

COMPETITION LAW IN ROMANIA

SECOND EDITION

GEORGETA DINU
ADELINA ROMAN
MARIUS ȘTEFANA
RADU TUFESCU



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Competition Law in Romania

Second Edition

**Georgeta Dinu
Adelina Roman
Marius Ștefana
Radu Tufescu**

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Competition Law.

General Editors: Roger Blanpain, Frank Hendrickx
Volume Editors: Francesco Denozza, Alberto Toffoletto



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.wklawbusiness.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 978-90-411-6154-3

This title is available on www.kluwerlawonline.com

© 2015, Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

Competition Law in Romania

Table of Contents

The Authors	3
List of Abbreviations	17
General Introduction	19
§1. GENERAL BACKGROUND OF THE COUNTRY	19
§2. THE ECONOMIC SYSTEM	20
§3. THE LEGAL SYSTEM	20
§4. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF ANTITRUST LAW	20
Part I. The Structure of Antitrust Law and Its Enforcement	25
Chapter 1. Sources of Antitrust Law	25
§1. NATIONAL SOURCES	25
§2. INTERNATIONAL SOURCES	26
I. Commission's Regulations	26
II. Commission's Guidelines	26
§3. SECONDARY SOURCES	27
I. Regulations	27
II. Guidelines	27
§4. SOURCES' RELATION AND HIERARCHY	28
§5. ROLE AND AUTHORITY OF PRECEDENTS	29
Chapter 2. Scope of Application	30
§1. TERRITORIAL REACH	30

Table of Contents

§2. SPECIAL SECTORS	30
I. Motor Vehicles	30
II. Telecommunications	30
III. Insurance	31
IV. Transport	32
§3. STATE-OWNED ENTERPRISES AND PUBLIC UTILITIES	32
I. Public Undertakings	32
II. Public Utilities	32
III. Postal Services	33
IV. Electricity	33
§4. SENSIBLE EFFECT AND <i>DE MINIMIS</i>	34
Chapter 3. Overview of Substantive Provisions	36
§1. RESTRICTIVE AGREEMENTS	36
§2. DOMINANT UNDERTAKINGS	37
§3. CONCENTRATIONS	38
§4. OTHER PROHIBITIONS	39
§5. TESTS OF ILLEGALITY	39
I. Per Se Prohibitions and Naked Restrictions	39
II. Balancing Tests	40
III. Merger Tests	40
Chapter 4. Overview of Main Notions	42
§1. UNDERTAKING	42
§2. RELEVANT MARKET	43
§3. MARKET POWER/DOMINANT POSITION	44
§4. AGREEMENTS AND CONCERTED PRACTICES	45
§5. RESTRICTION OF COMPETITION	46
§6. MONOPOLIZATION AND ABUSE OF DOMINANCE	46
§7. CONCENTRATIONS	46
§8. JOINT VENTURES	48

Chapter 5. Consequences of Violations and Enforcement Institutions	50
§1. ADMINISTRATIVE ENFORCEMENT	50
I. The Antitrust Authorities	50
A. Formation, Composition	50
B. Investigating Powers	50
C. Adjudicating Powers (Ascertaining and Sanctioning)	52
D. Other Institutional Tasks (Consultancy to Parliament/ Government)	53
II. Government Direct Enforcement Activities	54
III. Other Administrative Agencies Applying Antitrust Rules	55
IV. Administrative Fines	55
A. Method of Setting the Fines Imposed Pursuant to Articles 51 and 52 of the Competition Law	56
B. Method of Setting Fines Imposed Pursuant to Article 53 of the Competition Law	57
C. Acknowledgement of the Infringement	60
D. Inability to Pay	61
E. Fine Imposed on an Association of Undertakings	62
F. Periodic Penalty Payments	64
G. Payment of Fines	65
H. Leniency Policy	65
I. Immunity from Fines	66
J. Type A Immunity	67
K. Type B Immunity	67
L. Reduction of Fine	67
M. Procedural Aspects	68
1. Formal Applications for Immunity	68
2. Application for a Marker	69
3. Other Procedural Aspects	69
V. Administrative Injunctions and Other Restrictive Orders	70
VI. Interim Measures	70
A. Prima Facie Infringement	71
B. Urgency Due to the Risk of Serious and Irreparable Damage to Competition	71
C. Nature and Characteristics of Interim Measures	72
D. Procedure and Appeal	72
§2. CIVIL ENFORCEMENT	73
I. Competent Civil Courts	73
II. Sanctions	74
A. Nullity	74
B. Damages	74
1. Types of Antitrust Matters Where Private Actions Are Available	75

Table of Contents

2.	Admissible Evidence	75
3.	Collective Actions	76
4.	Limitation Period	76
5.	Compensation Granted	76
C.	Interim Measures	77
§3.	CRIMINAL ENFORCEMENT	78
I.	Criminal Sanctions for Antitrust Violations	78
II.	Other Application of Criminal Law to Relevant Conducts	79
III.	Role of Prosecutors	79
IV.	Competent Criminal Courts	79
Part II.	The Application of the Prohibitions	81
Chapter 1.	Restrictive Agreements	82
§1.	HORIZONTAL AGREEMENTS	84
I.	Cartels	84
A.	Price Fixing	85
1.	The 2014 <i>ROREC</i> and <i>ECOTIC</i> Cases – Price Fixing within Buy-Back Campaigns	86
2.	The 2010 <i>Timișoara Taxi</i> Case – First Leniency Case	88
3.	The 2010 <i>Body of Expert and Licensed Accountant (BELAR Association)</i> Case – Highest Ever Percentage of Fine Applied by the Competition Council (9.2%)	90
4.	The 2008 <i>National Association of Dental Technicians (NADT)</i> Case – Concerted Practice within an Association	92
5.	The 2012 <i>Private Pensions</i> Case – The Price Fixing Alleged by the Statement of Objections Not Held by the Plenum of the Competition Council	94
6.	The 2005 <i>Cement</i> Case – The Biggest Price Fixing Cartel Case, Annulled by the Court Insofar as One of the Undertakings Was Concerned	95
7.	The 2004 <i>Meal Tickets</i> Case – An Example of the Regulatory Authority's Determining Involvement	96
8.	The 2005 <i>Association of Ship-Owners and River Harbours Operators</i> Case – Combination of Horizontal and Vertical Agreement	98
9.	The 2005 National Union of Real Estate Agencies (NUREA) – Decision of an Association	99
B.	Market/Client Allocation	99
1.	The 2010 <i>Private Pensions</i> Case – An Example of Regulatory Failure on a New Market and the First Case Ascertainning Breach of the TFEU	100
2.	The 2006 <i>Cable Television Services</i> Case – Annulment in Court Due to Prescription Rules	101

Table of Contents

C.	Production/Innovation Limitation	103
1.	The 2011 <i>Oil Companies</i> Case – Highest Fine for Breach of Article 5 and the Debate on the Standard of Proof (Agreement/Concerted Practice)	103
D.	Group Boycott	105
1.	The 2014 <i>Romanian Media Club</i> Case: First Group Boycott Ever Sanctioned by the Competition Council	106
2.	The 2012 <i>Medicine Importers and Distributors Association and the Medicine Distributors Association in Romania</i> Case – The Exchange Rate Freezing by the Ministry of Health and the Distributors’ ‘Strike’	107
E.	Collusion on Other Objects	110
1.	The 2013 <i>Romanian Weapons Department Bid Rigging</i> Case	111
2.	The 2010 <i>Băile Olănești Bid Rigging</i> Case	113
3.	The 2008 <i>Dialysis Bid Rigging</i> Case (Fresenius Medical Care, Alsifcom Intermed and Opremi Medfarm)	113
4.	The 2002 <i>Privatization Bid Rigging</i> Case	115
5.	The 2012 <i>TRANSGAZ Bid Rigging</i> Cases	116
6.	The 2015 <i>ROMGAZ Bid Rigging</i> Case	116
7.	The 2012 <i>CNADNR Bid Rigging</i> Case	117
8.	The 2012 <i>National Union of Bailiffs</i> Case – Raising Artificial Barriers to Entry on the Market	117
II.	Information Exchange Practices	118
III.	Cooperation Agreements	120
A.	Research and Development	121
B.	Specialization	122
C.	Standardization	122
D.	Joint Production	122
E.	Joint Purchasing	123
F.	Joint Selling	123
1.	The 2011 Case of <i>Football TV Rights</i> and the First Application of the Commitments Procedure	123
§2.	VERTICAL AGREEMENTS	126
I.	Distribution	127
A.	Resale Price Maintenance	128
1.	The 2013 Case on the <i>Dental Products Market: Maximum Discount Levels</i>	128
2.	The 2013 Case on the <i>Polystyrene Adhesives and Mortars Market: Minimum Mark-Ups</i>	129
3.	The 2012 <i>Fornetti</i> Case: Commitments in Order to Alleviate Competition Concerns Relating to Potential Price Fixing within a Franchise Agreement	130

Table of Contents

4.	The 2012 Case on the <i>Telecommunication Market – Commitments by Orange, Vodafone and Cosmote</i> , Undertaken in Order to Alleviate Concerns Related to: Resale Price Maintenance, Market Allocation and Non-compete Obligations	131
5.	The 2011 Case on the <i>Market of Commercialization of Fruits and Vegetables in Bucharest</i> (Interfruct, Albinuta and Profi)	132
6.	The 2005 <i>Wrigley</i> Case on Resale Price Maintenance and Market and Customers Allocation	132
B.	Exclusive Distributorship	134
1.	The 2004 <i>Kandia</i> Case	134
2.	The 2004 <i>Renault</i> Case	135
3.	The 2004 <i>Rompak</i> Case	135
4.	The 2004 <i>Philip Morris</i> Case	135
5.	The 2005 <i>Colgate Palmolive</i> Case	136
6.	The 2005 <i>Wrigley</i> Case	136
7.	The 2011 <i>Producție Zarah Moden</i> Case	137
8.	The 2011 <i>Belupo</i> Case – Export Restrictions on the Pharmaceutical Market	138
9.	The 2011 <i>Bayer</i> Case – Export Restrictions on the Pharmaceutical Market	140
C.	Exclusive Dealing	141
1.	The 2004 <i>Sicomed</i> Case	141
2.	The <i>Insulin</i> Case	142
3.	The 2013 <i>Video-Lottery</i> Case	146
D.	Selective Distribution	148
E.	Franchising	148
II.	Technology Licensing	148
A.	Patent Licensing	148
B.	Trademark Licensing	148
C.	Know-How and Trade Secret Licensing	149

Chapter 2. Dominant Undertakings' Prohibited Practices 150

§1.	EXPLOITATIVE PRACTICES	151
I.	Excessive/Unfair Pricing/Imposing Other Unfair Trading Terms	151
A.	The 2005 <i>Cement</i> Case – The First Allegation of Abuse of Collective Dominance (Imposition of Excessive Prices on the Grey Cement Relevant Market)	152
B.	The 2004 <i>Kronospan</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Imposition of Excessive/Unfair Prices on the Wood Panel Products Market, Following Merger Clearance	153
C.	The 2010 <i>Romanian National Post Company (CNPR)</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Excessive Pricing – One of the Most Detailed Analysis on Excessive Pricing in the Competition Council Decisions	154

Table of Contents

D. The 2006 <i>Astral Telecom and Cablevision</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Excessive Prices on the Cable TV Services Market	156
E. The 2003 <i>National Company Romanian Tobacco (SNTR)</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Imposition of Excessive Prices and Discrimination on the Cigarettes Market in Romania	158
F. The 1999 <i>Romanian Shareholders Registry</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Imposition of Unfair Trading Terms and Refusal to Deal on the Relevant Market of Registry Services on the Extra-Stock Market	159
G. The 2010 <i>Actavis v. Novartis</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Imposition of Excessive/Unfair Prices on the Pharma Market – Considerations on Excessive Pricing Involving Intellectual Property Rights	160
H. The 2004 <i>Petrom</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Imposition of Excessive/Unfair Prices on the Oil Market	161
I. The 2011 <i>Prefab v. Lafarge</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Excessive Pricing on the Cement Market – Detailed Analysis of Relevant Market Definition	162
J. The 2012 <i>Central Depository</i> Case: Commitments in Order to Alleviate Concerns Regarding a Potential Market Foreclosure (Excessive Pricing and Unfair Trading Terms)	163
K. The 2012 <i>PROGAZ</i> Case: Commitments in Order to Remove Concerns Regarding Potential Excessive Prices and Discriminatory Conditions Imposed by a Company Holding a Natural Monopoly Position	165
II. Discrimination	166
A. The 2010 <i>Romanian National Post Company (CNPR)</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Discrimination on the Postal Market – Detailed Analysis of the Characteristics of Discrimination	167
B. The 1999 <i>Romanian Shareholders Registry</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Discrimination, Unfair Trading Terms and Refusal to Deal on the Relevant Market of Registry Services on the Extra-Stock Market	170
C. The 2003 <i>National Company Romanian Tobacco (SNTR)</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Discrimination and Imposition of Excessive Prices on the Cigarettes Market in Romania	172
D. The 2014 <i>Traian Vuia Airport</i> Commitments to Address Alleged Concerns of Discrimination and Exploitation of State of Economic Dependence	172
§2. EXCLUSIONARY PRACTICES	174
I. Predation	174

Table of Contents

A. The 2007 <i>TPSUT</i> Case – Allegation of Predatory Prices in Offers in Auctions on the Market of Lease of Constructions Equipment and Demolition Services	175
II. Tying	176
III. Rebates	176
A. The 2008 <i>Com Nico Serv v. Michelin</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance on the Market for Distribution of Auto Tyres for Cars – Rebates	176
IV. Refusal to Deal	177
A. The 2011 <i>Netmaster v. Orange Romania</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Refusal to Deal on the Calls Termination Market	178
B. The 2011 <i>Netmaster v. Vodafone Romania</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Refusal to Deal on the Calls Termination Market	186
C. The 2012 <i>Netmaster v. Romtelecom</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Refusal to Deal on the Calls Termination Market	187
D. The 2011 <i>Astral Telecom v. Romtelecom and Electrica Dobrogea</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Refusal to Deal on the Market of the Service of Access to the Associated Infrastructure – Poles	190
E. The 2006 <i>National Company for Freight Railway Transport (CFR Marfă)</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Refusal to Supply and Discrimination on the Freight Rail Transport Market	191
F. The 1999 <i>Romanian Shareholders Registry</i> Case – Abuse of Dominance by Refusal to Deal and Imposition of Unfair Trading Terms on the Relevant Market of Registry Services on the Extra-Stock Market	192
V. Price Squeeze	192
VI. Exploitation of Economic Dependence	192
A. The 2014 CEZ Commitments on the Electricity Distribution Market	193
B. The 2011 <i>Prefab v. Lafarge</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Exploitation of Economic Dependence on the Cement Market	194
C. The 2011 <i>Astral Telecom v. Romtelecom and Electrica Dobrogea</i> Case – Allegation of Abuse of Dominance by Exploitation of Economic Dependence on the Market of the Service of Access to the Associated Infrastructure – Poles	194
D. The 2014 Traian Vuia Airport Commitments to Address Alleged Concerns of Discrimination and Exploitation of State of Economic Dependence	197

Chapter 3. Concentrations	198
§1. HORIZONTAL MERGERS	198
I. The 2004 OMV/Petrom Merger on the Oil Market – Commitments	198
II. The 2004 Kronospan/Sepal Merger on the Market of Simple and Laminated MDF	199
III. The 2007 Kronospan/Constantia Merger on the Market of Raw and Coated Particle Boards	199
IV. The 2010 Lidl Romania/Plus Romania and TREI Romania Merger on the Retail Market for Food and Non-food Products	200
V. The 2011 Fresenius/Renamed and Nefromed Merger on the Market of Dialysis Services – Structural Remedies	201
VI. The 2013 Auchan/Real Merger on the Retail Market – Behavioural Commitments	202
VII. The 2013 Burda/SHR Merger on Magazines Sector – Divestitures	203
§2. VERTICAL MERGERS	204
I. The 2004 Lafarge/SICIM Merger on the Market for Port Services	204
II. The 2011 Fresenius/Renamed and Nefromed Merger on the Market of Dialysis Products	204
§3. MARKET/PRODUCT EXTENSION MERGERS	205
I. The 2010 Interbrands/Wella Romania Merger on the Markets for Professional and Consumer Hair Care Products	205
§4. PURE CONGLOMERATE MERGERS	206
§5. JOINT VENTURES	206
Part III. Administrative Procedure	207
Chapter 1. Administrative Investigations before the Antitrust Authority	207
§1. INITIATIVE	207
I. General Sector Inquiries	207
II. Ex Officio Investigations	209
III. Complaints	210
A. Admissibility of Complaints: Object	211
B. Admissibility of Complaints: Legitimate Interest	211
C. Filling in the Complaint Form	212
D. Assessment of Complaints	213
E. The Rejection of a Complaint	215
F. Procedural Rights of the Complainant	217

Table of Contents

§2. POWERS	218
I. Request for Information	218
II. Investigating and Search Powers	219
A. Powers of Inspection	220
B. Dawn Raids	223
C. Legal Privilege	224
III. Cooperation with Other State Institutions	225
§3. RIGHT OF DEFENCE	227
I. The Proceedings: Hearings, Access to File, Briefs	227
A. Hearings	227
B. Access to File	229
C. Access to File: Persons Who Have Access to the File	229
D. Access to File: Available Information	230
E. Access to File: Unavailable Information	230
F. How the Access to the File Is Provided	232
G. When Access to the File Is Granted	233
H. The Access to the File of the Complainant	233
I. Providing Documents to Other Parties Involved in the Merger Proceedings	234
J. Providing Documents in Specific Situations Determined by Law	234
II. Statement of Objections	235
III. Final Hearing and Decision	235
Chapter 2. Voluntary Notifications and Clearance Decisions	237
§1. PRIOR NOTIFICATIONS OF AGREEMENTS/UNILATERAL CONDUCTS	237
§2. INFORMAL GUIDANCE LETTERS	237
Chapter 3. Merger Control	238
§1. PRELIMINARY FILING OBLIGATIONS	238
I. Criteria and Thresholds	238
II. Turnover Calculation	238
III. Market Share Calculation	240
IV. Other Relevant Notions	241
A. Obligation to Notify	241
B. Simplified Procedure	245
C. Ancillary Restrictions	246
§2. STRUCTURE OF PROCEEDINGS	248
I. Preliminary Assessment and Full Investigation	248
II. Time Framework	248

Table of Contents

III. Right of Defence	249
A. Right to Be Heard	249
B. Right of Access to the File	250
§3. CLEARANCE AND CONDITIONAL CLEARANCE	251
I. Conditions and Undertakings	251
A. Content of the Remedies	253
1. Divestiture of a Business to a Suitable Purchaser	254
2. Divestiture of a Viable and Competitive Business	255
3. Transfer to a Suitable Purchaser	256
4. Removal of Links with Competitors	257
5. Other Remedies	258
B. Timing and Procedure	259
§4. RELATIONS WITH OTHER MERGER CONTROL AUTHORITIES	263
I. Other Authorities within the Local Jurisdiction	263
II. International Coordination	263
Chapter 4. Challenging of the Administrative Decision	265
§1. COMPETENT COURTS	265
§2. TIME LIMITS	265
§3. SCOPE OF JUDICIAL REVIEW	266
Selected Bibliography	269
Index	273

Competition Law in Romania

Second Edition

**Georgeta Dinu
Adelina Roman
Marius Ștefana
Radu Tufescu**

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Competition Law.

General Editors: Roger Blanpain, Frank Hendrickx
Volume Editors: Francesco Denozza, Alberto Toffoletto



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.wklawbusiness.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN 978-90-411-6154-3

This title is available on www.kluwerlawonline.com

© 2015, Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.