

International Labour Law Reports

III LILIF 33

INTERNATIONAL LABOUR LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 33

Editor

ALAN GLADSTONE

Geneva, Switzerland

Editorial Board

Prof. ALVIN GOLDMAN

University of Kentucky

Prof. TORE SIGEMAN

University of Uppsala

Prof. JEAN-MAURICE VERDIER

University of Paris, Nanterre

Prof. LORD WEDDERBURN OF CHARLTON

London School of Economics and Political Science

University of London

Prof. MANFRED WEISS

University of Frankfurt

Founding Editor

The late JUSTICE ZVI H. BAR-NIV

BRILL - NIJHOFF

LEIDEN/BOSTON

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-9004-27522-5

E-ISSN 2211-6028

(c) Copyright 2014 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill-Nijhof and Hotei Publishers.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or external use is granted by Brill Academic Publishers provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers MA 01923, USA.

Fees are subject to change.



INTERNATIONAL LABOUR LAW REPORTS

This volume covers the period 1 October 2012 to 30 September 2013.

REPORTERS

International

COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE
EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES

Prof. Mia Rönmar
Lund Univ. (Sweden)

HUMAN RIGHTS BODIES

Dr. Martin Oelz
International Labour Office
Geneva

National

AUSTRALIA

Prof. Breen Creighton
RMIT Univ. (Melbourne)

AUSTRIA

Dr. Nora Melzer
Univ. of Graz

BELGIUM

Prof. Roger Blanpain
Catholic Univ. of Leuven,
Univ. of Limburg and
Univ. of Tilburg

Prof. Chris Engels
Catholic Univ. of Leuven

CANADA

Prof. Brian Langille
Univ. of Toronto

FINLAND

Prof. Niklas Bruun
Univ. of Helsinki

FRANCE

Prof. Philippe Auvergnon
Univ. Montesquieu
Bordeaux IV

GERMANY	Dr. Christoph Gyo Goethe Univ., Frankfurt
HUNGARY	Dr. József Hajdú Univ. of Szeged
IRELAND	Prof. Anthony Kerr Univ. College, Dublin
ISRAEL	Judge Stephen Adler Former President, National Labour Court
ITALY	Prof. Mariella Magnani Univ. of Pavia
JAPAN	Prof. Kôzô Kagawa Osaka Jogaquin College Prof. Hiroya Nakakubo Hitotsubashi Univ.
NETHERLANDS	Prof. A.T.M. Jacobs Univ. of Tilburg Dr. Famke Laagland Nijmegen Univ.
NORWAY	Prof. Stein Evju Univ. of Oslo
POLAND	Dr. Dagmara Skupień Univ. of Lodz Dr. Malgorzata Kurzynoga Univ. of Lodz

SPAIN

Prof. F. Ferrando García
Univ. of Murcia

Prof. F. Gómez Abelleira
Univ. Carlos III de Madrid

Dr. Belén Garcia Romero
Univ. of Murcia

SWEDEN

Prof. Ronnie Eklund
Univ. of Stockholm

Prof. Tore Sigeman
Univ. of Uppsala

UNITED KINGDOM

Prof. M. Freedland
St. John's College, Oxford

Dr. Nicola Countouris
Univ. College London

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Prof. A.L. Goldman
Univ. of Kentucky

Prof. Robert Covington
Vanderbilt Univ.

CASES REPORTED BY JURISDICTION

INTERNATIONAL

Court of Justice of the European Union

HK Danmark v. Dansk almennyttigt Boligselskab v. Dansk Arbejdsgiverforening	C.J.E.C. 1	187
<i>European Court of Human Rights (and other human rights institutions) C.N. and V. v. France</i> (Application No. 67724/09)	H.R. 1	143

NATIONAL

Australia

Construction Forestry Mining & Energy Union v. Mammoet Australia Pty Ltd	Austral. 1	365
---	------------	-----

Austria

<i>Supreme Court 8Ob A 46/12s</i>	Aust. 1	233
2011/08/0230	Aust. 2	279

Belgium

15 October 2'012, no. S11.0052N	Bel. 1	375
---------------------------------	--------	-----

Finland

2013: 10 and 2013:11	Fin.	271
----------------------	------	-----

France

Mrs Fatima X v. Association Baby Loup	Fr. 1	41
---------------------------------------	-------	----

Germany

Decision of November 20, 2012 - 1 AZR 179/11	Ger. 1	319
--	--------	-----

Ireland

Benedict McGowan and others v. the Labour Court and others	Ire. 1	291
The Commissioner of An Garda Siochana v. Ravinder Singh Oberoi	Ire. 2	59

Israel

The New Histadrut General Labour Federation v. Pelephone Communications Ltd.	Isr. 1	355
Mikud Guarding & Security v. National Labour Union; State of Israel; The New Histadrut General Labour Federation	Isr. 2	251

Italy

Decision No. 231 of 23 July 2013	It. 1	261
Decision No. 18921 of 5 November 2012	It. 2	179
Decision no. 107 of 29 May 2013	It. 3	165

Japan

Yachiyo Transportation Co. Ltd. v. Kono Taro	Jap. 1	173
Tsuda Electric Meters Co. v. Okada	Jap. 2	157

Norway

Supreme Court, Rt. 2013, p. 258	Nor. 1	3
---------------------------------	--------	---

Poland

2 October 2013, PK 82/12	Pol. 1	31
24 September 2013, III PK 90/12	Pol. 2	309

Spain

Decision of 14 March 2013 (Constitutional Court)	Sp. 1	85
Decision of 30 September 2013 (National Court/Social Chamber)	Sp. 2	129
Decision of 21 June 2012 (Supreme Court/Social Chamber)	Sp. 3	203

Sweden

Labour Court AD 2011 1020	Sw. 1	199
Labour Court AD2013 34	Sw. 2	345

United Kingdom (Great Britain through Vol.XVII)

North and others v. Dumfries and Galloway Council (Scotland)	G.B. 1	109
---	--------	-----

United States of America

Amos v. PPG Industries, Inc.	U.S.A. 1	225
Ampersand Publishing, LLC v. National Labor Relations Board	U.S.A. 2	249
Vance v. Ball State University	U.S.A. 3	49
U.S. v. Windsor	U.S.A. 4	121
University of Texas Southwest Medical Center v. Nassar	U.S.A. 5	75
Nitro-Lift Technologies, L.L.C. v. Howard	U.S.A. 6	385

CASES REPORTED BY SUBJECT MATTER

CUMULATIVE VOLUMES 30-32*

(For a cumulative list of cases reported in Volumes I to VII see Volume VII; for a cumulative list of cases reported in Volumes VIII to XIII see Volume XIII; for Volumes XIV to XVIII see Volume XVIII; for Volumes XIX to XXIV see Volume XXIV; and for Volumes XXV to XXIX see Volume XXIX)

PART ONE

GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LABOUR LAW AND KEY CONCEPTS

Conflict of Laws

Discrimination claim of foreign national			
employed abroad – contractual choice of law	U.S.A. 6	XXXI	3
Dutch dismissal law – international context	Neth. 2	XXXII	3
Cross-border services – EU law	Nor.1	XXXIII	3

Equal treatment (see also Basic Rights pertaining to Labour)

Limited or open list of discrimination			
criteria – burden of proof	Pol. 1	XXXIII	31
Prohibition of age discrimination – Directive			
2000/78 – maximum entry age for fire service	C.J.E.C. 1	XXX	3
Blue and white collar workers – equal treatment	Bel. 1	XXXI	15
Blue collar worker fixed-term contract – unfair			
dismissal provision – equal treatment	Bel. 1	XXXII	11
Principle of equal treatment – seniority bonus –			
reserved to professional category –			
justification	Fr. 1	XXXI	27
Labour contract - execution - power of management -			
restrictions to fundamental freedoms - restriction of			
religious freedom - secularism - unjustified			
dismissal	Fr. 1	XXXIII	41

* Cases touching on multiple subjects may be found under two or more headings.

Employee and employer

Relationship between manufacturing company and its contractor's employees – retaliation against employee for his report to Labour Office	Jap. 2	XXX	13
Employer liability for acts of "supervisors"	U.S.A. 3	XXXIII	49
Definition of employee – child labour	U.S.A. 5	XXXI	35
Employment status – volunteer – whether employee	Ire. 2	XXXIII	59
Collective redundancies – Directive 98/59/EC – winding up – consultation – equivalence between employer and liquidator	C.J.E.C. 1	XXXI	49
Opera chorus member – worker under Labour Union Act	Jap. 2	XXXI	59
Home care of older people – employed and self-employed – Integration in household	Aust. 1	XXXII	25

PART TWO

BASIC RIGHTS PERTAINING TO LABOUR

Freedom of association

European Convention of Human Rights – freedom of association – discrimination	Fin. 1	XXXI	67
Victimisation – engaging in industrial activity – causal connection between trade union activity and suspension – onus of proof	Austral. 1	XXXII	33
Right to strike (see previous volumes)			
Freedom of speech (see previous volumes)			

Right to privacy

Public employees right of privacy – constitutionality of review of police department review of officers' text messages	U.S.A. 2	XXX	23
Employee records – confidential information – evidence of gender discrimination	U.S.A. 3	XXXI	73
Employer's power to monitor employees – by private agency	It. 1	XXXI	89
Right of employees of government contractor to informational privacy	U.S.A. 7	XXXI	95
Computer monitoring in the workplace	Sp. 2	XXXII	43

Freedom of occupation

Covenant restricting competition by former employee – trade secrets	U.S.A. 4	XXX	35
Withdrawal from non-competition clause	Czech. 1	XXXII	53

Discrimination

Religious discrimination – discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation – direct and indirect discrimination – dismissal	G.B.1	XXX	43
Religious discrimination – employment status – arbitration agreements	G.B. 1	XXXII	69
Non-discrimination on grounds of sex – difference in retirement age for men and women	Pol. 2	XXX	59
Gender discrimination – equal pay – comparable worth	U.S.A. 6	XXX	65
Transgender discrimination	U.S.A. 6	XXXII	101
Exclusion of male military personnel from parental leave – European Convention	H.R. 1	XXXII	111
Age discrimination – age specified by party discriminated against considered governing	Hun. 2	XXXI	103
Maximum age for entry into fire service – genuine and determining occupational requirement	C.J.E.C. 1	XXX	3
Mandatory retirement age – pension scheme	Nor. 1	XXXI	109
Retaliation under Title VII by third party	U.S.A. 2	XXXI	119
Retaliation under Title VII – burden of proof	U.S.A. 5	XXXIII	75
Discrimination based on “view of life” (“weltanschauung”)	Aust. 2	XXX	75
Limits on class actions in discrimination cases	U.S.A. 1	XXXI	123
Dress code – sex discrimination	Sp. 1	XXXI	133
Indirect sex discrimination – pensions – part-time workers	Sp. 1	XXXIII	85
Equal pay – comparators – same employment	G.B. 1	XXXIII	109
Defence of Marriage Act – discrimination	U.S.A. 4	XXXIII	121
Gender discrimination and variable pay	Sp.2	XXXIII	129

PART THREE

MANPOWER

Free mobility of labour (see previous volumes)

Manpower operations

Validity of transfer of part of undertaking – organisational structure of the transferee employer	It. 2	XXXII	125
“Hand-over” employment – character and purpose – entitlement to severance allowance on termination of employment	Sp. 2	XXX	87
Prison work – European Convention	H.R. 1	XXXI	151
Employer duty of loyalty – employment protection	H.R. 1	XXXIII	143

PART FOUR

INDIVIDUAL EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP

Individual contract of employment

Housekeeper tasks – employment relationship – employer instruction and control	Hun. 3	XXXI	167
OnCall categorisation of employment relationship – superannuation	Austral. 2	XXXI	175
The employer’s duty to rehire an employee after retirement a of 60 -- legality of excluding him from the “continued employment” arrangement required by a statute to promote the employment of elderly persons	Jap. 2	XXXIII	157
Employment status - shams - mutuality of obligations	G.B. 1	XXXI	187
Forced or compulsory labour – domestic servitude - European Convention	H.R. 1	XXXIII	167
Fixed-term contract of disabled worker - failure to state technical, organisational, production or replacement reasons in the employment contract - lawfulness	It. 1	XXX	105
Fixed-term contract – temporary agency work	Fin. 1	XXXII	133
Fixed term contract	It. 3	XXXIII	165

Employment contract between individual and diplomatic mission - state immunity	H.R. 1	XXX 387
Change of terms and conditions in the contract - employer's right to direct and supervise the work - termination	Fin. 2	XXX 111
Succession of employment contract upon company split	Jap. 1	XXX 115
Repudiation by employee - third party - remedy available to employer	Austral. 1	XXXI 207
Sex workers - enforcement of illegal employment contract - constitutional protection - applicability of Labour Relations Act - remedies	S.A. 1	XXX 123
Framework Agreement on fixed-term work - EC Directive - successive fixed-term contracts	C.J.E.C. 1	XXXII 139

Remuneration

Statutory minimum remuneration - Labour Court - joint committees	Ire. 1	XXXI 215
Entitlement to severance allowance on termination of "hand-over" employment contract	Sp. 2	XXX 87

Hours of work

Dividing up of working time period - extent of employer discretion - protection against changes in scheduling of working hours	Swe. 1	XXX 137
Right to rest as a personal right - violation of employee's dignity	Pol. 1	XXX 147

Weekly rest and annual leave

Right to adoption leave and social security benefits in case of adoption by one partner of same sex couple of the other's biological child	Sp. 3	XXX 157
Calculation of attendance rate to get annual paid holidays	Jap. 1	XXXIII 173

Safety and health including maternity (previously under "individual contract of employment")

The Right to Sit at Work Law - failure to provide chairs for workers collective or individual dispute	Isr. 2	XXX 169
Possibility of serious injury	U.S.A. 4	XXXI 227

Employees' refusal to perform work exposing them to physical harm	It. 2	XXXIII	179
Civil responsibility for work accidents of self-employed subcontractors	Neth. 1	XXXII	151
Works outing – connection to employment – minimum numerical Participation	Aust. 2	XXXII	159
Employee on sick leave – pressure to return – dismissal void	Sp. 3	XXXI	241
Family and medical leave Act – immunity of states	U.S.A. 1	XXXII	165
Disabilities - equal treatment - UN and EU standards - obligation to provide accommodation	C.J.E.C. 1	XXXIII	187
Psychological harassment - employer's responsibility - obligation of actual safety - sexual harassment	Fr. 1	XXX	175
Parental leave – difference of treatment – biological and adoptive father – transferable right of leave	Sp. 2	XXXI	253
Retired workers suffering from asbestos - considered as workers	Jap. 1	XXXII	175
Risk during breast feeding	Sp. 3	XXXII	181
Dismissal of medical marijuana user – statutory protection of use	U.S.A. 7	XXXII	197
<i>Termination of employment</i>			
Dismissal of church employees – infringement of loyalty	Ger. 1	XXXI	269
Disciplinary termination of mentally troubled employee – prolonged absence from work	Jap. 2	XXXII	205
Dismissal for justified reasons – reduction of personnel	It. 4	XXXI	283
Employee's notice of absence in case of illness – penalties for default	Aust. 2	XXXI	291
Dismissal of university professor - tenure - fair procedures	Ire. 2	XXX	181
Abolition of job - tasks given to other employees - lawful cause of dismissal	Hun. 1	XXX	191
Abusive dismissal - concept - blue-collar workers	Bel. 1	XXX	197
Employer's duty of loyalty	Swe. 1	XXXIII	199
Non-renewal of fixed-term contract - successive contracts - justified reason	Fin. 1	XXX	203