Equity and Equitable Principles in the World Trade Organization

Addressing conflicts and overlaps between the WTO and other regimes

Anastasios Gourgourinis



Equity and Equitable Principles in the World Trade Organization

Addressing conflicts and overlaps between the WTO and other regimes

Anastasios Gourgourinis



First published 2016 by Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

and by Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2016 Anastasios Gourgourinis

The right of Anastasios Gourgourinis to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by him in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gourgourinis, Anastasios, author.

Equity and equitable principles in the World Trade Organization; addressing conflicts and overlaps between the WTO and other regimes / Anastasios Gourgourinis.

pages cm. — (Routledge research in international economic law) Includes index.

World Trade Organization.
 International commercial arbitration.
 Equity.
 Foreign trade regulation.
 Title.
 K4600.G68 2015
 343.08'7—dc23
 2015004296

ISBN: 978-0-415-71548-5 (hbk) ISBN: 978-1-315-86759-5 (ebk)

Typeset in Baskerville by Apex CoVantage, LLC



Equity and Equitable Principles in the World Trade Organization

There has been little comprehensive treatment of the role of equity and equitable principles in WTO Dispute Settlement Body (DSB) proceedings. This lack is especially important in World Trade Organization (WTO) disputes where normative overlaps and conflicts occur between the multilateral trade regime and other specialized international regimes. This book analyses whether and how equity and equitable principles can be employed as juridical tools in the legal reasoning of judges and lawyers in WTO disputes. It especially focuses on challenges posed by fragmentation in international law, and asks how equity and equitable principles constitute a 'toolbox' capable of addressing these in WTO dispute settlement within this context.

Anastasios Gourgourinis provides a coherent methodology for addressing conflicts and overlaps between WTO and non-WTO norms in the context of DSB proceedings. As a work which explores both the potential role of equity and equitable principles in dispute settlement, and the effects of fragmentation in international law, this book will be of great interest and use to researchers and students in international trade and economic law, public international law, and international political economics.

Anastasios Gourgourinis is Lecturer in Public International Law, specializing in International Economic Law, at the Faculty of Law of the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens. He is also a research fellow at the Academy of Athens, and a practising advocate with the Athens Bar in Greece.

Routledge Research in International Economic Law

Available

Recognition and Regulation of Safeguard Measures Under GATT/WTO

Sheela Rai

The Interaction between WTO Law and External International Law

The Constrained Openness of WTO Law Ronnie R.F. Yearwood

Human Rights, Natural Resource and Investment Law in a Globalised World

Shades of Grey in the Shadow of the Law Lorenzo Cotula

The Domestic Politics of Negotiating International Trade

Intellectual Property Rights in US-Colombia and US-Peru Free Trade Agreements Johanna von Braun

Foreign Investment and Dispute Resolution Law and Practice in Asia

Vivienne Bath and Luke Nottage (eds)

Improving International Investment Agreements

Armand De Mestral and Céline Lévesque (eds)

Public Health in International Investment Law and Arbitration Valentina Vadi

The WTO and the Environment

Development of Competence beyond Trade James Watson

Foreign Direct Investment and Human Development

The Law and Economics of International Investment Agreements Olivier De Schutter, Johan Swinnen and Jan Wouters

Microtrade

A New System of International Trade with Volunteerism Towards Poverty Elimination Yong-Shik Lee

Science and Technology in International Economic Law

Balancing Competing Interests Bryan Mercurio and Kuei-Jung Ni

The WTO and Infant Industry Promotion in Developing Countries

Perspectives on the Chinese Large Civil Aircraft $Juan\ He$

Trade Remedies

A Development Perspective Asif Qureshi

Equity and Equitable Principles in the World Trade Organization

Addressing Conflicts and Overlaps between the WTO and Other Regimes Anastasios Gourgourinis

Forthcoming

A Chinese Perspective on International Investment Law Guiguo Wang

Culture and International Economic Law

Valentina Vadi and Bruno de Witte

Defences in International Investment Law

Francis Botchway

Για την Ευγνωσία και τον Γεράσιμο

Foreword

This ambitious work is a tour de force that explores the manner in which the WTO Dispute Settlement Body (DSB) utilises equity and equitable principles to bridge procedural and substantive normative conflict between WTO norms and other norms of international law. It originates from a PhD thesis which we had the pleasure of jointly supervising, and displays the scholarly depth and breadth evident there as well as Dr Gourgourinis's continued original thinking on fundamental questions regarding the role of equity and equitable principles in providing solutions to problems arising from normative fragmentation in international law. In particular, Dr Gourgourinis's analysis contributes to our greater understanding of WTO case law and the processes of judicial reasoning by the DSB in employing equity and equitable principles as judicial tools for the resolution of normative conflict between international law and WTO law. Moving beyond conventional WTO scholarship that focuses on the interpretative power of Articles 31-33 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, this work highlights the continuing pertinence of fundamental questions such as the applicable law and the role of extraneous legal norms (including equity) in the WTO judicial process. It challenges the prevailing understanding in WTO scholarship when a conflict of norms exists, suggesting instead that the DSB has been much more creative in drawing on equity to create procedural rights of due process (together with good faith) and substantive rights of international responsibility for non-violation of WTO obligations under Article XXIII.1(b) GATT. The breadth of this work is impressive, ranging from the fragmentation ('diversity') of international law and the status, role and function of equity at international law to in-depth analysis of judicial reasoning across a wide range of diverse WTO panel and Appellate Body reports. This is a rich tapestry indeed, with much for the general international lawyer and the trade lawyer alike to appreciate.

> Fiona Smith and Catherine Redgwell, 3 July 2015

Preface

This book is an updated version of the PhD thesis I defended at University College London in January 2010. It reflects the law as it stood, to the best of the author's knowledge, on 1 March 2015, unless otherwise indicated. Certain of the arguments have appeared in: 'Delineating the Normativity of Equity in International Law', 11 ICLR (2009), pp. 327–347; 'Equity in International Law Revisited (with Special Reference to the Fragmentation of International Law)', 103 ASIL Proceedings (2009), pp. 79–82; 'Lex Specialis in WTO and Investment Protection Law', 53 GYIL (2010), pp. 579–622; 'General/Particular International Law and Primary/ Secondary Rules: Unitary Terminology of a Fragmented System', 22 EJIL (2011), pp. 993–1026, and 'The Distinction between Interpretation and Application of Norms in International Adjudication', 2 JIDS (2011), pp. 31–57.

Acknowledgements

Since I first embarked on the research that eventually led to this book, I have accumulated many debts, only a proportion of which I have space to acknowledge. Accordingly, I apologize in advance if I have inadvertently omitted anyone to whom acknowledgement is due.

Most importantly, I am heartily grateful to my Ph.D. supervisors, Professor Catherine Redgwell and Professor Fiona Smith, whose insights, encouragement, and support guided me throughout the course of my doctoral research. Without a doubt, both my thesis and this book would have been much poorer without their expertise, experience, and patience, and for this I will always be in their debt. I would also like to warmly thank my doctoral examiners, Professor Malgosia Fitzmaurice and Professor Lorand Bartels, for their valuable comments and suggestions.

I was fortunate to have had the opportunity of benefiting from the expertise of several academics and international lawyers, before and after my return to Greece in 2010, who assisted me, in various ways, to develop, test and improve my arguments during the various stages. I must make individual mention to Professor Emmanuel Roucounas, Professor Antonis Bredimas, Professor Angelos Yokaris, Judge Linos-Alexander Sicilianos, Professor Photeini Pazartzis, Professor Maria Gavouneli, Dr. Georges Kyriakopoulos, as well as Professor Haris Pamboukis, Professor Georges Abi-Saab, Professor Gabrielle Marceau, Professor Joanne Scott, Professor Joost Pauwelyn, Professor Stelios Perrakis, Professor Andrew Lang, Professor Federico Ortino, Professor Georgio Sacerdoti, Professor Lena Divani, Professor Ioannis Lianos, Professor Achilles Skordas, and Dr. Eleni Micha, I am particularly indebted to Professor Antonis Bredimas, who first taught me how and why international economic law is one of the fastest-growing fields of public international law, for his unwavering support and guidance, as well as to Professor Emmanuel Roucounas, for his open-hearted and steady support and for giving me the valuable opportunity to work under his supervision as a Researcher at the Academy of Athens since my return to Greece.

I also gratefully acknowledge the generous financial support I received from the Greek State Scholarship Foundation ('IKY') as a Scholar in International Economic Law, and I further express my gratitude to my scholarship supervisor, Professor Christos Gortsos. In addition, I am especially thankful to the UCL Faculty of Laws for funding my research trips to Washington D.C. and Geneva.

Moreover, I owe my deepest gratitude to all of my friends. They stood by me during this entire process, in various ways. *Inter alios*, and without wanting to exclude anyone, I would like to particularly mention Nikolaos Argyriou, Dimitra Boulougouri, Thomas Dimitriou, Leonidas Dimou, Nikolaos Floros, Konstantinos Hassiotis, Fotis Karkanis, Emmanouil Kasotakis, Georgios Krassas-Nikolaidis, Ioanna Messini, Kyriaki (Korina) Raptopoulou, Andreas Themelis, Vassiliki-Maria Tzatzaki and Aspasia Zirou.

I am also grateful to all my dear friends and bright young colleagues in Greece and abroad, including but not limited to, Michalis Dekastros, Markos Karavias, Ilias Plakokefalos and Michalis Risvas, for their valuable help in various ways. Special thanks goes to Panos Merkouris and Efthimios Papastavridis for reading various drafts, but most importantly for their camaraderie during our studies in London, as well as to Martins Paparinskis, for our most enjoyable and insightful discussions on international law and for being a critical friend. Furthermore, I am most indebted to Aristeidis Koliopoulos and Margarita Lygizou. Their love and support during my London days contributed immensely to the completion of this thesis on which this book is based, and for this they will always have my love and deepest gratitude.

I would also like to warmly thank the Routledge publishing team, including Katie Carpenter, Mark Sapwell and Marie Louise Roberts, with which I had the great pleasure to work with for the purposes of this book, for their professionalism, care and kind patience.

Further, I must express my gratitude to my parents Gerasimos and Ioanna, my brothers Alexios and Michalis, and my young sister Elli. Their unconditional love, affection and constant support have always kept me going, and for this I send them my love.

But above all, I am deeply grateful to my wife Eygnosia and our son Gerasimos, my source of inspiration and aspiration in life, to whom this book is dedicated; their love, support and patience guide me in good times and bad times, and always remind of the things that *do* matter. Had it not been for them, the completion of this book would certainly not have materialized.

Abbreviations

Abbreviation	Full title
AJCL	American Journal of Comparative Law
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
AIDI	Annuaire de l'Institut de Droit International
AFDI	Annuaire Français de Droit International
Alta. L. Rev	Alberta Law Review
Am. U. Int'l L. Rev	American University International Law Review
Am. U. L. Rev	American University Law Review
ASIL Proceedings	American Society of International Law Proceedings
Ann. A. A. A.	Annuaire de l'Association des auditeurs et anciens
	auditeurs de l'Académie de droit international de
	La Haye
AJLP	Australian Journal of Legal Philosophy
Austl. T. S.	Australian Treaty Series
Aust YBIL	Australian Yearbook of International Law
Berkeley J. Int'l L.	Berkeley Journal of International Law
BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty
Brooklyn J. Int'l L.	Brooklyn Journal of International Law
BYBIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CJICL	Cambridge Journal of International and Comparative
	Law
Can. Y.B. Int. L.	Canadian Yearbook of International Law
Cardozo L.Rev	Cardozo Law Review
Chicago JIL	Chicago Journal of International Law
Chinese JIL	Chinese Journal of International Law
Colo. J. Int'l Env't'l. L. & Pol'y	Colorado Journal of International Environmental Law and Policy
Colum. J. Transnat'l L.	Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
Colum. L. Rev	Columbia Law Review
Cornell Int'l L. J.	Cornell International Law Journal
Cornell L. Q.	Cornell Law Quarterly
Denv. J. Int'l L. & Pol'y	Denver Journal of International Law and Policy

Duke Journal of Comparative and International Law Duke J. Comp. & Int'l L. DSR World Trade Organization, Dispute Settlement Reports, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press **ECHR** European Court of Human Rights European Court of Justice ECJ EJIL European Journal of International Law EILS European Journal of Legal Studies Emory International Law Review Emory Int'l L. Rev. R. Bernhardt (ed.), Encyclopedia of Public International EPIL Law, Amsterdam: North-Holland Fordham International Law Journal Fordham Int'l L. J. FYBIL Finnish Yearbook of International Law Georgia Journal of International and Comparative Law Ga. J. Int'l & Comp. L. Georgetown International Environmental Law Review Geo. Int'l Env't'l L Rev. Geo. J. Int'l L. Georgetown Journal of International Law George Washington Journal of International Law Geo. Wash. J. Int'l L. & Econ. and Economics Geo. Wash. Int'l L. George Washington International Law Review Rev. Grotius Society Transactions of the Grotius Society German Yearbook of International Law GYIL Hague Yearbook of International Law Hague Y.B. Int'l L. Harvard International Law Journal Harv. I. L. J. Harv. L. Rev. Harvard Law Review Hastings L. J. Hastings Law Journal Human Rights Law Review H. R. L. Rev. I/A Court H.R. Inter-American Court of Human Rights International Court of Justice ICJ International and Comparative Law Quarterly ICLQ International Centre for the Settlement of Investment ICSID Disputes ICSID Review: Foreign Investment Law Journal ICSID. Rev.- FILJ IDI Institut de Droit International ILA International Law Association ILC International Law Commission ILMInternational Legal Materials Indian J. Int'l L. Indian Journal of International Law Indian Y.B.Int'l Aff. Indian year book of international affairs Indiana International & Comparative Law Ind. Int'l & Comp. L. Review Rev. International Community Law Review (formerly: ICLR (formerly: Int'l International Law Forum Du Droit International) L.F. D. Int'l)

International Criminal Law Review

Int. Cr. L. R.

Int'l J. Marine & International Journal of Marine and Coastal Law Coastal L. Int'l Law. International Lawyer Int'l Org. L. Rev. International Organizations Law Review Iran-US CTR Iran-United States Claims Tribunal Reports Is. L. Rev. Israel Law Review Italian Yearbook of International Law IYIL JEL Journal of Environmental Law Journal of International Dispute Settlement JIDS Journal of International Arbitration J. Int'l Arb. J. Priv. Int. L. Journal of Private International Law J. Small & Emerging Journal of Small and Emerging Business Law Bus. L. Journal of International Economic Law JIEL J. Transnat'l L. &Pol'y Journal of Transnational Law & Policy The Journal of World Investment & Trade (formerly: JWIT The Journal of World Investment) KGZ Kokusaiho gaiko zassi (The Journal of International Law and Diplomacy) Kentucky Law Journal Ky. L. J. Law & Soc'y Rev. Law and Society Review London Court of International Arbitration LCIA LCP Law and Contemporary Problems Leiden Journal of International Law LJIL L.I.E.I. Legal Issues of Economic Integration Loy. L. A. L. Rev. Loyola of Los Angeles Law Review L. Q. Rev. Law Quarterly Review The Law & Practice of International Courts and L.P.I.C.T. Tribunals Manchester Journal of International Economic Law Manchester J. Int'l Econ. L. Max Planck YUNL Max Planck Yearbook of United Nations Law McGill L. J. McGill Law Journal Mich. J. Int'l L. Michigan Journal of International Law Melbourne Journal of International Law MJIL MPEPIL online edition R. Wolfrum (ed.), Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public International Law (MPEPIL) online edition. Available online at http://www.mpepil.com. Nat. Res. J. Natural Resources Journal Netherlands International Law Review NILR Nord. J. Intl. L. Nordic Journal of International Law (formerly:

Northwest U. L. Rev. Northwestern University Law Review
NYIL Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

Nordisk Tidsskrift for International Ret)

Abbreviations xv N.Y.U. J. Int'l Law & New York University Journal of International Law and Politics New York University Law Quarterly Review N.Y.U. L. Q. Rev. Ocean Development & International Law Ocean Dev.v & Int'l L. Ohio State Journal on Dispute Resolution Ohio St.J.Disp.Res. Österreichische Zeitschrift für öffentliches Recht und ÖzöRV Völkerrecht Pace International Law Review Pace Int'l L. Rev. Permanent Court of Arbitration P.C.A. Permanent Court of International Justice PCIJ Official Journal of the European Union O.J. Queensland University of Technology Law and Justice QUTLIJ Journal Revue Africaine de Droit International et Comparé R.A.D.I.C. Revue Belge de Droit International R.B.D.I. Recueil de Cours de l'Académie de la Haye de Droit **RCADI** International Revue of International Studies Rev. Int. St. Revue de droit international, de sciences Rev. Droit Int'l Sciences Dipl. & diplomatiques et politiques Politiques R.G.D.I.P. Revue Générale de Droit International Public Rev. Hellenique Droit Revue Hellénique de Droit International Int'l Reports of International Arbitral Awards RIAA South African Law Journal SALJ SCC Stockholm Chamber of Commerce Schweiz. Jahrbuch Schweizerisches Jahrbuch für internationales Recht Int'les Recht Stanford Journal of International Law Stan. J. Int'l L. Stanford Law Review Stan. L. Rev. Stat. L. R. Statute Law Review Transnational Dispute Management TDM Temple International and Comparative Law Journal Temp. Int'l & Comp. L. J. Texas International Law Journal Tex. Int'l L. J. TS Treaty Series Tulane Journal of International and Comparative Tul. J. Int'l & Comp. L. Law

University of Toronto Faculty of Law Review U. Toronto Fac. L. Rev. United Nations Treaty Series UNTS U. Chi. L. Rev. University of Chicago Law Review U. Miami L Rev. University of Miami Law Review

Tul. L. Rev.

Tulane Law Review

U.N.S.W. L. J. Va. J. Int'l L. Vand. J. Transnat'l L. Va. L. Rev.

Victoria U. Wellington L. Rev.

Widener L. Symp. J.

WTR

YbILC Y.B.W.A.

ZaöRV

University of New South Wales law journal

Virginia Journal of International Law Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law

Virginia Law Review

Victoria University at Wellington Law Review

Widener Law Symposium Journal

World Trade Review

Yearbook of the International Law Commission

The Yearbook of World Affairs

Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und

Völkerrecht

List of ICJ and PCIJ judgments, orders & advisory opinions cited, and their abbreviations

Short case title

Aegean Sea Continental Shelf case Ambatielos case

21modifetos Case

Application of the Convention on Racial Discrimination case

Application of the Genocide Convention case

Armed Activities case (Congo v Uganda)

Arbitral Award case

Arbitral Award of 31 July 1989 case Asylum case

Austro-German Customs Regime Advisory Opinion

Avena case

Full case title and citation

Aegean Sea Continental Shelf (Greece v Turkey), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1978)

Ambatielos case (Jurisdiction) (Greece v United Kingdom), Preliminary Objection, Judgment, ICJ Reports (1952)

Case Concerning the Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Georgia v Russian Federation), Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures, Order, ICJ Reports (2009)

Case concerning the Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v Serbia and Montenegro), Judgment, ICJ Reports (2007)

Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v Uganda), Judgment, 19 December 2005, ICJ Reports (2005)

Case Concerning the Arbitral Award made by the King of Spain on 23 December 1906 (Honduras v Nicaragua), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1960)

Arbitral Award of 31 July 1989 (Guinea-Bisau v Senegal), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1991)

Colombian-Peruvian asylum case (Colombia/Peru), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1950)

Customs Regime Between Germany and Austria, Advisory Opinion, PCIJ, Series A/B, No. 41 (1931)

Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v United States of America), Judgment, ICJ Reports (2004)

- Barcelona Traction case (Second Phase)
- Barcelona Traction case (Preliminary Objections) Borchgrave case
- Border and Transborder Armed Actions case
- Certain Phosphate Lands in Nauru Chorzow Factory case

(Jurisdiction)

- Chorzow Factory case (Merits)
- Continental Shelf case (Tunisia/Libya)
- Continental Shelf case (Tunisia/Libya) (Application to Intervene)
- Continental Shelf case (Libya/Malta)
- Continental Shelf case (Libya/Malta) (Application to Intervene)
- Corfu Channel case
- Danzig Advisory Opinion
- Diplomatic and Consular Staff case
- Effect of Awards of the U.N. Administrative Tribunal Advisory Opinion
- Eastern Greenland case
- Electricity Company of Sofia and Bulgaria case

- Case Concerning the Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Company, Limited (Belgium v Spain), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1970)
- Case Concerning the Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Company, Limited (Belgium v Spain), Preliminary Objections, Judgment, ICJ Reports (1964)
- The Borchgrave case (Belgium v Spain), Preliminary Objections, Judgment, PCIJ, Series A/B., No. 72 (1937)
- Case Concerning the Border and Transborder Armed Actions (Nicaragua/Honduras), Jurisdiction and Admissibility, Judgment, ICJ Reports (1988)
- Certain Phosphate Lands in Nauru (Nauru v Australia), Preliminary Objections, Judgment, ICJ Reports (1992)

Case concerning the Factory at Chorzow, Claim for indemnity - Jurisdiction, PCIJ, Series A., No. 9 (1927)

Case concerning the Factory at Chorzow, Claim for Indemnity - Merits, PCIJ, Series A., No. 13 (1928)

Continental Shelf (Tunisia/Libyan Arab Jamahiriya), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1982)

- Continental Shelf (Tunisia/Libyan Arab Jamahiriya), Application to Intervene, Judgment, ICJ Reports (1981)
- Continental Shelf (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya/Malta), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1985)
- Continental Shelf (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya/Malta), Application to Intervene, Judgment, ICJ Reports (1984)
- Corfu Channel case (United Kingdom v Albania), Judgment, ICJ Reports (1949)
- Treatment of Polish Nationals and Other Persons of Polish Origin or Speech in the Danzig Territory, Advisory Opinion, PCIJ, Ser. A./B., No. 44 (1933)
- Case concerning the United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran, Judgment, ICJ Reports (1980)
- Effect of Awards of Compensation Made by the United Nations Administrative Tribunal, Advisory Opinion, ICI Reports (1954)
- Legal Status of Eastern Greenland (Denmark v Norway), Judgment, PCIJ, Ser. A./B., No. 53 (1933)
- Electricity Company of Sofia and Bulgaria, Judgment, PCIJ, Series A/B, No. 77 (1939)