

清华西方哲学研究

第二卷

第一期 (二零一六年夏季卷)

Tsinghua Studies in Western Philosophy

Vol. 2, No. 1 (Summer 2016)

中国社会科学出版社

清华西方哲学研究

第二卷

第一期 (二零一六年夏季卷)

Tsinghua Studies in Western Philosophy
Vol. 2, No. 1 (Summer 2016)

中国社会科学出版社

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

清华西方哲学研究. 第二卷. 第一期: 2016 年. 夏季卷 / 黄裕生主编.
—北京: 中国社会科学出版社, 2016. 7
ISBN 978-7-5161-8688-6

I. ①清… II. ①黄… III. ①西方哲学—文集 IV. ①B5-53

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字(2016)第 182747 号

出 版 人	赵剑英
责任编辑	冯春风
责任校对	张爱华
责任印制	张雪娇

出 版	中国社会科学出版社
社 址	北京鼓楼西大街甲 158 号
邮 编	100720
网 址	http: // www. csspw. cn
发 行 部	010-84083685
门 市 部	010-84029450
经 销	新华书店及其他书店

印 刷	北京君升印刷有限公司
装 订	廊坊市广阳区广增装订厂
版 次	2016 年 7 月第 1 版
印 次	2016 年 7 月第 1 次印刷

开 本	710 × 1000 1/16
印 张	36
插 页	2
字 数	574 千字
定 价	138.00 元

凡购买中国社会科学出版社图书,如有质量问题请与本社营销中心联系调换
电话:010-84083683
版权所有 侵权必究

Academic Advisory Board (学术咨询委员会)

Co – chairpersons (主席):

YE Xiushan (叶秀山) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences / Tsinghua University, China*

XIE Weihe (谢维和) *Tsinghua University, China*

WAN Junren (万俊人) *Tsinghua University, China*

Members (委员):

Jacques Bidet *University of Paris X, France*

Wolfgang Carl *University of Göttingen, Germany*

William E. Carroll *University of Oxford, UK*

John M. Cooper *Princeton University, USA*

DENG Xiaomang (邓晓芒) *Huazhong University of Science and Technology, China*

Wolfgang Freitag *University of Freiburg, Germany*

Markus Gabriel *University of Bonn, Germany*

Don Garrett *New York University, USA*

Simon Glendinning *London School of Economics, UK*

JIN Xiping (靳希平) *Peking University, China*

Jean – François Kervegan *University of Paris I, France*

Anton F. Koch *Heidelberg University, Germany*

Sandra Lapointe *MacMaster University, Canada*

LIANG Zhixue (梁志学) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

LI Qiuling (李秋零) *Renmin University of China, China*

NI Liangkang (倪梁康) *Sun Yat – sen University, China*

Emanuel Renault *University of Paris X, France*

Greg Restall *University of Melbourne, Australia*

Tom Rockmore *Duquesne University, USA*

Birgit Sandkaulen *University of Bochum, Germany*

Thomas M. Scanlon *Harvard University, USA*

Thomas Schmidt *Humboldt University of Berlin, Germany*
 Malcolm Schofield *University of Cambridge, UK*
 Thomas Sheehan *Stanford University, USA*
 Robert Stern *University of Sheffield, UK*
 Martin Stokhof *University of Amsterdam, Netherlands*
 SUN Zhouxing (孙周兴) *Tongji University, China*
 Larry Temkin *Rutges University, USA*
 TONG Shijun (童世骏) *East China Normal University, China*
 Johan van Benthem *University of Amsterdam, Netherlands*
 WANG Lu (王路) *Tsinghua University, China*
 WANG Shuren (王树人) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*
 YAO Dazhi (姚大志) *Jilin University, China*
 YAO Jiehou (姚介厚) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*
 YU Jiyuan (余纪元) *State University of New York at Buffalo, USA*
 ZHAO Dunhua (赵敦华) *Peking University, China*
 ZHANG Rulun (张汝伦) *Fudan University, China*
 ZHANG Xianglong (张祥龙) *Peking University/ Shandong University, China*
 ZHANG Zhiwei (张志伟) *Renmin University of China, China*
 Günter Zöller *LudwigMaximilian University of Munich, Germany*

Editorial Board (编辑委员会)

Editor – in – Chief (主编):

HUANG Yusheng (黄裕生) *Tsinghua University, China*

Associate Editor – in – Chief (执行主编):

SONG Jijie (宋继杰) *Tsinghua University, China*

Members (委员):

CHEN Dezhong (陈德中) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

CHEN Jiaming (陈嘉明) *Xiamen University, China*

CHEN Yajun (陈亚军) *Nanjing University, China*

CUI Weihang (崔唯航) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

DENG Anqing (邓安庆) *Fudan University, China*

FANG Xianghong (方向红) *Sun Yat - sen University, China*

FU Youde (傅有德) *Shandong University, China*

FU Yongjun (傅永军) *Shandong University, China*

GUO Dawei (郭大为) *Party School of the Central Committee of C. P. C., China*

HAN Lixin (韩立新) *Tsinghua University, China*

HAN Shuifa (韩水法) *Peking University, China*

HANG Donghui (韩东晖) *Renmin University of China, China*

JIANG Yi (江怡) *Beijing Normal University, China*

LI Daqiang (李大强) *Jilin University, China*

LI He (李河) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

LI Meng (李猛) *Peking University, China*

LI Wentang (李文堂) *Party School of the Central Committee of C. P. C., China*

LIU Fenrong (刘奋荣) *Tsinghua University, China*

LIU Wei (刘玮) *Renmin University of China, China*

LIU Zhe (刘哲) *Peking University, China*

MA Yinmao (马寅卯) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

MO Weimin (莫伟民) *Fudan University, China*

NIE Minli (聂敏里) *Renmin University of China, China*

PENG Gang (彭刚) *Tsinghua University, China*

SHANG Jie (尚杰) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

SHANG Xinjian (尚新建) *Peking University, China*

SUN Xiangchen (孙向晨) *Fudan University, China*

TIAN Wei (田薇) *Tsinghua University, China*

WANG Heng (王恒) *Nanjing University, China*

WANG Qi (王齐) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

WANG Xiaochao (王晓朝) *Tsinghua University, China*

WU Guosheng (吴国盛) *Peking University, China*

WU Tianyue (吴天岳) *Peking University, China*

XIA Ying (夏莹) *Tsinghua University, China*
XIE Wenyu (谢文郁) *Shandong University, China*
XU Xiangdong (徐向东) *Zhejiang University, China*
YU Qizhi (于奇智) *South China Normal University, China*
YU Zhenhua (郁振华) *East China Normal University, China*
ZHANG Rong (张荣) *Nanjing University, China*
ZHANG Shen (张慎) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*
ZHANG Tingguo (张廷国) *Huazhong University of Science and Technology, China*
ZHANG Xuefu (章雪富) *Zhejiang University, China*
ZHAO Jianying (赵剑英) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*
ZHOU Lian (周濂) *Renmin University of China, China*
ZHOU Xiaoliang (周晓亮) *Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China*

Assistant Editors and Manuscript Editors (助理编辑和稿件编辑)

ZHANG Weite (张伟特) *Heidelberg University, Germany*
MENG Xianzhi (孟宪芝) *University of Massachusetts Amherst, USA*
ZHOU Nanjun (周南君) *The Chinese University of Hong Kong, China*
NIU Ziniu (牛子牛) *Tsinghua University, China*
GONG Lixuan (龚李萱) *Tsinghua University, China*
ZHU Yinqiu (朱吟秋) *Tsinghua University, China*
LV Xingyu (吕星宇) *Tsinghua University, China*
LIU Xin (刘鑫) *Heidelberg University, Germany*
TIAN Jie (田洁) *Shandong University, China*
ZHOU Lian (周炼) *University of Melbourne, Australia*
LI Jingjing (李晶晶) *McGill University, Canada*
LI Ruoyu (李若语) *LudwigMaximilian University of Munich, Germany*
YI Gang (易刚) *Heidelberg University, Germany*
WANGXu (王旭) *Leuphana University of Lüneburg, Germany*
LUO Sihang (骆斯航) *Indiana University, USA*
WENG Shaomiao (翁少妙) *LudwigMaximilian University of Munich, Germany*

目 录

名家特稿

中国哲学精神之绵延（二）：扬雄《太玄》的哲学

意义	叶秀山/文（3）
康德“德行论导论”句读（三）	邓晓芒/文（17）
能否扼住命运的咽喉——普罗米修斯主题的变奏	刘东/文（55）

分析哲学

维特根斯坦《逻辑哲学论》中的超越唯心论	唐浩/文（105）
精致的排除性与精致的因果性	钟磊/文；丁岳涛/译（121）
论何物可名	李大强/文（144）
[评论] 评陈嘉映论早期维特根斯坦（附作者声明）	唐浩/文（161）
[回应] 对陈嘉映回应的回应	唐浩/文（182）

纪念金岳霖诞辰 120 周年专栏：讲座和会议论文

迂回之径：一条未曾涉足之路	约翰·佩里/文；谢凯博/译（187）
从康德到弗雷格：论先验逻辑对现代逻辑的奠基	王策/文（207）
论当代西方心理内容研究中的命题角色	宋荣/文（222）
论戴维森的心智理论	戴益斌/文（238）

伦理学与政治哲学

- “不可避免”的行动、道德责备与康德原则 徐向东/文 (255)
- [英文] 政治文本的理想解释 阿洛伊修斯·P. 马丁尼奇/文 (292)
- 独守千秋纸上尘：古希腊哲学与当代中国问题之
反思 刘康/文 (312)
- 此生可臻于至乐——奥古斯丁论美德本身足以构成
至乐 克里斯蒂安·托诺/文；韩穗/译 (353)
- [评论] 政治哲学的学科分工 骆斯航/文 (379)

科学史与科学哲学

- 宇宙论、形而上学与宇宙的本源：从斯蒂芬·霍金
到托马斯·阿奎那 威廉·E. 卡洛/文；吕鹏/译 (387)

哲学重镇专栏：纽约大学

- 纽约大学的哲学简介 唐·伽勒特/文；张伟特/译 (405)
- 什么是休谟“真正宗教”的
真相？ 唐·伽勒特/文；王达菲 张伟特/译 (408)
- [英文] 堕胎与谋杀 彼得·文格/文 (435)
- 规律性、规则、意义、真值条件和认知
规范 保罗·霍里奇/文；田继江/译 (449)

柏拉图研究：德国图宾根学派

- 柏拉图与历史——图宾根大学古典系教授就职
演讲 康拉德·盖瑟/文；程炜/译 (477)
- 柏拉图学园和对柏拉图哲学进行一个系统阐

释的问题 汉斯·J. 克雷默/文；易刚/译（504）

口头辩证法与书写游戏：论《斐德
若》 托马斯·A. 斯勒扎克/文；程炜/译（548）

Contents

Special Articles

The Continuum of the Spirit of Chinese Philosophy (II) :
The Philosophical Significance of YANG Xiong's *Tai Xuan* YE Xiushan (3)

A Commentary on Kant's “The Introduction to the
Doctrine of Virtue” (III) DENG Xiaomang (17)

Can the Throat of Fate be Clutched? The Changes of
Prometheus Themes LIU Dong (55)

Analytical Philosophy

Transcendental Idealism in Wittgenstein's *Tractatus* TANG Hao (105)

Sophisticated Exclusion and Sophisticated
Causation ZHONG Lei; trans. by DING Yuetao (121)

On What Can be Named LI Daqiang (144)

[Review] CHEN Jiaying's Arguments about the Early
Wittgenstein in his *Philosophy of Language* TANG Hao (161)

[Response] A Response to CHEN Jiaying's Reply TANG Hao (182)

In Commemoration of JIN Yuelin (1895—1984)

The Great Detour: The Road Not Taken	John Perry; trans. by XIE Kaibo (187)
From Kant to Frege: On Transcendental Logic as a Foundation of Modern Logic	WANG Ce (207)
The Role of Propositions in Contemporary Studies of Mental Content	SONG Rong (222)
On Davidson's Theory of the Mental	DAI Yibin (238)

Ethics & Political Philosophy

Unavoidable Action, Moral Blame and Kant Principle	XU Xiangdong (255)
Ideal Interpretation of Political Texts	Aloysius P. Martinich (292)
Reflections on Ancient Greek Philosophy and the Problems of Contemporary China	LIU Kang (312)
Happiness in This Life? Augustine on the Principle that Virtue Is Self – sufficient for Happiness	Christian Tornau; trans. by HAN Sui (353)
[Review] Division of Subjects in Political Philosophy	LUO Sihang (379)

History of Science & Philosophy of Science

Cosmology, Metaphysics, and the Origin of the Universe: From Stephen Hawking to Thomas Aquinas	William E. Carroll; trans. by LV Peng (387)
--	---

New York University Philosophy

New York University

- Philosophy Don Garrett; trans. by ZHANG Weite (405)
- What’s True about Hume’s “True Religion” Don Garrett; trans. by WANG Dafei & ZHANG Weite (408)
- Abortion and Murder Peter Unger (435)
- Regularities, Rules, Meanings, Truth Conditions, and Epistemic Norms Paul Horwich; trans. by TIAN Jijiang (449)

Plato Studies: The Tübingen School

- Plato and History Konrad Gaiser; trans. by CHENG Wei (477)
- The Platonic Academy and the Problem of a Systematic Interpretation of Plato’s Philosophy Hans J. Krämer; trans. by YI Gang (504)
- Oral Dialectic and Writing Game: On *Phaedrus* Thomas A. Szlezák; trans. by CHENG Wei (548)

名家特稿
Special Articles

中国哲学精神之绵延(二)

——扬雄《太玄》的哲学意义

叶秀山(YE Xiushan)*

摘要：西汉扬雄（前53—18）的《太玄》把道家和儒家的学说“结合”在一个“玄”的“凝固”的“体系”之中。在《老子》书中有一种“一分为二（多）”的思想，而扬雄所阐述的主要是“合二（多）为一”。《老子》看到的世间万物，“同出一源”，是一个“生成”的“过程”，而扬雄眼里万物都是“现成”的“东西”，“需要一个“统一”的“力量”将它们“整合”起来，这个力量就是“玄”。在这个意义上，扬雄这个“玄”就不仅是《老子》的“道”，而且也是孔子的“道”。然而唯有从一个“同一”的“源泉”“发展”出来的“万物”这个“多”，才“在道理上”“有可能被允许”“回到”“产生”它的“一”去。从事物的“外面”“设定”“道”，无论它多么“深奥—玄”，都是一种“强制”的“和谐”。《太玄》从“道家”汲取的“玄”的思想，其思想也只能“凝固”在“黑暗”之中而“明”不起来，永远拥有一个“深不可测”的“神秘性”。

关键词：中国哲学；扬雄；《太玄》；《老子》

* 叶秀山，清华大学特聘教授，中国社会科学院哲学研究所学部委员、研究员（YE Xiushan, Distinguished Professor, Department of Philosophy, Tsinghua University, Beijing; Member of Academic Committee & Researcher, Chinese Academy of Social Science, Beijing）。

The Continuum of the Spirit of Chinese Philosophy(II) : The Philosophical Significance of YANG Xiong's *Tai Xuan*

Abstract: In his book *Canon of Supreme Mystery* (*Tai Xuan*, 《太玄》), YANG Xiong (53 B. C. E. — 18 C. E.), the Han dynasty philosopher, “re-unites” the doctrines of Confucianism and Taoism into a “solid” “system” of “mystery (*xuan*, 玄)”. In *The Book of Master Lao*, Laozi believes that “one divides into two (or multitude)”, while YANG argues that “two (or multitude) are united into one”. For Laozi, the multiplicity of beings is “generated from the same genesis” and is always in a “process” of “generating”, while for YANG, they are all “actually – existing” “things” that are united by a “unifying” “power” which is “mystery”. In this sense, the “mystery” is not only Laozian “Way (*Dao*, 道)”, but also a Confucian “Way”. However, the multiplicity of beings can be “*de jure*” “allowed” to “return” to the “one” that “generates” them, only when they are “developed” from “the same” “source”. The “Way” “determined” from the “outside” of things, no matter how “abstruse – mysterious” it is, is still one kind of “imposed” “harmony”. Therefore, the doctrine of “mystery” in the *Canon of Supreme Mystery*, which is somewhat borrowed from the early Taoism, has to be “solidified” in “the obscure” without being “illuminated”, and remains always “unfathomably” “mysterious”.

Keywords: Chinese philosophy; YANG Xiong; *Canon of Supreme Mystery*; *The Book of Master Lao*

扬雄初以辞赋进谏朝政，四十岁以后，作《太玄》，展现哲学思考的才能。《太玄》因思想艰深，用字古奥，不为当时多数人所理解，影响在后世才发挥出来；其实，《太玄》的工作，不出儒、道两家之传统，而仍以汉代哲学思潮为背景，它之所以难懂，可能多半还在字句方面，而出现书面语言与口头语言的疏离，大概有汉一代，也起到推波助澜的作用。许氏《说文解字》可以是一个例子。

按照顾颉刚的说法，在中国历史上，汉代把过去“流动”的东西，“凝固化”了，这个意思应该得到重视。汉代不但在实际政治制度上进一步“巩固”