

EDITED BY RICHARD SAUNDRY,
PAUL LATREILLE AND
IAN ASHMAN

REFRAMING RESOLUTION

Innovation and Change in the
Management of Workplace Conflict



Richard Saundry • Paul Latreille • Ian Ashman
Editors

Reframing Resolution

Innovation and Change in the Management
of Workplace Conflict

palgrave
macmillan

Editors

Richard Saundry
Plymouth Business School
Plymouth University
Plymouth, United Kingdom

Paul Latreille
Sheffield University Management School
Sheffield, United Kingdom

Ian Ashman
University of Central Lancashire
Lancashire Business School
Preston, United Kingdom

ISBN 978-1-137-51559-9

ISBN 978-1-137-51560-5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/978-1-137-51560-5

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016941471

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2016

The author(s) has/have asserted their right(s) to be identified as the author(s) of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Macmillan Publishers Ltd. London

Reframing Resolution

Acknowledgements

The editors would like to thank all the contributors for their work in compiling this volume and also Sir Brendan Barber for writing the foreword. We would also like to acknowledge the support of the Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service (Acas) in funding the empirical research which features in a number of Chapters. Furthermore we would like to acknowledge the funding of the Economic and Social Research Council for the seminar series 'Reframing Resolution – Managing Conflict and Resolving Individual Employment Disputes in the Contemporary Workplace' (Grant number: ES/J022276/1) which provided the foundation for this book.

Notes on Contributors

Ian Ashman is Director of the Institute for Research into Organisations, Work and Employment at the University of Central Lancashire. He has researched and published widely on various related subjects including downsizing, conflict, engagement, leadership and ethics. He is interested in the application of existentialism to these and similar topics.

Ariel Avgar is Associate Professor and Associate Dean at the School of Labor and Employment Relations at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. His research interests include organizational conflict management and dispute resolution and employment relations in the healthcare setting. He holds a PhD in Industrial Relations from the ILR School at Cornell University.

Greg Bamber is a Professor in the Department of Management, Monash University where he has served as: Director of Research & Discipline Leader: Human Resources & Employment Relations. He has more than a hundred academic publications, including in many refereed journals. He has also published numerous edited book chapters and several books.

Anthony Bennett is a freelance researcher and also a Director of RTB Consultancy. He formerly worked as Senior Lecturer in HRM at Sheffield Hallam University and the University of Central Lancashire. He is a practising mediator and has research interests in conflict management, equality and diversity, employee engagement and employee representation.

Virginia Branney is a part-time PhD student at the University of Central Lancashire. Since 1999, she has been an employment relations consultant and mediator. She is a member of the UK Employment Appeal Tribunal and also the Central Arbitration Committee. Prior to that, she was a national official for UNISON and the National Union of Public Employees.

Wonjoon Chung is a doctoral student in the School of Labor and Employment Relations, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. His research interests include conflict in organizations, conflict management, and dispute resolution.

Gill Dix is Head of Strategy at the Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service (Acas). She formerly held the role of Head of Research and Evaluation at Acas. Gill has a background in social and public policy research having worked in a number of public sector bodies, academia and the voluntary sector.

Liam Doherty is Managing Director of Ask HR Ltd, a private HR consultancy company and was formerly a Director of the Industrial Relations and Human Resources Division in IBEC, the national employers' organization in Ireland. He completed a PhD at The Queen's University, Belfast, which examined conflict management and dispute resolution systems in MNCs based in the Republic of Ireland.

John Forth is a principal research fellow and a member of the Employment Group at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research in London. His research is focused in three areas: the quality of employment relations; pay and rewards; and economic performance.

Jonny Gifford is CIPD Research Adviser for organizational behaviour. His interests include employee voice, social technology, workplace conflict and the application of behavioural science to HR. Previous research roles were at Roffey Park Institute and the Institute for Employment Studies.

Matthew Gould is a research fellow in the Centre for Employment Research at the University of Westminster, specializing in quantitative data analysis and mathematical models of behaviour. Matthew has worked on a variety of government commissioned projects and his work has been published in highly rated journals such as *Public Choice*.

Carol Jones is Principal Lecturer in Human Resource Management in the School of Management at the University of Central Lancashire, where she is also the Leader of the HRM Division. Her research interests include dispute

resolution, the workplace impact of domestic violence and the impact of domestic violence and the role of trade union representatives.

Ryan Lamare is an assistant professor in the School of Labor and Employment Relations at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. His research interests include: labor and employment arbitration; ADR in the securities industry; the development of ADR systems in organizations; the role of unions in politics; employment relations and HR at multinational companies; and quantitative research methods. He has published extensively on these issues and serves on the editorial board at *Human Resource Management Journal*.

Paul Latreille is Professor of Management and Associate Dean for Learning and Teaching at Sheffield University Management School. His research in applied labour economics and employment relations focuses on workplace conflict, mediation/ADR and Employment Tribunals. He has published extensively for academic and policymaker/practitioner audiences, and has completed numerous externally-commissioned projects.

David B. Lipsky is the Anne Evans Estabrook Professor of Dispute Resolution in the School of Industrial and Labor Relations, and Director of the Scheinman Institute on Conflict Resolution at Cornell University. He served as the national president of the Labor and Employment Relations Association (formerly the Industrial Relations Research Association) in 2006. In his research and teaching activities he primarily focuses on negotiation, conflict resolution, and collective bargaining. David Lipsky served as Dean of the School of Industrial and Labor Relations at Cornell from 1988 until 1997.

Louise McArdle is Principal Lecturer and Leader of the Strategy and Enterprise Division in the School of Management at the University of Central Lancashire. She is also a member of the Institute for Research into Organisations, Work and Employment and has previously published in the areas of workplace flexibility, TQM and Fair Trade.

Eric J. Neuman is Associate Professor of Management at the Heider College of Business at Creighton University and earned his PhD from the University of Michigan. In addition to research on intragroup conflict, he has studied deregulation, corporate political activity, corporate foundations, and social network methodologies

William Roche is Professor of Industrial Relations and Human Resources at the School of Business, University College Dublin and Honorary Professor at the Management School, Queen's University, Belfast. He has published extensively in

leading international peer-reviewed journals in industrial relations and human resource management. His recent books include *The Oxford Handbook of Conflict Management in Organizations*, Oxford University Press, 2014 (with Paul Teague and Alex Colvin).

Richard Saundry is Professor of HRM and Employment Relations at Plymouth University. His research interests are the management of workplace conflict and employee representation. He has published articles in a wide range of leading journals. He is a member of the editorial board of *Work, Employment and Society* and a Research and Policy Associate at Acas.

Paul Teague is Professor of Management at Queen's University, Belfast. He has written widely on the theme of the employment relations consequences of deeper European integration, social partnership and employment performance, workplace conflict management and human resources in the recession. He is co-editor with William Roche and Alex Colvin of *The Oxford Handbook of Conflict Management in Organizations*, which was published in 2014 by Oxford University Press.

Julian Teicher is Professor of Industrial Relations and the Director of Research in the Department of Management at Monash University and Director of the Australian Consortium for Research on Employment and Work. His research is in employment relations and public policy and management. He has published widely on topics including: conflict management, employee voice, privatisation, and e-governance.

Pete Thomas is a senior lecturer in the Department of Organisation Work and Technology at Lancaster University. His research interests centre on the place of discourse in organizations and applying Critical Discourse Analysis to investigate professionalization, mediation schemes and strategic management processes.

Peter Urwin is Director of the Centre for Employment Research, and Professor of Applied Economics at the University of Westminster. He has over 15 years' experience leading large-scale evaluations for government departments, including DWP, BIS, MoJ and MoD. Peter works in the areas of conflict resolution; education and employment economics; and equality and diversity.

Bernadine Van Gramberg is Professor and Dean of Swinburne Business School at Swinburne University of Technology. Bernadine's teaching, research and consulting are in the fields of workplace dispute resolution and public sector management.

Gemma Wibberley is a research associate at the Institute for Research into Organisations, Work and Employment, at the University of Central Lancashire. Her research interests include employees' experiences in the contemporary workplace, workplace conflict, and relationships with unions.

Abbreviations

Acas	Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service (UK)
ACCI	Australian Chamber of Commerce and Industry
ACTU	Australian Council of Trade Unions
ADR	Alternative Dispute Resolution
BCC	British Chambers of Commerce
BIS	Department of Business, Innovation and Skills (UK)
CBI	Confederation of British Industry
CDA	Critical Discourse Analysis
CIPD	Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development
CMS	Conflict Management Systems
CPR	International Institute for Conflict Prevention and Resolution (CPR)
EC	Early conciliation
EIRO	European Industrial Relations Observatory
ET	Employment Tribunal (UK)
FMCS	US Federal Mediation and Conciliation Service
FTW	Fair Treatment at Work Survey Service
FWC	Fair Work Commission (Australia)
HSE	Health Service Executive (Republic of Ireland)
ICMS	Integrated Conflict Management System
ILO	International Labour Organization
LRC	Labour Relations Commission (Republic of Ireland)
MNC	Multi-national corporation
NHCT	National Health Service (UK)

xvi Abbreviations

NHS	National Health Service (UK)
PCC	Pre-claim Conciliation
PCT	Primary Care Trust
SACCMA	South African Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration
SIPTU	Services, Industrial, Professional and Technical Union (Republic of Ireland)
STUC	Scottish Trades Union Congress
TEEU	Technical, Electrical & Engineering Union (Republic of Ireland)
TUC	Trades Union Congress (UK)
WERS	Workplace Employment Relations Study

List of Figures

3.1	Working days lost to stoppages, 1989–2013	37
3.2	Employment Tribunal claims, 1990/1991–2014/2015	41
3.3	Employment Tribunal receipts by jurisdiction, 2003/2004–2012/2013	43
8.1	A model of employee downsizing	152
12.1	Case load by matter type: Fair Work Commission	240
12.2	Changes and innovations introduced by the FWC for self-represented litigants	243
15.1	Attitudes towards mediation	330

List of Tables

3.1	Industrial action by sector of ownership, 2004 and 2011	40
3.2	Individual workplace disputes by sector of ownership, 2004 and 2011	46
3.3	The climate of employment relations, 1998, 2004 and 2010	47
3.4	Employees' evaluations of managers, 2004 and 2010	50
3.5	Workplace dispute resolution procedures, 2004 and 2010	51
4.1	Binomial logit, modelling characteristics associated with reporting of 'isolated dispute or incident of conflict'	62
4.2	Binomial logit, modelling characteristics associated with reporting of 'ongoing difficult relationship'	64
4.3	Binomial logit, modelling characteristics associated with reporting of whether [most serious] dispute	66
4.4	Binomial logit, modelling characteristics associated with reporting of whether a dispute is associated with 'Most Serious' category of impacts	68
4.5	Binomial logit, modelling characteristics associated with formal or informal resolution	71
6.1	Breakdown of sample	110
7.1	Characteristics of case study organizations	134
12.1	Anti-bullying claim applications to the Fair Work Commission 2013–2014	253
15.1	Perceived workplace conflict culture	331
16.1	ADR workplace resolution procedures	345

16.2	The formality of conflict management systems in non-union multinationals	348
16.3	Conflict management techniques and procedures in non-union multinationals	349
16.4	Primary motivations for introducing a particular form of conflict management system	350
16.5	Employees, representation and conflict management systems in organizations	351
16.6	Informal problem solving and dispute resolution in processes	351

Contents

1	Introduction	1
	Ian Ashman, Paul Latreille, and Richard Saundry	
Part I	Surveying the Terrain	11
2	Conceptualizing Workplace Conflict and Conflict Management	13
	Richard Saundry	
3	Exploring the Nature and Extent of Workplace Conflict	35
	John Forth and Gill Dix	
4	Workplace Conflict: Who, Where, When, and Why?	57
	Jonny Gifford, Matthew Gould, Paul Latreille, and Peter Urwin	

5	Social Structure and Conflict: A Relational Approach to the Study of Conflict and Its Management in Organizations	79
	Ariel C. Avgar, Eric J. Neuman, and Wonjoon Chung	
Part II	Managing Conflict on the Front-line	103
6	A Crisis of Confidence? Front-line Managers and the Complexities of Conflict	105
	Carol Jones and Richard Saundry	
7	From Representation Gap to Resolution Gap: Exploring the Role of Employee Voice in Conflict Management	127
	Gemma Wibberley and Richard Saundry	
8	Downsizing: Managing Redundancy and Restructuring	149
	Ian Ashman	
Part III	Workplace Mediation and Alternative Dispute Resolution	169
9	Experiencing Mediation from the Disputants' Perspective	171
	Anthony Bennett	
10	Workplace Mediation and UK Trade Unions: The Missing Link?	191
	Virginia Branney	
11	Turning Third-Party Intervention on Its Head: Assisted Bargaining and the Prevention of Workplace Conflict in Ireland	215
	William K. Roche	

12	Reshaping the Role of the Tribunal as Third Party in Australian Workplace Conflict Resolution	237
	Bernadine Van Gramberg, Julian Teicher and Greg Bamber	
13	Workplace Mediation Schemes: Antagonism and Articulation in the Discursive Process of Organizational Conflict and Disputes	265
	Louise McArdle and Pete Thomas	
	Part IV New Perspectives on Conflict Management	289
14	The Evolution of Conflict Management Policies in US Corporations: From Reactive to Strategic	291
	David B. Lipsky, Ariel C. Avgar, and J. Ryan Lamare	
15	Transforming the Culture of Conflict Management: Lessons from In-House Mediation	315
	Paul Latreille and Richard Saundry	
16	HRM, Organizational Citizenship Behaviour and Conflict Management: The Case of Non-union MNC Subsidiaries in Ireland	339
	Liam Doherty and Paul Teague	
	Erratum to: Reframing Resolution	E1
	Conclusion: The Future of Conflict Management and Resolution	363
	Index	369