



A Nuclear Strategy for India

**Rear Admiral
Raja Menon**

A Nuclear Strategy for India

江苏工业学院图书馆
藏书章

A Nuclear Strategy for India

Rear Admiral
Raja Menon




Sage Publications
New Delhi/Thousand Oaks/London

Copyright © United Service Institution of India, New Delhi, 2000

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or utilised in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

First published in 2000 by

Sage Publications India Pvt Ltd
M-32 Market, Greater Kailash, Part I
New Delhi 110 048

Sage Publications Inc.		Sage Publications Ltd.
2455 Teller Road		6 Bonhill Street
Thousand Oaks, California 91320		London EC2A 4PU

Published by Tejeshwar Singh for Sage Publications India Pvt Ltd, lasertypeset by Asian Telelinks, New Delhi and printed at Chaman Enterprises, Delhi.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data **available**

ISBN: 0-7619-9450-5 (US-Hb)
0-7619-9461-0 (US-Pb)

81-7036-930-4 (India-Hb)
81-7036-937-1 (India-Pb)

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	10
<i>List of Figures</i>	11
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	13
<i>Preface</i>	19
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	22
 1. International Relations and India's Geopolitical Environment	 23
The Idealism in Indian Foreign Policy	23
Freud vs Marx	26
The Status Quo Power and the Revisionist Power	27
Politics and Military Power	29
Coercive Nuclear Diplomacy	32
The Clausewitzian Divide	35
 2. The Western Narrative: Western Nuclear Theology	 41
Nuclear Diplomacy	41
Early Strategy	44
Deterrence	46
NSC-68	46
Arsenals	47
Massive Retaliation and the New Look	48
Strategic Vulnerability	49
The McNamara Years	49
The SIOP, Counter-force and Assured Destruction	52

Targeting Policy	54
McNamara's Legacy	54
Tactical Nuclear Weapons	55
Sufficiency and Finite Targeting	56
Flexible Targeting and Counter-force II	57
PD-59 and Countervailing Strategy	57
National Security Decision Directive No. 12 (NSSD-12)	59
The Soviet Strategy	60
The INF Controversy	60
The Irresistible Pull of Technology	62
The Lessons for Nuclear Strategy	63
 3. The Indian Narrative	 66
Homi Bhabha	66
The Tata Institute of Fundamental Research and Indian Rare Earths Limited	67
India, the USSR and China: The Early Years	68
The Beginnings of Rivalry	70
The End of Idealism	73
Take a Horse to Water	75
Alterations of Course with Sarabhai	77
A Fork in the Road	83
Pokhran I	85
The Late Fee for Strategic Delays	87
The Subcontinental Straw	89
A Second Chance	92
Diplomacy First, Strategy Second	94
The Chinese Accelerate	95
Brasstacks	98
Thrashing About in the Bushes	100
The Dangers of Nuclear Ambiguity	102
Doing Nothing is Doing Something	104
The Military Shoot Themselves in the Foot – Again	107
The CTBT Imbroglio	108
Losing the Way	111
Leading to Pokhran II	113

4. Pure Strategy and Technology	122
The Attractions of Technology	122
Nuclear Warheads	124
The Effects of Nuclear Weapons	124
The Technology of Missile Accuracy	128
Nuclear Weapons Development	136
Yield, Blast and Multiple Warheads	138
The Tripwire Strategy and First Use	140
The Future of Nuclear Weapons	142
Pure Strategy	145
<i>Deterrence by Punishment</i>	146
<i>Deterrence by Denial</i>	146
<i>Arsenals Related to Deterrence</i>	148
<i>Rationality</i>	151
<i>Perception</i>	152
<i>Defensive Avoidance</i>	154
Graduating to Nuclear Strategy	155
<i>The Weakness of Massive Retaliation</i>	156
<i>Flexible Targeting</i>	158
<i>Brinkmanship</i>	161
<i>Counter-force, First Strike and Stability</i>	163
<i>First Strike and Second Strike</i>	164
<i>The Unbreakable Merit of a Second Strike</i>	167
<i>The Dangers of Secretiveness</i>	167
<i>Counter-force and Flexible Response</i>	168
<i>Conventional War and Flexible Response</i>	169
<i>Non-weaponised Deterrence or Recessed Deterrence</i>	171
5. The Indian Arsenal	177
The Sino-Indian Political Scenario	177
The Old Chinese Arsenal	180
The New Chinese Arsenal	183
The Chinese Arsenal and India	186
The India-China Net Level of Expectation	190

The Indo-Pak Nuclear Calculus	192
The Merits and Demerits of Pakistan's Nuclear Logic	194
The Pakistan Arsenal	198
Reducing the Height of the Hill – Nuclear CBMs in South Asia	201
Indian Technological Levels	206
<i>Fissile Material</i>	207
<i>The Indian Missile Force</i>	209
<i>Missile Accuracy</i>	215
<i>Warhead Design</i>	217
Strategic Surveillance and the Degrading of Deterrence	218
The Mobile Launcher versus Silo Argument	220
The Submarine Launched Ballistic Missile Force for India	224
The Indian Nuclear Submarine	226
The Indian Missile Force	227
The Land-based Missile Force	228
The India-Pakistan Scenario, Flexible Response and the Cruise Missile	230
 6. The Command and Control System	 235
The Creation of Deterrence	241
Transiting from Conventional War to Deterrence	242
Managing the Conventional War, Centrally	245
Planning the Use of Nuclear Weapons	247
<i>The Chiefs of Staff Committee's 'Country' Targeting List</i>	248
<i>Nuclear Staff Requirements (NSRs)</i>	249
The Alerting System and Deterrence	252
Decapitation	254
Unwarranted or Accidental Nuclear Occurrence	256
The Serviceability and Safety of Nuclear Weapons	259
Separating Ownership from Control	261
The Indian Early Warning System	261
Early Warning Over the Sea	264

Satellite Surveillance and Early Warning	266
The National Command Authority	269
Delegation of Authority	271
The National Command Post	271
Communications	272
The ICBM Launch Control Net	278
The SLBM Launch Control Net	279
The Hot Line	281
 7. The Indian Nuclear Strategy and the International Environment	 284
American Political Views	284
The Sanctions	288
The CTBT and the Future	290
The United States, Bus Diplomacy and Nuclear Restraint	292
Lowering the Height of the Hill	296
The Future of Nuclear Weapons Use – The Superpowers	297
The European Arsenals	300
The Influence of International Agencies	301
The Future	303
Postscript	306
 <i>Index</i>	 309
<i>About the Author</i>	316

List of Tables

2.1	Distribution of Warheads, USA–USSR, 1981	59
2.2	Nuclear Warheads in Europe	61
4.1	Static Pressures and Wind Velocity	126
4.2	Effect of Range on Blast	127
4.3	Growth in Accuracy of Missiles	133
4.4	Yield-to-Weight Ratios of Nuclear Warheads	136
5.1	The Old Chinese Nuclear Arsenal	181
5.2	The Chinese Nuclear Arsenal by 2015	182
5.3	Table of Lethal Radii of Chinese Weapons	187
5.4	Probability of Destruction of Indian Silos by Chinese First Strike	188
5.5	Pakistan's Core Arsenal	200
5.6	Additional Forces That Could be Fielded by Pakistan	201
5.7	A List of CBMs Agreed to at the Lahore Talks	202
5.8	A Progression of Efficiencies of US Missiles (1963–1986)	212
5.9	A Comparison of the Volume, Weight, Range and Payload of Contemporary US and Soviet SLBMs	215
5.10	A Staff Requirement of the Indian Land-based Missile and Warhead Programme	230
6.1	DEFCON Table for India	253
6.2	Prevention of Nuclear Accidents or Unwarranted Weapons Use	258

List of Figures

2.1	The Competing Growth of Warheads	63
4.1	Effects of Nuclear Weapons on Cities	125
4.2	Blast Radii to Yield: The Trend Towards Optimum Warheads	139
4.3	A Sample Graph for the Equation of State of Plutonium	143
4.4	Three Instances of the Theory of Payoffs: The Basis of Deterrence Theory	149
4.5	The Fallacy of Massive Retaliation in Situations of Escalating Aggression	157
4.6	The Logic of Flexible Response: Getting Out of Massive Retaliation	159
4.7	Escalatory Moves with Flexible Response	160
4.8	First Strike with Second Strike	165
4.9	Conventional War Escalating to Flexible Response	170
5.1	The Pakistan Scenario Leading to the Nuclear Threshold	196
5.2	Line Drawing of Some Indian and US Rockets	211
5.3	The Rail Garrison Concept	229
6.1	Documentation and Rules Writing Group—Nuclear Affairs (Pune)	240
6.2	Transiting from Conventional to Nuclear War	247
6.3	Matching Targets to the Arsenal and the Nuclear Weapons System	251
6.4	The Analysis and Presentation of Intelligence	255
6.5	The Nuclear Weapons Inspectorate (Mumbai)	260

6.6	The Indian Early Warning System	265
6.7	Peninsula Radar Coverage	267
6.8	The Hierarchy and Division of the NCA into NCP and ANCP	270
6.9	Broad Layout and Organisation of NCP	273
6.10	High Capacity Satellite Imagery, LAN, Fibre Optic Primary, Microwave Secondary	275
6.11	Watch Officers Net—Manned at DEFCON 4 and Above: Civil Telephone Primary, Extended 'C' Band DTS Secondary	277
6.12	War-fighting and Early Warning Information (WAN) with Video Conferencing, Fibre Optic Primary, Cable Secondary	278
6.13	Launch Control Net (ICBM's) Fibre Optic Primary, HF Radio Secondary, DTS Tertiary ('C' Band, INMARSAT, DTS Telephone)	280
6.14	Launch Control Net (SLBMs), NCP to Transmitters—Fibre Optic Primary, DTS ('C' Band or INMARSAT) Secondary. Transmitters to Submarine ELF, VLF, HF Radio	281

List of Abbreviations

ABM – Anti-ballistic Missile
ACDA – Arms Control and Disarmament Agency
AD – Assured Destruction (M- Mutual)
AEC – Atomic Energy Commission
AEE – Atomic Energy Establishment
AHF – Advanced Hydrotest Facility
ALCM – Air Launched Cruise Missile
ANUCO – Anurag Co-processor
APC – Armoured Personnel Carrier
ARF – Asian Regional Forum
ASCI – Accelerated Strategic Computing Initiative
ASEAN – Association of South East Asian Nations
ASLV – Advanced Satellite Launch Vehicle
ASQR – Air Staff Quantitative Requirements
ASW – Anti-submarine Warfare
ASWAC – Airborne Warning and Control System (India)
AWACS – Airborne Warning and Control System (USA)
BARC – Bhabha Atomic Research Centre
BMD – Ballistic Missile Defence
BNSP – Basic National Security Policy
C3I – Command, Control, Communication and Intelligence
CAVTS – Combined Acceleration and Vibration Testing System
CBM – Confidence Building Measures
CBW – Chemical and Biological Warfare
CENTO – Central Treaty Organisation
CEO – Chief Executive Officer
CEP – Constant Error Probability

CIA – Central Intelligence Agency (USA)
 CIRUS – Canada, India, US Reactor
 CJCS – Chairman, Joint Chiefs of Staff (USA)
 CORA – A Swiss engineering company
 COSC – Chiefs of Staff Committee (India)
 CPI – Communist Party of India
 CPWD – Central Public Works Department
 Cray – Name of the Inventor of the CRAY Computer
 CSIR – Council for Scientific and Industrial Research
 CSS – Nato Designation for Chinese DF Rockets
 CTBT – Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty
 CWC – Chemical Warfare Convention
 DAE – Department of Atomic Energy
 DARHT – Dual Axis Radiographic Hydrodynamic Test Facility
 DEFCON – Defence Condition
 DEW – Distant Early Warning
 DGMO – Director General Military Operations
 DGS&D – Director General, Supplies and Development
 DIPAC – Defence Image Processing and Analysis Centre
 DOD – Department of Defence
 DPRK – Democratic Peoples' Republic of Korea
 DRDO – Defence Research and Development Organisation
 ECM – Electronic Counter Measures
 ELF – Extremely Low Frequency
 EMP – Electro-magnetic Pulse
 EU – European Union
 FBR – Fast Breeder Reactor
 FBTR – Fast Breeder Test Reactor
 FMCT – Fissile Material Cut-off Treaty
 FMT – Fissile Material Treaty
 FR – Flexible Response
 GDP – Gross Domestic Product
 GHQ – General Headquarters
 GLCM – Ground Launched Cruise Missile
 GLONAS – Global Navigation System
 GSLV – Geo-stationery Satellite Launch Vehicle
 GNP – Gross National Product

GPS – Global Positioning System
GSQR – General Staff Quantitative Requirement (army subcontinent)
GZ – Ground Zero
HE – High Explosive
HF – High Frequency
HNS – Host Nation Support
HOB – Height of Burst
HTPB – Hydroxyl Terminated Polybutadienne
IAC – Indian Airlines Corporation
IAEA – International Atomic Energy Agency
IAF – Indian Air Force
IBL – International Boundary Line
ICBM – Inter-continental Ballistic Missile
IDA – International Development Authority
IDSA – Institute of Defence Studies and Analysis (India)
IEWs – Indian Early Warning System
IGCAR – Indira Gandhi Centre for Atomic Research
IGMDP – Integrated Guided Missile Development Plan (India)
IISS – International Institute of Strategic Studies (UK)
IMET – International Military Education and Training (US sponsored)
IMF – International Monetary Fund
INCOSPAR – Indian National Committee for Space Research
INF – Intermediate Nuclear Forces
INSAT – Indian Satellite
INTCORCOM – Intelligence Coordination Committee
IPKF – Indian Peace Keeping Force
IRBM – Intermediate Range Ballistic Missile
IREL – Indian Rare Earths Limited
ISI – Inter-services Intelligence
J&K – Jammu & Kashmir
JCS – Joint Chiefs of Staff (USA)
JIC – Joint Intelligence Committee (India)
JL 2 – Julang 2: A Chinese missile
JSOP – Joint Strategic Operational Plan
JSTPS – Joint Strategic Target Planning Staff
KHz – Kilohertz
KMPH – Kilometres per Hour

kPa – Kilo Pascal
 KT – Kiloton
 LAC – Line of Actual Control (subcontinent)
 LAN – Local Area Network
 LCA – Light Combat Aircraft (India)
 LCC – Launch Control Centre
 LOC – Line of Control
 MAPS – Multiple Point Aiming System
 MBT – Main Battle Tank
 MEA – Ministry of External Affairs
 MFN – Most-favoured Nation
 MFT – Missile Flight Time
 MHz – Megahertz
 MIRV – Multiple Independently Targeted Re-entry Vehicle
 MM I/II – Minuteman I/II
 MOD – Ministry of Defence
 MPH – Miles per hour
 MR – Maritime Reconnaissance
 MRV – Multiple Re-entry Vehicle
 MT – Megaton
 MTBF – Mean Time Between Failures
 MTCR – Missile Technology Control Require
 MW – Megawatt
 MX – Missile (x)
 NAL – National Aeronautics Laboratory
 NATO – North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
 NCA – National Command Authority
 NCP – National Command Post
 NM – Nautical Miles
 NNWS – Non-nuclear Weapons States
 NPT – Non-proliferation Treaty
 NSA – National Security Agency
 NSC-68 – National Security Council (Document No. 68)
 NSD – National Security Document
 NSDD – National Security Decision Directive
 NSR – Naval Staff Requirements
 NTS – Nevada Test Site