# Language Loyalty, Continuity and Change

Joshua A. Fishman's Contributions to International Sociolinguistics



Ofelia García, Rakhmiel Peltz and Harold Schiffman with Gella Schweid Fishman

#### **BILINGUAL EDUCATION AND BILINGUALISM 60**

Series Editors: Nancy H. Hornberger and Colin Baker

# Language Loyalty, Continuity and Change

Joshua A. Fishman's Contributions to International Sociolinguistics

Ofelia García, Rakhmiel Peltz and Harold Schiffman

with Gella Schweid Fishman

MULTILINGUAL MATTERS LTD

Clevedon • Buffalo • Toronto

This volume has been compiled to mark the occasion of Joshua A. Fishman's 80th birthday and is being published in conjunction with a companion volume edited by Nancy H. Hornberger and Martin Pütz, entitled Language Loyalty, Language Planning, and Language Revitalization: Recent Writings and Reflections from Joshua A. Fishman. Both books are available from Multilingual Matters Ltd.

**Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data**A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

**British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data** A catalogue entry for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN1-85359-903-4 / EAN 978-1-85359-903-3(hbk) ISBN 1-85359-902-6 / EAN 978-1-85359-902-6 (pbk)

Multilingual Matters Ltd

UK: Frankfurt Lodge, Clevedon Hall, Victoria Road, Clevedon BS21 7HH. USA: UTP, 2250 Military Road, Tonawanda, NY 14150, USA. Canada: UTP, 5201 Dufferin Street, North York, Ontario M3H 5T8, Canada.

Copyright © 2006 Ofelia García, Rakhmiel Peltz, Harold Schiffman, Gella Schweid Fishman and Joshua A. Fishman.

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced in any form or by any means without permission in writing from the publisher.

Typeset by Wordworks Ltd. Printed and bound in Great Britain by the Cromwell Press Ltd.

# Language Loyalty, Continuity and Change

#### BILINGUAL EDUCATION AND BILINGUALISM

Series Editors: Professor Nancy H. Hornberger, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA and Professor Colin Baker, University of Wales, Bangor, Wales, Great Britain

#### **Recent Books in the Series**

Continua of Biliteracy: An Ecological Framework for Educational Policy, Research, and Practice in Multilingual Settings

Nancy H. Hornberger (ed.)

Languages in America: A Pluralist View (2nd edn) Susan J. Dicker

Trilingualism in Family, School and Community Charlotte Hoffmann and Jehannes Ytsma (eds)

Multilingual Classroom Ecologies

Angela Creese and Peter Martin (eds)

Negotiation of Identities in Multilingual Contexts

Aneta Pavlenko and Adrian Blackledge (eds)

Beyond the Beginnings: Literacy Interventions for Upper Elementary English Language Learners

Angela Carrasquillo, Stephen B. Kucer and Ruth Abrams

Bilingualism and Language Pedagogy

Janina Brutt-Griffler and Manka Varghese (eds)

Language Learning and Teacher Education: A Sociocultural Approach Margaret R. Hawkins (ed.)

The English Vernacular Divide: Postcolonial Language Politics and Practice Vaidehi Ramanathan

Bilingual Education in South America

Anne-Marie de Mejía (ed.)

Teacher Collaboration and Talk in Multilingual Classrooms Angela Creese

Words and Worlds: World Languages Review

F. Martí, P. Ortega, I. Idiazabal, A. Barreña, P. Juaristi, C. Junyent, B. Uranga and E. Amorrortu

Language and Aging in Multilingual Contexts

Kees de Bot and Sinfree Makoni

Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism (4th edn) *Colin Baker* 

Bilingual Minds: Emotional Experience, Expression, and Representation Aneta Pavlenko (ed.)

Raising Bilingual-Biliterate Children in Monolingual Cultures Stephen J. Caldas

Language, Space and Power: A Critical Look at Bilingual Education Samina Hadi-Tabassum

Developing Minority Language Resources

Guadalupe Valdés, Joshua A. Fishman, Rebecca Chávez and William Pérez

Language Loyalty, Language Planning and Language Revitalization: Recent Writings and Reflections from Joshua A. Fishman

Nancy H. Hornberger and Martin Pütz (eds)

For more details of these or any other of our publications, please contact: Multilingual Matters, Frankfurt Lodge, Clevedon Hall, Victoria Road, Clevedon, BS21 7HH, England http://www.multilingual-matters.com

## To Joshua A. Fishman

Our Teacher, Colleague and Friend

who has taught us
to walk with him by the light of the moon,
to assist marginalized language communities in their search for justice,
to do research that respects the complexity of languages in society,
to enjoy the beauty of ambiguity,
to be irritants in the oyster that is the world,
and above all, to share the pearls of the mind and of the heart with others.



Joshua A. Fishman at the Milbank Chapel of Teachers College, Columbia University, April 6, 2005. © Maria Hodek Hamilton

## **Foreword**

Old age isn't what it used to be. Retirement is a word that has acquired a plural and is now often used with an ordinal number: his first retirement, his second retirement, and so on, a multi-step rite of passage, as it were. How many retirements has Joshua A. Fishman celebrated over the years? This time around, some of his disciples who have seen to it that these occasions were observed in style by editing commemorative volumes and festschrifts - four tomes on the occasion of his 65th birthday - are getting ready to go into retirement themselves. But Joshua Fishman stands tall giving the rest of us the impression that retirement is something that happens once in a while, and when it's over you go back to your desk. Yet he doesn't try to ignore the fleeting time. He would be the first to admit that a busy week and a busy life have to be punctuated by moments of rest, reflection and remembrance, and if and when there is a chance to celebrate it must not be missed. It was only yesterday that he marked the longevity of the International Journal of the Sociology of Language by editing a specially enlarged one hundredth issue, but actually more than a decade has passed since.

Again, we are in a celebratory mood and we must be grateful to Joshua A. Fishman for providing the occasion, as well as to those who made sure it did not pass unnoticed. Joshua Fishman's scholarly reputation is firmly established in the academic world (Gesellschaft) and does not require another volume to prop it up; but in the community of his students and closer colleagues (Gemeinschaft) there is a strong desire to pay tribute to a man who has influenced their lives as much as the scholarly fields in which they have made a name for themselves, be it Bilingual Education, the Sociology of Language, Language Planning or Yiddish Studies. As becomes clear on the pages of this book, Fishman is living testimony to the complex intertwining of both of these 'normal types of human association.' In his work and in his life he has always acknowledged both, which is the secret behind his success in fathoming the depth of language as a social phenomenon and in inspiring others to follow his lead. The subsequent essays by Ofelia García and Harold Schiffman offer an overview of his scholarly achievements that is grounded in the harmonization of the instrumental and the symbolic, embodying the principles of Gesellschaft and Gemeinschaft. The result of their effort is as useful as a guide to Fishman's work as it is commendable and a fitting homage for the occasion. Rakhmiel Peltz in his essay does as much for Fishman's work on Yiddish, and Gella, his devoted wife, gives us the most complete bibliography of his writings to date. One title is likely to be missing, though, for not to be outdone even on this occasion, Fishman himself contributes an essay about 'a man in the moon' opening the door of his study a gap and allowing us a view at the man behind all the titles.

Florian Coulmas Tokyo, September 2005

# **Contents**

Foreword by Fibrian Coulmas
*****
PART 1: INTEGRATIVE ESSAYS
Fishmanian Sociolinguistics (1949 to the Present) by Ofelia García and Harold Schiffman with the assistance of Zeena Zakharia
Introduction
Before an intellectual prophet and leader
Language and Behavior and Fishmanian Sociolinguistics
'And never the twain shall meet?'
Multilingualism
multilingualism: Methodological propositions
multilingualism: Theoretical propositions    18      Domains    18      Diglossia    19
Language Maintenance/Language Shift / Reversing Language Shift 23 Language maintenance/language shift
Language Spread
Language Attitudes and Language and Ethnicity/Nationalism/ Identity/Religion/Power

Language and ethnicity       30         Language and nationalism       33         Language and identity       34         Language and power       35         Language and religion       37
Language Planning and Language Policy
Bilingual Education and Minority-Language Group Education. 42 Scholarly interest
Conclusion
Appendix 1: Joshua A. Fishman's Contributions to the Sociology of Language (CSL) book series
References
*****
The History of Yiddish Studies: Take Notice!  by Rakhmiel Peltz
Minority Languages and Cultures Have Their Own Research Agendas
Fishman's Approach to Yiddish Research
The Special Needs of Research on Minority Languages in Their Social Contexts: The Case of Yiddish
Fishman's Yiddish Research Oeuvre
Ales in eynem iz nito ba keynem ('No one person can embody all attributes,' Yiddish proverb).       8         The centrality of the Birnbaum study.       8         The structure of the volume.       84         Birnbaum's phases       84

Contents	vii
----------	-----

Birnbaum's work, Fishman's work
Language Resources in the United States
Yiddish, One of Many Jewish Languages
Holiness and Yiddish
Corpus Planning for Yiddish
Conclusions: Fishman the Filolog
References
*****
PART 2: CONCLUDING SENTIMENTS
A Week in the Life of a Man from the Moon by Joshua A. Fishman
*****
PART 3: BIBLIOGRAPHICAL INVENTORY
Joshua A. Fishman's Bibliographical Inventory compiled by Gella Schweid Fishman
Books, Monographs and Reports

. . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 178

# Part 1

# Integrative Essays



# Fishmanian Sociolinguistics (1949 to the Present)

OFELIA GARCÍA AND HAROLD SCHIFFMAN with the assistance of Zeena Zakharia

They shall yield fruit even in old age; vigorous and fresh shall they be. Psalm 92, as quoted by J.A. Fishman in relation to Yiddish (1991b: 9)

#### Introduction

### Before an intellectual prophet and leader

It has been humbling to reread the scholarly work of Joshua A. Fishman spanning the last 55 years. We both met Fishman after he had been established as the founding father of the Sociology of Language. We knew then that his work had been trailblazing, insightful, inspirational. Being in his presence as a teacher and a colleague was indeed a transforming experience, for he not only taught us well, but also included us in many scholarly enterprises. One of us (García) is frequently heard to exclaim, 'Everything I know, I learned in Fishman 101.' But it took this careful rereading of his work, both his early work as well as his recent work, to understand his prophetic vision, evident as early as 1949 when he published the prizewinning monograph, *Bilingualism in a Yiddish School*.

As Joshua A. Fishman turns 80 years old, we are inspired not only by his gift of intellectual prophesy manifested so early, but also by his extensive scholarly contribution. His fecund scholarship is attested in this volume by the bibliography of well over 1000 items that his wife and partner in the sociolinguistic enterprise, Gella Schweid Fishman, has been able to assemble. We can say about Joshua A. Fishman what the Psalmist in the epigraph of this article attested, for he continues to yield vigorous and fresh fruit even in old age. As we write, Fishman continues to publish – a total of five books, sixteen articles, and two reviews are currently in press. As we will see, Fishman's intellectual contributions are important, not only because they anticipate many future understandings, thus rendering his prophesy important, but also because they are broad-ranging, making him a true intellectual giant.

Fishman's work dedicates much attention to leaders who develop and mobilize positive ethnolinguistic consciousness. For example, *Bilingualism in the Barrio* studies the language consciousness and language loyalty of Puerto Rican intellectuals. And both in his first major research study, 'Language Loyalty in the United States' (1960–1965), as in its update, 'Language Resources in the United States' (1981–1985), the views of ethnic activists received special attention (see, for example, 'Ethnic Activists View the Ethnic Revival and its Language Consequences: An Interview Study of Three American Ethnolinguistic Minorities'). Fishman has also intensively studied the leadership role that Nathan Birnbaum held at the Tschernovits Language Conference on Yiddish (see, for example, Fishman, 1987).

This essay gives attention to the role of Joshua A. Fishman as a leader who has mobilized and energized younger scholars throughout the world to study language and behavior, especially as it relates to ethnolinguistic consciousness. Beyond anticipation and the size of his intellectual endeavor, Fishman has been, and continues to be, a leader in an intellectual field – one who has mobilized hundreds, if not thousands, of scholars, educators, language planners and government bureaucrats to study multilingualism and to act on its behalf, and especially on behalf of language minorities. At times Fishman has openly expressed his interest in having a leadership role. Writing about bilingual education, he states, '[I]t is my fond and fundamental hope to lead bilingual educators in the USA and elsewhere to consider themselves to be a single community of interest, each learning from the other and correcting each other's experimental and attitudinal limitations' [emphasis ours] (Fishman, 1976; viii). Fishman's scholarship is not only ideologically mobilized, but it is energizing for the rest of us who read him and study him.

Joshua A. Fishman's clear leadership role in the founding and development of the sociology of language is unquestionable and has been well established by various scholars. Fernando Peñalosa (1981: 4), for example, calls Fishman 'the leading figure in the development and characterization of the sociology of language as an identifiable discipline.' According to Glyn Williams (1992: 97), Fishman, 'more than anyone, has been responsible for the development of the sociology of language.' Wright (2004: 11) calls Fishman, 'a key figure in LPLP (Language Policy Language Planning) studies.' In a recent text on sociolinguistics, Florian Coulmas (2005: 158) describes Fishman as the scholar 'who more than anyone else laid the groundwork for the scientific investigation of language shift.' And Spolsky (2004: 188) has lately said: 'The study of the efforts of linguistic minorities to preserve their languages is another field initiated by the creative scholarship of Joshua Fishman. Just as his work pioneered research into language maintenance and the spread of English, so he too inaugurated the field that he calls reversing language shift.' In Dell Hymes' foreword to Fishman's first text on the sociology of language, Hymes (1972: v) writes: 'In several major areas of the field [sociology of language] – language loyalty, language development, bilingualism – Professor Fishman has been a leader in research; at the same time, he has worked to build the field as a whole.'

But which field is it that Fishman has built? It is clear that the work of Joshua A. Fishman goes beyond the two disciplines that the term 'sociology of language' evokes. His intellectual enterprise is grounded in language in society, but also encompasses psychology, political science, anthropology, history, education, geography, religion and literature. The danger of continuing to refer to the field that Fishman has so richly developed as 'sociology of language' is that it reduces it only to sociological inquiry about language. We propose here, based on Fishman's own reclaiming of the term 'sociolinguistics' (see 'Growing pains' section below), that we speak of Fishmanian sociolinguistics, as a way to build a space for the rich interdisciplinary field that he has developed and in which language in society remains at the core.

### This essay

Though we are unable to fully do justice to Joshua A. Fishman's intellectual genius, we nonetheless have found permission to do so in Fishman's own words, which we quote below. Speaking about the way in which research should and could be done and the way it is done in the real world, Fishman asks:

Why is there such a difference? Because researchers are limited in time, funds, ideas and ability; nevertheless, they must do the best they can with what they have. They cannot wait until the best of all possible worlds comes to pass (for it never will), so they try to *conduct their studies as best they can*. (Fishman, 1996a: 7)

We have tried to write this integrative essay 'as best we can,' knowing full well that it cannot represent or fully grasp Joshua A. Fishman's profound scholarship.

Because this volume includes Peltz's integrative essay about Joshua A. Fishman's work about Yiddish and in Yiddish, we omit the Yiddish category from our analysis. But we acknowledge from the outset the important role that Yiddish has had in Fishman's work. Fishman has always acknowledged the importance of what he calls 'listening to Yiddish with the third ear' in his work (1990: 114).

This integrative essay identifies some of the conceptual threads in Joshua A. Fishman's work over the last 50 years and attempts to analyze, in Fishman's (1971: 607) own words, 'How the worm has turned!' The essay is organized along conceptual threads that appear interwoven, and even entangled, in Fishman's own work, often in relationship to each other.