LABOUR LAW IN IRELAND

KEVIN COSTELLO



Labour Law in Ireland

Kevin Costello

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International Encyclopaedia of Laws/Labour Law and Industrial Relations.

General Editors: Roger Blanpain, Frank Hendrickx



Published by: Kluwer Law International B.V. PO Box 316 2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn The Netherlands Website: www.wklawbusiness.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by: Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S. 7201 McKinney Circle Frederick, MD 21704 United States of America

Sold and distributed in all other countries by: Turpin Distribution Services Ltd. Stratton Business Park Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ United Kingdom

Email: customer.service@wolterskluwer.com

Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 978-90-411-6169-7

This title is available on www.kluwerlawonline.com

© 2016, Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S., 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Website: www.wklawbusiness.com

Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

The Author	3
General Introduction	19
Chapter 1. Employment Law in Ireland in Context	19
§1. THE ECONOMIC AND HISTORICAL CONTEXT I. The Legal Historical Background A. The Legal and Constitutional History of Ireland to 1937 B. The Development of Labour Law in Ireland up to 1900 II. The Economic Historical Background. Irish Economic History 1922–2013	19 19 19 20
§2. THE IRISH EMPLOYMENT MARKET IN CONTEXT	23
Chapter 2. The Irish Judicature and Employment-connected Litigation	25
§1. THE IRISH COURT SYSTEM AND EMPLOYMENT LAW DISPUTES I. The District Court II. The Circuit Court III. The High Court	25 25 25 26
§2. EMPLOYMENT TRIBUNALS I. The Labour Court II. The Employment Appeals Tribunal (EAT) III. The Equality Tribunal IV. The Rights Commissioner V. Reform of the Current Tribunal System	27 27 28 29 29 30
Chapter 3. Sources of Employment Law	31
§1. IMPLIED CONTRACTUAL TERMS I. The Business Efficacy Test II. The Parties' Unhesitatingly Agreeing' Test	31 31 32

	III. The Parties' Employment Practice	34
§2.	CUSTOM AND PRACTICE	35
§3.	COLLECTIVE AGREEMENTS I. Where a Union Negotiator is Conferred with Agency Status II. Incorporation of Collective Agreement Terms in the Contract of	37 37
	Employment	38
§4.	NATIONAL SOCIAL PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENTS	38
§5.	REGISTERED EMPLOYMENT AGREEMENT	39
§6.	THE PROPER LAW OF THE CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT I. Rome 1 and the Brussels I Regulation in Irish Employment Law II. Employment Abroad and Access to Entitlements under the Unfair	41 41
	Dismissals Acts, 1977–2007 and the Redundancy Payments Acts, 1967–2007	42
§7.	International Treaties as a Source of Employment Rights	43
Par	t I. The Individual Employment Relationship	45
Cha	apter 1. Identification of a Contract of Employment	45
§1.	DISTINGUISHING THE EMPLOYEE FROM THE SELF-EMPLOYED WORKER	45
	 The Historical Evolution of the 'in Business on One's Account' Test 	45
	II. The Criteria for Determining Whether a Person Is in Business on Their Own Account	48
	A. The Supply of Apparatus	48
	B. The Power of Delegation	49
	C. The Receipt of Employment Benefits	49
	D. The Manner of Payment	50
	E. The Labelling of the Contract III. The Sham Destring and the Drafting of Contracts of Employment	50
	III. The Sham Doctrine and the Drafting of Contracts of Employment IV. Conclusion: Distinguishing Employment and Self-employment	51 53
§2.	THE EMPLOYMENT STATUS OF OFFICERS	53
§3.	THE EMPLOYMENT STATUS OF THE PARTNER	54
§4.	THE EMPLOYMENT STATUS OF THE CIVIL SERVANT	54
25	THE EMPLOYMENT STATUS OF THE RELIGIOUS MINISTER	55

	erm Workers, Part-time Workers, Agency s, Zero-hours Workers and non-EEA Workers	56
II. The Protection Restrictions of III. Fixed-term Wo	m Contract and the Unfair Dismissals Acts of Employees (Fixed-Term Work) Act 2003; on Fixed-term Employment orkers: the Rights to Reasons and to Information orkers: the Prohibition on Discrimination	56 56 57 59 60
§2. PART-TIME WORKE	ERS	61
II. Agency Worke Employment S	ent Status of Agency Workers at Common Law ers Deemed to be Employees for Miscellaneous	63 63 64 65
§4. Zero-hours Wor	KERS	66
§5. TEMPORARY EMPL	OYEES	66
National Work II. The Doctrine Non-national	and Administrative Consequences of a Foreign ker Working Without a Work Permit of Contractual Unenforceability and the Illegal	66 67 68
Chapter 3. The For Employ	rm and Content of the Contract of ment	70
I. The Statute of	MENTS AND THE CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT Frauds 1695 Employment (Information) Act 1994	70 70 70
§2. LEGAL CAPACITY I. Minors II. Convicted Pris	TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT soners	71 71 71
EMPLOYMENT I. Fraud on the l	Revenue and the Employment Contract of Fraud and Enforceability of the Contract of	71 72 73

 III. Defences to the Unenforceability Doctrine: the Unfair Dismissals Ac 1977–2007 A. Section 8(11) of the Unfair Dismissals Acts 1977–2007 B. The Ignorance of the Facts Defence C. The Severance Defence D. The European Directive Rights Exception; Hall v. Woolston Hall Leisure Ltd E. The Mitigating Circumstances Defence F. The 'Affront to Public Conscience' Exception Chapter 4. The Common Law and Constitutional Rights and 	73 73 74 75
Duties of the Parties During the Employment Relationship	78
I. The Common Law Duties of the Employee I. Duty to Observe Orders II. The Duty Not to Interfere with the Employer's Customer Base III. The Duty Not to Appropriate or Disclose Confidential Information IV. The Duty to Account V. The Duty to Adapt to Changed Work Practices VI. The Duty to Work Competently VII. The Duty of Fidelity	78 78 78 79 79 80 80
 I. The Duty to Maintain Trust and Confidence A. The Source and History of the Trust and Confidence Duty B. The Elements of the Duty of Trust and Confidence 1. The 'Serious Damage' Requirement 2. The Reasonable Employee Standard 3. The Significance of an Absence of Intention to Harm 4. Not Necessary that the Employee Be Aware of the Employer's Conduct 5. Conduct May Be Cumulative 6. Trust and Confidence Does Not Regulate the Decision to Dismiss 7. Trust and Confidence Duty May Be Excluded by Contract 	81 81 82 82 82 83 83 83 84 84
C. Remedies for Infringement of the Duty of Trust and Confidence II. The Duty to Make an Employee Aware of Contingent Benefits III. The Duty to Observe Fair Procedures in the Dismissal Process IV. The Duty to Provide Work V. The Duty to Exercise a Contractual Discretion in a Reasonable Manner VI. The Duty to Provide an Employee with a Safe System of Work	84 85 85 86 86

Chapter 5. Working Time and Holidays	88
 §1. THE SCOPE OF APPLICATION OF THE ORGANIZATION OF WORKING TIME ACT 1997 I. Exclusions from the 1997 Act A. Emergency and Public Defence Workers B. Shift Workers, and Workers Whose Working Hours are Self-determined C. The Organization of Working Time (General Exemptions) Regulations 1998 II. Doctors in Training III. Transport Workers 	88 88 88 88 89 90
 \$2. THE WORKING TIME RIGHTS CONFERRED BY THE ORGANIZATION OF WORKING TIME ACT 1997 I. Maximum Weekly Working Time A. The Definitions of 'Permit' and 'Work' B. The Four-month Reference Period II. The Daily Rest Period A. Exceptions to the Daily Rest Period B. Weekly Rest Period III. Rest Periods at Work A. Definitional Aspects of Section 12 of the Organization of Working Time Act 1997 B. Shop Employees' Daily Rest Periods C. The Burden of Proof and Claims of Infringement of Section 	91 91 91 91 92 92 94 95
 §3. HOLIDAYS Paid Annual Leave under the Organization of Working Time Act 1997 Public Holidays and the Organization of Working Time Act 199 	96 97 97
Chapter 6. Parental Leave, Maternity Leave, Force Majeure Leave, and Carer's Leave	99
§1. The Parental Leave Act 1996	99
§2. Force Majeure Leave	100
§3. MATERNITY LEAVE I. The Period and Timing of Maternity Leave under the Maternity Protection Acts 1994–2004 II. The Content of Statutory Maternity Leave III. Maternity-connected Rights	102 103 104
§4. THE CARER'S LEAVE ACT 2001	105

I. The Rights Guaranteed to a Person on Carer's LeaveII. The Right to Return to Work on the Expiry of Carer's Leave	105 105
Chapter 7. The Law Relating to Wages	107
§1. THE RECOVERY OF UNPAID WAGES I. Civil Proceedings in the District Court, Circuit Court and High	107
Court II. Proceedings under the Payment of Wages Act 1991	107 107
§2. THE RIGHT TO A WAGE STATEMENT	107
§3. WAGE INCREASES	108
§4. ELIGIBILITY TO WAGES ISSUES; INDUSTRIAL ACTION AND IMPRISONMENT I. Industrial Action and Wages A. Wages and the Full Strike B. Wages and Activity Short of a Full Strike II. Employees in Custody	108 108 108 109 110
§5. DEDUCTION OF WAGES I. Section 5 Payment of Wages Act 1991; the General Scheme II. The 'Fair and Reasonable' Condition in Section 5 III. Pre-authorized in the Contract; Notice of the Grounds; Implementation within Six Months IV. Deductions for Goods and Services Supplied to the Employee	110 110 112 112 112
 S6. THE NATIONAL MINIMUM WAGE ACT 2000 The National Minimum Wage; the General Scheme 'Reckonable' Remuneration Working Hours Exceptions to the Duty to Pay the National Minimum Wage Enforcing the Right to Minimum Pay The Employment Regulation Order as a Source of Minimum Wages The Factors Conditioning the Making of an Employment Regulation Order The Procedure for Making an Employment Regulation Order 	113 113 113 114 115 115 116
Chapter 8. Incapacity to Work	119
§1. Illness and Dismissal from Employment	119
§2. REMUNERATION AND ILLNESS AT COMMON LAW I. Illness and Wages: the Presumptive Common Law Entitlement	119 119

II. Illness and Wages; Displacing the Presumption	120
§3. QUALIFICATION FOR STATUTORY EMPLOYMENT RIGHTS AND ILLNESS	121
§4. SOCIAL WELFARE AND ILLNESS	121
Chapter 9. Legal Regulation of Dismissal at Common Law	123
 §1. PROTECTION AGAINST DISMISSAL AT COMMON LAW Summary Dismissal Dismissal on Notice Observance of Fair Procedures as a Condition of Lawful Dismissal The Content of Fair Procedures in Dismissal: the Right to Be Informed of the Charge The Right of Access to Witness Statements The Right to Legal Representation The Right to a Hearing before an Impartial, or Unbiased, Adjudicator The Argument that the Right of Dismissal on Notice is Legally Anachronistic Exceptions to the Prerogative to Dismiss for Any Reason on Notice Cases Where the Contract Displaces the Right of Dismissal of Notice Cases Where the Ground of Dismissal Offends Public Policy Remedies for Wrongful Dismissal Quantifying Damages No Damages for Distress and Loss of Esteem The Duty to Mitigate Deduction for Taxation Specific Performance The Dismissal Injunction 	125 125 125 126 126 126
Chapter 10. The Unfair Dismissals Acts 1977–2007	134
§1. CONDITIONS FOR ENTITLEMENT TO CLAIM UNFAIR DISMISSAL I. 'Dismissal' A. Unambiguous Words of Dismissal B. Refusal to Permit Employee Re-entry after an Ineffective Resignation C. Resignation Induced by Duress D. Non-renewal of a Fixed-term Contract E. Constructive Dismissal	134 134 135 135 135 137
II. One-year's Continuous Service A. Continuity of Employment B. One Year's 'Service'	138 139

§2. THE LEGAL CONDITIONS FOR A LAWFUL DISMISSAL UNDER THE UNF	AIR
DISMISSALS ACTS 1977–2007	140
I. The Standards Regulating Dismissal: the General Scheme	140
II. 'Substantial Grounds Justifying the Dismissal'	141
III. The Reasonableness Requirement; Section 6(7)(a) of the Unfair	
Dismissals Act 1977	143
IV. Fair Warning of Standards	143
V. Compliance with Fair Procedures	143
	144
A. The Right of Notice and Access to Witness Statements	144
B. The Rule against Bias	
VI. Consistency in Dealing with Similar Cases	145
VII. Proportionality	145
§3. Redress for Unfair Dismissal	146
I. Reinstatement	147
	147
II. Re-engagement	148
III. Compensation; 'Financial Loss Attributable to the Dismissal'	140
Chapter 11 The Redundancy Payments Acts 1067, 2007 and	
Chapter 11. The Redundancy Payments Acts 1967–2007 and	
the Protection of Employment Act 1977	151
§1. The Redundancy Payments Acts 1967–2007	151
	151
I. Continuous Employment for 104 weeks	151
II. The Definition of Redundancy	131
§2. Collective Redundancies	154
I. The Conditions Activating the Consultation Duty	154
II. The Timing of the Consultation	155
	156
III. Consultation with Whom?	130
Chapter 12 Protection Derived from the Transfer of	
Chapter 12. Protection Derived from the Transfer of	
Undertakings Directive 2003	157
81 Thangeen Protection	157
§1. Transfer Protection	137
§2. THE SCOPE OF APPLICATION OF THE TRANSFER REGULATIONS	157
I. 'Economic Entity'	157
A. The Background to the Suzen Case	157
	159
B. The Human Capital Intensive/Asset-reliant Distinction	139
II. The Nature of a 'Transfer' for the Purpose of the 2003	170
Regulations	160
A. Acquisitions Where There Has Been an Acquisition of the	4.274
Entity by Indirect Means	161
B. Transfers in the Context of Judicially Monitored Insolvency	an all-
Proceedings	161

	C. The Transfer Must Involve a Change in the Identity of the Employer	162
I.	RIGHTS GUARANTEED BY THE DIRECTIVE The Protection against Dismissal	163 163
	A. The Economic, Technical or Organizational Defence to	162
	Dismissal P. Romodica against a Transfer connected Dismissal	163 164
	B. Remedies against a Transfer-connected Dismissal The Continuity of Existing Rights and Obligations	164
Chapter	r 13. Protection against Discrimination on Grounds of Sex in Employment	166
§1. EQU	AL PAY UNDER THE EMPLOYMENT EQUALITY ACTS 1998–2011	166
I.	The Conditions for an Equal Pay Claim	166
	A. The Comparator Must Do 'Like Work'	166
	B. The Comparator Must Be Employed by the Same or an	
	'Associated' Employer	168
	C. The Comparator and the Complainant Must Have Been	ar was
	Employed 'at That or Any Other Relevant Time'	169
	D. 'Employed'	169
	Defences to Alleged Direct Discrimination in Pay: 'Grounds	160
	Other than Gender'	169 170
	Indirect Discrimination in Pay The Components of Indirect Discrimination Affecting Pay	170
IV.	A. 'At a Particular Disadvantage'	170
	B. The <i>Enderby</i> principle	171
	C. Defences to Alleged Indirect Discrimination in Pay	171
	Wages Adjusted Pro Rata to Hours Worked	171
	2. Compassionate Grounds: Socially Progressive Policies	172
	3. Possession of Superior Qualifications	172
	4. Industrial Relations	172
	DISCRIMINATION AND THE EMPLOYMENT EQUALITY ACTS	
	8–2011	173
1.	Establishing Direct Discrimination on Grounds of Sex under the Employment Equality Acts 1998–2011	173
	A. Less Favourable Treatment	174
	B. 'On Grounds of Sex'	175
	C. Discrimination on Grounds of Pregnancy Is Usually Sex Discrimination	175
	D. Sexual Harassment as Sex Discrimination	177
	E. Proof of Direct Discrimination	178
	F. The 'Genuine and Determining Occupational Requirement' Defence	179
	G. Measures of Affirmative Action	180
	THE RESIDENCE OF THE PROPERTY	* * * * *

 II. Indirect Discrimination on Grounds of Sex A. The Definition of Sex Discrimination on Grounds of Sex B. The Legitimate Aim Defence to Indirect Discrimination 1. Seniority Requirements 2. Measures Disadvantaging Job-sharing Workers 	181 181 181 181
Chapter 14. The Law on Discrimination on Grounds of Age, Disability and Race	183
I. Discrimination on Grounds of Disability II. The Definition of Disability II. The Concept of Direct Discrimination on Grounds of Disability III. The Concept of Indirect Discrimination on Grounds of Disability IV. The 'Reasonable Accommodation' Requirement V. Measures to Enable a Person Who Has a Disability 'to Have Access to Employment' VI. The Occupational Qualification, Significantly Increased Costs and Emergency Services Defences VII. Remedies for Disability Discrimination	183 183 184 185 186 188 189
 I. The Scope of the Rule against Discrimination on Grounds of Age II. Proof of Discrimination on Grounds of Age III. Evidence of 'Sufficient Significance' to Shift the Burden of Proof to the Employer A. Where Older Candidate Is Better Qualified B. Reliable Statistical Evidence Showing Preference for Younger Candidates C. Age-related Questions at Interview D. Indirectly Discriminatory Appointment Criteria IV. Discriminatory Advertising V. Defences to Age Discrimination A. Genuine and Determining Occupational Requirement B. 'Legitimate Aim' Defence C. The Compulsory Retirement Age Defence D. Occupational Benefits Schemes and Age 	191 192 192
§3. DISCRIMINATION ON GROUNDS OF RACE	199
Chapter 15. Non-competition Covenants	200
§1. POST-EMPLOYMENT NON-COMPETE OR NON-DISCLOSURE CLAUSES I. The Principles Required to Justify a Non-competition Clause II. The Protection of the Ex-employer's Customer Base	200 200 200

IV. Restrictive Covenants to Protect the Employer's Workforce	
§2. THE COMPETITION ACTS 1991–1996 AND RESTRICTIVE COVENANTS 2	203
Chapter 16. Employees and Intellectual Property 2	204
§1. PATENTS AND EMPLOYEES 2	204
§2. COPYRIGHT AND EMPLOYEES 2	204
Part II. Collective Labour Relations 2	207
Chapter 1. The Historical Development of Trade Union Legitimacy: Trade Unions and the Constitution 2	207
	207
I. Trade Unions and the Law in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries 2 II. Twentieth-century Developments: the Trade Union Acts 1941 to	207
	209
I. Statutory Restrictions on the Right of Freedom of Association II. No Right to Join a Trade Union in Irish Constitutional Law III. The Issue of the Right to Recognition of a Trade Union IV. Statutory Consultation/Recognition Duties V. The Non-recognizing Employer and the Industrial Relations (Amendment) Acts 2001–2004	209 209 210 211 211 213
Chapter 2. The Law Regulating Trade Unions 2	216
I. The Registration of Trade Unions: the Trade Union Act 1871 II. The Negotiation Licence III. The Grant of a Negotiation Licence Where the Union Has Less than the Required Minimum Membership IV. Obligations Imposed on Trade Unions Holding a Negotiation Licence V. Foreign-based Trade Unions	216 216 217 218 218 218 218 219 220
VII. Trade Unions and the Political Fund	220

Ch	apter 3. Worker Participation in Ireland	223
§1.	WORKER PARTICIPATION IN IRISH LAW I. Worker Directors in Public Commercial Bodies	223 223
	II. Works Councils in State Enterprises	224
	III. Works Councils in Community-scale Undertakings IV. Worker Involvement Consequent on the Establishment of a	224
	European Company	226
	V. European Communities (Cross-Border Mergers) Regulations 2008	227
§2.	EMPLOYEE SHARE OWNERSHIP	228
	I. Approved Profit-sharing Scheme	228
	II. Approved Share-option Scheme	228
Ch	apter 4. The Law Governing Strikes and Industrial Action	230
§1.	THE WAGES AND DISMISSAL OF EMPLOYEES INVOLVED IN INDUSTRIAL	
	ACTION	230
	I. Wages and Industrial Action	230
	II. Dismissal for Participation in a Strike or Other Industrial Action	231
§2.	TORTS COMMITTED BY PERSONS ENGAGED IN INDUSTRIAL ACTION	232
	I. The Tort of Inducement of Breach of Contract	232
	A. The History of the Tort of Direct Inducement of Breach of	
	Contract	233
	B. The Means Must Be Unlawful	235
	C. The Defendant Must Be Aware of the Contract	236
	D. There Must Be Intention to Interfere with the Contract	237
	E. Absence of Justification	237
	F. The Defendant's Actions Must Be the Cause of the Breach of	
	Contract	238
	II. The Tort of Unlawful Interference with Trade	238
	III. The Tort of Intimidation	239
§3.	STRIKE ACTIVITY AND INFRINGEMENT OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS	240
§4.	ILLEGALITIES COMMITTED BY PERSONS ENGAGED IN A PICKET	241
	I. Private Nuisance	241
	II. Harassment	242
	III. Pickets and Section 11(1) of the Industrial Relations Act 1990	242
	A. The Persons Who May Picket	243
	B. The Picketing Must Be Peaceful	243
	C. The Location of the Picket	244
	D. The Object of the Picket May Only Be either the	
	Communication of Information, or Persuasion Not to Work	244

E. On Worker Disputes Where Agreed Grievance Procedures Have	0.46
Not Been Exhausted	245
F. Actions Contrary to the Outcome of a Secret Ballot	246
G. Secondary Picketing	246
§5. Remedies Against Persons Engaged in Withdrawal of Labour	
OR PICKETING	247
I. Damages, Trade Unions and Vicarious Responsibility	248
II. The Interlocutory Injunction	249
A. Section 19 of the Industrial Relations Act 1990	250
B. The Conditions of Entitlement to the Protection of Section 19	251
III. The Remedy of Specific Performance	253
§6. STRIKES, INDUSTRIAL ACTION AND THE CRIMINAL LAW	253
Chapter 5. Settlement of Industrial Disputes	254
§1. DISPUTE RESOLUTION MACHINERY	254
I. The Labour Relations Commission	254
II. The Labour Court	254
Selected Bibliography	257
Index	259
HICK	400

Labour Law in Ireland

Kevin Costello

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International Encyclopaedia of Laws/Labour Law and Industrial Relations.

General Editors: Roger Blanpain, Frank Hendrickx

