

*Blackwell
Companions to
Philosophy*

A COMPANION TO THE PHILOSOPHY OF LANGUAGE

VOLUME I

Second Edition



Edited by
BOB HALE, CRISPIN WRIGHT,
and ALEXANDER MILLER

WILEY Blackwell

A COMPANION TO THE PHILOSOPHY OF LANGUAGE

SECOND EDITION

Volume I

Edited by

Bob Hale, Crispin Wright,
and Alexander Miller

WILEY Blackwell

This second edition first published 2017
© 2017 John Wiley & Sons Ltd

Edition history: Blackwell Publishing Ltd. (1e, 1997)

Registered Office

John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

Editorial Offices

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA

9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK

The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The right of Bob Hale, Crispin Wright, and Alexander Miller to be identified as the authors of the editorial material in this work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks, or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and authors have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data is available for this title

Hardback ISBN: 9781118974711

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Cover image: *The Chateau of Medan*, by Paul Cezanne (1839–1906) /
© CSG CIC Glasgow Museums and Libraries Collections

Set in 10/12.5pt Minion by SPi Global, Pondicherry, India

Printed in Singapore by C.O.S. Printers Pte Ltd

A Companion to the Philosophy of Language

Blackwell Companions to Philosophy

This outstanding student reference series offers a comprehensive and authoritative survey of philosophy as a whole. Written by today's leading philosophers, each volume provides lucid and engaging coverage of

the key figures, terms, topics, and problems of the field. Taken together, the volumes provide the ideal basis for course use, representing an unparalleled work of reference for students and specialists alike.

Already published in the series:

1. The Blackwell Companion to Philosophy, Second Edition
Edited by Nicholas Bunnin and Eric Tsui-James
2. A Companion to Ethics
Edited by Peter Singer
3. A Companion to Aesthetics, Second Edition
Edited by Stephen Davies, Kathleen Marie Higgins, Robert Hopkins, Robert Stecker, and David E. Cooper
4. A Companion to Epistemology, Second Edition
Edited by Jonathan Dancy, Ernest Sosa, and Matthias Steup
5. A Companion to Contemporary Political Philosophy (two-volume set), Second Edition
Edited by Robert E. Goodin and Philip Pettit
6. A Companion to Philosophy of Mind
Edited by Samuel Guttenplan
7. A Companion to Metaphysics, Second Edition
Edited by Jaegwon Kim, Ernest Sosa, and Gary S. Rosenkrantz
8. A Companion to Philosophy of Law and Legal Theory, Second Edition
Edited by Dennis Patterson
9. A Companion to Philosophy of Religion, Second Edition
Edited by Charles Taliaferro, Paul Draper, and Philip L. Quinn
10. A Companion to the Philosophy of Language
Edited by Bob Hale and Crispin Wright
11. A Companion to World Philosophies
Edited by Eliot Deutsch and Ron Bontekoe
12. A Companion to Continental Philosophy
Edited by Simon Critchley and William Schroeder
13. A Companion to Feminist Philosophy
Edited by Alison M. Jaggar and Iris Marion Young
14. A Companion to Cognitive Science
Edited by William Bechtel and George Graham
15. A Companion to Bioethics, Second Edition
Edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer
16. A Companion to the Philosophers
Edited by Robert L. Arrington
17. A Companion to Business Ethics
Edited by Robert E. Frederick
18. A Companion to the Philosophy of Science
Edited by W. H. Newton-Smith
19. A Companion to Environmental Philosophy
Edited by Dale Jamieson
20. A Companion to Analytic Philosophy
Edited by A. P. Martinich and David Sosa
21. A Companion to Genetics
Edited by Justine Burley and John Harris
22. A Companion to Philosophical Logic
Edited by Dale Jacquette
23. A Companion to Early Modern Philosophy
Edited by Steven Nadler
24. A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages
Edited by Jorge J. E. Gracia and Timothy B. Noone
25. A Companion to African-American Philosophy
Edited by Tommy L. Lott and John P. Pittman
26. A Companion to Applied Ethics
Edited by R. G. Frey and Christopher Heath Wellman
27. A Companion to the Philosophy of Education
Edited by Randall Curren
28. A Companion to African Philosophy
Edited by Kwasi Wiredu
29. A Companion to Heidegger
Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
30. A Companion to Rationalism
Edited by Alan Nelson
31. A Companion to Pragmatism
Edited by John R. Shook and Joseph Margolis
32. A Companion to Ancient Philosophy
Edited by Mary Louise Gill and Pierre Pellegrin
33. A Companion to Nietzsche
Edited by Keith Ansell Pearson
34. A Companion to Socrates
Edited by Sara Ahbel-Rappe and Rachana Kamtekar
35. A Companion to Phenomenology and Existentialism
Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
36. A Companion to Kant
Edited by Graham Bird
37. A Companion to Plato
Edited by Hugh H. Benson
38. A Companion to Descartes
Edited by Janet Broughton and John Carriero
39. A Companion to the Philosophy of Biology
Edited by Sahotra Sarkar and Anya Plutynski
40. A Companion to Hume
Edited by Elizabeth S. Radcliffe
41. A Companion to the Philosophy of History and Historiography
Edited by Aviezer Tucker
42. A Companion to Aristotle
Edited by Georgios Anagnostopoulos
43. A Companion to the Philosophy of Technology
Edited by Jan-Kyrre Berg Olsen, Stig Andur Pedersen, and Vincent F. Hendricks
44. A Companion to Latin American Philosophy
Edited by Susana Nuccetelli, Ofelia Schutte, and Otávio Bueno
45. A Companion to the Philosophy of Literature
Edited by Garry L. Hagberg and Walter Jost
46. A Companion to the Philosophy of Action
Edited by Timothy O'Connor and Constantine Sandis
47. A Companion to Relativism
Edited by Steven D. Hales
48. A Companion to Hegel
Edited by Stephen Houlgate and Michael Baur
49. A Companion to Schopenhauer
Edited by Bart Vandenabeele
50. A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy
Edited by Steven M. Emmanuel
51. A Companion to Foucault
Edited by Christopher Falzon, Timothy O'Leary, and Jana Sawicki
52. A Companion to the Philosophy of Time
Edited by Heather Dyke and Adrian Bardon
53. A Companion to Donald Davidson
Edited by Ernest Lepore and Kirk Ludwig
54. A Companion to Rawls
Edited by Jon Mandle and David Reidy
55. A Companion to W.V.O. Quine
Edited by Gilbert Harman and Ernest Lepore
56. A Companion to Derrida
Edited by Zeynep Direk and Leonard Lawlor
57. A Companion to David Lewis
Edited by Barry Loewer and Jonathan Schaffer
58. A Companion to Kierkegaard
Edited by Jon Stewart
59. A Companion to Locke
Edited by Matthew Stuart
60. The Blackwell Companion to Hermeneutics
Edited by Niall Keane and Chris Lawn
61. A Companion to Ayn Rand
Edited by Allan Gotthelf and Gregory Salmieri
62. The Blackwell Companion to Naturalism
Edited by Kelly James Clark

Forthcoming:

A Companion to Mill

Edited by Christopher Macleod and Dale E. Miller

List of Contributors

Paul Artin Boghossian is Silver Professor of Philosophy at New York University and Director of its New York Institute of Philosophy. He has published many papers on the philosophy of mind and the philosophy of language, on such topics as color, rule-following, eliminativism, naturalism, self-knowledge, *a priori* knowledge, analytic truth, realism, and relativism. He is the author of *Fear of Knowledge* (Oxford University Press, 2006) and co-editor of *New Essays on the A Priori* (with Christopher Peacocke; Oxford University Press, 2000). A collection of his essays – *Content and Justification* – was published by Oxford University Press in 2008. A series of exchanges with Timothy Williamson, some previously published some new, on the analytic and the *a priori*, will appear from Oxford University Press in 2018.

Berit Brogaard is Director of the Brogaard Lab for Multisensory Research and Professor of Philosophy at the University of Miami. Her areas of research include perception, consciousness, emotions, philosophical psychology, semantics, and philosophical logic. She has written three books: *Transient Truths* (Oxford University Press, 2012), *On Romantic Love* (Oxford University Press, 2015), and *The Superhuman Mind* (Penguin, 2015), as well as over one hundred peer-reviewed articles.

John Collins is Professor of Philosophy at the University of East Anglia. He has published widely in the philosophy of language and mind, with especial reference to generative linguistics, and on the concept of truth. He is the author of *Chomsky: A Guide for the Perplexed* (Continuum, 2008) and *The Unity of Linguistic Meaning* (Oxford University Press, 2011), and co-editor of *Experimental Philosophy, Rationalism, and Naturalism* (with Eugen Fischer; Routledge, 2015).

Edward Craig is former Knightbridge Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cambridge, and has been a Fellow of the British Academy since 1993. He is the author of *The Mind of God and the Works of Man* (Oxford University Press, 1987) and *Knowledge and the State of Nature* (Oxford University Press, 1990), as well as articles on various topics in the theory of knowledge and philosophy of language. He is chief editor of the *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

Andy Egan is Professor of Philosophy at Rutgers University. He has held positions at the University of Michigan and the Australian National University. He attended graduate school at the University of Colorado and Massachusetts Institute of Technology. He works primarily in philosophy of language and philosophy of mind.

Kit Fine is University Professor and Silver Professor of Philosophy and Mathematics at New York University. His areas of interest include philosophical logic, philosophy of language, and metaphysics and his more recent books include *Modality and Tense* (Oxford University Press, 2005) and *Semantic Relationism* (Blackwell, 2007). He is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Letters, and a corresponding Fellow of the British Academy.

Graeme Forbes is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado at Boulder. He is the author of *Attitude Problems* (Oxford University Press, 2006) and the textbook *Modern Logic* (Oxford University Press, 1994). He works mainly in semantics, metaphysics, and logic, and has interests in compositionality, intensionality, modal metaphysics, and modal logic.

Anthony S. Gillies is Professor of Philosophy at Rutgers University, and previously taught at the University of Michigan, Harvard, and the University of Texas at Austin, and was White Distinguished Visiting Professor at the University of Chicago. His research interests are in philosophy of language: formal semantics and pragmatics; epistemology: belief revision, defeasible reasoning; philosophical logic; and decision/game theory.

Bob Hale is an Emeritus Professor at the University of Sheffield, and his main research interests are in the foundations of mathematics, and philosophy of logic and language. He is a member of the editorial board of *Philosophia Mathematica*, and is author of *Abstract Objects* (Blackwell, 1987) and *Necessary Beings* (Oxford University Press, 2013; revised 2nd edn, 2015); co-editor of *Reading Putnam* (with Peter Clark; Blackwell, 1994); co-editor of *Modality: Metaphysics, Logic, and Epistemology* (with Aviv Hoffmann; Oxford University Press, 2010); and co-author of *The Reason's Proper Study* (with Crispin Wright; Oxford University Press, 2001).

Anandi Hattiangadi has been Professor of Philosophy at Stockholm University and Pro Futura Scientia Fellow at the Swedish Collegium of Advanced Studies since 2013, before which she was a tutorial fellow of St Hilda's College, Oxford. She has research interests in the philosophy of mind and language, epistemology, metaphysics, and metaethics. Her publications include *Oughts and Thoughts: Rule-Following and the Normativity of Content* (Oxford University Press, 2007), as well as numerous articles on the normativity of meaning, content, and belief.

Jussi Haukioja is Professor of Philosophy at the Norwegian University of Science and Technology and editor of the volume *Advances in Experimental Philosophy of Language* (Bloomsbury, 2015). His research interests are in philosophy of language, philosophy of mind, and realism and anti-realism.

Jane Heal is Emeritus Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of St John's College. Her interests are mainly in philosophy of language and

philosophy of mind. Her previous publications include her book *Fact and Meaning* (Blackwell, 1989) and several journal articles in these areas. She was elected a Fellow of the British Academy in 1997.

Barry Loewer is Professor and Director of the Rutgers Center for Philosophy and the Sciences. His published work lies mainly in the philosophy of mind and psychology, the philosophy of quantum mechanics, and metaphysics, including the book *Why There is Anything Except Physics* (Oxford University Press, 2008).

Guy Longworth is Associate Professor in Philosophy at the University of Warwick. He works mainly in the philosophy of language and mind, including intersections with epistemology.

E. J. Lowe was Professor of Philosophy at the University of Durham, where he taught from 1980 until his death in 2014. He authored 11 books, including *Kinds of Being* (Blackwell, 1989) and *The Possibility of Metaphysics* (Oxford University Press, 1998), and also co-edited four volumes and wrote over two hundred articles for journals and edited collections.

Michael P. Lynch is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Humanities Institute at the University of Connecticut. He is the author or editor of seven books including *In Praise of Reason* (MIT Press, 2012), *Truth as One and Many* (Oxford University Press, 2009), and *True to Life* (MIT Press, 2004). His research interests lie in pursuing problems within the intersection of epistemology, metaphysics, and the philosophy of language.

Penelope Mackie is Associate Professor and Reader in Philosophy at the University of Nottingham. She is the author of *How Things Might Have Been: Individuals, Kinds, and Essential Properties* (Oxford University Press, 2006) and of a number of articles on topics in metaphysics, including causation, modality, material constitution, free will, and the fixity of the past.

Aidan McGlynn is a lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh. He recently completed a series of papers and a monograph on knowledge first approaches to epistemology and the philosophies of language and mind. Since then, he has been working on evidence, first-person thought and self-knowledge, pornography, epistemic injustice, silencing, and objectification.

Andrew McGonigal holds a visiting professorship in philosophy at Washington and Lee University. Before taking up the position, he taught for 12 years at the University of Leeds. He is a co-editor of the *Routledge Companion to Metaphysics*, and in 2014–2015 was awarded a Society Fellowship at the Society for the Humanities at Cornell.

Alexander Miller is Professor of Philosophy and chair of the Department of Philosophy at the University of Otago. He works mainly on the philosophy of language and mind, metaphysics, and metaethics. His books include *Contemporary Metaethics: An Introduction Revised and Expanded* (2nd edn, Polity Press, 2013) and *Philosophy of Language Revised and Expanded* (2nd edn, Routledge, 2007). He is co-editor of *Rule-Following and Meaning* (with Crispin Wright; Acumen, 2002).

Richard Moran is Professor of Philosophy at Harvard University, having previously taught at Princeton University. He works primarily in the areas of moral psychology, the philosophy of mind and language, aesthetics and the philosophy of literature, and the later Wittgenstein. He has published papers on metaphor, on imagination and emotional engagement with art, and on the nature of self-knowledge. His book, *Authority and Estrangement: An Essay on Self-Knowledge*, was published by Princeton University Press in 2001.

Michael Morris is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Sussex. He is the author of *The Good and the True* (Oxford University Press, 1992), *An Introduction to the Philosophy of Language* (Cambridge University Press, 2007), and *Wittgenstein and The Tractatus* (Routledge, 2008), as well as papers in the philosophy of language and the philosophy of art.

Julien Murzi completed his PhD at the University of Sheffield in October 2010. He is Assistant Professor at the University of Salzburg, having previously been a post-doctoral fellow at the Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy (of which he continues to be an external member) and Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Kent. He has published papers on inferentialism, logical consequence, the semantic paradoxes, the realism/anti-realism debate, and the open future.

Bernhard Nickel is Professor of Philosophy at Harvard University. He works mainly in philosophy of language and semantics, with interests in metaphysics, the philosophy of science, and philosophy of mind. He is the author of *Between Logic and the World* (Oxford University Press, 2016), which presents a theory of generics and genericity.

Christian Nimtz is Professor of Theoretical Philosophy at Bielefeld University in Germany. His interests lie mainly in the philosophy of language, modal epistemology, and metaphilosophy. He has worked on natural kind terms, modal knowledge, thought experiments, and conceptual analysis.

Harold Noonan is Professor of Mind and Cognition at the University of Nottingham. He has published seven books, including *Hume* (One Word Publishers, 2007) and *Frege* (Polity Press, 2001), as well as various articles on topics in the philosophy of mind, philosophy of language, and philosophy of logic.

Christopher Peacocke is Johnsonian Professor of Philosophy at Columbia University, and was previously Waynflete Professor of Metaphysical Philosophy at the University of Oxford, where he also held a Leverhulme Personal Research Professorship. He is the author of several books, most recently *The Mirror of the World: Subjects, Consciousness, and Self-Consciousness* (Oxford University Press, 2014), and of papers in the philosophy of language, mind, psychology, and logic. He is a Fellow of the British Academy and the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

John Perry is the Waldgrave Stuart Professor of Philosophy Emeritus at Stanford University and Distinguished Professor of Philosophy Emeritus at the University of California, Riverside. He is co-director of the Center for the Explanation of Consciousness at the Center for the Study of Language and Information. He has authored several books, including the second

enlarged edition of *Reference and Reflexivity* (CSLI Publications, 2012) and various articles on the philosophy of language. He also co-hosts a weekly talk show called *Philosophy Talk*.

James Pryor is a Professor of Philosophy at New York University. His research focus is epistemology, formal semantics (especially issues at the intersection of philosophy, linguistics, and computer science), philosophy of mind, and related issues.

Mark Richard is Professor of Philosophy at Harvard University. He works in the philosophy of language, epistemology, and metaphysics, as well as in mathematical and intensional logic, philosophy of logic, and philosophy of mind. He owns a Fender Stratocaster but sadly at the moment lacks a dog. He is the author of numerous articles and books, most recently *Meaning in Context, Volume I: Context and the Attitudes* (Oxford University Press, 2013) and *Meaning in Context, Volume II: Truth and Truth Bearers* (Oxford University Press, 2015).

Ian Rumfitt is a Senior Research Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford. He works mainly in the philosophy of language, philosophical logic, and the philosophy of mathematics. His book *The Boundary Stones of Thought* (Oxford University Press, 2015) investigates conflicts between rival logical systems and how they might be rationally resolved.

Mark Sainsbury is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Texas at Austin, having formerly taught at King's College London. He is the author of *Russell* (Routledge, 1979), *Paradoxes* (Cambridge University Press, 1987), *Logical Forms* (Blackwell, 1991), *Departing From Frege* (Routledge, 2002), *Reference Without Referents* (Oxford University Press, 2005), and *Fiction and Fictionalism* (Routledge, 2009), and co-author of *Seven Puzzles of Thought and How to Solve Them: An Originalist Theory of Concepts* (with Michael Tye; Oxford University Press, 2013). His *Thinking About Things* is due out from Oxford University Press in 2017.

Stephen Schiffer is Silver Professor of Philosophy at New York University. He works primarily in philosophy of language, philosophy of mind, and metaphysics. He is the author of numerous articles and of three books: *Meaning* (Oxford University Press, 1972), *Remnants of Meaning* (MIT Press, 1987), and *The Things We Mean* (Oxford University Press, 2003). He is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

Peter Schulte teaches philosophy at the Bielefeld University. His areas of specialization are philosophy of mind, metaphysics, philosophy of language, metaethics, and free will.

Patrick Shirreff received a BA (Hons) from the University of Toronto in 2010 and is an ABD at the University of Michigan. His research focuses on the intersection of philosophy of language and epistemology. Specifically, Shirreff is interested in the semantics of epistemic language and what this semantic theorizing can show us about epistemic theorizing.

John Skorupski is Professor Emeritus of Moral Philosophy at the University of St Andrews. His current interests are in moral and political philosophy, metaethics and epistemology, and the history of nineteenth- and twentieth-century philosophy. His most recent books are *The Domain of Reasons* (Oxford University Press, 2010) and *Why Read Mill Today?* (Routledge, 2006).

Robert Stalnaker is Professor of Philosophy in the Department of Linguistics and Philosophy at MIT. His teaching and research interests are in philosophical logic, philosophy of mind, and the philosophy of language. He is the author of *Inquiry* (MIT Press, 1984), and of various articles on intentionality and the foundations of semantics and pragmatics. He also has two volumes of collected papers: *Context and Content* (Oxford University Press, 1999) and *Ways a World Might Be* (Oxford University Press, 2003).

Jason Stanley is Jacob Urowsky Professor of Philosophy at Yale University. His interests include the philosophy of language, the history and philosophy of logic, the history of analytic philosophy, epistemology, and the philosophy of mind. He is the author of four books, most recently *How Propaganda Works* (Princeton University Press, 2015) and *Know How* (Oxford University Press, 2011).

Florian Steinberger joined the Department of Philosophy at the Birkbeck University of London in 2015, prior to which he was Assistant Professor in Philosophy and Language at the Ludwig-Maximilians University in Munich and the Munich Center for Mathematical Philosophy. His main research interests include parts of epistemology, normativity, and the philosophies of logic and language.

Charles Travis is Professor Emeritus at King's College London and a Professor Afiliado in the Faculdade de Letras at the University of Porto. He has published extensively on the philosophy of language and the philosophy of mind. He is the author of many books, including *Perception: Essays After Frege* (Oxford University Press, 2013) and *Objectivity and the Parochial* (Oxford University Press, 2011), together with numerous articles.

Ralph C. S. Walker is Emeritus Fellow at Magdalen College, Oxford. His research interests are in Immanuel Kant, ethics, philosophy of religion, truth, and justification of beliefs. His publications include *Kant* (Oxford University Press, 1978) and *The Coherence Theory of Truth* (Routledge, 1988).

Brian Weatherson is the Marshall M. Weinberg Professor of Philosophy at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor. He works on epistemology, especially on issues at the intersection of ethics and epistemology, and issues at the interface between formal and traditional approaches to epistemology, as well as on many topics in philosophy of language.

Daniel Wee teaches philosophy at the Universiti Brunei Darussalam, having completed his PhD on rule-following and communitarianism at the University of Otago in 2016. His research interests are in philosophy of language, ethics, meta-philosophy, and critical thinking.

Bernhard Weiss is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cape Town. He is the editor of the collection *Dummett on Analytical Philosophy* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), and author of two books: *Michael Dummett* (Acumen, 2002) and *How To Understand Language* (Acumen, 2010). His areas of interest concern philosophies of language, logic and mathematics, and realism and anti-realism.

David Wiggins is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at Oxford. He was previously Professor of Philosophy at Birkbeck College, London, and before that Fellow and Praelector of University College, Oxford. His principal publications are *Sameness and Substance* (Blackwell, 1980) and *Needs, Values, Truth* (2nd edn, Blackwell, 1998), as well as *Ethics: Twelve Lectures on the Philosophy of Morality* (Cambridge University Press, 2006) and *Sameness and Substance Renewed* (Cambridge University Press, 2001). He is a Fellow of the British Academy.

Timothy Williamson has been Wykeham Professor of Logic at Oxford since 2000, and previously taught logic and metaphysics at the University of Edinburgh. His main research interests are in philosophical logic, epistemology, metaphysics, and philosophy of language. He is the author of *Identity and Discrimination* (Blackwell, 1990), *Vagueness* (Blackwell, 1994), *Knowledge and its Limits* (Oxford University Press, 2000), and most recently *Tetralogue* (Oxford University Press, 2015), as well as articles in journals of philosophy and logic.

Crispin Wright is Professor of Philosophy at New York University and Professor of Philosophical Research at the University of Stirling. His books include *Wittgenstein on the Foundations of Mathematics* (Harvard University Press, 1980), *Frege's Conception of Numbers as Objects* (Humanities Press, 1983), *Truth and Objectivity* (Harvard University Press, 1992), *Realism, Meaning and Truth* (2nd edn, Blackwell, 1993), *The Blackwell Companion to Philosophy of Language* (with Bob Hale; Blackwell, 1997), *The Reason's Proper Study* (with Bob Hale; Clarendon Press, 2001), *Rails to Infinity* (Harvard University Press, 2001), and *Saving the Differences* (Harvard University Press, 2003). Two collections of his papers, *The Riddle of Vagueness* and *Imploding the Demon*, are currently in preparation.

Preface to the Second Edition

We have taken advantage of Wiley-Blackwell's generous offer to publish a second and significantly expanded version of the first (1997) edition of the *Companion* to update the original chapters and to publish a range of new chapters that both broaden and deepen the coverage provided in the earlier edition.

Of the 25 chapters in the first edition, 21 have been updated, either by the original author or by a new author specifically commissioned for that purpose. Many updates take the form of postscripts to the originals, although a few simply revise and update the text from the first edition. The first edition chapter on intention and convention has been replaced by an entirely new chapter on the topic by Stephen Schiffer. The only first edition chapters reprinted unchanged are those by Christopher Peacocke, Robert Stalnaker, and Jason Stanley.

In addition to the 21 updates to the first edition and Schiffer's new chapter on intention and convention, there are 16 wholly new chapters covering both foundational issues and issues relating to specific linguistic phenomena. We have retained the tripartite structure of the original and have added a few new entries to the glossary.

We're grateful to all of our authors, both old and new, for their excellent chapters, updates, and glossary entries, and to Mark Cooper and Allison Koska at Wiley-Blackwell for their support and patience. Thanks, too, to Marielle Suba for her work on formatting final versions of the chapters, and to Marguerite Nesling and Giles Flitney for assistance with copy-editing and proofreading.

Bob Hale, Alex Miller, and Crispin Wright

Preface to the First Edition

The recent proliferation of dictionaries and encyclopedias of philosophy has resulted in no shortage of companionship for the philosophical tourist whose desire is merely for a short excursion. Our *Companion* is intended as a guide for a more determined and ambitious explorer. Thus this is no alphabetized compendium of brief statements of the principal theoretical positions, concepts, and protagonists in recent and contemporary philosophy of language, but comprises, rather, 25 extended essays on a nucleus of the most central issues in the field, each of which has seen and continues to see important work.

All of our contributors are active in research on their selected topics. Each was invited to contribute a chapter somewhat along the lines of the *State of the Art* series which *Mind* initiated in the mid-1980s: a survey and analysis of recent trends in work on the topic in question, offering a bibliography of the more important literature and incorporating a substantial research component. Accordingly, these are chapters for a philosophically experienced – advanced undergraduate, graduate, or professional – readership. Each chapter is, however, written so as to presuppose a minimum of prior knowledge of its specific subject-matter, and so offers both a self-contained overview of the relevant issues and of the shape of recent discussion of them and, for readers who want it, an up-to-date preparation for extended study of the topic concerned. There are, naturally, numerous points of connection among the chapters, some of which will be obvious enough from their titles or from a quick glance at their opening sections; others have been indicated by explicit cross-referencing. We have attempted, in the glossary, to provide concise explanations of all of the more important technical or semi-technical terms actually employed in the various chapters, and of a good number of other terms of art which, though not actually used by any of our contributors, figure centrally in other published work on the issues. The result, as we hope, is an anthology which will both stimulate research in the philosophy of language and provide an up-to-date textbook for its advanced teaching for many years to come.

Few would now subscribe to the idea which prevailed for a while in some Anglo-American philosophical circles during the 1970s, that the philosophy of language is First Philosophy, and that great issues in, for instance, metaphysics, epistemology, and the philosophy of mind, are to be resolved by, in effect, recasting them as matters for treatment within the theory of meaning. But there is no doubt that philosophy of language continues to occupy a position of central importance in contemporary philosophy, nor that some of

the best and most influential philosophical writing of the latter half of this century, by some of the foremost philosophical thinkers of our time, has been accomplished in this area. The threefold division into which we have organized the chapters closely reflects the landscaping which these leading authors have given to the subject. Part I, on *Meaning and Theories of Meaning*, comprises chapters which are all concerned, in one way or another, with issues connected to the nature of language mastery that have loomed large in the writings of Davidson, Dummett, and Grice. Part II, on *Language, Truth, and Reality*, pivots around more metaphysical issues to do with meaning: with the ongoing debate about meaning-skepticism that has drawn on the writings of Kripke, Putnam, Quine, and Wittgenstein, and with the connections between issues to do with meaning and the various debates about realism, whose excavation has been led by Dummett. Finally, Part III, on *Reference, Identity, and Necessity*, focuses on issues which take center stage in – or at least, loom large in the stage-setting for – Kripke's *Naming and Necessity*. Together, the three parts cover almost every topic that anyone familiar with contemporary work in the philosophy of language would expect to receive extensive discussion in a volume of this kind. There are nevertheless some vacancies which we would have liked, ideally, to have filled. There is, for example, no chapter focusing on the concept of a *criterion* which the first generation of commentary elicited from Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*, nor – perhaps more grievous – did we succeed in the end in commissioning a suitable study of semantic externalism or of notions of supervenience.

It remains to express our gratitude to our contributors, both for their patience with our editorial suggestions and for the excellence of their contributions and valuable assistance with glossary entries; to our publishers for bearing with us while we put together a volume which has been inevitably subject to many delays; to the secretarial staff of the Philosophy Departments of the Universities of St Andrews and Glasgow for assistance with the preparation and standardization of typescripts; and to each other.

Bob Hale and Crispin Wright

Contents

VOLUME I

<i>List of Contributors</i>	viii
<i>Preface to the Second Edition</i>	xv
<i>Preface to the First Edition</i>	xvi

Part I Meaning and Theories of Meaning **1**

1	Metaphysics, Philosophy, and the Philosophy of Language	3
	Michael Morris	
2	Meaning and Truth-Conditions: From Frege's Grand Design to Davidson's	27
	David Wiggins	
3	Intention and Convention in the Theory of Meaning	49
	Stephen Schiffer	
4	Meaning, Use, Verification	73
	John Skorupski	
	<i>Postscript: Bernhard Weiss</i>	
5	Semantics and Pragmatics	107
	Guy Longworth	
6	Pragmatics	127
	Charles Travis	
	<i>Postscript: Charles Travis</i>	
7	On the Linguistic Status of Context Sensitivity	151
	John Collins	
8	A Guide to Naturalizing Semantics	174
	Barry Loewer	
	<i>Postscript: Peter Schulte</i>	
9	Inferentialism	197
	Julien Murzi and Florian Steinberger	
10	Against Harmony	225
	Ian Rumfitt	

11	Meaning and Privacy Edward Craig <i>Postscript: Guy Longworth</i>	250
12	Tacit Knowledge Alexander Miller	272
13	Radical Interpretation Jane Heal <i>Postscript: Alexander Miller</i>	299
14	Propositional Attitudes Mark Richard	324
15	Holism Christopher Peacocke	357
16	Metaphor Richard Moran <i>Postscript: Andrew McGonigal</i>	375
17	Conditionals Anthony S. Gillies	401
18	Generics Bernhard Nickel	437
19	Deflationist Theories of Truth, Meaning, and Content Stephen Schiffer	463

VOLUME II

Part I	Language, Truth, and Reality	491
20	Realism and its Oppositions Bob Hale <i>Postscript: Bernhard Weiss</i>	493
21	Theories of Truth Ralph C. S. Walker <i>Postscript: Michael P. Lynch</i>	532
22	Truthmaker Semantics Kit Fine	556
23	Analyticity Paul Artin Boghossian <i>Postscript: Paul Artin Boghossian</i>	578
24	Rule-Following, Objectivity, and Meaning Bob Hale <i>Postscript: Daniel Wee</i>	619
25	The Normativity of Meaning Anandi Hattiangadi	649
26	Indeterminacy of Translation Crispin Wright <i>Postscript: Alexander Miller</i>	670