

Making Treaties Work

Human Rights, Environment
and Arms Control

Edited by

Geir Ulfstein

in collaboration with

Thilo Marauhn and Andreas Zimmermann

CAMBRIDGE

MAKING TREATIES WORK

Human Rights, Environment and Arms Control

Edited by
GEIR ULFSTEIN

in collaboration with
THILO MARAUHN and
ANDREAS ZIMMERMANN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521873178

© Cambridge University Press 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87317-8 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party internet websites referred to in this publication,
and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

MAKING TREATIES WORK

There is an increasing focus on the need for national implementation of treaties. International law has traditionally left enforcement to the individual parties, but more and more treaties contain arrangements to induce States to comply with their commitments. This book examines three forms of such mechanisms: dispute settlement procedures in the form of international courts, non-compliance procedures of an administrative character, and enforcement of obligation by coercive means. Three fields are examined, namely, human rights, international environmental law, and arms control and disarmament. These areas are in the forefront of the development of current international law and deal with multilateral, rather than purely bilateral issues. The three sections of the book on human rights, international environmental law and arms control contain a general introduction and three or four case studies of the most relevant treaties in the field. The book finishes with three concluding articles.

GEIR ULFSTEIN is Professor of Law and Director of the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, University of Oslo.

THILO MARAUHN is Professor of Public Law, International Law and European Law at the Justus-Liebig-Universität Gießen, and a Research Fellow at the University of Luzern.

ANDREAS ZIMMERMANN is Professor of Law and Director of the Walter-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel.

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book is the outcome of a joint research project undertaken by the editors. The underlying theme was to analyze how various regulatory regimes can facilitate the implementation of relevant treaty obligations undertaken by States parties. The editors had decided to invite specialists working in three fields of international law, namely, human rights, international environmental law and arms control, in order to provide analyses of arrangements for dispute settlement, compliance control and enforcement. These contributions were supplemented by introductions from the editors and concluding chapters by well-known academics.

Thilo Marauhn and Geir Ulfstein applied for financing from the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (German Research Foundation) and the Norwegian Research Council, respectively, and the editors are grateful to both these institutions for the support they provided which made this endeavour a reality. Drafts of the respective reports were presented and discussed at a workshop held at the Walther-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel, from 20 to 23 January 2005, which Andreas Zimmermann had undertaken to organize. Geir Ulfstein secured the contact with the authors and the publisher with a view to finalizing the book.

The editors would like to thank particularly all the contributors for their dedication, for allocating their precious time to this project, and for the open discussions during the workshop. We would like to give our special appreciation to Sarah Isabelle Reich, Justus Liebig University, Gießen, for her support in preparing the application to the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft, to the staff of the Walther-Schücking-Institute, in particular Carmen Thies, for having organized the workshop in such a professional manner, and, finally, the scientific assistants, Janne Kaasin, Karin Kaasen and Andreas M. Kravik, for their great efforts and skills in making the manuscript ready for publication.

Finally, thanks go to Cambridge University Press and its staff, first and foremost Finola O'Sullivan who ever since we first approached her has been an effective decision-maker.

NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

Jutta Brunnée is Professor of Law and Metcalf Chair in Environmental Law, University of Toronto.

Renate Kicker is Associate Professor at the Institute of International Law and International Relations, University of Graz, Austria; a Member of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) since September 1997; and Director of the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy (ETC).

Veit Koester was a civil servant with the Danish Ministry of Environment until 2002. He is External Professor at Roskilde University Centre, Denmark, and Visiting Professor at United Nations University's Institute of Advanced Studies, Yokohama, Japan and a guest lecturer at Copenhagen University, Faculty of Law. He is chairman of the Compliance Committee of the Aarhus Convention and chairman of the Compliance Committee of the Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety. He is a member of the Steering Committee for the IUCN (the World Conservation Union) Commission on Environmental Law and a member of the Conseil Européen du Droit de l'Environnement (CEDE).

Timo Koivurova is Research Professor of Arctic Environment and Minority Law, and Director of the Northern Institute for Environmental and Minority Law (NIEM/Arctic Centre).

Tuomas Kuokkanen is Counsellor, Ministry of Environment of Finland; was a member of the Implementation Committee under the Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution from 1999 to 2005; and is a

part-time Professor of International Environmental Law at the University of Joensuu.

Kathleen Lawand is Legal Adviser, Mines-Arms Unit, International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC).

Thilo Marauhn is Professor of Public Law, International Law and European Law at the Justus-Liebig-Universität Gießen, and Research Fellow at the University of Luzern.

Andreas Paulus is Lecturer, Institute for International Law, Ludwig-Maximilians-University München, Germany.

Rosalind Reeve is Associate Fellow of the Sustainable Development Programme, Chatham House, UK, and adviser to the David Shepherd Wildlife Foundation and the International Fund for Animal Welfare.

Laura Rockwood is Principal Legal Officer, Section Head for Non-Proliferation and Policy Making, Office of Legal Affairs, International Atomic Energy Agency.

Martin Scheinin is Professor of Constitutional and International Law and Director of the Institute for Human Rights at Åbo Akademi University, Turku, Finland. He was a member of the Human Rights Committee from 1997 to 2004.

Lisa Tabassi is Legal Officer, Technical Secretariat of the Organisation for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons (OPCW).

Christian J. Tams is Lecturer, Walther-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel, Germany.

Geir Ulfstein is Professor of Law and Director of the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, University of Oslo. He is Deputy Director of the Board, Norwegian Branch of the International Law Association. He is also a member of the International Law Association's Committee on Human Rights Law and Practice, and a member of the IUCN (the World Conservation Union) Commission on Environmental Law.

Mark Villiger is a Judge of the European Court of Human Rights, and is Titularprofessor of International and European Law at the University of Zurich.

Andreas Zimmermann is Professor of Law and Director of the Walter-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel. From 1999 to 2001 he was a member of the expert commission for the drafting of a Code of Offences Against International Law at the German Ministry of Justice. In 1997/8 he was a member of and legal adviser to the German delegation at the Preparatory Committee for, and at the United Nations Diplomatic Conference of Plenipotentiaries on, the Establishment of an International Criminal Court.

TABLE OF CASES

Permanent Court of International Justice

Mavrommatis Palestine Concessions Case (Greece v. United Kingdom), 1924 255,
352

International Court of Justice

Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of
Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Yugoslavia), 1996 18
Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of
Genocide (Croatia v. Yugoslavia), 2002 18
Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v.
Rwanda), 2002 18
Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States), 2004 354, 357, 359
Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Company Ltd (Belgium v. Spain), 1970 39, 354,
364
Case Concerning Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic
Republic of the Congo v. Uganda), 2005 43
Certain Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany), 2005 352, 353, 355
East Timor (Portugal v. Australia), 1995, 90 352, 354, 364
Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) 1998 371
Gabcikovo–Nagymaros Dam case (Hungary v. Slovakia), 1997 119, 362, 363
LaGrand (Germany v. US), 2001 354, 357
Land and Maritime Boundary between Cameroon and Nigeria (Cameroon v. Nigeria),
1998 352
Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian
Territory, Advisory Opinion, 2004 42, 54, 353, 354, 360
Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion, 1996 54, 252,
355, 360, 363, 367, 368
Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising
from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libya v. UK), 1998 352, 372
South West Africa Cases, 1962 255
Vienna Convention on Consular Relations (Paraguay v. US), 1998 371

Arbitration

- Behring Sea Fur Seals Arbitration, Moore's *International Arbitration Awards* 755, 1898 119
- Lake Lanoux case, 24 ILM 101, 1957 119
- MOX Case: Dispute Concerning Access to Information under Article 9 of the Ospar Convention (Ireland v. United Kingdom), Permanent Court of Arbitration, 2003 120, 384
- Southern Bluefin Tuna Arbitration, 39 ILM 1359, 2000 119
- Trail Smelter (US v. Canada), 3 UNRIAA 1905 (1941); (1939) 33 AJIL 182 119, 362

WTO Dispute Settlement Body

- EC – Asbestos: European Communities – Measures Affecting Asbestos-Containing Products, 2001, WT/DS135/AB/R 361, 370
- EC – Bananas: Report of the Appellate Body on the European Community Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas, 1997, WT/DS27/AB/R 354
- US – Shrimps: United States – Importation of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products, 1998, WT/DS58/AB/R 361
- US – Steel: United States – Imposition of Countervailing Duties on Certain Hot-Rolled Lead and Bismuth Carbon Steel Products Originating in the United Kingdom, 2000, WT/DS138/AB/R 361

International Labour Organization Administrative Tribunal

- Judgment 2032 (2001) 278
- Judgment 2232 (2003) 279
- Judgment 2256 (2003) 278
- Judgment 2327 (2004) 279
- Judgment 2328 (2004) 279

UN Human Rights Committee Reports

- A v. Australia, 1993 64
- Apirana Mahuika et al. v. New Zealand, 1984 61
- Bernard Ominayak, Chief of the Lubicon Lake Band v. Canada, 1984 49, 60, 61
- Dante Piandiong et al. v. Philippines, 1999 63
- A Publication and a Printing Company v. Trinidad and Tobago, 1989 60

European Commission on Human Rights

- Austria v. Italy, 1961 18
- Denmark, Norway, Sweden and the Netherlands v. Greece, 1968 22

European Court of Human Rights

Akkoc v. Turkey, 1993	106
Amuur v. France, 1996	104
Austria v. Italy, Application, 1960	79
Belilos v. Switzerland, 1988	80
Broniowski v. Poland, Application, 1996	83
Brumarescu v. Romania, Application, 1995	83
Corigliano v. Italy, 1982	81
Cyprus v. Turkey, 2001	22, 79
Denmark, Norway, Sweden and the Netherlands v. Greece, 1967	79
France, Norway, Denmark and Sweden v. Turkey, 1982	79
Gençel v. Turkey, Application, 1999	83
Ilascu v. Moldova and Russia, Application, 1999	82
Ireland v. United Kingdom, 1978	22, 79
Kalashnikov v. Russia, 2002	106
Le Compte, Van Leuven and de Meyere v. Belgium, 1982	82
Lorsé v. Netherlands, 2001	106
Mamatkulov v. Abdurasulovic v. Turkey, Applications, 1999	72
Moreira de Azevedo v. Portugal, 1991	81
Tyrer v. United Kingdom, 1978	88
Van der Ven v. Netherlands, 2003	106
X etc. v. Netherlands, 1984	73

Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Advisory Opinion, 1999	359
Barrios Altos Case, 2003	27

Netherlands

LJN: AU8685, Rechtbank 's-Gravenhage, 09/751003-04	298
--	-----

United Kingdom Privy Council

Tangiora v. Wellington District Legal Services Committee (2000) 4 LRC 44	45
--	----

TABLE OF TREATIES AND OTHER INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

General Instruments

1945 UN Charter

- art. 2(3) 353
- art. 2(4) 267
- art. 33 7, 255, 353
- art. 39 269, 270, 304, 406
- art. 41 270
- art. 42 270
- art. 48 304
- art. 53 392
- art. 96 354
- Chapter VII 251, 266, 295–6, 297, 304

1945 ICJ Statute

- art. 36(1) 17
- art. 36(2) 17
- art. 63(2) 123

1963 Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 596 UNTS 291 4, 371

- art. 36 357

1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1155 UNTS 331 46

- art. 3 207
- art. 28 76
- art. 31 44
- art. 31(3)(a) 233
- art. 60 5, 129, 212, 214, 393
- art. 60(1)(a)(i) 85
- art. 60(2)(c) 122, 269, 409
- art. 60(5) 212, 214

- 1998 Statute of the International Criminal Court (Rome Statute), 2187 UNTS 3 298,
 358
 art. 12 359
 art. 13 359

- 2001 Articles on State Responsibility 5
 art. 33(2) 39
 art. 41 42
 art. 42 6, 42, 122, 409
 art. 42(11) 364
 art. 42(b)(ii) 409
 art. 48 6, 42, 409
 art. 48(1) 408
 art. 48(7) 364, 365, 409
 art. 49 6, 42, 43
 art. 54 6, 42, 43, 408

General regional instruments

- 1948 Charter of the Organization of American States, 119 UNTS 3
 art. 9 46
- 1948 Statute of the Council of Europe
 art. 3 23, 24, 85
 art. 4 23
 art. 7 31, 85
 art. 8 31, 46, 85, 109
 art. 23(a) 31

- 1972 European Convention on State Immunity, ETS No. 074A
 Additional Protocol 1972 89
 art. 1 89
 art. 2 89
 art. 4 89

- 2000 Constitutive Act of the African Union, OAU Doc. CAB/LEG/23.15
 art. 30 46

- 2000 Cotonou Agreement [2000] OJ L317/3 403
 art. 9 402
 art. 96(2) 402

Human rights

1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 78

UNTS 177

art. IX 17

1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, UN Doc. A/810 (1948) 71 15, 48, 88

art. 3 97

1950 European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental
 Freedoms, ETS No. 5 15, 70–90, 384

art. 3 77, 93, 105, 110, 396

art. 6(1) 83

art. 8 77

art. 10 77

art. 11 77

art. 15 45

art. 19 74

art. 21 74

art. 22 74

art. 23 75

art. 24 37

art. 25 75

art. 26 76

art. 28 75, 76

art. 29 75

art. 30 72, 75

art. 33 79, 407

art. 34 76, 78, 79

art. 35 77

art. 35(2)(b) 17, 76

art. 35(3) 76, 77

art. 36(3) 87

art. 37(1)(a) 75

art. 38(1)(b) 78

art. 39 78

art. 40 78

art. 41 81, 82, 83

art. 45 78

art. 46 80

art. 46(1) 33, 71, 80

art. 46(2) 33, 71, 84, 85, 400

art. 46(3) 86

art. 46(4)	87
art. 52	26
art. 54	33
art. 55	41
art. 59(2)	74
Protocol 1, art. 1	83
Protocol 11	17, 70, 80
Protocol 12	70–1
Protocol 14	34, 72, 74, 76, 77, 80, 86–7
art. 8(2)	34

1960 Unesco Convention Against Discrimination, 429 UNTS	93
art. 17	25

1966 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD), 660 UNTS	195
art. 9	25
art. 11	20
Optional Protocol	68

1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 999 UNTS	171
15, 48–69, 89, 375, 376, 377, 380, 381, 382, 384	
art. 1	48, 49
art. 2	50, 65
art. 2(3)	51
art. 3	50
art. 4	45
art. 6	48, 49
art. 7	49, 97, 396
art. 8	49
art. 9	49, 64
art. 10	48–9
art. 11	49
art. 12	49
art. 13	49
art. 14	49
art. 15	49
art. 16	49
art. 17	49
art. 18	49
art. 19	49
art. 20	49

art. 21	49
art. 22	48
art. 23	49
art. 24	49
art. 25	48
art. 26	48
art. 27	48, 50
art. 28	19, 50, 52, 64, 126
art. 29	126
art. 30(4)	52
art. 31	19
art. 39(2)	53, 64
art. 40	25, 50, 52, 53, 64, 65
art. 40(1)	51, 57
art. 40(2)	51, 57
art. 40(4)	53
art. 41	17, 20, 50, 51, 54, 55, 56, 407
art. 41(1)	19, 20
art. 42	50, 51, 54, 55, 56
art. 42(6)(c)	52
art. 44	18, 54
Protocol 1 on Individual Complaints	49, 50, 52, 63–4, 68
art. 4	19
art. 4(2)	62
art. 5(1)	56, 62
art. 5(3)	62
art. 5(4)	20, 52, 63
art. 5(a)	199

1966 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), 993

UNTS 3	15, 47, 48
art. 16	25

1969 American Convention on Human Rights, 1144 UNTS 123 89

art. 26	28
art. 27	45
arts. 34–40	19
art. 34	19
art. 35	19
art. 41(f)	36
art. 42	28
art. 43	28