lived mainly in rural Harvana. rural and urban parts of Tamil Nadu, and New Delhi. These women took part in a highly visible and an often dangerous political refusal of neoliberalism. Their campaigns, many of which are ongoing, share a long-term goal to replenish the uneven social fabric. Yet each campaign, whether for access to common lands, women's physical and sexual safety, or castebased autonomy and equality, had its own complexities marked by each locality's history. The campaigns described in this book open up another set of questions about how AIDWA functions as a leftist women's organization: in its membership, its decision making, its leadership structures, and its internal reproduction. For if neoliberalism partly inspired sectoral analyses and inter-sectoral organizing methods, this book explores what allowed that counter-response to emerge from AIDWA.

AIDWA has deep ties with the Communist Party of India (Marxist) [CPI(M)]. It is politically independent of the CPI(M), but is part of the Party's universe of mass organizations. AIDWA shares with the CPI(M) a general orientation toward the Indian state and political economy. It also leverages its own power through the Party and its other mass organizations (labor union, youth, agricultural worker, agricultural cultivator, and student organizations). Many of its national and state-level leaders are also members of the CPI(M) who regard bringing women into radical politics as integral to their Marxist commitment to fighting for socialism. AIDWA is an enduring and militant part of the women's movement in India, focused on mobilizing the largest numbers of women to determine their own lives and build a more just future.

Membership is open to any woman regardless of her political affiliation, as long as she upholds the central organizational tenets of equality, emancipation, and the liberation of women. From its beginning, AIDWA has been an education for both the Party and the larger women's movement. It pushed its left allies to give more prominence to women's issues like dowry violence, and sexual violence in the home and by the state. It has sustained and deepened a gendered analysis of class exploitation. It also pioneered new ways for feminists to approach struggles against casteism and religious communalism through attention to the gender and class specificities of these bigotries.

This book represents the first major study of AIDWA to look at its geographical reach (across the country) and its class depth (from middle class women to landless women). It is also the first major study to look at AIDWA since its groundbreaking organizing strategy (inter-sectoral organizing) led to an expansion of its membership in the 1990s and 2000s. The earlier work on AIDWA (notably by Amrita Basu [1992] and Raka Ray [1999]) was published before this expansion.² These previous studies have been based on work in either one or two states and do not tackle the rural and urban parts of AIDWA. The sheer productive force of AIDWA's activism during the 1990s and into the 2000s, and the lack of attention given to it by scholars of the Indian women's movement, calls for analysis beyond what this volume provides.

AIDWA's differences from the autonomous women's movement in its organizing methods, its membership base, and its ongoing adherence to socialist ideals do not fully explain why it has attracted so little academic attention. Many early books written about the Indian women's movement gave primary attention to autonomous groups, and were written by women active in these groups.3 Even the more recent work that provides a richly informative window on feminist NGOs, small women's collectives, and governmental women's agencies has little to say about any of the national leftist women's organizations.4 Collections of essays purporting to represent South Asian feminisms and gender politics in India also hold an impoverished view of the movement as a complex whole.5

Apart from Ray and Basu, the academic literature on AIDWA is minimal. There are, however, two other kinds of writing on its analysis and activism. The first is AIDWA's own texts. There are the documents produced for its conferences held every three years. AIDWA publishes magazines in many states, in a host of languages. Each campaign and major issue that AIDWA selects to analyze generates pamphlets and research documents. These are not kept in one central archive, but are to be found in the many offices of AIDWA across the country and in the homes of members. The second is the work of journalists who cover AIDWA's campaigns and turn to AIDWA for its opinions on the myriad issues germane to its activism. Most magazines and newspapers tend to avoid AIDWA, but a few dedicated journalists such as Asha Krishnakumar and T.K. Rajalakshmi have followed AIDWA's work over many years. None of these writings can afford to stand outside the time of their production—they are about events and struggles that are ongoing and decisive. This means that none of these texts take the longer view in order to assess AIDWA's transformation from 1981 to the present.

This research project began in the early 1990s. It has taken me from the back roads of Haryana to the fisher communities of Tamil Nadu, from the members' homes of Mumbai to the organization's offices in Kolkata, from the headquarters and the legal clinic of AIDWA in Delhi. I have interviewed veteran and new members of AIDWA at the national level, the state