ASIF H. QURESHI

Interpreting WTO Agreements

Problems and Perspectives



Second Edition

INTERPRETING WTO AGREEMENTS

Problems and Perspectives
SECOND EDITION

ASIF H. QURESHI



CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107043299

© Asif H. Oureshi 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Qureshi, Asif H. (Asif Hasan), 1956- author.

Interpreting WTO agreements : problems and perspectives / Asif H. Qureshi. – Second edition.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-04329-9 (hardback)

Commercial treaties – Interpretation and construction.
 Foreign trade regulation – Interpretation and construction.
 Tariff – Law and legislation – Interpretation and construction.
 World Trade Organization.
 Judicial process.
 Title.

K4610.Q87 2015 382'.92-dc23 2014029902

ISBN 978-1-107-04329-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

INTERPRETING WTO AGREEMENTS

The case law of the World Trade Organization is extensive, now running into some three hundred decided cases and thousands of pages. The interpretative process involved in this jurisprudence constitutes a form of legislative activity, and is therefore of great significance not only to the parties to disputes, but to the membership of the WTO. Qureshi identifies some of the underlying problems of interpreting WTO agreements, and examines the conditions for the interpretation of these agreements. Since the first edition of this book, the case law has grown, and the interpretation evolved further. This second edition addresses these developments and engages in the contemporary discourse on the subject. Also included is a new section on issues of interpretation relating to preferential trade agreements and the WTO. This book is an essential tool for WTO trade specialists, as well as government and judicial officers concerned with interpreting these agreements.

ASIF H. QURESHI is Professor of International Economic Law in the School of Law at Korea University, Seoul, a barrister attached to Quadrant Chambers, London and Editor-in-Chief of Manchester Journal of International Economic Law.

To my parents who live on in me

此为试读, 需要完整PDF请访问: www.ertongbook.com

PREFACE TO FIRST EDITION

My interest in the problems of interpreting the WTO Agreements is a long-standing one. My first monograph on the WTO focused on the implementation of the WTO Agreements, and interpretation is very much a part of implementation. When that book was published, however, interpretation was not that big an issue. Some of the inspiration for this work also comes from my earlier research on IMF conditionality.² Anyone working on the legal aspects of IMF conditionality at that time had to engage with the works of Joseph Gold - in particular his work on interpretation.3 Judge Rosalyn Higgins's work on problems and processes no doubt provided the idea for a problems-based approach to the subject,4 although it is a matter of judgement whether my work is in any way process oriented. Another inspiration for the writing of the current book is irritation (which can also be a motivating factor for research) stemming from the preoccupation in the existing literature on the interpretation of the WTO Agreements with the interaction of international environmental and human rights norms with the WTO Agreements. Diverse perspectives even on a seemingly technical subject can have significance in the development of international law.⁵

This monograph was researched and written while I was visiting Fudan Law School, Shanghai, China; the Law School, University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia; and the Graduate School of Law and Politics, University of Osaka, Japan. Of course, a substantial part was also

See A. H. Qureshi, The World Trade Organization: Implementing International Trade Norms (Manchester University Press, 1996).

² See A. H. Qureshi, International Economic Law (Sweet and Maxwell, London 1999) part two.

See J. Gold, Interpretation: The IMF and International Law (Kluwer Law International, The Hague 1996).

See R. Higgins, Problems and Processes: International Law and How It Works (Clarendon Press, Oxford 1995).

See A.H. Qureshi (ed.), Perspectives in International Economic Law (Kluwer Law International, The Hague 2002).

completed at my base in the Law School, University of Manchester. I am particularly grateful to Professor Lu Zhian, Professor Khaw Lake Tee and Professor Mari Nagata for their very kind hospitality during my sojourns in China, Malaysia and Japan, respectively. I am also very grateful to my colleagues in Manchester for facilitating these trips.

There are a host of others to whom gratitude needs to be expressed. I thank these people and apologise for not naming all of them here individually. I would, however, like to mention Finola O'Sullivan of Cambridge University Press for facilitating this publication and for her firm advice on deadlines! I am also grateful to Valerie Hughes, former Director of the Appellate Body of the WTO, for her comments on chapter 2, and to Willie Chatsika, Counsellor in the Technical Cooperation Division of the WTO, for his observations on an earlier draft of chapter 5.

Last but not least, this book would not have been possible without the love and care that sustained me while I worked on it. Mianghi 'Kamsa Hamnida', as they say in Korean.

PREFACE TO SECOND EDITION

The first edition of this monograph published in 2006 was the first ever monograph fully devoted to a comprehensive examination of the problems relating to the interpretation of the WTO Agreements. Eight years have now elapsed since the first edition. Between 2006 to April 2014 there have been some thirty-seven WTO Appellate Body reports and sixty-three Panel reports. Additionally, there has been much scholarly engagement on the subject of interpretation of international treaties focusing not only on the issues relating to the interpretation of WTO Agreements but also deliberating on those relating to the interpretation of bilateral investment agreements. This has been accompanied by some in-depth studies on treaty interpretation generally, including an important focus by the International Law Commission on fragmentation in international law. Against this background also has been the slow progress of the Doha Round of trade negotiations and a consequent pegging of hopes in some quarters on the development of world trade law through the auspices of the WTO dispute settlement process. In the same vein, the mushrooming of regional trade agreements with their respective, albeit mainly dormant, dispute settlement mechanisms, has placed a greater responsibility, as much as complexity, on the shoulders of the legal custodians of the WTO Agreements. This second edition tries to take into account these developments. In particular, the perspective here has taken into account, wherever appropriate, development issues in the analysis, as should be the case in any serious work on interpretation of WTO Agreements. In some measure the practice in investment arbitration on interpretation has also been taken into account. All the chapters have been substantially revised and a new chapter added.

I am very grateful to Ms Minyoung Ko from the Law School at Korea University for her research assistance in bringing about this second edition. Selflessly, she took time off from her own PhD research and delivered, as and when I needed her, valuable and thorough research assistance. I am also grateful and fortunate to have worked on this

second edition in the very congenial environment of the Law School, Korea University alongside my distinguished colleagues and friends, in particular Professors Nohyoung Park, Park Ki-Gab, Jae-Hyung Lee, Byung-Geun Kang, and Keechang Kim, Tae-Jin Kim and Lin Zhang. Finally a special mention to all the students in the Law School for making it a pleasure to teach!

ABBREVIATIONS

AB Appellate Body

ADA Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of the General

Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994

BIT Bilateral investment treaty

BOP Committee Balance of Payments Committee

CERD Charter of International Economic Rights and Duties of States

DSB Dispute Settlement Body

DSU Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the

Settlement of Disputes

ECJ European Court of Justice

FCN Friendship, commerce and navigation
GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

HS International Convention on the Harmonized Description and

Coding System

IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICSID International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes

IDL International development law
IIA International investment agreement
ILC International Law Commission
IMF International Monetary Fund
ITO International Trade Organization

LDC Least-developed country MFN Most-favoured nation

MTN Multilateral trade negotiations

NAFTA North American Free Trade Agreement
NIEO New International Economic Order
PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

PTA Preferential trade arrangements

RTA Regional trade agreement SA Agreement on Safeguards

S&D Special and differential treatment

SCM Agreement Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
SPS Agreement Agreement on Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures

TBT Technical Barriers to Trade

TPR Trade policy review

TPRM Trade Policy Review Mechanism
TRIMs Trade-Related Investment Measures

TRIPS Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights
UNCITRAL United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

VAT Value added tax

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 1969

WHO World Health Organization

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organization

WTO World Trade Organization

Negotiations: The Legal Texts

TABLE OF WTO CASES

Argentina-Bovine Hides (Panel) WT/DS155/R 210-11, 213 Argentina-Footwear (AB) WT/DS121/AB/R 90, 206, 254, 281, 290, 292, 302, 304,

314, 324, 326, 337

Argentina-Peach Safeguards (Panel) WT/DS238/R 127

Argentina-Poultry Anti-Dumping Duties (Panel) WT/DS241/R 67

Argentina-Textiles (AB) WT/DS56/AB/R 201

Australia-Apples (Panel) WT/DS367/R 30, 78

Australia-Automotive Leather (Panel) WT/DS126/R 90

Australia-Salmon (AB) WT/DS18/AB/R 99

Brazil-Aircraft (AB) WT/DS46/AB/R 29, 174, 204, 211, 213, 220-1, 222, 223, 296, 334

Brazil-Aircraft (Panel) WT/DS46/R 165, 167, 215-16

Brazil-Desiccated Coconut (AB) WT/DS22/AB/R 98, 107, 288, 312, 313, 317

Brazil-Desiccated Coconut (Panel) WT/DS22/R 128, 129

Canada-Aircraft (AB) WT/DS70/AB/R 27, 80, 88, 303

Canada-Aircraft (Panel) WT/DS70/R 108

Canada-Automotive Industry (AB) WT/DS139/AB/R; WT/DS142/AB/R 287, 298

Canada-Automotive Industry (Panel) WT/DS139/R; WT/DS142/R 24, 206

Canada-Continued Suspension (AB) WT/DS321/AB/R 87, 94

Canada-Dairy Products (AB) WT/DS103/AB/R; WT/DS113/AB/R 50, 52, 54, 63

Canada-Foreign Investment Review Act (Panel) BISD 30S/140 173

Canada-Ice Cream and Yoghurt (GATT) (Panel) BISD 36S/68 172, 173

Canada-Renewable Energy (AB) WT/DS412/AB/R; WT/DS426/AB/R 156, 176

Canada-Wheat (AB) WT/DS276/AB/R 92, 99

Chile-Price Band System (AB) WT/DS207/AB/R 52, 78, 87, 108, 254

Chile-Price Band System (Panel) WT/DS207/R 108

China-Audio Visual (AB) WT/DS363/AB/R 14, 16, 24, 27, 30, 59, 63, 122, 146

China-Audio Visual (Panel) WT/DS363/R 127, 129

China-Automobile Parts (AB) WT/DS339/AB/R 61

China-Electronic Payment Services (Panel) WT/DS413/R 27

China-GOES (AB) WT/DS414/AB/R 29, 302

China-Raw Materials (AB) WT/DS394/AB/R 137-8, 140-1, 148, 149, 150, 152, 153, 156, 157, 346

China-Raw Materials (Panel) WT/DS394/R 211, 219

Dominican Republic-Bags (Panel) WT/DS415/R; WT/DS416/R; WT/DS417/R; WT/DS418/R 208, 296

Dominican Republic-Cigarettes (Panel) WT/DS302/R 167

EC-Aircraft (AB) WT/DS316/AB/R 15, 46, 48, 49, 62, 89, 95

EC-Asbestos (AB) WT/DS135/AB/R 60, 92, 102, 260

EC-Asbestos (Panel) WT/DS135/R 24, 27, 30, 105

EC-Bananas (AB) WT/DS27/AB/RW2/ECU 33, 52, 67, 167, 170, 175, 201, 213, 232

EC-Bananas (Panel) WT/DS32/R 90, 169, 172, 201

EC-Bananas II (Panel) WT/DS27/RW2/ECU 207, 208

EC-Bananas III (AB) WT/DS27/AB/R 87, 94, 101, 156, 317

EC-Bananas III (Ecuador II) (AB) WT/DS27/AB/R 37, 39-40, 45, 52, 62, 63, 75, 81, 107

EC-Bananas III (US) (AB) WT/DS27/AB/RW/USA 37, 39-40, 45, 52, 62, 63, 75, 81, 107

EC-Bed Linen (AB) WT/DS141/AB/R 77, 296, 309, 320

EC-Bed Linen (Panel) WT/DS141/R 24, 126, 204, 221, 222, 303, 304, 334

EC-Biotech (Panel) WT/DS291/R; WT/DS292/R; WT/DS293/R 46, 48, 62

EC-Chicken Classification (AB) WT/DS269/AB/R 24, 28, 29, 31, 35, 42, 50, 51, 52, 54-6, 60, 61, 62, 63, 125-6, 140, 206, 233

EC-Chicken Classification (Panel) WT/DS269/R 15, 19-20, 24, 31, 40, 41, 61, 124, 206

EC-Commercial Vessels (Panel) WT/DS301/R 167

EC-Computer Equipment (AB) WT/DS67/AB/R 15, 16, 54, 59, 63, 140, 230

EC-Dessert Apples (Panel) BISD 36S/93 173, 201

EC-Fastners (AB) WT/DS397/AB/R 52, 149, 157

EC-Hormones (AB) WT/DS26/AB/R 26, 60, 77, 88, 91, 94, 100, 101, 152, 154, 156, 173-4, 175, 177, 254, 319, 326

EC-Information Technology Products (Panel) WT/DS375/R 61

EC-Parts and Components (Panel) BISD 37S/132 173

EC-Pipe Fittings (AB) WT/DS219/AB/R 298, 306

EC-Pipe Fittings (Panel) WT/DS219/R 334

EC-Poultry (AB) WT69/AB/R 52, 63

EC-Sardines (AB) WT/DS231/AB/R 174

EC-Seal Products (AB) WT/DS400/AB/R; WT/DS401/AB/R 114

EC-Seal Products (Panel) WT/DS400/R; WT/DS401/R 220

EC-Sugar Subsidies (Panel) WT/DS265/R 21, 60

EC-Tariff Preferences (AB) WT/DS246/AB/R 29, 164-5, 201, 216, 223

EC-Tariff Preferences (Panel) WT/DS246/R 106, 108, 148, 166, 174-5

EC-Trademark/GI (Panel) WT/DS290/R 122

Guatemala-Portland Cement from Mexico (AB) WT/DS60/AB/R 314

India-Automotive Sector (Panel) WT/DS146/R; WT/DS175/R 108, 212 India-Patents (AB) WT/DS50/AB/R 16, 59, 60, 91, 98, 99, 122, 212 India-Patents (Panel) WT/DS50/R 221-2

India-Quantitative Restrictions (AB) WT/DS90/AB/R 29, 67, 78, 96-7, 103-5, 106-7, 223, 306

India-Quantitative Restrictions (Panel) WT/DS90/R 108, 211, 212Indonesia-Automobiles (Panel) WT/DS54/R; WT/DS55/R; WT/DS59/R; WT/DS64/R 50, 67, 79, 155, 204, 212, 213-14, 222, 223, 334

Japan-Agricultural Products (AB) WT/DS76/AB/R 77, 100
Japan-Agricultural Products (Panel) BISD 35S/163 173
Japan-Alcoholic Beverages (AB) WT/DS8/AB/R; WT/DS10/AB/R; WT/DS11/AB/R 3 21 24 26 25 41 45 62 63 74 76 155 254

AB/R 3, 21, 24, 26, 35, 41, 45, 62, 63, 74, 76, 155, 254 Japan–Alcoholic Beverages (Panel) WT/DS8/R; WT/DS10/R; WT/DS11/R 50, 51 Japan–DRAMS (Panel) WT/DS336/R 63

Japan-Photographic Film (Panel) WT/DS44/R 95, 108, 129

Korea-Commercial Vessels (Panel) WT/DS273/R 128

Korea-Dairy Safeguard (AB) WT/DS98/AB/R 93, 99, 254, 290, 291-2, 302, 303, 305, 306, 315, 316

Korea-Dairy Safeguard (Panel) WT/DS98/R 95

Korea-Government Procurement (Panel) WT/DS163/R 46, 130, 252

Korea-Polyacetal Resins (GATT) ADP/92 108

Korea-Various Measures on Beef (AB) WT/DS161/AB/R 93, 152

Mexico-High-Fructose Corn Syrup (AB) WT/DS132/AB/RW 93, 100 Mexico-Rice AD Measures (AB) WT/DS295/AB/R 127 Mexico-Soft Drinks (AB) WT/DS308/AB/R 89

Mexico-Telecommunications (Panel) WT/DS204/R 3, 62, 127, 129

New Zealand-Electrical Transformers from Finland (Panel) BISD 32S/55 302

Philippines-Distilled Spirit (AB) WT/DS396/AB/R; WT/DS403/AB/R 29 Philippines-Distilled Spirit (Panel) WT/DS396/R; WT/DS403/R 208, 214

Thailand-Cigarettes (Philippines) (AB) WT/DS371/AB/R 87, 148 Thailand-Steel (AB) WT/DS122/AB/R 87, 88, 93, 99, 283, 296 Turkey-Rice (Panel) WT/DS334/R 108, 208 Turkey-Textiles (AB) WT/DS34/AB/R 103, 168-9, 306, 343, 345 Turkey-Textiles (Panel) WT/DS34/R 87, 108

US-Aircraft (AB) WT/DS353/AB/R 52, 54, 63, 77, 80

US-Anti-Dumping Act of 1916 (AB) WT/DS136/AB/R; WT/DS162/AB/R 95, 96, 101, 123, 313, 327

US-Anti-Dumping Act of 1916 (Panel) WT/DS136/R 122, 328

US-Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties (China) (AB) WT/DS379/AB/R 23, 30, 45, 46, 47, 54, 60, 62, 63, 288, 311, 316, 319, 335

US-Bond (AB) WT/DS343/AB/R 156

US-Carbon Steel (AB) WT/DS213/AB/R 11, 26, 59, 71, 88, 100, 297, 298-300, 301, 326, 328

US-Carbon Steel (Panel) WT/DS213/R 24, 174

US-Clove Cigarettes (AB) WT/DS406/AB/R 29, 30, 33, 35-6, 61-2, 67, 71, 72, 74, 107, 259

US-Clove Cigarettes (Panel) WT/DS406/R 185, 215, 223

US-COOL (AB) WT/DS384/AB/R; WT/DS386/AB/R 135, 148, 175

US-COOL (Panel) WT/DS384/R; WT/DS386/R 223-4

US-Copyright Act (Panel) WT/DS160/R 31, 32, 61, 77, 166, 167

US-Corrosion-Resistant Steel Sunset Review (AB) WT/DS244/AB/R 95, 283, 295, 298, 299, 300, 308

US-Corrosion-Resistant Steel Sunset Review (Panel) WT/DS244/R 297

US-Cotton Subsidies (AB) WT/DS267/AB/R3 52, 149, 156, 157, 185, 208, 309

US-Cotton Yarn (Panel) WT/DS192/R 3, 30, 31

US-Customs User Fee (Panel) BISD 35S/245 172, 173, 201

US-Definition of Industry Concerning Wine and Grape Products (Panel) BISD 39S/436 173, 302

US-DRAMS (AB) WT/DS296/AB/R 288, 326, 327

US-EC Products (AB) WT/DS165/AB/R 74, 95

US-EC Products (Panel) WT/DS165/R 122

US-FSC (AB) WT/DS108/AB/R 84, 86, 306, 318

US-Gambling (AB) WT/DS285/AB/R 27, 31, 32, 41, 50, 52, 60, 61, 62

US-Gambling (Panel) WT/DS285/R 15, 16, 21, 22, 32, 51, 54, 60, 108, 114

US-Gasoline (AB) WT/DS2/AB/R 29, 59, 76, 254, 261, 268

US-Hormones Suspension (AB) WT/DS320/AB/R 156

US-Hot-Rolled Steel (AB) WT/DS184/AB/R 283, 294, 303, 308-9, 311, 320, 323, 324, 325, 326

US-Lamb Safeguards (AB) WT/DS177/AB/R; WT/DS178/AB/R 90, 277, 290, 291, 301, 302, 308, 316, 326

US-Lead Bars (Panel) WT/DS138/R 77

US-Line Pipe Safeguards (AB) WT/DS202/AB/R 52, 292-3, 297, 301, 303, 306, 308

US-Malt Beverages (Panel) BISD 39S/206 173, 228

US-Offset Act (AB) WT/DS217/AB/R 20, 21, 22, 60, 86, 303, 304, 309-10

US-Oil Country Tubular Goods (OCTG) from Mexico (AB) WT/DS282/AB/R 284

US-Oil Country Tubular Goods (OCTG) from Mexico (Panel) WT/DS282/R 3

US-Pork (Panel) BISD 38S/30 172, 173

US-Sardines (Panel) WT/DS231/R 3

US-Section 211 (Havana Club) (AB) WT/DS176/AB/R 78

US-Section 301 of the Trade Act 1974 (Panel) WT/DS152/R 22, 24, 25, 60, 86, 95, 120, 206, 327, 328

US-Shirts and Blouses (AB) WT/DS33/AB/R 72, 73, 74, 87, 88, 100, 166, 170

US-Shirts and Blouses (Panel) WT/DS33/R 306

US-Shrimp (AB) WT/DS58/AB/R 17, 20, 24, 29, 52, 77, 79, 83, 85, 121, 138, 164, 204, 207, 222, 313

US-Shrimp (Panel) WT/DS58/RW 46, 62, 173, 212, 214

US-Softwood Lumber (AB) WT/DS264/AB/R 288

US-Softwood Lumber (Panel) WT/DS264/R 91

US-Softwood Lumber IV (AB) WT/DS257/AB/R 26, 27, 52, 60, 64, 96, 113, 288, 294, 295, 296, 298, 318, 329

US-Stainless Steel (AB) WT/DS344/AB/R 51, 52, 72, 74, 100, 349

US-Steel Plate from India (Panel) WT/DS206/R 334

US-Steel Safeguards (AB) WT/DS248/AB/R 73, 324

US-Steel Safeguards (Panel) WT/DS248/R 174

US-Sugar Waiver (GATT) (Panel) L/6631 -37S/228.1990 167, 170, 172

US-Textiles Rules of Origin (Panel) WT/DS243/R 78, 79

US-Tuna I (Panel) GATT DS21/R - 39S/155 172

US-Tuna II (AB) WT/DS381/AB/R 30, 33, 34, 35, 36, 45, 61, 67, 107

US-Tuna II (Panel) WT/DS381/R 173

US-Underwear (Panel) WT/DS24/R 95, 173

US-Upland Cotton (AB) WT/DS267/AB/R 45

US-Zeroing (AB) WT/DS350/AB/R 11, 12, 15, 24, 25, 50, 61, 148, 151, 296, 320, 321

US-Zeroing (Panel) WT/DS294/R 28, 45, 86, 97-8, 123, 283

CONTENTS

Preface to first edition	page xi
Preface to second edition	xiii
List of abbreviations	XV
Table of WTO Cases	xvii

Introduction 1

1.

in the WTO 3
1.1 Introduction 3
1.2 Interpretation of the VCLT in the WTO generally 10
1.3 Interpretations of the VCLT 14
1.4 Conclusion 56
Annex: Analytical Index of Articles 31-3 of the Vienna Convention
on the Law of Treaties 1969: WTO, ICSID/UNCITRAL and ICJ

Interpreting principles of treaty interpretation

- Interpreting institutional aspects of the WTO Agreements 65
 - 2.1 Introduction 65

jurisprudence

2.2 The mandate for legislative interpretation of WTO Agreements: interface with the judicial interpretative function in the WTO

69

- 2.3 Approaches to interpreting the institutional aspects of the WTO under the Marrakech Agreement 82
- 2.4 Interpretation and the institutional aspects of the dispute settlement system 85
- 2.5 Interpretation and the TPRM 107
- 2.6 Conclusion 109
- The national dimension to interpretation in the framework of the WTO 111
 - 3.1 Introduction 111
 - 3.2 Theory 113

vii