



OPERATIONS RESEARCH FOR UNMANNED SYSTEMS

Edited by **JEFFREY R. CARES** and **JOHN Q. DICKMANN, Jr**

WILEY

OPERATIONS RESEARCH FOR UNMANNED SYSTEMS

Edited by

Jeffrey R. Cares

Captain, US Navy (Ret.)

Alidade Inc.

USA

and

John Q. Dickmann, Jr.

Sonalysts Inc.

USA

WILEY

This edition first published 2016
© 2016 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Registered Office

John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, United Kingdom

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com.

The right of the author to be identified as the author of this work has been asserted in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and author have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Cares, Jeffrey R., editor. | Dickmann, Jr., John Q., editor.

Title: Operations research for unmanned systems / edited by Jeffrey R. Cares and John Q. Dickmann, Jr.

Description: Chichester, UK ; Hoboken, NJ : John Wiley & Sons, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index. |

Description based on print version record and CIP data provided by publisher; resource not viewed.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015036918 (print) | LCCN 2015033015 (ebook) | ISBN 9781118918913 (Adobe PDF) |

ISBN 9781118918920 (ePub) | ISBN 9781118918944 (cloth)

Subjects: LCSH: Autonomous vehicles--Industrial applications. | Drone aircraft--Industrial applications. |

Vehicles, Remotely piloted--Industrial applications.

Classification: LCC TL152.8 (print) | LCC TL152.8 .O64 2016 (ebook) | DDC 629.04/6--dc23

LC record available at <http://lccn.loc.gov/2015036918>

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Set in 10/12pt Times by SPi Global, Pondicherry, India

Printed and bound in Singapore by Markono Print Media Pte Ltd

About the Contributors

Rajan Batta

Associate Dean for Research and Graduate Education, School of Engineering
and Applied Sciences
SUNY Distinguished Professor, Department of Industrial & Systems Engineering
University at Buffalo (State University of New York), NY
USA

Fred D. J. Bowden

Land Capability Analysis Branch
Joint and Operations Analysis Division
DSTO-E, Edinburgh, SA
Australia

Shannon R. Bowling

Dean of the College of Engineering Technology and Computer Science
Bluefield State College
Bluefield, WV
USA

Juan José Vales Bravo,

Environmental Information Network of Andalusia
Environment and Water Agency
Johan Gutenberg, Seville
Spain

Elena María Méndez Caballero

Environmental Information Network of Andalusia
Environment and Water Agency
Johan Gutenberg, Seville
Spain

Jeffrey R. Cares

Captain, US Navy (Ret.)
Alidade Inc.
USA

Francisco Cáceres Clavero

Regional Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning
Avenida Manuel Siurot, Seville
Spain

Kelly Cohen

Department of Aerospace Engineering and Engineering Mechanics
College of Engineering
University of Cincinnati
Cincinnati, OH
USA

Andrew W. Coutts

Land Capability Analysis Branch
Joint and Operations Analysis Division
DSTO-E, Edinburgh, SA
Australia

Agamemnon Crassidis

The Kate Gleason College of Engineering
Rochester Institute of Technology
Rochester, NY
USA

Sean Deller

Joint and Coalition Warfighting (J7)
Washington, DC
USA

Richard M. Dexter

Land Capability Analysis Branch
Joint and Operations Analysis Division
DSTO-E, Edinburgh, SA
Australia

John Q. Dickmann, Jr.

Sonalysts Inc.
USA

Fernando Giménez de Azcárate

Regional Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning
Avenida Manuel Siurot, Seville
Spain

Luke Finlay

Land Capability Analysis Branch
Joint and Operations Analysis Division
DSTO-E, Edinburgh, SA
Australia

Matthew J. Henchey

Herren Associates
Washington, DC
USA

Patrick Chisan Hew

Defence Science and Technology Organisation
HMAS Stirling
Garden Island, WA
Australia

Raymond R. Hill

Department of Operational Sciences
US Air Force Institute of Technology/ENS
Wright-Patterson AFB
Dayton, OH
USA

David Hopkin

Section Head
Maritime Asset Protection
Defence Research and Development Canada – Atlantic
Dartmouth, NS
Canada

Keirin Joyce

University of New South Wales at the Australian Defence Force Academy
(UNSW Canberra)
Australia

Mark Karwan

Department of Industrial and Systems Engineering
University at Buffalo (State University of New York), NY
USA

Elad Kivelevitch

Department of Aerospace Engineering and Engineering Mechanics
College of Engineering
University of Cincinnati
Cincinnati, OH
USA

Manish Kumar

Department of Mechanical, Industrial & Manufacturing Engineering
University of Toledo
Toledo, OH
USA

José Manuel Moreira Madueño

Regional Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning
Avenida Manuel Siurot, Seville
Spain

David M. Mahalak

Applied Logistics Integration Consulting
Dallas, PA
USA

Gregoria Montoya Manzano

Environmental Information Network of Andalusia
Environment and Water Agency
Johan Gutenberg, Seville
Spain

Raquel Prieto Molina

Environmental Information Network of Andalusia
Environment and Water Agency
Johan Gutenberg, Seville
Spain

Bao Nguyen

Senior Scientist
Defence Research and Development Canada
Centre for Operational Research and Analysis
Ottawa, ON
Canada

Ben Pietsch

Land Capability Analysis Branch
Joint and Operations Analysis Division
DSTO-E, Edinburgh, SA
Australia

Ghaith Rabadi

Department of Engineering Management & Systems Engineering (EMSE)
Old Dominion University
Norfolk, VA
USA

Laura Granado Ruiz

Environmental Information Network of Andalusia
Environment and Water Agency
Johan Gutenberg, Seville
Spain

Thomas R. Ryan, Jr. (Tommy Ryan)

Department of Systems Engineering
United States Military Academy
West Point, NY
USA

Irene Rosa Carpintero Salvo

Environmental Information Network of Andalusia
Environment and Water Agency
Johan Gutenberg, Seville
Spain

Isabel Pino Serrato

Environmental Information Network of Andalusia
Environment and Water Agency
Johan Gutenberg, Seville
Spain

Denis R. Shine

Land Capability Analysis Branch
Joint and Operations Analysis Division
DSTO-E, Edinburgh, SA
Australia

Brian B. Stone

Department of Operational Sciences, US Air Force Institute of Technology/ENS
Wright-Patterson AFB, OH
USA

Huang Teng Tan

Department of Operational Sciences
US Air Force Institute of Technology/ENS
Wright-Patterson AFB
Dayton, OH
USA

Andreas Tolk

The MITRE Corporation
USA

Ricardo Valerdi

Department of Systems and Industrial Engineering
University of Arizona
Tucson, AZ
USA

Handson Yip

Supreme Allied Command Transformation
Staff Element Europe
SHAPE, Mons
Belgium

Acknowledgements

At the end of any major literary undertaking such as writing this book, authors take time to thank the many people who support their work. In this case, however, the editors are supporting, and the main effort, the real work that went into this book, was accomplished by the contributing authors. We justifiably thank them for the time and effort spent to create each chapter, and the patience they displayed with a lengthy submission and editing process. There is no doubt, moreover, that each of them has their own thanks to convey, but it would have made the process much longer and more complicated to include their own thanks here. To those who also supported the various authors in their independent efforts, we are likewise truly grateful.

We are also grateful for the support provided by the Military Operations Research Society (MORS). Four of the chapters, those by Han and Hill; Nguyen, Hopkin and Yip; Henchey, Batta, Karwan and Crassidis; and Deller, Rabadi, Tolk and Bowling first appeared in their research publication, *MORS Journal*. It is with their kind permission that they are reprinted here. It speaks loudly for the *MORS Journal* that some of the cutting edge research on this important topic was first presented in their pages.

Contents

About the Contributors	xiii
Acknowledgements	xix
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and Scope	3
1.3 About the Chapters	4
References	6
2 The In-Transit Vigilant Covering Tour Problem for Routing Unmanned Ground Vehicles	7
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 Background	8
2.3 CTP for UGV Coverage	9
2.4 The In-Transit Vigilant Covering Tour Problem	9
2.5 Mathematical Formulation	11
2.6 Extensions to Multiple Vehicles	14
2.7 Empirical Study	15
2.8 Analysis of Results	21
2.9 Other Extensions	24
2.10 Conclusions	25
Author Statement	25
References	25

3	Near-Optimal Assignment of UAVs to Targets Using a Market-Based Approach	27
3.1	Introduction	27
3.2	Problem Formulation	29
3.2.1	<i>Inputs</i>	29
3.2.2	<i>Various Objective Functions</i>	29
3.2.3	<i>Outputs</i>	31
3.3	Literature	31
3.3.1	<i>Solutions to the MDVRP Variants</i>	31
3.3.2	<i>Market-Based Techniques</i>	33
3.4	The Market-Based Solution	34
3.4.1	<i>The Basic Market Solution</i>	36
3.4.2	<i>The Hierarchical Market</i>	37
3.4.2.1	<i>Motivation and Rationale</i>	37
3.4.2.2	<i>Algorithm Details</i>	40
3.4.3	<i>Adaptations for the Max-Pro Case</i>	41
3.4.4	<i>Summary</i>	41
3.5	Results	42
3.5.1	<i>Optimizing for Fuel-Consumption (Min-Sum)</i>	43
3.5.2	<i>Optimizing for Time (Min-Max)</i>	44
3.5.3	<i>Optimizing for Prioritized Targets (Max-Pro)</i>	47
3.6	Recommendations for Implementation	51
3.7	Conclusions	52
Appendix 3.A	A Mixed Integer Linear Programming (MILP) Formulation	53
3.A.1	<i>Sub-tour Elimination Constraints</i>	54
References		55
4	Considering Mine Countermeasures Exploratory Operations Conducted by Autonomous Underwater Vehicles	59
4.1	Background	59
4.2	Assumptions	61
4.3	Measures of Performance	62
4.4	Preliminary Results	64
4.5	Concepts of Operations	64
4.5.1	<i>Gaps in Coverage</i>	64
4.5.2	<i>Aspect Angle Degradation</i>	64
4.6	Optimality with Two Different Angular Observations	65
4.7	Optimality with N Different Angular Observations	66
4.8	Modeling and Algorithms	67
4.8.1	<i>Monte Carlo Simulation</i>	67
4.8.2	<i>Deterministic Model</i>	67
4.9	Random Search Formula Adapted to AUVs	68
4.10	Mine Countermeasures Exploratory Operations	70
4.11	Numerical Results	71
4.12	Non-uniform Mine Density Distributions	72
4.13	Conclusion	74
Appendix 4.A	Optimal Observation Angle between Two AUV Legs	75
Appendix 4.B	Probabilities of Detection	78
References		79

5	Optical Search by Unmanned Aerial Vehicles: Fauna Detection Case Study	81
5.1	Introduction	81
5.2	Search Planning for Unmanned Sensing Operations	82
5.2.1	<i>Preliminary Flight Analysis</i>	84
5.2.2	<i>Flight Geometry Control</i>	85
5.2.3	<i>Images and Mosaics</i>	86
5.2.4	<i>Digital Analysis and Identification of Elements</i>	88
5.3	Results	91
5.4	Conclusions	92
	Acknowledgments	94
	References	94
6	A Flight Time Approximation Model for Unmanned Aerial Vehicles: Estimating the Effects of Path Variations and Wind	95
	Nomenclature	95
6.1	Introduction	96
6.2	Problem Statement	97
6.3	Literature Review	97
6.3.1	<i>Flight Time Approximation Models</i>	97
6.3.2	<i>Additional Task Types to Consider</i>	98
6.3.3	<i>Wind Effects</i>	99
6.4	Flight Time Approximation Model Development	99
6.4.1	<i>Required Mathematical Calculations</i>	100
6.4.2	<i>Model Comparisons</i>	101
6.4.3	<i>Encountered Problems and Solutions</i>	102
6.5	Additional Task Types	103
6.5.1	<i>Radius of Sight Task</i>	103
6.5.2	<i>Loitering Task</i>	105
6.6	Adding Wind Effects	108
6.6.1	<i>Implementing the Fuel Burn Rate Model</i>	110
6.7	Computational Expense of the Final Model	111
6.7.1	<i>Model Runtime Analysis</i>	111
6.7.2	<i>Actual versus Expected Flight Times</i>	113
6.8	Conclusions and Future Work	115
	Acknowledgments	117
	References	117
7	Impacts of Unmanned Ground Vehicles on Combined Arms Team Performance	119
7.1	Introduction	119
7.2	Study Problem	120
7.2.1	<i>Terrain</i>	120
7.2.2	<i>Vehicle Options</i>	122
7.2.3	<i>Forces</i>	122
7.2.3.1	<i>Experimental Force</i>	123
7.2.3.2	<i>Opposition Force</i>	123
7.2.3.3	<i>Civilian Elements</i>	123
7.2.4	<i>Mission</i>	124

7.3	Study Methods	125
7.3.1	<i>Closed-Loop Simulation</i>	125
7.3.2	<i>Study Measures</i>	126
7.3.3	<i>System Comparison Approach</i>	128
7.4	Study Results	128
7.4.1	<i>Basic Casualty Results</i>	128
7.4.1.1	<i>Low Density Urban Terrain Casualty Only Results</i>	128
7.4.1.2	<i>Dense Urban Terrain Casualty-Only Results</i>	130
7.4.2	<i>Complete Measures Results</i>	131
7.4.2.1	<i>Low Density Urban Terrain Results</i>	131
7.4.2.2	<i>Dense Urban Terrain Results</i>	132
7.4.2.3	<i>Comparison of Low and High Density Urban Results</i>	133
7.4.3	<i>Casualty versus Full Measures Comparison</i>	135
7.5	Discussion	136
	References	137
8	Processing, Exploitation and Dissemination: When is Aided/Automated Target Recognition “Good Enough” for Operational Use?	139
8.1	Introduction	139
8.2	Background	140
8.2.1	<i>Operational Context and Technical Issues</i>	140
8.2.2	<i>Previous Investigations</i>	141
8.3	Analysis	143
8.3.1	<i>Modeling the Mission</i>	144
8.3.2	<i>Modeling the Specific Concept of Operations</i>	145
8.3.3	<i>Probability of Acquiring the Target under the Concept of Operations</i>	146
8.3.4	<i>Rational Selection between Aided/Automated Target Recognition and Extended Human Sensing</i>	147
8.3.5	<i>Finding the Threshold at which Automation is Rational</i>	148
8.3.6	<i>Example</i>	148
8.4	Conclusion	149
	Acknowledgments	151
	Appendix 8.A	151
	<i>Ensuring $\mathbb{E}[Q_s]$ Decreases as ζ_s Increases</i>	152
	References	152
9	Analyzing a Design Continuum for Automated Military Convoy Operations	155
9.1	Introduction	155
9.2	Definition Development	156
9.2.1	<i>Human Input Proportion (H)</i>	156
9.2.2	<i>Interaction Frequency</i>	157
9.2.3	<i>Complexity of Instructions/Tasks</i>	157
9.2.4	<i>Robotic Decision-Making Ability (R)</i>	157
9.3	Automation Continuum	157
9.3.1	<i>Status Quo (SQ)</i>	158
9.3.2	<i>Remote Control (RC)</i>	158
9.3.3	<i>Tele-Operation (TO)</i>	158

9.3.4	<i>Driver Warning (DW)</i>	158
9.3.5	<i>Driver Assist (DA)</i>	158
9.3.6	<i>Leader-Follower (LF)</i>	159
9.3.6.1	<i>Tethered Leader-Follower (LF1)</i>	159
9.3.6.2	<i>Un-tethered Leader-Follower (LF2)</i>	159
9.3.6.3	<i>Un-tethered/Unmanned/Pre-driven Leader-Follower (LF3)</i>	159
9.3.6.4	<i>Un-tethered/Unmanned/Uploaded Leader-Follower (LF4)</i>	159
9.3.7	<i>Waypoint (WA)</i>	159
9.3.7.1	<i>Pre-recorded "Breadcrumb" Waypoint (WA1)</i>	160
9.3.7.2	<i>Uploaded "Breadcrumb" Waypoint (WA2)</i>	160
9.3.8	<i>Full Automation (FA)</i>	160
9.3.8.1	<i>Uploaded "Breadcrumbs" with Route Suggestion Full Automation (FA1)</i>	160
9.3.8.2	<i>Self-Determining Full Automation (FA2)</i>	160
9.4	<i>Mathematically Modeling Human Input Proportion (H) versus System Configuration</i>	161
9.4.1	<i>Modeling H versus System Configuration Methodology</i>	161
9.4.2	<i>Analyzing the Results of Modeling H versus System Configuration</i>	165
9.4.3	<i>Partitioning the Automation Continuum for H versus System Configuration into Regimes and Analyzing the Results</i>	168
9.5	<i>Mathematically Modeling Robotic Decision-Making Ability (R) versus System Configuration</i>	169
9.5.1	<i>Modeling R versus System Configuration Methodology</i>	169
9.5.2	<i>Mathematically Modeling R versus System Configuration When Weighted by H</i>	171
9.5.3	<i>Partitioning the Automation Continuum for R (Weighted by H) versus System Configuration into Regimes</i>	175
9.5.4	<i>Summarizing the Results of Modeling H versus System Configuration and R versus System Configuration When Weighted by H</i>	177
9.6	<i>Mathematically Modeling H and R</i>	178
9.6.1	<i>Analyzing the Results of Modeling H versus R</i>	178
9.7	<i>Conclusion</i>	180
9.A	<i>System Configurations</i>	180
10	Experimental Design for Unmanned Aerial Systems Analysis: Bringing Statistical Rigor to UAS Testing	187
10.1	<i>Introduction</i>	187
10.2	<i>Some UAS History</i>	188
10.3	<i>Statistical Background for Experimental Planning</i>	189
10.4	<i>Planning the UAS Experiment</i>	192
10.4.1	<i>General Planning Guidelines</i>	192
10.4.2	<i>Planning Guidelines for UAS Testing</i>	193
10.4.2.1	<i>Determine Specific Questions to Answer</i>	194
10.4.2.2	<i>Determine Role of the Human Operator</i>	194

10.4.2.3	<i>Define and Delineate Factors of Concern for the Study</i>	195
10.4.2.4	<i>Determine and Correlate Response Data</i>	196
10.4.2.5	<i>Select an Appropriate Design</i>	196
10.4.2.6	<i>Define the Test Execution Strategy</i>	198
10.5	<i>Applications of the UAS Planning Guidelines</i>	199
10.5.1	<i>Determine the Specific Research Questions</i>	199
10.5.2	<i>Determining the Role of Human Operators</i>	199
10.5.3	<i>Determine the Response Data</i>	200
10.5.4	<i>Define the Experimental Factors</i>	200
10.5.5	<i>Establishing the Experimental Protocol</i>	201
10.5.6	<i>Select the Appropriate Design</i>	202
10.5.6.1	<i>Verifying Feasibility and Practicality of Factor Levels</i>	202
10.5.6.2	<i>Factorial Experimentation</i>	202
10.5.6.3	<i>The First Validation Experiment</i>	203
10.5.6.4	<i>Analysis: Developing a Regression Model</i>	204
10.5.6.5	<i>Software Comparison</i>	204
10.6	<i>Conclusion</i>	205
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	205
	<i>Disclaimer</i>	205
	<i>References</i>	205
11	Total Cost of Ownership (TOC): An Approach for Estimating UMAS Costs	207
11.1	<i>Introduction</i>	207
11.2	<i>Life Cycle Models</i>	208
11.2.1	<i>DoD 5000 Acquisition Life Cycle</i>	208
11.2.2	<i>ISO 15288 Life Cycle</i>	208
11.3	<i>Cost Estimation Methods</i>	210
11.3.1	<i>Case Study and Analogy</i>	210
11.3.2	<i>Bottom-Up and Activity Based</i>	211
11.3.3	<i>Parametric Modeling</i>	212
11.4	<i>UMAS Product Breakdown Structure</i>	212
11.4.1	<i>Special Considerations</i>	212
11.4.1.1	<i>Mission Requirements</i>	214
11.4.2	<i>System Capabilities</i>	214
11.4.3	<i>Payloads</i>	214
11.5	<i>Cost Drivers and Parametric Cost Models</i>	215
11.5.1	<i>Cost Drivers for Estimating Development Costs</i>	215
11.5.1.1	<i>Hardware</i>	215
11.5.1.2	<i>Software</i>	218
11.5.1.3	<i>Systems Engineering and Project Management</i>	218
11.5.1.4	<i>Performance-Based Cost Estimating Relationship</i>	220
11.5.1.5	<i>Weight-Based Cost Estimating Relationship</i>	223
11.5.2	<i>Proposed Cost Drivers for DoD 5000.02 Phase Operations and Support</i>	224
11.5.2.1	<i>Logistics–Transition from Contractor Life Support (CLS) to Organic Capabilities</i>	224

11.5.2.2	<i>Training</i>	224
11.5.2.3	<i>Operations—Manned Unmanned Systems Teaming (MUM-T)</i>	225
11.6	Considerations for Estimating Unmanned Ground Vehicle Costs	225
11.7	Additional Considerations for UMAS Cost Estimation	230
11.7.1	<i>Test and Evaluation</i>	230
11.7.2	<i>Demonstration</i>	230
11.8	Conclusion	230
	Acknowledgments	231
	References	231
12	Logistics Support for Unmanned Systems	233
12.1	Introduction	233
12.2	Appreciating Logistics Support for Unmanned Systems	233
12.2.1	<i>Logistics</i>	234
12.2.2	<i>Operations Research and Logistics</i>	236
12.2.3	<i>Unmanned Systems</i>	240
12.3	Challenges to Logistics Support for Unmanned Systems	242
12.3.1	<i>Immediate Challenges</i>	242
12.3.2	<i>Future Challenges</i>	242
12.4	Grouping the Logistics Challenges for Analysis and Development	243
12.4.1	<i>Group A—No Change to Logistics Support</i>	243
12.4.2	<i>Group B—Unmanned Systems Replacing Manned Systems and Their Logistics Support Frameworks</i>	244
12.4.3	<i>Group C—Major Changes to Unmanned Systems Logistics</i>	247
12.5	Further Considerations	248
12.6	Conclusions	251
	References	251
13	Organizing for Improved Effectiveness in Networked Operations	255
13.1	Introduction	255
13.2	Understanding the IACM	256
13.3	An Agent-Based Simulation Representation of the IACM	259
13.4	Structure of the Experiment	260
13.5	Initial Experiment	264
13.6	Expanding the Experiment	265
13.7	Conclusion	269
	Disclaimer	270
	References	270
14	An Exploration of Performance Distributions in Collectives	271
14.1	Introduction	271
14.2	Who Shoots How Many?	272
14.3	Baseball Plays as Individual and Networked Performance	273
14.4	Analytical Questions	275