



BIOETHICS IN CONTEXT

Moral, Legal, and Social Perspectives

GARY E. JONES AND
JOSEPH P. DEMARCO

BIOETHICS IN CONTEXT

Moral, Legal, and Social Perspectives

GARY E. JONES AND
JOSEPH P. DEMARCO



broadview press

BROADVIEW PRESS – www.broadviewpress.com
Peterborough, Ontario, Canada

Founded in 1985, Broadview Press remains a wholly independent publishing house. Broadview's focus is on academic publishing; our titles are accessible to university and college students as well as scholars and general readers. With over 600 titles in print, Broadview has become a leading international publisher in the humanities, with world-wide distribution. Broadview is committed to environmentally responsible publishing and fair business practices.

© 2016 Gary E. Jones and Joseph P. DeMarco

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, kept in an information storage and retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or otherwise, except as expressly permitted by the applicable copyright laws or through written permission from the publisher.

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Jones, Gary E., Ph.D., author

Bioethics in context : moral, legal, and social perspectives / Gary E. Jones and Joseph P. DeMarco.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-55481-234-9 (paperback)

1. Bioethics—Textbooks. 2. Medical ethics—Textbooks. 3. Bioethics—Law and legislation—United States. 4. Medical laws and legislation—United States. 5. Science—Law and legislation—United States. I. DeMarco, Joseph P., 1943-, author II. Title.

QH332.J664 2016

174.2

C2016-904220-0

Broadview Press handles its own distribution in North America

PO Box 1243, Peterborough, Ontario K9J 7H5, Canada

555 Riverwalk Parkway, Tonawanda, NY 14150, USA

Tel: (705) 743-8990; Fax: (705) 743-8353

email: customerservice@broadviewpress.com

Distribution is handled by Eurospan Group in the UK, Europe, Central Asia, Middle East, Africa, India, Southeast Asia, Central America, South America, and the Caribbean. Distribution is handled by Footprint Books in Australia and New Zealand.

Canada Broadview Press acknowledges the financial support of the Government of Canada through the Canada Book Fund for our publishing activities.

Edited by Martin R. Boyne

Book Design by Em Dash Design

PRINTED IN CANADA

Contents

Acknowledgments 15

Introduction 17

Chapter 1: Moral Theory in Bioethics 25

CONSEQUENTIALISM AND DEONTOLOGY 25

Consequentialism 28

RULE CONSEQUENTIALISM 33

HARE'S UTILITARIANISM 37

Kantian Deontology 38

Rule Theory 43

Case Study: Dr. Mando 47

ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES 49

Principlism 49

Particularism 53

Virtue Ethics 56

Feminist Ethics and the Ethics of Care 60

Casuistry 64

CONCLUSION 66

EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS 68

Chapter 2: Basic Law 73

THE AMERICAN LEGAL SYSTEM 73

Common Law 73

Statutory Law 75

<i>Executive Orders and Agencies</i>	76
<i>Constitutional Law</i>	76
<i>State Court Systems</i>	77
<i>The Federal Court System</i>	78
LEGAL PROCESSES AND LAWSUITS	79
<i>Legal Processes</i>	79
<i>Lawsuits</i>	79
ETHICS AND THE LAW	81
CONCLUSION	83
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	84
Chapter 3: Justice and the Right to Care	85
THE MEANING OF JUSTICE	85
JUSTICE AND EQUALITY	86
<i>Equality of Resources: Ronald Dworkin</i>	87
<i>Group Equality: R.H. Tawney</i>	89
<i>Complex Equality: Michael Walzer</i>	90
<i>Criteria of Just Distribution</i>	90
THEORIES OF JUSTICE	92
<i>Utilitarian Theory</i>	92
<i>Social Contract Theory</i>	93
<i>Libertarian Theory</i>	95
<i>Feminist Ethics and Just Health Care</i>	96
<i>Norman Daniels's Approach to Health-Care Justice</i>	97
<i>Just Health Care: Beauchamp and Childress</i>	98
ALLOCATION OF HEALTH CARE	99
<i>Models for the Allocation of Health Care to Individuals</i>	99
THE PROPRIETARY MODEL	99
THE MERIT MODEL	102
THE SOCIAL WORTH MODEL	103
THE NEED MODEL	104
<i>Policy Options for the Allocation of Health Care</i>	105
FEE-FOR-SERVICE MODEL	105
THE UNIVERSAL AND COMPREHENSIVE PROVISION OF BENEFITS	
MODEL	106
FEE-FOR-SERVICE WITH A SAFETY NET MODEL	107
UNIVERSAL BASIC HEALTH-CARE MODEL	108

<i>Professional Considerations</i>	108
<i>Containment of Health-Care Costs</i>	109
<i>Rationing of Health Care</i>	111
PATIENT PROTECTION AND AFFORDABLE CARE ACT	115
<i>The PPACA and the Iron Triangle</i>	116
ACCESSIBILITY	117
QUALITY	117
COST	119
<i>Concerns about the Viability of the PPACA</i>	121
<i>The PPACA and the US Constitution</i>	122
EXPANSION OF MEDICAID	123
INDIVIDUAL MANDATE	124
<i>Ethical Aspects of the Individual Mandate and Medicaid Expansion</i>	125
CONCLUSION	128
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	129
 Chapter 4: The Duty to Treat	 131
PHYSICIANS AND OTHER HEALTH-CARE PROVIDERS	131
<i>In General, No Duty to Treat</i>	131
<i>Duty Not to Abandon</i>	133
<i>Is There a Moral Duty to Treat?</i>	134
<i>Standards of Care</i>	135
<i>Malpractice</i>	138
<i>Good Samaritan Laws</i>	139
HOSPITALS	141
<i>Medicare</i>	141
<i>Medicaid</i>	142
<i>Emergency Treatment</i>	143
<i>Staff Physicians</i>	145
<i>Nurses</i>	145
RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF THIRD-PARTY PAYERS	146
<i>ERISA: Employment Retirement Income Security Act</i>	152
CONCLUSION	154
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	155

Chapter 5: Informed Consent 157

THE BASICS OF INFORMED CONSENT 158

- Three Concepts of Informed Consent* 159
- Elements of Informed Consent* 162
- Disclosure* 163
- Waiving and Delegating Informed Consent* 165
- Proxy Decision Making* 166
- Advance Directives* 167

ASSESSING CAPACITY 169

- The Meaning of Decisional Capacity* 169
- Mental Illness and Capacity to Consent* 175
- Enhancing Capacity* 175
- Capacity: Young and Old* 178
- Religion and Capacity* 178
- Does Rejection of Treatment Indicate Incapacity?* 179
- Erring on the Side of Autonomy* 179
- Assessing Capacity* 180

INFORMED CONSENT: ETHICAL ISSUES 181

- Constraints on Informed Consent* 181
 - COERCION 181
 - MANIPULATION 182
 - OFFERS AND REWARDS 183
 - INFLUENCE 183
- Medical Paternalism* 184
- Autonomy vs. Beneficence* 184
- Ethical Evaluation of Informed Consent* 185
- Informed Consent and Ethics Committees* 186

INFORMED CONSENT: LEGAL ISSUES 187

- The Scope of Informed Consent* 188
 - COMMUNITY OF PHYSICIANS STANDARD 188
 - REASONABLE PHYSICIAN STANDARD 190
 - OBJECTIVE PATIENT STANDARD 191
 - SUBJECTIVE PATIENT STANDARD 195
- Three Exceptions to Informed Consent* 195
 - INCOMPETENCY 195
 - EMERGENCY CARE 196
 - THE THERAPEUTIC PRIVILEGE 196

<i>Legal Consequences of the Failure to Obtain Informed Consent</i>	198
<i>Revising Informed Consent</i>	202
<i>False Imprisonment</i>	203
<i>Special Problem Areas</i>	207
CONCLUSION	211
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	213
Chapter 6: Informed Refusal and the Discontinuation of Treatment 221	
THE CRITERIA FOR AND MEANING OF DEATH	221
Persistent Vegetative States	223
Religious Objections to the Brain-Death Criterion	224
MEDICAL FUTILITY	224
<i>What Is Medical Futility?</i>	225
PHYSIOLOGICAL OR STRICT FUTILITY	228
QUANTITATIVE FUTILITY	228
QUALITATIVE FUTILITY	228
<i>Case Studies of Medical Futility</i>	229
ARE WANGLIE AND BABY K CASES OF MEDICAL FUTILITY?	231
<i>Who Decides?</i>	231
<i>What Is the Chance of Success?</i>	232
<i>Policies on Futility</i>	234
THE AMA POLICY	235
THE TEXAS STATUTE	235
DISCONTINUING MEDICAL TREATMENT	237
<i>Determining Whether to Discontinue Treatment</i>	237
FAMILY CONSENT	238
SUBSTITUTED JUDGMENT	238
BEST INTEREST STANDARD	239
MIXED STANDARD: LIMITED OBJECTIVE TEST	239
<i>Withdrawing versus Withholding Treatment</i>	242
<i>Passive Euthanasia</i>	243
<i>Active Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide</i>	243
THE ETHICS AND LAWS OF ASSISTED SUICIDE	245

ETHICAL AND LEGAL FOUNDATIONS OF INFORMED REFUSAL	246
<i>The Ethics of Informed Refusal</i>	246
<i>Legal Foundations of Informed Refusal</i>	246
KAREN QUINLAN: PRIVACY AND TREATMENT	247
NANCY CRUZAN: CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE	249
ELIZABETH BOUVIA: DO MOTIVES MATTER?	249
REMOVING RESPIRATORS VERSUS REMOVING FEEDING TUBES	250
OTHER CASES: SCHIAVO AND BORENSTEIN	250
TREATMENT DECISIONS INVOLVING CHILDREN	254
<i>Birth Defects and Treatments</i>	255
<i>Parental Autonomy and Mandated Treatment</i>	256
<i>Refusal of Treatment for Religious Reasons</i>	259
CONCLUSION	261
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	261
Chapter 7: Nursing: Legal and Moral Issues	267
WHAT IS NURSING?	267
<i>Licensure and Credentialing</i>	268
<i>Nurse Practice Acts and Nursing Boards</i>	269
<i>Standard of Care</i>	272
<i>Nurses and Conscience Clauses</i>	276
THE LIMITS OF NURSES' RESPONSIBILITIES	278
<i>Nurses and Diagnoses</i>	278
<i>Whose Obligation: Nurse's or Physician's?</i>	279
<i>Nurses Practicing Medicine?</i>	280
<i>Advocating for a Patient</i>	283
<i>Boundary Violations</i>	285
<i>Nurses in Emergencies</i>	285
SOME PARTICULAR DUTIES AND OBLIGATIONS	286
<i>Nursing Assessment</i>	286
<i>Acquiring Informed Consent</i>	286
<i>Duty to Protect against Patient Self-Harm</i>	290
<i>Duty to Warn Third Parties</i>	291
<i>Reporting Suspected Child Abuse</i>	292
CONCLUSION	292
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	293

Chapter 8: Privacy and Confidentiality 297

PRIVACY 298

Privacy as a Moral Rule 300

Utilitarian Justifications for Privacy 302

Covert Surveillance 303

The Legal Right to Privacy 305

THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY OF CONDUCT 305

THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY OF INFORMATION 307

CONFIDENTIALITY 307

The Physician–Patient Relationship 307

The Physician's Obligation of Confidentiality 310

HIPAA Regulations 311

Maintaining Confidentiality 312

Other Legal Exceptions to Confidentiality 314

EVALUATING THE TARASOFF CASE 318

HIV and the Law 319

Duty to Warn of Genetic Risk 321

CONCLUSION 324

EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS 324

Chapter 9: Cultural Competency 329

THE IMPORTANCE OF CULTURAL COMPETENCY 329

Reasons in Support of Cultural Competency 330

MEDICAL DIAGNOSES AND CULTURAL DIFFERENCE 332

Reacting to Patients: Responding to Differences 335

Respecting Differences and Negotiating Biases 336

Responding to Patient Biases 339

Not All People in Any Culture Are the Same 340

Whose Culture Dominates? 341

The Initial Encounter with Patients 342

CULTURAL COMPETENCY AND INFORMED CONSENT 344

Cultural Competency and Informed Refusal 345

CULTURAL COMPETENCY AND TRANSLATION 346

Translation and the Law 352

When Culture Conflicts with the Law 354

DECIDING TO REPORT 355

BALANCING MORAL AND LEGAL OBLIGATIONS 358

THE AFFORDABLE CARE ACT	358
CONCLUSION	362
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	363
Chapter 10: Issues in Human Reproduction	367
ABORTION	367
<i>Fetuses and Personhood</i>	368
<i>Philosophical Perspectives on Abortion</i>	370
<i>Legal Aspects of Abortion</i>	372
THE LEGAL STATUS OF THE FETUS	375
IN VITRO FERTILIZATION	381
SURROGATE MOTHERHOOD	384
INVOLUNTARY STERILIZATION	387
GENETIC TESTING AND TREATMENTS	390
<i>Genetics and Disease</i>	390
<i>Genetic Testing</i>	392
<i>Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis</i>	393
GENETIC ENHANCEMENTS	395
<i>Senescence</i>	400
<i>Happiness</i>	401
THE STEM-CELL DEBATE	402
HUMAN CLONING	406
<i>Cloning to Produce Children</i>	406
<i>Cloning for Research Purposes</i>	408
CONCLUSION	410
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	411
Chapter 11: Mental Illness	415
WHAT IS MENTAL ILLNESS?	415
COMMITMENT, CONSENT, AND DECISION MAKING	416
<i>Institutional Commitment and Consent</i>	417
<i>Treatment Decisions</i>	418
INCOMPETENCE	422
<i>The Use of Restraints</i>	422

LEGAL RESPONSIBILITIES AND LIABILITIES	424
<i>Malpractice</i>	424
<i>Duties to Third Parties</i>	426
CONCLUSION	428
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	429
 Chapter 12: Medical Research: Clinical Trials	 433
WHAT ARE CLINICAL TRIALS?	433
PROTECTING RESEARCH SUBJECTS	435
<i>Historical Abuse</i>	435
<i>The Belmont Report</i>	437
<i>The Declaration of Helsinki</i>	440
PLACEBOS	440
TYPES OF CLINICAL TRIALS	443
<i>Phase I Trials</i>	443
<i>Phase II Trials</i>	445
<i>Phase III Trials</i>	446
PROTOCOLS	447
CLINICAL EQUIPOISE	448
PARTICIPATION IN A CLINICAL TRIAL	449
FEDERAL REGULATIONS	451
LEGAL ISSUES IN CLINICAL TRIALS	457
<i>Abney, et al. v. Amgen Inc.</i>	457
<i>Grimes v. Kennedy Krieger Institute, Inc.; Myron Higgins, A Minor, Etc., et al. v. Kennedy Krieger Institute, Inc.</i>	459
<i>Kristina Ann Dahl, MD, et al. v. HEM Pharmaceuticals, Inc., et al.</i>	461
<i>Estate of Kevin Baker v. University of Vermont</i>	462
<i>Greenberg, et al. v. Miami Children's Hospital Research Institute, Inc., et al.</i>	465
CONCLUSION	468
EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	468

Chapter 13: Transplantation Ethics 477

ORGAN DONATION 477

EVALUATING PROSPECTIVE ORGAN RECIPIENTS 478

SELLING ORGANS 480

LIVE DONORS 481

Donors Lacking Competence 482

Donations against One's Will 484

PRISONERS AS ORGAN DONORS 486

CONCLUSION 487

EXERCISES AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS 487

Index 491

Index of Court Cases 507

Index of Statutes 511

Index of Model Acts 513

Bioethics in Context

BIOETHICS IN CONTEXT

Moral, Legal, and Social Perspectives

GARY E. JONES AND
JOSEPH P. DEMARCO



broadview press

