

Fortresses and Fairness

STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Edited by

Maria O'Sullivan and Dallal Stevens

B L O O M S B U R Y

States, the Law and Access to Refugee Protection

Fortresses and Fairness

Edited by Maria O'Sullivan and Dallal Stevens



PUBLISHING
OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2017

Hart Publishing An imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Hart Publishing Ltd Kemp House Chawley Park Cumnor Hill Oxford OX2 9PH UK

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc 50 Bedford Square London WC1B3DP UK

www.hartpub.co.uk www.bloomsbury.com

Published in North America (US and Canada) by Hart Publishing c/o International Specialized Book Services 920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300 Portland, OR 97213-3786 LISA

www.isbs.com

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published 2017

© Maria O'Sullivan and Dallal Stevens 2017

The Editors have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3) except where otherwise stated.

> All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union, http://eur-lex.europa.eu/, 1998-2017.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN: HB:

978-1-50990-128-9

ePDF:

978-1-50990-129-6

ePub:

978-1-50990-130-2

A catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Series: Studies in International Law, volume 65

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon Printed and bound in Great Britain by TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

STATES, THE LAW AND ACCESS TO REFUGEE PROTECTION

This timely volume seeks to examine two of the most pertinent current challenges faced by asylum seekers in gaining access to international refugee protection: first, the obstacles to physical access to territory and, second, the barriers to accessing a quality asylum procedure—which the editors have termed 'access to asylum justice'. To address these aims, the book brings together leading commentators from a range of backgrounds, including law, sociology and political science. It also includes contributions from NGO practitioners. This allows the collection to offer interdisciplinary analysis and to incorporate both theoretical and practical perspectives on questions of immense contemporary significance. While the examination offers a strong focus on European legal and policy developments, the book also addresses the issues in different regions (Europe, North America, the Middle East, Africa and Australia). Given the currency of the questions under debate, this book will be essential reading for all scholars in the field of asylum law.

Volume 65 in the series Studies in International Law

Studies in International Law

Recent titles in this series

Democratic Statehood in International Law: The Emergence of New States in Post-Cold War Practice

Jure Vidmar

International Law and the Construction of the Liberal Peace Russell Buchan

The OIC, the UN, and Counter-Terrorism Law-Making: Conflicting or Cooperative Legal Orders?

Katja Samuel

Statelessness: The Enigma of the International Community
William E Conklin

The Reception of Asylum Seekers under International Law: Between Sovereignty and Equality *Lieneke Slingenberg*

International Law and Child Soldiers

Gus Waschefort

The Contractual Nature of the Optional Clause
Gunnar Törber

Non-State Actors in International Law Edited by Math Noortmann, August Reinisch and Cedric Ryngaert

The Rule of Law at the National and International Levels: Contestations and Deference

Edited by Machiko Kanetake and André Nollkaemper

Human Rights Obligations of Non-State Armed Groups

Daragh Murray

Security and International Law Edited by Mary E Footer, Julia Schmidt and Nigel D White

Complicity and its Limits in the Law of International Responsibility Vladyslav Lanovoy

> Complicity in International Criminal Law Marina Aksenova

For the complete list of titles in this series, see 'Studies in International Law' link at www.hartpub.co.uk/books/series.asp

Preface

This book brings together a number of commissioned contributions by leading commentators in the field of asylum law, including a selection of the best papers presented at an international conference organised by Maria O'Sullivan and Susan Kneebone on refugee law and policy at the Monash Prato Centre in Italy in 2014 entitled 'Access to Asylum: Current Challenges and Future Directions'. The volume examines what we consider to be two of the most pertinent current challenges faced by asylum seekers in gaining access to international refugee protection: first, the obstacles to physical access to territory and, second, the barriers to accessing a fair and effective asylum procedure—which we have termed 'access to asylum justice'. In doing so, we have attempted to give readers a broad perspective on these issues. Thus, we chose contributors from a range of backgrounds, including academics from the fields of law, sociology and political science. We also sought the invaluable practical insight of nongovernmental organisation (NGO) practitioners. Furthermore, while there is analysis of European legal and policy developments, the book also addresses law and practice in different regions including South Africa, the Middle East (Lebanon), Australia and the United States (US). Within Europe, we have included practical insights from the important border states of Hungary, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Croatia.

Refugee law and policy is a fast-moving area of law. We have made every attempt to provide an up-to-date analysis of the issues. To that end, the book deals with recent jurisprudence and developments that have not yet been analysed to any significant extent in the literature, such as the new asylum legislation in Turkey (the Law on Foreigners and International Protection 2014); the decision of the UK Supreme Court on fast track procedures (*Detention Action v Secretary of State for the Home Department* 2014); the decision of the High Court of Australia on the applicability of procedural fairness to the detention of asylum seekers at sea (*CPCF v Minister for Immigration and Border Protection* 2015), and the fluctuating legal approach to asylum seekers in the Levant countries of the Middle East. The information contained herein is accurate as of 30 June 2016.

We take this opportunity to thank a number of people for their contribution. We are grateful to Hart Publishing for commissioning the book and to Hart editorial staff: Bill Asquith, Sinead Moloney and Emily Braggins for their valued work on the volume. We acknowledge the contributors for their excellent chapters in this book. Particular recognition is given to those working in small NGOs who devoted their personal time to this endeavour when, in some cases, confronting extremely difficult circumstances of increased migration to Europe in 2015–16. We also thank Susan Kneebone for her role in organising the conference, which was the spring-board to this volume, and Natalie Kyneswood, who worked closely with us for several months undertaking the final formatting and style guide checks. Her assistance was invaluable.

Finally, we express our gratitude to our institutions—Faculty of Law, Monash University and the School of Law, University of Warwick—for their ongoing support of our research and work in the areas of asylum and refugee law and policy.

Maria O'Sullivan Faculty of Law, Monash University Melbourne, Australia

Dallal Stevens School of Law, University of Warwick Coventry, United Kingdom July 2016

List of Editors and Contributors

The Editors

Dr Maria O'Sullivan is a Senior Lecturer in the Faculty of Law and an Associate of the Castan Centre for Human Rights Law at Monash University, Australia. She teaches Administrative Law, International Refugee Law and the Law of Armed Conflict. Prior to commencing her academic career, Maria worked as a Legal Adviser to the Australian Refugee Review Tribunal and is an Associate Member of the International Association for Refugee Law Judges. Her research focuses on a comparative analysis of Australian and European refugee law and practice. Maria's publications include 'The Ethics of Resettlement: Australia and the Asia-Pacific Region' (2016) 20(2) International Journal of Human Rights and 'Non-state Actors of Protection in Refugee law' (2012) 24(1) International Journal of Refugee Law. Her work has been cited by the High Court of Australia and in various reports of the Australian Parliament on refugee legislation. She is also a regular contributor to media commentary and community debate on asylum in Australia.

Dr Dallal Stevens is a Reader and Director of Research at the School of Law, University of Warwick. Her research interests focus on refugee and asylum law and policy. She has published numerous books, peer reviewed journal articles, book chapters and reports, including UK Asylum Law and Policy: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives (Sweet & Maxwell, 2004) and Refugee Protection and the Role of Law: Conflicting Identities (Routledge, 2014) edited with Susan Kneebone and Loretta Baldassar. Recently, she has been considering the impact of globalisation on asylum and her current research is concerned with the protection of refugees and forced migrants in the Middle East, and the movement of people across the Mediterranean to Europe. Stevens' work has been supported by external grants from the British Academy, the Arts and Humanities Research Board, and the ESRC. She has acted as an adviser to a number of national bodies, including the Home Office and Parliament and has served as a trustee for the former immigration law advisory agency in the UK—the Immigration Advisory Service—and for the Electronic Immigration Network. Stevens is on the editorial board of the Journal of Immigration, Asylum and Nationality Law and Law and Humanities.

The Contributors

Deborah Anker is Clinical Professor of Law and Director of the Harvard Law School Immigration and Refugee Clinical Program (HIRC). She has taught law students at Harvard for over 25 years. Author of a leading treatise, Law of Asylum in the United States, Anker has co-drafted ground-breaking gender asylum guidelines and amicus curiae briefs. Professor Anker is one of the most widely known asylum scholars and practitioners in the United States; she is cited frequently by international and domestic courts and tribunals, including the United States Supreme Court. Deborah Anker is a pioneer in the development of clinical legal education in the immigration field, training students in direct representation of refugees and creating a foundation for clinics at law schools around the country.

Sergio Carciotto has been the Director of the Scalabrini Institute for Human Mobility in Africa (SIHMA), a research centre based in Cape Town, since its establishment in April 2014. Sergio previously worked in South Africa for local NGOs and in Italy for the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. He holds an MA Degree in Development Studies from the University of the Western Cape in South Africa and an MA Degree in Refugee Rights and Migration Studies from La Sapienza University in Rome.

Nadine El-Enany is Senior Lecturer at Birkbeck School of Law, University of London, where she co-directs the Centre for Research on Law and Race. Nadine teaches and researches in the fields of migration law, European Union law and criminal justice. She has published widely in the field of EU asylum and immigration law. Her current research focuses on questions of race and criminal and social justice in migration, protest and death in custody cases. Nadine is Chair of the Runnymede Trust Emerging Scholars Race Forum. She has written for Media Diversified, the Guardian, London Review of Books, Truthout, Left Foot Forward and Critical Legal Thinking.

Nula Frei is working as a research associate at the Centre for Migration Law and the Swiss Centre of Expertise in Human Rights at the University of Bern, Switzerland. She has studied law and political science at the Universities of Bern, Fribourg, Zurich and Lille and is currently working on a PhD thesis on Identification and Protection of Victims of Human Trafficking in Asylum Procedures from a Human Rights Perspective.

Constantin Hruschka studied law, history and philosophy in Würzburg, Poitiers and Paris. Subsequently he worked as a scientific researcher at the Universities of Würzburg and Munich. After his bar exam in 2002, he also started working as a lawyer in Munich. Constantin is currently on special leave from the UNHCR where he worked as Associate Protection Officer

in the UNHCR Office in Nuremberg (2004-09) and thereafter as Legal Officer in the Office for Switzerland and Liechtenstein prior to joining the Policy Development and Evaluation Service (PDES) of UNHCR in Geneva (2013–14). Currently he works as the Head of the Protection department at the Swiss Refugee Council (OSAR) and is a Member of the Swiss Federal Commission on Migration (FCM). He is also a lecturer for European Law and European Asylum Law at the Universities of Fribourg (Switzerland) and Bielefeld (Germany).

Júlia Iván holds a Masters in Law and Political Sciences in 2006 at the Eötvös Lóránd University in Budapest. She worked at the Hungarian Helsinki Committee (HHC) for nine years (2007–16) as a legal officer in the refugee programme. She was in charge of co-ordinating the lawyers' network of the HHC, which deals with several hundreds of asylum applicants each year. As a co-ordinator she was responsible for providing strategic guidance and updates on international legal developments for practitioners. Her main areas of work were drafting human rights reports on Hungary, on access to protection in the UNHCR-funded border monitoring programme and the protection of unaccompanied minor refugees. Besides individual case management and project co-ordination she also regularly delivered training to border guards, lawyers and judges with the HHC. She continues to work as an independent legal expert and researcher on migration.

Corey R Johnson holds a BSc in Political Science from the University of Wyoming, an MA in International Policy from La Trobe University and an LLM in Human Rights Law from Monash University. He currently works in the Advocacy Programme at the Scalabrini Centre of Cape Town and has worked with refugees and migrants in Australia and South Africa.

Linda Kirk is the Deputy Director and Sub-Dean of the Migration Law Program at the ANU College of Law, Australian National University, and a Visiting Fellow of the Refugee Law Initiative, School of Advanced Study, University of London. She was a Senior Member of the Australian Migration Review Tribunal and the Refugee Review Tribunal from 2009-14. From 2002–08 she was a Senator for South Australia and the Deputy Chair of the Joint Standing Committee on Migration of the Australian Parliament. Linda was the Chair of the Australasian Chapter of the International Association of Refugee Law Judges (IARLJ) from October 2011 to July 2016, and is now a member of the Committee of the Asia-Pacific Chapter of the IARLJ. She is currently enrolled on the Doctor of Juridical Science degree at Monash University, and is writing her dissertation on consistency in refugee status determination.

Maggie Morgan is the Albert M Sacks Clinical & Advocacy Fellow at the Harvard Immigration and Refugee Clinic (HIRC). She previously worked as a Clinical Fellow in the Health Law & Policy Clinic at Harvard Law School and clerked for the Honourable Nanette K Laughrey of the Western District of Missouri. She is a 2011 graduate of Harvard Law School, where she was a clinical student in HIRC and the Human Rights Clinic and interned at several international organisations including Asylum Access in Tanzania and the Supreme Court of Rwanda. Before law school, she earned an MA in International Relations at the University of Chicago, conducted research on the plight of migrant labourers in Jalisco, Mexico, and taught in Korea and Spain. She earned her AB from Harvard College, specialising in Government.

Kris Pollet is a senior legal and policy officer at the European Council on Refugees and Exiles (ECRE); a pan-European network of 82 organisations assisting asylum seekers and refugees in 37 European countries. Before joining ECRE he worked as a legal officer at Amnesty International's EU Office and the Flemish Refugee Council and as a research assistant at the European Institute, Faculty of Law, University of Gent. He is currently coordinating ECRE's legal and policy work on the Common European Asylum System as well as with regard to the activities of EASO and Frontex.

Selma Porobić holds a double MD and a PhD degree in Migration Studies focusing on forced migration from Lund University, Sweden, and is a Director of Centre for Refugee and IDP studies at the Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina. She has over 10 years' academic experience in the field and has produced a number of papers, books and educational events focusing on refugee experiences, psychological impacts of forced migration, forced migration research methods and refugee protection. Her current research interests range from return migration to Bosnia and other post-conflict areas, to asylum and refugee integration policies and practices in the Western Balkans region.

Cavidan Soykan works in the Faculty of Political Science Human Rights Centre at Ankara University. She has completed a PhD in Sociology at the University of Essex and holds a Bachelor and a Master's degree in Politics from Ankara University as well as certificates in International Human Rights Law from the European University Institute and the International Institute of Human Rights. The focus of her doctoral research is on Turkey's asylum system, exploring how it works and how asylum applicants experience it. Through the in-depth interviews with asylum applicants mainly from Iran, Iraq, Afghanistan, Somalia and Sudan, her study aims to explore people's asylum trajectories and the lived experiences of asylum and migration law in Turkey.

Drago Župarić-Iljić holds an MA degree in Sociology and Social Anthropology from the Central European University in Budapest, Hungary. He is currently a PhD candidate in Sociology at the Faculty of Humanities and

Social Sciences, University of Zagreb (Croatia). He works at the Institute for Migration and Ethnic Studies in Zagreb as a junior research assistant. He has published articles, books and reports in the field of forced migration, asylum and refugee studies, as well as on the topics of ethno-national minorities and foreigners' integration policies and implemented practices in Croatia.

Abbreviations

AAT Administrative Appeal Tribunal (Australia)

AATA Administrative Appeals Tribunal Act 1975 (Australia)

AIDA Asylum Information Database

AITP Act on International and Temporary Protection (Croatia)

ANC African National Congress
BiH Bosnia and Herzegovina

CAT Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or

Degrading Treatment or Punishment

CBP Customs and Border Patrol (US)
CEAS Common European Asylum System

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination

Against Women

CJ Chief Justice

CJEU Court of Justice of the European Union

COI Country of Origin Information

CoE Council of Europe

CPT Council of Europe's Committee for the Prevention of Torture and

Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child CTRRO Cape Town Refugee Reception Office

DFT Detained Fast Track (UK)

DFID Department for International Development (UK)

DGMM Directorate General of Migration Management (Turkey)

DIBP Department of Immigration and Border Protection (Australia)

DNSA Detained Non-Suspensive Appeals (UK)

DPA Dayton Peace Accords

EASO European Asylum Support Office

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights
ECRE European Council on Refugees and Exiles

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EMN European Migration Network

xx Abbreviations

EPIM European Program for Integration and Migration

EU European Union

Ex Comm Executive Committee of the High Commissioner's Programme

FCC Federal Circuit Court (Australia)
FRA Fundamental Rights Agency
FTP Fast Track Procedure (Australia)

FTR Asylum and Immigration Tribunal Fast Track Procedure

Rules 2005 (UK)

FTT First Tier Tribunal (Immigration and Asylum Chamber) (UK)

GDP Gross Domestic Product
GPS Global Positioning System
HCA High Court of Australia

HHC Hungarian Helsinki Committee

IAA Immigration Assessment Authority (Australia)
IAAAS Immigration Advice and Application Assistance

Scheme (Australia)

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

IDP Internally Displaced Persons
ILO International Labour Office
IMF International Monetary Fund

IOM International Organisation for Migration

NAAU National Asylum Allocation Unit (UK)

NIA Nationality Immigration and Asylum Act 2002 (UK)

NGO Non-Governmental Organisation
MA Migration Act 1958 (Australia)

MHRR Ministry of Human Rights and Refugees (BiH)

MoI Ministry of Interior (Croatia)
MoS Ministry of Security (BiH)
MP Member of Parliament

MPA Maritime Powers Act 2013 (Australia)

MRD Migration and Refugee Division of the AAT (Australia)
MSAAA Movement and Stay of Aliens and Asylum Act (BiH)

OAU Organisation of African Unity

ODIHR Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (OSCE)

OFPRA L'Office français de protection des réfugiés et apatrides

OHCHR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

OIN Office of Immigration and Nationality (Hungary)

OSCE Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe

PAIG Protection Application Information and Guides (Australia)

PJCHR Parliamentary Joint Committee on Human Rights (Australia)

PSO Protection Screening Officer (US)

RMA Registered Migration Agent (Australia)
RRO Refugee Reception Offices (South Africa)
RRT Refugee Review Tribunal (Australia)

RRT Refugee Review Tribunal (Australia)
RRO Refugee Reception Offices (South Africa)

RSD Refugee Status Determination

RSDO Refugee Status Determination Officer (South Africa)

SCA Supreme Court of Appeal (South Africa)

SSHD Secretary of State for the Home Department (UK)

TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

TPC Tribunal Procedure Committee

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom

UMAs Unlawful Maritime Arrivals (Australia)
UNODC United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

US United States

USAID United States Agency for International Development

WB Western Balkans

Contents

	,			
	w.	itors and Contributors		
Ab	breviat	ions	xix	
		Part I: Conceptual Background		
1.	Access to Refugee Protection: Key Concepts and Contemporary			
	Chal	lenges	3	
	Marie	a O'Sullivan and Dallal Stevens		
	I.	Introduction		
	II.	Background: 'Asylum' and 'Refugee Protection'	5	
		A. Meaning of Asylum	7	
		B. Right to Seek Asylum	8	
		C. 'Refugee Protection'		
	III.	States, Access to Territory and the Law	10	
		A. 'The State' (or States) and 'Borders'		
		(i) Territory, Borders and the Law	10	
		(ii) State 'Responsibility'	16	
	IV.			
		Due Process Challenges	20	
		A. The Concept of Access to Justice	20	
		(i) State Interpretation and Implementation		
		of Due Process	22	
		(ii) Fair Hearing/Procedural Fairness		
		(iii) Legal Assistance		
		(iv) Fast Track/Accelerated Procedures		
		(v) Vulnerable Applicants		
	V.	Conclusion	27	
2.	Asvl	um in the Context of Immigration Control: Exclusion		
		Default or Design?	29	
		ne El-Enany		
	I.		29	
	II.	The Limits of the Refugee Convention		
	III.	The Impact of 'Fortress Europe' on Protection		
	IV.	The Migrant and the Refugee: A Costly Distinction		
	V.	Alan Kurdi: The Human Refugee		
	VI.	Conclusion: Racism, Exclusion and Blaming the Victim		

Part II: Access to Territory

3.		re Do State Responsibilities Begin and End? Border	
		usions and State Responsibility	47
	Júlia		
	I.	Introduction	
	II.	The Application of Human Rights Law to Borders	49
	III.	The Border Monitoring Experience in Hungary	
		2007–13: Difficulties in Accessing Protection	53
	IV.	The Change of Practice in 2013–14: Towards a More	
		Comprehensive Border Control Practice	57
	V.	Building a Physical and Legal Fence: Closure	
		of Hungary's Southern Borders	60
	VI.	Litigation and Follow-up of the Cases	
	* ***	of Removed Refugees and Migrants	
	VII.	Conclusions	66
4.	Acce	ss to International Protection: Border Issues in Turkey	69
	Cavio	dan Soykan	
	I.	Background and Context	
	II.	The Current Situation and the New Law	71
	III.	Access to Physical Territory: Problems	
		at the Turkish Borders	75
		A. Forced Returns and Illegal Removals:	
		Getting into Turkey from Iran	76
		B. Transiting Turkey: Push Backs and Detention	78
	IV.	Barriers to Accessing Asylum Justice: The Role of the	
		UNHCR in Turkey	
	V.	UNHCR'S Limited Access to Removal Centres	
	VI.	Conclusion	88
5.	Inter	rdiction and Screening of Asylum Seekers at	
		Implications for Asylum Justice	93
		a O'Sullivan	
	I.	Introduction	93
	II.	Relevant Legal Principles	95
		A. International Standards	95
		B. Regional Standards	
		C. Domestic Procedural Fairness Principles	98
	III.	Screening at Sea and Fairness—State Practice	100
		A. Introduction	
		B. Australian Interdiction and Screening at Sea	
		C. The High Court Decision in CPCF	
		D. Legislative Changes: 2014	108