

# Economic and Social Rights after the Global Financial Crisis

EDITED BY AOIFE NOLAN



# ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS AFTER THE GLOBAL FINANCIAL CRISIS

Edited by

AOIFE NOLAN

*The University of Nottingham*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107043251](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107043251)

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Economic and social rights after the global financial crisis / edited by Aoife Nolan.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04325-1 (hardback)

1. Economic policy. 2. Basic needs—Law and legislation. 3. Human rights—Economic aspects. 4. Social rights. 5. Global Financial Crisis, 2008–2009. I. Nolan, Aoife, editor of compilation.

K3820.E26 2014

330—dc23

2014013616

ISBN 978-1-107-04325-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## FIGURES

7.1	Unemployment rates in Spain annual averages (2006–12)	<i>page</i> 211
7.2	Population at risk of poverty or social exclusion (2005–12)	212
7.3	Inequality in Spain, Portugal and the European Union (2005–12)	213
7.4	Government revenue and inequality in Europe (2010)	229
7.5	Top personal income tax rates in the EU-15 (2011)	230
7.6	Budget cuts vs tax evasion in Spain (2012)	231
9.1	GDP growth in Colombia (1995–2011)	275
9.2	Total number of <i>tutelas</i> filed (1992–2001)	276
9.3	Total <i>tutelas</i> and health <i>tutelas</i> (1999–2011)	289

## CONTRIBUTORS

RADHIKA BALAKRISHNAN is Executive Director of the Center for Women's Global Leadership, and Professor, Women's and Gender Studies at Rutgers University. She has a PhD in Economics from Rutgers University. Previously, she was Professor of Economics and International Studies at Marymount Manhattan College. She has worked at the Ford Foundation as a programme officer in the Asia Regional Programme. She is on the Board of the Center for Constitutional Rights and the International Association for Feminist Economics. She is the co-editor with Diane Elson of *Economic Policy and Human Rights: Holding Governments to Account* (2011). She edited *The Hidden Assembly Line: Gender Dynamics of Subcontracted Work in a Global Economy* (2001), co-edited *Good Sex: Feminist Perspectives from the World's Religions*, with Patricia Jung and Mary Hunt (2000), and also authored numerous articles that have appeared in books and journals.

CHRISTIAN COURTIS is a human rights officer with the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, where he coordinates the working team on economic, social and cultural rights. He is a law professor at the University of Buenos Aires Law School (Argentina) and invited professor at ITAM Law School (Mexico). He has been a visiting professor and researcher at various universities in Europe, Latin America and the United States. He has served as a consultant for the World/Panamerican Health Organization, UNESCO, the UN Department for Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), the Economic and Social Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) and the Inter-American Institute for Human Rights. He was previously the coordinator of the Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Project of the International Commission of Jurists (Geneva). He has written various books and articles (many of them published in Mexico) on human rights, constitutional theory and legal theory and sociology. He is author of the ground-breaking *Courts and the*

*Legal Enforcement of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Comparative Experiences of Justiciability* (2008).

OLIVIER DE SCHUTTER is a professor at the Catholic University of Louvain and at the College of Europe (Natolin). From 2008–14, he was the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the right to food. He is also a member of the Global Law School Faculty at New York University and is a visiting professor at Columbia University. In 2002–6, he chaired the EU Network of Independent Experts on Fundamental Rights, a high-level group of experts which advised the European Union institutions on fundamental rights issues. He has acted on a number of occasions as an expert for the Council of Europe and for the European Union. From 2004, and until his appointment as the UN Special Rapporteur on the right to food, he was the General Secretary of the International Federation of Human Rights (FIDH) on the issue of globalisation and human rights.

JAMES HEINTZ is Research Professor at the Political Economy Research Institute of the University of Massachusetts, Amherst. He has collaborated with numerous UN agencies, including the United Nations Development Program, the International Labour Organization, the UN Research Institute for Social Development, the UN Economic Commission for Africa, and UN Women. He has published in the areas of employment and labour markets, macroeconomic alternatives, the distributive effects of monetary policy, and development strategies in sub-Saharan African countries.

HELEN HERSHKOFF is the Herbert M. and Svetlana Wachtell Professor of Constitutional Law and Civil Liberties at New York University School of Law, where she co-directs the Arthur Garfield Hays Civil Liberties Program. She joined the NYU faculty in 1995, after having practiced law in New York for almost 20 years, first at a private law firm, then at The Legal Aid Society of New York, and finally at the American Civil Liberties Union. She is the author of numerous articles about socio-economic rights that are published in journals that include the Harvard, Stanford and New York University law reviews, and is a co-author of several books involving United States civil procedure. She is a graduate of Harvard College and Harvard Law School, and studied Modern History at St Anne's College, Oxford University, as a Marshall Scholar.

DAVID LANDAU is Associate Dean for International Programs and Assistant Professor of Law at The Florida State University College of Law. He holds an AB and JD from Harvard University, and is currently completing his

PhD in Government there. His main research interests are in comparative constitutional law and politics, with a particular focus on Latin America. He has recently done work on the enforcement of social rights and on constitution-making processes, and is completing a book (with Manuel José Cepeda) containing translations and commentary on major decisions of the Colombian Constitutional Court. He has also served as a consultant on constitutional issues for the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Honduras. His work has appeared in the *Harvard International Law Journal* and the *Alabama Law Review*, among other fora.

STEPHEN LOFFREDO is Professor of Law and Director of the Economic Justice Project at the City University of New York School of Law. After graduating from Harvard Law School and clerking for the New Jersey Supreme Court, he entered practice in 1982 as a staff attorney with The Legal Aid Society in the South Bronx, where he provided neighbourhood legal services and conducted law reform litigation, including actions that secured the rights of homeless families in New York to safe and adequate shelter and established the right of single, homeless shelter residents to public assistance and Medicaid. He has continued to practise poverty law through the clinical programme at CUNY and as counsel to the Urban Justice Center. He has written and spoken widely on the constitutional dimensions of economic rights and the role of wealth in a constitutional democracy, and served as consultant to the late Senator Paul Wellstone on the constitutional aspects of federal welfare legislation.

NICHOLAS J. LUSIANI is Director of the Human Rights in Economic Policy Program at the Center for Economic and Social Rights, where his work focuses on developing alternative human rights-centred economic and development policies. He received a Master's degree in International Affairs from the School of International and Public Affairs at Columbia University, where he specialised in international human rights law and macroeconomics. Niko has published extensively in the areas of human rights, economic analysis and fiscal policy, including, most recently, *Maximum Available Resources and Human Rights: Analytical Report* (2011) and 'Human Rights in the "Great Regression": Towards a Human Rights-centred Economic Policy in Times of Crisis' in Reidel *et al.*, *Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Contemporary Issues and Challenges* (2014) (co-authored).

GUSTAVO MAURINO is Founder and Co-director of Asociación Civil por la Igualdad y la Justicia (ACIJ). He holds a JD from the National

University of Córdoba and a postgraduate degree in tort law, University of Belgrano, Buenos Aires. He is a professor (undergraduate and postgraduate level) in civil law, constitutional theory and legal philosophy at the University of Palermo, Buenos Aires. He coordinates the professional practice section of the Department of Clinical Education, University of Palermo, is a visiting lecturer in the Political Science and International Studies Department of Di Tella University, and lectures in the Human Rights Master's Programme at Lanús National University. Maurino is co-author of *Las Acciones Colectivas, Análisis Conceptual, Constitucional, Procesal, Jurisprudencial y Comparado* (2006) (with Martin Sigal and Ezequiel Nino) and a book on medical malpractice, co-authored with Alfredo Kraut. He is the editor of *Los Escritos de Carlos Nino* (2007).

EZEQUIEL NINO holds a JD from Universidad de Buenos Aires and a BA in Journalism from Taller Escuela Agencia, Buenos Aires. He earned his Master of Laws (LLM) from New York University and a Masters in International Relations from the University of Pompeu Fabra and the University of Barcelona. He is the founder and co-director of Asociación Civil por la Igualdad y la Justicia (ACIJ) and teaches Constitutional Law and Professional Practice at Universidad de Palermo. He participates annually in the Seminar in Latin America on Constitutional and Political Theory (SELA) organised by Yale Law School and several Latin American universities. He has been appointed to the UNCAC (UN Convention against Corruption) Coalition Coordination Committee. He is co-author of *Las Acciones Colectivas, Análisis Conceptual, Constitucional, Procesal, Jurisprudencial y Comparado* (2006) (with Martin Sigal and Gustavo Maurino) and several articles on economic, social and cultural rights, access to information and anti-corruption issues.

AOIFE NOLAN is Professor of International Human Rights Law at Nottingham University School of Law. She has published extensively in the areas of human rights, particularly in relation to children's rights and economic and social rights, as well as on constitutional law. She is the founding coordinator of the Economic and Social Rights Academic Network, UK and Ireland (ESRAN-UKI). She has worked with and acted as an expert advisor to a wide range of international and national organisations and bodies working on human rights issues, including the Council of Europe, a range of UN Special Procedures, ESCR-Net, the Northern Ireland Bill of Rights Forum and the International NGO Coalition for an Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. Her recent books on economic and social rights include



*Children's Socio-economic Rights, Democracy & the Courts* (2011) and *Human Rights & Public Finance: Budgets and the Promotion of Economic and Social Rights* (2013) (co-edited with R. O'Connell and C. Harvey).

COLM O'CINNEIDE is a Reader in Law at University College London. He has published extensively in the field of human rights and anti-discrimination law, and is currently Vice-President of the European Committee on Social Rights of the Council of Europe. He has also acted as a specialist legal advisor to the Joint Committee on Human Rights of the UK Parliament and as UK *rapporteur* for the European Commission's network of independent legal experts on anti-discrimination law.

ANASHRI PILLAY is a Lecturer in Law at Durham University, where she teaches international law and international human rights law. She has held academic posts at Leeds University and the University of Cape Town. Anashri's research interests lie in the field of comparative constitutional law, particularly the adjudication of economic and social rights by national courts. Her publications focus on principles of judicial restraint; implementation of economic and social rights; and judicial review for unreasonableness. Anashri is a member of the Economic and Social Rights Academic Network, UK and Ireland (ESRAN-UKI), the International Association of Constitutional Law (IACL) and the African Network of Constitutional Lawyers (ANCL).

LIDIA RABINOVICH is a human rights lawyer and academic researcher. She currently serves as Head of Legal Aid Child Representation at the Israeli Ministry of Justice. She previously headed the legal division of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) office in Tel Aviv and served as a human rights officer in the Special Procedures Branch at the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) in Geneva. Prior to joining the UN, she served as State Attorney at the Israeli Ministry of Social Affairs and at the Israeli Ministry of Justice, dealing mainly with children's rights and child protection, juvenile justice and rights of persons with disabilities. She holds an LLB from the Hebrew University in Jerusalem and an LLM, magna cum laude, from Tel Aviv University. She has taught child rights and welfare law at Tel Aviv University. Areas of expertise include welfare law and international human rights law, particularly the rights of the child and economic and social rights.

RAQUEL ROLNIK is an architect and urban planner, with over 30 years' experience in planning and urban land management. She has extensive

experience in the implementation and evaluation of housing and urban policies. Based in São Paulo, she is a professor at the Faculty of Architecture and Urbanism of the University of São Paulo and is the author of several books and articles on the urban issue. In her career, she has held various government positions, including Director of the Department of Planning of the city of São Paulo (1989–92) and National Secretary for Urban Programs of the Brazilian Ministry of Cities (2003–7), as well as NGO activities (she was Urbanism Coordinator of the Polis Institute (1997–2002)). She has advised national and local governments on policy reform and institutional development as well as on planning and management of housing and local development programmes. Between May 2008 and June 2014, she held the mandate of Special Rapporteur on adequate housing, appointed by the United Nations Human Rights Council.

MAGDALENA SEPÚLVEDA CARMONA was the United Nations Special Rapporteur on extreme poverty and human rights from 2008 to 2014. She is a Visiting Fellow at the United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD). Since 2013, she has been a member of the High Level Panel of Experts on Food Security and Nutrition of the UN Committee on World Food Security (CFS). Ms Sepúlveda is a Chilean lawyer who holds a PhD in International Law from Utrecht University in the Netherlands and an LL.M in human rights law from the University of Essex in the United Kingdom. She has worked as a researcher at the Netherlands Institute for Human Rights, as a staff attorney at the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, and as the Co-Director of the Department of International Law and Human Rights of the United Nations-mandated University for Peace in San Jose, Costa Rica. She has also served as a consultant to several intergovernmental and non-governmental organisations such as the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, the Economic Commission for Latin American and the Caribbean, the Norwegian Refugee Council and the Inter-American Institute for Human Rights. More recently she was Research Director at the International Council on Human Rights Policy in Geneva and Research Fellow at the Norwegian Center for Human Rights.

MURRAY WESSON completed his LLB at the University of KwaZulu-Natal in Durban, South Africa, before studying at the University of Oxford as a Rhodes Scholar. There he completed a Bachelor of Civil Law, MPhil in Law and DPhil in Law. He is currently an associate professor at the Faculty of

Law, University of Western Australia. He was previously a lecturer at the School of Law, University of Leeds, and a visiting lecturer at the Central European University in Budapest, Hungary. His teaching and research are in the areas of constitutional and human rights law, with a particular interest in socio-economic rights.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book would not have been possible without the generous contributions of a considerable number of scholars. Huge thanks are owed to Daniel Brinks, Manuel José Cepeda, Rosalind Dixon, Alice Donald, Mary Dowell-Jones, Conor Gearty, Jessie Hohmann, Benjamin Mason Meier, Paul O'Connell, Rory O'Connell, Marius Pieterse and Sigrun Skogly. Their extensive advice and feedback contributed enormously to the quality of the book. I am also grateful to Finola O'Sullivan and Elizabeth Spicer of Cambridge University Press for their excellent advice and support throughout the process. Pei-Lun Tsai provided outstanding research assistance.

The support of colleagues at the School of Law, University of Nottingham is much appreciated. Thanks are due to the Socio-economic Rights and Administrative Justice Project, Faculty of Law, Stellenbosch University, the Children's Rights Centre, Queen's University Belfast and the Project on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at the Geneva Academy of International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights, where I spent time while working on the book. As always, I owe enormous thanks to my family and friends for their love and support, especially Kevin, Helen, Emer, Katie, Oisín, JJ and the KT Collective.

## CASES

### National Cases

#### *Argentina*

- 'Alba Quintana, Pablo c/ GCBA y otros s/ amparo (art. 14 CCABA) s/ recurso de inconstitucionalidad concedido' (12/05/2010) 319
- 'Asociación Esrlerosis Múltiple de Salta c/ Ministerio de Salud, Estado Nacional s/ amparo' (18/12/2003) 313
- ATE v. Municipalidad de Salta* (6/18/2013) 330
- 'Avico c/de la Pesa' (07/12/1934 – Fallos: 172:21) 322
- 'Badaro, Adolfo Valentín' (resoluciones de 08/08/2006 – Fallos: 329:3089 y de 26/11/2007 – Fallos: 330:4866) 329
- 'Bustos c/Estado Nacional' (26/10/2004 – Fallos: 327:4495) 326
- 'Chocobar, Sixto Celestino' (27/12/1996 – Fallos: 319:3241) 329
- 'Cine Callao' (22/06/1960 – Fallos: 247:121) 322
- 'Defensor del Pueblo de la Nación c/ Buenos Aires, Provincia de y otro (Estado nacional) s/ amparo' (08/05/2007) 313
- 'Defensor del Pueblo de la Nación c/ Estado Nacional y otra (provincia del Chaco) s/ proceso de conocimiento' (18/09/2007) 315, 332
- 'Díaz, Brígida c/ Prov. de Buenos Aires y Estado Nacional' (25/03/2003) 311
- 'Ercolano c/Lanteri de Renshaw' (28/04/1922 – Fallos: 136:170) 322
- 'GME c/ Instituto Nacional de Servicios Sociales para Jubilados y Pensionados s/ amparo' (17/12/2011) 312
- 'Guida, Liliana c/ Poder Ejecutivo Nacional' (02/06/2000 – Fallos: 323:1566) 324, 325, 330
- 'Hileret c/Provincia de Tucumán' (05/9/1903 – Fallos: 98:20) 322
- 'Inchauspe c/Junta Nac. de Carnes' (01/09/1944 – Fallos: 199:483) 322, 323
- 'Laudicina, Ángela Francisca c/ Pcia. De Buenos Aires y otro s/ amparo' (09/03/2004) 311
- 'María Flavia Judith c/ Instituto de Obra Social de la Prov. de Entre Ríos y Estado Provincial' (30/10/2007) 312
- 'Massa c/Poder Ejecutivo Nacional' (27/12/2006 – Fallos: 329:5913) 326, 327
- 'Mendoza, Beatriz Silvia y otros c/Estado Nacional' (08/07/2008) 318
- 'Mendoza, Beatriz Silvia y otros c/ Estado Nacional y otros s/ daños y perjuicios (daños derivados de la contaminación ambiental del Río Matanza-Riachuelo', 329:2316 (20/06/2006) 317–18, 321

- 'Parraga, Alfredo c/INSSJ y P (ex Pami) s/amparo' (16/05/2006) 312  
 'Peralta c/Estado Nacional' (Fallos: 313:1513) 324, 325  
 'Provincia de San Luis c/Estado Nacional' (Fallos: 326:417) 326-7  
 'Quisberth Castro, S.Y. c/ Gobierno de la Ciudad de Buenos Aires s/ amparo' (24/04/2012) 318, 319, 320, 332  
 'Quisberth Castro, S.Y. c/ Gobierno de la Ciudad de Buenos Aires s/ amparo' (12/07/2010) 319  
 'Realí Alejandro Juan Ruben c/PEN' – CNACAF – SALA IV – 07/11/2006 326  
 'Rinaldi c/Guzman Toledo' (15/03/2007 – Fallos: 330:855) 328  
 'Rodríguez, Karina Verónica c/ Estado Nacional y otros s/ acción de amparo', 329:553 (07/03/2006) 315  
 'Roger Martín Raúl c/EN-PEN' – CNACAF – SALA I – 11/09/2004 326  
 'Sánchez, María del Carmen' (17/05/2005 – Fallos: 328:2833) 329, 330  
 'Sanchez, Norma Rosa c/ Estado Nacional y otros s/ acción de amparo' (11/05/2004) 311  
 'Smith c/Poder Ejecutivo Nacional' (01/02/2002 – Fallos: 325:28) 325, 326  
 'Tobar, Leónidas c/E.N. – Mº Defensa – Contaduría General del Ejército – Ley 25.453 s/ amparo – Ley 16.986' (22/08/2002 – Fallos: 325:2059) 325, 330

### *Colombia*

- Constitutional Review Judgment, C-288 of 2012 273  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-252 of 2010 292  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-044 of 2004 272  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-776 of 2003 282, 284  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-373 of 2002 286  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-1064 of 2001 272, 281-2  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-1433 of 2000 279  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-955 of 2000 279  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-747 of 1999 278  
 Constitutional Review Judgment, C-700 of 1999 278  
 Tutela Judgment, T-291 of 2009 285, 293  
 Tutela Judgment, T-760 of 2008 290-1  
 Tutela Judgment, T-025 of 2004 285, 286-7  
 Tutela Judgment, T-153 of 1998 286  
 Tutela Judgment, T-458 of 1997 270  
 Tutela Judgment, T-426 of 1992 270, 277  
 Tutela Judgment, T-406 of 1992 272  
 Unification Judgment, SU-090 of 2000 286  
 Unification Judgment, SU-111 of 1997 278

### *Germany*

- 'Asylum Seekers Benefits', BVerfG, 1 BvL 10/10 (18 July 2012) 176  
 'Hartz IV', BVerfG, 1 BvL 1/09, 1 BvL 3/09, 1 BvL 4/09 (9 February 2010) 143, 175-6, 189, 241

BVerfGE 82, 60 (29 May 1990)	176
BverfGE 99, 246 (10 November 1988)	176
BVerfGE 45, 187 (21 June 1977)	176
BVerfGE 40, 121 (18 June 1975)	176
BVerwGE 25, 23 (31 August 1966)	176
BVerwGE 1, 159 (24 June 1954)	176
BVerfGE 1, 97 (19 December 1951)	176

### *Hungary*

Decision 43/1995 (30 June 1995)	143
---------------------------------	-----

### *Latvia*

Case no. 2009-43-01 (21 December 2009)	143, 189
----------------------------------------	----------

### *Portugal*

Judgment no. 187/2013 (5 April 2013)	15, 189, 144
Judgment no. 353/2012 (5 July 2012)	132, 189
Judgment no. 191/88 (20 September 1988)	176
Judgment no. 43/88 (25 February 1988)	176
Judgment no. 12/88 (12 January 1988)	176
Judgment no. 39/84 (11 April 1984)	176

### *South Africa*

<i>Abahlali Basemjondolo Movement SA and another v. Premier of KwaZulu-Natal and others</i> 2010 (2) BCLR 99 (CC)	346
<i>City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality v. Blue Moonlight Properties 39 (Pty) Ltd</i> 2012 (2) BCLR 150 (CC)	356-9, 361, 363, 364
<i>Government of the Republic of South Africa v. Grootboom</i> 2000 (11) BCLR 1169 (CC)	241, 243, 249, 344, 356, 357, 363
<i>Khosa and Others v. Minister of Social Development</i> 2004 (6) BCLR 569 (CC)	344, 354
<i>Mazibuko v. City of Johannesburg</i> 2010 (3) BCLR 239 (CC)	241, 295, 345, 348-52, 353, 354, 356, 362, 363
<i>Minister of Health v. Treatment Action Campaign (No. 2)</i> 2002 (10) BCLR 1033 (CC)	241, 344, 354
<i>Nokotyana and others v. Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality and Others</i> 2010 (4) BCLR 312 (CC)	345
<i>Occupiers of 51 Olivia Road, Berea Township and 197 Main Street Johannesburg v. City of Johannesburg and Others</i> 2008 (3) SA 208 (CC)	344-5, 355

- Pheko and Others v. Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality* 2012 (2) SA 598 (CC); 2012 (4) BCLR 388 (CC) 359–360, 361, 363
- Port Elizabeth Municipality v. Various Occupiers* 2005 (1) SA 217 (CC) 344
- Residents of Joe Slovo Community, Western Cape v. Thubelisha Homes and Others* 2009 (9) BCLR 847 (CC) 345, 346–8, 352, 355, 362, 363
- Schubart Park Residents Association and Others v. City of Tshwane and Others* 2012 ZACC 26 359, 360–1, 363
- Sebola and another v. Standard Bank of South Africa Ltd and another* 2012 (5) SA 142 (CC); 2012 (8) BCLR 785 (CC) 351
- Soobramoney v. Minister of Health (KwaZulu-Natal)* 1997 (12) BCLR 1696 (CC) 344

### Spain

- Constitutional Tribunal of Spain, ‘Conflicto positivo de competencia n.º 4540–2012, contra el Decreto 114/2012, de 26 de junio, sobre régimen de las prestaciones sanitarias del sistema Nacional de Salud en el ámbito de la Comunidad Autónoma de Euskadi y, concretamente, contra los artículos 1; 2, apartados 2 y 3; 3; 4; 5; 6, apartados 1 y 2; 7, apartados 2 y 3; 8, apartados 1 y 2, y disposición final primera’ (3 December 2012) 223

### United Kingdom

- Burnip v. Birmingham City Council* [2012] EWCA Civ 629 190
- R (KM) v. Cambridgeshire County Council* [2012] UKSC 23 177, 190
- R (L) v. Leeds City Council* [2010] EWHC 3324 (Admin) 177
- R (on the application of Rodgers) v. Swindon Primary Care Trust* [2006] EWCA Civ 392 177
- R v. Secretary of State for Social Security, ex parte Joint Council for the Welfare of Immigrants* [1997] 1 WLR 275 177

### United States (Federal)

- Bruns v. Mayhew*, 931 F Supp 2d 260 (D Maine 2013) 252
- Califano v. Westcott*, 443 US 76 (1979) 258
- City of Boerne v. Flores*, 521 US 507 (1977) 258
- City of Chicago v. Shalala*, 189 F 3d 598 (7th Cir 1999) 255
- Dandridge v. Williams*, 397 US 471 (1970) 238
- Graham v. Richardson*, 403 US 365 (1971) 254 256
- Harris v. McRae*, 448 US 297 (1980) 239
- Application of Griffiths*, 413 US 717 (1973) 254
- Katzenbach v. Morgan*, 384 US 641 (1966) 258
- Korab v. Fink*, 748 F 3d 875 (9th Cir 2014) 252
- Marbury v. Madison* 5 US 137 (1803) 305



- Mathews v. Diaz*, 426 US 67 (1976) 255  
*Michigan v. Long*, 463 US 1032 (1983) 238  
*National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius*, 132 S Ct 2566 (2012) 260  
*Nyquist v. Mauclet*, 432 US 1 (1977) 254  
*Saenz v. Roe*, 526 US 489 (1999) 255  
*San Antonio Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Rodriguez*, 411 US 1 (1973) 238-9  
*Shapiro v. Thompson*, 394 US 618 (1969) 255  
*Soskin v. Reinertson*, 353 F 3d 1242 (10th Cir 2004) 252  
*Takahashi v. Fish & Game Commission*, 334 US 410 (1948) 254  
*Unthaksinkun v. Porter*, No. C11-0588JLR, 2011 WL 4502050 (WD Wash 28 September 2011) 252

### *United States (State)*

#### *Arizona*

- Kurti v. Maricopa County*, 33 P 3d 499 (Ariz Ct App 2001) 252

#### *California*

- California Hospital Assn v. Douglas*, 848 F Supp. 2d 1117 (C.D. Cal. 2012) 138

#### *Colorado*

- Lobato v. State*, 304 P 3d 1132 (Colo. 2013) 245  
*Lobato v. State*, 218 P 3d 358 (Colo. 2009) 245

#### *Connecticut*

- Barannikova v. Greenwich*, 643 A 2d 251 (1994) 258  
*City Recycling, Inc. v. State*, 778 A 2d 77 (Conn 2001) 253  
*Hong Pham v. Starkowski*, 16 A 3d 635 (Conn 2011) 252, 253, 255, 258, 259

#### *Indiana*

- Bonnor ex rel. Bonnor v. Daniels*, 907 NE 2d 516 (Ind 2009) 245

#### *Maryland*

- Ehrlich v. Perez*, 908 A 2d 1220 (Md 2006) 252