

The First Women Lawyers

A Comparative Study of Gender, Law and the Legal Professions

Mary Jane Mossman

The First Women Lawyers

A Comparative Study of Gender, Law and the Legal Professions

Mary Jane Mossman

· H'ART · PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON 2006

Published in North America (US and Canada) by Hart Publishing c/o International Specialized Book Services 920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300 Portland, OR 97213-3786 USA

Tel: +1-503-287-3093 or toll-free: +1-800-944-6190 Fax: +1-503-280-8832 Email: orders@isbs.com Website: www.isbs.com

© Mary Jane Mossman 2006

First published 2006, reprinted 2006, 2007

Mary Jane Mossman has asserted her right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing at the address below.

Hart Publishing, 16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530 Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710 Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk Website: http//:www.hartpub.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data Available

ISBN-13: 978-1-84113-590-8 (paperback) ISBN-10: 1-84113-590-9 (paperback)

Typeset by Forewords, Oxford Printed and bound in Great Britain by TJ International, Padstow, Cornwall

THE FIRST WOMEN LAWYERS

This comparative study explores the lives of some of the women who first initiated challenges to male exclusivity in the legal professions in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Their challenges took place at a time of considerable optimism about progressive societal change, including new and expanding opportunities for women, as well as a variety of proposals for reforming law, legal education, and standards of legal professionalism. By situating women's claims for admission to the bar within this reformist context in different jurisdictions, the study examines the intersection of historical ideas about gender and about legal professionalism at the turn of the twentieth century. In exploring these systemic issues, the study also provides detailed examinations of the lives of some of the first women lawyers in six jurisdictions: the United States, Canada, Britain, New Zealand and Australia, India, and western Europe. In exploring how individual women adopted different legal arguments in litigated cases, or devised particular strategies to overcome barriers to professional work, the study assesses how shifting and contested ideas about gender and about legal professionalism shaped women's opportunities and choices, as well as both support for and opposition to their claims. As a comparative study of the first women lawyers in several different jurisdictions, the book reveals how a number of guite different women engaged with ideas of gender and legal professionalism at the turn of the twentieth century.

For Mary Estelle and for Donna, Stella and Emma

Acknowledgements

This comparative study of the first women lawyers evolved over several years of research and reflection about issues of gender, law and the legal professions. I am grateful to the Osgoode Society for Legal History for its support and encouragement at an early stage of my historical research. The comparative research was greatly assisted by funding from the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada, and I am especially grateful to anonymous peer reviewers who affirmed their confidence in this project. Osgoode Hall Law School of York University provided me with a Research Fellowship for six months at an important point, and the law school has also been generous with funding for summer research assistants. I am also grateful to York University for the Walter Gordon Fellowship in 2004–05, which enabled me to complete this manuscript in a timely fashion; and to the University of Ottawa's Gordon Henderson Chair in Human Rights at the beginning of the project.

The research for this study could not have been undertaken without the enthusiastic support of the library staff at Osgoode Hall Law School: Professor Balfour Halévy, Special Collections Librarian Judy Ginsberg, Reference Librarians Marianne Rogers and Louise Tsang, the Inter-Library Loan assistant, Maureen Boyce, and other members of the staff of the Law Library; I also received special help with European materials from Julianna Drexler at Collège Glendon. I also thank the staff at a number of archives: the Oriental and India Office at the British Library in London, the Section des Manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Royale in Brussels, the archives at Lincoln's Inn, and university archives at Dalhousie, the University of British Columbia, and the Law Library at McGill University.

In addition, many colleagues and friends have been generous with their time, their willingness to listen, and their suggestions: Beverley Baines, Jane Banfield, Paula Bartley, David Bell, Carl Berger, Naomi Black, Tony Blackshield, Daniel Boyer, Bettina Bradbury, Marianne Brandis, Joan Brockman, Ine Corstjens, Brettel Dawson, Maeve Doggett, Jonathan Dudley, Caroline Forder, Ursula Franklin, Linda Gehrke, Jerry Ginsburg, Philip Girard, Cameron Harvey, Douglas Hay, Leslie Howsam, Mary Kinnear, Angie MacDonald, Laurel Sefton MacDowell, Denis Magnusson, Jeanette Neeson, Michael Robertson, Lynda Tanaka, Nadine Taub, Joanna Tie Ten Quee, Margaret Thornton, Ann Wilton, Carol Wilton and Lois Yorke. I also acknowledge with special thanks the assistance of Hazel Pollack at Osgoode in fine-tuning the manuscript; and the warm

encouragement of Noli Swatman, the late Greg Jacobs, and other staff in York University's Office of Research Administration.

This project has also benefitted from the work of a number of dedicated and hard-working student research assistants: Cindy L Baldassi did an outstanding job during the most critical period of this project, tracking down elusive books, articles, and citations. At Osgoode, Ami Atal, Tamara Barclay, Leanna Bayliss, Wendy Greyling, Courtney Harris, Gail Henderson, Christine Jenkins, Linda Knol, Emma Rhodes, and Christine Vanderschoot provided enthusiastic assistance, as did Victoria Mainprize at Dalhousie and Anila Srivastava at the University of British Columbia. Professor Karen Pearlston and Reference Librarian Louise Tsang also undertook follow-up research at the British Library and at Lincoln's Inn in London, which was much appreciated. I am also grateful to Richard Hart and others at Hart Publishing for support and assistance in the publication process.

In addition, I am pleased to acknowledge the *Canadian Journal of Women and the Law/Revue Femmes et Droit*, whose editors kindly agreed to permit me to reproduce parts of the Introduction and of chapter 5 which were earlier published in the *Journal/Revue*.

Beyond the research challenges, I thank Brian Bucknall for patient and insightful words about writing and the creative imagination, several family members who very kindly read parts of this manuscript, and especially Mary Estelle Mossman for weekly words of encouragement until the task was finished. The book is dedicated to her memory, and to three other women in my family who always supported my aspirations.

Portraits of Women Lawyers

PORTIAS OF TODAY

The Illustrated London News, 13 November 1897.











































FRĂULEIN ANITA AUGSPURG, Germany.







Contents

	Acknowledgements	V
	Portraits of Women Lawyers	ix
Intr	roduction The First Women Lawyers	1
	Prologue: Contemporary Questions about Women as Lawyers	T
	Rethinking the First Women Lawyers: Themes of Gender, Professionalism and Women's Lives	5
	Toward a Comparative History: Introducing the First Women Lawyers	16
1	American Pioneers: The First Women Lawyers	23
	A Century of Struggle	23
	The Context for the First Women Lawyers: New Ideas about Women's Equality and Legal Professionalism	29
	Constitutionalising (In)Equality for Women Lawyers	40
	Women's Rights and Professional Identities	54
2	Women Lawyers in Canada: Becoming Lawyers 'On the Same Terms as Men'	67
	Women as 'Fellow Lawyers'	67
	The Context for the First Women Lawyers in Canada; Reformist Ideas about Professionalism and Women's Roles	73
	'Persons,' Pronouns, and Policy Choices: Judicial Reasoning in French and Langstaff	89
	Contested Ideas: New Women and Legal Professionalism	99
3	'Sound Women' and Legal Work: The First Women in Law	
		113
	Women's Access to the Legal Professions in Britain	113
	Eliza Orme: Challenging 'Woman's Sphere' and a 'Gentleman's Profession'	121
	A Woman in Law in the Public Sphere	137
	Eliza Orme and the Gender Issue	148

viii Contents

4	Colonies of the British Empire: The First Woman Lawyer in New Zealand	155
	Women Lawyers in the Colonies	1.5
	Ethel Benjamin	160
	A 'Rebel [Extending] the Boundary of the Right'?	18
5	The Empire and British India: The First Indian Woman 'In Law'	191
	A Woman Pleading in a British Court in India: 1896	19
	Becoming a Woman in Law in India	196
	Cornelia Sorabji: 'No Peer Among the Women of India'	232
6	European Connections: Women in Law and the Role of Louis Frank	239
	La Femme-Avocat and European Women Lawyers	239
	Lydia Poët, Marie Popelin and Jeanne Chauvin: Louis Frank's Support	
	for Women in Law	246
	The Context of L'Affaire Chauvin	269
Cor	nclusion Reflecting on the First Women Lawyers	277
	Bibliography	291
	Index	319

Introduction The First Women Lawyers

PROLOGUE: CONTEMPORARY QUESTIONS ABOUT WOMEN AS LAWYERS

[What] difference does it make that Clara Brett Martin succeeded in becoming a lawyer in 1897, and what difference should it make that the legal profession increasingly includes large numbers of women as well as men? Beyond the ... careers of individual women lawyers, what impact will the advent of a significant number of women in the legal profession have on the practice of law, on legal rules and concepts, on the roles lawyers play in our society? Most importantly, will women who become lawyers be just like men who are lawyers, or will they bring a new dimension to lawyering? 1

HIS BOOK HAD its beginnings in these questions, first posed in May 1986 in the historic surroundings of Osgoode Hall in Toronto. The occasion was the Law Society's first ever continuing education programme on 'Women in the Legal Profession,'2 and the audience included a large number of women lawyers, many of them newly-admitted members of the profession. Passing through the old winding corridors of Osgoode Hall, the heart of the Ontario legal profession for nearly two hundred years, the participants gathered expectantly in the large lecture hall. Even before the programme started, the sight of so many women, all of whom were also *lawyers*, confirmed an unprecedented transformation in the demography of the Canadian legal profession. For, although a few women had chosen to become lawyers in earlier decades, the highly accelerated rate of women's entry to the legal profession after 1970 was

² CLE Programme 'Women in the Legal Profession' (Toronto, Law Society of Upper Canada, 13 May 1986). Similar programmes were later offered by law societies and bar associations across Canada, as well as by the National Association of Women and the Law in Winnipeg in

February 1987.

¹ MJ Mossman, 'Portia's Progress: Women as Lawyers - Reflections on Past and Future' (1988) 8 Windsor Yearbook of Access to Justice 252 at 266. See also Law Society of Upper Canada, Crossing the Bar: A Century of Women's Experience 'Upon the Rough and Troubled Seas of Legal Practice' in Ontario (Toronto, Law Society of Upper Canada Archives, 1993) at 41; and RL Abel, 'Comparative Sociology of Legal Professions: An Exploratory Essay' (1985) 1 American Bar Foundation Research Journal 5 at 40.

'nothing short of revolutionary.' Indeed, even taking account of significant expansion in the legal profession between the early 1960s and the 1980s, the rate of expansion for women lawyers was still disproportionately large: while the number of male law students across Canada doubled between 1962–63 and 1980–81, the number of female law students increased twenty four times in the same period. Reflecting an optimistic future for this 'revolution in numbers' of women in law, Justice Rosalie Abella predicted in her keynote speech that '... with any luck, 15 years from now if someone tries to organise a conference on Women in the Legal Profession, we will wonder what they're talking about.'

Such optimism, however, has been increasingly tempered by a sense of paradox: while individual women have achieved significant success in law, there is continuing evidence of systemic gender barriers. Certainly, there have been some notable achievements, including the fact that nearly equal numbers of men and women are now law students in most Canadian provinces, with even higher proportions of women students in civil law programmes in Québec. Women have been appointed judges of provincial and federal courts, including Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of Canada; partners and even managing partners of major law firms; tribunal chairs and CEOs; and deans and professors of law schools. A woman lawyer was briefly Prime Minister of Canada, and two women

³ RL Abel, 'United States: The Contradictions of Professionalism' in R Abel and P Lewis (eds), Lawyers in Society: the Common Law World, vol I (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1988) 186 at 202.

⁴ RL Abel, above, n 1 at 23 and Table 3. See also Canadian Bar Association, Touchstones for Change: Equality, Diversity and Accountability – the Report on Gender Equality in the Legal Profession (Ottawa, Canadian Bar Association, 1993) at 25; DAA Stager with HW Arthurs, Lawyers in Canada (Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1990) at 159–60; Cameron Harvey, 'Women in Law in Canada' (1970–71) 4 Manitoba Law Journal 9; and L Silver Dranoff, 'Women as Lawyers in Toronto' (1972) 10 Osgoode Hall Law Journal 177.

⁵ R Silberman Abella, 'Women in the Legal Profession' in CLE Programme, above, n 2 at 21. See also Cynthia Fuchs Epstein, 'Women in Law: Old Dilemmas, New Dilemmas,' above, n 2 at 16–18.

6 Current statistics reveal that women law students constitute 50% or more of most common law programmes at Canadian universities: see 'Key Facts about Canadian Common-Law Schools' in LSAT Registration and Information Book (Canadian), 2003–2004 (Newtown, PA, Law School Admission Council, Inc, 2003) at 60. See also BM Mazer, 'An Analysis of Gender in Admission to the Canadian Common Law Schools from 1985–86 to 1994–95' (1997) 20 Dalhousie Law Journal 135.

7 See Touchstones for Change, above, n 4 at 50–51. Justice Bertha Wilson was appointed to the Supreme Court of Canada in 1982; Justice Claire L'Heureux-Dubé was appointed in 1987 and Justice Beverley McLachlin in 1989. Justice Wilson retired in 1991. Justice McLachlin became Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of Canada in 2000, the same year in which Justice Louise Arbour became a member of the Court. Justice L'Heureux-Dubé retired in 2002 and Justice Marie Deschamps was appointed to the Court. In 2004, Justice Arbour resigned, and Justices Rosalie Abella and Louise Charron were appointed to two existing vacancies; thus, for the first time in 2004, four of nine members of the Supreme Court of Canada were women. See also RM Salokar and ML Volcansek (eds), Women in Law: A Bio-Biographical Sourcebook (Westport, CT, Greenwood Press, 1996).

8 See Touchstones for Change, above, n 4 at chapters 5-9.

lawyers have been appointed federal Minister of Justice. Beginning in the 1970s, Canadian law schools began to offer courses about women and the law, 10 and women lawyers established a national policy organisation and a national law journal. 11 In recent years, moreover, many women lawyers have successfully participated in test case litigation and legislative lobbying on issues about gender equality, particularly in relation to equality guarantees in the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, 12 Indeed, as a special American report published in 1999 concluded, women lawyers were 'the story of the [twentieth] century':

They've gone from being exiled from the corridors of political and corporate power to treading them en masse. Once banished from the nation's law schools (and from Harvard Law School until as recently as 1950) they now make up nearly half of this year's entering class. Women lawyers have forced the most exclusive law firms to open their doors. Just as importantly, they've forced the most entrenched male partners to open their minds. (Well, most of them.) 13

Paradoxically, however, a stream of academic research, professional inquiries, and judicial task force reports in several jurisdictions has revealed how issues of gender equality in the law and the legal professions continue to present contemporary challenges. A number of academic studies suggest that women lawyers generally remain, in Margaret Thornton's telling phrase, mere 'fringe-dwellers of the jurisprudential community,'14 For example, in their study of men and women lawyers in large firms in Toronto in the early 1990s, John Hagan and Fiona Kay concluded that women lawyers did not succeed as well as their male colleagues, even when women invested in their careers to the same extent as men; the

12 Hon Kim Campbell was Prime Minister of Canada (1993), having previously served as the first woman Minister of Justice (1990-1993). Hon Anne McLellan was also Minister of Justice

10 According to a survey of course offerings on 'Women and the Law' in Canadian law schools for 1977-80, conducted by Professor Jane Banfield of York University (survey on file), eight law schools were providing such a course; for example, see B Baines, 'Women and the Law: Course Materials' (Kingston, Queen's University Faculty of Law, 1974). See also MJ Mossman, "Otherness" and the Law School: A Comment on Teaching Gender Equality (1985) 1 Canadian Journal of Women and the Law 213.

11 Female lawyers and law students organised the first national conference of Women and the Law in Windsor, Ontario in 1974; the conference resulted in the creation of the National Association of Women and the Law: see LS Dranoff, Women in Canadian Law (Toronto, Fitzhenry and Whiteside, 1977) at 87. The first issue of the Canadian Journal of Women and the Law/ Revue Femmes et Droit was published in 1985.

12 See S Razack, Canadian Feminism and the Law: The Women's Legal Education and Action Fund and the Pursuit of Equality (Toronto, Second Story Press, 1991); and M J Mossman, 'The Paradox of Feminist Engagement with Law' in Nancy Mandell (ed), Feminist Issues: Race, Class and Sexuality, 2nd edn (Scarborough, Prentice Hall Allyn and Bacon Canada, 1998) 180.

13 'The Story of the Century,' The American Lawyer, March 1999, at 49.

14 M Thornton, Dissonance and Distrust: Women in the Legal Profession (Melbourne, Oxford University Press, 1996) at 3-4. See also M Thornton, 'Feminist Jurisprudence: Illusion or Reality' (1986) 3 Australian Journal of Law and Society 5.

authors identified a 'glass ceiling' for women lawyers in many of these firms. 15 The Canadian Bar Association's report in 1993 confirmed this academic research, but also warned that the 'glass ceiling' was often experienced by minority women as a 'steel door,' 16 pointing out how gender intersects with women's race, class, sexual orientation, language, dis/ability, religion, marital and/or parental status, age, and educational background to create additional barriers. Similarly, in her more recent study of men and women lawyers in British Columbia, Joan Brockman found persistent discriminatory attitudes towards women lawyers, not just among older lawyers who were members of the 'old boys' club' and thus 'relics of the past,' but also among the 'baby dinosaurs,' younger male lawyers who were growing up to replace them. 17 Studies in the United Kingdom, 18 in the civil law jurisdictions of Europe, 19 and in the United States²⁰ have reached similar conclusions. Thus, as Judith Resnick gloomily reported about the work of American judicial task forces on gender bias, 'a decade of academic and court-based documentation of deep-seated and endemic unfairness has not undermined the resiliency of legal culture;' although judicial task forces may 'authorize inquiry, ask forbidden questions, [and] obtain information, ... [professional cultures] still remain impenetrable to profound change.'21

¹⁵ J Hagan and F Kay, Gender in Practice: A Study of Lawyers' Lives (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1995) at 182. See also K Hull and R Nelson, 'Gender Inequality in Law: Problems of Structure and Agency in Recent Studies of Gender in Anglo-American Legal Professions' (1998) 23 Law and Social Inquiry 681; and S O'Donovan-Polten, The Scales of Success (Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2001).

16 Touchstones for Change, above, n 4 at 11 and 60-61.

¹⁷ J Brockman, Gender in the Legal Profession: Fitting in or Breaking the Mould (Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 2001) at 200.

18 See C McGlynn, The Woman Lawyer: Making the Difference (London, Butterworths, 1998); H Sommerlad and P Sanderson, Gender, Choice and Commitment: Women Solicitors in England and Wales and the Struggle for Equal Status (Aldershot, Ashgate/Dartmouth, 1998);

and S Fredman, Women and the Law (Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1997).

19 See U Schultz and G Shaw (eds), Women in the World's Legal Professions (Oxford, Hart Publishing, 2002). See also C Menkel-Meadow, "Feminization" of the Legal Profession: The Comparative Sociology of Women Lawyers' in R Abel and P Lewis (eds), Lawyers in Society: Comparative Perspectives, vol III (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1989) at 196; and C Menkel-Meadow, 'The Comparative Sociology of Women Lawyers: The "Feminization" of the Legal Profession' (1987) 24 Osgoode Hall Law Journal 897.

20 See M Harrington, Women Lawyers: Rewriting the Rules (New York, Plume Books, 1995); D Rhode, Justice and Gender: Sex Discrimination and the Law (Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 1989); K Berger Morello, The Invisible Bar: The Woman Lawyer in America 1638 to the Present (New York, Random House, 1986); and C Menkel-Meadow, 'Exploring a Research Agenda of the Feminization of the Legal Profession: Theories of Gender and Social Change' (1989) 14 Law and Social Inquiry 289. See also C Fuchs Epstein, Women in Law (New York, Basic Books, 1981) and 2nd edn (Chicago, University of Illinois Press, 1993); R Moss Kanter, 'Reflections on Women and the Legal Profession: A Sociological Perspective' (1978) 1 Harvard Women's Law Journal 1; and A Sachs and J Hoff Wilson, Sexism and the Law: A Study of Male Beliefs and Legal Bias in Britain and the United States (New York, The Free Press, 1978).

²¹ J Resnik, 'Ambivalence: The Resiliency of Legal Culture in the United States' (1993) 45 Stanford Law Review 1525 at 1535. See also B Lentz and D Laband, Sex Discrimination in the Legal Profession (Westport, CT, Quorum Books, 1995); and M Thornton, above, n 14.

Such conclusions pose significant challenges: they confirm that even with an unprecedented number of women becoming lawyers, the admission of women to the bar has not engendered the law or the legal professions. Instead, gender remains deeply embedded within traditional legal norms and professional cultures; and as Thornton pointed out, 'neither an increase in the number of women nor the passing of time can provide an automatic remedy.'22 Moreover, as Carrie Menkel-Meadow suggested, the 'success' of individual women in the legal profession may be inversely related to the extent of their commitment to gender issues. As she reflected, 'Are ... women, who act like men, allowed to penetrate the restricted boundaries [of judicial appointment, law firm promotion, and academic success], while those who act more like women are kept out?....'23 Such questions reveal how Virginia Woolf's claim, that women could enter the professions and 'use them to have a mind of [their] own and a will of [their] own,' remains profoundly contested.24

RETHINKING THE FIRST WOMEN LAWYERS: THEMES OF GENDER, PROFESSIONALISM AND WOMEN'S LIVES

The professional and personal challenges that confront women lawyers today did not have their origins in the 1960s, as many have suggested. Rather, they reach back ... to the pioneer generation of women lawyers who were the first to articulate and grapple with the challenges facing women in the legal profession,25

As Virginia Drachman argued in her study of women's efforts to gain admission to the bar in the United States in the last decades of the nineteenth century, the history of the first women lawyers is relevant to an understanding of contemporary issues of gender and professionalism. In describing how nineteenth century women lawyers struggled to balance their gender and professional identities, 26 for example, Drachman explained

22 M Thornton, above, n 14 at 291; according to Thornton, 'clubs, corporeality, and corporatism' represent ongoing sites of contestation for women lawyers.

23 C Menkel-Meadow, above, n 19 (OHLI) at 899-900: according to Menkel-Meadow, such questions confront the issue of 'whether women will be changed by the profession, or whether the legal profession will be changed by the increased presence of women.' See also Touchstones for Change, above, n 4 at 11.

24 V Woolf, Three Guineas (London, Hogarth Press, 1977) lst pub 1938, at 151. See also JC Foster, 'Antigones at the Bar: Women Lawyers as Reluctant Adversaries' (1986) 10:3 Legal Studies Forum 287; C Smart, 'Feminism and Law: Some Problems of Analysis and Strategy' (1986) 14 International Journal of the Sociology of Law 109; and M Thornton, Feminism and the Contradictions of Law Reform' (1991) 19 International Journal of the Sociology of Law

453.
25 VG Drachman, Women Lawyers and the Origins of Professional Identity in America: The Letters of the Equity Club 1887 to 1890 (Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press, 1993) at vii. 26 VG Drachman, Sisters in Law: Women Lawyers in Modern American History