



# SUSTAINABLE SECURITY

---

Rethinking American National Security Strategy

---

Edited by JEREMI SURI and BENJAMIN VALENTINO

# Sustainable Security

## *Rethinking American National Security Strategy*

Edited by Jeremi Suri  
and  
Benjamin Valentino

OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America.

© Oxford University Press 2016

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

You must not circulate this work in any other form  
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

CIP data is on file at the Library of Congress  
ISBN 978-0-19-061147-7 (hbk)  
ISBN 978-0-19-061148-4 (pbk)

Hardback printed by Bridgeport National Bindery, Inc., United States of America

# Sustainable Security

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This volume is a product of sustained collaboration through the Tobin Project, a community of scholars and policymakers committed to cultivating rigorous academic understanding of the most significant problems facing the United States. The engagement of the Tobin community has strengthened this endeavor at every step along the way, and we have been fortunate to work with many great minds over the course of this initiative.

First among these is Stephen Van Evera, who chairs the Tobin Project's National Security initiative and has been integral to this project from its inception. It has been a privilege to work with Steve, and this book is much better for his suggestions, his critiques, and his encouragement to reach for transformative scholarship on the biggest threats to American security. We owe him a deep debt of gratitude, and we have done our very best to weave his vision and expertise into the scholarship represented in this volume.

This project was made possible by the generous support of the Carnegie Corporation of New York, whose long-term investment has been central to the development of the Tobin Project's work on security. We are grateful for their contributions to this effort, as well as their broader longstanding commitment to helping scholars make their work as valuable to society as possible. The statements made and views expressed herein are solely the responsibility of the authors.

We would like to thank all those who have participated in our meetings and workshops—scholars and policymakers alike—whose comments and guidance were invaluable as this volume took shape. We are grateful to Matthew Connelly and Paul Barford for contributing to early stage discussions of sustainable national security; Jeremy Shapiro, Jeremy Pressman, Colin Kahl, Elissa Slotkin, Robert Art, F. Gregory Gause III, and Carl Robichaud for their contributions to our meeting on US global security commitments; The Institute for the Study of Diplomacy for cohosting a seminar on grand strategy; Ambassador Thomas Pickering, Paula Newberg, Barry Posen, and William Hitchcock for their helpful comments at the seminar; and Ambassador James Dobbins, Stephen P. Cohen, Shuja Nawaz, Peter Mandaville, and Vikram Singh for contributing to our meeting on Afghanistan.

We would also like to thank Daniel Baer, Peter Harrell, Michael Phelan, Dafna Rand, and James Schear for their insights on the problems facing US foreign policy and the open questions they confronted; Risa Brooks, Mathew Burrows, David Ekbladh, M. Taylor Fravel, David Singh Grewal, and Joseph Nye for sharing their insights on long-term security issues at a workshop in Cambridge, MA; the Lyndon B. Johnson School of Public Affairs for hosting our May 3–4 workshop, and Terrence Chapman, Robert Chesney, Kyle Longley, Patrick McDonald, Larry O'Bryon, and Peter Trubowitz for their comments during the meeting; and Michael Beckley for

participating in our May 28, 2013 workshop in Hanover, NH. We would also like to thank Omar Samad and New America for convening an illuminating discussion on Afghan neutrality.

We also gratefully acknowledge all those who participated in our December 2012 conference on sustainable national security strategy. We extend a special thanks to a few key figures who made the conference possible: Robert Art, who graciously moderated our forum on US regional security commitments; Jennifer Harris, Michael Phelan, and Kori Schake, whose comments as respondents helped strengthen chapter drafts; and David McKean, Esther McClure, Steven Feldstein, and Kaleb Redden, who were kind enough to provide formal remarks throughout the conference.

We are fortunate to have had the opportunity to collaborate with Scott Parris and Cathryn Vaulman, our editors at Oxford University Press; we thank them for all of their help in bringing this volume to print. We also wish to thank the four anonymous reviewers of the manuscript, whose thoughtful comments were invaluable to us during the revisions process.

Finally, we are grateful to the staff and leadership at the Tobin Project, whose hard work and commitment have been indispensable from the birth of this initiative to its close. Tobin's mission is to mobilize scholars to work on solving problems of great importance to our nation. As this project demonstrated, however, that work would not be possible without the tremendous effort and expertise of the dedicated people at Tobin. We are especially grateful to John Cisternino, the Tobin Project's Director of Research; Melanie Wachtell Stinnett, the Project's former director of Policy and Communications; and Sidharth Shah, who was vital to planning and shaping this inquiry. They made this project better in every way. We also thank Rebecca Chan, Miranda Priebe, and Sam Dunham, who all gave comments and suggestions that improved this volume and greatly facilitated the publication process; Medha Gargeya and Nathaniel Donahue, who helped prepare and edit the manuscript; and Robert Ward for his long-term work to make sure this volume reaches the audiences of scholars, policymakers, students, and citizens for whom we and the contributors meant it.

## LIST OF EDITORS

**Jeremi Suri** is the Mack Brown Distinguished Chair for Leadership in Global Affairs and has a joint appointment in the Lyndon B. Johnson School of Public Affairs and the Department of History at the University of Texas at Austin. Professor Suri was previously with the University of Wisconsin, where he was the E. Gordon Fox Professor of History, the Director of the European Union Center of Excellence, and the Director of the Grand Strategy Program. He is interested in the formation and spread of nation-states, the emergence of modern international relations, the connections between foreign policy and domestic politics, and the rise of knowledge institutions as global actors. He is the author and editor of seven books, including a biography of one of America's most distinguished diplomats, *Henry Kissinger and the American Century* (Harvard University Press, 2007). His latest book, *Liberty's Surest Guardian: American Nation-Building from Washington to Obama*, was released in the fall of 2011. He also co-edited *Foreign Policy Breakthroughs: Cases in Successful Diplomacy* (Oxford University Press, 2016) with Robert Hutchings, and *The Power of the Past: History and Statecraft* (Brookings Institution Press, 2016) with Hal Brands.

**Benjamin Valentino** is an Associate Professor of Government at Dartmouth College. His research interests include the causes and consequences of violent conflict and American foreign and security policies. At Dartmouth he teaches courses on international relations, international security, American foreign policy, and the causes and prevention of genocide. He also serves as codirector of the Government Department Honors Program and the faculty coordinator for the War and Peace Studies Program at Dartmouth's Dickey Center for International Understanding. Professor Valentino's book, *Final Solutions: Mass Killing and Genocide in the 20th Century* (Cornell University Press, 2004), received the Edgar S. Furniss Book Award for making an exceptional contribution to the study of national and international security. His work has appeared in outlets such as *The New York Times*, *Foreign Affairs*, *The American Political Science Review*, *Security Studies*, *International Organization*, *Public Opinion Quarterly*, *World Politics*, and *The Journal of Politics*.



## CONTRIBUTORS

**Joshua William Busby** is an Associate Professor of Public Affairs at the University of Texas-Austin, LBJ School of Public Affairs. Dr. Busby was a research fellow at Princeton's Woodrow Wilson School (2005–2006), Harvard's Kennedy School (2004–2005); and the Brookings Institution (2003–2004). He received his PhD in 2004 from Georgetown University. Busby is the author of two books on social movements published by Cambridge University Press. Busby is a Life Member in the Council on Foreign Relations. He has written extensively on climate change and national security in publications such as *International Security*, *Security Studies*, and *Political Geography*, as well as for several think tanks. Dr. Busby is one of the lead researchers on a project funded by the Department of Defense on Climate Change and African Political Stability (CCAPS). He is also the principal investigator of another DOD-funded project, Complex Emergencies and Political Stability in Asia (CEPSA).

**Daniel Byman** is a Professor in the Security Studies Program in the Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service, with a concurrent appointment with the Georgetown Department of Government. He served as director of Georgetown's Security Studies Program and Center for Security Studies from 2005 to 2010. Professor Byman is a Senior Fellow and Director of Research at the Center for Middle East Policy at the Brookings Institution. He is the author or coauthor of seven books; his most recent book, *Al Qaeda, the Islamic State, and the Global Jihadist Movement: What Everyone Needs to Know*, was published by Oxford University Press in 2015. His articles have appeared in *Foreign Affairs* and *Foreign Policy*, as well as journals including *Political Science Quarterly*, *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism*, *International Security*, and *Journal of Strategic Studies*. From 2002 to 2004, he served as a Professional Staff Member with the 9/11 Commission and with the Joint 9/11 Inquiry Staff of the House and Senate Intelligence Committees. Before joining the Inquiry Staff, he was the Research Director of the Center for Middle East Public Policy at the RAND Corporation. He has also worked as an analyst on the Middle East for the US government.

**Audrey Kurth Cronin** is professor and the director of the International Security Program at George Mason University's School of Policy, Government, and International Affairs. Before joining George Mason in 2011, she directed the core course on war and statecraft at the US National War College. Prior to that, she was the Director of Studies for the Changing Character of War program at the University of Oxford, UK. She is a member of the Council on Foreign Relations and has served in the US Congressional Research Service, the Office of the Secretary of Defense/Policy, and the Office of the Secretary of the Navy. Academically,



Professor Cronin has a longstanding interest in the question of how conflicts end. While on the faculty at Oxford, she completed her fourth book, *How Terrorism Ends: Understanding the Decline and Demise of Terrorist Campaigns* (Princeton University Press, 2009). She has published widely in scholarly and policy journals. She received her AB (*summa cum laude*) from Princeton, and her MPhil and DPhil degrees from Oxford University.

**Daniel W. Drezner** is Professor of International Politics at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy at Tufts University, a nonresident senior fellow at the Brookings Institution, and a contributing editor at the *Washington Post*. Prior to Fletcher, he taught at the University of Chicago and the University of Colorado at Boulder. He has also worked for the Civic Education Project, the RAND Corporation, and the US Department of the Treasury. Drezner is the author of five books, including *All Politics is Global: Explaining International Regulatory Regimes* (Princeton University Press, 2007) and *The System Worked: How the World Stopped Another Great Depression* (Oxford University Press, 2014), and has edited two others. He has published articles in numerous scholarly journals as well as in the *New York Times*, *Wall Street Journal*, and *Foreign Affairs*, and has been a contributing editor for *Foreign Policy* and *The National Interest*. He received his BA in political economy from Williams College and an MA in economics and PhD in political science from Stanford University.

**Sumit Ganguly** is a professor of political science, holds the Rabindranath Tagore Chair in Indian Cultures and Civilizations, and is the Director of the Center on American and Global Security at Indiana University, Bloomington. A specialist on the contemporary politics of South Asia, he has written extensively on questions of nuclear stability, ethnic conflict, and counterinsurgency in the region. He is an Associate Editor of *Security Studies* and serves on the editorial boards of *Asian Security*, *Current History*, *The India Review*, *International Security*, *Journal of Democracy*, and *Pacific Affairs*. His most recent book is *The Oxford Short Introduction to Indian Foreign Policy* (Oxford University Press, 2015). Next year, Cambridge University Press will publish his book, *Deadly Impasse: India and Pakistan at the Dawn of a New Century*.

**John W. Hall** is the Ambrose-Hesseltine Associate Professor of US Military History at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. His research focuses on early American warfare with a particular emphasis on intercultural conflict and cooperation between European and Native American societies during the eras of the American Revolution and the Early Republic and US defense policy more generally. A lieutenant colonel in the US Army Reserve, he previously served as a doctrinal concept developer in the Future Warfare Division of the US Army Training and Doctrine Command. He is the author of *Uncommon Defense: Indian Allies in the Black Hawk War* (Harvard University Press, 2009), has also published in the *Journal of Military History* and a number of edited volumes, and is currently working on a book entitled *Dishonorable Duty: The U.S. Army and the Removal of the Southeastern Indians*. He holds a BS in History from the US Military Academy at West Point and received his PhD in History in 2007 from the University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill.

**Nancy F. Hite-Rubin** is Assistant Professor of Political Economy at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy at Tufts University. Her research and teaching interests lie at the intersection of comparative political economy and international relations, and she has done fieldwork on the West Bank, India, and the Philippines. She focuses mostly on comparative politics in developing and transitional countries and is keenly interested in the relationship between informal markets, access to state institutions, clientelism, and political psychology. Her book manuscript, *Economic Modernization and the Disruption of Patronage Politics: Experimental Evidence from the Philippines*, employs qualitative, field experimental, and quantitative research methodology to investigate how marginalized people respond to economic development. She received her PhD in Political Science from Yale University in 2012 and earned an LLM in Law and Economics from the University of Hamburg, Germany on a Fulbright Scholarship. She holds a BA in Economics (with distinction) from the University of Texas, Austin.

**William Inboden** is William Powers, Jr. Chair and Executive Director of the William P. Clements, Jr. Center for National Security at the University of Texas-Austin. He also serves as Associate Professor at the LBJ School of Public Affairs and is a Distinguished Scholar at the Robert S. Strauss Center for International Security and Law. Previously, he served as Senior Director for Strategic Planning on the National Security Council at the White House, where he worked on a range of foreign policy issues including the 2006 *National Security Strategy*, democracy and governance, contingency planning, counterradicalization, and multilateral institutions and initiatives. Inboden also worked at the Department of State as a Member of the Policy Planning Staff and a Special Advisor in the Office of International Religious Freedom, and has worked as a staff member in both the US Senate and the House of Representatives. He is the author of *Religion and American Foreign Policy, 1945–1960: The Soul of Containment* (Cambridge University Press, 2010). Inboden received his PhD and MA degrees in history from Yale University.

**Jonathan Kirshner** is the Stephen and Barbara Friedman Professor of International Political Economy in the Department of Government at Cornell University. His research and teaching interests focus on international relations, political economy (especially macroeconomics), and politics and film. He is the author of numerous books, including *American Power after the Financial Crisis* (Cornell University Press, 2014), *Currency and Coercion: The Political Economy of International Monetary Power* (Princeton University Press, 1995), and *Appeasing Bankers: Financial Caution on the Road to War* (Princeton University Press, 2007), which won the best book award from the International Security Studies Section of the International Studies Association. He is the editor of the volumes *Globalization and National Security* (Routledge, 2006) and *Monetary Orders: Ambiguous Economics, Ubiquitous Politics* (Cornell University Press, 2003), and, with Eric Helleiner, the coeditor of two volumes and the multidisciplinary book series Cornell Studies in Money. He previously chaired the Economics and National Security Program at the Olin Institute of Strategic Studies at Harvard. Kirshner is a recipient of the Provost's Award for Distinguished Scholarship and the Stephen and Margery Russell Distinguished Teaching Award from Cornell University. He is currently pursuing projects on classical realism, the

international political implications of the financial crisis, and the politics of mid-century cinema.

**Jennifer Lind** is an Associate Professor of Government at Dartmouth College and Faculty Associate of the Reischauer Institute for Japanese Studies at Harvard University. She has previously been a Fellow at the Sasakawa Peace Foundation; a Visiting Scholar at the Waseda University for Advanced Study in Tokyo, Japan; and a consultant for RAND Corporation and for the Office of the Secretary at the US Department of Defense. Lind is the author of *Sorry States: Apologies in International Politics* (Cornell University Press, 2008). Her work has also been featured in *International Security*, *International Studies Quarterly*, *The Atlantic*, and *Foreign Affairs*. Lind's current research addresses the way countries rise to the status of great powers and the coming struggle for the Western Pacific between the United States and China. She holds an MA in Pacific International Affairs from University of California, San Diego and a PhD in Political Science from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

**Sara Bjerg Moller** is Assistant Professor at the School of Diplomacy and International Relations at Seton Hall University. Her research interests lie at the intersection of international cooperation and conflict processes. Her dissertation, "Fighting Friends: Institutional Cooperation and Military Effectiveness in Multinational Wars," analyzes the institutional design and effectiveness of multinational fighting arrangements in wartime. Her work has been published in the *Los Angeles Times*, *Boston Globe*, *National Interest*, *Middle East Times*, and *World Politics Review*. She received her PhD from Columbia University; prior to undertaking PhD studies, she worked as a Research Associate for Middle Eastern Studies at the Council on Foreign Relations.

**Cindy Williams** is a Research Affiliate of the Security Studies Program at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, where she was a Principal Research Scientist until her retirement in 2013. She is also an elected fellow and a former member of the board of directors of the National Academy of Public Administration and a member of the Council on Foreign Relations, in addition to serving on the editorial board of *International Security*. Formerly, she was an Assistant Director of the Congressional Budget Office, where she led the National Security Division in studies of budgetary and policy choices related to defense and international security. Dr. Williams also served as a director and in other capacities at the MITRE Corporation in Bedford, Massachusetts; as a member of the Senior Executive Service in the Office of the Secretary of Defense; and as a mathematician at RAND. Dr. Williams holds a PhD in mathematics from the University of California, Irvine. She is coauthor, with Gordon Adams, of *Buying National Security: How America Plans and Pays for Its Global Role and Safety at Home* (Routledge, 2010). She is the editor of *Filling the Ranks: Transforming the U.S. Military Personnel System* (MIT Press, 2004) and *Holding the Line: U.S. Defense Alternatives for the Early 21st Century* (MIT Press, 2001), and co-editor, with Curtis Gilroy, of *Service to Country: Personnel Policy and the Transformation of Western Militaries* (MIT Press, 2006).

**William C. Wohlforth** is the Daniel Webster Professor in the Dartmouth College Department of Government. A widely recognized expert in international relations,

he has published works on topics ranging from the Cold War to contemporary US grand strategy. He is the editor of five books and the author of three others, including *America Abroad: The United States' Global Role in the 21st Century* (Oxford University Press, 2016) with coauthor Stephen G. Brooks. He has published some sixty articles and book chapters, and his work has appeared in journals including *Foreign Affairs*, *International Security*, *American Political Science Review*, and *World Politics*. He is a member of the editorial boards of the *Cambridge Studies in International Relations*, *Security Studies*, and *International Security*, is a member of the Council on Foreign Relations, and has served as a consultant for the National Intelligence Council and the National Bureau of Asian Research. Before coming to Dartmouth in 2000, Wohlforth held faculty appointments at Princeton University and Georgetown University. He has taught undergraduate courses on a wide array of topics, including international politics, Russian foreign policy, leadership and grand strategy, violence and security, and decision making. He is currently writing a book on nationalism and war with Nicholas Sambanis and Stergios Skaperdas.

# Sustainable Security

# CONTENTS

|                 |      |
|-----------------|------|
| List of Figures | vii  |
| List of Tables  | ix   |
| Acknowledgments | xi   |
| List of Editors | xiii |
| Contributors    | xv   |

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| <b>Sustainable Security: Rethinking American National Security Strategy</b> | <b>1</b> |
| <i>Jeremi Suri and Benjamin Valentino</i>                                   |          |

## **Section I: Recalibrating National Security Strategy**

### **1. Dollar Diminution and New Macroeconomic Constraints on American Power**

*Jonathan Kirshner*

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>2. Does American Military Power Attract Foreign Investment?</b> | <b>51</b> |
| <i>Daniel W. Drezner and Nancy F. Hite-Rubin</i>                   |           |

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>3. Preserving National Strength in a Period of Fiscal Restraint</b> | <b>73</b> |
| <i>Cindy Williams</i>  |           |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>4. State Finance and National Power: Great Britain, China, and the United States in Historical Perspective</b> | <b>112</b> |
| <i>Jeremi Suri</i>  |            |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>5. Reforming American Power: Civilian National Security Institutions in the Early Cold War and Beyond</b> | <b>136</b> |
| <i>William Inboden</i>   |            |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>6. To Starve an Army: How Great Power Armies Respond to Austerity</b> | <b>166</b> |
| <i>John W. Hall</i>  |            |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>7. Climate Change and US National Security: Sustaining Security Amidst Unsustainability</b> | <b>196</b> |
| <i>Joshua William Busby</i>  |            |

**Section II: Regional Security Commitments**

**8. At Home Abroad: Public Attitudes toward  
America's Overseas Commitments 233**

*Benjamin Valentino*

**9. The Right Choice for NATO 245**

*William C. Wohlforth*

**10. The United States and the Middle East: Interests, Risks, and Costs 263**

*Daniel Byman and Sara Bjerg Moller*

**11. Keep, Toss, or Fix? Assessing US Alliances in East Asia 297**

*Jennifer Lind*

**12. Terminating the Interminable? 332**

*Sumit Ganguly*

**13. A Sustainable Approach to Afghanistan: Neutralization 349**

*Audrey Kurth Cronin*

**Conclusion 385**

*Jeremi Suri and Benjamin Valentino*

**Index 393**



## LIST OF FIGURES

- 2.1. Residual Analysis 61
- 2.2. FDI Inflows and Military Spending (1990–2007) 63
- 2.3. Predictive Margins with 95% CIs 69
- 2.4. Military Spending and FDI Inflows (1990–2007) 69
- 3.1. World Defense Expenditures in 2012 75
- 3.2. US Federal Debt Held by the Public, 1790 to 2013 78
- 3.3. Revenues and Outlays as a Share of GDP (Percent) 80
- 3.4. Nonwar Budgets for National Defense under Three Plans 82
- 3.5. Military Departments' Shares of Total Budget for the Services,  
Selected Years 89
- 4.1. Li Hongzhang, during his Visit to the United States in 1896 127
- 8.1. Majority Says United States Should “Mind Its Own Business  
Internationally” 237
- 8.2. Support for an Active Part in World Affairs 237
- 8.3. Support for Overseas Military Bases 238

## LIST OF TABLES

- 2.1. Main Regression Results 59
- 2.2. Military Spending and FDI Split Analysis: Global North and Global South 62
- 2.3. Military Spending and FDI Split Analysis: North America and Excluding North America 64
- 2.4. Balance Comparisons with Military Expenditure and FDI Measures (1985–2010) 66
- 3.1. Navy Ships under the Navy's Plan and under Three Options 94
- 3.2. Comparison of Options 109
- 8.1. Percent of Respondents Who Believe "the United States Currently Has a Formal Treaty That Pledges the United States to Help Defend" (Italicized Countries are Correct) 243
- 10.1. Posited US Interests and Possible Threats 289
- 13.1. Neutralization Cases 355