

Criminal Litigation

Catherine Almond, Caroline Butler, Maura Butler,
Rebecca Coen, Tom Conlon, Vincent Deane,
Áine Flynn, Orla Keenan, Aisling Kelly, Matthew Kenny,
Professor Shane Kilcommins, Jenny McGeever,
Brian McLaughlin, Móirín Moynihan, Ronan O'Brien,
Dara Robinson, and Dr Eimear Spain
Edited by Maura Butler

4th Edition



CRIMINAL LITIGATION

Editor & Co-author
Maura Butler





Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP, United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Law Society of Ireland 2016

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First edition 2006 Second edition 2009 Third edition 2012

Impression: 2

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Public sector information reproduced under Open Government Licence v3.0 (http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/open-government-licence.htm)

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press 198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016949484

ISBN 978-0-19-967866-2

Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CRO 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

Disclaimer

While every care has been taken in the production of this book, no legal responsibility or liability is accepted, warranted, or implied by the authors, editors, publishers, or the Law Society in respect of any errors, omissions, or misstatements.

CRIMINAL LITIGATION

PREFACE

This practice-orientated textbook will prove useful to those who wish to understand how the Irish Criminal Justice System works. Its contents demonstrate the practical application of the core principles of academic law, criminology and policing studies.

Whilst primarily created to enhance the training of trainee solicitors, it will be a universally useful resource to many others to include qualified practitioners who are solicitors, barristers, judges, and police officers (Gardaí).

The objective of this book is to emulate the real-time sequential manner of the journey of an accused person, from the initial investigation of crime to the determination of that case, up to and including sentencing and any judicial reviews or appeals. The generic nature of the chapter contents includes both a prosecution and a defence perspective. Separate chapters distinguish universal principles of 'ordinary' and regulatory/white-collar crime, victims' rights, juvenile justice sentencing, appeals, and judicial reviews. Rights and obligations arising during the investigation of crime and application of evidential rules are addressed, followed by an examination of the processes that characterise the commencement of prosecutions, granting of legal aid, and stages leading to trial. Particular attention is given to the Director of Public Prosecution's choice of trial venue and to the manner in which the trial process works in both the summary and indictable jurisdiction. Discreet areas of practice are selected, such as the prohibition, defences, and penalties of the most common road traffic offences, the impact of the European Convention on Human Rights in this jurisdiction, and European arrest warrant practice and procedure. The advocacy chapter focuses on the solicitor advocate but has universal applicability for all actors in that environment. The text concludes by profiling best practice in the ethical management and governance of practitioner obligations, client care and practice management in criminal litigation work.

It is hoped that the material produced herein will demystify the practicalities of compiling and presenting a case in the criminal courts at all levels, and thereby assist comprehension in this important and specialised area of practice.

Every effort has been made to ensure that the text is accurate, but the editor would be grateful to learn of any errors or omissions. Any such comments or queries should be sent to the editor at the Law Society of Ireland.

No decision or course of action should be taken on the basis of this text and competent professional legal advice should be sought before any decision or course of action is taken.

The reader is alerted to the OUP Online Resource Centre at http://www.oxfordtextbooks.co.uk/ orc/lsim_criminal/> that supports this text in the context of the ever-changing nature of legislation and case law in this dynamic practice environment. The editor's aim is to facilitate updating of this Online Resource Centre as the need arises, with the kind cooperation of the authors.

The editor tenders grateful thanks to the commitment of all co-authors for sharing their expertise, Robert Lowney for his formatting input, Declan Bannon for his support, and especially the entire OUP team for their professionalism, advice, and support.

Maura Butler, Editor 2016

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Grateful acknowledgement is made to the publishers of copyright material which appears in this book. References to Irish and European Union case-law and legislation which has been made available in the public domain is acknowledged. In particular, extracts from domestic legislation have been reproduced, with the kind permission of The Houses of the Oireachtas, in compliance with its Licence to re-use Public Sector Information subject to Oireachtas Copyright pursuant to the European Communities (Re-Use of Public Sector Information) Regulations 2005 to 2015 (SI Nos 279 of 2005, 103 of 2008, and 525 of 2015). Wherever a version of the text of legislation occurs in this text, a disclaimer is hereby applied to the effect that it is not the official text of the Act or an official restatement of the official Journal of Proceedings of Dáil Éireann or Seanad Éireann, which is the version published in hard copy under statutory authority. The source of some legislation accessed for discussion in this text is acknowledged as the compilation of legislation by the Office of the Attorney General as reproduced in the electronic Irish Statute Book (eISB), the official versions of which remain the printed versions published by Government Publications. The Revised Acts, as consolidated by the Law Reform Commission in compliance with the Government's eLegislation strategy, are acknowledged as an invaluable resource in accessing and comprehending legislation in the fulfillment of its mission to bring all amendments and changes to an Act together in one document. In all other instances where material has been accessed by individual authors of this text, that material has been expressly acknowledged by referencing the source.

AUTHORS

Catherine Almond, LLB, qualified as a solicitor in London in 1990, joined Sheehan & Partners in 1999, and became a Partner in 2015. She has conducted criminal trials in the Circuit Court, the Central Criminal Court, and the Special Criminal Court, and has extensive experience in extradition and European arrest warrant cases. She has also brought cases to the European Court of Human Rights, most recently to Grand Chamber level. Catherine is currently a member of the Legal Experts Advisory Panel (LEAP) based in London and Brussels, the European Criminal Bar Association, the Law Society of Ireland, and the Dublin Solicitors Bar Association.

Caroline Butler, BA Hons, solicitor, is the principal of a Dublin-based practice established in 2000 which specialises in criminal litigation, particularly—but not exclusively—in the areas of High Court bail, extradition, judicial review, and *habeas corpus*.

Maura Butler, BA (Legal Science), LLB, MSc IT Education, Dip Applied European Law, Pg Dip Criminological Studies, and Dip Teaching Trial Advocacy Skills, qualified as a solicitor in 1985. Having worked as a criminal defence advocate and academic, since 1999 Maura has been a course manager in the Education Department, Law Society of Ireland, delivering trainee solicitor training in criminal litigation, criminal advocacy, corporate crime, and legal practice Irish, and is the editor of this textbook. Maura has been Chairperson of The Association for Criminal Justice, Research and Development (http://www.acjrd.ie) since 2007.

Rebecca Coen, BCL, LLM (Criminal Justice), BL, is the author of *Garda Powers: Law and Practice* (Clarus Press, 2014). A senior prosecutor at the Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions, she deals with cases at every level of the criminal process but is primarily focused on the prosecution of indictable offences.

Tom Conlon, LLB, Dip Fin Serv Law, solicitor, is a former defence solicitor and prosecution solicitor and has been with the Director of Public Prosecutions since 2003, specialising in drink driving cases, *habeas corpus*, and judicial review. He is also admitted as a solicitor in Northern Ireland.

Vincent Deane, BComm, LLB, is the principal of his own legal practice in County Mayo. He is the state solicitor for County Mayo. Vincent was formerly a senior prosecution solicitor with the Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions.

Áine Flynn, LLB, MLitt Criminology, is a partner in KOD Lyons Solicitors, practising human rights and criminal law. She has taught in the Law Society of Ireland, Trinity College, and UCD, and is a member of the Law Society Human Rights Committee. She has been a legal representative on the panels of the Mental Health Tribunal and the Mental Health (Criminal Law) Review Board since 2006.

Orla Keenan, BA, TCD (TSM) (Hons), LLB, qualified as a solicitor in 2010 and works in the Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions.

Aisling Kelly, LLB, MA, is a practising barrister who specialises in criminal law. She previously worked as a solicitor with the Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions, the United Nations, and in private practice as a solicitor.

Matthew Kenny, BA, is the principal of his own firm and was previously (from 2003) a partner in Sheehan & Partners Solicitors until December 2015. Matthew was awarded the Public Interest Law Association Gold Medal for his public law work in 2013 and is on their High Level Expert Working Group of The Irish Council of Civil Liberties on providing legal advice in a Garda Station.

Professor Shane Kilcommins is a graduate of UL (BA in Law and European Studies, 1994) the University of Wales, Aberystwyth (PhD 1999), and UCC (MA in Teaching and Learning, 2007). He joined the Law School, University of Limerick in 2014 after lecturing in UCC for 13 years. He lectures in evidence law, criminal law, jurisprudence, penology, and criminology. He was a Visiting Fulbright Scholar at Temple Law School in 2008/2009. He has co-authored various funded research reports on discrimination, victims of crime, and integrative learning. He is an examiner for the Law Society of Ireland in criminal law and criminal law and criminal procedure, and has acted as an external examiner for Trinity College, UCD, DCU, DIT, and the IPA.

Jenny McGeever, BA, DIP ED, qualified as a solicitor in 1994 and has since worked full time in criminal defence work. She specialises in criminal defence work and human rights law.

Brian McLaughlin, LLB (QUB), LLM International Human Rights Law (NUI), MA Criminology (DIT), BL (Inn of Court of Northern Ireland, Kings Inns), is a principal prosecutor in the Office of the Director of Prosecutions and has substantial experience of prosecuting serious and complex criminal cases. Brian practised at the Northern Ireland Bar primarily in the fields of criminal and public law. He worked as a prosecutor in the Public Prosecution Service for Northern Ireland before joining the Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions. Brian has extensive experience in training and lecturing in law and has worked as a legal adviser to the Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission and in the delivery of international humanitarian projects.

Móirín Moynihan, BEd, MSc, qualified as solicitor in 1993. She has over 20 years' experience as a criminal law practitioner with expertise in juvenile justice and human rights.

Ronan O'Brien, BCL, HDipIT, MA, has been working exclusively in the area of criminal law since 1999. He worked with the defence firm Sheehan & Partners until 2002 and, since then, has been working in the Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions where he is currently the deputy head of the District Court Section.

Dara Robinson, LLB, qualified as a solicitor in London in 1988, and joined Sheehan & Partners in 1992, becoming a partner in 1998, and his practice covers the entire spectrum of criminal defence work. He holds a Diploma in Anti-Money Laundering from the ICA/University of Manchester Business School. He is a member of the Society's Criminal Law Committee and is Vice-Chair of the Society's Regulation of Practice Committee and a member of the Money Laundering Reporting Committee. He is a member of European Criminal Bar Association and the (UK) Association of Regulatory and Disciplinary Lawyers, as well as being a member of the LEAP Advisory Board established by the London-based Fair Trials International to provide a Europewide network of criminal lawyers.

Dr Eimear Spain is a Senior Lecturer the School of Law, University of Limerick. She has published numerous books, book chapters, and articles in the areas of health, criminal, constitutional, and administrative law both nationally and internationally, including a monograph entitled *The Role of Emotions in Criminal Law Defences; Duress, Necessity and Lesser Evils* (2011) with Cambridge University Press. Eimear is a founding member and co-director of the Centre for the Understanding of Emotions in Society in the University of Limerick. Eimear has worked with stakeholders including Cosc, the National Office for the Prevention of Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based Violence, the Department of Justice, An Garda Síochána, the Irish Prison Service, and the Inspector of Prisons.

INTRODUCING THE ONLINE RESOURCE CENTRE



Online Resource Centres are developed to provide students and lecturers with ready-to-use learning and teaching resources. They are free-of-charge, designed to complement the textbook and offer additional materials that are suited to electronic delivery.

The Online Resource Centre to accompany *Criminal Litigation* can be found at: **www.oxford-textbooks.co.uk/orc/lsim_criminal/** and aims to feature updates written by the authors or the editor on areas where the law has changed since the book was published, or between submission of the manuscript and publication of the book.

TABLE OF CASES

A v United Kingdom (1999) 27 EHRR 611 53 A, B & C v Ireland (2011) 53 EHRR 13 285	Brogan v United Kingdom (1989) 11 EHRR 117289
AG v Briant [1846] 15 MW 169 186	Bromley v R (1986) 161 CLR 315 48
AG v Byrne [1974] IR 1 196	Brozicek v Italy (1989) 12 EHRR 371 295
AG v Casey (No. 2) [1963] IR 33 112	Burke v DPP [2007] 2 ILRM 371 143
AG v Cummins [1972] IR 312 68	Butenas v Governor of Cloverhill Prison [2008]
AG v Fennell (No. 1) [1940] IR 445 188	4 IR 189 311
AG v Gilliland [1985] IR 643 143	Butkevicius v Lithuania (Application No.
AG v O'Brien [1965] IR 142 64, 171, 172, 187 AG v O'Callaghan [1966] IR 501 128–30,	48297/99, 26 March 2002) 294 Bykov v Russia (Application No.
132, 137, 147	4378/02) 291
AG v O'Sullivan [1930] IR 553 44	Byrne v Conroy [1998] 2 ILRM 113 9
AG v Taylor [1986] 1 WLR 1479 182	Byrne v McDonnell [1997] 1 IR 392 208
AG (Kelly) v Kearns (1946) 80 ILTR 45 47, 48	
AG (Ruddy) v Kenny (1960) 94 ILTR 185 188	
AG's Reference (No. 2 of 1992) (1993), The Times,	Cadder v Her Majesty's Advocate [2010] UKSC
31 May 246 Al-Khawaja and Tahery v United Kingdom	43 98, 172 Cahill v Reilly [1994] 3 IR 547 150
(Application No. 26766/05, 15 December	Can v Austria (1985) 8 EHRR 14 295
2011) 298	Carmody v Minister for Justice, Equality and
Allenet de Ribemount v France (Application	Law Reform [2010] IR 653 284, 296
No. 15175/89) 294	CC v Ireland and Others [2006] IESC 33 29
Amutgan v Turkey (Application No. 5138/04	CD v DPP [2009] IESC 70 170
(Fifth Section), 3 February 2009) 98	Chahal v United Kingdom (1997) EHRR
Ananyev v Russia (Application Nos. 42525/07	413287
and 60800/08, 10 January 2012) 285	Christie and Morris v Leachinsky [1947] AC 573 66
Art 26 and the Employment Equality Bill 1996, In re [1997] 2 IR 321 29	Cimen v Turkey (Application No. 19582/02
mre [1777] 2 IN 721 27	(Second Section), 3 February
	2009) 98
B v DPP [1997] 2 ILRM 118 270	Cirpaci v Governor of Mountjoy Prison [2014]
Barker v Wingo 407 US 514 (1972) 124	IEHC 76275
Barry v Ireland [2005] ECHR 865 289	CK v DPP [2007] IESC 5 270
Bazorkina v Russia (2008) 46 EHRR 15 286	Clune v DPP and Clifford [1981] ILRM
Begley (Paul) v DPP [2013] IECCA 32 35, 38	17 203
Bendenoun v France (1998) 18 EHRR 54 293	Competition Authority v The Irish Dental
BF v DPP [2001] 1 IR 656 160 Bodaerenko v Ukraine (Application No. 27892/05	Association [2005] IEHC 361 32 Connors v DPP (unreported, 28 February 2006,
(Fifth Section), 14 May 2013) 98	High Court) 183
Bosphorus v Ireland (Application No.	Conroy v Attorney General [1965] IR
45036/98) 285	411208
Braddish (Daniel) v DPP and Mr Justice Haugh	Cormack (Stephen) and Keith Farrell v the DPP
[2001] 3 IR 127; [2002] 1 ILRM	[2008] IESC 63 124
151 170, 183, 270, 296	Coughlan v Patwell [1993] 1 IR 31 203
Brady v Environmental Protection Agency	Croissant v Germany (1993) 16 EHRR
[2007] IEHC 5829	135296
Brennan v Windle [2003] 3 IR 494 194, 195	Cumann Luthchleas Gael Teo v Judge Windle
Broderick v DPP [2006] 1 IR 629 137	[1994] 1 IR 525 120

```
D O'D v DPP and Judge Patricia Ryan
                                                  DPP v Carter [2014] IEHC 179 . . . 233
       (unreported, 17 December 2009, High
                                                  DPP v Casey (No. 2) [1963] IR 33 . . . 182
       Court) . . . 41
                                                  DPP v Casey (Raymond) & another
Damache (Ali Charaf) v DPP, Ireland and the
                                                         (unreported, 14 December 2004, Court
       Attorney General [2012] IESC 11...63,
                                                         of Criminal Appeal) . . . 185
                                                  DPP v Cash [2007] IEHC 108 . . . 54
Davydov v Ukraine (Application Nos. 17674/02
                                                  DPP v Christo (unreported, 31 January 2005,
       and 39081/02, 1 July 2010) . . . 285
                                                         Court of Criminal Appeal) . . . 112
Dayanan v Turkey (Application No. 7377/03
                                                  DPP v Clarkin (unreported, 10 February 2010,
       (Second Section), 13 October
                                                         Court of Criminal Appeal) . . . 39
       2009) . . . 98, 297
                                                  DPP v Cleary (Daniel) [2005] 2 IR 189 . . . 185
DC v DPP [2005] 4 IR 281 . . . 125
                                                  DPP v Clinton [1984] ILRM 127 . . . 262
De Búrca v Attorney General [1976] IR
                                                  DPP v Collins (unreported, 27 September 2007,
       38 . . . 335
                                                         Circuit Court) . . . 29
De Wilde Ooms and Versyp v Belgium (1979) 1
                                                  DPP v Connolly [2003] 2 IR 1 . . . 84
       EHRR 373 ... 288
                                                  DPP v Connolly (Martin) (unreported, 7 May
Dilkes v Bowman Shaw [1981] RTR 4...245
                                                         2002, Court of Criminal Appeal) . . . 183
Director of Corporate Enforcement v Brian
                                                  DPP v Cooney [1998] ILRM 321 . . . 112, 182
       Scannell of Brian Scannell & Company
                                                  DPP v Corbally [2001] 1 IR 180 . . . 143, 144,
       (20 May 2015) ... 25
                                                  DPP v Cormack [1999] 1 ILRM 398 . . . 239,
Director of Corporate Enforcement v Lauri
      Quinn (1 April 2014) . . . 25
                                                         253
Director of Corporate Enforcement v McEvoy's
                                                  DPP v Corrigan [1988] RTR 52 . . . 258
       Self Service Drapery Limited (3 February
                                                  DPP v Creed (Glen) (unreported, 31 July
      2011) . . . 25
                                                         2009) . . . 173
Director of Public Prosecutions v see DPP v
                                                  DPP v Croom Carroll (Tate) [1999] 4 IR
Donnelly v Ireland [1998] 1 IR 321 . . . 40
                                                         126 . . . 258
Donnelly v Judges of Dublin Metropolitan
                                                  DPP v Cunningham (unreported, 27 May 2007,
      District Court [2015] IEHC 125 . . . 292,
                                                         Court of Criminal Appeal) . . . 86
      294
                                                  DPP v D [2009] IEHC 132 . . . 270
Donoghue (Patrick) v DPP [2014] IESC
                                                  DPP v D'Arcy (unreported, 23 July 1997, Court
      56 . . . 126, 127, 160, 271
                                                         of Criminal Appeal) . . . 84
Doorson v The Netherlands (1996) 22 EHRR
                                                  DPP v Devlin [1998] IEHC 139 . . . 255
       330 . . . 53
                                                  DPP v Diver (John) [2005] 3 IR 270 . . . 81, 86,
Doran v Reilly [2011] 1 IR 544 . . . 190
DPP v Balfe [1998] 4 IR 50 . . . 187
                                                  DPP v Doherty (unreported, 26 February
DPP v Bell [1992] RTR 335 . . . 246
                                                         1993) . . . 130
DPP v Binead and Donohue (unreported, 28
                                                  DPP v Doyle (Gary) [1994] 2 IR 286; [1994]
      November 2006, Court of Criminal
                                                         1 ILRM 529 . . . 153, 192-3, 326, 330
                                                  DPP v DR [1998] 2 IR 106 . . . 46
       Appeal) . . . 108
DPP v Birney & Others [2007] IR 337 . . . 63, 108
                                                  DPP v Duffy and Duffy Motors (unreported,
DPP v Boyce [2005] IECC 143 . . . 62
                                                         23 March 2009, Central Criminal
DPP v Boza (Kastriot) (15 April 2011, Supreme
                                                         Court) . . . 35
      Court) . . . 137
                                                  DPP v Dunne [2009] IECCA 3 . . . 277
                                                  DPP v Dwyer [2007] 2 IR 825 . . . 144
DPP v Bradley (Alan) [2000] 1 IR 420 . . . 66
                                                  DPP v EC [2006] IECCA 69 . . . 125
DPP v Brazil (unreported, 22 March 2002,
      Court of Criminal Appeal) . . . 112, 182
                                                  DPP v Edgeworth [2001] 2 IR 131 . . . 187
DPP v Brehony (Regina) (unreported, 2 March
                                                  DPP v Farrell [1978] IR 13 . . . 69
                                                  DPP v Farrell (Michael) [2010] IECCA
      1993, Supreme Court) . . . 239, 254
DPP v Brophy (unreported, 2 April
                                                         68 . . . 231
      1993) . . . 130
                                                  DPP v Finnegan [2008] IEHC 347 . . . 262
DPP v Buck [2002] 2 IR 268 . . . 97
                                                  DPP v Finnerty [1999] 4 IR 364 . . . 79, 107
DPP v Buckley (Gerry) [2007] IEHC 150 . . . 197
                                                  DPP v Fitzgibbon [2014] 2 ILRM 116 . . . 224
DPP v Bullman (2009) IECCA 84 . . . 75
                                                  DPP v Flahive [1988] ILRM 133 . . . 258
DPP v Byrne [1994] 2 IR 236 . . . 270
                                                  DPP v Foley (John) [2006] IECCA 72 . . . 182
DPP v Byrne [2002] 2 ILRM 68 . . . 258
                                                  DPP v Gill [1980] 1 IR 263 . . . 12, 124, 192
DPP v Byrne (Garret) [2014] IEHC 394 . . . 74
                                                  DPP v Gillane (unreported, 14 December 1998,
DPP v C (M) (unreported, 16 June 1995,
                                                         Court of Criminal Appeal) . . . 45
      Central Criminal Court) . . . 44
                                                  DPP v Gilmore [1981] ILRM 102 . . . 254, 261
                                                  DPP v Gormley; DPP v White [2014] IESC 17;
DPP v C (W) [1994] 1 ILRM 435 . . . 211
                                                         [2014] 1 ILRM 377 . . . 70, 72, 78, 79,
DPP v Cabot (Redmond) (unreported, 20 April
                                                         83, 84, 85, 88, 89, 90, 95-8, 99, 102,
      2004, High Court) . . . 261
DPP v Cagney (Maresa) [2013] IESC 13...261
                                                         107, 108, 152, 172, 173, 297, 339, 340
```

DPP v Healy [1990] 2 IR 73 . . . 78, 84, 97

DPP v Campbell [2014] IECA 15 . . . 35

DDD - 11 (1) (DDD - O(Pl Ctti C Lin-iti
DPP v Horgan (Ian) (unreported, 27 July 2009,	DPP v O'Flynn Construction Company Limited
Court of Criminal Appeal) 187	[2007] 4 IR 500 34
DPP v Howley [1989] ILRM 629 67	DPP v O'Mahoney (Tiarnan) and Bernard Daly
DPP v Hughes [2012] IECCA 85 38	[2016] 226/15 & 230/15, Court of
DPP v JC [2015] IESC 31 64, 171, 172, 180,	Appeal 123
291, 299	DPP v O'Reilly [1990] 2 IR 415 112,
DPP v Joyce [1985] ILRM 206 260	113, 182
DPP v Joyce (Bernard) (15 July 2004, High	DPP v O'Reilly (Joseph) (6 March 2009, Court
Court) 262	of Criminal Appeal) 187
DPP v JS (unreported, 1983, Circuit	DPP v POC (unreported, 7 March 2003, Court
Court) 45	of Criminal Appeal) 184
DPP v JT (1988) 3 Frewen 141 46, 54, 125	DPP v PP [2015] IECA 152 44
DPP v Kelly [2005] 2 IR 321 229	DPP v Pringle (1981) 2 Frewen 57 185
DPP v Kenny [1990] 2 IR 110 63, 64, 65,	DPP v Quilligan [1987] ILRM 606 67
171, 187	DPP v Reddan [1995] 3 IR 560 85
	DPP v Redmond [2001] 3 IR 390 37
DPP v Lee (unreported, 2 March 1988, High	
Court) 266	DPP v Reilly and Moorehouse [2008] IEHC
DPP v Lee (unreported, 20 July 2004, Court of	419 190
Criminal Appeal) 182	DPP v Roddy [1977] IR 177 117
DPP v Lenihan (Rory) [2009] IECCA 54 230	DPP v Rooney [1993] ILRM 61 62
DPP v Lynch [2009] IECCA 31 187	DPP v Ryan [2014] 2 ILRM 98 224
DPP v McCrea (Paul) [2010] IESC 60 255	DPP v Shaw [1982] IR 1 67, 70
DPP v McGinley [1998] 2 IR 408 145, 146,	DPP v Smith (unreported, 22 November 1999,
147	Court of Criminal Appeal) 84
DPP v McGuinness [1978] IR 189 46	DPP v Smyth [2010] 3 IR 688 293
DPP v McKillen [1991] 2 IR 506 122	DPP v Spratt [1995] 1 IR 585; [1995] 2 ILRM
DPP v McLoughlin [2009] IESC 65; [2010] 1 IR	117 81, 184, 255
590 146, 147	DPP v Stewart (Jamie) [2001] 3 IR
DPP v McNally and Breathnach [1981] 2	103 258
Frewen 43 70	DPP v Stewart (unreported, 12 January 2004,
DPP v Madden [1977] IR 336 CCA 97	Court of Criminal Appeal) 233
DPP v Maguire [1995] 2 IR 286 182	DPP v Sweeney [1996] 2 IR 313 186
DPP v Mallon (Gareth) (3 March 2011, Court	DPP v Tallant [2003] 4 IR 343 186
of Criminal Appeal) 63, 187	DPP v Tanner (Michael) (unreported, 30
DPP v Manning (unreported, 9 February 2007,	November 2006, Court of Criminal
High Court) 35	Appeal) 185
DPP v Marley [1985] ILRM 17 182	DPP v Tiernan [1988] IR 250 224
DPP v Matthews (unreported, 14 July 2006,	DPP v Tuite (Gerard Anthony) (2 May
Court of Criminal Appeal) 108	1983, Court of Criminal
DPP v MJM (unreported, 28 July 1995, Court	Appeal) 196
of Criminal Appeal) 48	DPP v Vickers [2009] IESC 58 146, 147
DPP v Molloy (unreported, 1 June 1995,	DPP v Watkins [1989] 1 All ER 1126 258
Supreme Court) 239, 253	DPP v Whelan (Francis) (unreported, 2
DPP v Molloy (unreported, 28 July 1995, Court	February 2009, High Court) 185
of Criminal Appeal) 45	DPP v White see DPP v Gormley
DPP v Mooney [1993] ILRM 214 254	DPP v Wilson (Keith) (25 February 2011,
DPP v Mulvey (David) [2014] IESC 18 146	Supreme Court) 134
DPP v Murphy (Angela) [1999] 1 IR 98192	DPP v XY (unreported, 15 November 2010,
DPP v Murphy (Michael) [2005] 4 IR	Central Criminal Court) 42
504 86, 184	DPP v Yamanoha [1994] 1 IR 565 186
DPP v Murphy (Philip) (unreported, 12 July	DPP v Z [2014] IECCA 13; [2014] 2 ILRM
2001, Court of Criminal Appeal) 184	132 224, 230
DPP v Murray (Paul) [2012] IECCA 60 35	DPP (Garda Padraig Lynn) v Ivan O'Kelly
DPP v MW (unreported, 1983, Circuit	(unreported, 10 February 1998, High
Court) 45	Court) 82
DPP v O'Brien [2005] 2 IR 206 97, 173	DPP (Lenihan) v McGuire [1996] 3 IR
DPP v O'Connell [1995] 1 IR 244 84	586 81
DPP v O'Connor (unreported, 9 March 1999,	DPP (Stratford) v Fagan [1994] 3 IR 265;
Supreme Court) 262	[1994] 2 ILRM 349 61, 254
DPP v O'Donoghue [2007] 2 IR 336 43	DPP (Walsh) v Cash [2007] IEHC 108291
DPP v O'Driscoll (James) (19 July 1999, Court	Dudgeon v United Kingdom (1982) 4 EHRR
of Criminal Appeal) 184	149 284
DPP v O'Driscoll (Philip) (unreported, 1 July	Dunne v DPP [2002] 2 IR 25; [2002] 2 ILRM

2010, Supreme Court) . . . 186

242 . . . 170, 183

xxvi TABLE OF CASES

- Dunne v Governor of Cloverhill Prison [2009] IESC 11 . . . 217
- Dunnes Stores Ireland Co v Ryan [2002] 2 IR 60...32
- Engel v Netherlands (1979) 1 EHRR 647 . . . 293
- English v DPP [2009] IEHC 27 . . . 170
- Entick v Carrington [1765] 2 Wils 275 . . . 62 Environmental Protection Agency v Swalcliffe Limited [2004] IEHC 190 . . . 29
- Eviston v DPP (unreported, 31 July 2002) . . . 50
- Finucane v McMahon [1990] ILRM 505 . . . 9
 Fitt v United Kingdom (2000) EHRR 1 . . . 295
 Fox, Campbell and Hartley v United Kingdom
 (1991) EHRR 157 . . . 287, 289
- G v DPP [1994] 1 IR 374...270 G v DPP [2014] IEHC 33...220
- Galvin (Damien) v Governor of Cloverhill Prison and the DPP [2013] IEHC 11...146
- Geaney (John) v Judge Connellan (8 December 1999, High Court) . . . 196
- Gibbons v Governor of Wheatfield Prison [2008] IEHC 206...285
- Gilligan v The Special Criminal Courts and Others [2005] IESC 86 . . . 236
- Gormley and White see DPP v Gormley
- H v DPP [2006] IESC 55; [2006] 3 IR 575 . . . 126, 270
- Haughey, Re [1971] IR 217 . . . 208
- Heaney v Ireland [1994] 3 IR 593 . . . 107
- Heaney (Stephen) v Judge Brady and the DPP (3 November 2009, High Court) . . . 192
- Heaney and McGuinness v Ireland [2000] ECHR 684 . . . 106, 292
- Hiro Bilani v Spain (1995) 19 EHRR 566 . . . 290
- Hobbs v Hurley (unreported, 10 June 1980, High Court) . . . 254, 258
- Hollington v Hewthorn [1943] KB 587 . . . 167 Howard v District Judge Early and DPP
 - (unreported, 4 July 2000, Supreme Court) . . . 229
- IA v France (Application No. 28213/95, 23 September 1998) . . . 287 Ilaşcu v Moldova and Russia (2005) 40 EHRR

1040 . . . 286

- Jespers v Belgium (1981) 27 DR 61 . . . 295 Jingguo Li v Governor of Wheatfield Prison [2011] IEHC 353 . . . 138
- Joyce (David) v Judge Patrick Brady and the DPP [2011] IESC 36 . . . 150, 151, 270

- JST and President of the Circuit Court and the DPP (Supreme Court Appeal No. 662014, 10 March 2015) . . . 126
- K v His Honour Judge Carroll Moran (unreported, 5 February 2010) . . . 125
- Kafkaris v Cyprus (2008) 49 EHRR 877 . . . 288 Kavanagh v Delaney and others [2008] IESC 1 . . . 27
- Keegan (Andrew) and Garda Síochána Ombudsman Commission [2012] IEHC 356...119
- Kennealy v DPP (unreported, 18 May 2010, High Court) . . . 183
- Kennedy v DPP [2011] IEHC 311; [2012] 3 IR 744...290
- Kennedy v The Law Society of Ireland [2002] 2 IR 458 . . . 180
- Kenny v Judge Coughlan [2014] IESC 15...290
- Kentford Securities Ltd, Re; DCE v McCann [2010] IESC 59 . . . 39
- Keogh v DPP [2009] IEHC 502 . . . 170
- King v Attorney General [1981] IR 233 . . . 234
- KU v Finland (2008) 48 EHRR 1237 . . . 53
- Kyprianou v Cyprus (Application No. 73797/01) . . . 292
- Laura Kelly case (2010) Irish Examiner, 30 March . . . 45
- Lavery v Member in Charge of Carrickmacross Garda Station [1999] 2 IR 390 . . . 79, 172, 297
- Law Society v Competition Authority (unreported, 21 December 2005, High Court) . . . 296
- Lawlor v Hogan [1993] ILRM 606 . . . 194 Lynch (Wayne) v District Judge Fitzpatrick (unreported, 31 January 2007, High Court) . . . 185
- Lyons v Cooney [1978] IR 41 . . . 243, 244
- McArdle v Governor of Cloverhill Prison [2005] 4 IR 249 . . . 312
- McCabe (Damien) v Governor of Mountjoy Prison & Ors [2014] IEHC 309 . . . 233
- McCabe (Damien) v Ireland and the Attorney General [2014] IEHC 435 234
- McCann v Judges of Monaghan District Court [2010] ILRM 17 . . . 299
- McCarrick v Leavy [1964] IR 225 . . . 68
- McCormack (Kevin) v Judge of the Circuit Court & DPP (unreported, 17 April 2007, High Court) . . . 184
- McDonagh v Governor of Cloverhill Prison [2005] 1 IR 394 . . . 132, 136, 275
- McFarlane (Brendan) v DPP and the Members of the Special Criminal Court [2008] IESC 7...124
- McFarlane v DPP [2007] 1 IR 134 . . . 125

McFarlane v Ireland (2011) 52 EHRR 20 . . . 125, 290 McKeon v DPP (unreported, 12 October 1995, Supreme Court) . . . 145, 146, 147 McKeown v DPP (unreported, 9 April 2003, Supreme Court) . . . 183 McNulty (Fergal) v DPP & His Honour Judge White (unreported, 18 February 2009, Supreme Court) . . . 187 McNulty v Ireland and the Attorney General [2015] IESC 357 . . . 294 Maguire v DPP [2004] 3 IR 241 . . . 132 Mallon v Minister for Agriculture [1996] 1 IR 517 . . . 203 Manson (Sterling) v Judge O'Donnell, DPP and MBRS (27 January 2000, High Court) . . . 196 Mapp v Gilhooley [1991] IR 253 . . . 44 Marks v Beyfus [1890] 25 QBD 494 . . . 186 Mattocia v Italy (2000) 36 EHRR 825 . . . 295 MC v Bulgaria (Application No. 39272/98, 4 December 2003) . . . 53 Melling v O'Mathghamhna [1962] IR 1 . . . 30, 208 Miller v Minister for Pensions [1947] 2 All ER 372 . . . 196 Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform v see MJELR v Minister for Justice and Equality v see MJE v Minister for Justice and Law Reform v see MJLR v Minister for Justice v see MJ v Miranda v State of Arizona 384 US 436 $(1966) \dots 98$ MJ v Corrigan [2007] 2 IR 448 . . . 300 MJE v Connolly [2012] IEHC 575 . . . 316 MJE v Holden [2013] IEHC 62 . . . 300 MJE v Jociene [2013] IEHC 290 . . . 312 MJE v Lipinski [2015] (unreported) . . . 316 MJE v MV [2015] IEHC 524 . . . 303 MJE v Nolan [2013] IESC 54 . . . 300 MJE v Palonka [2015] IECA 69 . . . 316 MJE v Rostas [2014] EHC 391 . . . 300, 313 MJE v Savachenko [2015] (unreported, High Court) . . . 313 MJE v TE [2013] IEHC 323 . . . 300, 314 MJELR v Aamond [2006] IEHC 382 . . . 310 MJELR v Alteravicius [2006] 3 IR 148 . . . 302 MJELR v Bailey [2012] IESC 16 . . . 312, 316 MJELR v Gheorghe [2009] IESC 76 . . . 300 MJELR v Gorman [2010] IEHC 210 . . . 314 MJELR v Gotzlik [2009] 3 IR 390 . . . 312 MJELR v Iordache [2008] IEHC 186 . . . 313 MJELR v McG (C) [2007] IEHC 47 . . . 310 MJELR v McGuigan [2013] IEHC 216 . . . 300, MJELR v O'Falluin [2010] IESC 37 . . . 310 MJELR v Olsson [2011] IESC 1 . . . 312 MJELR v Rettinger [2010] IESC 45 . . . 299, 314 MJELR v Stapleton [2006] 3 IR 26 . . . 300 MJELR v Stapleton [2008] 1 IR 669 . . . 313 MJLR v ES [2014] IEHC 376 . . . 314 MJLR v JAT [2014] IEHC 320 . . . 314

MN v SM [2005] 4 IR 461 . . . 48

- Moore (Edward) and others v DPP and the
 Attorney General [2013 No. 54 JR];
 [2013 No. 70 JR]; [2013 No. 120 JR];
 [2013 No. 925 JR]; [2013 No. 86
 JR] . . . 233, 234

 MS v DPP, Ireland and the Attorney General
 (22 December 2015, Court of
 Appeal) . . . 190

 Mulligan v Governor of Portlaoise Prison
 [2010] IEHC 269 . . . 285

 Mullins (Patrick) v DPP (unreported,
 23 February 2004, High Court) . . . 122

 Murphy v DPP [1989] ILRM 71 . . . 170

 Murray (John) v United Kingdom (1996) 22
 EHRR 29 . . . 292
- Nascimento v Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform, Ireland and the Attorney General [2011] 1 IR 1 . . . 288

 National Irish Bank, Re [1999] 3 IR 145 . . . 28, 292

 Natunen v Finland (Application No. 21022/04, 31 March 2009) . . . 296

 Neumister v Austria [1968] ECHR 1 . . . 287, 296
- Oates (Michael) v Judge Browne and the DPP (11 November 2010 High Court) . . . 197 O'Brien v DPP [2014] IESC 39 . . . 292, 294 O'Brien (Jason) v District Judge Coughlan and the DPP [2011] IEHC 330 . . . 195 Ocalan v Turkey (2005) 41 EHRR 45 . . . 295 O'Callaghan v DPP (unreported, 20 May 2004, High Court) ... 183 O'Halloran and Francis v United Kingdom (2008) 46 EHRR 21 . . . 292 O'Hara v United Kingdom [2001] ECHR 598 . . . 287 Orchowski v Poland (Application No. 47095/99, 15 July 2002) . . . 285 O'Regan (Paul) v DPP [1999] 7 JIC 2005; [2000] 2 ILRM 68 . . . 196 Osman v United Kingdom [1998] EHRR 101 . . . 53 O'Sullivan v Hamill [1999] 3 IR 9 . . . 45 O'Sullivan, Herlihy & Moore v DPP [2007] IEHC 137 ... 170
- Panovits v Cyprus (Application No. 4268/04
 (First Section), 11 December
 2008)...98, 297
 PB v DPP [2013] IEHC 401...125
 PC v DPP [1999] 2 IR 25...125
 People v Crosbie and Others [1966] IR
 426...129
 People v Quinlan [1962] ILT & SJ 123...247
 People v Walsh [1980] IR 294...66
 People (AG) v Defendant see AG v Defendant
 People (DPP) v Defendant see DPP v Defendant
 Pichugin v Russia (Application No. 38623/03,

23 October 2012) . . . 289

Oztiirk v Germany (1984) 6 EHRR 409 . . . 293

xxviii TABLE OF CASES

PJ Carey Contractors Limited v DPP [2012] IR Sharlott (Anthony) v Judge Collins & Ors and 234 . . . 27 the DPP (Notice Party) [2010] IEHC PM v Malone [2002] IESC 46 . . . 270 482 . . . 233 PT v DPP [2007] IESC 39 . . . 126 Shelley-Morris v Bus Átha Cliath [2003] 1 IR 232 . . . 30 Sikorski v Poland (Application No. 17599/05, Quilligan v Kilrane & Anor [2014] IEHC 22 July 2009) . . . 285 116 . . . 195 Simple Imports Ltd v The Revenue Quinn v Ireland (2001) 33 EHRR 344 . . . 292 Commissioners [2000] 2 IR 243 . . . 187 Smith (Patrick) v DPP [2015] Appeal No. 2015/37 . . . 127 R v Boswell [1984] RTR 315 . . . 249 Sparrow v Minister for Agriculture, Food and R v Brasier (1779) 1 Leach 199 . . . 44 Fisheries [2010] IESC 6 . . . 126 R v Buisson [1990] 2 NZLR 542 . . . 186 Stafford v United Kingdom (2002) 35 EHRR R v City of Sault Sainte Marine [1978] 85 DLR 1121 . . . 288 Stanbridge v Healy [1985] ILRM 290 . . . 239, 253 161 . . . 29 R v Cook (1918) 34 TLR 515 . . . 69 State v Purcell [1926] IR 207 . . . 129 R v Galbraith [1981] 2 All ER 1060 . . . 197 State (Duggan) v Evans (1978) 112 ILTR R v Hayes [1977] 2 All ER 288 . . . 44 61 . . . 122 R v Hill (1851) 2 Den 254 . . . 45 State (Healy) v Donoghue [1976] IR R v Horncastle and Others [2009] UKSC 325 . . . 79, 96, 150, 151, 269, 270 14 . . . 298 State (Higgins) v Farrell [2009] 4 IR 189 . . . 75 R v Lapworth [1931] 1 KB 117 . . . 46 State (Littlejohn) v Governor of Mountjoy R v Silva [2006] 4 All ER 900 . . . 186 Prison (unreported, 18 March 1976, R v Spurge [1961] 2 QB 205 . . . 246 Supreme Court) . . . 206 R v Strong [1995] Crim LR 428 . . . 247 State (McCormack) v Curran [1987] ILRM R v Voisin [1918] 1 KB 531 . . . 68 225 . . . 50 Registrar of Companies v District Judge David State (McEvitt) v Delap [1981] IR 125 . . . 208 State (O'Connell) v Fawsitt and DPP [1986] IR Anderson and System Partners Limited [2005] 1 IR 21 . . . 38 362 . . . 124 State (O'Hagan) v Delap [1982] IR 213 . . . 208 Rex v Coyle [1926] NI 208 . . . 48 Reynolds v Roche [1972] RTR 282 . . . 249 State (Quinn) v Ryan [1965] IR 70 . . . 302 Ribitsch v Austria (1996) 21 EHRR 573 . . . 285 State (Royle) v Kelly [1974] IR 259 . . . 275 Richards v MIB (unreported, 12 June 1996, Stirling (John) v District Judge Collins & DPP Supreme Court) . . . 239, 253 (unreported, 25 February 2010, High Richardson v Governor of Mountjoy Prison Court) . . . 182 [1980] ILRM 82 . . . 275 Strock v Germany (2006) 43 EHRR 96 . . . 286 Rock v Ireland [1997] 3 IR 484 . . . 107 Sweeney v Governor of Loughan House Open Ronan v District Judge John Coughlan [2005] Prison [2014] IESC 42 . . . 275 4 IR 274 . . . 135 Rowe and Davis v United Kingdom (2000) 30 EHRR 1 . . . 295 Tarasov v Ukraine (Application No. 17416/03 Ruiz Torija v Spain (1995) 19 EHRR 553 . . . 290 (Fifth Section), 31 October 2013) . . . 98 Ryan v DPP [1989] IR 399 . . . 130 Telfner v Austria (2002) 34 EHRR 207 . . . 294 Ryan (Edward) v Governor of Midlands Prison Testa v Croatia (Application No. 20877/04, 12 July 2007) ... 285 [2014] IESC 54 . . . 271, 275 TH v DPP [2006] 3 IR 520 . . . 289 Tralee Beef and Lamb Ltd (In Liquidation), Re; Salabiaku v France (1988) 13 EHRR 379 . . . 29, Kavanagh v Delaney & Ors [2008] IESC 1 . . . 39 Salduz v Turkey (2009) 49 EHRR 19; [2008] Trimbole v Governor of Mountjoy Prison ECHR 1542 . . . 97, 172, 297 [1985] ILRM 465 ... 9 Saunders v United Kingdom (1997) 23 EHRR Trymback v Ukraine (Application No. 44385/02 313 . . . 28, 98, 292 (Fifth Section), 12 January 2012) ... 98 Savage v DPP [2008] IESC 39 . . . 183 Schenk v Switzerland (1991) 13 EHRR 242 . . . 291 Vasileva v Denmark (2005) EHRR 681 . . . 286 Scoppola v Italy (No .2) (Application No. Vrabec and Others v Slovakia (Application No. 10249/03) . . . 298 31312/08) . . . 290 Scully v DPP [2005] 1 IR 242 . . . 183 SH v DPP [2006] 2 IR 575 . . . 125 Shannon Regional Fisheries Board v Walsh v Byrne [2015] IEHC 414 . . . 48

Weir (Mary) v DPP (unreported, 29 July

2008) . . . 259

Cavan County Council [1996] 3 IR

267 . . . 29

TABLE OF CASES xxix

Whelan (Francis) v Judge McMahon & DPP
(2 February 2009) . . . 174
Whelan and Lynch v Minister for Justice [2012]
1 IR 27 . . . 288, 289
White v Ireland [1995] 1 IR 268 . . . 40
Wilson v McPhail [1991] SCCR 170 . . . 246
Wynne v United Kingdom (1995) 19 EHRR
333 . . . 288

X v Austria (1963) 11 CD 31 . . . 292 X and Y v Austria [1978] 12 DR 160 . . . 295 X and Y v The Netherlands (1985) 8 EHRR 235 . . . 53, 54, 291

Y v Slovenia (Application No. 41107/10, 28 August 2015) . . . 54

Z v DPP [1994] 2 IR 476 . . . 125 Zoltukhin v Russia [2009] ECHR 252 . . . 299

TABLE OF LEGISLATION

Irish Legislation	Broadcasting Act 2009 s. 2 228
Statutes	Bunreacht na hÉireann see Constitution of Ireland
Air Pollution Act 1987 5	
Air Pollution Act 2011 5	Central Bank Act 1942
	Part IIIC (ss. 33AN–33BF) 119
Bail Act 1997 4, 128, 131, 132, 138,	s. 33AQ 39
276, 325	s. 33AR 39
s. 1 131	Child Care Act 1991 123
s. 1A133	Child Trafficking and Pornography Act
s. 1A(3) 133	1998 62
s. 1A(4) 133	s. 3(1) 42
s. 1A(5)(c) 133	s. 3(2) 42
s. 1A(11) 133	
	s. 3(3) 42 Children Act 2001 4 127 156 158 159
s. 1A(12) 133	Children Act 2001 4, 127, 156, 158, 159,
s. 1A(13) 133	160, 163, 169, 175, 206, 228, 333
s. 2 131–2, 133, 136, 139,	s. 3(1) 206
147, 148	Pt. 4 (ss. 17–51) 158
s. 2(1) 131	s. 18219
s. 2(2A) 148	s. 19158
s. 2(2B) 148	s. 19(1) 158, 219
s. 2(2C) 148	s. 19(2) 158
s. 2(2D) 148	s. 23 219
s. 2(3) 131	s. 25 158
s. 2A 133, 134	s. 27 158
s. 2A(1) 133	Pt. 5 (ss. 52–54) 156
s. 2A(2) 133	s. 52 156, 206
s. 2A(3) 133	s. 52(1) 156
s. 2A(4) 133	s. 52(2) 156, 157
s. 2A(6) 133	s. 52(3) 157
s. 3 132, 139	s. 52(4) 157, 206
s. 4 132	Pt. 6 (ss. 55–70) 83, 157
s. 4(3) 132	s. 56 157
s. 5(1) 136, 137	s. 57 157
s. 6 135	s. 58 157
s. 6(1)(b) 135	s. 61 157
s. 6(2) 135	Pt. 7 (ss. 71–76) 158
s. 6(3) 135, 139	s. 71 158, 206
s. 6(4) 135	s. 71(2) 159
s. 6A 144	s. 74 159
s. 7 138	s. 75 159, 214
s. 7(1)–(2) 138	s. 75(1) 159, 206
s. 9 147, 276	s. 75(2) 159, 206, 219
s. 9(5) 147	s. 75(3) 159, 206, 219
s. 10 148	s. 75(4) 206
Bankers' Books Evidence Acts	s. 75(5) 206, 219
1879–1959 169	s. 75(6) 219
Bankers' Books Evidence Act 1879 30	s. 75(7) 219

此为试读,需要完整PDF请访问: www.ertongbook.com