

Editors Patrick Rebuschat,
Detmar Meurers,
and Tony McEnery

CURRENTS IN LANGUAGE LEARNING SERIES

Series Editor Nick C. Ellis

Language acquisition occupies a central place in the study of human cognition, and research on how we learn language can be found across many disciplines, from developmental psychology and linguistics to education, philosophy and neuroscience. The investigation of a complex phenomenon like language acquisition naturally requires insights, tools, and methods from many disciplines, yet it is still relatively rare to find studies that combine multiple approaches. This volume brings together leading researchers in cognitive psychology, corpus research, developmental psychology, linguistics, and natural language processing to discuss opportunities and challenges of combining multiple approaches to language learning. The peer-reviewed chapters in this volume are written in an accessible and engaging fashion. Together, they provide the reader with a panorama of the exciting research currently being conducted at the intersection of experimental, computational and corpus-based approaches to language learning.

"This issue contains insightful state-of-the-art reviews and offers a great overview of the issues learner corpus and SLA research are facing, an absolute must-read for everyone in these and neighboring fields."

-Stefan Th. Gries, University of California, Santa Barbara

"A timely contribution on the roles that experimental, corpus-based and computational approaches play in our understanding of language learning, bringing together both conceptual overviews and empirical evidence."

-Florence Myles, University of Essex

PATRICK REBUSCHAT is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Linguistics and English Language at Lancaster University and Distinguished International Professor at the LEAD Graduate School and Research Network, University of Tübingen. His work explores the cognitive and neural basis of language, with a particular focus on implicit learning, statistical learning, bilingualism and second language acquisition.

DETMAR MEURERS is Professor of Computational Linguistics at the University of Tübingen. His work explores the use and relevance of explicit linguistic modeling and computational linguistic methods in a range of contexts.

TONY McENERY is Distinguished Professor of English Language and Linguistics at Lancaster University and former Director of the ESRC Centre for Corpus Approaches to Social Science. He undertakes research using corpus linguistics in a range of areas across theoretical and applied linguistics. He is currently serving as Research Director at the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC).





omputationa. HEEDING. TANDED. and and

E CENTOR PED DIO ased Approaches

Currents in Language Learning Series Series Editor: Nick C. Ellis

Currents in Language Learning is a biennial book series published by Wiley and the Language Learning Research Club at the University of Michigan. It provides programmatic state-of-the-art overviews of current issues in the language sciences and their applications in first, second, and bi/multilingual language acquisition in naturalistic and tutored contexts. It brings together disciplinary perspectives from linguistics, psychology, education, anthropology, sociology, cognitive science, and neuroscience.

In this series:

Agendas for Language Learning Research edited by Lourdes Ortega, Alister Cumming, and Nick C. Ellis

Improving and Extending Quantitative Reasoning in Second Language Research edited by John M. Norris, Steven J. Ross, and Rob Schoonen

Experimental, Computational, and Corpus-Based Approaches to Language Learning: Evidence and Interpretation edited by Patrick Rebuschat, Detmar Meurers, and Tony McEnery

Experimental, Computational, and Corpus-Based Approaches to Language Learning: Evidence and Interpretation

Patrick Rebuschat, Detmar Meurers, and Tony McEnery, Editors

WILEY

© 2017 Language Learning Research Club, University of Michigan

Registered Office

John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, United Kingdom

Editorial Offices

101 Station Landing, Medford, MA 02155, USA 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK

The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The right of Patrick Rebuschat, Detmar Meurers and Tony McEnery to be identified as the authors of the editorial material in this work has been asserted in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book. This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Cataloging in Publication data has been applied for, and is available at the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-1-119-43261-6

Set in 10/13 pt TimesNRPS by Aptara Printed in the U.S.A. by The Sheridan Group

01-2017

Experimental, Computational, and Corpus-Based Approaches to Language Learning: Evidence and Interpretation

Contents

Foreword5
Patrick Rebuschat, Detmar Meurers, and Tony McEnery Language Learning Research at the Intersection of Experimental, Computational, and Corpus-Based Approaches
Padraic Monaghan and Caroline F. Rowland Combining Language Corpora With Experimental and Computational Approaches for Language Acquisition Research
Nick C. Ellis Cognition, Corpora, and Computing: Triangulating Research in Usage-Based Language Learning
Detmar Meurers and Markus Dickinson Evidence and Interpretation in Language Learning Research: Opportunities for Collaboration With Computational Linguistics
Anke Lüdeling, Hagen Hirschmann, and Anna Shadrova Linguistic Models, Acquisition Theories, and Learner Corpora: Morphological Productivity in SLA Research Exemplified by Complex Verbs in German
Dana Gablasova, Vaclav Brezina, and Tony McEnery Exploring Learner Language Through Corpora: Comparing and Interpreting Corpus Frequency Information
Dana Gablasova, Vaclav Brezina, and Tony McEnery Collocations in Corpus-Based Language Learning Research: Identifying, Comparing, and Interpreting the Evidence 155–179

Theodora Alexopoulou, Marije Michel, Akira Murakami, and Detmar Meurers	
Task Effects on Linguistic Complexity and Accuracy: A Large-Scale Learner Corpus Analysis Employing Natural Language Processing Techniques	180–208
Nicole Ziegler, Detmar Meurers, Patrick Rebuschat, Simón Ruiz, José L. Moreno-Vega, Maria Chinkina, Wenjing Li, and Sarah Grey Interdisciplinary Research at the Intersection of CALL, NLP, and SLA: Methodological Implications From an Input Enhancement Project	209–231
Katrin Wisniewski Empirical Learner Language and the Levels of the Common European Framework of Reference	232–253
Brian MacWhinney A Shared Platform for Studying Second Language Acquisition	254–275
Index	. 276–287

Foreword

Currents in Language Learning provides programmatic state-of-the-art overviews of current issues in the language sciences and their application in first, second, and bi/multilingual language acquisition in naturalistic and tutored contexts. It brings together disciplinary perspectives from linguistics, psychology, education, anthropology, sociology, cognitive science, and neuroscience.

The investigation of a complex phenomenon like language acquisition naturally requires insights, tools, and methods from many disciplines, yet it is still relatively rare to find studies that combine multiple approaches. This third volume in the Currents in Language Learning Series brings together leading researchers in cognitive psychology, corpus research, developmental psychology, linguistics, and natural language processing to discuss opportunities and challenges of combining these multiple approaches to language learning. Language Learning and the ESRC Centre for Corpus Approaches to Social Science sponsored a Currents in Language Learning Roundtable proposed by Patrick Rebuschat, Detmar Meurers, and Tony McEnery on the topic Connecting data and theory: Corpora and second language research held at the University of Lancaster, UK in July, 2015 at the Corpus Linguistics 2015 conference. The participants then teamed up to produce state-of-the-art overviews of the new directions, as well as drawing out more general implications for collaborative research at the intersection of experimental, computational and corpus-based approaches to language learning. Subsequent internal and external reviews resulted in these clear and cutting-edge syntheses.

> Nick C. Ellis University of Michigan Editor, *Currents in Language Learning Series*

Language Learning Research at the Intersection of Experimental, Computational, and Corpus-Based Approaches

Patrick Rebuschat, a,b Detmar Meurers, b,c and Tony McEnerya,d

^aDepartment of Linguistics and English Language, Lancaster University, ^bLEAD Graduate School & Research Network, University of Tübingen, ^cSeminar für Sprachwissenschaft, University of Tübingen, and ^dEconomic and Social Research Council, Centre for Corpus Approaches to Social Science

Keywords psycholinguistics; corpus linguistics; computational linguistics; natural language processing; first language acquisition; second language acquisition; multimethod approaches; interdisciplinary research

Language acquisition occupies a central place in the study of human cognition, and research on how we learn language can be found across many disciplines, from developmental psychology and linguistics to education, philosophy, and neuroscience. It is a very challenging topic to investigate given that the learning target in first and second language acquisition is highly complex, and part of the challenge consists in identifying how different domains of language are acquired to form a fully functioning system of usage (Ellis, 2017). Correspondingly, the evidence about language use and language learning is generally shaped by many factors, including the characteristics of the task in which the language is produced (Alexopoulou, Michel, Murakami, & Meurers, 2017).

Our research was supported by the Economic and Social Research Council, UK (grant ES/K002155/1) and by the LEAD Graduate School & Research Network (grant DFG-GSC1028), a project of the Excellence Initiative of the German federal and state governments.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Patrick Rebuschat, Department of Linguistics and English Language, Lancaster University, Lancaster LA1 4YL, United Kingdom. E-mail: p.rebuschat@lancaster.ac.uk

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

The challenge is further complicated by the fact that language acquisition is affected by individual learner characteristics. Individual differences are particularly well studied for second language acquisition, where it is clear that factors such as native language, type of instruction, and motivation affect learning rate and ultimate attainment (Ushioda & Dörnyei, 2012; Williams, 2012). But recent research indicates that there is also considerable individual variation in child language development (see Rowland, 2013). To develop an understanding of language acquisition, we need to take into account these individual differences (MacWhinney, 2017).

Despite these and other challenges, the past decades have witnessed significant progress in our understanding of how children and adults learn languages. The conceptual and empirical progress arguably is fueled by an increasing range of methods and approaches that are being used to study language acquisition (see Hoff, 2011; Mackey & Gass, 2012). For example, experimental approaches using artificial or natural languages have made it possible to investigate how changes across exposure conditions such as input frequency, instruction type, or prior knowledge affect learning in rigorously controlled environments. Learner corpora are growing in size and task types covered, with increasingly rich annotation supporting detailed analyses employing sophisticated statistical methods. Digital learning environments integrating computational methods hold the promise of supporting the systematic exploration of learning mechanisms in authentic teaching and learning, providing new sources of evidence on the roles played by the linguistic environment, interaction, and feedback in learning. The investigation of a complex phenomenon like language acquisition can significantly benefit from insights, tools, and methods from many disciplines, yet it is still relatively rare to find studies that combine multiple approaches.

The research described in Monaghan and Mattock (2012), Ellis, Römer, and O'Donnell (2016), and Christiansen and Chater (2016) transparently illustrates the potential of multimethod approaches to language. For example, Monaghan and Mattock's (2012) investigation of word learning is an excellent illustration of how corpus research can connect with experimental research. Monaghan and Mattock first conducted corpus analyses of child-directed speech. They then used the information derived from these analyses to construct an artificial language that is based on natural language statistics. On this basis, they investigated the acquisition of nouns and verbs by adult learners in an artificial language experiment. While artificial language research is occasionally criticized for its limited ecological validity, the use of distributional information from natural language corpora in the artificial language construction mitigates some of this criticism (see also Monaghan & Rowland, 2017). Another

impressive example of multimethod research is Ellis et al. (2016), who investigate the acquisition, processing, and use of verb-argument constructions (VACs), and their monograph contains a series of behavioral experiments, large-scale corpus analyses supported by natural language processing (NLP) techniques, and several computational simulations (connectionist and agent based). The result of this systematic multimethod exploration is a significant, in-depth understanding of how we learn, process, and use VACs—and a research model for others to follow suit. Finally, Christiansen and Chater's (2016) theoretical framework for understanding language acquisition, evolution, and processing is the direct result of multimethod research and would not be possible without the insights the authors gained from working at the intersection of experimental, computational, and corpus-based approaches for more than two decades.

The question of how to promote multidisciplinary research across methodological boundaries has been central to the work of the three editors of this volume. A series of review articles aiming to connect research areas and introduce methodologies exemplify this (e.g., Meurers, 2012, 2015; Meurers & Dickinson, 2017; Rebuschat, 2013). One of the editors, Tony McEnery, directs the ESRC Centre for Corpus Approaches to Social Sciences (CASS, http://cass.lancs.ac.uk) at Lancaster University, whose primary objective is to enable colleagues in other, nonlinguistic disciplines to utilize the corpus approach. The two other editors are part of Tübingen's unique LEAD Graduate School & Research Network, which brings together over 130 scientists from education, psychology, linguistics, neuroscience, informatics, sociology, and economics to investigate learning and educational achievement. The LEAD initiative includes an interdisciplinary research and training program for doctoral students and postdocs, which is funded by Germany's Excellence Initiative. In the same spirit, we have enjoyed organizing numerous symposia, workshops, summer schools, and conferences, and we have edited several books and special journal issues with the specific aim of bringing together leading researchers from different disciplines whose paths would normally not cross (e.g., Andringa & Rebuschat, 2015; Meurers, 2009; Rebuschat, 2015; Rebuschat, Rohrmeier, Hawkins, & Cross, 2012; Rebuschat & Williams, 2012). This special issue is part of this ongoing effort.

This Special Issue

This special issue was inspired by a symposium on "Connecting Data and Theory: Corpora and Second Language Research," which was organized by the editors and took place in Lancaster, UK, on July 19, 2015. The symposium was jointly funded by the Language Learning Roundtable Grant Program and

by CASS. The objective was to establish a dialogue between experts on second language acquisition, corpora, and computational analysis methods. This dialogue can significantly enrich the empirical basis of second language research but, to date, collaborations across these fields are still rare. The symposium aimed at directly addressing this shortcoming. There were three sessions, each approaching the symposium topic from a distinct research area. Nick Ellis and Brian MacWhinney provided the view from cognitive psychology, Detmar Meurers and Markus Dickinson the view from computational linguistics, and Anke Lüdeling and Sylviane Granger the view from corpus linguistics. The symposium concluded with a general discussion.

The discussion and feedback were both very positive and lively, and when the opportunity arose to produce a special issue on "Currents in Language Learning," we readily agreed to do so. Five presentations of the symposium provided the basis for four expanded and updated articles (Ellis; Lüdeling et al.; MacWhinney; Meurers & Dickinson). Additional chapters were written by colleagues who attended the symposium and made thoughtful contributions (Alexopoulou et al.; Gablasova et al; Monaghan & Rowland; Ziegler et al.). Based on the symposium discussions, we decided to expand the scope for the special issue in two areas. We solicited an article that would contribute a language testing angle (Wisniewski) and broadened the topic to language learning in general, given the long and fruitful tradition of using corpora, NLP tools, and computational modeling in child language research.

As a result, the third issue of the "Currents in Language Learning" series brings together leading researchers in cognitive psychology, computational linguistics, corpus linguistics, developmental psychology, and linguistics. Our contributors were asked to (i) discuss recent work and trends, (ii) outline opportunities and challenges of combining multiple approaches, and (iii) propose directions for future research at the intersection of experimental, computational, and corpus-based approaches to language learning. Each submission was peer reviewed by several anonymous reviewers and by the editors.

In the first article, Padraic Monaghan and Caroline Rowland describe the challenges of combining experimental, computational, and corpus approaches to research in child language acquisition. Their article clearly articulates the benefits of multidisciplinary approaches by providing three examples for a successful combination of methods (grammatical category acquisition, morphological development, and the acquisition of sentence structure). On this basis, they conclude with a discussion of future directions. In the second article, Nick Ellis approaches the topic from the perspective of usage-based linguistics. Ellis clearly illustrates the essential contributions made by experimental,

computational, and corpus-based research to the establishment of usage-based theories of language (see also Ellis, Römer, & O'Donnell, 2016). In the next article, Detmar Meurers and Markus Dickinson provide a comprehensive review of how computational linguistics and NLP techniques can contribute to our understanding of second language learning. They focus on two contributions: First, computational linguistics can enrich the options for obtaining substantial amounts of data for language learning research, including data obtained via intelligent computer-assisted language learning (ICALL) interfaces (see also Ziegler et al., 2017). Second, NLP techniques can support the identification and interpretation of data of relevance to second language research via automatic linguistic annotation of large-scale corpora—which they argue requires more cross-disciplinary discussion to operationalize relevant learner language distinctions and develop annotation schemes that are adequate to support second language research.

The next three articles focus on essential methodological considerations arising from corpus-based language learning research. Anke Lüdeling, Hagen Hirschmann, and Anna Shadrova illustrate how learner corpus data can be used to investigate acquisition patterns by concentrating on second language morphological productivity as a test case. They raise methodological points regarding linguistic modeling, the formation of target hypotheses, and error annotation. Dana Gablasova, Vaclav Brezina, and Tony McEnery focus on collocations in language learning research. The interest in formulaic language has been growing in both first and second language research, and there is now a considerable number of experimental and corpus-based studies in this area (e.g., Christiansen & Arnon, in press). Gablasova et al. critically review measures of association that are frequently used to identify collocations (t score, MI score, Log Dice) and discuss how a better understanding of these measures greatly facilitates the interpretation of trends in language production data. In the sixth article, the same authors focus on the role of corpus-based frequency information for advancing our understanding of how languages are learned. They illustrate the issues involved in the interpretation and comparison of corpus frequencies by contrasting several first and second language corpora.

The next two articles provide concrete examples of the benefits of working at the intersection of experimental, computational, and corpus-based approaches to language learning. Dora Alexopoulou, Marije Michel, Akira Murakami, and Detmar Meurers test hypotheses derived from instructed second language acquisition research and task-based language teaching by applying techniques from computational linguistics to a very large learner corpus. They analyze the texts in the EF-Cambridge Open Language Database

(https://corpus.mml.cam.ac.uk/efcamdat), a learner corpus that contains over 70,000,000 words collected through an online language learning platform. Their article demonstrates how large corpora and NLP techniques can contribute to contemporary language learning research by complementing experimental evidence. Nicole Ziegler, Detmar Meurers, Patrick Rebuschat, Simón Ruiz, José L. Moreno-Vega, Maria Chinkina, Wenjing Li, and Sarah Grey combine theoretical and methodological insights from second language acquisition, NLP, and ICALL research to investigate the effectiveness of input enhancement in promoting second language development. Their study is experimental, but data are collected via a Web-based ICALL system (WERTi, http://purl.org/icall/werti) that provides computerized pedagogical treatment of learner-selected texts and automatically tracks and collects learners' action and engagement with the input. This results in a particularly rich data set, beyond what is typically available via traditional experimental approaches.

In the next article, Katrin Wisniewski provides a conceptual review of how learner corpora can contribute to language testing research, emphasizing the importance of empirical scale validity. Wisniewski focuses on the Common European Framework of Reference, the most common European reference tool to describe levels of foreign language proficiency, and explicitly works out the opportunities and challenges of working across disciplinary and methodological boundaries. The issue concludes with an important call for the construction of a shared platform to study second language acquisition. Brian MacWhinney argues that further advancement of second language acquisition theory and practice requires a combination of experimental data, a better understanding of how individual differences impact learning, and corpus data that permit the investigation of acquisition patterns. The proposed platform would facilitate this by enabling the collection of substantial amounts of learner data online and by establishing a common protocol on how to share the data—in line with the Child Language Data Exchange System, the central repository for child language data that contributed greatly to our understanding of how children learn language (see Monaghan & Rowland, 2017). The success of such an approach rests on researchers across the world sharing data and agreeing on common protocols for adding and retrieving data.

Acknowledgements

The special issue, and the symposium on which it was based, would not have been possible without the essential support and contributions of many colleagues. We are grateful to our symposium presenters and delegates for making it such a successful event, and we thank our authors for submitting

excellent manuscripts for this special issue. We are indebted to the anonymous peer reviewers, who thoroughly assessed the texts and provided very valuable feedback, especially on how to make the contributions accessible and relevant across disciplines. At *Language Learning*, we are particularly grateful to Nick Ellis (General Editor) and Pavel Trofimovich (Journal Editor) for their sustained support throughout this project, and to Izzat Ibrahim for his friendly assistance in the production of this special issue. At Lancaster and Tübingen, we are very grateful to Lisa Becker and Abi Hawtin for their help in copyediting the volume and to Katarina Pardula for her support in organizing the symposium. Finally, we would like to gratefully acknowledge the financial support of the ESRC Centre for Corpus Approaches to Social Science and Language Learning's Roundtable Grant Program, without which neither the symposium nor the special issue would have been possible.

Note

1 For more information on the LEAD Graduate School & Research Network, please see http://www.lead.uni-tuebingen.de

References

- Alexopoulou, T., Michel, M., Murakami, A., & Meurers, D. (2017). Task effects on linguistic complexity and accuracy: A large-scale learner corpus analysis employing natural language processing techniques. *Language Learning*, 67(S1), 181–209.
- Andringa, S., & Rebuschat, P. (Eds.). (2015). New directions in the study of implicit and explicit learning [Special issue]. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, *37*, 185–196.
- Christiansen, M. H., & Arnon, I. (in press). More than words: The role of multiword sequences in language learning and use [Special issue]. *Topics in Cognitive Science*.
- Christiansen, M. H., & Chater, N. (2016). *Creating language: Integrating evolution, acquisition, and processing.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Ellis, N. C. (2017). Cognition, corpora, and computing: Triangulating research in usage-based language learning. *Language Learning*, 67(S1), 41–66.
- Ellis, N. C., Römer, U., & O'Donnell, M. B. (2016). *Usage-based approaches to language acquisition and processing: Cognitive and corpus investigations of construction grammar*. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Hoff, E. (Ed.). (2011). Research methods in child language: A practical guide. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Mackey, A., & Gass, S. M. (2012). Research methods in second language acquisition: A practical guide. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell
- MacWhinney, B. (2017). A shared platform for studying second language acquisition. *Language Learning*, 67(S1), 255–276.

- Meurers, D. (Ed.). (2009). On the automatic analysis of learner language [Special issue]. *CALICO Journal*, 26(3), 469–473.
- Meurers, D. (2012). Natural language processing and language learning. In C. A. Chapelle (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Applied Linguistics* (pp. 4193–4205). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Meurers, D. (2015). Learner corpora and natural language processing. In S. Granger, G. Gilquin, & F. Meunier (Eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of learner corpus research* (pp. 537–566). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Meurers, D., & Dickinson, M. (2017). Evidence and interpretation in language learning research: Opportunities for collaboration with computational linguistics. *Language Learning*, 67(S1), 67–96.
- Monaghan, P., & Mattock, K. (2012). Integrating constraints for learning word-referent mappings. *Cognition*, 123, 133–143. doi:10.1016/j.cognition.2011.12.010
- Monaghan, P., & Rowland, C. (2017). Combining language corpora with experimental and computational approaches for language acquisition research. *Language Learning*, 67(S1), 15–40.
- Rebuschat, P. (2013). Measuring implicit and explicit knowledge in second language research. *Language Learning*, 63, 595–626.
- Rebuschat, P. (Ed.). (2015). *Implicit and explicit learning of languages*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Rebuschat, P., Rohrmeier, M., Hawkins, J. H., & Cross, I. (Eds.). (2012). *Language and music as cognitive systems*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Rebuschat, P., & Williams, J. N. (Eds.). (2012). *Statistical learning and language acquisition*. Berlin, Germany: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Rowland, C. (2013). Understanding child language acquisition. London: Routledge.
- Ushioda, E., & Dörnyei, Z. (2012). Motivation. In S. Gass & A. Mackey (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of second language acquisition* (pp. 396–409). New York: Routledge.
- Williams, J. N. (2012). Working memory. In S. Gass & A. Mackey (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of second language acquisition* (pp. 427–441). New York: Routledge.
- Wisniewski, K. (2017). Empirical learner language and the levels of the Common European Framework of Reference Language. *Learning*, 67(S1), 233–254.
- Ziegler, N., Meurers, D., Rebuschat, P., Ruiz, S., Moreno-Vega, J. L., Chinkina, M., et al. (2017). Interdisciplinary research at the intersection of CALL, NLP, and SLA: Methodological implications from an input enhancement project. *Language Learning*, 67(S1), 210–232.