

STATE
BUILDING
IN
LATIN
AMERICA

Hillel David Soifer



State Building in Latin America

HILLEL DAVID SOIFER

Temple University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107107878

© Hillel David Soifer 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Soifer, Hillel David

State building in Latin America / Hillel David Soifer, Temple University.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-10787-8 (hardback)

1. Nation-building – Latin America. 2. Political development – Latin America. I. Title.

JL966.S74 2015

320.98–dc23 2015004870

ISBN 978-1-107-10787-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

State Building in Latin America

State Building in Latin America diverges from existing scholarship in developing explanations both for why state-building efforts in the region emerged and for their success or failure. First, Latin American state leaders chose to attempt concerted state building only where they saw it as the means to political order and economic development. Fragmented regionalism led to the adoption of more laissez-faire ideas and the rejection of state building. With dominant urban centers, developmentalist ideas and state-building efforts took hold, but not all state-building projects succeeded. The second plank of the book's argument centers on strategies of bureaucratic appointment to explain this variation. Filling administrative ranks with local elites caused even concerted state-building efforts to flounder, while appointing outsiders to serve as administrators underpinned success. Relying on extensive archival evidence, the book traces how these factors shaped the differential development of education, taxation, and conscription in Chile, Colombia, Mexico, and Peru.

Hillel David Soifer is an assistant professor of political science at Temple University. His research has been published in journals such as *Comparative Political Studies*, *Studies in Comparative International Development*, and *Latin American Research Review*. He was awarded the 2013 Alexander George Award for Best Article by the Qualitative and Multi-Method Section of the American Political Science Association, and has served as the Peggy Rockefeller Visiting Scholar at the David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies at Harvard University.

Acknowledgments

I don't know why authors seem to leave the most important acknowledgments for last; in my case there is one person to whom clearly I owe the most. Annie has supported me, made me laugh, joined me on much-needed outings, challenged my ideas, and taught me about hers. Though this book would not have been completed without her, her impact goes far beyond that. I don't know what stroke of luck has allowed me to share my life with such a smart, warm, adventurous, and patient partner, but I count my blessings daily.

Sanity during the long road to completing this book was also maintained by the support and distraction of old friends near and (alas, too often) far, including Emma and Mike, Abbie and Willy, Steph and Mike, and Sean and Sam. I'd also like to thank Lance for always greeting me with a wagging tail and the eternal hope for a walk and a snack, and to acknowledge the distraction of political debates on email with Alex, David, and Matt. Academia has the wonderful quality of turning colleagues into friends. Some of my closest friendships – with Casey, Fiona, Mark, Will, Magda, Diana, and Shannon – date back to the beginning of graduate school, and it has been a real pleasure to have known these good people, their partners, and their families over the years. I'm also grateful to my family: my parents, my brother and his three great kids, and my in-laws Pam, Robbie, JP, Coley, and Lizzie, including even those individuals who asked when the book would be done every time we talked.

This book began as a dissertation supervised by Jorge Domínguez, Steven Levitsky, John Coatsworth, and Paul Pierson. My hope is that the final product on these pages shows just how much I got from their careful reading and helpful feedback even as it barely resembles that initial

foray into these issues. I'm also grateful to various institutions at Harvard University for funding the dissertation research on which much of the book is based. Early in my research, I imposed myself on scholars in both Chile and Peru, who patiently answered my incoherent questions and steered me away from making even more fundamental errors. For their time and kindness, I thank Sol Serrano, Rafael Sagredo Baeza, Carlos Contreras, Patricia Ames, and Aldo Panfichi. Jen Tobin has (I believe) not read a word of this manuscript, but her company made my research in Lima more enjoyable.

Thanks to generous invitations from colleagues, I was able to present seminars on this project as it developed and to benefit from the feedback I received. In approximate chronological order, starting from the earliest (and probably painfully incoherent) version, I thank audiences at Dartmouth University, the Princeton Program on Latin American Studies, the University of Michigan, St. Antony's College of Oxford, SUNY-Stony Brook, Brown University, The College of New Jersey, CDDRL at Stanford University, the University of New Mexico, and Trinity College. I'd like to single out Eduardo Dargent and Juan Pablo Luna, who also provided welcome opportunities for me to present research related to this book at their institutions, to exchange ideas about our shared interests, and to benefit from their hospitality in Lima and Pirque. I look forward to continuing to work with both of these generous colleagues, and to returning the favor to the extent possible by welcoming them to our small town in New Jersey.

The advice, reading suggestions, comments, and criticisms of many friends and colleagues have shaped this book in important ways. I am grateful to Nancy Appelbaum, Michael Bernhard, Max Cameron, Giovanni Capoccia, John Carey, Ryan Carlin, Miguel Centeno, Sarah Chartock, Mark Copelovitch, Jorge Domínguez, Angelica Duran Martínez, Kent Eaton, Andres Estefane, Gustavo Flores-Macías, Daniel Gingerich, Agustina Giraudy, Paul Gootenberg, Ivan Jaksic, Rob Jansen, Diana Kapiszewski, Robert Karl, Alan Knight, Kendra Koivu, Marcus Kurtz, Mara Loveman, Lauren Morris MacLean, James Mahoney, Reo Matsuzaki, Conor O'Dwyer, Maritza Paredes, James Robinson, Joshua Rosenthal, Andrew Schrank, Gay Seidman, Dan Slater, Maya Tudor, Kurt Weyland, Nicholas Wheeler, Sean Yom, and Daniel Ziblatt.

For kind advice about the revision process, I thank Miguel Centeno, Steve Levitsky, Rachel Riedl, Rich Snyder, and Deborah Yashar. For the time they took to carefully read large portions of the manuscript (in most cases, when it was much longer than the version in your hands!) and for

their helpful comments, I thank Alisha Holland, Jamie Loxton, Rachel Riedl, Ryan Saylor, Erica Simmons, Prerna Singh, Dan Slater, Rich Snyder, Annie Stilz, and Alberto Vergara. A few generous souls – Steve Levitsky, Ryan Saylor, and especially Matthias vom Hau – have each seen more iterations of this project than I care to admit and than they might care to remember, yet each has patiently offered helpful and thorough comments on many different occasions. I'm truly lucky to have such colleagues.

Much of the writing of this book was accomplished during my time at Temple University, and I consider myself very lucky to share space and community on the fourth floor of Gladfelter Hall with such a smart and generous group of folks. I'm particularly grateful to Rich Deeg and Gary Mucciaroni who have served as wonderful department chairs during my time at Temple, to Sandra Suarez, Robin Kolodny, and Orfeo Fioretos for their wisdom and advice, and to Kevin Arceneaux, Sarah Bush, Ryan Vander Wielen, and Megan Mullin (even though she left us for warmer climes!) for joining me to get coffee, helping me explore Philadelphia, and otherwise being good company. Thanks, too, to Cassie Emmons and Travis Blemings for their careful research assistance.

Bates College was my first home in professional academia. I'd like to thank my colleagues there, especially John Baughman, Áslaug Asgeirsdottir, and Karen Melvin, for their friendship and for understanding my reasons for leaving. Before arriving at Temple, I also spent a year at Princeton University, where thanks to the generosity of the University Center for Human Values and the Politics Department, I was able to enjoy a semester to focus on my research. The final revisions on the book manuscript were completed during a year of leave funded by the Peggy Rockefeller Visiting Fellowship at the David Rockefeller Center for Latin American Studies at Harvard University, and I thank Merilee Grindle and Edwin Ortiz for their generosity and for welcoming me back into the community where I spent several years as a graduate student. Thanks to Rich Snyder, I spent much of that year in residence at Brown University, where the graduate students, visiting scholars, and faculty at CLACS and the Watson Institute helped make my time rewarding and intellectually stimulating. I thank Rich, the staff at the Watson Institute and the Center for Latin American and Caribbean Studies, and especially Kate Goldman for welcoming me to Providence.

Eric Crahan originally expressed interest in this manuscript many years ago, and he and Robert Dreesen shepherded it through the review process. I am grateful to both for their efficiency and their guidance. Robert in particular improved the book with his urging to leave out some

extraneous material that was not ready for primetime. I'm also grateful to Liz Janetschek and the production team at Cambridge University Press for their efficiency and professionalism. The anonymous reviewers were careful and generous with their time, and I thank them for their comments on several iterations of the manuscript; though it took me a long time to address their comments, I am truly grateful for the additional work I was encouraged to do, and I'm confident that the book has improved as a result of their urgings. I, of course, bear exclusive responsibility for all of the errors it still contains.

Abbreviations

[Note that while I use a consistent label to refer to each publication over time, government reorganizations at various points in time in each country led to changes in ministerial names and portfolios.]

AE	Anuario Estadístico, Chile (Annual Statistical Extract, Chile)
CNR	Compañía Nacional de Recaudación, Peru (private firm with which the national government contracted for tax collection after 1902, as discussed in Chapter 5)
HEC	Estado Mayor General del Ejército (various years) <i>Historia del Ejército Chileno</i> (10 volumes) (Santiago: Colección Biblioteca Militar) (official history of the Chilean Army)
MED	Memoria del Ministerio de Instrucción Pública, Peru (Annual Report of the Ministry of Public Education, Peru)
MGOB	Memoria del Ministerio de Gobierno e Interior, Peru (Annual Report of the Ministry of Governance and the Interior, Peru)
MGUERRA	Memoria del Ministerio de Guerra, Peru (Annual Report of the War Ministry, Peru)
MHAC	Memoria del Ministerio de Hacienda, Chile (Annual Report of the Finance Ministry, Chile)
MILIMA	Memoria de la Dirección de Instrucción Pública del Departamento de Lima (Annual Report of the Directorate of Public Education, Department of Lima)
MINT	Memoria del Ministerio de Interior, Chile (Annual Report of the Interior Ministry, Chile)

MIP Memoria del Ministerio de Justicia, Culto, e Instrucción
Pública, Chile (Annual Report of the Justice, Religion,
and Public Education Ministry, Chile)

Annual Official Government Publications Used, by Library/Archive Location

[Note this list does NOT include individual government documents accessed, which are cited as necessary in the text.]

CHILE

Archivo Nacional Histórico

Boletín de Leyes (various years)

Memoria del Ministerio de Guerra 1848, 1856-1858, 1860, 1868,
1873, 1875-1877, 1881, 1882, 1884, 1885

Memoria del Ministerio de Industria y Obras Públicas, 1891-1895

Memoria del Ministerio de Interior 1852, 1854, 1856, 1859, 1860,
1864-1866

Biblioteca Nacional

Anuario Estadístico de la República de Chile 1848-1858, 1861-1912

Memoria del Ministerio de Guerra 1887-1900

Memoria del Ministerio de Hacienda 1834-1836, 1839, 1884-1900

Memoria del Ministerio de Interior 1875-1878, 1880-1881,
1884-1902, 1904, 1908-1910

Memoria del Ministerio de Justicia, Culto, e Instrucción Pública
1840-1851, 1868-1900

Mensajes Presidenciales (various years)

PERU

Archivo Nacional

Memoria del Ministerio de Gobierno 1890, 1896, 1898, 1901, 1902,
1904, 1905, 1907, 1908, 1911, 1913

Memoria del Ministerio de Guerra 1874, 1889, 1890, 1893, 1897,
1900-1929.

Memoria del Ministerio de Instrucción Pública 1853, 1862, 1864,
1890-1893, 1896-1898, 1900-1910, 1912-1922

Instituto DeNegri

Memoria de la Dirección de Instrucción Pública del Departamento de
Lima 1875

Memoria del Ministerio de Gobierno 1831, 1847, 1860, 1870, 1872,
1874, 1878, 1879, 1883, 1885, 1888, 1897, 1899, 1906, 1920, 1921

Memoria del Ministerio de Guerra 1829, 1845, 1853, 1870, 1872,
1879

Memoria del Ministerio de Hacienda 1828, 1849, 1851, 1853, 1862,
1864, 1867, 1868, 1874, 1876, 1878, 1879, 1885, 1886, 1890,
1892, 1896, 1903

Memoria del Ministerio de Instrucción Pública 1847, 1883

Mensajes Presidenciales, various years

Government Documents Collection, Harvard University

Censo Escolar 1902

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page ix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii
<i>Annual Official Government Publications Used, by Library/Archive Location</i>	xv
Introduction: The Origins of State Capacity in Latin America	I
<i>Two Questions</i>	3
The Emergence of State-Building Projects	4
The Success of State-Building Projects	5
<i>Studying Intra-Regional Variation</i>	6
<i>State Capacity: Concepts and Measures</i>	9
<i>State Capacity in Latin America: Historical Trends</i>	II
<i>Research Design: Thick Measures, Detailed Case Studies</i>	15
<i>Explaining Variation in State Capacity</i>	17
The Emergence of State-Building Projects	17
Theorizing State-Building Failure	20
Applying the Argument	23
I The Emergence of State-Building Projects	24
<i>Geography and State Development</i>	27
Size	29
Terrain	30
Urban Primacy, Regional Salience, and State Development	32
Chile	38
Mexico	39
Peru	40
Colombia	41
<i>The Ideational Foundations of State-Building Projects</i>	46
The Varied Content of Mid-Century Liberalism	46

	The State and Progress in Chile	48
	“Order” and “Progress” in Mexico	49
	The State and “Progress” in Peru	51
	Colombia’s Anti-Statist Consensus	52
	<i>Conclusion</i>	55
2	A Theory of State-Building Success and Failure	59
	<i>Administrative Institutions and the Outcomes of</i>	
	<i>State-Building Efforts</i>	61
	Causal Mechanisms	62
	Scoring Cases on the Forms of Rule	65
	<i>The Public Administration of State Building</i>	82
	Patrimonialism	82
	Overlapping Bureaucratic Networks	83
	Technical Expertise	84
	Customary Law	85
	<i>Conclusion</i>	86
3	Alternative Historical Explanations and Initial Conditions	87
	<i>Colonial Legacies</i>	88
	Mechanisms of Colonial Impact	88
	The Bourbon Reforms: State Power at the Twilight of	
	Colonial Rule	89
	<i>Foundational Wars, New States?</i>	94
	<i>Post-Independence Crisis</i>	96
	Education	97
	Taxation	100
	Monopoly of Force	103
	<i>Explaining State Administrative Appointment Practices</i>	107
	Perceived Threats to Systemic Stability	108
	The Place of Traditional Authority in National Projects	116
	The Currency of Patronage	120
	<i>Conclusion</i>	123
4	State Projects, Institutions, and Educational Development	124
	<i>Educational Development and State Power: Dimensions and</i>	
	<i>Indicators</i>	126
	Indicators of Primary Schooling Provision	126
	Indicators of Control over Public Primary Schooling	126
	<i>Comparative Development</i>	127
	Provision	127
	Systematization	130
	Inspection	133
	<i>Lack of Educational Initiative in Colombia</i>	134
	<i>A Structural Alternative: Inequality and Education Development</i>	138
	<i>Deployed Rule and State Power: The Development of School</i>	
	<i>Inspection in Chile</i>	140

	<i>Institutional Change and Education Development in Peru</i>	143
	<i>Explaining Cross-State Divergence in Mexican Education</i>	147
	Statistical Analysis	148
	Sonora	154
	Michoacán	155
	<i>Conclusion</i>	156
5	Political Costs, Infrastructural Obstacles, and Tax State Development	158
	<i>Operationalizing Tax State Development</i>	160
	Tax Types	160
	Tax Burden	162
	<i>Comparative Development</i>	162
	Tax Types	163
	Tax Burden	172
	<i>Explaining Variation in Tax Capacity</i>	179
	Deciding to Tax: Resource Rents and Political Costs	179
	Implementing Taxation: Forms of Rule and Effective Administration	181
	Peru: Local State Agents and the Failure to Tax after the Guano Boom	181
	Chile: Deployed Rule and the Recovery of Taxation after the Nitrate Boom	186
	Federalism and Tax State Development in Colombia and Mexico	193
	Laissez-Faire Liberalism and Reluctance to Tax in Colombia	193
	Mexico: Deployed Rule and the Expansion of Federal Taxation	195
	<i>Conclusion</i>	200
6	Local Administration, Varieties of Conscription, and the Development of Coercive Capacity	202
	<i>War and the State: Limits of the "Bellic" Approach</i>	204
	<i>The Capacity to Mobilize</i>	206
	Chile	207
	Peru	209
	Colombia	211
	Mexico	214
	<i>Local Officials and Military Recruitment</i>	220
	Deployed Rule, Legal-Formal Conscription, and Chilean Military Effectiveness	222
	Mexico: Voluntary Enlistment and Legalistic Recruitment	224
	Delegated Rule and Peruvian Military Weakness	227
	The Absence of Systematic Recruitment Efforts in Colombia	229
	<i>Conclusion</i>	230

Conclusion	232
<i>The Emergence and Outcomes of State-Building Efforts</i>	232
Alternative Explanations	234
<i>A Broader Perspective on Latin American State Building</i>	235
Urban Primacy and the Origins of State-Building Projects	235
Forms of Rule and the Outcomes of State-Building Efforts	246
<i>The End of the Liberal Era</i>	249
<i>Theorizing State Building</i>	252
Bringing Ideas into State Development	252
Separating Emergence and Success	255
Causal Importance	259
<i>Historical State Building and Contemporary "Nation Building"</i>	260
Works Cited	263
Index	291

Introduction

The Origins of State Capacity in Latin America

States are crucial to nearly every aspect of our lives. The ability of state institutions to effectively exert authority throughout the national territory underpins variation in access to economic opportunity, the provision of public goods, and the protection of legal rights. Yet in Latin America, variation in state capacity has only recently become an object of serious scrutiny. Much of our understanding of the state has come from studies of its origins in Europe, where a vigorous debate among scholars has generated extensive cumulation of knowledge in both theoretical and empirical terms.¹ This school of research has been complemented in recent years by a growing literature exploring the “failure” of some contemporary states to fulfill even their basic functions.²

This dual focus on the world’s strongest and weakest states ignores much of the contemporary variation: no state in Latin America, for example, could be described as a Hobbesian Leviathan or a Scandinavian cradle-to-grave provider, nor is any as vestigial as those of Chad or Somalia. Yet within Latin America, state capacity varies quite widely across countries. Some countries, like Chile and Uruguay, provide basic public goods and security to their citizens, and are able to extract revenues and enforce laws. But illiteracy in Bolivia is about five times as high as in Uruguay. For every child not vaccinated in Chile, about ten go unvaccinated in Ecuador. While the 2011 census in Uruguay was administered effectively, the 2005 census in Peru was so flawed it had to be

¹ Among the many important contributions to this literature, some central works are Tilly (1975), Tilly (1992), Ertman (1997), Downing (1992), Spruyt (1994), and Gorski (2003).

² Herbst (2000); Bates (2008).