

Refuge from Inhumanity? War Refugees and International Humanitarian Law

Edited by David James Cantor
and Jean-François Durieux

BRILL | NIJHOFF

Refuge from Inhumanity? War Refugees and International Humanitarian Law

Edited by

David James Cantor and Jean-François Durieux



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Refuge from inhumanity? : war refugees and international humanitarian law / Edited by David James Cantor and Jean-François Durieux.

p. cm. -- (International refugee law series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-90-04-26158-7 (hardback : alk. paper) -- ISBN 978-90-04-26159-4 (e-book) 1. Refugees--Legal status, laws, etc. 2. War (International law) 3. Asylum, Right of. 4. Humanitarian law. I. Cantor, David James, editor of compilation. II. Durieux, Jean-François, editor of compilation.

KZ6530.R42 2014

341.4'86--dc23

2014016757

This publication has been typeset in the multilingual "Brill" typeface. With over 5,100 characters covering Latin, IPA, Greek, and Cyrillic, this typeface is especially suitable for use in the humanities. For more information, please see www.brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2213-3836

ISBN 978-90-04-26158-7 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-26159-4 (e-book)

Copyright 2014 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Global Oriental and Hotei Publishing. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill nv provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA.

Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Refuge from Inhumanity? War Refugees and International Humanitarian Law

International Refugee Law Series

Editor-in-Chief

David James Cantor

Editorial Board

Deborah Anker
Bhupinder Chimni
Geoff Gilbert
Guy S. Goodwin-Gill
Liliana Jubilut
Susan Kneebone
Hélène Lambert
Bonaventure Rutinwa
Volker Türk

VOLUME 2

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/irls*

Acknowledgements

We wish to thank the many friends and colleagues who have contributed to this volume, whether through generously giving their time and expertise to produce its constituent chapters, their encouragement and critical engagement at all stages of the project, or both.

The Refugee Law Initiative (School of Advanced Study, London) and the Refugee Studies Centre (Oxford) provided invaluable support in organising an international conference on the theme of the book in February 2013, which strengthened the breadth and depth of the final contributions. Particular thanks to Chloe Pieters (RLI), Dawn Chatty and Heidi El-Megrisi (RSC). Moreover, Guy Goodwin-Gill and the Warden and Fellows of All Souls College in Oxford deserve special thanks for generously hosting that event.

Both within and outside the conference framework, we benefitted from the insights of our friends at UNHCR and ICRC, in particular Alice Edwards and Kees Wouters at UNHCR; and at ICRC, Cordula Droege, Ramin Mahnad and Marie-Louise Tougas, as well as former Director of Law and Doctrine Yves Sandoz, with whom some critical elements of this discussion were originally broached.

We are grateful to Nicolas Rodriguez Serna for editorial assistance and to the series editor Lindy Melman at Martinus Nijhoff for her wise and timely advice.

Abbreviations

AC	armed conflict
AG	Advocate General
AIT	Asylum and Immigration Tribunal (UK)
Art/s	Article/s
CA1	Article 1 common to the 1949 Geneva Conventions
CA2	Article 2 common to the 1949 Geneva Conventions
CA3	Article 3 common to the 1949 Geneva Conventions
CIL	customary international law
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CNDA	Cour nationale du droit d'asile (France)
CRR	Commission de recours des réfugiés (France)
CSDP	Common Security and Defence Policy
CSFP	Common Security and Foreign Policy
DRC	Democratic Republic of the Congo
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECRE	European Council on Refugees and Exiles
ECTHR	European Court of Human Rights
Ed/s	editor/s
Edn	edition
EEA	European Economic Area
EP	European Parliament
EU	European Union
EUCFR	EU Charter of Fundamental Rights
EWCA	England and Wales Court of Appeal
GNI	gross national income
HCP	High Contracting Parties
HRL	human rights law
IAC	international armed conflict
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICL	international criminal law
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IDP	internally displaced person
IHL	international humanitarian law
ILC	International Law Commission

IRL	international refugee law
LDCS	least developed countries
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
NIAC	non-international armed conflict
OAU	Organization of African Unity
Para/s	paragraph/s
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PIL	public international law
POW	prisoner of war
QD	Qualification Directive
R2P	Responsibility to Protect
RSD	refugee status determination
SCSL	Special Court of Sierra Leone
TEU	Treaty on the European Union
TFG	Transitional Federal Government
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
UK	United Kingdom
UKAIT	United Kingdom Asylum and Immigration Tribunal
UKCA	United Kingdom Court of Appeal
UKUT/UT	United Kingdom Upper Tribunal / Upper Tribunal
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
v	versus
Vol/s	volume/s

Notes on Contributors

Céline Bauloz

is research assistant at the Global Migration Centre (Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Geneva) and assistant editor of the *Refugee Survey Quarterly* (Oxford University Press). She has just finished her Ph.D. thesis on complementary forms of protection in the European Union and the United States at the Graduate Institute. Céline has previously been visiting researcher at Harvard Law School and has worked as teaching assistant at the Geneva Academy of International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights, as well as consultant for international and non-governmental organizations. Her latest publications include the *Research Handbook on International Law and Migration* (co-edited with Vincent Chetail – Edward Elgar Publishing 2014).

David James Cantor

is Director of the Refugee Law Initiative and a Reader in Human Rights Law at the School of Advanced Study, University of London. His research addresses the protection of refugees and other displaced persons and he has carried out extensive fieldwork across Latin America. He has also trained and advised governments from Latin America, the Caribbean, Africa, Asia and the Pacific. He previously worked as a Legal Officer at the Refugee Legal Centre and for UNHCR. He holds a three-year ESRC Future Research Leaders grant for his project on *Pushing the Boundaries: New Dynamics of Forced Migration and Transnational Responses in Latin America*.

Jean-François Durieux

has taught international law at the Refugee Studies Centre (Oxford) 2007–2009, and again 2011–2012. He is currently affiliated with this Centre as a Research Associate and as Senior Adviser to the Humanitarian Innovation Project. He served with UNHCR for over 30 years, during which he worked in Africa, Asia, North America and Latin America, as well as at UNHCR Headquarters in Geneva, notably in the Division of International Protection and in the Regional Bureau for Europe. He has published widely in the field of international and regional refugee law, with a focus on legal responses to mass influxes of refugees, as well as the legal implications of refugee emergencies and protracted refugee situations. He has organised seminars and short courses on statelessness and on the cross-fertilisation of refugee law, human rights law, and international humanitarian law.

Eric Fripp

is a member of the Bar of England and Wales, practicing in London at Lamb Building, Elm Court, Temple, where he convenes the Immigration, Asylum, and Nationality Practice Group. He has been involved in many leading cases involving refugee law, and has particular interests in the prehistory and development of the present international refugee law regime, the interaction of statelessness and refugee law, and the scope of entitlement under Article 1A(2) Refugee Convention. He holds the degrees of MA (History) (University of St Andrews), LL.M., MA, and LL.M. (University of London).

Geoff Gilbert

is a Professor of Law in the School of Law and Human Rights Centre at the University of Essex. He has been Editor-in-Chief of the *International Journal of Refugee Law* since 2002. He is author of 'Current Issues in the Application of the Exclusion Clauses' in Feller, Türk and Nicholson (eds), *Refugee Protection in International Law* (CUP 2003). He was founding Director of Studies for UNHCR's annual Thematic Refugees and Human Rights course for judges, government officials and UNHCR staff at the International Institute for Humanitarian Law, Sanremo, Italy, from 2005–07. He was Specialist Adviser to the UK Joint Parliamentary Committee on Human Rights in its inquiry into the treatment of asylum-seekers, 2006–07.

Guy S. Goodwin-Gill

is Senior Research Fellow, All Souls College, Oxford, Professor of International Refugee Law, and a Barrister at Blackstone Chambers, London. He is the Founding Editor of the *International Journal of Refugee Law*, and recent publications include 'The Dynamic of International Refugee Law' (2013) 25 IJRL 651, introductions to refugee and related treaties and instruments in the UN Audio-Visual Library of International Law: <http://www.un.org/law/avl/>; *The Limits of Transnational Law*, with Hélène Lambert (eds) (CUP 2010); *Brownlie's Documents on Human Rights*, 6th edition with the late Sir Ian Brownlie (OUP 2010); and *The Refugee in International Law*, 3rd edition with Jane McAdam (OUP 2007).

Françoise J. Hampson

is a Barrister and Professor of Law in the School of Law and Human Rights Centre at the University of Essex. She was an independent expert member of the UN Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights from 1998–2007. She has acted as a consultant on humanitarian law to the International Committee of the Red Cross and taught at Staff Colleges or

equivalents in the UK, USA, Canada and Ghana. She has successfully litigated many cases before the European Court of Human Rights in Strasbourg. She has taught, researched and published widely in the fields of armed conflict, international humanitarian law and on the European Convention on Human Rights.

Vanessa Holzer

is British Red Cross Senior Research Fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law in Cambridge where she leads a team of researchers for the British Red Cross/ICRC project on customary international humanitarian law. Vanessa previously worked for UNHCR and at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law. She holds an LLM from the LSE and is finishing a doctorate at the University of Frankfurt. The opinions in her chapter are hers alone and do not necessarily correspond to those of the British Red Cross or the ICRC.

Maja Janmyr

is a post-doctoral researcher at the Faculty of Law, University of Bergen. Her research addresses issues related to the international laws of responsibility, international human rights, refugee law, and humanitarian law. She has published a book on the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees' international responsibility in relation to insecurity in refugee camps (*Protecting Civilians in Refugee Camps: Unable and Unwilling States, UNHCR and International Responsibility*, Brill 2014). Her current work, pursued under the auspices of the project Migration to Norway: Flows and Regulations, focuses on the forced return of failed asylum seekers in the Norwegian context.

Stéphane Jaquemet

is presently country representative for UNHCR in Colombia. Before that, he was the representative in Nepal and, previously, in Lebanon. Having spent 21 years with UNHCR, Jaquemet has held a number of senior positions both at UNHCR Headquarters in Geneva and in other UNHCR offices, including Indonesia, Togo and Croatia. He served as Chief of Protection Capacity Section, Department of International Protection, at UNHCR Headquarters in Geneva from 1997 to 2002. He previously worked for the ICRC as a delegate and legal officer. He has published widely in the field of refugee law and humanitarian law.

Hélène Lambert

is Professor of International Law at the University of Westminster, where she is Research Director for the Law School. She previously worked as a Protection Officer for UNHCR and acted as a consultant for UNHCR, the Council of Europe,

and the European Commission, as well as the Swedish Ministry of Justice. She has published widely in the field of comparative and international refugee law where her research has sought to develop a transnational approach to the field. Her recent publications include *The Limits of Transnational Law*, with Guy S. Goodwin-Gill (eds) (CUP 2010) and *The Global Reach of European Refugee Law*, with Jane McAdam and Maryellen Fullerton (eds) (CUP 2013). She is currently undertaking a project for the UNHCR seeking to develop doctrinal guidance on issues of nationality and statelessness.

Jennifer Moore

is Professor of Law at the University of New Mexico. In *Humanitarian Law in Action within Africa* (Oxford University Press, 2012), she explores transitional justice in countries emerging from armed conflict, with case studies on Uganda, Sierra Leone and Burundi. She is co-author (with Musalo and Boswell) of *Refugee Law and Policy: A Comparative and International Approach* (4th edn Carolina Academic Press 2011). In 2002–03, Moore taught international law at the University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania as a Fulbright Scholar. From 1991–95, she worked for the U.N. High Commissioner for Refugees in Conakry, Guinea and Washington, D.C. She attended Amherst College (B.A., 1983) and Harvard Law School (J.D., 1987).

Violeta Moreno-Lax

is a Lecturer in Law at Queen Mary, University of London, and the EU Asylum Law Co-ordinator at the Refugee Law Initiative, University of London. She has previously taught at the Universities of Liverpool, Oxford, Louvain, and Nijmegen as well as at the College of Europe. She has acted as consultant for the European Parliament and the European Commission, and has advised a number of governmental and non-governmental organisations in the area of refugee and migrant rights. She specialises in international and European law, migration studies, and human rights. Her key works include: *Seeking Asylum in Europe: Border Controls and Refugee Rights under EU Law* (OUP forthcoming) and *EU Immigration and Asylum Law*, with S. Peers, E. Guild et al (2nd edn Brill 2012).

Hugo Storey

is an Upper Tribunal Judge (Immigration and Asylum Chamber) (formerly Senior Immigration Judge of the Asylum and Immigration Tribunal) in the United Kingdom. He was formerly a law academic, and later an Honorary Research Fellow, at the University of Leeds. In an academic capacity he has published widely on human rights, refugee, international law and European

law issues. He is one of the International Association of Refugee Law Judges' (IARLJ's) founding members and is currently a member of its Council, the chair of its Publications Committee, Rapporteur of its COI-CG (Country of Origin-Country Guidance) Working Party and is the current President of the IARLJ's European Chapter. He was one of the experts utilised by the European Commission when drafting the Refugee Qualification Directive (/2004/83/EC) and, more recently, its "recast". He has been active in the training of judges doing asylum and immigration work inside and outside the UK.

Diana Trimiño Mora

is a Women's Protection and Empowerment Policy Advisor for the International Rescue Committee. She previously conducted research for the Refugee Law Initiative's project *Pushing the Boundaries*. Her experience with refugee protection and displacement includes working with the UNHCR in their Americas' Regional Legal Unit as an Associate Legal Officer, and Refugee Resettlement Coordinator and Migrant's Rights Adviser at the International Organisation for Migration. She has worked on women's issues in various world regions, including with the Raoul Wallenberg Institute for Human Rights and Humanitarian Law and the Inter-American Institute of Human Rights.

Evangelia (Lilian) Tsourdi

is a Ph.D. candidate and Researcher at the Law Faculty and the Institute for European Studies of the Université libre de Bruxelles (ULB) and Research Assistant at the Université catholique de Louvain (UCL). She is also member of the coordination team of the Academic network for legal studies on immigration and asylum in Europe, the 'Odysseus Network' and Doctoral Affiliate of the Refugee Law Initiative (RLI). Her research focuses on the Common European Asylum System. Lilian has worked as a consultant for a number of non-governmental organizations, the UNHCR as well as the European Commission and Parliament.

Tamara Wood

is a Nettheim Doctoral Teaching Fellow and PhD Candidate at the University of New South Wales, where she lectures in Forced Migration and Human Rights in International Law. She has published in international law and refugee studies journals, including the *Forced Migration Review* and the *International and Comparative Law Quarterly*, and has presented her research at conferences and workshops at the University of Oxford and University of London, UK. Prior to commencing at the University of New South Wales, Tamara worked as a refugee advocate in Australia, assisting onshore refugee applicants with their

claims for asylum. Tamara's current research focuses on the scope of the expanded African refugee definition contained in Article I(2) of the 1969 OAU *Convention Governing the Specific Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa*.

Reuven (Ruvi) Ziegler

is lecturer in law at the University of Reading School of Law (specialising in human rights, international humanitarian law and international refugee law); Editor-in-Chief, Working Paper Series, Refugee Law Initiative (Institute for Advance Legal Study, University of London); Researcher, Israel Democracy Institute (analysing the treatment of African asylum seekers in Israel as part of the Constitutional Principles project); Academic visitor, Faculty of Law, University of Oxford. DPhil, MPhil, BCL (Oxon); LLM (Hebrew); LLB, BA (Economics) (Haifa). Webpage: http://works.bepress.com/ruvi_ziegler/.

Contents

Acknowledgements IX

Abbreviations X

Notes on Contributors XII

PART 1

Introduction

- 1 Refuge from Inhumanity? Canvassing the Issues 3
Jean-François Durieux and David James Cantor

PART 2

Interpretive Guidance from IHL: Cross-Cutting Issues

- 2 The 'War Flaw' and Why It Matters 39
Hugo Storey
- 3 Causation in International Protection from Armed Conflict 57
Hélène Lambert
- 4 Expanding Refugee Protection through International Humanitarian Law: Driving on a Highway or Walking near the Edge of the Abyss? 79
Stéphane Jaquemet

PART 3

Interpretive Guidance from IHL: Inclusion and Exclusion under the Refugee Convention

- 5 Persecution and the Nexus to a Refugee Convention Ground in Non-International Armed Conflict: Insights from Customary International Humanitarian Law 101
Vanessa Holzer
- 6 Inclusion of Refugees from Armed Conflict: Combatants and Ex-combatants 128
Eric Fripp

- 7 **Exclusion is Not Just about Saying ‘No’: Taking Exclusion Seriously in Complex Conflicts** 155
 Geoff Gilbert

PART 4

Interpretive Guidance from IHL: Regional Definitions and Systems

- 8 **The African War Refugee: Using IHL to Interpret the 1969 African Refugee Convention’s Expanded Refugee Definition** 179
 Tamara Wood
- 9 **A Simple Solution to War Refugees? The Latin American Expanded Definition and its relationship to IHL** 204
 David James Cantor and Diana Trimiño Mora
- 10 **Revisiting the Civilian and Humanitarian Character of Refugee Camps** 225
 Maja Janmyr
- 11 **The (Mis)Use of International Humanitarian Law under Article 15(C) of the EU Qualification Directive** 247
 Céline Bauloz
- 12 **What Protection for Persons Fleeing Indiscriminate Violence? The Impact of the European Courts on the EU Subsidiary Protection Regime** 270
 Evangelia (Lilian) Tsourdi
- 13 **Of Autonomy, Autarky, Purposiveness and Fragmentation: The Relationship between EU Asylum Law and International Humanitarian Law** 295
 Violeta Moreno-Lax

PART 5

IHL Protections for Non-Return to Armed Conflict

- 14 Laws of Unintended Consequence? Nationality, Allegiance and the
 Removal of Refugees during Wartime 345
 David James Cantor

- 15 The Scope of the Obligation Not to Return Fighters under the Law of
 Armed Conflict 373
 Françoise J. Hampson

- 16 *Non-Refoulement* between 'Common Article 1' and 'Common
 Article 3' 386
 Reuven (Ruvi) Ziegler

PART 6

Wider Approaches to Protection of War Victims

- 17 Protection against the Forced Return of War Refugees:
 An Interdisciplinary Consensus on Humanitarian
 Non-refoulement 411
 Jennifer Moore

- 18 *Non-refoulement*, Temporary Refuge, and the 'New' Asylum
 Seekers 433
 Guy S. Goodwin-Gill

- Bibliography 461
- Index 485