# The Notion of Employer in the Era of the Fissured Workplace

Should Labour Law Responsibilities Exceed the Boundary of the Legal Entity?

Editors

Roger Blanpain & Frank Hendrickx

Guest Editors

Hiroya Nakakubo & Takashi Araki

Contributors

Diego Álvarez Alonso Takashi Araki Matthew W. Finkin Tess Hardy Sylvaine Laulom Shih-Hao Liu Hiroya Nakakubo Jeremias Prassl Bernd Waas Aelim Yun Qi Zhong Mimi Zou



# The Notion of Employer in the Era of the Fissured Workplace

Should Labour Law Responsibilities Exceed the Boundary of the Legal Entity?

#### **Editors**

Roger Blanpain

Frank Hendrickx

#### **Guest Editors**

Hiroya Nakakubo Takashi Araki

#### Contributors

Diego Álvarez Alonso Takashi Araki Matthew W. Finkin Tess Hardy Sylvaine Laulom Shih-Hao Liu

Hiroya Nakakubo Jeremias Prassl Bernd Waas Aelim Yun Qi Zhong Mimi Zou



Published by:

Kluwer Law International B.V.

PO Box 316

2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn

The Netherlands

Website: www.wklawbusiness.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.

7201 McKinney Circle

Frederick, MD 21704

United States of America

Email: customer.service@wolterskluwer.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd

Stratton Business Park Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade

Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ United Kingdom

Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-8470-2

e-Book: ISBN 978-90-411-8471-9 web-PDF: ISBN 978-90-411-8472-6

© 2017 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S., 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA, Website: www.wklawbusiness.com

Printed in the United Kingdom.

### Notes on Contributors

Diego Álvarez Alonso, Lecturer of Labour Law and Social Security Law, University of Oviedo.

Takashi Araki, Professor, the University of Tokyo, Senior Research Fellow, JILPT.

Matthew W. Finkin, Professor of Law, the University of Illinois.

Tess Hardy, Lecturer in Law, University of Melbourne.

**Sylvaine Laulom**, Professor, Head of the Institute of Labour Studies of Lyon, University Lumière Lyon 2.

Shih-Hao Liu, Professor, Law School, Ming-Chuan University.

Hiroya Nakakubo, Professor, Hitotsubashi University, Senior Research Fellow, JILPT.

**Jeremias Prassl**, Associate Professor in the Faculty of Law, Fellow of Magdalen College, University of Oxford.

Bernd Waas, Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, Goethe University of Frankfurt.

Aelim Yun, Professor of Law and Social Security Law, Korea National Open University.

Oi Zhong, Researcher, Japan Institute for Labor Policy and Training.

Mimi Zou, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Chinese University of Hong Kong.

# Summary of Contents

Notes on Contributors	V
Introduction Hiroya Nakakubo & Takashi Araki	1
CHAPTER 1 The Legal Ambiguity of Fissured Work in the United States Matthew W. Finkin	7
CHAPTER 2 Fissurization in Japan: Overview and Analysis from a Legal Perspective Qi Zhong	33
CHAPTER 3 Reconsidering the Notion of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured Workplace: Traversing the Legislative Landscape in Australia Tess Hardy	53
CHAPTER 4 Reconsidering the Notion of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured Workplace in the UK: Should Labour Law Responsibilities Exceed the Boundary of the Legal Entity? Jeremias Prassl	81
CHAPTER 5 Reconsidering the Notion of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured Workplace in Germany: Should Labour Law Responsibilities Exceed the Boundaries of the Legal Entity?  Bernd Waas	105

#### Summary of Contents

CHAPTER 6 Reconsidering the Notion of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured Workplace: Responses to Fissuring in French Labour Law Sylvaine Laulom	127
CHAPTER 7 Labor Law and "Atomization of Work": Legal Responses to the "Fissured Workplace" in Spain Diego Álvarez Alonso	145
CHAPTER 8 Regulating the Fissured Workplace: The Notion of the 'Employer' in Chinese Labour Law Mimi Zou	183
CHAPTER 9 Realizing Workers' Rights Beyond Corporate Boundaries in South Korea Aelim Yun	205
CHAPTER 10 The Fissured Workplace and Predicaments and Breakthroughs in Taiwanese Labour Law Shih-Hao Liu	229

## Table of Contents

Notes	on Contributors	V	
Introd	uction		
Hiroya	ı Nakakubo & Takashi Araki	1	
Снарти	er 1		
The Le	egal Ambiguity of Fissured Work in the United States		
	ew W. Finkin	7	
§1.01	Introduction	7	
§1.02	The Arc of Business Size and Structure	9	
§1.03	The Conundrum of Vicarious Liability	13	
§1.04	The Legislative Terrain	18	
	[A] Wage and Hour Law	20	
	[B] Collective Bargaining Law	22	
	[C] Antidiscrimination Law	24	
	[D] A Sidelong Glance at Social Security and Unemployment		
	Compensation	27	
§1.05	The Challenge of Fissurization	28	
§1.06	Cloven Work, Cloven Workers	31	
Снарті	ER 2		
	ization in Japan: Overview and Analysis from a Legal Perspective		
Qi Zho		33	
§2.01			
	[A] Overview of Fissurization Phenomena Dealt with in Legislation		
	and Case Law	34	
	[1] The Foreman Contracting System	34	

		[2]	Multilayered Subcontracting Relationships in the	35	
		[2]	Construction Industry, Etc.	33	
		[3]	Business Process Contracting in the Workplaces of Ordering Companies (In-House Subcontracting)	35	
		[4]	Worker Dispatch	37	
		[5]	Individual Contracting	39	
		[6]	Franchising	40	
		[7]	Subcontracting Alliance ("Keiretsu") and Offshoring	42	
	[B]		nsion of Employer's Responsibility in the Fissured Workplace		
	[-]	Cont		44	
		[1]	The Issue of Extending Employer's Responsibility		
			Under Individual Labor Relations	44	
		[2]	Statutory Extension of Employer's Responsibility		
			Under Individual Labor Relations	45	
		[3]	Extension of Employer's Responsibility Under the		
			Doctrine of Denying the Legal Entity of the Direct	46	
		[4]	Employer Extension of Employer's Responsibility Under the Theory	40	
		[4]	of the Implied Labor Contract	47	
		[5]	Extension of Employer's Responsibilities Under the Labor		
		[-]	Union Act	48	
			[a] Extension in the Cases of Parent-Subsidiary and		
			Subcontracting Relations	48	
			[b] Extension of the Employer in the Fissured Workplace		
			Context	49	
§2.02	Con	clusio	n .	51	
Снартег					
			Notion of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured		
		raver	rsing the Legislative Landscape in Australia	F 2	
Tess Ho		1		53	
§3.01		duction		53	
§3.02			Extent Are Australian Workplaces 'Fissured' and What ossible Effects?	55	
			ilable Data on Fissured Forms of Work	55	
	[A] [B]		sible Effects of Fissured Work	58	
§3.03			y Responses in the Labour Sphere	59	
85.05	[A]		imum Employment Standards as Prescribed by Statute and	35	
	[A]		dern Awards	61	
	[B]		erprise Agreements	62	
	[C]		m Contracting	64	
	[D]		essorial Liability	65	
§3.04	77		y Responses in the Work Health and Safety Sphere	67	
§3.05			y Responses in the Competition and Consumer Sphere	69	
\$3.06					

§3.07	[A] [B] Cond	Backg Streng clusion		d and Weaknesses of Current Statutory Responses	72 75 80
Chapte		.1 3.7			
				n of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured Workplace	
		ould La	abou	r Law Responsibilities Exceed the Boundary of the	
Legal E		1			0.1
Jeremio					81
§4.01		duction		mulavar	81
§4.02				imployer	82
	[A]			the Relevant Case Law	82
	[B]			Strands of the Concept of the Employer	83
				nitary Strand ulti-Functional Strand	83
					85
			[a]	Inception and Termination of the Contract of	0.5
			[b]	Employment	85
			[b]	Receiving Labour and Its Fruits	86
			[C]	Providing Work and Pay	86
			[d]	Managing the Enterprise-Internal Market	86
64.02	г.		[e]	Managing the Enterprise-External Market	86
§4.03				in the UK Today	86
	[A]	-		nenomena	87
				ncy Work	87
			[a]	Inception and Termination of the Contract of	0.0
			r1 - 1	Employment	89
			[b]	Providing Work and Pay	89
				ate Equity	90
			[a]	Inception and Termination of the Contract of	
			<b>C1</b> -2	Employment	92
			[b]	Managing the Enterprise-Internal Market	92
				Rise of Crowdwork	93
	[B]			ns for the Scope of Employment Law Coverage	94
				k-Down of Employment Law Coverage	94
				mplete and Incoherent Coverage	95
§4.04				udicial Responses	97
	[A]			Employment Law	97
				itory Avenues	98
				mon Law Developments	99
	[B]			Labour Law	99
§4.05				Future Prospects	100
D10 90 00	[A]			Functional Concept of the Employer	100
§4.06				toring Coherence in a Fissured World	102
	App	endix: F	urth	er Reading in <i>The Concept of the Employer</i>	103

CHAPTER	5		
Reconsid	dering	the Notion of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured Workplace	
in Germ	any: S	Should Labour Law Responsibilities Exceed the Boundaries	
of the Le	egal E	ntity?	
Bernd W	-	,	105
§5.01	Intro	duction	105
§5.02	Empl	oyee and Employer: Basic Information and Recent	
	Deve	lopments	105
	[A]	The Notion of 'Employee'	105
		[1] Basic Elements	105
		[2] Recent Developments	107
	[B]	Notion of 'Employer'	108
		[1] Basic Elements	108
		[2] Recent Developments	109
§5.03	Curre	ent Situation of Fissurisation	110
	[A]	Groups of Companies	110
	[B]	Contracting-Out	110
	[C]	Supply Chains	111
	[D]	Franchising	112
§5.04	Resp	onses by the Legislator and the Courts	112
	[A]	Groups of Companies	112
	[B]	Contracting-Out	116
	[C]	Supply Chains	118
	[D]	Franchising	119
§5.05	Evalu	uation and Future Prospects	120
	[A]	The 'Functional Employer' in the Case of Temporary	
		Agency Work	120
	[B]	'Indirect Employment Relationship' or 'the Employer	
		Behind the Employer'	123
§5.06	Conc	lusion	124
§5.07	Sum	mary	124
0			
CHAPTER		with a Nation of 'Employer' in the Ere of the Figured	
		g the Notion of 'Employer' in the Era of the Fissured	
-		esponses to Fissuring in French Labour Law	127
Sylvain			127
§6.01		duction	127
§6.02		ent Situation of Fissurisation in France	129
§6.03		ent Legislative and Interpretative Responses: Individual	101
		Temporary Employment Agencies and Other Forms of	131
	$[\Lambda]$	Supplying Workers	131
		oupplying workers	101

		[1] Temporary Employment Agencies: A Complete Regulation of a Triangular Relationship with Shared Responsibilities	132					
		[2] The Loan of Employees for a Non-profit Purpose	133					
	[B]	Groups of Companies: Some Incomplete and Fragmented						
		Solutions	135					
		[1] Groups of Companies and Workers' Representation	136					
		[2] Groups of Companies and Employment Responsibilities	137					
	[C]	Contracting-Out and Subcontracting Processes	140					
	[-]	[1] The Responsibility of the Client or the Principal						
		Contractor	140					
		[2] Health and Safety at Work in Subcontracting	140					
	[D]	Franchising Systems	141					
§6.04	Curr	ent Legislative Responses and Interpretations: Collective Labour						
	Rela	tions	142					
§6.05	Cond	clusions	143					
CHAPTE		ad "Atamiration of Work", Logal Despapers to the "Figured						
		nd "Atomization of Work": Legal Responses to the "Fissured						
		n Spain	1.45					
-		z Alonso	145					
§7.01		oduction	145 147					
§7.02		The Contemporary Picture of "The Fissured Workplace" in Spain						
§7.03		Protection of Employees in Subcontracting Processes 1:						
	[A]	Joint and Several Liabilities and Other Legal Obligations	151					
	[17]	Concerning Subcontracting of Works and Services	151					
	[B]	Health and Safety at Work Within Subcontracting Schemes	154					
	[C]	Specific Provisions for the Construction Sector	156					
67.04	[D]	Evaluation and Future Prospect	157					
§7.04	Contracting-Out Workforce Supply: General Prohibition and							
		Constrained Admission of Temporary Agency Work						
	[A]	Illegal Assignment of Workers	158					
	[B]	Temporary Work Agencies	159					
	[C]	Evaluation and Future Prospect	161					
§7.05		Other Outcomes of "The Fissured Workplace": Piecemeal						
		ulations and Legal Responses "Under Construction"	162					
	[A]	Supply Chains: Can They Be Subsumed Within the Current						
		Legal Framework?	163					
	[B]	Business-Groups: Isolated Statutory Provisions and "Piercing						
		the Corporate Veil"	164					
	[C]	Franchising and Other Forms of Business Cooperation:	200 1000 10					
		A Pending Gap	166					
	[D]	"Independent" Contractors: "Economically Dependent						
		Autonomous Workers" and "Bogus Self-Employment"	168					
	[TT]	Contraction and Cottons Description	170					

#### Table of Contents

§7.06	Collective Labor Law and Labor Relations in "The Fissured					
	Workplace"	171				
	[A] Workers' Representation and Information and Consultation					
	Rights in Subcontracting Schemes	172				
	[B] Workers' Representation and Information and Consultation					
	Rights in Business-Groups	173				
	[C] Collective Bargaining	175				
	[D] Trade Union Action and the Right to Strike	176				
	[E] Beyond Legal Issues: Trade Unions and Labor Relations					
	in the "Fissured World"	177				
	[F] Evaluation and Future Prospect	180				
§7.07	Conclusion	181				
Снартея	₹ 8					
-	ing the Fissured Workplace: The Notion of the 'Employer' in					
	e Labour Law					
Mimi Z		183				
§8.01	Introduction	183				
§8.02	The Evolution of the Fissured Workplace	185				
	<ul><li>[A] The 'Three Old Irons'</li><li>[B] Towards a Flexible Labour Market</li></ul>	185				
		186				
	<ul><li>[C] The Emergence of Fissurisation</li><li>[D] A Case Study of the Construction Sector</li></ul>	187				
	[E] Reversing the Deregulatory Agenda	188				
§8.03	The Notion of the 'Employer'	191				
90.03	[A] The Scope of the 'Labour Relationship'	193				
	[B] A 'De Facto' Employment Relationship	193 194				
	[C] Employee versus Independent Contractors	195				
	[D] Regulating Labour Dispatch Arrangements	196				
	[1] Background	196				
	[2] Dispatch Labour and the Labour Contract Law	197				
	[3] Further Restrictions in 2013	198				
	[4] Dispatch Labour and Occupational Health and	170				
	Safety Issues	199				
	[5] Collective Labour Relations and Dispatch Workers	200				
	[6] Other Legal and 'Soft Law' Measures	201				
§8.04	Conclusion	202				
Снартен	R 9					
	ng Workers' Rights Beyond Corporate Boundaries in South Korea					
Aelim '		203				
§9.01	Introduction	205				
§9.02	Current Situation of Fissurization					
	[A] Overview	200				
	[1] Multi-Lavered Subcontracting	206				

		[2] Agency Employment	208				
		[3] In-House Subcontracting	209				
		[4] Procurement/Contracting-Out of Public Service	209				
		[5] Supply Chain	210				
		[6] Others	211				
	[B]	Motives and Backgrounds	212				
		[1] Trends and Size of Precarious Employment	212				
		[2] Factors of the Growth of Precarious Employment	213				
	[C]	Overview of the Labour Law Issues	214				
		[1] Individual Labour Relations	214				
		[2] Collective Labour Relations	215				
\$9.03	Curr	ent Legislative and Interpretative Responses	216				
	[A]	Individual Labour Relations	216				
		[1] Implied Contract of Employment Theory	216				
		[2] The Standard for Establishing Temporary					
		Agency Employment	217				
		[a] Leading Case	217				
		[b] New Precedent	218				
		[c] Allocation of Employer Responsibility Etc.	219				
		[3] Multi-Layered Subcontracting	220				
	[B]	Collective Labour Relations	222				
§9.04		uation and Future Prospect	223				
§9.05	Bibli	iography	225				
Снартег							
		Workplace and Predicaments and Breakthroughs in					
		abour Law					
Shih-Ha			229				
		oduction	229 230				
§10.02							
	[A]	The Industrial Ecology of Small and Medium Enterprises	231				
	[B]	The Popularity of Amoeba Organisations in Taiwan	232				
	[C]	OEM-Based Businesses in Taiwan	232				
§10.03		nsion of Employer Responsibility in the Fissured Workplace	234				
	[A]	Historical Background	234				
	[B]	Legal Sources of Basic Worker Protection Standards	234				
		[1] Employment Agreements and the Labour Standards Law	234				
		[2] Non-fixed Term Contracts and Unfair Dismissal	235				
		[3] Collective Agreement	236				
		[4] Working Rules	237				
		[5] Laws Protecting Subcontracted Workers from					
		Occupational Accidents	238				
	[C]	Reform of the Occupational Safety and Health Act	238				
		[1] Expanding the Scope of Protection to All Workers	238				

#### Table of Contents

		[2] Expanding the Scope of Protection to Entire Workplace	238
	[D]	Reform of the Gender Equality in Employment Act	239
	[E]	Lack of Protection for Special Workers	239
		[1] Lack of Complete Protection for Agency Workers	239
		[2] Lack of Protections for Freelance Workers	240
§10.04	Cond	clusion	241

#### Introduction

Hiroya Nakakubo\* & Takashi Araki\*\*

#### THE TOPIC AND ITS BACKGROUND

The Japan Institute for Labor Policy and Training (JILPT) hosted its 13th Comparative Labor Law Seminar (the Tokyo Seminar) on February 29 and March 1, 2016. The seminar addressed the topic *Reconsidering the Notion of "Employer" in the Era of the Fissured Workplace: Should Labor Law Responsibilities Exceed the Boundary of the Legal Entity?* which was on consultation with Prof. Kazuo Sugeno, President of the JILPT. As the organizers of the seminar, it was our pleasure to invite distinguished scholars from Australia, China, France, Germany, Japan, the Republic of Korea, Spain, Taiwan, the United Kingdom and the United States (U.S.) to participate in the project. The following memo was sent to the participating scholars to elaborate on the topic:

"The fissured workplace" is the term used by David Weil in his recent book, "The Fissured Workplace: Why Work Became So Bad for So Many and What Can Be Done to Improve It" (Harvard University Press, 2014). Weil describes the phenomenon of "fissuring" as follows (pp. 8-9):

During much of the twentieth century, the critical employment relationship was between large businesses and workers. ... However, most no longer directly employ legions of workers to make products or deliver services. Employment has been actively shed by these market leaders and transferred to a complicated network of smaller business units. Lower-level businesses operate in more highly competitive markets than those of the firms that shifted employment to them.

<sup>\*</sup> Hitotsubashi University.

<sup>\*\*</sup> University of Tokyo.

<sup>1.</sup> The JILPT Tokyo Seminar was originally organized by Professor Kazuo Sugeno (Professor Emeritus, the University of Tokyo, Honorary President of the International Society for Labour and Social Security Law, President of JILPT) and Professor Yasuo Suwa (Professor Emeritus, Hosei University, Chairman, Central Labor Relations Commission) in 1991. The papers submitted to the previous JILPT Tokyo Seminars were published in the Bulletin of Comparative Labour Relations No. 30 (1995), No. 34 (1999), No. 38 (2000), No. 47 (2003), No. 53 (2005), No. 61 (2007), No. 68 (2008), No. 76 (2010), No. 81 (2012), and No.88 (2014).

Consequently, [w]age setting and supervision shift from core businesses to a myriad of organizations, each operating under the rigorous standards of lead businesses but facing fierce competitive pressures. Although lead businesses set demanding goals and standards, and often detailed work practice requirements for subsidiary companies, the actual liability, oversight, and supervision of the workforce become the problem of one or more other organizations. And by replacing a direct employment relationship with a fissured workplace, employment itself becomes more precarious, with risk shifted onto smaller employers and individual workers, who are often cast in the role of independent businesses in their own right.

As the fissured workplace has deepened and spread across the economy, work that once provided middle-class wages and benefits has declined. Jobs that once resided inside lead businesses providing decent earnings and stability now reside with employers who set wages under far more competitive conditions. Where lead companies once shared gains with their internal workforce, fissuring leads to growing inequality in how the value created in the economy is distributed.

Traditionally, labor and employment law has imposed various obligations on "employers." Legal responsibilities usually stop at the boundary of the legal entity, even though there are some exceptions reflecting the nature of the subject. However, Weil's argument of the "fissured workplace" vividly shows that there has been a fundamental change in the structure of businesses. It is no longer sufficient to discuss the responsibility of the person directly hiring workers. Law should squarely grasp and tackle this new reality. But how far can the current labor law go in questioning the responsibility of persons who have no direct contractual relationship with the workers? Can we develop effective theories under the existing legal framework? Or do we need a new set of legislation? Do other measures such as soft law or reputation mechanisms in the market deal with the undesirable consequences of the fissurization more properly? Inspired by Weil's excellent analysis, we would like to discuss these challenges facing our labor law today.

#### SUGGESTED FOCUS AND OUTLINE

Fissurization may take various forms, such as multi-layered subcontracting, outsourcing, franchising, and supply-chains. These measures are aimed at, or result in, "externalization" of the employment relationship, which brings about many problematic phenomena.

From the legal point of view, it seems there are two types of employment externalization. First, by outsourcing, contracting out, or utilizing supply-chain mechanisms, the lead companies may be relieved of employment-related responsibilities in multi-layered contractual relationships even though they wield considerable influence on the fate of the actual workers. This is the issue of the notion of "employer," or who should bear the legal responsibility as the employer. Second, in the process of fissurization, traditional workers or employees tend to be converted into, or sometimes misclassified as, self-employed or independent contractors. This is the issue of the notion of "employee."

While the second issue is of course important, it has already been discussed rather extensively. We therefore decided to place the focus of the 13th Tokyo Seminar on the first issue.

After explaining the aforementioned focus of the discussion, we offered the following points to the participants as a general guideline for the country papers, with a note that they were free to depart from them given that the situation and legal responses might differ in their respective countries:

#### 1. Introduction

- General observation about the topic before going into the analysis.

#### 2. Current situation of fissurization

- How far has the overall phenomenon conceptualized as "fissurization of the workplace" developed in your country, and why (if not, why so)?
  - A. What are the individual phenomena composing such "fissurization of the workplace" (such as subcontracting, supply chain, franchising and others). Please describe them somewhat concretely. Are they new phenomena or rather conventional practices?
  - B. What are managerial motives and socioeconomic backgrounds which give rise to such "fissurization of the workplace" (such as cost-cutting and evasion of labor-law responsibilities under intensified global competition)?
  - C. Please give an overview of the labor law issues (both interpretative and legislative) contained in "fissurization of the workplace."

#### 3. Current legislative and interpretative responses

 Measures to protect workers by going beyond the boundary of the legal entity should be described both in individual employment relations and collective labor relations.

#### 3.1 Individual labor relations

- Please describe the current legislation in your country, if any, to protect workers in a multi-layered contractual relationship or indirect employment relationship, for instance:
  - Site owner's responsibilities concerning health and safety regulations in the construction site
  - User's responsibilities in a temporary agency work relationship
  - Parent or holding company's responsibilities to the daughter company's workers concerning wages, work-related injuries, dismissal regulations, and other duties arising from employment.
  - Have these regulations existed for a long time, or were they newly adopted to deal with fissurization?
  - Please describe the interpretative responses to protect workers in a multilayered contractual relationship or indirect employment relationship, such as expanding the notion of "employer" (single employer, joint employer, etc.), and piercing the corporate veil.
  - Have these theories existed for a long time, or were they newly adopted to deal with fissurization?

#### 3.2 Collective labor relations

- Please describe the current legislative and interpretative responses to fissurization in collective labor relations, for instance:
  - Does a parent or holding company bear the duty to bargain with, consult with, or give information to, representatives of the workers (such as labor unions or works councils) of its daughter or subsidiary company?
  - Does your country have special regulations on behalf of those who are not directly employed by the company concerning matters such as works council elections or other procedures in workers' involvement schemes?
  - Have social partners (labor unions and employers' organizations) set up special mechanisms addressing fissurization?