NATIONAL MINORITY RIGHTS IN EUROPE

Tove H. Malloy

National Minority Rights in Europe

TOVE H. MALLOY



OXFORD

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

> Published in the United States by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

> > © Tove H. Malloy

The moral rights of the author have been asserted Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence Number C01P0000148 with the permission of HMSO and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

First published 2005

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Malloy, Tove H.

National minority rights in Europe / Tove H. Malloy.

p. cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-19-927443-6 (hbk.: alk. paper) 1. Minorities—Legal status, laws, etc.— Europe. 2. Minorities—Government policy—Europe. I. Title.

KJC5144.M56M35 2005 342.2408'73—dc22

2005003878

Typeset by Newgen Imaging Systems (P) Ltd., Chennai, India Printed in Great Britain on acid-free paper by Biddles Ltd., King's Lynn

ISBN 0-19-927443-6

1 3 5 7 9 10 8 6 4 2

NATIONAL MINORITY RIGHTS IN EUROPE

Acknowledgements

There are many reasons for writing a book on national minority rights. My reasons are linked to two personal experiences. First, during my years with the Danish Foreign Service, I observed the fervour with which seasoned and senior diplomats dealt with the so-called 'border region question'. Denmark's adventure into border region constitutionalism and her subsequent military and political defeat in 1864 continue to have a remarkably strong impact not only on her foreign policy but also on the national identity of her subjects. Secondly, when I was assigned to the Danish Embassy in Budapest, Hungary, I had ample opportunity to observe the impact of Hungary's history on the Hungarian national identity. Thus, it was when I realized the importance to the Hungarian national identity of the large paintings of extra-territorial 'possessions' in the halls of the Hungarian Parliament, that my ideas of researching a Ph.D. and eventually this book began in earnest.

Of course, I had no idea what was entailed in writing a major work on national minority rights, nor did I realize as is often said that it is no simple matter to turn a Ph.D. into a book. It is thus with great humility that I wish first and foremost to thank Professor Michael Freeman of the Department of Government at Essex, for the dedication and conscientiousness with which he attended to my many deficits in the academic disciplines. His attention to detail as well as his untiring readiness to explain complex matters were the supporting pillars when the structure of my work was prone to collapse. Most of the material and the arguments in this book are familiar to him, including the ones where our views did not meet. Some material and arguments will be new to him, and I hope that he will appreciate these with the usual healthy criticism and scepticism. One aspect I know that we have in common is the need to see national minority rights in a multi-disciplinary perspective. I thank Michael Freeman for three memorable years.

I also wish to thank Professors Geoff Gilbert and Frances Millard as well as Dr David Howarth for their enthusiastic comments. I am particularly grateful for the comments I received from Professor Peter Jones of Newcastle as he made me see a number of issues much more clearly. Any deficiencies or inaccuracies are of course mine.

The exhilarating experience of researching and writing a book could not have been accomplished without the continuous support and permission to be absent which I have been granted by the Danish Foreign Service. I would like to express my gratitude to Ambassadors Claus Grube, Poul Erik Dam Kristensen, Reimer Nielsen, and the late William Thune Andersen. My greatest debt of gratitude is to Ambassador K. Erik Tygesen, whose personal efforts have supported my pursuits for excellence on more than one occasion.

This book has taken longer than I expected to reach the publisher. This is partly due to the months I took off to join Dr George Ulrich and his team at the European Masters Programme in Human Rights and Democratization. I thank him as well as Professors Manfred Nowak and Horst Fischer for inviting me to Venice. The experience of spending those intensive months with 90 dedicated knowledge-thirsty students was a gift that I will treasure for life.

Another delay was caused by a transatlantic move to join the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI). I would like to thank Director Marc Weller for inviting me to work with him in Flensburg even though he knew that there would be times when I might be distracted as the deadline for my book drew closer. The work at ECMI has greatly enhanced my understanding of national minority issues. I also thank ECMI Chairman Ambassador Peter Dyvig as well as my colleagues for support and encouragement, with special thanks to librarian Wes McKinley for helping me on numerous occasions. It is indeed an irony that I have completed this book in Flensburg, a town where national minority rights are seen in action in daily life.

Thanks also to Gwen Booth who first read my proposal at Oxford University Press. Her assistance in bringing this book to print has been invaluable. I also wish to thank Louise Kavanagh and Virginia Williams as well as the anonymous reviewers for valuable comments and support.

As often there is unfortunately one who did not live to see the final product but who bears great responsibility for setting the author on a course to seek understanding. In my case this is my late father who was a self-proclaimed observer of the national minority question of the Danish-German border region and who taught me how ingrained the 'lesson of 1864' is in the self-consciousness of the Danish 'nation'. This book is also for him.

Above all, my greatest debt is to Bill, my husband, without whom there simply would not have been a Ph.D. thesis, let alone a book. Bill has supported me from the very first moments of my academic pursuits, he has shared all good as well as bad times, during the preparation of this manuscript. Words cannot express my desire to thank him, but I hope to be able to pay back my debts in full in the future.

T.H.M. Flensburg, October 2004

Abbreviations

AC Advisory Committee to the Framework Convention

AER Assembly of European Regions

CAHMIN Ad Hoc Committee for the Protection of National Minorities

CDCC Council for Cultural Co-operation
CDDH Steering Committee on Human Rights
CDLR Steering Committee on Local Government
CDMM Steering Committee on the Mass Media

CEI Central European Initiative

CEMR Council of European Municipalities and Regions

CERD Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

CFSP Common Foreign and Security Policy

CLRAE Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of Europe

CM Committee of Ministers (Council of Europe)
CoR Committee of the Regions (European Union)
CPMR Conference of Peripheral and Maritime Regions
CSCE Conference on Security and Co-operation in Europe
CSFP Common Security and Foreign Policy (European Union)

DAHR Democratic Alliance of Hungarians in Romania

DH-MIN Committee of Experts for the Protection of National Minorities

EAGGF European Agriculture Guidance and Guarantee Fund

EC European Community

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental

Freedoms (1950)

ECJ European Court of Justice

ECLSG European Charter of Local Self-Government (1985)

ECMI European Centre for Minority Issues

ECRML European Charter on Regional and Minority Languages (1992)

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
EEC European Economic Community

EP European Parliament

ERDF European Regional Development Fund

ESF European Social Fund EU European Union

EWS Early Warning System (EU)

FIFG Financial Instrument for Fisheries Guidance

FCNM Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (1995)

FIDH International Federation of Human Rights

37	*	43	
ъ	. 1	·v	

Abbreviations

GA General Assembly (United Nations)

GDP Gross Domestic Product

GOHMA Government Office of Hungarian Minorities Abroad

HCNM High Commissioner on National Minorities

HTMH Határon Túli Magyarok Hivatala HRC Human Rights Committee

IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966)

ICERD International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial

Discrimination (1966)

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966)

ICJ International Court of Justice ILO International Labour Organization

LDA Local Democracy Agencies

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization NGO Non-governmental Organizations

MKP Hungarian Coalition Party (Slovakia)

OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

PA Parliamentary Assembly (Council of Europe)
PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice
PLO Palestinian Liberation Organization

RegLeg Conference of the Presidents of Regions with Legislative Powers

RFE/RL Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty

SEA Single European Act (EU)

SPD Social Democratic Party (of Germany)

TBKP United Communist Party of Turkey

TEC Treaty establishing the European Community

TEU Treaty on European Union

ToRs Terms of Reference

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948)

UN United Nations

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

USSR Union of Soviet Socialist Republics

Table of Treaties*

* Treaties without page references are included because of their relevance to the subject.

Treaty of Peace between the Allied and Associated Powers and Austria, Poland, the
Serb-Croat-Slovene State, and Czecho-Slovakia of 19 September 1919,
Treaty Series, No. 11 (1919)
Montevideo Convention on the Rights and Duties of
States (1933)
United Nations Charter (1945)
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (1948) 84
European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and
Fundamental Freedoms (1950)
194, 218, 219, 221, 226, 236, 251, 253, 260, 270, 273
UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960) 85
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966)
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966) 84
International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial
Discrimination (1966)
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969) 61, 62, 67
Helsinki Final Act (1975)
European Charter of Local Self-government (1985)
Single European Act (1986)
Charter of Paris for a New Europe (1990)
European Charter for Regional and Minority Languages (1992)
Maastricht Treaty (1992) 57, 251, 255, 257, 259–66, 268, 269, 276, 287
Treaty on European Union (1992)
Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities
of January (1995) 54–6, 59, 67, 68, 69, 70, 76, 82, 85, 93, 139, 140, 153,
215, 216, 217, 219, 221–8, 230, 231, 232, 235–40,
247, 248, 249, 270, 275, 292, 293, 296, 305, 306, 313
European Stability Pact (1995)
European Convention on Nationality (1997)
Amsterdam Treaty (1997)
Treaty Establishing the European Community (1997) 268, 272
Stability Pact for South Eastern Europe (1999)
Treaty of Nice (2000)
European Charter of Fundamental Rights and
Freedoms (2000) 57, 250, 272, 273, 274, 275, 276, 277, 281, 287, 293
Treaty Establishing a Constitution for
Europe (2004)
268, 272, 277–80, 282, 283, 287, 293, 306, 310, 314

Table of Documents*

* Documents without page references are included because of their relevance to the subject.

EC/EU

Regulation 1612 on the rights of migrant workers and their families (1968) 253 n. 4 Directive 486 on children of migrants (1977)
Council Regulation 2052 as regards the European Regional
Development FUND (1988)
Declaration on Yugoslavia (1991)
Declaration on the Guidelines on the Recognition of New States in Eastern
Europe and the Soviet Union (1991)
Council Regulation 1035 establishing a European Monitoring Centre on Racism
and Xenophobia (1997)
Council Directive 43 'Implementing the Principle of Equal Treatment between
Persons Irrespective of Racial or Ethnic Origin' (2000) 57 n. 22; 270 n. 76
Council Directive 750 'Action Programme to Combat Discrimination',
2001–2006 (2000)
Laeken Declaration (2001)
EP
Resolution on 'the granting of special rights to be citizens of the European
Community in implementation of the decision of the Paris Summit of
December 1974' (1974)
Resolution on a Community Charter of Regional Languages and Cultures and
on a Charter of Rights of Ethnic Minorities (1981)
Resolution on Measures in Favour of Minority Languages and
Cultures (1983)
Resolution on the languages and cultures of regional and ethnic minorities
in the European Community (1987)
freedoms (1989)
Resolution on the Community Charter of Fundamental Social
Rights (1989)
Resolution on languages in the Community and the situation of
Catalan (1991)
Resolution on Union citizenship (1991)
Resolution on linguistic and cultural minorities in the European
Community (1994)
Resolution on the Constitution of the European Union (1994) 269 n. 71; 269
Resolution on the establishment of the Charter of Fundamental Rights (1999) 273 n. 89
Resolution on the drafting of a European Union Charter
of Fundamental Rights (2000)
Resolution on measures to promote language learning and
linguistic diversity (2001)

CoR

Opinion of the Committee of the Regions on the revision of the Treaty on European Union and of the Treaty establishing the European Community (1995)				
THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE				
CM grouped reply to PA Recommendations 1134 (1990), 1177 (1992), 1201 (1993), 1255 (1995), 1285 (1996), 1300 (1996), and 1345 (1997) of 19 January 1999				
PA				
Recommendation 1134 on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National Minorities (1990)				
CLRAE				
Resolution 52, CG (4) 5 (1997)				
CSCE				
Vienna Concluding Document (1989) 63 n. 42 Copenhagen Concluding Document (1990) 63; 215; 229; 235; 291; 292				

Table of Documents

Helsinki Summit Declaration
UN
Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948)
ILO
ILO
Convention No 169 concerning Indigenous Peoples in Independent Countries (1989)
OTHER DOCUMENTS
Collier, Paul et al., Breaking the Conflict Trap: Civil War and Development Policy (Washington: IBRD/World Bank, 2003)

Table of Travaux Préparatoires to the FCNM*

* Travaux Préparatoires without page references are included because of their relevance to the

subject. Final Activity Report on the protection of national minorities for the attention of the Committee of Meeting Report, Committee of Experts for the Protection of National Minorities, DH- MIN(92)7 of 30 November 1992 Proposal for a European Convention for the Protection of Minorities, CDL-MIN(93)6 of Explanatory Report on the Proposal for a European Convention for the Protection of Minorities, 229 n. 44; 232 n. 54 Report to the CDDH, DH-MIN(93)4 of 28 July 1993 222 n. 17, 19; 223 n. 22 Final Activity Report of the CDDH for the attention of the Committee of Ministers, CDDH(93) of 22 August 1993 Terms of Reference for the CAHMIN on the drawing up of a framework convention and a protocol complementing the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), CAHMIN(94)1 of 10 October 1993 Preliminary draft Preamble and opening provisions containing certain principles of the framework Convention, CAHMIN/GR (94)1 misc. of 17 February 1994 Report of the first meeting of the CAHMIN Drafting Group, CAHMIN/GR(94)2 rev. of 04 March 1994 Meeting Report, CAHMIN(94)9 of 23 March 1994 Study of control and monitoring system in international conventions. Proposals for a control or monitoring system under a framework convention on the protection of minorities, CAHMIN(94)7 of 12 April 1994 Preliminary Draft Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities prepared by the Chairman and the Vice-Chairman of the CAHMIN with the assistance of the Secretariat, Contribution of the CDCC to the work of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Protection of National Minorities (CAHMIN), CDCC-BU(94)7 rev. of 16 May 1994 Proposals concerning the Preliminary Draft Framework Convention for the Protection of National Meeting Report, CAHMIN(94)16 of 13 June 1994. 227 n. 36; 230 n. 46; 231 n. 53

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(94)19 of 07 July 1994
Informal proposal for further discussion in the CAHMIN submitted by the delegation of the Netherlands in co-ordination with Belgium, Germany, Hungary, Norway, and Portugal, CAHMIN(94)24 of 18 August 1994

Control of the Implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National

Minorities, CAHMIN(94)17 prov. of 20 June 1994

Summary of the main points raised by the opinion of the Directorate of Legal Affairs on the Draft Framework Convention, CAHMIN(94)25 of 18 August 1994

Decisions of the Committee of Ministers concerning the work of the CAHMIN at the 516th meeting of the Ministers' Deputies, CAHMIN(94)27 of 08 September 1994

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(94)28 of 19 September 1994

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(94)32 of 14 October 1994 223 n. 24; 227 n. 37; 230 n. 47

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(94)33 of 15 November 1994

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(94)35 of 09 December 1994

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(95)9 of 08 March 1995

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(95)16 of 23 May 1995

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(95)21 of 19 September 1995

Meeting Report, CAHMIN(95)22 of 24 January 1996

Table of Cases

ECtHR

Isop v Austria (1962)	. 89
X and Y v Belgium (1966)	. 89
Certain Aspects of the Laws on the Use of Languages in Education in Belgium (1968) 76 n	. 89
K v France (1984)	
Bideault v France (1986)	. 89
Loisidou v Turkey (1996)	. 92
The Socialist Party v Turkey (1998)	. 92
The United Communist Party v Turkey (1998)	
Sidiropoulos and others v Greece (1998)	
Sheffield and Horsham v UK (1998)	. 92
Okçnoglu v Turkey (1999)	. 92
Özdep v Turkey (1999)	. 92
Sürek and Özdemir v Turkey (1999)	. 92
Sener v Turkey (2000)	
or new case	
HRC	
Sandra Lovelace v Canada (1977)	. 90
Kitok v Sweden (1985)	
AD v Canada (Mikmaq Tribal Society) (1986)	
Dominique Guesdon v France (1986)	
SG v France (1988)	. 89
GB v France (1989)	
ICJ	
Asylum case (1950)	31
<i>Morocco</i> case (1952)	
	. 51
ECJ	
Klöckner Werke AG and others v High Authority (1962)	n 6
Casagrande v Landeshauptstadt München (1963)	
Nold v Commission (1974)	n 5
	n. 6
	n. 6
Hauer v Land Rheinland-Pfalz (1979)	
National Panasonic v Commission (1980)	
Mutsch v Belgium (1985)	
Friedrich Kremzow v Austria (1997)	
Bickel and Franz (1998)	
Angonese v Cassa de Risparmio di Bolzano SpA (2000)	n. 92

Contents

Acknowledgements	xi
Abbreviations	xiii
Table of Treaties	XV
Table of Documents	xvi
Table of Travaux Préparatoires to the FCNM	xix
Table of Cases	xxi
Introduction	1
I. PROBLEMATIZATION: INDIVIDUALISM	
AND COLLECTIVISM	
1. Overview: National Minority, or Co-nation?	15
1.1 Who are Europe's National Minorities?	18
1.2 National Minorities and the Structure of	
International Law	24
1.2.1 National minority rights prior to 1989	28
1.2.2 National minorities and state nationalism	32
1.3 National Minorities and Public Policy	35
1.4 Ethical Terminology	38
1.5 Models of Accommodation	40
1.6 Citizenship	44
1.7 Justice	48
2. Co-nation Rights after 1989: Cultural, or Political Rights?	51
2.1 Emergence of a Co-nation Rights Scheme in	
Europe after 1989?	53
2.1.1 International treaties and conventions	54
2.1.2 International custom	60
2.1.3 General principles of law	70
2.1.4 Judicial decisions	75
2.2 The Writings of Publicists	77
2.3 Conclusions	81