Investigating Variation

The Effects of Social Organization and Social Setting

语言变体调查:

社会组织与社会环境的影响

Nancy C. Dorian 著



Investigating Variation

The Effects of Social Organization and Social Setting

语言变体调查:

社会组织与社会环境的影响

Nancy C. Dorian 著



图书在版编目(CIP)数据

语言变体调查: 社会组织与社会环境的影响/(美)南希·C·多里安著.

一上海:上海外语教育出版社,2017

(牛津社会语言学丛书)

ISBN 978 - 7 - 5446 - 4920 - 9

I.①语··· Ⅱ.①南··· Ⅲ.①社会语言学-英文 Ⅳ.①H0

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字(2017)第 089069 号

图字: 09-2016-736

©Oxford University Press 2010

"Investigating Variation: The Effects of Social Organization and Social Setting" was originally published in 2010. This reprint is published by arrangement with Oxford University Press for sale/distribution in the Mainland (part) of the People's Republic of China (excluding the territories of Hong Kong SAR, Macau SAR and Taiwan province) only and not for export therefrom.

本书由牛津大学出版社授权上海外语教育出版社有限公司出版。 仅供在中华人民共和国境内(香港、澳门、台湾除外)销售。

出版发行: 上海外语教育出版社

(上海外国语大学内) 邮编: 200083

电 话: 021-65425300 (总机)

电子邮箱: bookinfo@sflep.com.cn

址: http://www.sflep.com.cn http://www.sflep.com

责任编辑: 奚玲燕

印 刷:上海华教印务有限公司

开 本: 787×1000 1/16 印张 23.25 字数 607千字

版 次: 2018年1月第1版 2018年1月第1次印刷

ED 数: 2100 册

书 号: ISBN 978-7-5446-4920-9 / H · 2170

定 价: 70.00 元

本版图书如有印装质量问题,可向本社调换

出版说明

社会语言学是研究语言与社会多方面关系的学科,它从社会科学的不同角度,诸如社会学、人类学、民族学、心理学、地理学和历史学等去考察语言。自20世纪60年代发端以来,社会语言学已经逐渐发展成为语言学研究中的一门重要学科,引发众多学者的关注和探究。

"牛津社会语言学丛书"由国际社会语言学研究的两位领军人物——英国卡迪夫大学语言与交际研究中心的教授 Nicolas Coupland 和 Adam Jaworski(现在中国香港大学英语学院任教)——担任主编。丛书自 2004年由牛津大学出版社陆续出版以来,推出了一系列社会语言学研究的专著,可以说是汇集了这一学科研究的最新成果,代表了当今国际社会语言学研究的最高水平。

我们从中精选出九种,引进出版。所选的这些专著内容广泛,又较贴近我国学者研究的需求,涵盖了当今社会语言学的许多重要课题,如语言变体与语言变化、语言权力与文化认同、语言多元化与语言边缘化、语言与族裔、语言与立场(界位)、语言与新媒体、语用学与礼貌、语言与法律以及社会语言学视角下的话语研究等等。其中既有理论研究,又有方法创新;既有框架分析建构,又有实地考察报告;既体现本学科的前沿和纵深,又展现跨学科的交叉和互补。

相信丛书的引进出版能为从事社会语言学研究的读者带来新的启示,进一步推动我国语言学研究的发展。

For the Gaelic speakers of Embo, welcoming and generous beyond telling to the linguist who turned up in their midst in 1963, and most especially to my faithful telephone partners and visitors of 1993 and after, without whom it would have been impossible to bring this study to completion: Babbie, Jessie Wulina, Kenna, Bella Bheag, Jessie, Jenny, Wilma, and Isabel.

Acknowledgments

More than forty years after I first began to investigate the Gaelic spoken by the East Sutherland fisherfolk and their descendants, I consider it now, fully as much as I did then, an incomparable privilege to have been deeply engaged with the people who spoke this variety of Gaelic and their family circles. The four books to which that engagement has given rise are strong testimony to the almost inexhaustible interest of working with the people in question, but their unfailing generosity deserves its own testimony. "Highland hospitality" is legendary, and in these communities it went far beyond the usual sphere to emerge also in the kindness shown in making an inquisitive linguist's work as personally rewarding as it was professionally fruitful. Humanly and professionally, the years of my association with the people of the former East Sutherland fishing communities have been rich to a degree that words do not easily express. All of these kind people have my lasting gratitude, but in truth the debt is one that can never be repaid.

There is a sense in which every East Sutherlander with whom I ever had a conversation about local conditions or events or practices contributed to the present book. The most immediate contributions, however, are those of the individuals at every level of Gaelic proficiency who provided the linguistic material discussed in this study and displayed (in the case of the active speakers) in its tables. I enter them here according to village of origin.

Of Brora: Mrs. Bella Coul; Miss Jean Dempster; Mrs. Catherine McDonough; Mrs. Dorothy MacRae MacKay; Mrs. Jessie MacLennan; Mr. Donald MacLeod; Mrs. Sarah MacRae and Mr. John MacRae; Miss Bella MacRae; Mr. William MacRae; Miss Bella Jean Sutherland.

Of Golspie: Mr. Hugh MacDonald; Mrs. Margaret MacKay; Miss Jean MacRae; Mrs. Betty Sutherland and Mr. Sinclair Sutherland; Mrs. Elizabeth Sutherland and Mr. Alexander Sutherland.

Of Embo: Mr. Dan Banks; Mr. James Cumming; Mrs. Nana Cumming; Mr. Donald Hugh Cumming; Mrs. Sophia Davey; Mrs. Isabel Ross Finch; Mrs. Christina Fraser and Mr. John Fraser; Mrs. Jessie MacKay Fraser and Mr. Thomas Fraser; Mr. Thomas Fraser; Mrs. Jessie MacKay Frew; Mrs. Bella Grant; Mrs. Isobel Sutherland Hadden; Mrs. Nana MacPhail Johnston; Mr. Alexander MacKay; Mr. Andrew MacKay; Mrs. Bella MacKay; Mrs. Betsy MacKay and Mr. Harold MacKay; Mr. David MacKay; Mr. Donald MacKay; Mr. James MacKay; Mrs. Jenny Cumming MacKay; Mrs. Lena MacKay and Mr. Kenneth MacKay; Mr. Lindsay MacKay; Mr. Thomas MacKay "Brown"; Mr. Thomas MacKay; Mrs. Jessie Fraser Ratell; Mrs. Bella Ross Roach; Mr. Alex Ross; Mrs. Barbara Ross; Mrs. Bella Ross; Mrs. Donald Ross; Miss Jessie Ross; Mrs. Jessie Ann Ross and Mr. Donald Ross; Miss Margaret Ross; Mr. Paul Ross; Mr. Peter Ross; Miss Wilma Ross; Mr. Donald Sutherland; Mrs. Margaret Taylor, Mrs. Georgie Watt; Mrs. Isabel Joan Fraser Wilton.

During the preparation of this book, a number of colleagues answered questions or in some cases read bits or chapters of early manuscript drafts. In that connection I would like to thank Colleen Cotter, Bill Jancewicz, Ruth King, Paul Lewis, Ronald Macaulay, Robin Sabino, Suzanne Romaine, and Sally Thomason. Colleen Cotter, Ronald Macaulay, and Suzanne Romaine in particular sent critiques or questions in response to an early draft of the first three chapters that were invaluable in helping me present the idiosyncratic, socially neutral linguistic variation of East Sutherland fisherfolk Gaelic in a way that would be as intelligible as possible to readers with no personal experience of such variation phenomena. Two reviewers for Oxford University Press likewise supplied useful critiques at a much later stage in the enterprise. Suzanne Romaine and Robin Sabino kindly sent me copies of articles I would otherwise not have known about that proved relevant to parts of my presentation. The availability of Summer Institute of Linguistics (SIL) phonetic fonts to the general public was a boon for which I am very grateful (and for being steered to them by Robin Sabino and her graduate student Norman Hubbard), as I am also for the kindness of SIL's Mark Anderson in locating an early user's manual for the fonts I adopted. Series editors Nikolas Coupland and Adam Jaworski made the suggestion that resulted in the main title for this book.

Finally a word of appreciation for East Sutherland fisherfolk Gaelic itself. Peripherally aberrant it may be, but to anyone who comes to it without preconceived ideas of what Scottish Gaelic should sound like, it is a lovely dialect, graced by its long, Scandinavian-sounding vowels; people passing my office and hearing it on recordings occasionally asked if it were a variety of Swedish. Those of us who speak only this variety of Gaelic easily recognize the folk wisdom of the proverb: 'S geal leis an fhitheach an isean fhein, "White to the raven is its own chick."

Phonetic/Phonological Values of Symbols Appearing in the Text

The vowels /i/, /e/, /e/, /u/, /o/, /o/ have their standard phonetic values; the same vowel symbols with /:/ are the equivalents with phonemic length. All are "pure" vowels without on- or off-glides.

The vowels printed as /a/ and /a:/ represent phonetic [α] and [α :]. The vowel printed as /ə/ represents [β], [γ], or a backed [ι], and the vowel printed as /ə:/ represents high, back, unrounded [ω :]. All vowels have phonemically nasal counterparts.

Diphthongs are essentially combinations of the above, but [i] and [u] can act as off-glides that contrast with two-vowel sequences occupying a full two morae, such as $[pi.\overline{\nu}]$ 'food' versus $[pi.\alpha.u]$ 'feed'.

The consonants printed as $/\check{c}/$ and $/\check{j}/$ represent the affricates [tš] and [d \check{s}]. The consonant /r/ represents an abbreviated (one- or two-tap) trill initially, single-flap medially, and an abbreviated (and occasionally voiceless) trill finally. The consonant printed as $/\check{t}/$ represents a velarized lateral. Except in compounding, only the consonant /n/ can appear with phonemic length.

The labial, dental, and velar stops and the affricate appear aspirated, unaspirated, or voiced, but the three possibilities appear contrastively only in word-initial position, where the voiced series occurs morphophonemically in response to a triggering element that is often absent from the surface structure. The contrast between the aspirated and unaspirated series of voiceless stops and affricate is neutralized in medial position (see the diminutive of /khath/ below, in which the originally aspirated final stop loses its aspiration when the suffix is added). Wordfinally only the voiceless aspirated and voiced stops and affricate appear.

Initial contrasts

 $/k^hat^h/$ 'cat' $[k^h\alpha t^h]$ $/kat^h/$ 'swelling' (gerund) $[k\alpha t^h]$ $/(\mathfrak{d})$ gat $^h/$ 'the cat' $[(\mathfrak{d})$ gat $^h]$

Final contrasts

 $/k^hat^h/$ 'cat' $[k^h\alpha t^h]$ /ad/ 'hat' $[\alpha d]$

Medial contrasts

/khatan/ 'kitten' = 'cat' + masculine diminutive suffix /-an/ [khatan] /adag/ 'small hat' = 'hat' + feminine diminutive suffix /-ag/ [α dag]

The first syllable of disyllabic or polysyllabic words is normally stressed, for example, /'moriçɛn/ 'fisherfolk'. The exceptions, apart from a very few English loanwords of longstanding and many recent English loanwords, are adjectives or verbs with prefixes that are still at least somewhat productive, for example, the adjectival prefix /mi-/ 'un-, non-', the verbal prefix /a-/ 're-'.

Contents

Phonetic/Phonological Values of Symbols Appearing in the Text, xxi

The Variation Puzzle, 3
1 Linguistic Variation without Social Weighting
2 High Levels of Socially Neutral Linguistic Variation
in Three Socioeconomically Undifferentiated
Minority-Language Enclaves
3 Exposure to Standard-Language or Mainstream Norms
and Deviations from Those Norms in English
and in Gaelic
3.1 English and Its Dialect Forms
3.2 Vernacular Gaelic and Formal Gaelic
3.3 Local Speech Features in the East Sutherland
Fisherfolk Context
4 Initial Encounters with Variability
4.1 Encountering the Language
4.2 Encountering Intra-Community Variation
4.3 Age-Related Variation13
4.3.1 Establishing an Age-and-Proficiency
Continuum15
5 Inter-Speaker and Intra-Speaker Variation
in the Gaelic-Speaking Communities

2

	5.1 Examples of Inter- and Intra-Speaker Differences		
	in the Use of Two Variables		
	5.2 The Evidence of Dialect Geography18		
	5.3 The Possible Effect of Gender		
	5.4 The Possible Effect of Style		
	5.5 The Possible Effect of Kinship or of Household		
	Membership		
	5.6 The Prevalence of Idiosyncratic, Socially Neutral		
	Variation		
6	Coming to Grips with the Variation Puzzle		
	6.1 The Inadequacy of Obsolescence as an		
	Explanation for Idiosyncratic Variation		
7	Researcher Responses to Seemingly Idiosyncratic		
	Variation among Speakers		
	7.1 Residual Prescriptivism		
	7.2 Data Control via Source Selection		
	7.3 Search for an Assumed Uniformity26		
	7.4 Concentration on the Group Rather		
	than the Individual		
	7.5 Expectation of Linguistic Focusing within Small,		
	Tight-Knit, Highly Interactive Communities 29		
	7.6 Expectation of Linguistic Accommodation		
	to Other Speakers		
	7.7 Expectation of Linkage between Variation		
	and Social Differentiation		
	7.8 Researcher Responses: Summary		
8	Variation within and across Village Boundaries 32		
	8.1 Local Responses to Variation:		
	Inter-Village Variation		
	8.2 Local Responses to Variation:		
	Intra-Village Variation		
	8.3 Fisherfolk Populations United		
	and Divided by Gaelic		
9	Plan of the Remainder		
	of the Book		
Т	he East Sutherland Fishing Communities, 39		
1	Introduction: Fishing as a Subsistence Mode		
2	Creation of the East Sutherland Fishing Communities:		
4			
	The "Improvement" Era		
	in the East Sutherland Context41		
3	Fishing as a Way of Life in East Sutherland		
J	3.1 The Local Fishery: Line Fishing		
	3.2 The National Fishery: Herring Fishing		
	The same of the sa		

	4	The East Sutherland Fisherfolk as a Socially
		and Linguistically Distinctive Population 47
		4.1 Separateness and Poverty47
		4.2 Separateness and Language
		4.2.1 Settlement History and Dialect
		Distinctiveness
		4.2.2 Geographically Based Differences
		in the Gaelic of the Fishing Communities 51
		4.2.3 The Church as a Potentially Unifying
		Institution51
		4.3 Separateness and Endogamy
		4.3.1 Maintenance of Kin Ties
		4.3.2 Naming Practices and the Maintenance
		of Kin Ties
		4.3.3 Maintaining Less Familiar Degrees
		of Kinship
		4.3.4 Focus on Kinship
	5	The Fishing Communities as Face-to-Face
		Communities
		5.1 Geographic and Demographic Characteristics56
		5.2 Egalitarianism as a Fishing Community Norm 59
		5.3 Gender-Distinctive Work Roles
		5.4 Multiplex Roles
		5.5 Community Membership62
3	D	imensions of Linguistic Variation in a
	S	ocioeconomically Homogeneous Population, 64
		Introduction: The Residual Fisherfolk Populations
		in the 1960s and After
	2	Varieties of Variation in East Sutherland Gaelic 65
	3	Geographically Based Variation in Fisherfolk Gaelic 67
		3.1 An Example of Geographically Based Variation 67
		3.2 Establishing the Existence of Geographically
		Based Variation
	4	Age-Related Variation in Fisherfolk Gaelic 69
		4.1 An Example of Age-Related Variation70
		4.2 Establishing the Existence of Age-Related
		Variation
	5	Style-Related Variation in Fisherfolk Gaelic
		5.1 An Example of Style-Related Variation
		5.2 Establishing the Existence of Style-Related
	,	Variation
	6	Personally Patterned Variation in Fisherfolk Gaelic 76
		6.1 An Example of Personal-Pattern Variation

		6.2	Case	es of Age-Related Variation	
				Personal-Pattern Variation Compared	78
			6.2.1	Contrasting Cases Involving Analogical	
				Regularization	79
			6.2.2	2 A Single Variable Demonstrating Both	
				Age-Related and Personal-Pattern Variation	182
		6.3		-Related and Personally Patterned Variation	
				npared: Summary	82
		6.4		Idiosyncratic Variant-Use Patterns	
				Key Embo Sibling Pair	83
			6.4.1	Variables for Which the Siblings Favored	WI I
			- 1	Different Variants	84
		6.5	Estab	blishing the Existence of Personally	0.5
	-	71		erned Variation	86
	/	The	Chall	llenges of Investigating Personally Patterned	0.7
				in the Fisherfolk Communities	
				embling a More Adequate Database	
		1.2		blishing Lack of Social Weighting in Connect Individual Variant Selections	
				Evidence from Apparent Unawareness of	00
			7.2.1	Alternative Forms	90
			722	2 Evidence from Dyadic Conversational Mat	
			1	Repetitions Using Different Variants	
			7.2.3	B Evidence from Intra-Speaker	
			, 1213	Variant Alternation	93
			7.2.4	4 Evidence from Traditional Material	
				5 Evidence from Responses to One Pair	
				of Socially Weighted Variants	95
			7.2.6		
				English Loanwords	96
		7.3	Sumi	nmary: Absence of Social Evaluation in	
			Perso	sonally Patterned Variation	98
4	A	Ge	neral	l Introduction to Speakers and Variable	es. 100
	1			tion	
	2			abase	
				ited Material	
				ely Spoken Material	
	3			Embo Gaelic	
				age of Origin	
		4.3	Sex		
		4.4	Profi	ficiency: Descriptive Proficiency-Level	
				els	106

		4.5 Proficiency: Evaluative Proficiency-Level
		Labels
	5	Speakers
		5.1 Factors in Gaelic-Language Social
		Interaction Patterns
	6	Variables: Introduction
		6.1 Selection of Variables for Presentation
		6.2 Particular Variable Features Selected
		for Discussion
		6.3 Choices in the Identification of Variant Forms \dots 115
		6.4 Representation of the Variables
		6.4.1 Adopting English Glosses
		6.4.2 Avoiding a Main-Variant Nomination 118
		6.5 Inclusion of Repetitions and Broken-Off
	-7	Variants in Token Counts
	/	Selection and Presentation of Variables: Summary 122
5	A	Close Look at Some Embo Variables
	aı	nd Their Use, 123
		art I: The Variables
	Г ₀	art i. The variables
		Introduction
	2	Order of Presentation and Percentage of Use
	J	3.1 The Significance of Personal-Pattern Variation
		Ubiquity: Brora and Golspie Parallels
		3.2 Absolute Numbers versus Percentage of Use 127
		3.3 Elicited versus Freely Spoken Variants and Other
		Possible Stylistically Cued Patterns of
		Variant Use
	4	Multivariant Variables: Five-Variant Variables
	ì	4.1 The Variable Adverbial ('in')
		4.1.1 Use of Multiple Variants
		4.1.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
		4.2 The Variable Conjunctional ('when')
		4.2.1 Use of Multiple Variants
		4.2.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
		4.3 The Variable ('along with')
		4.3.1 Use of Multiple Variants
		4.3.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
	5	Gender and Multiple- or Single-Variant Use Patterns
		for the Five-Variant Variables

6	Alignment of Individual Variant Preferences:
	Three Five-Variant Variables
	6.1 Variant-Preference Distributions
	6.2 Variant-Preference Clusterings
	6.3 Clusterings by Sex of Speaker
	6.4 Invariance
	6.5 The London-Embo Speaker Group
	6.6 Patterns of Atypical Variant Preference143
7	Multivariant Variables: Four- and Three-Variant
	Variables
	7.1 The Variable ('would go')143
	7.1.1 A Case of Linguistic Variation Together with
	Linguistic Change144
	7.1.2 The Role of Acoustic Salience146
	7.1.3 Use of Multiple Variants
	7.1.4 Patterns of Variant Preference by
	Age and Sex
	7.2 The Variable ('family')
	7.2.1 Use of Multiple Variants
	7.2.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
	Age and Sex
	7.3 The Variable ('from, off, of')
	7.3.1 Use of Multiple Variants
	7.3.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by Age and Sex153
	7.4 The Variable (preterite particle) before Front
	Vowel
	7.4.1 Use of Multiple Variants
	7.4.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
	Age and Sex156
	7.5 The Variable ('potato')
	7.5.1 Use of Multiple Variants
	7.5.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
	Age and Sex
8	Alignment of Individual Variant Preferences:
	Eight Multivariant Variables
9	Two-Variant variables
	9.1 The Variable ('wasn't/weren't')
	9.1.1 Use of More than One Variant
	9.1.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
	Age and Sex
	9.1.3 The Analogical Factor
	9.2 The Variable ('came')
	9.2.1 Use of More than One Variant
	9.2.2 Patterns of Variant Preference by Age and Sex 167

9.3		/ariable ('tomorrow')
	9.3.1	Use of More than One Variant 168
	9.3.2	Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
	9.3.3	Variables with Structurally Parallel
		Variants in /-ax/ and /-iç/169
9.4		/ariable ('saw')
		Use of More than One Variant
	9.4.2	Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
9.		/ariable Demonstrative ('that')
	9.5.1	Use of More than One Variant
	9.5.2	Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
9.	5 The \	/ariable Affirming ('is/are')
w .		Use of More than One Variant
	9.6.2	Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
9.		/ariable ('needing')
		Use of More than One Variant
	9.7.2	Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
9.	8 The \	/ariable ('this')
		Use of More than One Variant
	9.8.2	Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
9.		/ariable ('out')
		Use of More than One Variant
	9.9.2	Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
9.10		/ariable ('near')
		1 Use of More than One Variant
	9.10.	2 Patterns of Variant Preference by
		Age and Sex
Par	t II: V	ariant Use by Speech Functions,
	V	ariability by Speaker and Variable, and
	S	peakers' Levels of Variant-Preference
1	he Effe 0.1 Va 0.2 Va	Agreement and Disagreement ct of Elicitation on Variant Use
1		ther Variables
	U.J U	variables

11	Other Potentially Style-Related Patterns of
	Variant Use
	11.1 Variant-Use Patterns in Traditional Material 189
	11.2 Variant-Use Patterns in Stories with Sharp
	Differences in Tone and Affect
	11.3 Variant-Use Patterns in Extended Discourse 191
	11.3.1 The "Gift Tape"
	11.3.2 The "Ceilidh Tapes"
	11.4 Variant-Use Patterns with Different
	Interlocutors194
	11.5 Conclusion
12	Variability as a Property of Variables and of Speakers 196
	12.1 Individual Speakers' Levels of Variation 197
	12.2 Variables Compared by the Number of
	Individuals Using More than One Variant199
13	Speakers Compared by the Typicality or Aberrance
	of Their Variant Preferences
14	Speakers' Levels of Agreement and Disagreement
	with Fellow Speakers
	14.1 Relatively High Levels of Agreement on Variant
	Preference
	14.1.1 High Agreement Levels by Sex
	and Proficiency Level
	14.1.2 High Agreement Levels between Spouses 203
	14.1.3 High Agreement Levels within the
	London-Embo Group
	14.1.4 High Agreement Levels outside the
	London-Embo Group
	14.2 Relatively Low Levels of Agreement on Variant
	Preference
	14.2.1 Low Agreement Levels by Sex
	and Proficiency Level
	14.3 Unpredictable Outcomes in Levels of Agreement
	on Variant Preferences
6 Ki	n Groups, Peer Groups, and Variation, 209
1	Introduction
	The Influence of Family and Peer Group 210
	The Centrality of Kin Groups in Embo's Social Structure 212
	Working with the Members of Key Sibling Sets 213
5	Variant Selections by Percentage of Use among
	Family-Group Members: Introduction 217
	5.1 Group 1
	5.2 Group 2
	5.3 Group 3224