

VERÖFFENTLICHUNGEN DES INSTITUTS
FÜR DEUTSCHES, EUROPÄISCHES
UND INTERNATIONALES MEDIZINRECHT,
GESUNDHEITSRECHT UND BIOETHIK
DER UNIVERSITÄTEN HEIDELBERG UND MANNHEIM

JOCHEN TAUPITZ · MARION WESCHKA
Editors

CHIMBRIDS

Chimeras and Hybrids in Comparative European and International Research

Scientific, Ethical, Philosophical
and Legal Aspects

Jochen Taupitz • Marion Weschka
Editors

CHIMBRIDS - Chimeras and Hybrids in Comparative European and International Research

**Scientific, Ethical, Philosophical
and Legal Aspects**

Series Editors

Professor Dr. Dr. h.c. Thomas Hillenkamp
Professor Dr. Lothar Kuhlen
Professor Dr. Eibe Riedel
Professor Dr. Jochen Taupitz (Geschäftsführender Direktor)

Editors

Professor Dr. Jochen Taupitz
Institut für Deutsches, Europäisches
und Internationales Medizinrecht,
Gesundheitsrecht und Bioethik
der Universitäten
Heidelberg und Mannheim
Schloss, Westflügel
68131 Mannheim
Germany
taupitz@jura.uni-mannheim.de

Marion Weschka, LL.M., Mag. rer. publ.
Institut für Deutsches, Europäisches
und Internationales Medizinrecht,
Gesundheitsrecht und Bioethik
der Universitäten
Heidelberg und Mannheim
Schloss, Westflügel
68131 Mannheim
Germany
Marion.Weschka@imgb.de

ISSN 1617-1497
ISBN 978-3-540-93868-2 e-ISBN 978-3-540-93869-9
DOI 10.1007/978-3-540-93869-9
Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York

Library of Congress Control Number: 2009926888

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2009

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilm or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Violations are liable to prosecution under the German Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Cover design: WMX Design GmbH, Heidelberg

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Edited by

Thomas Hillenkamp, Lothar Kuhlen, Eibe Riedel,
Jochen Taupitz (Geschäftsführender Direktor)

Preface

The research project “CHIMBRIDS - Chimeras and Hybrids in Comparative European and International research – Scientific, Ethical, Philosophical and Legal Aspects”, coordinated by the Institute for German, European and International Medical Law, Public Health Law and Bioethics of the Universities of Heidelberg and Mannheim (IMGB), focuses on the scientific, ethical and legal implications of the creation of and research with human-animal mixed creatures.

National, European and international concepts and strategies concerning the legal and ethical framework of this research are still largely missing, even though they are absolutely necessary in order to use the potential of chimera and hybrid research effectively and efficiently for the benefit of science and society. Accordingly, dynamic development of chimera and hybrid research creates insecurity on the part of decision-makers and society at large. This has been evidenced recently when the approval of the Human Embryology and Fertilisation Bill by the UK House of Commons was controversially debated.

With research activities lasting from 01.10.2005 to 30.11.2007, CHIMBRIDS contributes to a solution for the existing problems, sheds light on the chances and risks of chimera and hybrid research and suggests legal solutions and prospective research practices in order to help decision-makers fulfill their tasks in an informed and efficient manner.

We would like to express our gratitude to all participants of the project for their support of CHIMBRIDS and this publication:

First of all, this applies to all authors of this volume for their scholarship and dedicated involvement on an interdisciplinary level.

Furthermore, the research assistants and the staff of the IMGB provided invaluable support. Dr. Sara Kranz drafted and implemented the financial and organisational framework of the project, defining the structural and topical composition and progression of international workshops and conferences and aligning this development to the parameters required for the interim reports. This task, eventually leading to the publication at hand, was continued by Markus Fuderer. Prof. Dr. Marcus Oehrich, Heike Malone, and Annette Wedler provided their insight and support with regard to the organisation of the various project milestones. Anne Laspeyres and Katharina Teske assisted the project coordination between the participants. The editing and typographical layout was carefully performed by Christoph Balmert, Beate Braunagel, Johanna Carl, Juliane Geldermann, Fabian Geyer, Kristina Helmer, Lisa Hochhaus, Sebastian Köbler, Gerrit Krämer, Stephanie Lohr, Mayte Richter, and Andrea Sautter. The continuous support of the “Verein zur Förderung des deutschen, europäischen und

VI Preface

internationalen Medizinrechts, Gesundheitsrechts und der Bioethik in Heidelberg und Mannheim e.V.” was also valuable during this project.

Tom Finnegan from Durham University was responsible for proofreading and harmonising the language of the multinational contributions into one consistent style for this volume.

Administrative assistance was also provided by the University of Mannheim, especially by Sabine Volz.

Without the substantial financial contribution by the Research Directorate of the Commission of the European Communities in the course of the 6th Framework Programme of the European Union, a work of such scope and detail would not have been possible.

January 2009

Jochen Taupitz
Marion Weschka

Table of Contents

Introduction

<i>(Marion Weschka)</i>	1
-------------------------------	---

A. General research aspects3

I. Problems with terminology and definitions <i>(Michael Bader)</i>	5
--	---

II. Etymological background and further clarifying remarks concerning chimeras and hybrids <i>(Josef Kuře)</i>	7
--	---

1. Introduction	7
-----------------------	---

2. Semantic analysis.....	7
---------------------------	---

a. Chimera as an archetype	7
----------------------------------	---

b. Etymological background.....	10
---------------------------------	----

c. Chimera as a metaphor and as a terminus technicus.....	11
---	----

d. Hybrid.....	12
----------------	----

e. Some further differentiations	14
--	----

f. Chimera as a strategy	15
--------------------------------	----

3. Anthropological clarifications	16
---	----

a. Chimera and the deeper understanding of humanity.....	16
--	----

b. Should we cross boundaries?.....	18
-------------------------------------	----

c. The art of slowness	19
------------------------------	----

III. Scientific background <i>(Michael Bader, Regine Schreiner, Eckhard Wolf)</i>	21
--	----

1. Introduction	21
-----------------------	----

2. Intra-species mixtures	24
---------------------------------	----

a. Intra-species chimeras.....	24
--------------------------------	----

b. Intra-species hybrids.....	28
-------------------------------	----

3. Inter-species mixtures	28
---------------------------------	----

a. Inter-species chimeras.....	28
--------------------------------	----

b. Inter-species hybrids.....	32
-------------------------------	----

VIII Table of Contents

c. Examples of inter-species mixtures

aa. Xenotransplantation (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	35
bb. Transgenic animals carrying human genes (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	39
cc. Nuclear transfer research (<i>Andras Dinnyes, Marion Weschka, Qi Zhou</i>)	43
dd. Transplantation of human embryonic stem cells into animal brain (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	51
ee. Hamster test: Testing human sperm capacity with hamster ova (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	52
ff. Mixing of embryos (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	53
gg. Interspecies gestation (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	54
hh. Other mixtures (Matrixes)	55
- Remarks to the matrix „Chimeras and Hybrids” (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	55
- Matrix Chimeras and Hybrids: Human-Animal mixtures (Chimbrids)	57
- Encompassing Matrix	59

IV. Ethics

(<i>Autumn Fiester, Marcus Düwell</i>)	61
--	----

1. Introduction.....	61
2. The Fundamental Debates on Moral Status: What Makes Entities Morally Significant?.....	62
a. Preliminary Remarks	62
b. Moral Status Based on Sentience (i.e., on the ability to feel pain or suffer)	63
c. Moral Status Based on Agency, Self-Consciousness or Rationality	64
d. Moral Status Based on the Significance of the Human Species ..	65
e. Moral Status Based on the Intrinsic Value of Animals.....	66
aa. Applications of Moral Status: Potentiality, Precaution and Symbolic Extensions of Status	67

bb. Applications of Moral Status: Potentiality.....	67
cc. Applications of Moral Status: Precaution	68
dd. Applications of Moral Status: Symbolic Meanings	68
f. The Moral Status of Human Embryos and Chimbrids.....	70
3. Specific Moral Considerations in Evaluating Chimbrids: An Ethical Matrix.....	70
a. Preliminary Remarks	71
b. Moral Considerations in Research Ethics.....	71
c. Moral Considerations in Animal Ethics.....	73
V. Law.....	79
1. Legal tools and strategies for the regulation of chimbrids (<i>Elisabeth Rynning</i>).....	79
a. Introduction	79
b. Determining the aims of the regulatory project	80
c. Identifying the appropriate regulator	81
d. The choice of regulatory instruments	81
e. Decision-making in individual cases	84
f. Monitoring and sanctions	84
g. Some challenges in the regulation of chimbrids	85
2. Which Beings Should Be Entitled to Human Rights? (<i>Erwin Bernat</i>)	88
a. The General Concept of Personhood	88
b. Human Rights – Their Meaning and Their Foundation.....	89
c. Human Rights and the Constitution.....	91
aa. The Paradigm: Born of a Human (the Natural Person)	91
bb. Does the Unborn Human Being Enjoy Constitutionally Protected Human Rights?	92
cc. Indicators of Personhood	94
d. The Status of Chimeras and Chimeric Embryos.....	95
3. Chimbrids and International Law (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	98

X Table of Contents

4. EU Law and Council of Europe Law applicable to chimera and hybrid research (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	116
a. Relevant facts.....	116
b. Research law.....	116
c. Protection of human-beings by the fundamental rights of the European Union.....	119
d. Protection of human rights and the dignity of the human being within the Council of Europe's Legal Framework.....	119
e. Protection of biotechnological inventions.....	121
f. Protection of personal data.....	122
g. Protection of Health.....	123
h. Protection of animals in the case of animal experiments.....	129
i. Genetics in the non-human domain.....	131
5. National law.....	132
a. EU member states.....	132
aa. Austria (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	132
bb. France (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	136
cc. Germany (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	140
dd. Sweden (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	145
ee. Spain (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	150
ff. United Kingdom (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	151
b. Other Countries.....	158
aa. Switzerland (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	158
bb. Israel (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	165
cc. United States (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	169

dd. Canada (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	173
ee. China (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	178
ff. Japan (<i>Marion Weschka</i>).....	180
B. Key Cases in chimbrids research.....	185
I. Case 1 – Muotri: Transfer of human embryonic stem cell–derived neurons in mouse brain.....	187
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	187
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Autumn Fiester</i>)	190
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Deryck Beyleveld</i>).....	196
II. Case 2 – Chen: Interspecies somatic cell nuclear transfer	201
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	201
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	205
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Marion Weschka</i>)	209
III. Case 3 – Bailey: Animal-Human Xenotransplantation.....	231
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	231
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	235
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Marion Weschka</i>)	237
IV. Case 4 – Fink: Porcine Xenografts in Parkinson’s Disease and Huntington’s Disease patients	263
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	263
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>).....	267

XII Table of Contents

3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Jan C. Joerden</i>)	271
V. Case 5 – McCune: The SCID-hu Mouse	287
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>)	287
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Autumn Fiester</i>)	290
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Sonia Desmoulin</i>)	293
VI. Case 6 – EMEA: Transgenic goat producing human antithrombin	317
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	317
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Dominik Groß</i>)	320
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Sylvie Bordet</i>)	324
VII. Case 7 – O’Doherty: Mouse with human chromosome	353
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	353
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Dominik Groß</i>)	356
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Sylvie Bordet</i>)	360
VIII. Case 8 – Yanagimachi: Hamster egg penetration test	361
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>)	361
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter</i>)	364
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	367
IX. Case 9 – Fehilly: Human-animal embryo mixing	379
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	379
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Dominik Groß</i>)	381

3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Marion Weschka</i>)	385
X. Case 10 – Nan et al.: Interspecies gestation.....	405
1. Scientific considerations (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	405
2. Ethical considerations (<i>Josef Kuře</i>)	407
3. Legal regulation in different countries (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	410
XI. Short Remarks to the cases 1-10 in the light of European legal order (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>)	427
C. Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations.....	433
I. General remarks	435
II. Scientific overview of human-animal mixtures	437
III. Ethical Aspects	441
1. Moral status	441
2. Human research ethics	443
3. Animal ethics.....	444
4. Appearance and Symbolic Meaning	445
5. Plurality of ethical theories and legal regulations.....	446
IV. Legal Aspects	449
1. The regulatory needs and challenges	449
2. Regulatory tools and strategies applied	450
3. Concluding remarks.....	452
V. Recommendations	455
Annex.....	459
Annex A. Chimbrids – Scientific, Ethical and Legal reports.....	461
I. Science	463
1. Transgenic animals carrying human genes: Methods and Ethical Aspects (<i>Michael Bader</i>)	463

XIV Table of Contents

2. Xenotransplantation – Aspects of Chimerism (<i>Regine Schreiner, Regina Klose, Eckhard Wolf</i>).....	475
3. Nuclear Transfer, Chimeras and Hybrids: Activities and legal Aspects of Research in Hungary (<i>Andras Dinnyes</i>).....	501
4. Interspecies Nuclear Transfer Research in China (<i>Qi Zhou</i>).....	524
5. Developing Human-Nonhuman Chimeras in Human Stem Cell Research: Ethical Issues and Boundaries (<i>Philip Karpowicz, Cynthia B. Cohen, Derek van der Kooy</i>).....	535
6. Chimeras in developmental biology: scientific objectives and ethical issues (<i>Béatrice de Montera, Isabelle Hue, Jean-Paul Renard</i>).....	556
II. Ethics.....	571
1. Man-made chimeras, hybrids and mosaics – ethical perspectives (<i>Gisela Badura-Lotter, Marcus Düwell</i>).....	571
2. Ethical Issues in Transgenesis: Biopharming, Xenotransplantation & Recreational Transgenesis (<i>Autumn Fiester</i>).....	592
III. Law.....	603
1. Theses concerning chimerisation and hybridisation from an ethical and legal perspective (<i>Jan C. Joerden, Cornelia Winter</i>).....	603
2. The Regulation of Hybrids and Chimeras in the UK (<i>Deryck Beylvelld, Tom Finnegan, Shaun D. Pattinson</i>).....	645
3. Providing a legal framework for chimeras - French Report (<i>Sonia Desmoulin</i>).....	667
4. Legal Aspects of Human-Animal Chimeras and Hybrids: Country Report Sweden (<i>Elisabeth Rynning</i>).....	689
5. Chimeras and Other Human-Animal Mixtures in Relation to the Swiss Constitution and Swiss Laws: A Case for Regulatory Action (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>).....	706
6. Die rechtliche Regelung von Chimären und Hybridwesen – ein österreichischer Landesbericht (<i>Erwin Bernat</i>).....	716
7. New types of chimeras and hybrids: a challenge for biolaw (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>).....	734

8. The legislation on chimeras and hybrids in Spain (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	741
9. Discussing the European Union Competences to Legislate on Chimbrids Research (<i>Filip Krepelka</i>)	743
10. Legal Issues involving Hybrids and Chimeras: United States Country Report (<i>Timothy Stoltzfus Jost</i>)	754
11. Legal Aspects of Human-Animal Combinations in Canada (<i>Sylvie Bordet</i>)	778
12. Legal and Ethical Aspects of Chimera and Hybrid Research in Israel: Country Report with Comparative Observations (<i>Amos Shapira</i>)	798
13. Bioethical Discussions on Specified Embryos in Japan (<i>Motomu Shimoda</i>)	809
14. The Law Concerning Regulations Relating to Human Cloning Techniques, Handling of a Specified Embryo and Animal Experiment in Japan (<i>Fumio Tokotani</i>)	817
15. Human embryonic stem cell research in China (<i>Dai Kuisheng</i>)	819

Annex B. Country Reports on the 10 Cases827

I. Germany: Case 1-10 according to German Law (<i>Jan C. Joerden, Marion Weschka</i>)	829
1. Case 1 – Muotri Case.....	829
2. Case 2 – Chen Case (interspecies SCNT human into rabbit).....	833
3. Case 3 – Animal-Human Xenotransplantation	835
4. Case 4 – Fink	837
5. Case 5 – McCune.....	838
6. Case 6 – EMEA	841
7. Case 7 – O’Doherty	842
8. Case 8 – Golden Hamster test.....	843
9. Case 9 – Mixing of embryos.....	844
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	844

XVI Table of Contents

II. UK: Case 1-10 according to UK law (<i>Deryck Beyleveld</i>)	847
1. Muotri Case	847
2. Chen Case	848
3. Bailey Case. Baboon to Human Cardiac Xentotransplant in Neonates.....	849
4. Fink Case Porcine Xenografts for Huntington's.....	850
5. McCune Case: SCID.....	850
6. Transgenic Goat Case	851
7. Mice with Down's Syndrome Phenotypes.....	851
8. Golden Hamster Test	851
9. Mixing of Embryos.....	852
10. Interspecies Gestation.....	852
III. France Legal Issues in French Law: the case studies (<i>Sonia Desmoulin</i>)	855
1. Case 1 – Muotri	855
2. Case 2 – Chen	860
3. Case 3 – Chen (alternative).....	863
4. Case 4 – Fink	867
5. Case 5 – McCune.....	868
6. Case 6 – EMEA	872
7. Case 7 – O'Doherty	875
8. Case 8 – Golden Hamster test.....	876
9. Case 9 – Mixing of Embryos	878
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	880
IV. Sweden – Case 1-10 according to Swedish law (<i>Elisabeth Rynning</i>)	883
1. Case 1 – Muotri, A.R. et al. (2005).....	883
2. Case 2 – Chen, Y. et al. (2003)	884
3. Case 3 – Bailey Leonard L. et al. (1985)	886
4. Case 4 – Fink, J.S. et al. (2000)	887
5. Case 5 – McCune et al. (1988).....	888

6. Case 6 – EMEA	890
7. Case 7 – O'Doherty, A. et al. (2005)	890
8. Case 8 – Hoo Lee M. et al. (2007)	891
9. Case 9 – Mixing of embryos	892
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	894
V. Spain – Case 1-10 according to Spanish law (<i>Carlos María Romeo Casabona, Iñigo de Miguel Beriain</i>)	897
1. Case 1	897
2. Case 2	898
3. Case 3	901
4. Case 4	903
5. Case 5	905
6. Case 6	908
7. Case 7	909
8. Case 8 – Golden Hamster test	912
9. Case 9 – Mixing of embryos	912
10. Case 10 – Interspecies gestation	914
VI. Austria – Case 1-10 according to Austrian Law (<i>Erwin Bernat</i>)	917
1. Case 1 – Muotri case	917
2. Case 2 – Chen case	917
3. Case 3 – Bailey case	918
4. Case 4 – Fink case	918
5. Case 5 – McCune case	919
6. Case 6 – Transgenic goat case	919
7. Case 7 – O'Doherty case	919
8. Case 8 – Hoo Lee case	920
9. Case 9 – Fehilly case	920
10. Case 10 – Nan case	921
VII. Switzerland Case 1 to 10 according to Swiss Law (<i>Rainer J. Schweizer, Hans-Peter Bernhard</i>)	923
1. Case 1 - Muotri	923