

INTERNATIONAL LAW and ITS DISCONTENTS

Confronting Crises

FDITED BY

BARBARA STARK

International Law and Its Discontents

CONFRONTING CRISES

Edited by

Barbara Stark

Hofstra University School of Law



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107047501

© Barbara Stark 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

International law and its discontents : confronting crises / edited by Barbara Stark.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04750-1 (Hardback)

Law-Social aspects.
 Law-Economic aspects.
 Comparative law.
 International law and human rights.
 Stark, Barbara, 1952-editor,

K561.I57 2015

341-dc23 2014045664

ISBN 978-1-107-04750-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

INTERNATIONAL LAW AND ITS DISCONTENTS

In Civilization and Its Discontents, Sigmund Freud argued that civilization itself is the major source of human unhappiness, inhibiting instincts and generating guilt. In Globalization and Its Discontents, Joseph Stiglitz shows how the "economic architecture" that produced globalization has also driven the backlash against it. This book brings together some of international law's most outspoken "discontents," those who situate their malaise in international law itself. Their shared objective is to expose international law's complicity in the ongoing economic and financial global crises and to assess its capacity – and its will – to address them constructively.

Some, like Freud, view that which holds us together as an inevitable source of discontent. Others, like Stiglitz, draw on the energy of the backlash. How have these crises affected particular groups, sovereign states, and international law itself? How have they responded? When does crisis serve as a catalyst, and for what?

Barbara Stark is Professor of Law at Hofstra University. She has published dozens of articles in the California and UCLA law reviews and the Yale, Stanford, Virginia, Vanderbilt, Pennsylvania, and Michigan journals of international law, among others. Since joining the Hofstra faculty in 2005, she has published five books.

CONTRIBUTORS

Dan Danielsen is Professor of Law at Northeastern University. Professor Danielsen's current research focuses on the role of corporate actors in transnational regulation and governance. His work identifies regulatory strategies to shape and harness corporate power to improve social welfare and increase economic development around the globe. Recent publications include: "Economic Approaches to Global Regulation: Expanding the International Law and Economics Paradigm," J. Int'l Bus. & L., 10 (2011), p. 23; "Local Rules and a Global Economy: An Economic Policy Perspective," Transnational Legal Theory, 1 (2010), p. 49.

Sharon F. Lean is Associate Professor and Graduate Director in the Department of Political Science at Wayne State University. Her specialty is Latin American politics. Her current research considers the impact of accountability institutions such as human rights commissions and election administration bodies on the quality of democracy. She is author of Civil Society and Electoral Accountability in Latin America (Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), which includes a chapter on the electoral underpinnings of Venezuela's Bolivarian Revolution. She is contributing coeditor with Thomas Legler and Dexter S. Boniface of Promoting Democracy in the Americas (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007).

Karin Mickelson is Associate Professor at the University of British Columbia Faculty of Law. Her research activities focus on the South-North dimension of international law, and she has been actively involved in TWAIL (Third World Approaches to International Law). She has analyzed the failure of international environmental law to respond to the concerns of the South in "South, North, International Environmental Law, and International Environmental Lawyers," Yearbook of International Environmental Law, 11 (2000), p. 52; recent publications include "The Maps of International Law: Perceptions of Nature in the Classification of Territory," Leiden Journal of International Law, 27 (2014), p. 621, and "Between Crisis and

Complacency: Seeking Commitment in International Environmental Law," *Netherlands Yearbook of International Law*, 44 (2013), p. 139.

Dianne Otto holds the Francine V. McNiff Chair in Human Rights Law at Melbourne Law School and is the Director of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities (IILAH). Professor Otto's research interests include addressing gender, sexuality, and race inequalities in the context of international human rights law, the UN Security Council's peacekeeping work, the technologies of global "crisis governance," and other threats to economic, social, and cultural rights, as well as the transformative potential of people's tribunals and other NGO initiatives. Recent publications include Rethinking Peacekeeping, Gender Equality and Collective Security (edited with Gina Heathcote, Palgrave, 2014) and three edited volumes, Gender Issues and Human Rights (Edward Elgar Publishing, 2013). She also authored a bibliographic chapter, "Feminist Approaches," in Oxford Bibliographies Online: International Law, ed. Tony Carty (Oxford University Press, 2012).

Ileana Porras is the Associate Dean of Academic Affairs at the University of Miami School of Law. Professor Porras teaches in the fields of international law (including international legal theory, European Union law, the international law of sustainable development, international environmental law, and trade and environment) and property law. She was the founding Director of the Brown International Advanced Research Institutes and has been a Visiting Professor at the Watson Institute-Brown University, Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law, Arizona State University, and Boston College Law School. Her scholarship has been primarily concerned with issues of violence, colonialism, trade, and the environment. Most recently her work has focused on the subject of the city and sustainable development. She is the author of "The City and International Law: In Pursuit of Sustainable Development," Fordham Urban Law Journal, 36 (2009), p. 537; "Appropriating Nature: Commerce, Property and the Commodification of Nature in the Law of Nations," Leiden Journal of International Law, 27:3 (September 2014), pp. 641-60; "Liberal Cosmopolitanism or Cosmopolitan Liberalism? Notes from International Law," in Parochialism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Foundations of International Law, ed. Mortimer Sellers (Cambridge University Press, 2011); and "Constructing International Law in the East Indian Seas: Property, Sovereignty, Commerce and War in Hugo Grotius' 'De Iure Praedae' -The Law of Prize and Booty, or 'On How to Distinguish Merchants from Pirates," Brooklyn Journal of International Law, 31 (2006), p. 741.

Brad R. Roth is Professor of Law and Political Science at Wayne State University. His scholarship applies political theory to problems in international

and comparative public law. He is the author of Sovereign Equality and Moral Disagreement (Oxford University Press, 2011), Governmental Illegitimacy in International Law (Oxford University Press, 1999), and numerous articles and book chapters on sovereignty, human rights, and international criminal justice, as well as the coeditor, with Gregory H. Fox, of Democratic Governance and International Law (Cambridge University Press, 2000).

Barbara Stark is Professor of Law at the Maurice A. Deane School of Law, Hofstra University. Her work has appeared in the California, UCLA, and Hastings law reviews and the Yale, Stanford, Michigan, Virginia, and Vanderbilt journals of international law, among others. Her recent publications include: "International Law from the Bottom Up: Fragmentation and Transformation," University of Pennsylvania Journal of International Law, 34 (2013), p. 687; "Jam Tomorrow: A Critique of International Economic Law," in eds. Chios Carmody et al., Distributive Justice and International Economic Law (Cambridge, 2012); "What's Left?" (reviewing International Law on the Left: Re-Examining Marxist Legacies (Susan Marks, ed., Cambridge University Press, 2008) George Washington International Law Review, 42 (2011), p. 191; "Theories of Poverty/The Poverty of Theory," BYU Law Review (2009), p. 381; and Family Law in the World Community (with Marianne Blair et al., 2009).

Andrew Strauss is Professor of Law and Associate Dean for Faculty Research and Strategic Initiatives at Widener University School of Law. He specializes in international law. Professor Strauss has been a Visiting Professor at the University of Notre Dame Law School, Rutgers Camden Law School, and the European Peace University. Strauss is coauthor (with Burns Weston, Richard Falk, and Hilary Charlesworth) of the fourth edition of International Law and World Order, a standard international law textbook. Recent publications include "Cutting the Gordian Knot: How and Why the United Nations Should Vest the International Court of Justice with Referral Jurisdiction," Cornell International Law Journal (2011) and A Global Parliament: Essays and Articles (with Richard Falk) (2011).

Jeanne M. Woods is the Ted and Louana Frois Distinguished Professor of International Studies at Loyola University College of Law in New Orleans. She teaches Public International Law, International Trade, International Human Rights, and Law and Poverty. In 2004, she was a Fulbright Lecturer at the China University of Political Science and Law in Beijing, Peoples' Republic of China. Her publications include Human Rights and the Global Marketplace: Economic, Social and Cultural Dimensions (Transnational Publishers/Brill, 2005) (with Hope Lewis).

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book began as a roundtable at the Annual Meeting of the American Society of International Law, and I am grateful to the Society for its efforts to stimulate critical debate. The Institute for Global Law and Policy at Harvard Law School provided a forum for the contributors at the half-way point, and we are deeply indebted to its Faculty Director, David Kennedy. The comments of those who joined that panel, including Kerry Rittich, Fran Ansley, Jennifer Rosenblum, and Alvaro Santos, were very much appreciated.

Finally, my warmest gratitude to those at Hofstra for their sustained support: to the law school for its generous research grants; to Deans Eric Lane and Ron Colombo for their steadfast support for faculty scholarship; to my indefatigable research librarian, Patricia Kastings; to my research assistant Christina Pingaro, who assumed major responsibility for the index; to Mary Ruggilo and Teresa Harrington, for their coordination of staff support; and especially to my assistant Joyce Amore Cox, for her years of patience, skill, and hard work.

John Berger has been a kind and wise editor, and we are happy to join the long list of distinguished legal scholarship that would not exist without him.

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments
Introduction: The Discontents Confront Crisis
Barbara Stark
PART I THE ENVIRONMENT
Binge Development in the Age of Fear: Scarcity, Consumption, Inequality, and the Environmental Crisis **Reana Porras**
2 International Law as a War Against Nature? Reflections on the Ambivalence of International Environmental Law Karin Mickelson
PART II GENDER
3 Decoding Crisis in International Law: A Queer Feminist Perspective
Dianne Otto
Barbara Stark
PART III SOVEREIGN STATES
5 Corporate Power and Instrumental States: Toward a Critical Reassessment of the Role of Firms, States, and Regulation in Global Governance
Dan Danielsen

6	Global Economic Inequality and the Potential for Global Democracy: A Functionalist Analysis	104
	Andrew Strauss	194
PA	ART IV INTERNATIONAL POLITICAL CRISIS	
7	A Bolivarian Alternative? The New Latin American Populism Confronts the Global Order Brad R. Roth and Sharon F. Lean	221
8	Global Crisis and the Law of War	221
	Jeanne M. Woods	249
Inc	dex	287

INTRODUCTION: THE DISCONTENTS CONFRONT CRISIS

Barbara Stark

I INTRODUCTION

In Civilization and its Discontents, Sigmund Freud argues that civilization itself is the major source of human unhappiness, inhibiting instincts and generating guilt. In Globalization and Its Discontents, Nobel prize-winning economist Joseph Stiglitz shows how the "economic architecture" which has produced globalization has also driven the backlash against it. This book brings together some of international law's most outspoken "discontents"; those who situate their malaise in international law itself. Their shared objective here is to expose international law's complicity in the ongoing economic and financial global crises and to assess its capacity – and its will – to address them constructively.

Some, like Freud, view that which holds us together as an inevitable source of discontent. Others, like Stiglitz, draw on the energy of the backlash to address urgent needs with radical pragmatism. Some are frustrated; others are angry; all are thoughtful and provocative.

This project began as a roundtable at the 2012 Annual Meeting of the American Society of International Law. The participants were invited to consider international law's "discontents" in relation to the Annual Meeting's theme, *Confronting Complexity*. Do its discontents generate "complexity" in international law? Do they resolve or even

I am deeply grateful to the Maurice A. Deane School of Law, Hofstra University, for its generous support of this project and to Joyce Amore Cox, for her patience and skill in preparing the manuscripts.

exploit it? To what effect? Under what circumstances does complexity disrupt what Antony Anghie has called the "civilizing mission [of the] imperial encounter?"

The speakers brought unexpected energy and originality to the session. They challenged the premises of the conference theme as well as the characterization of the 2008 economic and financial "crises" as somehow more significant than those that have affected the developing world more, and the developed world less. They questioned the constructs of "developed" and "developing," rejecting them along with "Global north and global south," "First and Third Worlds," and "the West and the Rest." They rejected the structure of the roundtable itself, appropriating for themselves (and an increasingly involved audience), the roles of interlocutors.

In this volume, three of the original participants are joined by six similarly prominent, cutting-edge international law scholars. They are a diverse and unruly group, tethered together by their shared focus on the ongoing global crises – their causes and consequences – and the transformative potential of international law.

A The Great Recession

The Great Recession has impacted more people worldwide than any crisis since the Great Depression. Rooted in bad government policy and worse corporate behavior in the United States, the American financial meltdown was globalized with devastating consequences, raising fundamental questions about global capitalism.

In 2007, the subprime mortgage market collapsed in the United States. Because lenders, such as Countrywide, made their money from the fees generated by transactions, they had been encouraging unqualified buyers to assume mortgage obligations that they would never be able to pay off. Subprime lending was not that risky, it was thought, as long as the residential real estate market remained strong and housing costs continued to grow. Homeowners also invested in the bubble, by taking out low-interest mortgage equity loans that enabled them to spend despite stagnant income.

The subprime mortgages themselves were sold to investment firms and repackaged. They were sliced and diced and rebundled into derivatives, complex securities created by investment banks and hedge funds. Because many of these "innovative" new instruments were unregulated, there was no legal obligation to secure them. Because there was no legal obligation, there were no reserves backing them when they failed. Even those that were regulated were highly leveraged; investors' debt was allowed to be as much as thirty times their equity. Ratings agencies, such as Standard & Poors, whose fees were paid by the investment banks, still gave them triple A ratings. Government regulators, like everyone else, were unconcerned.

Then the housing bubble burst and the entire market tumbled. The now-underwater mortgages, the "toxic assets," were impossible to isolate because no one knew how to unbundle the complex new derivatives. So the bottom fell out, and once venerable investment firms like Bear Sterns and Lehman Brothers collapsed. Markets panicked, triggering a global recession.

As Stiglitz explains in *Freefall*,² the United States economy constitutes such a large proportion of the global economy that when it dives, it takes the rest of the world with it. In addition, the United States exported its recession because it had already exported its philosophy of deregulation. One quarter of the inadequately secured United States mortgages were held by foreign banks.

Those in low income states were especially vulnerable. They were quickly hit by the collapse in global demand.³ Remittances – which dwarf foreign aid – from the United States and Europe plummeted.⁴ The crises also spread rapidly because of policies long-foisted on developing states by the United States and the International Monetary Fund (IMF).⁵

Joseph Stiglitz, Freefall: America, Free Markets and the Sinking of the World Economy (New York: W. W. Norton, 2010), p. 23.

² Ibid. ³ Ibid., p. 23.

⁴ Ibid., p. 24. Remittances were further reduced because the money transfer companies that enabled families to send money to keep their children in school were often the same companies that were used to send money to terrorist groups, such as the Shabab in Somalia. Nicholas Kulish, "Somalis Face a Snag in Lifelines From Abroad," *New York Times*, August 4, 2013.

⁵ Ibid.

B Inequality

The Great Recession spread like wildfire because globalization had already eliminated the barriers that might have slowed it down. But the impact of the Great Recession has been skewed. As economist Branko Milanovic explains, "[F]rom a global perspective, two decades of globalization have produced what 'seems like a fairly benign outcome.' If you look at the world as a single nation, income inequality has, in fact, declined. Income in the middle has grown faster than at the top." But inequality persists among countries, as Princeton economist Angus Deaton notes: "For every country with a catch-up story there has been a country with a left-behind story."

Inequality within states, in fact, has increased almost everywhere. According to French economist Thomas Piketty, author of Capital in the Twenty-First Century, income inequality is increasing. In terms of salary and compensation packages, Piketty shows that inequality in the United States is "probably higher than in any other society at any time in the past, anywhere in the world." As set out in the Equilar 100 CEO Pay Study, conducted for the New York Times, the median compensation for a chief executive in 2013 was a stunning \$13.9 million, up 9 percent from 2012. Piketty attributes two-thirds of the increase in American inequality over the past forty years to the growth of such "supersalaries."

Even the IMF has noted, for the first time, that inequality threatens global stability. In a recent study, the IMF concluded that: "A flatter distribution of income contributes more to sustainable economic growth than the quality of a country's political institutions, its foreign debt and openness to trade, its foreign investment and

⁶ Eduardo Porter, "A Global Boom, But Only For Some," New York Times, March 19, 2014, p. B1.

John Cassidy, "Forces of Divergence," The New Yorker, March 31, 2014, p. 69.

⁸ Thomas Piketty, Capital in the Twenty-First Century (2014).

⁹ Cassidy, "Forces of Divergence," p. 70.

Peter Eavis, "Executive Pay: Invasion of the Supersalaries," New York Times, April 13, 2014, p. BU1.

whether its exchange rate is competitive." Reducing income inequality is now explicitly part of the IMF's core mandate. 11

The crises may be easing for some, ¹² but even in the United States they continue for many. ¹³ The wealth divide among races in the United States has deepened. ¹⁴ A study by the Urban Institute showed that in 2010 whites on average had twice the income of blacks and Hispanics, but six times the wealth. ¹⁵ Europe, similarly, was hit hard. In May 2013, unemployment in the Eurozone reached a new high. ¹⁶ Spaniards foraged in dumpsters for food. ¹⁷ Greek children went hungry. ¹⁸ While industrial output in Germany rose 2.5 percent in June 2013, it declined 1.5 percent in France. ¹⁹ While some analysts

Eduardo Porter, "In New Tack, I.M.F. Aims At Income Inequality," New York Times, April 9, 2014, p. B1.

See for example Danielle Costello, "The Drought Is Over (at Least for CEOs's)," New York Times, April 11, 2011, www.nytimes.com/2011/04/10/ business/10comp.html?pagewanted=all (noting that the median pay for top executives at 200 major companies was \$9.6 million in 2010). Annie Lowrey, "Incomes Flat In Recovery, But Not For the 1%," New York Times, February 16, 2013, p. B1 (noting that "Incomes rose more than 11 percent for the top 1 percent of earners during the economic recovery, but not at all for everybody else, according to new data").

Motoko Rich, "Feeble Job Numbers Show Recovery Starting to Stall," New York Times, July 9, 2011, p. A1 (noting new Labor Department statistics showing an increase in unemployment, up to 9.2 percent).

Signe-Mary McKernan, et al., Less Than Equal: Racial Disparities in Wealth Accumulation, The Urban Institute, 2012 http://urban.org

¹⁵ Ibid.

David Jolly, "In Continuing Sign of Weakness, Unemployment Hits New High in the Euro Zone," New York Times, May 1, 2013, p. B2.

Suzanne Daley, "Spain Recoils as Its Hungry Forage Trash Bins for a Next Meal," New York Times, September 25, 2012, p. A6 (describing "survival tactics" where "unemployment rose over 50 percent among young people and more and more households have adults without jobs").

Liz Alderman, "More Children in Greece Start to Go Hungry," New York Times, April 17, 2013, p. A1 (citing "2012 Unicef report showing that among the poorest Greek households with children, more than 26 percent had an economically weak diet").

David Jolly, "Rising Output in Factories Hints at Growth in Europe," New York Times, August 14, 2013.

were encouraged by rising output in factories, twenty-six million Europeans remain unemployed.²⁰ In 2014, the European Union finally took a step back from German-inspired austerity, entering into a new budget pact allowing debt-burdened states such as Greece and Italy some much-needed leeway.²¹

The issues rending Europe, such as disappearing pensions and shrinking social safety nets,²² remain unimaginable luxuries in the developing states. As set out in the *UN Resolution on the World Economic Crisis*:²³

Developing countries, which did not cause the global economic and financial crisis, are nonetheless severely affected by it. The economic and social progress achieved during recent years, in particular on internationally agreed development goals, including the Millennium Development Goals, is now being threatened in developing countries, particularly least developed countries . . . Women also face greater income insecurity and increased burdens of family care. ²⁴

Since May of 2013, moreover, capital has been fleeing emerging markets as their currencies and stock markets plunge.²⁵

C The Crises in Developing States

Recent reports from the Bank, somewhat surprisingly, "show a broad reduction in extreme poverty." In part, this reflects the fact that the world's poorest had no jobs, housing, savings, benefits, or pensions to

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ Ian Wishart, "Renzi Prods Merkel into Shift as EU Eases Austerity Focus," Bloomberg News, June 27, 2014.

David C. Unger, "Europe's Social Contract, Lying in Pieces," New York Times, June 9, 2013; Jack Ewing, "A Recession's Daunting Reach," New York Times, April 26, 2013.

²³ G.A. Res. 63/303, UN GAOR, 63rd Sess., Agenda Itm 48, UN Doc. A/Res/63/303 (2009).

²⁴ Ibid., p. 2.

Paul Krugman, "This Age of Bubbles," New York Times, August 23, 2013, p. A27.

Annie Lowrey, "Extreme Poverty in Developing World is Down Despite the Recession, Report Says," New York Times, March 7, 2012, p. A4.

lose. Closer analysis shows that while there has been "a small drop in the number of people living below \$2 per day ... the number of people living between \$1.25 and \$2 almost doubled from 648 million to 1.18 billion between 1981 and 2008."²⁷

But questions have been raised about the validity of the benchmark for "extreme poverty" itself.²⁸ The Bank assumes an improvement in "poverty" using the \$1.25 per day standards of the poorest 10–20 countries. As critics note, this is barely subsistence. Many also question the usefulness of GNP or per capita expenditure as meaningful indicators.²⁹ Amartya Sen and Martha Nussbaum, for example, have set out an alternative to GNP that focuses on "human capabilities . . . what people are actually able to do and be."³⁰

Half of the decline in the extreme poverty rate, moreover, is attributable to China, ³¹ where growth is slowing. ³² Nor do the bank reports take into account the costs of that growth, including environmental degradation. ³³ According to *The Lancet*, China's outdoor pollution contributed to 1.2 million premature deaths in 2010, or 40 percent of the worldwide total. ³⁴ An American science journal reported in July 2013 that life expectancy in northern China had fallen by five years because of air pollution. ³⁵

²⁷ Ibid.

Annie Lowrey, "Movin' On Up," New York Times Magazine, May 5, 2013, p. 18.

See for example Martha C. Nussbaum, Women and Human Development: The Capabilities Approach (2006), pp. 5–6.

³⁰ Ibid. ³¹ Lowrey, "Movin' On Up," p. 16.

Keith Bradsher, "Easy Credit Dries Up, Choking Growth in China," New York Times, April 16, 2013, p. A1; Keith Bradsher, "China Says Lending Put Growth Rate at 7.5 Percent," New York Times, July 16, 2014, p. B2 (noting that heavy lending by the central bank "appears to have headed off or at least delayed a widely expected broader slowdown of the Chinese economy").

³³ See for example Edward Wong, "Life in a Toxic Country," New York Times, August 4, 2013, p. SRI.

Ted Alcorn, "China's Skies: A Complex Recipe for Pollution with No Quick Fix," The Lancet 1973, 1973–1974 (2013), p. 381.

Yuyu Chen et al., "Evidence on the Impact of Sustained Exposure to Air Pollution on Life Expectancy from China's Huai River Policy," Proc. Nat'l Acad. Sci. USA 12936, 12936–12941 n. 32 (2013), p. 110.