rereading america

Cultural Contexts for Critical Thinking and Writing



Gary Colombo • Robert Cullen • Bonnie Lisle

Rereading America

Cultural Contexts for Critical Thinking and Writing

Seventh Edition

Edited by

Gary Colombo
Los Angeles Community College District

Robert Culle
SAN JOSE STA

Bonnie Lisle
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, LOS ANGELES

For Bedford / St. Martin's

Senior Developmental Editor: John Sullivan Senior Production Editor: Lori Chong Roncka

Senior Production Supervisor: Nancy Myers

Marketing Manager: Karita dos Santos Editorial Assistant: Jennifer Lyford

Production Assistant: Katherine Caruana

Copyeditor: Barbara Price

Cover Design: Donna Lee Dennison

Cover Art: Elena and Michel Gran, American Flag. Photo courtesy of Hollis Taggart Galleries, New York City and Albemarle Gallery, London. Painting courtesy of Elena and Michel Gran. © Elena and Michel Gran.

Composition: Stratford/TexTech

Printing and Binding: Haddon Craftsmen, Inc., an R. R. Donnelley & Sons Company

President: Joan E. Feinberg

Editorial Director: Denise B. Wydra

Editor in Chief: Karen S. Henry

Director of Marketing: Karen Melton Soeltz

Director of Editing, Design, and Production: Marcia Cohen

Managing Editor: Elizabeth M. Schaaf

Library of Congress Control Number: 2006940026

Copyright © 2007 by Bedford / St. Martin's

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, except as may be expressly permitted by the applicable copyright statutes or in writing by the Publisher.

Manufactured in the United States of America

1 0 9 f

For information, write: Bedford / St. Martin's, 75 Arlington Street, Boston, MA 02116 (617-399-4000)

ISBN-10: 0-312-44703-5 ISBN-13: 978-0-312-44703-8

Acknowledgments and copyrights appear at the back of the book on pages 853–58, which constitute an extension of the copyright page. It is a violation of the law to reproduce these selections by any means whatsoever without the written permission of the copyright holder.

Rereading America

Cultural Contexts for Critical Thinking and Writing

Preface for Instructors

About Rereading America

Designed for first-year writing and critical thinking courses, *Rereading America* anthologizes a diverse set of readings focused on the myths that dominate U.S. culture. This central theme brings together thought-provoking selections on a broad range of topics — family, education, success, gender roles, race, religion, and America seen from a global perspective — topics that raise controversial issues meaningful to college students of all backgrounds. We've drawn these readings from many sources, both within the academy and outside of it; the selections are both multicultural and crosscurricular and thus represent an unusual variety of voices, styles, and subjects.

The readings in this anthology speak directly to students' experiences and concerns. Every college student has had some brush with prejudice, and most have something to say about education, the family, or the gender stereotypes they see in films and on television. The issues raised here help students link their personal experiences with broader cultural perspectives and lead them to analyze, or "read," the cultural forces that have shaped and continue to shape their lives. By linking the personal and the cultural, students begin to recognize that they are not academic outsiders — they too have knowledge, assumptions, and intellectual frameworks that give them authority in academic culture. Connecting personal knowledge and academic discourse helps students see that they are able to think, speak, and write academically and that they don't have to absorb passively what the "experts" say.

Features of the Seventh Edition

A Cultural Approach to Critical Thinking Like its predecessors, the seventh edition of Rereading America is committed to the premise that learning to think critically means learning to identify and see beyond dominant cultural myths—collective and often unconsciously held beliefs that influence our thinking, reading, and writing. Instead of treating cultural diversity as just another topic to be studied or "appreciated," Rereading America encourages students to grapple with the real differences in perspective that arise in a

pluralistic society like ours. This method helps students to break through conventional assumptions and patterns of thought that hinder fresh critical responses and inhibit dialogue. It helps them recognize that even the most apparently "natural" fact or obvious idea results from a process of social construction. And it helps them to develop the intellectual independence essential to critical thinking, reading, and writing.

Classic and Conservative Perspectives To provide students with the historical context they often need, each chapter in this edition of Rereading America includes a "classic" expression of the myth under examination. Approaching the myth of success, for example, by way of Horatio Alger's Ragged Dick — or the myth of racial superiority by way of Thomas Jefferson's infamous diatribe against "race mixing" — gives students a better sense of the myth's origins and impact. We've also included at least one contemporary conservative revision of the myth in each chapter, so you'll find in this edition readings by cultural critics who stand to the right of center, writers like Rick Santorum, Shelby Steele, Ken Hamblin, Dinesh D'Sousa, and David Kupelian.

New Issues Today, tensions between secular and religious values continue to trouble communities across America. Not a year goes by without a case coming before the courts involving issues such as prayer in school, the display of the Ten Commandments, the public celebration of religious holidays, the teaching of evolution, or the inclusion of "God" in the Pledge of Allegiance. This edition of Rereading America offers a new chapter that invites students to reflect on the role of religion in American culture. "One Nation Under God: American Myths of Church and State" examines the current resurgence of religion in the United States and explores the myths of secularism and religious belief that frame our thinking about the meaning of faith. Authors in this chapter include Anne Lamott, David Kupelian, Bill McKibben, and Eric Marcus, who examine the foundations of personal belief and its force in a secular culture. The Visual Portfolio offers a pictorial meditation on the delicate balance between belief and intolerance in American society. Diana L. Eck and Maria Poggi Johnson explore religious diversity — and religious division — in contemporary America. The chapter closes with readings addressing the competing claims of church and state, with pieces from James Madison, Noah Feldman, and Sam Harris.

Timely New Readings To keep Rereading America up to date, we've worked hard to bring you the best new voices speaking on issues of race, gender, class, family, education, religion, and freedom. As in past editions, we've retained old favorites like Malcolm X, Richard Rodriguez, Shelby Steele, Jamaica Kincaid, Deborah Tannen, Jean Anyon, Toni Cade Bambara, Gary Soto, Judith Ortiz Cofer, and Mike Rose. But you'll also find a host of new selections by such authors as Evan Wolfson, Jonathan Kozol, Maysan Haydar, Deborah Rudacille, Sam Harris, and Harvey Mansfield. And like earlier versions, this edition of Rereading America includes a healthy mix of personal

and academic writing, representing a wide variety of genres, styles, and rhetorical strategies.

Visual Portfolios In addition to frontispieces and cartoons, we've included a Visual Portfolio of myth-related images in every chapter of Rereading America. These collections of photographs, advertisements, and reproductions of famous paintings invite students to examine how visual "texts" are constructed and how, like written texts, they are susceptible to multiple readings and rereadings. Each portfolio is accompanied by a series of questions that encourage critical analysis and connect portfolio images to ideas and themes in chapter reading selections. As in earlier editions, the visual frontispieces that open each chapter are integrated into the prereading assignments found in the chapter introductions. The cartoons, offered as a bit of comic relief and as opportunities for visual thinking, are paired with appropriate readings thoughout the text.

Focus on Media We've continued the practice of including selections focusing on the media. Chapter Three includes a selection by Diana Kendall on the media's role in disseminating myths of material success. Chapter Four offers analyses of gender issues in the media, including Jean Kilbourne on images of women in advertising and Joan Morgan on black feminism and hip-hop culture. In our new chapter on religion, Chapter Six, David Kupelian argues that the media corrodes key religious values. And in Chapter Seven, Todd Gitlin examines the ways American popular culture influences societies throughout the world.

Focus on Struggle and Resistance Most multicultural readers approach diversity in one of two ways: either they adopt a pluralist approach and conceive of American society as a kind of salad bowl of cultures, or, in response to recent worries about the lack of "objectivity" in the multicultural curriculum, they take what might be called the "talk show" approach and present American culture as a series of pro-and-con debates on a number of social issues. The seventh edition of Rereading America, like its predecessors, follows neither of these approaches. Pluralist readers, we feel, make a promise that's impossible to keep: no single text, and no single course, can do justice to the many complex cultures that inhabit the United States. Thus, the materials selected for Rereading America aren't meant to offer a taste of what "family" means for Native Americans, or the flavor of gender relations among immigrants. Instead, we've included selections like Melvin Dixon's "Aunt Ida Pieces a Quilt" or Harlon Dalton's "Horatio Alger," because they offer us fresh critical perspectives on the common myths that shape our ideas, values, and beliefs. Rather than seeing this anthology as a mosaic or kaleidoscope of cultural fragments that combine to form a beautiful picture, it's more accurate to think of Rereading America as a handbook that helps students explore the ways that the dominant culture shapes their ideas, values, and beliefs.

This notion of cultural dominance is studiously avoided in most recent multicultural anthologies. "Salad bowl" readers generally sidestep the issue of cultural dynamics: intent on celebrating America's cultural diversity, they offer a relatively static picture of a nation fragmented into a kind of cultural archipelago. "Talk show" readers admit the idea of conflict, but they distort the reality of cultural dynamics by presenting cultural conflicts as a matter of rational — and equally balanced — debate. All of the materials anthologized in *Rereading America* address the cultural struggles that animate American society — the tensions that result from the expectations established by our dominant cultural myths and the diverse realities that these myths often contradict.

Ultimately, *Rereading America* is about resistance. In this new edition we continue to include readings that offer positive alternatives to the dilemmas of cultural conflict. To make this commitment to resistance as visible as possible, we've tried to conclude every chapter of this new edition with a suite of readings offering creative and, we hope, empowering examples of Americans who work together to redefine our national myths.

Extensive Apparatus Rereading America offers a wealth of features to help students hone their analytic abilities and to aid instructors as they plan class discussions, critical thinking activities, and writing assignments. These include:

- A Comprehensive Introductory Essay The book begins with a comprehensive essay, "Thinking Critically, Challenging Cultural Myths," that introduces students to the relationships between thinking, cultural diversity, and the notion of dominant cultural myths, and shows how such myths can influence their academic performance. We've also included a section devoted to active reading, which offers suggestions for prereading, prewriting, note taking, text marking, and keeping a reading journal. Another section helps students work with the many visual images included in the book.
- New "Fast Facts" Begin Each Chapter Several provocative statistics before each chapter introduction provide context for students and prompt discussion. For example, "Roughly 35 million Americans (one in eight) live below the government's official poverty line."
- Detailed Chapter Introductions An introductory essay at the beginning of each chapter offers students a thorough overview of each cultural myth, placing it in historical context, raising some of the chapter's central questions, and orienting students to the chapter's internal structure.
- Prereading Activities Following each chapter introduction you'll find
 prereading activities designed to encourage students to reflect on what
 they already know about the cultural myth in question. Often connected

- to the images that open every chapter, these prereading activities help students to engage the topic even before they begin to read.
- Questions to Stimulate Critical Thinking Three groups of questions following each selection encourage students to consider the reading carefully in several contexts: "Engaging the Text" focuses on close reading of the selection itself; "Exploring Connections" puts the selection into dialogue with other selections throughout the book; "Extending the Critical Context" invites students to connect the ideas they read about here with sources of knowledge outside the anthology, including library research, personal experience, interviews, ethnographic-style observations, and so forth. As in past editions, we've included a number of questions linking readings with contemporary television shows and feature films for instructors who want to address the interplay of cultural myths and the mass media.
- New "Further Connections" Close Each Chapter These questions and assignments help students make additional connections among readings. They also provide suggestions for exploring issues through research and include ideas for community projects.
- An Extensive Instructor's Manual Resources for Teaching REREADING
 AMERICA provides detailed advice about ways to make the most of
 both the readings and the questions; it also offers further ideas for dis cussion, class activities, and writing assignments, as well as practical
 hints and suggestions that we've garnered from our own classroom
 experiences.
- Online Resources The Top Links Web site for Rereading America contains annotated research links. For more information, visit bedford stmartins.com/rereadingamerica to explore this site and other helpful electronic resources for both students and instructors.

Acknowledgments

Critical thinking is always a collaborative activity, and the kind of critical thinking involved in the creation of an anthology like *Rereading America* represents collegial collaboration at its very best. Since publication of the last edition, we've heard from instructors across the country who have generously offered suggestions for new classroom activities and comments for further refinements and improvements. Among the many instructors who shared their insights with us as we reworked this edition, we'd particularly like to thank the following: José Amaya, Iowa State University; Michael A. Arnzen, Seton Hill University; Alvin Clarke, Iowa State University; Scott DeShong, Quinebaug Valley Community College; Stephen Evans, University of Kansas; Irene Faass, Iowa State University; Eileen Ferretti, Kingsborough Community College; Susan E. Howard, University of Houston, Downtown; Emily

Isaacs, Montclair State University; Laureen Katana, Community College of Philadelphia; Misty Krueger, University of Tennessee; Robb Kunz, Utah State University; Mark Lidman, Maple Woods Community College; Seri Luangphinith, University of Hawai'i at Hilo; Michael Morris, Eastfield College; Roxanne Munch, Joliet Junior College; Beverly Neiderman, Kent State University; Carol Nowotny-Young, University of Arizona; Ellen O'Brien, Roosevelt University; Ildiko Olasz, Michigan State University; Cecilia Ornelas, California State University, Fullerton; Ted Otteson, University of Missouri, Kansas City; Carol Perdue, Green River Community College; Evelyn Pezzulich, Bridgewater State College; Mary Anne Quick, Bristol Community College; Elizabeth Rich, Saginaw Valley State University; Therese Rizzo, University of Delaware; Carolyn Rubin-Trimble, University of Houston, Downtown; Lori Taylor, SUNY University at Buffalo; Linda Tucker, Southern Arkansas University; Phoebe Wiley, Frostburg State University; Malcolm Williams, University of Houston, Downtown; Elizabeth Wright, Pennsylvania State University, Hazleton.

For their help with the sixth edition, we'd like to thank Andrea Beaudin, Southern Connecticut State University; Nancy C. Botkin, Indiana University South Bend; Deborah Brink, Lower Columbia College; Blythe Creamer, University of California, Davis; Stephen F. Evans, University of Kansas; Kathy A. Fedorko, Middlesex County College; Julie Hirsch, University of Arizona, Tucson; Jennifer Lynn Holley, Southern Connecticut State University; Deborah Kirkman, University of Kentucky; Anna Leahy, Missouri Western State College; Kelly Mayhew, San Diego City College; Julie Nash, Merrimack College; Deirdre Neilen, SUNY Upstate Medical University; Hector Perez, University of the Incarnate Word; Josephine Perry, Los Medanos College; Margaret B. Racin, West Virginia University; Daniela Ragusa, University of Rhode Island; Marguerite Regan, Southwestern College; Elizabeth Rich, Saginaw Valley State University; Kim Robeson, MiraCosta Community College; Renée Ruderman, Metropolitan State College of Denver; Tereza M. Szeghi, University of Arizona; Karen Toloui, Diablo Valley College; Lisa Toner, University of Kentucky; Alberto S. Vitale, Indiana University South Bend; James Ray Watkins, Jr., Eastern Illinois University; James M. Welch, Wittenberg University; and Terry Williams, San Diego State University.

For their help with the fifth edition of *Rereading America*, we'd like to thank the following: Etta C. Abrahams, Michigan State University; Richard L. Arthur, Miami University of Ohio; Scott E. Ash, Nassau Community College; Michael Augsperger, University of Iowa; Larry Cain, Chabot College; Rosann M. Cook, Purdue University at Calumet; Mary Jean Corbett, Miami University of Ohio; Stephen Curley, Texas A&M University at Galveston; Ann M. DeDad, Cannon University; Florence Emch, California State University, Los Angeles; Juan F. Flores, Del Mar College; Nancy Gonchar, The College of New Rochelle; Tara Hart, Howard Community College; Sue Ellen Holbrook, Southern Connecticut State University; Stephen Horvath, Howard Community College; Irwin J. Koplik, Hofstra University; Michael

Lewis, University of Iowa; Linda Maitland, University of Houston; Doug Merrell, University of Washington; Robert Murray, St. Thomas Aquinas College; Kathleen O'Brien, Boston University; Renée Ruderman, Metropolitan State College of Denver; Karen Ryan-Engel, Gannon University; Amy Sileven, Southern Illinois University at Carbondale; Jane E. Simonsen, University of Iowa; Juliet Sloger, University of Rochester; Ken Smith, Indiana University South Bend; Judith A. Stainbrook, Gannon University; Douglas Steward, University of Kansas.

For their help with the fourth edition of Rereading America, we'd like to thank the following: Dan Armstrong, Lane Community College; H. Inness Asher, University of Louisiana, Lafayette; Margot Gayle Backis, St. John Fisher College; Marlow Belschner, Southern Illinois University; Nancy Botkin, Indiana University South Bend; Carol Brown, South Puget Sound Community College; William Carroll, Norfolk State University; Dolores Crim, Purdue University, Hammond; Linda L. Danielson, Lane Community College; Emily Detiner, Miami University; Kathy Doherty, Bentley College; Melinda M. Fiala, University of Missouri, Kansas City; Sara Gogol, Portland Community College; Joyce Huff, George Washington University; Kim Lang, Shippensburg University; Uvieja Leighton, The Union Institute; Elizabeth L. Lewis, Vermilion Community College; Jennifer Lowood, Vista Community College; Brij Lurine, University of New Mexico; Eunice M. Madison, Purdue University, Calumet; Kenneth K. Martin, Community College of Philadelphia; James McWard, University of Kansas; Kevin A. Moberg, University of North Dakota; John G. Morris, Cameron University; Craig J. Nauman, University of Wisconsin, Madison; Bruce Ouderkirk, University of Nebraska, Lincoln; E. Suzanne Owens, Lorain County Community College; Elizabeth Paulson, California State University; Amy Sapowith, University of California, Los Angeles; Jurgen Schlunk, West Virginia University; Tony Slagle, The Ohio State University; Penny L. Smith, Gannon University; Sharon Snyder, Purdue University, Calumet; Deborah Tenneg, Yale University; Ruthe Thompson, University of Arizona; Lorraine Threadgill, Community College of Philadelphia; Steve Turnwall, Los Medanos College; Riley Vann, West Virginia University; Nancy Wallace, Temple University; Ellen Weinauer, University of Southern Mississippi; Claudia L. Whitling, South Puget Sound Community College; Judy Wilkinson, Skyline College; Mark Wollarges, Vanderbilt University; Phyllis Zrzuay, Franklin Pierce College.

We are also grateful to those reviewers who helped shape previous editions.

As always, we'd also like to thank all the kind folks at Bedford/ St. Martin's, who do their best to make the effort of producing a book like this a genuine pleasure. Our publishers, former president Charles Christensen and president Joan Feinberg, deserve special praise for the support they've shown us over the years and for the wise counsel they've offered in the occasional hour of need. Our editor, John Sullivan, has been a true partner in the development of this edition and has again demonstrated the kind

of style and grace we've come to expect from him as the consummate professional. We also want to thank Lori Chong Roncka, who served as production editor on this edition; Barbara Price, who expertly copyedited the manuscript; Donna Dennison, who produced our new cover; Sandy Schechter, for clearing text permissions; Linda Finnegan and Helane Prottas, for researching and tracking down art; and editorial assistant Jennifer Lyford, who helped out with many of the hundreds of details that go into a project such as this. Finally, we'd like to acknowledge our spouses, Elena Barcia, Liz Silver, and Roy Weitz.

Contents

Preface for Instructors

Introduction: Thinking Critically, Challenging Cultural Myths	1
1	
Harmony at Home: The Myth of the Model Family	17
A Family Tree, Freedom from Want, and Freedom from Fear NORMAN ROCKWELL	21
The myth of the model family as visualized by America's most popular illustrator.	
Looking for Work GARY SOTO	26
"For weeks I had drunk Kool-Aid and watched morning reruns of <i>Father Knows Best</i> , whose family was so uncomplicated in its routine that I very much wanted to imitate it. The first step was to get my brother and sister to wear shoes at dinner."	
What We Really Miss About the 1950s Stephanie Coontz	31

"What most people really feel nostalgic about . . . is the belief that the 1950s provided a more family-friendly economic and social environment, an easier climate in which to keep kids on the straight and narrow, and above all, a greater feeling of hope for a family's long-term

future, especially for its young."

Aunt Ida Pieces a Quilt Melvin Dixon	48
"Francine say she gonna send this quilt to Washington like folks doing from all 'cross the country, so many good people gone. Babies, mothers, fathers and boys like our Junie "	
An Indian Story ROGER JACK	51
"Finally it got so I didn't worry as much about the folks at home. I would be out walking in the evening and know someone else's presence was with me."	
From Changing American Families	61

From Changing American Families JUDY ROOT AULETTE

"The stratification systems of class, race ethnicity, and gender constitute a major feature of the macro level of social organization in our society. They exist beyond the control of any individual and are so pervasive they sometimes become invisible."

Visual Portfolio		83
READING IMAGES OF AMERICA	N FAMILIES	

It Takes a Family: Conservatism and the Common Good 88 RICK SANTORUM

"In a society in which the liberal understanding of marriage becomes the law of the land, divorce would not only be the norm rather than the exception, but the institution of marriage would disappear altogether."

98

What Is Marriage? Evan Wolfson

"Exclusion from the freedom to marry unfairly punishes committed same-sex couples and their families by depriving them of critical assistance, security, and obligations in virtually every area of life, including, yes, even death and taxes."

Learning Power: The Myth of Education and Empowerment 113

From Report of the Massachusetts Board of Education, 1848 121 HORACE MANN

"Education, then, beyond all other devices of human origin, is the great equalizer of the conditions of men, — the balance-wheel of the social machinery."

Idiot Nation MICHAEL MOORE

132

"A nation that not only churns out illiterate students BUT GOES OUT OF ITS WAY TO REMAIN IGNORANT AND STUPID is a nation that should not be running the world — at least not until a majority of its citizens can locate Kosovo (or any other country it has bombed) on the map."

Against School JOHN TAYLOR GATTO

152

"School has done a pretty good job of turning our children into addicts, but it has done a spectacular job of turning our children into children."

"I Just Wanna Be Average" Mike Rose

161

". . . I was placed in the vocational track, a euphemism for the bottom level. Neither I nor my parents realized what this meant." $\,$

From Social Class and the Hidden Curriculum of Work 173 JEAN ANYON

". . . public schools in complex industrial societies like our own make available different types of educational experience and curriculum knowledge to students in different social classes."

Visual Portfolio

190

READING IMAGES OF EDUCATION AND EMPOWERMENT

193 The Achievement of Desire RICHARD RODRIGUEZ "For although I was a very good student, I was also a very bad student. I was a 'scholarship boy,' a certain kind of scholarship boy. Always successful, I was always unconfident." 206 Para Teresa INÉS HERNÁNDEZ-ÁVILA "... we were not only equal but superior to them. That was why I studied. If I could do it, we all could." 210 Learning to Read MALCOLM X "My homemade education gave me, with every additional book that I

219 The Roots of Debate in Education and the Hope of Dialogue DEBORAH TANNEN

read, a little more sensitivity to the deafness, dumbness, and blindness

that was afflicting the black race in America."

"Valuing attack as a sign of respect is part of the argument culture of academia — our conception of intellectual interchange as a metaphorical battle."

Still Separate, Still Unequal JONATHAN KOZOL

239

"'It is not fair that other kids have a garden and new things. But we don't have that.... I wish that this school was the most beautiful school in the whole why world.'"

3

Money and Success: The Myth of Individual Opportunity

264

259

From Ragged Dick HORATIO ALGER

> "'. . . Ragged Dick. You must drop that name, and think of yourself now as' — 'Richard Hunter, Esq.' said our hero, smiling. 'A young gentleman on the way to fame and fortune."

270 The Lesson TONI CADE BAMBARA "Equal chance to pursue happiness means an equal crack at the dough, don't it?" 278 Horatio Alger HARLON L. DALTON "... the Alger myth ... serves to maintain the racial pecking order. It does so by mentally bypassing the role of race in American society." The Black Avenger 285 KEN HAMBLIN "... I have lobbed a loud salvo by declaring myself the Black Avenger, standing tall to dispel the Myth of the Hobbled Black. I am standing up to put an end to the decades of liberal propaganda which deny that today opportunity exists for any American man or woman willing to pursue it." 294 Serving in Florida BARBARA EHRENREICH "I had gone into this venture in the spirit of science, to test a mathematical proposition, but somewhere along the line, in the tunnel vision imposed by long shifts and relentless concentration, it became a test of myself, and clearly I have failed." Class in America — 2003 307 GREGORY MANTSIOS "From cradle to grave, class standing has a significant impact on our chances for survival." Visual Portfolio 325 READING IMAGES OF INDIVIDUAL OPPORTUNITY Money 330 DANA GIOIA "Chock it up, fork it over, shell it out. Watch it burn holes through pockets." From Seven Floors Up 332 SHARON OLDS

"Suddenly I see that I have thought that it could not

happen to me, homelessness"