### BARNETT OMAN

# CONTRACTS Cases and Doctrine

Sixth Edition



# **CONTRACTS**

### Cases and Doctrine

Sixth Edition

Randy E. Barnett

Carmack Waterbouse Professor of Legal Theory Georgetown University Law Center

Nathan B. Oman

Professor of Law William & Mary Law School



Copyright © 2017 Randy E. Barnett and Nathan B. Oman Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S. serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.WKLegaledu.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.WKLegaledu.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer Attn: Order Department PO Box 990 Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1234567890

ISBN 978-1-4548-7103-3

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Barnett, Randy E., author. | Oman, Nathan, author.

Title: Contracts: cases and doctrine / Randy E. Barnett Carmack,

Waterhouse Professor of Legal Theory, Georgetown University Law Center;

Nathan B. Oman, Professor of Law, William & Mary Law School.

Description: Sixth edition. | New York: Wolters Kluwer, [2017] | Series:

Aspen casebook series

Identifiers: LCCN 2016043983 | ISBN 9781454871033

Subjects: LCSH: Contracts—United States. | LCGFT: Casebooks. Classification: LCC KF801.A7 B35 2017 | DDC 346.7302/2—dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016043983



Certified Chain of Custody Promoting Sustainable Forestry

www.sfiprogram.org SFI-01681

# CONTRACTS

#### EDITORIAL ADVISORS

#### Rachel E. Barkow

Segal Family Professor of Regulatory Law and Policy Faculty Director, Center on the Administration of Criminal Law New York University School of Law

#### **Erwin Chemerinsky**

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law Raymond Pryke Professor of First Amendment Law University of California, Irvine School of Law

#### Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law New York University School of Law Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow The Hoover Institution Senior Lecturer in Law The University of Chicago

#### Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business Stanford University Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business Columbia Law School

#### James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law The University of Michigan Law School

#### Tracey L. Meares

Walton Hale Hamilton Professor of Law Director, The Justice Collaboratory Yale Law School

#### Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law Maurice A. Deane School of Law at Hofstra University

#### Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law Harvard Law School

#### David Alan Sklansky

Stanley Morrison Professor of Law Stanford Law School Faculty Co-Director Stanford Criminal Justice Center

试读结束: 需要全本请在线购买: www.ertongbook.com

### About Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S. delivers expert content and solutions in the areas of law, corporate compliance, health compliance, reimbursement, and legal education. Its practical solutions help customers successfully navigate the demands of a changing environment to drive their daily activities, enhance decision quality and inspire confident outcomes.

Serving customers worldwide, its legal and regulatory portfolio includes products under the Aspen Publishers, CCH Incorporated, Kluwer Law International, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs names. They are regarded as exceptional and trusted resources for general legal and practice-specific knowledge, compliance and risk management, dynamic workflow solutions, and expert commentary. To my wife, Beth, and my kids, Laura and Gary, for all their love and support. - Randy E. Barnett

> For Jacob and Beth, third party beneficiaries.

- Nathan B. Oman

## **PREFACE**

In the beginning there was the textbook. It consisted of explanatory text. Students studied contracts largely on their own using treatises such as those by Blackstone and Kent or summaries of these treatises written by learned practitioners. Next came the casebook. It consisted of cases. Casebooks were developed for teaching contracts in the university classroom setting using the "case method." Then came the multivolume modern specialized treatises, the Restatements, the Realist Revolution, the Uniform Commercial Code, and, most recently, an explosion of legal scholarship with an increasing emphasis on legal theory.

As contracts casebook authors struggled to cope with each of these developments, contracts casebooks were transformed into an amalgam of highly edited cases and "squibs," fragments of law review articles, excerpts from the Uniform Commercial Code and the Restatement — and, of course, the ubiquitous "note material." The idea was to integrate the diverse sources of contract law in a single tightly edited volume. However, this evolution from casebook to integrated snippets of material has resulted in several undesirable consequences.

First, contracts teaching materials are now predigested. Practicing lawyers and legal scholars must scan whole cases, whole articles, and whole statutes to glean the information relevant to their problem. Unfortunately, to get everything into a single volume, cases, articles, and other materials are so heavily edited that students are not required to sift through the materials themselves. The scanning has already been done for them by the casebook author. Rather than gleaning the message of a case or an article, the challenge posed to students and professors by today's casebooks is to decipher the casebook *author's* message hidden in the structure of the materials.

Further, because highly edited casebooks inevitably take on a heavy dose of their authors' views of contracts, novice professors are forced either to learn and accept the author's viewpoint or to swim heroically against the tide. Experienced professors with independent minds are less likely to engage in fighting the casebook and are more likely to supplement it with their own materials, perhaps eventually abandoning the casebook altogether. While it is inevitable that the author's views will be reflected in any casebook, the more heavily edited and integrated a casebook is, the more difficult it becomes for teachers to project to students their own views of contract.

Finally, to make room for more cases about complex commercial transactions, contracts casebooks have increasingly abandoned the classic cases that contracts professors still debate to this day. Complicated commercial fact patterns make contracts seem remote from the life experience of

xxxii Preface

average first-year law students, who are required to take the course but may or may not be interested in pursuing careers practicing commercial law. As a result, contracts professors are at a competitive disadvantage with their colleagues who teach seemingly more engaging first-year subjects such as criminal law or torts.

This book charts a different course. It contains far fewer cases that are more lightly edited than has become the norm. In addition to commercial transactions, we have favored a mix of classic and very recent cases involving provocative controversies, memorable fact patterns, and public figures. These are cases that lend themselves to discussing both basic contract doctrine and the broad philosophical, economic, and political implications of adhering to these legal rules and principles.

In place of vexatious note material, students will find "Study Guides" before most cases and, after each topic, "Reference" citations to the most popular and respected contract treatises. In this way, students receive useful questions and suggestions *before* they read a case and ready access to more comprehensive and authoritative explanations of the material than is possible in a casebook. Each section also includes relevant provisions of the Uniform Commercial Code and the Restatement (Second) of Contracts.

We believe it is safe to say that this casebook contains a larger portion of the scholarship providing context on the famous contracts cases than any other. These "relational background" materials will enrich the students' understanding of the cases and will stimulate a deeper classroom discussion than will cases or statutes alone. Students actually *enjoy* them! They also illustrate that opinions of appellate courts are often surprisingly incomplete and that one's sympathies for the parties may shift upon learning more about the facts. In addition, historical, comparative, ethical, economic, statutory, procedural, empirical, commercial, and theoretical "background materials" were selected and edited to engage students with the subject of contracts and spark debate, but also to be accessible. They can be assigned as required or optional reading, or they may be skipped altogether without detracting from doctrinal coverage, thereby greatly shortening the book.

This sixth edition makes a few changes. Chief among these has been an effort to improve the "modularity" of the book, making it easier to teach sections independent of one another and allowing professors to pick and choose which doctrinal areas to cover, particularly those teaching shorter, one-semester courses. We have created a free-standing section on public policy defenses, which were covered only in the introduction of earlier

<sup>1.</sup> For example, surrogacy agreements, failed vasectomies, involuntary servitude, palimony claims, sexual harassment, reporters' promises of confidentiality, and children's rights.

For example, Chevy Corvettes, Carbolic Smokeballs, custom stereos, oil embargoes, cancelled coronations, football players, opera singers, college catalogues, employment manuals, computer software, and pregnant cows.

<sup>3.</sup> For example, Shirley Maclaine, Robert Reed, Brooke Shields, Jack Dempsey, Lee Marvin, Lillian Russell, and Elvis.

<sup>4.</sup> References are provided to Randy E. Barnett, The Oxford Introduction to U.S. Law: Contracts (2010), E. Allan Farnsworth, Contracts (4th ed. 2004), John D. Calamari & Joseph M. Perillo, Contracts (6th ed. 2009), and John E. Murray, Murray on Contracts (5th ed. 2011).

Preface xxxiii

editions. We have also added a few new cases, included some classics overlooked by previous editions, and added newly published background materials.

• In Chapter 1, In re Baby M and the associated material has been replaced by Jordan v. Knafel along and background materials by Lawrence Cunningham.

In Chapter 2, Tonglish v. Thomas has been replaced by KGM Harvesting Co. v. Fresh Network and Mistletoe Express Service v. Locke has been replaced by the classic case of Security Stove & Mfg. Co. v.

American Ry. Express Co.

- Chapter 4 includes new background materials on Lucy v. Zehmer by Barak Richman, and has added Arnold Palmer Golf Company v. Fuqua Industries Inc., Copeland v. Baskin Robbins USA, the classic case of Lefkowitz v. Great Minneapolis Surplus Store, Inc., and Nguyen v. Barnes & Noble Inc., which replaces Specht v. Netscape. We have also added a drafting problem based on Arnold Palmer Golf Company, and a summary of empirical research by Florencia Marotta-Wurgler on online contracting replaces the ABA Working Materials on that topic.
- In Chapter 6, we replaced Brown v. Oliver with Masterson v. Sine and omitted In re RealNetworks.
- In Chapter 7, we added Lawrence v. Fox, along with historical background materials on this seminal case. We have omitted the section on Agency.
- In Chapter 9, we added Boothe v. Fitzpatrick and Harris v. Watson.
- In Chapter 11, we added Pitts v. McGraw-Edison Co.
- In Chapter 12, we replaced Step-Saver Data Sys. Inc. v. Wyse Technology with Vlases v. Montgomery Ward & Company.
- Finally, in Chapter 16 we added Samaniego v. Empire Today LLC to the section on arbitration agreements and added a new section on public policy defenses consisting of A.Z. v. B.Z. and Meyer v. Hawkinson.

For those professors who wish to teach contract theory by means of excerpts from legal scholarship, the anthology *Perspectives on Contract Law*<sup>5</sup> continues to mesh harmoniously with the organization of this casebook. In contrast to the complex and sometimes idiosyncratic organization of some other casebooks, a great effort was made to adhere to a comprehensible organization reflecting the cause of action for breach of contract: Enforcement, Mutual Assent, Enforceability, Performance and Breach, and Defenses. While starting with enforcement or remedies is sometimes controversial (and we explain this choice in the introduction to Chapter 2), the modular construction of the casebook permits professors easily to reorder these topics as they see fit.

Randy E. Barnett & Nathan B. Oman

November 2016

# **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This book would not have been possible without the assistance of a great many persons. First are the wonderful people at Little, Brown and now Aspen Publishers of Wolters Kluwer. Their commitment to excellence by means of repeated peer reviews of the original proposal and successive drafts immeasurably improved the final product. Special thanks are due to Carol McGeehan, who originally conceived of this project, Betsy Kenny, who ably assisted her in shepherding it from conception to completion, and Tony Perriello, who deftly edited the manuscript for the first edition. I owe a great debt as well to the professors who gave selflessly of themselves as anonymous reviewers of the manuscript: Miriam A. Cherry, Kevin Davis, David A. Hoffman, Kristin Madison, Katherine E. White, and Noah D. Zatz. Although I do not know who of them suggested which improvements to the text, I do know that, as a group, they functioned for me as a coauthor — looking over my shoulder to ensure that the book responded to the diverse needs and preferences of other contracts teachers. In addition, I received helpful suggestions from Ian Ayres, Sheldon Halpern, Alexander Mieklejohn, and Anthony Jon Waters. Several professors who used earlier editions of this casebook made a great many excellent suggestions for its improvement: Mark Chinen, Marcus Cole, Adrienne Davis, Mark Drumbl, Harold Dubroff, Mark Gergen, Grace Giesel, Henry Greely, Matthew Harrington, Michael Kelly, Kristin Madison, Carol Rose, Peter Siegleman, Robert Shepherd, Jim Smith, Eric Talley, Kellye Testy, William Vukowich, Kathy White, Christopher Wonnell, and David Snyder. My eagle-eyed BU colleague Mark Pettit (and contracts teacher extraordinaire) performed an enormous service by noting numerous typos and mistakes in the second edition.

Many improvements to previous drafts of this book were stimulated by class discussion with my contracts students at Northwestern University, Harvard Law School, Boston University School of Law, and Georgetown University Law Center. Finally, I wish also to thank my extraordinary research assistants: Dan Brown at Chicago-Kent College of Law (Class of 1994), at Boston University, Saba Khairi (Class of 1995), Kristin Taylor, Andrew White, Kathleen Eagan (Class of 1996), Leslie Ravestein (Class of 2000), Lourdes German (Class of 2004) and, at Harvard Law School, Jaime Byrnes (Class of 2004). In addition to their other contributions, these students are solely responsible for researching and writing the wonderful judicial biographies that set this casebook apart by giving readers a sense of the men and women who struggled both to decide the cases before them and to justify their decisions. The idea to include judicial biographies in a casebook

XXXV

was innovated by Professor Curtis R. Reitz and a few of his biographies are included here as well. The cases and materials on legal ethics in Chapters 6, 7, and 16 were suggested by the W M. Keck Foundation's project on legal ethics, which is administered by Geoffrey Hazard, Jr. and Susan Koniak.

Finally, with this edition, I welcome aboard Nate Oman as a coauthor. I have long held Nate in high regard and was most grateful when he accepted my invitation to join the book. I encouraged him to bring a fresh eye to everything in the last edition, while being mindful that we did not want to change things too much for existing users. I believe he has added enormous value with the revisions we've made to the Sixth Edition, which were all done at his behest.

Speaking for Nate and myself, we also wish to thank the following authors and publishers for permitting us to include excerpts from these works:

- American Bar Association, excerpts from Model Rules of Professional Conduct. Copyright © 2002 by the American Bar Association. Reprinted with permission. Copies of ABA Model Rules of Professional Conduct 2002 are available from Service Center, American Bar Association, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611-4497, 1-800-285-2222.
- American Law Institute, Restatement (Second) of Contracts. Copyright © by the American Law Institute. Reprinted with permission.
- American Law Institute, Uniform Commercial Code. Copyright © by the American Law Institute. Reprinted with permission.
- Barnett, Randy E., A Consent Theory of Contract, 86 Colum. L. Rev. 269 (1986). Copyright © 1986 by Columbia Law Review. Reprinted with permission.
- Barnett, Randy E., and Becker, Mary E., Beyond Reliance: Promissory Estoppel, Contract Formalities, and Misrepresentations, 15 Hofstra L. Rev. 443 (1987). Copyright © 1987 by Hofstra Law Review. Reprinted with permission.
- Bennett, James, G.M. Settles Suit Over Plant Closing, New York Times, April 15, 1994. Copyright © 1994 by The New York Times Company. Reprinted with permission.
- Bernstein, Lisa, Opting Out of the Legal System: Extralegal Contractual Relations in the Diamond Industry, 21 J. Legal Stud. 115 (1992). Reprinted with permission.
- Blinkoff, Samuel, Note, Contracts: Acceptance of an Offer for a Unilateral Contract: Effect of Tender, 14 Cornell L.Q. 81 (1928). Copyright © 1928 by Cornell University. All rights reserved.
- Cox, Stephen, Mysteries of the Titanic, Liberty, May 1997. Copyright © 1997 Liberty. Reprinted with permission.
- Cunningham, Lawrence A., Contracts in the Real World: Stories of Popular Contracts and Why They Matter. Copyright © 2012 Cambridge University Press. Reprinted with permission.
- Danzig, Richard, *Hadley v. Baxendale:* A Study in the Industrialization of the Law, 4 J. Legal Studies 249 (1975). Copyright © 1975 by Journal of Legal Studies, University of Chicago Law School. Reprinted with permission.

- Danzig, Richard, The Capability Problem in Contract Law (1978 ed.). Copyright © 1978 by Foundation Press. Reprinted with permission.
- Danzig, Richard, and Watson, Geoffrey R., The Capability Problem in Contracts (2d. ed. 2004). Copyright © 2004 by Foundation Press. Reprinted with permission.
- Delong, Sidney W., The New Requirement of Enforcement Reliance in Commercial Promissory Estoppel: Section 90 as Catch-22. Wisconsin Law Review 943, 953, 1003-1008, 1009-1014, 1021 (1997). Copyright © 1997 University of Wisconsin Law Review. Reprinted with permission.
- Dobbs, Dan B., Introduction to Equity and Equitable Remedies. Reprinted from Handbook on the Law of Remedies, copyright © 1993 by West Publishing Company. Reprinted with permission.
- Epstein, Richard, Pleadings and Presumptions, 40 U. Chi. L. Rev. 556 (1973). Copyright © 1973 by University of Chicago Law Review. Reprinted with permission.
- Etherington-Smith, Meredith and Pilcher, Jeremy, The "It" Girls: Lucy, Lady Duff-Gordon, The Couturiere "Lucille," and Eleanor Glynn, Romantic Novelist XIII-XIV 174-178. Copyright © 1986 by Harcourt Brace Jovanovich. Reprinted with permission.
- Farnsworth, E. Allan, Contracts (2d ed. 1990). Copyright © 1990 by Allan E. Farnsworth. Reprinted with permission.
- Farnsworth, E. Allan and Young, William F., Contracts (4th ed. 1988). Copyright © 1988 by Foundation Press. Reprinted with permission.
- Fuller, Lon L., Basic Contract Law (1947 ed.). Copyright © 1947 by West Publishing Company. Reprinted with permission.
- Furmston, M. P., ed., Cheshire, Fifoot & Furmston's Law of Contract (12th ed. 1991). Copyright © 1991 by Butterworth & Co., Ltd. Reprinted with permission.
- Gilmore, Grant, The Death of Contract. Copyright © 1974 by the Ohio State University Press. All rights reserved. Reprinted with permission.
- Goldberg, Victor, Framing Contract Law: An Economic Perspective 45-46, 48-49, 52-53, 55-58, 281-284. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. Copyright © 2006 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College. Reprinted by permission of the publisher.
- Llewellyn, Karl N., for the poem regarding White and Corlies, found in AA.A.IVI of the Karl N. Llewellyn Papers at the University of Chicago Law School. Reprinted with permission of the owner, the University of Chicago Law School.
- Maine, Sir Henry, Ancient Law (1864 ed.). Copyright © 1963 by Sir Henry Maine. Reprinted with permission of Beacon Press.
- Marotta-Wurgler, Florencia, Some Realities of Online Contracting, 19 Sup. Ct. Econ. Rev. 11 (2011). Copyright © 2011 University of Chicago Press. Reprinted with permission.
- National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, Handbook of the National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws and Proceedings of the Thirty-fifth Annual Meeting, Uniform Informational Transactions Act, and the Uniform Electronic Transactions Act. Material here was reprinted with permission of the National

- Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, 676 North St. Clair Street, Suite 1700, Chicago, Illinois 60611, (312) 915-0195.
- Petzinger, Thomas, The Texaco-Pennzoil Wars. Copyright © 1987 by Thomas Petzinger. Reprinted with permission of The Putnam Publishing Group.
- Pomeroy, A Treatise on Equity Jurisprudence (2d ed. 1892). Copyright © 1892 by Bancroft-Whitney Company. Reprinted with permission of Bancroft-Whitney, a division of Thomson Legal Publishing, Inc.
- Richman, Barak, Weinstock, Jordi, and Mehta, Jason, A Bridge, A Tax Revolt, and the Struggle to Industrialize: The Story and Legacy of Rockingham County v. Luten Bridge Co., 84 N.C. L.Rev. 1841, 1851-1879, 1906-1908 (2006). Copyright © 2006. Reprinted with permission.
- Roberts, Jorie, Hawkins Case: A Hair-Raising Experience, Harvard Law Record, vol. 66, no. 6, March 11, 1978, p. 1. Copyright © 1978 by Harvard Law Record. Reprinted with permission.
- Simpson, A. W. B., Contracts for Cotton to Arrive: The Case of the Two Ships *Peerless*, 11 Cardozo L. Rev. 287 (1990). Copyright © 1990 by Cardozo Law Review. Reprinted with permission.
- Simpson, A. W. B., Quackery and Contract Law: The Case of the Carbolic Smokeball, 14 J. Legal. Stud. 345 (1985). Copyright © 1985. Reprinted with permission.
- Simpson, A. W. B., The Doctrine of Consideration Introduction. Reprinted from A History of the Common Law of Contract: The Rise of the Action of Assumpsit (1975 ed.). Out of Print. Reprinted with permission.
- Threedy, Deborah L., A Fish Story: Alaska Packers Association v. Domenico, 2000 Utah L. Rev. 185. Copyright © Deborah L. Threedy. Reprinted with permission.
- Von Mises, Ludwig, Human Action (revised ed. 1963). Copyright © 1963 by Contemporary Books. Reprinted with permission.
- Waddams, Stephen, Dimensions of Private Law: Categories and Concepts in Anglo-American Legal Reasoning 23-27 (2003). Copyright © 2003 by Cambridge University Press. Reprinted with permission of Cambridge University Press.
- Weintraub, Russell J., A Survey of Contract Practice and Policy, 1992 Wis. L. Rev. 1. Copyright © 1992 by the Board of Regents of the University of Wisconsin System. Reprinted with permission of the Wisconsin Law Review.
- Whitford, William C. and Macaulay, Stewart, Hoffman v. Red Owl Stores: The Rest of the Story, 61 Hastings L.J. 801 (2009). Reprinted with permission of William C. Whitford, Stewart Macaulay, and University of California, Hastings College of the Law.
- Williams, Sandra Boyd, The Indiana Supreme Court and the Struggle Against Slavery, 30 Indiana Law Review 305, 307-309 (1997). Copyright © 1997 Indiana University Law Review. Reprinted with permission.

# **C**ONTRACTS

# **SUMMARY OF CONTENTS**

| Contents<br>Preface<br>Acknowledgments   | 201<br>2020201<br>2020201 |
|--|---------------------------|
|  | I                         |
| Enforcing Private Agreements   | 1                         |
| <ol> <li>Introduction to Contract I</li> <li>Damages for Breach of Con</li> <li>Other Remedies and Causes</li> </ol>   | TRACT 33                  |
|  | ш                         |
| MUTUAL ASSENT  | 241                       |
| <ol> <li>REACHING AN AGREEMENT</li> <li>DISCERNING THE AGREEMENT</li> <li>WRITTEN MANIFESTATIONS OF A</li> <li>MULTIPARTY TRANSACTIONS</li> </ol>              | 243<br>359<br>451<br>501  |
|  | ш                         |
| Enforceability   | 547                       |
| <ul> <li>PRINCIPLES OF ENFORCEABILITY</li> <li>THE DOCTRINE OF CONSIDERATION</li> <li>THE INTENTION TO BE LEGALE</li> <li>THE DOCTRINE OF PROMISSOR</li> </ul> | TION 579 Y BOUND 647      |

|                 |                   | IV   |                   |
|-----------------|-------------------|--|-------------------|
| PERFORM         | IAN               | CE AND BREACH  | 791               |
| 1               | 12.<br>13.<br>14. | Performance<br>Conditions<br>Breach                                | 793<br>835<br>859 |
| Em.             |                   | V  |                   |
| DEFENSI         | ES T              | O CONTRACTUAL OBLIGATION   | 929               |
|                 |                   | LACK OF CONTRACTUAL CAPACITY ASSENT IMPROPERLY OBTAINED AND ASSENT | 931               |
| =               | 17.               | TO IMPROPER TERMS FAILURE OF A BASIC ASSUMPTION                    | 961<br>1065       |
| Table of Judges |                   | 1153   |                   |
| Table of        |                   |  | 1157<br>1167      |
| Index           | , 0.              |  | 1173              |