

Maria Repnikova introduces the webs of Chinese media politics that are hidden beneath the imagery of overarching contention between the omnipowerful state and suppressed dissidents. Drawing on rich empirical data, this novel analysis demonstrates that the relationship between China's critical journalists and the state is that of a fluid collaboration, whereby an ambiguous partnership is sustained through continuous acts of guarded improvisation. Journalists and the state actively reinvent the rules of their engagement, but the latter holds the upper hand in controlling the space and scope of this creative manoeuvring. This improvised cooperative mode of state-society relations differs from other authoritarian contexts, pointing to China's uniqueness when it comes to managing critical voices in the long-term. This book provides fresh empirical and theoretical insights into Chinese politics, comparative authoritarianism and global communication.

Maria Repnikova is a scholar of comparative authoritarianism and political communication in illiberal contexts, with a focus on China and Russia. She holds a Doctorate in Politics from Oxford University where she was a Rhodes Scholar. In the past, Maria has researched Chinese migration to Russia as a Fulbright Fellow, has held the Overseas Press Club fellowship in Beijing and was a post-doctoral fellow at the Annenberg School for Communication. Maria speaks fluent Mandarin and Russian. She teaches international communication, Chinese media politics and society, and information politics in non-democratic regimes.

Cover image by Aaron Taylor-Waldman





# Media Politics in China

# Media Politics in China

# Improvising Power under Authoritarianism

Maria Repnikova

Georgia State University



### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryagani, Delhi – 110002, India 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107195981
DOI: 10.1017/9781108164474

© Maria Repnikova 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19598-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Media Politics in China

Maria Repnikova introduces the webs of Chinese media politics that are hidden beneath the imagery of overarching contention between the omnipowerful state and suppressed dissidents. Drawing on rich empirical data, this novel analysis demonstrates that the relationship between China's critical journalists and the state is that of a fluid collaboration, whereby an ambiguous partnership is sustained through continuous acts of guarded improvisation. Journalists and the state actively reinvent the rules of their engagement, but the latter holds the upper hand in controlling the space and scope of this creative manoeuvring. This improvised cooperative mode of state-society relations differs from other authoritarian contexts, pointing to China's uniqueness when it comes to managing critical voices in the long-term. This book provides fresh empirical and theoretical insights into Chinese politics, comparative authoritarianism and global communication.

Maria Repnikova is a scholar of comparative authoritarianism and political communication in illiberal contexts, with a focus on China and Russia. She holds a Doctorate in Politics from Oxford University where she was a Rhodes Scholar. In the past, Maria has researched Chinese migration to Russia as a Fulbright Fellow, has held the Overseas Press Club fellowship in Beijing and was a post-doctoral fellow at the Annenberg School for Communication. Maria speaks fluent Mandarin and Russian. She teaches international communication, Chinese media politics and society, and information politics in non-democratic regimes.



To Change-Makers Within the System



This book examines the relationship between China's critical journalists and the party-state in the past decade, under the Hu-Wen leadership. In contrast to existing scholarship on comparative authoritarianism and Chinese politics and society, which tends to analyse the perspectives of societal actors and the state separately from one another, this study brings the two together, unveiling the intricacies of their interactions. It portrays the engagement between critical journalists and central officials as a fluid, state-dominated partnership characterised by continuous improvisation. Party officials grant journalists an ambiguous consultative role, while journalists align their political and professional agenda to the central state. Their collaboration is maintained in large part due to the flexible nature of this arrangement, referred to as 'guarded improvisation'. The two actors make ad hoc adjustments in response to one another, but the party-state consistently directs the process and the scope of this creative manoeuvring.

The analysis draws on unique access to politically sensitive material, including 120 in-depth interviews with critical journalists, media and crisis management experts, and government officials. It also includes multilayered textual analysis of the Chinese Communist Party journal, Qiushi, and selected articles in two outspoken media outlets, Caijing and Nanfang Zhoumo. The data is employed to analyse the routine interactions between critical journalists and the party-state, as well as their dynamics during major crisis events, specifically the Wenchuan earthquake and coal-mining disasters. This study further includes a comparative dimension by drawing contrasts between the case of China and the Soviet Union, as well as between China and Russia, and between the Hu-Wen period and the Xi era.

Through the lens of journalist-state relations, this book theorises the workings of limited openings for political public participation in China and under authoritarianism more broadly. In China, it captures the bottom-up and top-down dimensions of these openings by underscoring the within-the-system nature of China's societal activism, as well as its

### Preface

X

unequal positioning vis-à-vis the state, and the importance of mutually embraced ambiguity for sustaining the engagement between critical voices and central officials. The book further demonstrates how the top-down management of political openings in China carries both consultative and fluid dimensions as the state opens up some input channels in policy-making while keeping the rules of the game intentionally ambiguous. Finally, the book questions the dichotomy of resilience versus democratisation underlying the study of comparative authoritarianism by highlighting the potential for societal actors to shape authoritarian governance in a constructive manner, even if not managing or intending to pave the way for a democratic transition.

## Acknowledgements

This book is a product of intellectual and emotional synergy from many individuals across three continents. The groundwork for the study was laid during my time as a doctoral student at the University of Oxford, under thoughtful supervision of Professors Vivienne Shue and Stephen Whitefield. Professor Shue was the first to spark and sustain my interest in Chinese politics, media and society, and her inspiring intellectual guidance and logistical support over the past eight years made for the nucleus of this project. She has always pushed me to delve deeper into pursuit of puzzles that intrigue me the most in the field this book represents one of these puzzles. Professor Whitefield added a comparative and theoretical lens to the study of China and helped position my ideas in the context of varieties of authoritarianism and political participation in illiberal systems. His perspective transformed the project, and I am very grateful for his supervision.

Encouragement and support from mentors and colleagues, including Andrew Mertha, Guobin Yang, Marwan Kraidy, Harley Balzer, Rana Mitter, Jonathan Sullivan, Jeffrey Wasserstrom, Anne-Marie Brady, Daniel Lynch, Patricia Thornton, Kristen Looney, Christian Sorace, Rachel Murphy, Kevin O'Brien, Rachel Stern, Ashley Esarey, Peter Lorentzen, Daniela Stockmann, Jonathan Hassid, Marina Svensson, Timothy Colton, James Phillips, Floriana Fossato, Karrie Koesel, Rongbin Han, Maria Lipman, Bingchun Meng, Ola Onuch, Victor Pickard, Tania Saeed, Martin Dimitrov, Wang Haiyan, Nancy Bermeo, Monroe Price, Michael D. Carpini, Kecheng Fang, Mohamed Zayani, Omar Al-Ghazzi, Anne Kaun, Yue Hou, Min Jiang, amongst others, have greatly enriched the writing and the analysis. All the mistakes in this book, of course, are solely my own.

Financial support from the Rhodes Trust, the Wai Seng Scholarship Fund, the Contemporary China Studies Programme at Oxford, the Leverhulme Trust Grant, St. Antony's College, Oxford University Department of Politics and International Relations, and most recently the Project for Advanced Research in Global Communication (PARGC)

at the Annenberg School for Communication, University of Pennsylvania, has enabled me to carry out the research and writing.

Between 2014 and 2016, as a postdoctoral fellow at the Annenberg School, I received enormous support in the process of completing the manuscript revisions. I am especially grateful to Marina Krikorian who has offered daily doses of encouragement and intellectual exchange, and made me feel welcome, as well as to all the wonderful staff at Annenberg, and of course, to Marwan Kraidy who tirelessly reminded me that the book project is the key objective of my fellowship and has graciously given me enough time to complete it. I would have never come to PARGC were it not for the introduction and support from Guobin Yang. His friendship, mentorship and nuanced approach to scholarship on Chinese media and society have been truly inspiring. Special thank you goes to Michael D. Carpini, the Dean of Annenberg School, who has welcomed and integrated me into the community of communication scholars and encouraged me to pursue the path of global communication.

During the process of manuscript revisions, a number of invited talks have brought new questions and insights into the analysis. A visit to Cornell University in October 2015 is especially memorable, thanks to the invitation of Andrew Mertha, who has become a very supportive mentor and a friend in the past several years. His work on fragmented authoritarianism and policy entrepreneurship has been a rich influence in this book.

From idea development to production stages of the book, Lucy Rhymer at Cambridge University Press has offered timely and consistent support. As a first-time author, it has been a tremendous pleasure to work with her and all the staff at Cambridge University Press in making this book come to fruition. I would also like to thank my current employer, Georgia State University, Department of Communication, for allocating time and resources in these last steps on the book's journey to publication.

Media Politics in China would not have been possible without the help of colleagues and interviewees in China and in Russia. I am forever indebted to the individuals who have selflessly helped me carry out the research on a subject that is sensitive and challenging to investigate for insiders and outsiders alike. A special thank you is due to Professor Zhan Jiang, who has taught me the most I know about China's media politics, and generously shared his contacts and advice throughout my research. Professor Xiao Dongfa at Beijing University has helped with contacts and research support from the very beginning and made Beijing a home each time I visited. He sadly passed away in April 2016, and this book is in part a tribute to his friendship and wisdom. Liu Cong, Anna and Cissy have provided invaluable research assistance and support. Filip Noubel, a close friend and a beautiful writer and translator, as well as a long-time

resident and an unbeatable media and society expert in Beijing, has shared rare practitioner insights on the subject, as well as his intricate knowledge of Chinese tea, literature and culture. Wu Wei (Vivian Wu), a relentless media practitioner and intellectual, and has been a part of this project and my China journey throughout, from the first media training she was leading to her days at the New School in New York. Max Duncan hosted me in Beijing and has offered friendship, humour and exposure into the intricacies of Western media reporting in China. Maria Lipman hosted me at the Moscow Carnegie Centre and gracefully facilitated introductions with Russian experts and media professionals. I am also deeply grateful to all the editors, journalists, scholars and officials who agreed to speak to me extensively and openly. I could not imagine such openness was possible when I started this research, and I greatly value their patience with me, as well as their trust and enthusiasm for my project. Out of concern for anonymity, I cannot thank individual journalists, editors and officials who have partaken in this project. I hope I have managed to do them justice by attempting to explain the complicated and often contradictory realities they inhabit.

Finally, this study stands firmly on the foundation of my friends and family. Elena Minina, one of my closest friends and sharpest critics, never failed to highlight potential improvements both in terms of language and content. Elena's enduring friendship, wit, and unwavering sarcastic enthusiasm has been my true rock, as the book went through its metamorphosis from dissertation to published manuscript. My soul-sister and a remarkable thinker and friend, Nadiya Figueroa, has taught me to always seek the higher meaning from the work, to value the human facets of research and writing and to patiently build global and local linkages, while being tightly held on distance with ample doses of love and visionary advice. Nadiya Kravets, another life-long friend and supporter of this idea from the early days of the MPhil, has mulled through my writings and spiritual journeys over coffee pots and unforgettable butter sandwiches at St Antony's college, in Boston and Atlanta. My tiny, resilient, beautiful family Tatiana Repnikova, Galina Alpatova and Dmitri Repnikov, have provided a soft cushion of emotional support and love throughout this endeavour, even if it translated into less time together in the past years. They have patiently lived through the endless phases of this book, as it became a part of them. Arthur Vissing and his parents, Lise and Lars Vissing, have made this journey especially colourful and soulful. From endless conversations about Chinese media over home-cooked meals in Oxford, Rabat, Copenhagen, Lisbon and Bonne, to streams of encouragement and Charlie Chaplin films, this book is fused with beautiful memories.



# Contents

	Preface Acknowledgements	page ix xi
	Part I Conceptual & Theoretical Frameworks	1
1	Introduction	3
2	Theoretical Pay-offs	21
	Part II Mutual Objectives and Routine Dynamics	43
3	Unified Objectives: The Official Discourse and Journalistic Interpretation of Media Supervision	45
4	Restrictions on Critical Journalism: How They Are Applied and Negotiated	76
	Part III Crisis Events	109
5	Critical Journalists, the Party-state and the Wenchuan Earthquake	111
6	The Battle over Coal-Mining Safety	142
	Part IV Comparisons	173
7	Beyond China: Critical Journalists and the State under Gorbachev and Putin	175
8	From Hu to Xi: Shifts and Continuities	206
	Appendix A Appendix B Bibliography Index	222 227 231 265
		vii