

蒿 琨 (HAO Kun) 著

**BOOKER T. WASHINGTON
VS.
W. E. B. DU BOIS
AND
THEIR LEGACY
FOR
AFRICAN-AMERICAN
LEADERSHIP**

布克·华盛顿与杜波依斯的思想之争
及其对非裔政治领袖的影响



社会科学文献出版社
SOCIAL SCIENCES ACADEMIC PRESS (CHINA)

布克·华盛顿与杜波依斯的思想之争
及其对非裔政治领袖的影响

蒿 琨 (HAO Kun) 著

**BOOKER T. WASHINGTON VS. W. E. B. DU BOIS
AND THEIR LEGACY
FOR AFRICAN-AMERICAN LEADERSHIP**



社会科学文献出版社
SOCIAL SCIENCES ACADEMIC PRESS (CHINA)

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

布克·华盛顿与杜波依斯的思想之争及其对非裔政治
领袖的影响 = Booker T. Washington vs. W. E. B. Du

Bois and Their Legacy for African-American

Leadership: 英文 / 蒿琨著. -- 北京: 社会科学文献

出版社, 2017. 7

ISBN 978-7-5201-0812-6

I. ①布… II. ①蒿… III. ①华盛顿 (Washington,
Booker T. 1856-1915) - 政治思想 - 研究 - 英文 ②杜波伊
斯 (Du Bois, William Edward Burghardt 1868-1963) - 政
治思想 - 研究 - 英文 ③美国黑人 - 民权运动 - 历史 - 研究
- 英文 IV. ①D097.12 ②D771.25

中国版本图书馆CIP数据核字 (2017) 第151825号

Booker T. Washington vs. W. E. B. Du Bois and Their Legacy for African-American
Leadership

Authored by Hao Kun

ISBN 978-7-5201-0812-6

Published by Social Sciences Academic Press

13/15 F, A/B Tower of Hua Long Plaza, Bldg 3, Jia No. 29, Beisanhuan Zhonglu, Xicheng
District, Beijing, P.R. China

Postcode: 100029

Project Manager: Gao Mingxiu

In-house Editors: Wang Xiaoqing, Liao Hanbin

Printed in Beijing, China

Price: 98 RMB

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced by any means without written
permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgements

There are a number of people whose support and patience have made the completion of this book possible. I especially would like to thank my Ph.D. supervisor, Professor Wang Enming, to whom I owe a tremendous debt of gratitude. Firstly, he, with his profound knowledge in American culture and his passion for and devotion to American studies, has reinforced my dedication into this major. Secondly, Professor Wang has given me enormous help and support in my term paper writing and my application for the Fulbright program. Thirdly, I want to thank him for reading my thesis at different stages, and for the encouragement, understanding and suggestion he has given to me. He has worked with me throughout the process of writing this book. His critical scrutiny and invaluable suggestions have guided me to work through every draft of every chapter of this book, and his comprehensive knowledge has assisted in the refinement of my writing and the fruition of this thesis.

My gratitude also goes to scholars on African American studies, both at home and abroad, whose contributions to this field have influenced the construction of this book and broadened my perspective on the issues discussed in it. I also want to extend my appreciation to professors at Harvard for the books they recommended for this book. I also owe gratitude to staffs at Widener Library and Lamont Library of Harvard University, who kindly assisted me in finding books relevant to my book. This open-minded experience at Harvard University made

my study of American society and culture that started at postgraduate stage and resumed during the Ph.D stage more meaningful.

I would also like to thank those dedicated teachers, Professor Yu Jianhua, Professor Zhangjian, Professor Gu Lixing, Professor Zhang Dingquan, etc., in the English College of Shanghai International Studies University for their thought-provoking classes. I also like to thank my classmates and co-workers at SISU for their friendship. It is a great luck to share this academic journey with those young and promising future scholars.

Additionally, I want to express my thankfulness and love to my husband and my family members who have been loving and supporting me in every avenue of my life. Their sacrifice, understanding and encourage help me finish the journey of pursuing a doctorate degree. Last of all, I want to give my thanks to my son. It is exactly because of him that I have learned to grow up with a more mature mind of balancing life and work and working with high efficiency.

摘要

非裔美国人与白人同是美国社会的缔造者和改造者。同时，非裔美国人在美国社会和历史中被重新塑造，并深受美国自由平等的社会文化思想影响。然而，奴隶制的废除以及美国宪法第十四条、十五条修正案的通过，并没有让非裔美国人享有与白人同等的自由和权利。就如何为非裔美国人争取自由与平等的权利，非裔领袖产生了严重的分歧。这些分歧主要体现在三个方面，即非裔领袖之间的意识形态差异、领袖风格区别和实践技巧的不同。非裔领袖的这些分歧，一方面源于他们因不同的成长背景和人生经历而形成的对美国社会的不同认知，另一方面受到特定历史时期族裔关系的制约及美国社会文化与政治环境的影响。

19 世纪与 20 世纪之交，布克·T. 华盛顿与 W. E. B. 杜波依斯就非裔美国人实现自由与平等的路径展开了一场辩论，这场辩论是非裔美国人历史上第一场重要的辩论，也是非裔美国人走向分歧之路的开始。华盛顿主张非裔群体通过接受职业教育获得财富和经济地位，通过自我奋斗的方式取得主流社会的认可，进而实现平等。就当时美国南方的政治环境而言，华盛顿不主张非裔美国人争取政治权利，认为要求政治权利对非裔美国人的发展没有实质性的意义。与之相反，杜波依斯强调政治手段，认为政治权利是保障非裔美国人其他权利的根本和基础。没有政治权利的保障，非裔美国人获得的其他权利只能是暂时的、不稳固的。他主张通过抗争手段来获取非裔美国人应该享有的权利。同时，杜波依斯坚持非裔美国人应该接受全面的高等教育，主张受过高等教育的非裔精英扮演非裔美国人领袖

的角色。华盛顿与杜波依斯思想最主要的分歧在于：非裔美国人应优先追求政治权利还是经济地位？非裔美国人应该接受传授基本技能的职业教育还是全面的高等教育？非裔美国人的未来是通过按主流新教传统自我优化、自我奋斗来保障，还是依靠族群中的精英来引领？

华盛顿与杜波依斯关于实现非裔美国人自由平等的路径之争成为非裔美国人在美国社会争取平等的重要思想遗产，为后来非裔领袖带领非裔美国人群体在美国社会实现进步提供了重要的理论基础，并且在这一方面仍起着重要的指导意义。杜波依斯的思想奠定了抗争的基调，20世纪60年代美国的民权运动继承了杜波依斯的这一思想，用抗争的方式争取政治权利和种族平等。而民权运动后期，黑人民族主义强调非裔的经济权利，这一点是华盛顿经济赋权思想的延伸。随着20世纪80年代美国社会新保守主义的复兴，华盛顿强调非裔美国人自我奋斗和内化自我素质的思想被黑人新保守派赋予了新的历史意义，并被用来向杜波依斯一派的思想发起挑战。进入21世纪后，以巴拉克·奥巴马为代表的新一代非裔精英成为非裔领袖的代表，使杜波依斯的精英思想对美国未来社会的意义再次成为值得人们思考的问题。

本书讨论华盛顿与杜波依斯分别为非裔美国人设计的获得自由、平等的路线，阐述两人思想之争，比较二者思想上的异同，从而分析他们的思想遗产对后来美国非裔领袖的深刻影响。本书分为六个部分：引言部分阐述本书的研究意义与拟研究的问题，梳理国内外研究的相关状况和有关文献资料。第一章和第二章分别论述华盛顿、杜波依斯两人的个人经历，以及二者在非裔如何在美国社会获得自由平等这一问题上的重要观点，并从这些观点入手探讨他们二人留下的思想遗产。第三章探讨两人在教育、政治权利、社会地位等领域的思想分歧，并从美国社会和政治文化的矛盾性出发阐释华盛顿与杜波依斯间思想分歧的本质。第四章分析华盛顿和杜波依斯的思想遗产对后来非裔领袖的历史意义，即其是如何影响20世纪下半叶非裔美国人的斗争走向的。他们的思想遗产为民权运动、黑人民族主义、黑人新保守主义、“民权运动既成派”等社会运动和思潮提供了相关的理论依据。结论部分在总结全文的基础上指出华盛顿与杜波依斯的思想

辩论有三个层面的意义：美国社会政治文化本身的对立矛盾性导致非裔领袖在阐释美国社会时必然发生分歧，非裔美国人的思想分歧是对美国社会一种更为深刻的认识；非裔美国人思想的分歧为其在美国社会取得进步提供了更多的可能性，他们正在这种分歧中前进；华盛顿与杜波依斯对立的非裔美国人路径随着美国社会的进步与变革已经演化成互补的手段。当代非裔美国人从二人的思想中各取所需，攀登着美国社会的进步阶梯。

关键词：布克·T. 华盛顿；W. E. B. 杜波依斯；非裔领袖；民权运动；黑人民族主义；新保守派

Abstract

Throughout their experience in the U.S., African Americans, their leaders in particular, have been wrestling with the problem of how to apply the principles of liberal democracy to them. However, African American leaders differ markedly in ideologies, leadership styles and tactics. The differences, on the one hand, are caused by their different life experiences and perceptions of American society, and on the other hand, are shaped by racial landscapes at given times and in given places, as well as changes in American social and political developments. A classical case in point is the differences between two great black leaders, Booker T. Washington and W. E. B. Du Bois. Their debate on the road to achieve freedom and equality for blacks indicates the deep disagreement on strategies of combating rising segregation and discrimination among African American community.

To Washington, economic empowerment, not political rights and social equality, ranks as the first urgent goal for blacks to attain after their emancipation. Thus, Washington, emphasizing self-help and industrial education, advocates to gain economic success first and avoid directly confronting the segregation and disfranchisement issues. Washington believes that blacks as an efficient workers could gain wealth, and that eventually through their ownership of capital they would be able to achieve status recognized by the American society. By contrast, Du Bois rejects racial segregation and blacks' disfranchisement. Political right

was a major concern of Du Bois. He firmly maintains that political power is the beginning of all permanent reforms and the only hope for maintaining gains. Du Bois believes that higher education would be the real path to racial progress for blacks, and held the view that high education was for the exceptional part of his race, namely "the Talented Tenth" who serves as the leadership for blacks.

More importantly, the influence of Washington-Du Bois debate is lasting and the significance of it is profound. Washington and Du Bois continue to speak to us beyond their own historical eras. Many of their opposing ideologies can still be found in today's discussions on black issues, providing theoretical bases for black people's search for progress in America. Washington and Du Bois debate finds itself in the Civil Rights Movement, Black Nationalism, Black Neo-Conservatism, etc. The modern black movements are influenced by Washington-Du Bois debate but also extension of their debate.

This book consists of six parts. In the introductory part, this book firstly introduces the origins of this book and the problems this book aims to solve. Then this book moves on to define black leadership, establishing the working definition for the discussion of African American leadership in this book. Following that, this book proceeds to the literature review of present study of Washington and Du Bois, pointing out the dimension that has been researched and the workable attempts that could be made in further study. Based on the above endeavor, this book outlines its own research approach and working framework.

Chapter One first summarizes Washington's life experience and his main thoughts concerning racial problems and black people's progress in America. Following that, the historical and social background where Washington was set is discussed, in order to help understand the limitations of Washington's thoughts and progressive points in his thinking. And then Chapter One ends with an evaluation of Washington's whole life with a detailed discussion on his legacy and his limitations.

Following the discussion of Washington, Chapter Two, in the same way, first summarizes Du Bois' life experience and his main thoughts concerning racial problems and black people's progress in America. Then it goes on to discuss the historical context in the formation of Du Bois' thoughts in order to have a deep understanding of its limitations and progressive points. Similarly, this chapter ends with an evaluation of Du Bois' whole life with a detailed discussion on his legacy and his limitations.

On the basis of the examination both in Chapter One and Chapter Two, Chapter Three moves on to compare and contrast the similarities and differences in their thoughts. The conflicts of their thoughts in the political, social, economic as well as cultural fields are explored one by one. And more importantly, the second part of this chapter interprets the nature of their conflicts from the perspectives of American political culture and American history, and argues that their conflicts reflect the opposing ideologies in America history such as conservatism vs. liberalism, pragmatism vs. idealism, the North culture vs. the South culture, as well as different interpretations of American Dream.

Beyond that, Chapter Four, from a historical perspective, goes on to explore the significance of Washington-Du Bois debate to later African American leaders with the aim of presenting a clear understanding of the continuity and development of African American leadership. Washington-Du Bois debate finds itself in the Civil Rights Movement, Black Nationalism, the reemergence of Neo-Conservatism, and well as the battle between black Neo-Conservatism and "Civil Rights Establishment".

Finally, based on the discussion in the previous chapters, in the conclusion part, this book argues that the conflicts between Washington and Du Bois are reflection of contradictions in American culture itself. Washington-Du Bois debate has evolved into complimentary means that help direct black people in their search for progress within the transformed and advanced American society. The divergence and division of the roads to uplift in American society among

African Americans on the one hand indicate a more profound understanding of American society on the side of African Americans, and on the other hand provide more possibilities for African Americans to achieve final equality.

Keywords: Booker T. Washington; W. E. B. Du Bois; Black Leadership; Civil Rights Movement; Black Nationalism; Neo-Conservatism

Contents

Introduction	/ 1
Chapter One Booker T. Washington and His Legacy	/ 31
Chapter Two W. E. B. Du Bois and His Legacy	/ 62
Chapter Three Washington vs. Du Bois: Clashes and Clashes Interpretations	/ 93
Chapter Four The Significance of Washington-Du Bois Legacy to Later Black Leadership	/ 124
Conclusion	/ 151
Bibliography	/ 157

Introduction

0.1 Origins of this Book

Although the American Civil War destroyed slavery, it did not end the “race problem”. Nor did the Thirteenth, Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments to the U.S. Constitution and a dozen years of “reconstruction” significantly change the status of African Americans as second-class citizens. Most African Americans remained inferior to most whites in economic status, political power, and the exercise of civil rights, to say nothing of self-esteem or social prestige. In the quest for equality and racial advancement, African Americans have managed to draw their leaders from their own ranks. Although African American leaders face the same fundamental dilemma that how can the principles and practices of liberal democracy be extended and guaranteed to them, they differ markedly in ideologies, leadership styles and strategies. The differences, on the one hand, are caused by their different personal life experiences and perceptions of American society, and on the other hand, are shaped by the racial landscapes at given times and in given places, as well as changes in American social and political developments. A classical case in point is the differences between two great black leaders, Booker T. Washington and W. E. B. Du Bois. Their intense debate over the road to achieve freedom and equality for blacks is the first case

of controversy among African Americans, indicating deep disagreements on strategies and opinions on combating rising segregation and discrimination, and on promoting black social and economic progress among black people.

During the years after the failure of Reconstruction in the South, no movement affecting African Americans life was more important than the program of Booker T. Washington. In 1895, Washington was invited to make a speech for the opening of the Atlanta Cotton States and International Exposition before a biracial audience. This speech was well received by both blacks and whites and thus made him rise to national prominence and emerge as a powerful African American leader. Certain African Americans raised their voices against Washington's stand in Atlanta Exposition Speech. Among them, W. E. B. Du Bois won recognition as the leader of the opposition by publicly criticizing Washington's industrial education program practiced in Tuskegee Institute and his accommodating racial strategy. On the contrary, Du Bois highlighted the importance of an overall higher education for African Americans and intensively condemned the disfranchisement of black people.

The debate between Washington and Du Bois involves such controversies as accommodation versus protest, segregation versus integration, industrial education versus liberal-arts education, economic progress versus political rights. Accordingly, this debate offers two roads for black people to choose from in order to achieve the ends of freedom and equality. More importantly, the influence and significance of this debate is lasting and profound. Washington and Du Bois continue to speak to us beyond their own historical era. Many of their opposing ideologies can still be found in today's discussions on black issues, providing theoretical bases for black people's search for progress in America. The Washington-Du Bois debate finds itself in the Civil Rights Movement, Black Nationalism, Black Neo-Conservatism etc. The modern-black movements are influenced by Washington-Du Bois debate, but they are also extension of their debate.

0.2 Research Questions of this Book

Since Washington-Du Bois debate concerns the fundamental issues of black people such as political rights, economic power and social status from the end of the Civil War until the present, this book, through a study of the controversy of the two prominent black leaders, intends to make a modest effort in contributing to the knowledge and understanding of the impact and influence of the debate on the leadership of African Americans and shed light on the understanding of African American political thoughts in general. To this end, this book raises several related questions as follows:

- (1) What are the key thoughts of Booker T. Washington and W. E. B. Du Bois regarding black people's road to achieve freedom and equality?
- (2) In what extent have their personal life experiences and the social environments that they lived in shaped their perceptions of racial problems?
- (3) What are the differences and similarities between Washington's key thoughts and Du Bois'? Why did they prioritize political rights, economic rights and social equality in different ways? To what extent could the reasons of their differences be interpreted from the conflicting presence of American political culture itself?
- (4) What are the legacies left behind by Washington and Du Bois for later black leaders? What is the historical significance of Washington-Du Bois controversy to black movements throughout the twentieth century? In what ways are their legacies reinterpreted by black leaders in those movements?
- (5) Does Washington-Du Bois debate still possess significance to black leaders in the twenty-first century, when America is under new historical conditions? What is the future for black leadership?

0.3 The Significance of This Book

The significance of this book lies in the following aspects:

To begin with, this book argues that there has never been any unanimous voice among blacks. Since the emancipation of black people, black leaders have sought diverse ways to achieve first-class citizenship. However, how to reach this goal has remained debatable among black leaders. At the turn of the twentieth century, some advocated to use physical violence to force concessions from the whites. A few urged blacks to return to Africa. The majority, however, suggested that black Americans use peaceful, democratic means to change undesirable conditions. At this period of time, Washington encouraged blacks to become skilled workers, hoping that if they became indispensable to the prosperity of the South, political and social rights would be granted to them. Du Bois' advice was to struggle for civil rights, specifically the right to vote, grounding on the assumption that once voting rights are achieved, economic and social rights would follow. The controversy between Washington and Du Bois is the first classical debate on these black related issues, leaving room for the opposing thoughts to develop among blacks later. In 1905, W. E. B Du Bois and his colleagues issued the Niagara Movement, initiating the modern Civil Rights Movement. The Civil Rights Movement ended in the 1960s, with its basic goals and objectives having been achieved through passage of the Fair Housing Act of 1968. As a matter of fact, two years earlier, in 1966, the Civil Rights Movement was challenged first by the advocates of Black Power, and then by more diverse factions of radicals and black nationalists. Beginning with an analysis of the opposing thoughts of Washington and Du Bois, and then moving on to an exploration into the historical significance of their debate to the divergence among modern black leaders, this book presents an overall debatable history of African American in their struggle for freedom and equality.