

The Law and Regulation of Mining

Minerals to Energy

Barlow Burke

PROFESSOR OF LAW

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY WASHINGTON COLLEGE OF LAW

Robert Beck

PROFESSOR OF LAW EMERITUS

SOUTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

Copyright © 2010
Barlow Burke
Robert Beck
All Rights Reserved

ISBN: 978-1-59460-670-0
LCCN: 2009923708

Carolina Academic Press
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Table of Cases

Cases (Reprinted opinions in **boldfaced type**)

- A.T. Massey Coal Co. v. Internat'l Union,
United Mine Workers, 199
- Adams Sanitation Co., Inc v. Common-
wealth of Pennsylvania, Dep't of
Envtl. Protection, 299
- Adolph v. Federal Emergency Manage-
ment Agency, 354
- Agins v. City of Tiburon, 327
- Agins v. Tiburon, 328
- Akers v. Baldwin, 233–235, 244
- Alabama Power Co. v. E.P.A., 756–760**
- Alaska Department of Environmental
Conservation v. EPA, 745
- Alaska Placer Co. v. Lee, 40–170
- Alfred L. Snapp Inc. v. Puerto Rico ex.
rel. Barez, 743
- Alliance for Clean Coal v. Bayh, 658
- Alliance for Clean Coal v. Miller,
658–737
- Alliant Energy Corp. v. BIE, 736–739**
- Alumet v. Bear Lake Grazing Co., 149
- Am. Petroleum Inst. v. E.P.A., 744
- American Mining Congress v. U.S. EPA,
480–565
- Andalex Resources, Inc. v. Myers, 208
- Annaco, Inc. v. Hodel, 441–444**
- Antrim Mining Inc. v. Davis, 571
- Apex Coal Corp. v. Alabama Surface
Mining, 574
- Appalachian Power Co. v. EPA, 760
- Appeal of Baird, 92
- Appeal of Fulmer, 66
- Appolo Fuels, Inc. v. United States, 377
- Arras v. Columbia Quarry Co., 139
- Arsenal Coal Company v. Common-
wealth of Pennsylvania, Dep't of
Envtl. Resources, 480
- Babcock Coal & Coke Co. v. Brackens
Creek Coal Land Co., 92
- Baier v. Glen Alden Coal Co., 134
- Ball v. Island Creek Coal Co., 116–120
- Baltimore Gas & Electric Co. v. NRDC,
495
- Barrett v. Indiana, 279
- Barton v. Thaw, 86
- Baughman v. Bradford Coal Co., 571
- BCCA v. EPA, 754
- Beacon Hill Farm Associates II v.
Loudown County Board of Supervi-
sors, 305
- Beaver Creek Coal Co. v. Nevada Power
Co., 652
- Beck v. Cagle, 211
- BedRoc Ltd. LLC v. United States, 133
- Begley v. Peabody Coal Co., 150–158
- Bennett v. Hebener, 150–153**
- Bennett v. Henderson, 48
- Benton v. Georgia Marble Co., 271
- Bethlehem Steel Corp. v. Shonk Land
Co., 150–170, 188
- Big Vein Pocahontas Co. v. Browning,
174
- Bond v. Godsey, 69
- Bonds v. Sanchez-O'Brien Oil & Gas Co.,
194
- Bonzo v. Nowlin, 67
- Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co., 743
- Bostic v. Bostic, 81
- Brady v. Stafford, 41
- Bragg v. Robertson, 574, 575–583**
- Brand v. Consolidated Coal Co., 66
- Broadwater Farms Joint Venture v.
United States, 381
- Brockman v. Jones, 40

- Brown v. Haight, 169
 Brown v. Maryland., 295
Browning v. Mountain States Coal Corp., 171–174
 Bryan v. Big Two Mile Gas Co., 170
 Budinsky v. Pennsylvania Dep't of Envtl. Resources, 479
Buffalo Mining Company v. Martin, 98–103, 111
 Bumbarger v. Walker, 134
 Bureau of Mines v. George's Creek Coal & Land Co., 354
 Bushman v. MFC Drilling, 149
 Caballo Coal Co. v. Indiana Michigan Power Co., 652–654
Cage Brothers v. McCormick, 139–142
 Cajun Electric Power Co-op v. FERC, 717
 Caldwell v. Fulton, 91
Calvert Joint Venture # 140 v. Snider, 51–57
 Cambria Coal Co. v. Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, 255
 Cameron v. Lebow, 149
 Cane Tennessee, Inc. v. United States, 352–378, 381
 Canestraro v. Faerber, 433–474
 Captline v. County of Allegheny, 311
 Carroll v. Caldwell, 211
 Case v. Elk Horn Coal Corp., 230
Castle Valley Special Serv. Dist. v. Utah Bd. of Oil, Gas and Mining, 537–540
 Catlin Coal Co. v. Lloyd, 216
 Central Ill. Pub. Serv. Co. v. Consolidated Coal Co., 651
 Central Maine Power Co. v. Federal Energy Regulatory Comm'n, 665
Chandler v. French, 71–74
Chartiers Block Coal Co. v. Mellon, 33–38, 39, 234, 278
 Cherokee Water Company v. Forderhouse, 8–9
 Chevron U.S.A., Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc., 422–453, 455, 488, 512, 550, 566, 570, 594, 599, 633, 650, 655, 773
 Childers v. Neely, 209–210
 Chosar Corp. v. Owens, 49, 61–65, 434
 Christensen v. Chromalloy American Corp., 25
 Christian Land Corp. v. C&C Co., 170
 Christman v. Emineth, 19
 Cincinnati Gas & Electric Co. v. Costle, 751
 Citizens Coal Council v. Norton, 422, 530–536
 Citizens Fidelity Bank and Tr. Co. v. Kentucky Utilities Co., 198, 645
 Citizens for Responsible Resource Development v. Watt, 555
 Citizens for the Preservation of Knox County v. Department of Mines and Minerals, 436
 Citizens Organized Against Longwalling v. Div. of Reclamation, 121, 540
 City of Northglenn, Colo. v. Grynberg, 50
 Clean Air Markets Group v. Pataki, 745
 Clinchfield Coal Co. v. Hodel, 445
 Coal Resources, Inc. v. Gulf & Western Industries, Inc., 149–159
Coalite, Inc. v. Aldridge, 134–138, 139
 Cogar v. Farber, 394
 Cogar v. Sommerville, 254–255, 328
 Commerce Union Bank v. Kinkade, 232–253
 Commonwealth v. Clearview Coal Co., 311
 Commonwealth Edison Co. v. Decker Coal Co., 651
 Commonwealth Edison Co. v. Pollution Control Bd., 746
 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania v. Panhandle Mining Co., 312
Commonwealth v. Barnes & Tucker Co., 295–299, 300
 Commonwealth v. Fitzmartin, 234
 Commonwealth v. Harmar Coal Co., 300
 Commonwealth v. PBS Coals, Inc., 557
 Commonwealth v. Watt, 410
 Communications Satellite Corp. v. FCC, 712
Connecticut v. Am. Electric Power Co., Inc., 743, 781–786
 Connecticut v. EPA, 752
 Connors v. P & M Coal Co., 199

- Consolidated Edison Co. of New York v. Pataki, 725
- Consolidated Gas Supply Corp. v. Riley, 66
- Cope v. United States Fuel Co., 214
- Coteau Properties Company v. Babbitt, 466
- Craig v. Bickel, 270
- Crews v. Plainsman Trading Co., 25
- Culp v. Consol Pennsylvania Coal Co., 132, 326
- Culp v. Consolidation Coal Co., 120 217
- Cumberland Reclamation Co. v. Secretary, United States Dept. of the Interior, 471
- Cuomo v Long Is. Light. Co., 719–722
- Davis v. Nokomis Quarry, Inc., 184–188
- Davison v. Reynolds, 39
- Defenders of Wildlife v. EPA, 612
- Del Monte Mining & Milling Co. v. Last Chance Mining & Milling Co., 9
- Dennard v. Freeport Minerals Co., 179–183
- Department for Natural Resources and Environmental Protection v. No. 8 Ltd. of Virginia, 261
- Department of Natural Resources v. Indiana Coal Council, Inc., 378–381
- Dept. of Transportation v. Goike., 127
- Dethloff v. Zeigler Coal Co., 41, 161–169
- Diederich v. Ware, 40
- Dinwiddie Construction Co. v. Campbell, 41
- DK Excavating, Inc. v. W. Va. Div. of Env'tl. Protection, 471–475
- Doe v. United States., 337
- Doochin v. Rackley, 244
- Doverspike v. Chambers, 70
- Downstate Stone Co. v. United States, 234
- Drummond Coal Co. v. Hodel, 480
- Drummond Coal Co. v. Watt, 410
- Drummond v. White Oak Fuel Co., 217
- Dubbers-Albrecht v. Nathan, 40
- Duffeld v. Hue, 92
- Dufour v. Maize, 301
- Duhig v. Peavy-Moore Lumber Co., 49
- Duke Energy and Marketing LLC. v. Davis, 670
- Dunn v. United Sierra Corp., 179
- Duquesne Light Co. v. Barasch,** 703–709, 710, 715
- Durand v. IDC Bellingham, LLC, 657
- Eagle Gas Co. v. Doran & Assocs., 66
- Eastwood Lands Inc. v. U.S. Steel Corporation, 223
- Edgar v. MITE Corp., 736
- Edwards v. Chicago and Northwestern Railway, 198
- Einsig v. Pennsylvania Mines Corp., 39
- Elk Run Coal Co. v. Babbitt, 445
- Elliot Coal Min. Co., Inc. v. Director, Office of Workers' Compensation, 91
- Ely v. Briley, 33
- English v. English,** 67–69
- Entergy Louisiana, Inc. v. La. Pub. Serv. Comm'n., 666
- Environmental Defense v. Duke Energy Corp.,** 766–772
- Environmental Defense Fund v. EPA, 747–754
- Erwin v. Bethlehem Steel Corp., 215–217
- F.P.C. v. Hope Natural Gas Co., 711
- Federal Power Comm'n v. Florida Power & Light, 661
- Federal Power Comm'n v. Hope Natural Gas Co., 677–710
- Federal Power Comm'n v. Natural Gas Pipeline, 710
- Federal Power Comm'n v. Southern California Edison Co., 661–665
- Federal Power Commission v. Conway Corp.,** 661–665
- First English Evangelical Lutheran Church of Glendale v. County of Los Angeles, 337
- First Nat'l Bank of Boston v. Konner, 8
- Fleming Foundation v. Texaco, Inc., 20–29
- Florida Rock Industries, Inc. v. United States,** 328–336, 337, 342
- Flying Diamond Corp. v. Rust, 94
- Forest Council v. Division of Mineral Resources Management, Ohio Dept. of Natural Resources, 382

- Fremont Lumber Co. v. Starrell Petroleum Co., 169
 Friedman v. Texaco, Inc., 32
 Galloway Coal Co. v. Bessemer Coal, Iron & Land Co., 42
 Garcia v. San Antonio Metropolitan Transit Authority, 291
 General Motors Corp. v. Indianapolis Power & Light Co., 745
 General Refractories Co. v. Raack, 40
 Geophysical Service, Inc. v. Thigpen, 49
 Georgia Power Co. v. Cimarron Coal Corp., 640–644
 Georgia v. Tennessee Copper Co., 741–743, 786
 Geo-Tech Reclamation Industries, Inc. v. Hamrick, 305
 Gerhard v. Stephens, 8
 Getty Oil Co. v. Jones, 30, 96–98
 Getty Oil Co. v. Royal, 96
 Gibbons v. Ogden, 295
 Gilbertson v. Charlson, 49
 Ginn v. Consolidated Coal Company, 573
 Givens v. Givens, 70
 Graham v. Drydock Coal Co., 234
 Graham v. Smith, 70
 Grams v. Environmental Quality Council, 436
 Grand Canyon Trust v. Arizona Corporation, 661
 Grannell v. Wakefield, 211
 Great Plains Resources, Inc. v. Tomlison, 104
 Griffith v. Cloud, 31
 Gulf Coast Coalition of Cities v. Public Utility Commission of Texas, 717
 Gulf Refining Co. v. Stanford, 9, 44–47
 Gwaltney of Smithfield, Ltd. v. Chesapeake Bay Fdn., 436
 Halliburton Co. v. Can-Tex Energy Corp., 126
 Hancock v. Terry Elkhorn Mining Co., 640
 Harmon Mining Corporation v. Hodel, 479
 Harper v. Regency Development Co., Inc., 139
 Harris v. Griffith, 9
 Harrison-Wyatt, LLC v. Ratliff, 128–132
 Hathorn v. Amoco Production Co., 70
 Hatton v. Falcon Coal Co., 7
 Havoco of America, Ltd. v. Sumitomo Corp. of America, 652
 Haydo v. Amerikohl Mining Co., 574
 Haydo v. Amerikohl Mining, Inc., 354
 Hayes v. Equitable Energy Resources Co., 149
 Hayes v. Howell, 235
 Hays v. Cohes Co., 133
 Heidt v. Aughenbaugh Coal Co., 234
 Heirs of Galen Roberts v. Coal Processing Corp., 93–94
 Hetrick v. Appollo Gas Co., 93
 Hieber v. Central Kentucky Traction Co., 134
 Higginbottom v. Thiele Kaolin Co., 159
 Hindman v. Farren, 179
 Hinson v. Loper, 235
 Hodel v. Indiana, 290, 409
 Hodel v. Irving, 326
 Hodel v. Virginia Surface Mining & Reclamation Ass'n, Inc., 281–290, 312–314, 350, 400, 409
 Hoffman v. Magnolia Petroleum Co., 44
 Holden v. Hardy, 279
 Holladay v. Peabody Coal Co., 103
 Holloway v. Kruger, 41
 Holmes Limestone Co. v. Andrus, 410
 Home Creek Smokeless Coal Co. v. Combs, 149
 Hovden v. Lind, 33
 Hughes v. Cowan Stone Co., 235
 Hughes v. Oklahoma, 294
 Hummel v. McFadden, 48, 86–91, 92, 233
 Hunt Oil Co. v. Kerbaugh, 50
 Hutchison v. Sunbeam Coal Corp., 150, 154–158
 Illinois South Project, Inc. v. Hodel, 430–432, 445, 480–481, 495–496
 In re Chateaugay Corp., 623–625
 In re Daniels, 623
 In re Hanson Oil Co., Inc., 171
 In re Jenny Lynn Mining Co., 623
 In re Madison Gas & Electric Co., 698
 In re Permanent Surface Mining Regulation Litigation, 326, 327, 394,

- 407–408, 410, 410–421, 445,
497–504, 584
- In the Matter of Astoria Gas Turbine
Power-LLC v. Tax Comm’n of
N.Y.C.*, 724
- In the Matter of Citizens for the Hudson
Valley v. New York State Bd.*, 658
- In the Matter of Crown/Vista Energy
Project*, 773–778
- In the Matter of Energy Ass’n of N. Y. v.
N. Y. P. S. Comm’n*, 718–724
- Ind.Mich. Power Co. v. Runge*, 665
- Indiana Coal Council, Inc. v. Lujan*,
382–422, 433
- Indiana Municipal Power Agency v.
FERC*, 670–680
- Indianapolis P. & L. Co. v. Penna. Pub.
Util. Comm’n*, 696–716
- Industrial Energy Consumers of Ohio
Power Co. v. Pub. Utilities Comm’n*,
658
- Innes v. Beauchene*, 210
- Internat’l Salt Co. v. Geostow*, 39
- Ionno v. Glen-Gery Corp.*, 145–148
- Irwin v. Yuba County*, 241
- Island Creek Coal Company v. Rodgers*,
218–223
- Jackson v. Burlington Northern, Inc.*, 33
- Jersey Central P. & L. Co. v. FERC*, 698
- Jim Walter Resources v. Southern Nat-
ural Gas*, 133
- Jones v. Consolidation Coal Co.*, 139
- Juniata Valley Bank v. Martin Oil Co.*,
206
- Karst-Robbins Coal Company, Inc. v.
Arch of Kentucky*, 121–244
- Keeble v. Heckingill*, 49
- Kelly v. Rainelle Coal Co.*, 8, 48, 74–80
- Kemmerer v. Midland Oil*, 39
- Kennecott Corp. v. Union Oil Co. of Cal-
ifornia*, 143
- Kennecott Copper v. Train*, 750
- Kennecott Corp. v. Union Oil Co.*, 184
- Kennedy v. Emerald Coal & Coke Co.*,
198
- Kennedy v. General Geophysical Co.*, 49
- Kennedy v. Hicks*, 48, 233
- Kentuckians for the Commonwealth-Inc.
v. Rivenburgh*, 585–598
- Kentucky Utilities Co. v. South East
Coal Co.*, 645
- Keystone Bituminous Coal Ass’n v.
DeBenedictis*, 314–325
- Kidd v. Hoggett*, 189
- Kimball v. Walden*, 48
- Kirby v. Ashland Oil, Inc.*, 270
- Klostermann v. Houston Geophysical*,
134
- Kunkel v. Meridian Oil Inc.*, 31
- Kunkes v. United States*, 350
- Kutsch v. Miller*, 190–193, 278
- La. Energy & Power Authority v. FERC*,
699
- L.E. Cooke Corp. v. Hayes*, 150
- Langford v. Hughes*, 189–190
- Large v. Clinchfield Coal Co.*, 117–120
- Larkin v. Laster*, 270
- Laurel Pipe Line Co. v. Bethlehem*, 574
- Lawton v. Steele*, 278
- Lear v. Chouteau*, 60
- Leet v. Vinglas*, 188
- Lenox Coal Co. v. Duncan-Spangler Coal
Co.*, 217
- Leslie Salt Co. v. United States*, 281
- Lichtenfels v. Bridgeview Coal Co.*, 92
- Lignite Energy Council v. EPA*, 778–781
- Lindsey v. Wilson*, 104
- Lloyd v. Catlin Coal Company*, 216
- Lochner v. New York*, 279
- Lockyer v. FERC*, 682–689
- Logan v. Logan*, 70
- Lomax v. Henderson*, 189
- Lomex Corp. v. McBryde*, 175–178
- Louden v. West Virginia Division of En-
vironmental Protection*, 437
- Louisiana Interstate Gas Corp. v. FERC*,
712
- Lowe v. Guyan Eagle Coals, Inc.*, 103
- Lucky Strike Coal Co. v. Department of
Environmental Resources*, 115
- Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife*, 436
- Machipongo Land and Coal Co. v. Com-
monwealth of Pennsylvania*,
361–377
- MacMaster v. Onstad.*, 33
- Madison Gas & Electric Co. v. Pub.
Serv. Comm’n of Wisc.*, 699–703

- Maine Public Service Co. v. Federal Power Commission**, 712, 732–736
Makarova v. United States, 784
Manufacturers Light & Heat Co. v. Tenant, 210
Marchetti v. Lumaghi Coal Co., 216
Martin v. Kentucky Oak Mining Co., 223–230
Martinka Coal Co. v. The West Virginia Division of Environmental Protection, 436–437
Mason v. Peabody Coal Co., 214
Massachusetts v. E.P.A., 786
McCardle v. Indianapolis Water Co., 710
McCoy v. Richards, 270
McCoy-Elkhorn Coal Corp. v. United States Env'tl. Protection Agency, 291–293
McDonough Co. v. E.I. Dupont Denemours & Co., Inc., 42–44
McGraw v. Berry, 41
McKenzie v. Cherry River Coal & Coke Co., 170
Meaher v. Getty Oil, 153
Melvin v. Old Ben Coal Company, 121, 517
Michigan v. EPA, 753
Mid-America Terminal of Ky. v. Owensboro, 39
Middleton v. Harlan-Wallins Coal Corp., 7–39, 127
Mike Ross, Inc. v. Dante Coal Co., 82–85
Miles v. Martin, 22
Miller Land & Mineral Co. v. State Highway Comm'n of Wyoming, 30
Minnesota v. Clover Leaf Creamery Co., 328
Missouri Public Service Co. v. Peabody Coal Co., 645–651
Missouri v. Illinois, 743
Mixon v. One Newco, Inc., 235
Molinary v. Powell Mountain Coal Co., 67, 433–436, 571–573, 574
Moore v. Lackey Mining Co., 103–128
Moore v. Vines, 70
Morton v. Superior Court, 640
Moser v. United States Steel Corp., 27–30
Motor Vehicle Mfrs. Ass'n v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co., 711
Mounger v. Pittman, 9
Mueller v. Stangeland, 33
Muir v. Thompson Coal Co., 174
Mullins v. Clinchfield Coal Corp., 40
Munn v. Illinois, 659
N.M. Uranium, Inc. v. Moser, 178
National Cable Television Assn. v. United States, 624
National Coal Ass'n v. Lujan, 445
National Coal Ass'n v. Uram, 445
National Lead Co. v. Magnet Cove Barium, 41
National Mining Ass'n v. Kempthorne, 395
National Mining Association v. Babbitt, 522–530
National Mining Association v. United States Dep't of the Interior, 406, 445, 455, 456–461, 462–465
National Wildlife Fed'n v. Hodel, 326–407, 422, 436, 475–477, 481, 491, 494, 497, 504, 507–513, 552–555
National Wildlife Federation v. Lujan, 326, 403, 406, 408, 429, 478, 491, 514–517, 522, 553–555
Natural Resources Defense Council v. E.P.A., 746
Natural Resources Defense Council v. Train, 570
Nectow v. City of Cambridge, 343
New Domain Oil & Gas Co. v. McKinney, 66
New Energy Co. of Indiana v. Limbach, 294
New York Public Service Commission v. Federal Energy Regulatory Comm'n, 665
New York v. EPA, 766
New York v. Reilly, 781
Newman v. RAG Wyoming Land Co., 133
Noble Hurley & Co. v. Blackjack Clay Co., 179
Nollan v. California Coastal Commission, 328
Noonan v. Pardee, 326

- Noranda Exploration, Inc. v. Ostrom, 50
 North Carolina Utilities Comm'n v.
 FERC, 698–710
 Northern Illinois Coal Corp. v. Medill,
 301, 399
 Northern Indiana Pub. Serv. Co. v. Car-
 bon County Coal Co., 651
 Northern States Power Co. v. FERC,
 666–670
 Nutter v. Stockton, 70
 Ohio Oil Co. v. Sharp, 50
 Ohio River Valley Environmental Coali-
 tion v. Timmermayer, 584
 Ohio v. EPA, 752
 Ohio Valley Environmental Coalition v.
 Bulen, 600–611, 612–617, 618
 Old Ben Coal Company v. Department
 of Mines and Minerals, 517,
 518–519
 Opal v. Material Service Corp., 134
 Oresta v. Romano Bros., Inc., 139–234
 Owens v. Thompson, 159–161
 P & N Investment Corp. v. Florida
 Ranchettes, Inc., 69
 Pace v. State ex rel Rice, 39
 Palazzollo v. Rhode Island, 327–381
 Pan Coal Co. v. Garland Pocahontas, 40
 Panhandle Cooperative Royalty Co. v.
 Cunningham, 14
 Patrick Coal Corp. v. Office of Surface
 Mining Reclamation and Enforce-
 ment, 445
 Payne v. Consolidation Coal Co., 41
 PBS Coals, Inc. v. Burnham Coal Co.,
 203–205
 Peabody Coal Co. v. Pasco, 230
 Peabody Coal Co. v. Erwin, 234
 Peabody Coal Co. v. Watt, 408–410, 505
 Penman v. Jones, 311
 Penn Central Transportation Co. v. City
 of New York, 327
 Pennsylvania Central Brewing Co v.
 Lehigh Valley Coal Co., 39
 Pennsylvania Coal & Coke Corp. v. Dun-
 can-Spangler Coal Co., 132–217
 Pennsylvania Coal Ass'n v. Babbitt, 427
 Pennsylvania Coal Co. v. Mahon,
 306–310
 Pennsylvania Coal Mining Assoc. v.
 Watt, 408, 427
 Pennsylvania Federation of Sportsmen's
 Clubs v. Hess, 584
 Pennsylvania v. West Virginia, 294
 People v. Gold Run Ditch & Mining Co.,
 241
 Peoples Bank and Tr. Co. v. Nettleton
 Fox Hunting and Fishing Ass'n., 44
 Phillips v. First, 120
 Phillips v. Fox, 104–234
 Pike v. Bruce Church, 294
 Pittman v. Weber Energy Corp., 211
 Pittsburg & Midway Coal Mining Co. v.
 Shepherd, 111–114
 Platte River Whooping Crane Habitat
 Maintenance Tr. v. FERC, 612
 Plymouth Coal Co. v. Pennsylvania, 277
 Pocahontas Mining Limited Liability Co.
 v. Jewell Ridge Coal Corp., 115
 Porter v. Consolidation Coal Co., 120
 Porter v. Mack Mfg. Co., 94
 Potomac Electric Power Co. v. EPA, 755
 Potomac Electric Power Co. v. FERC,
 657
 Pottawattamie County v. Iowa Dept. of
 Environmental Protection, 640
 Potts Run Coal Co. v. Benjamin Coal
 Co., 48, 233
 Powderhorn Coal Co. v. OSM, 444
 Power Line Task Force, Inc. v. Northern
 States Power Co., 658
 Prager v. Hodel, 354
 Preseault v. I.C.C., 342
 Psencik v. Wessels, 15
 PSI Energy v. AMAX Coal Co., 645
 PSI Energy, Inc. v. Exxon Coal USA,
 Inc., 652
 Public Utilities Comm'n of Rhode Island
 v. Attleboro Steam & Electric Co.,
 661
 Pyramid Coal Corp. v. Pratt, 39
 Quality Excelsior Coal Co. v. Reeves, 48
 Quarto Mining Co. v. Litman, 85
 Quintain Dev. LLC v. Columbia Nat.
 Resources, Inc., 104
 Rabun County v. Georgia Transmission,
 658
 Rapanos v. United States, 552

- Rastle v. Gamsjager, 9
- Raven Red Ash Coal Company v. Ball, 128
- Rayle Coal Co. v. Chief, Division of Water Resources, 557
- Raytheon Constructors, Inc. v. ASARCO, Inc., 199–203
- Reed v. Wylie, 11–19, 20–24, 28
- Reeves, Inc. v. Stake, 294
- Reidinger v. Optometry Examining Board, 699
- Reiss v. Rummel, 33
- Reynolds v. McMan Oil and Gas Co., 127
- Reynolds v. Pardee & Curtin, 40
- Reynolds v. Pardee & Curtin Lumber Co., 41
- Reynolds v. W. H. Hinman Co., 134
- Richardson v. Citizens Gas, 115
- Rith Energy v. United States, 381
- Rochez Brothers v. Duricka, 234
- Rock House Fork Land Co. v. Raleigh Brick and Tile Co., 7
- Rocky Mt. Fuel Co. v. Heflin, 86
- Rodgers Jackson Hill Coal and Coke Co. v. Bales, 223
- Roncace v. Welsh, 40
- Rose v. Oneida Coal Co., 121–328
- Rousselot v. Spanier, 8
- Russell v. Island Creek Coal Co., 328–517
- Sahara Coal Co. v. Illinois Department of Mines and Minerals, 437–440
- San Diego Gas & Electric Co. v. Covalt, 665
- San Diego Gas & Electric Co. v. Fed. Energy Regulatory Comm'n, 654–657
- Sanders v. Wilkerson, 41
- Sanford v. Alabama Power Co., 40
- Sanitary Transfer & Landfill, Inc. v. DNR, 701
- Savant v. Superior Coal Co., 214
- Save Our Cumberland Mountains v. Clark, 479
- Save Our Cumberland Mountains v. Lujan, 573
- Save Our Cumberland Mountains, Inc. v. Hodel, 573–574
- Save Our Cumberland Mountains, Inc. v. Watt, 445–449
- Schuster v. Pennsylvania Turnpike Comm'n., 49
- Schwarz v. State, 32
- Scott v. Laws, 48
- Scurfield Coal, Inc. v. Commonwealth, 541
- Seismic Petroleum Services, Inc. v. Ryan, 49
- Shannon v. Missouri Valley Limestone Company, 640
- Shawnee Coal Co. v. Andrus, 470
- Shell Petroleum Corp. v. Scully, 50
- Shell Pipe Line Corporation v. Old Ben Coal Company, 223, 519–522
- Shively v. Elkhorn Coal Corp., 40
- Sibert v. Kubas, 49
- Sierra Club v. EPA, 755
- Sierra Club v. Watt, 408
- Skivolocki v. East Ohio Gas Co., 234–253
- Smith v. Glen Alden Coal Co., 48, 91, 233, 311
- Smith v. Pittston Co., 114
- Smith v. Pocahontas Fuel Co., 48–149
- Smyth v. Ames, 710
- Solid Waste Agency of Northern Cook County v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 291
- Solid Waste Authority of Northern Cook County v. Corp. of Engineers, 584
- Son v. Coal Equity, Inc., 654
- Southern Indiana Gas & Electric Co. v. AMAX Coal Co., 645
- Southern Natural Gas Co. v. Jim Walter Resources, 133
- Southland Corp. v. Ashland Oil, Inc., 206
- Southland Royalty Co. v. Pan American Petroleum Corp., 28
- Southwestern Pennsylvania Growth Alliance v. Browner, 748
- Spring Creek Ranch, LLC v. Svenberg, 271–276
- Spurlock v. Santa Fe Pacific Railroad Co., 31
- Stamp v. Windsor Power House Coal Co., 215
- State Dept. of Environmental Protection v. Jersey Central Power & Light Co., 743

- State ex rel. R.T.G., Inc. v. Ohio, 354–361
 State Lands Comm’n v. Superior Court, 241
 State of California v. Federal Energy Regulatory Comm’n, 666
 State of Michigan et al v. EPA, 773
 State of Missouri v. Alternate Fuels, Inc., 569
 Stewart v Chernicky, 233–253
 Storm Associates, Inc. v. Texaco, 25
 Sun Oil Co. v. Whitaker, 19–28
 T & E Industries v Safety Light Corp., 199
 Tahoe-Sierra Preservation Council, Inc. v. Tahoe Regional Planning Agency, 327
 Tampa Electric Co. v. Garcia, 690–696
 Tankersley v. Peabody Coal Co., 194–198, 217
 Taylor v. Coal-Mac, Inc., 244
 Taylor v. MFC Drilling, 149
 Taylor v. Thomas, 174
 Tennant v. Callaghan, 541
 Tennessee Valley Kaolin Corp. v. Perry, 159
 Terry v. Conway Land, Inc., 9
 Texaco, Inc. v. Short, 235, 261–269
 Texas Municipal Power Agency v. EPA, 745
 The Johns Hopkins Hospital v. Peabody Coal Co., 148
 The North American Coal Corp. v. Huber, 255–257
 The State ex rel. R.T.G., Inc. v. The State of Ohio, 354–361
 The Stearns Company, Ltd. v. United States, 382–393, 395–397
 The West Virginia Mining and Reclamation Ass’n v. Babbitt, 557–569
 Thomason v. Mullinax, 40
 Thunder Basin Coal Co. v. Southwestern Pub. Serv., 652
 TransCanada Pipelines, Ltd. v. FERC, 713
 Tressler Coal Mining Co. v. Klefeld, 174
 Triple Elkhorn Mining Co. v. Anderson, 128
 Trivette v. Consolidation Coal Co., 103
 Trustees for Alaska v. Gorsuch, 482–490
 U.S. v. Troup, 410
 U.S. Steel Corp. v. Multistate Tax Comm’n, 786
 Union Electric Co. v. EPA, 746
 United States of America v. Duke Energy Corp., 760–766
 United States Steel Corp. v. Hoge, 39, 122–126
 United States v. 371.93 Acres of Land, More or Less, Situate in Monroe, 31
 United States v. Buffalo Mining Co., 645
 United States v. Camp Coal Co., 445
 United States v. Carolene Products Co., 280
 United States v. Devils Hole, Inc., 471
 United States v. Fire Ring Fuels, 454
 United States v. Ford Motor Co., 746
 United States v. Gorman Fuel, Inc., 570
 United States v. H.G.D.&J. Mining Co., Inc., 471
 United States v. Hill, 445
 United States v. Hubler, 445, 618–622
 United States v. Kennedy, 467–469
 United States v. Lopez, 291
 United States v. Manning Coal Corp., 454
 United States v. Perry, 445
 United States v. Rapoca Energy Co., 450–454
 United States v. River Coal Company, Inc., 623
 United States v. Spring Ridge Coal Company, 454
 United States v. Stearns Coal and Lumber Co., 241–243
 United States v. The Stearns Co., 237–241
 United States v. Tri-No Enterprises, 469
 United States v. Whizco, 622
 United States v. Winstar Corp., 724
 Uphoff v. Trustees of Tufts College, 66
 Utah Internat’l, Inc. v. Colorado-Ute Electric Ass’n, 652
 Utah International, Inc. v. Department of the Interior, 354–410
 Van Slooten v. Larsen, 270
 VanAlstine v. Swanson, 70
 Vicars v. First Virginia, 19

- Vines v. McKenzie, 126
 Virginia Citizens for Better Environment,
 Inc. v. Watt, 427
 Wagstaff v. Matthews, 32
 Walley v. Iraca, 128
Ward v. Harding, 244–251
 Ward v. Woods, 40
 Waters v. Monroe Coal Co., 92
 Watson v. O'Hern, 148
 Webster County Coal Co. v. Seminole
 Elec. Coop., Inc., 651
 Wells v. American Electric Power Co.,
 120–121
 West Coast Hotel Co. v. Parrish, 280
West v. National Mines Corp., 628–633,
 634–639
West Virginia Coal Association v. Reilly,
 541–551, 598
 West Virginia Dept. of Highways v.
 Farmer, 8
 West Virginia Highlands Conservancy v.
 Norton, 583
 Westbrook v. Ball, 9
 Westchester Assocs., Inc. v. Boston Edi-
 son Co., 665
Western Energy Company v. Genie Land
 Company, 257, 261, 301–305
 Western Pennsylvania Water Co. v. Com-
 monwealth, 557
 Wheeler v. City of Pleasant Grove, 337
 Whitacre v. State, 381
 Whitman v. American Trucking Ass'n,
 746
Whitney Benefits, Inc. v. United States,
 343–350, 351, 352
 Williamson v. Lee Optical of Oklahoma,
 Inc., 281
 Williamson County Regional Planning
 Commission v. Hamilton Bank, 337
 Willowbrook Mining Co. v. Pennsylvania
 Department of Environmental Re-
 sources, 394
 Wilms v. Jess, 42, 215
 Wilson v. Bishop, 270
 Windber Constr. Co. v. Coleman, 174
 Winnings v. Wilpen Coal Co., 121–213
Wisc. P. & L. Co. v. Public Serv. Com-
 m'n of Wisc., 714, 725–752
 Wisconsin Electric Power Co. v. Pub.
 Serv. Comm'n, 698
 Wisconsin v. FPC, 699–710
 Wulf v. Shultz, 14
 Wyatt v. United States, 378
 Wyoming v. Oklahoma, 294
 Zaschak v. Traverse Corp., 208
 Zeigler Coal Co. v. Dethloff, 41
 Zimpel v. Trawick, 208

Preface and Acknowledgments

This casebook is intended for a two or three credit hour elective law school course. It is aimed at those law students interested in (1) examining some basic property concepts in the context of the law pertaining to hard minerals, as opposed to oil and gas law and (2) placing natural resources in the context of energy, regulatory, and environmental law settings. Its substantive law thread is found in the law pertaining to coal mining, and its value for undergraduate as well as graduate courses in natural resources is that it follows the coal from the mine to the light switch.

For one of the co-authors of the book (Burke), the course is taught, chapter by chapter, in roughly equal segments, with time in the semester (his is a fourteen week semester) to pause over problems that can be worked out in class as well as speakers on topics as the students read about them in the book. For the other (Beck), the course has been taught on the basis of a 20 or so page assignment per class with occasional use of videos on, for example, safety and health issues.

Barlow Burke acknowledges the work of Erica Gaspar, Meryl Eschen, and Ami Pathak, his Research Assistants at American University who both assisted and developed his ideas for the course, as well as past students who used these materials as they were developed. Professor Burke wishes also to acknowledge the summer grant assistance program of The Washington College of Law, American University, for freeing his time to work on the project, and in particular, his Dean, Claudio Grossman. Bob Beck, being retired from the SIU Law School faculty, is grateful for continued access to and use of Law School facilities for projects such as this coursebook.

Robert E. Beck
Barlow Burke
October 2009

Contents

Table of Cases	xiii
Preface and Acknowledgments	xxiii
Chapter 1 • Mineral and Surface Ownership	3
A. Mineral Production in the United States	3
1. Coal	3
2. Iron Ore	5
3. Stone	5
4. Some Other Non-Fuel, Non-Ferrous Minerals	5
a. Copper	5
b. Gold	6
c. Lead	6
d. Phosphate	6
Notes on Theory of Ownership of, Documents Creating Interests in, and Remedies for Wrongs to Those Interests in, the Underground	6
B. Defining the “Mineral” Estate	9
<i>Reed v. Wylie</i>	11
Notes	19
<i>Reed v. Wylie</i>	20
Notes	24
Note on Extraction Methods for Coal	25
<i>Moser v. United States Steel Corp.</i>	27
Notes	30
C. Multiple Severances	33
<i>Chartiers Block Coal Co. v. Mellon</i>	33
Notes	39
Note on Trespass	40
D. Severance by Reservation or Exception	42
<i>McDonough Co. v. E.I. DuPont Denemours & Co., Inc.</i>	42
Notes	44
<i>Gulf Refining Co. v. Stanford</i>	44
Notes	47
E. Prospecting	49
F. Review	51
<i>Calvert Joint Venture # 140 v. Snider</i>	51

Chapter 2 • The Mineral Lease	59
A. Permission from the Mineral Owner	59
1. Introduction	59
2. What Do You Need for a Lease?	60
B. Dealing with Owners: Who Should Execute the Lease?	61
<i>Chosar Corp. v. Owens</i>	61
Notes	65
<i>English v. English</i>	67
Notes	69
Note on Successive Ownership	69
C. Distinguishing a Lease from Other Interests	70
<i>Chandler v. French</i>	71
<i>Kelly v. Rainelle Coal Co.</i>	74
Notes	80
<i>Mike Ross, Inc. v. Dante Coal Co.</i>	82
Notes	85
D. The Lessee's Interest	86
E. The Nature of the Ownership Interest	86
<i>Hummel v. McFadden</i>	86
Notes	91
<i>Heirs of Galen Roberts v. Coal Processing Corp.</i>	93
F. The Scope of the Access Easement	94
Notes	96
<i>Buffalo Mining Company v. Martin</i>	98
Notes	103
<i>Quintain Dev. LLC v. Columbia Nat. Resources, Inc.</i>	104
 Chapter 3 • Incorporating Technological Change into the Mineral Estate	 111
A. Surface Easements and New Technology	111
<i>Pittsburg & Midway Coal Mining Co. v. Shepherd</i>	111
Notes	114
B. Longwall Mining	116
<i>Large v. Clinchfield Coal Co.</i>	117
Notes	120
C. Methane Recovery	121
<i>United States Steel Corp. v. Hoge</i>	122
Notes	126
<i>Harrison-Wyatt, LLC v. Ratliff</i>	128
Notes	132
Problem	133
D. Explosives: Strict Liability and Negligence	133
<i>Coalite, Inc. v. Aldridge</i>	134
Notes	139
<i>Cage Brothers v. McCormick</i>	139
Problem	143
 Chapter 4 • The Estate Owner-Lessee Relationship	 145
A. The Duty to Develop	145
1. By Implication	145

<i>Ionno v. Glen-Gery Corp.</i>	145
Notes	148
<i>Bennett v. Hebener</i>	150
Notes	153
<i>Hutchison v. Sunbeam Coal Corp.</i>	154
Notes	158
2. By Express Undertaking	159
<i>Owens v. Thompson</i>	159
Note	161
<i>Dethloff v. Zeigler Coal Co.</i>	161
Notes	169
B. Payments and Royalties	171
<i>Browning v. Mountain States Coal Corp.</i>	171
Notes	174
<i>Lomex Corp. v. McBryde</i>	175
Notes	178
Notes on Royalty in Kind	178
Notes on Calculating the Amount on Which Royalty Is Payable	179
<i>Dennard v. Freeport Minerals Co.</i>	179
Notes	183
<i>Davis v. Nokomis Quarry, Inc.</i>	184
Notes	188
C. Standard of Care	189
1. To the Lessor	189
<i>Langford v. Hughes</i>	189
Notes	190
2. To Third Parties	190
<i>Kutsch v. Miller</i>	190
Notes	194
3. Effecting Transfers of Mineral Properties: Successor Liability	194
<i>Tankersley v. Peabody Coal Co.</i>	194
Notes	198
<i>Raytheon Constructors, Inc. v. ASARCO, Inc.</i>	199
4. Provisions of the Transfer	203
<i>PBS Coals, Inc. v. Burnham Coal Co.</i>	203
Notes	206
D. Choosing an Entity for Mineral Development	208
E. Mining Partnership	209
<i>Childers v. Neely</i>	209
Notes	210
F. Joint Venture (a/k/a Joint Adventure)	211
G. Financing Hard Mineral Development	211
 Chapter 5 • Surface Owner Consent to Extraction	 213
A. The Common Law Right of Support	213
Notes	216
B. Overlying Seam Support	217
C. Support of the Land in Its Natural State or Condition	217
<i>Island Creek Coal Company v. Rodgers</i>	218