

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

*HARPER
ESTREICHER
GRIFFITH*

LABOR LAW
**Cases, Materials,
and Problems**

*Eighth
Edition*



Wolters Kluwer

Labor Law

Cases, Materials, and Problems

Eighth Edition

Michael C. Harper

*Professor of Law and Barreca Labor Relations Scholar
Boston University*

Samuel Estreicher

*Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law
New York University*

Kati Griffith

*Associate Professor of Labor and Employment Law
Cornell University*



Wolters Kluwer

Copyright © 2015 Michael C. Harper, Samuel Estreicher, and Kati Griffith.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.wolterskluwerlb.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.wolterskluwerlb.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-4943-8

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Harper, Michael C., 1948- author.

Labor law : cases, materials, and problems/Michael C. Harper, Professor of Law and Barreca Labor Relations Scholar, Boston University; Samuel Estreicher, Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law New York University; Kati Griffith, Associate Professor of Labor and Employment Law, Cornell University. —8th ed.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4548-4943-8 (alk. paper)

I. Estreicher, Samuel, author. II. Griffith, Kati, author. III. Title.

KF3369.H348 2014

344.7301 —dc23

2014043928

Labor Law

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
Raymond Pryke Professor of First Amendment Law
University of California, Irvine School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Senior Lecturer in Law
The University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Maurice A. Deane School of Law at Hofstra University

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Professor of Law
Stanford Law School

About Wolters Kluwer Law & Business

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business is a leading global provider of intelligent information and digital solutions for legal and business professionals in key specialty areas, and respected educational resources for professors and law students. Wolters Kluwer Law & Business connects legal and business professionals as well as those in the education market with timely, specialized authoritative content and information-enabled solutions to support success through productivity, accuracy and mobility.

Serving customers worldwide, Wolters Kluwer Law & Business products include those under the Aspen Publishers, CCH, Kluwer Law International, Loislaw, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs family of products.

CCH products have been a trusted resource since 1913, and are highly regarded resources for legal, securities, antitrust and trade regulation, government contracting, banking, pension, payroll, employment and labor, and healthcare reimbursement and compliance professionals.

Aspen Publishers products provide essential information to attorneys, business professionals and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, the product line offers analytical and practical information in a range of specialty practice areas from securities law and intellectual property to mergers and acquisitions and pension/benefits. Aspen's trusted legal education resources provide professors and students with high-quality, up-to-date and effective resources for successful instruction and study in all areas of the law.

Kluwer Law International products provide the global business community with reliable international legal information in English. Legal practitioners, corporate counsel and business executives around the world rely on Kluwer Law journals, looseleafs, books, and electronic products for comprehensive information in many areas of international legal practice.

Loislaw is a comprehensive online legal research product providing legal content to law firm practitioners of various specializations. Loislaw provides attorneys with the ability to quickly and efficiently find the necessary legal information they need, when and where they need it, by facilitating access to primary law as well as state-specific law, records, forms and treatises.

ftwilliam.com offers employee benefits professionals the highest quality plan documents (retirement, welfare and non-qualified) and government forms (5500/PBGC, 1099 and IRS) software at highly competitive prices.

MediRegs products provide integrated health care compliance content and software solutions for professionals in healthcare, higher education and life sciences, including professionals in accounting, law and consulting.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business, a division of Wolters Kluwer, is headquartered in New York. Wolters Kluwer is a market-leading global information services company focused on professionals.

For Robert and Dorothea Harper, in loving appreciation

M.C.H.

For Chuna David Estreicher (December 4, 1917-January 19, 2003)

וְתִלְמוּד תּוֹרָה כְּנֶגֶד כָּלֶם.

("And the study of Torah is the foundation of all.")

S.E.

For Jack and Joyce Griffith

K.L.G.

Preface

We have revised and updated our basic text in labor law to take account of developments since the publication of the seventh edition. With the help of our new coauthor, Professor Kati Griffith of the Cornell University School of Industrial and Labor Relations, we have added two new chapters – one on immigration and labor law and the other on cross-border issues in labor law.

Michael C. Harper
Samuel Estreicher
Kati L. Griffith

September 2014

Acknowledgments

We appreciate the permission of the following publishers, authors, and periodicals to reprint excerpts from their publications:

- George W. Brooks, *The Strengths and Weaknesses of Compulsory Unionism*, 11 *New York University Review of Law and Social Change* 32 (1982-1983). Reprinted by permission of the New York University Review of Law and Social Change. New York, N.Y.
- Archibald Cox, *Labor Decisions of the Supreme Court at the October Term, 1957*, 44 *Virginia Law Review* 1051 (1958). Reprinted by permission of The Virginia Law Review Association, Charlottesville, Va. and Fred B. Rothman & Company, Littleton, Colo.
- Samuel Estreicher, *Collective Bargaining or "Collective Begging"?: Reflections on Antistrikebreaker Legislation*, 93 *Michigan Law Review* 577 (1994). Reprinted by permission of The Michigan Law Review Association, Ann Arbor, Mich.
- Samuel Estreicher, *Deregulating Union Democracy*, 21 *Journal of Labor Research* 247 (2000), reprinted in *The Internal Governance and Organizational Effectiveness of Labor Unions*, ch. 17 (Estreicher et al. eds., 2001). Reprinted by permission of the Journal of Labor Research, George Mason University, Fairfax, Va.
- Samuel Estreicher, *Policy Oscillation at the Labor Board*, 37 *Administrative Law Review* 176 (1985). Reprinted by permission of the American Bar Association, Chicago, Ill.
- Samuel Estreicher, *Win-Win Labor Law Reform*, 10 *The Labor Lawyer* 674 (1994). Reprinted by permission of the American Bar Association, Chicago, Ill.
- William Forbath, *Law and the Shaping of the American Labor Movement*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. Copyright © 1989 by the Harvard Law Review Association. Copyright © 1991 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College. Reprinted by permission of Harvard University Press.
- Mayer G. Freed et al., *Unions, Fairness, and the Conundrums of Collective Choice*, 56 *Southern California Law Review* 461 (1983). Reprinted with the permission of the Southern California Law Review, Los Angeles, Cal.
- Michael C. Harper, *The Consumer's Emerging Right to Boycott: NAACP v. Claiborne Hardware and Its Implications for American Labor Law*, 93 *Yale Law Journal* 409 (1984). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal

- Company, New Haven, Conn. and Fred B. Rothman & Company, Littleton, Colo.
- Michael C. Harper, *Leveling the Road from Borg-Warner to First National Maintenance: The Scope of Mandatory Bargaining*, 68 *Virginia Law Review* 1447 (1982). Reprinted by permission of The Virginia Law Review Association, Charlottesville, Va. and Fred B. Rothman & Company, Littleton, Colo.
- Michael C. Harper, *Limiting Section 301 Preemption: Three Cheers for the Trilogy, Only One for Lingle and Lueck*, 66 *Chicago-Kent Law Review* 685 (1990). Copyright © 1992. Reprinted by special permission of the Chicago-Kent College of Law, Illinois Institute of Technology.
- Michael C. Harper, *Union Waiver of Employee Rights*, 4 *Industrial Relations Law Journal* 335 (1981). Copyright © 1981 by Industrial Relations Law Journal. Reprinted by permission.
- Michael C. Harper & Ira Lupu, *Fair Representation as Equal Protection*, 98 *Harvard Law Review* 1212 (1985). Copyright © 1985 by the Harvard Law Review Association, Cambridge, Mass. Reprinted by permission.
- Bruce Kaufman & Jorge Martinez-Vasquez, *Monopoly, Efficient Contract and Median Voter Models of Union Wage Determination: A Critical Comparison*, 11 *Journal of Labor Research* 401 (1990). Reprinted by permission of the Journal of Labor Research, George Mason University, Fairfax, Va.
- Douglas L. Leslie, *Right to Control: A Study in Secondary Boycotts and Labor Antitrust*, 89 *Harvard Law Review* 904 (1976). Copyright © 1976 by the Harvard Law Review Association, Cambridge, Mass. Reprinted by permission.
- Howard Lesnick, *The Gravamen of the Secondary Boycott*. Article originally appeared at 62 *Columbia Law Review* 1363 (1962). Reprinted by permission of the author, Professor Howard Lesnick at the University of Pennsylvania Law School, Philadelphia, Pa.
- Mancur Olson, *The Logic of Collective Action: Public Goods and the Theory of Groups*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. Copyright © 1965 and 1971 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College. Reprinted by permission of Harvard University Press.
- Paul C. Weiler, *Governing the Workplace: The Future of Labor and Employment Law*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. Copyright © 1990 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College. Reprinted by permission of Harvard University Press.
- Paul C. Weiler, *Promises to Keep: Securing Workers' Rights to Self-Organization Under the NLRA*, 96 *Harvard Law Review* 1769 (1983). Copyright © 1983 by the Harvard Law Review Association. Reprinted by permission of the Harvard Law Review Association, Cambridge, Ma. and Professor Paul Weiler at the Harvard Law School, Cambridge, Mass.

Labor Law

Summary of Contents

<i>Contents</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxxi</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxxiii</i>
CHAPTER 1. The Historical and Institutional Framework	1
CHAPTER 2. The Jurisdiction, Structure, and Procedure of the NLRB	67
CHAPTER 3. Protection of Concerted Activity	115
CHAPTER 4. NLRB Determination of Bargaining Authority	231
CHAPTER 5. Obtaining Bargaining Authority Outside of the NLRB Election Process	355
CHAPTER 6. Regulation of the Process of Collective Bargaining	397
CHAPTER 7. Weapons of Economic Conflict: Strikes, Boycotts, and Picketing	521
CHAPTER 8. The Enforcement of Collective Bargaining Agreements	649
CHAPTER 9. Problems of Business Transformation	749
CHAPTER 10. Labor and the Antitrust Laws	791
CHAPTER 11. Preemption of State Authority	829
CHAPTER 12. Limited Sovereignty: The Relationship Between Employee and Bargaining Agent	895
CHAPTER 13. Regulation of Union Government and Administration	983
CHAPTER 14. Labor Law and Immigration	1051
CHAPTER 15. Cross-Border Labor Law	1077
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>1113</i>
<i>Table of Authorities</i>	<i>1135</i>
<i>Index</i>	<i>1153</i>

Contents

Preface

xxxi

Acknowledgments

xxxiii

1 The Historical and Institutional Framework 1

A. The Common Law	1
1. The Evolution of Labor Organizations	1
2. Judicial Response to Labor Disputes	5
a. Criminal Conspiracy	5
<i>Philadelphia Cordwainers</i>	
<i>(Commonwealth v. Pullis)</i>	5
<i>Commonwealth v. Hunt</i>	7
Notes and Questions	8
b. The Labor Injunction	10
<i>Vegeahn v. Guntner</i>	10
Notes and Questions	14
3. Judicial Response to Protective Labor Legislation	18
<i>Lochner v. New York</i>	18
Notes and Questions	20
B. The Antitrust Laws	22
Note: Union Growth and Industrial Strife in the 1890s and the Early Twentieth Century	22
1. The Sherman Act	23
Note: <i>Loewe v. Lawlor</i> (The “Danbury Hatters” Case)	23
2. The Clayton Act	25
Note: The Origins of the Labor Exemption	25
<i>Duplex Printing Press Co. v. Deering</i>	26

	Notes and Questions	31
	Note: Labor Organization and the Management of Work from World War I Through the 1920s	33
C.	The Norris-LaGuardia Act and Reexamination of the Antitrust Laws: Mandating Government Neutrality in Labor Disputes	35
1.	The Norris-LaGuardia Act of 1932	35
a.	The "Labor Injunction"	35
b.	Modern Applications of the Norris-LaGuardia Act	37
2.	Reexamination of the Antitrust Laws	38
	<i>Apex Hosiery Co. v. Leader</i>	38
	<i>United States v. Hutcheson</i>	42
	Notes and Questions	45
D.	Modern Labor Legislation: Affirmative Protection of Collective Representation	47
1.	The Railway Labor Act (RLA)	47
2.	The National Labor Relations Act (NLRA)	49
a.	The Original NLRA: The Wagner Act of 1935	49
i.	The Origins of the Wagner Act	49
	<i>NLRB v. Jones & Laughlin Steel Corp.</i>	52
ii.	Labor Organization During the New Deal Period	53
iii.	The Purposes of the Wagner Act	55
iv.	The Orientation of the Wagner Act	56
b.	The Taft-Hartley Act of 1947	57
i.	Labor Organization and the Administration of the NLRA from 1935 to 1947	57
ii.	The Taft-Hartley Amendments	58
c.	The Landrum-Griffin Act of 1959	60
i.	Labor Organization from 1947 to 1959	60
ii.	The Landrum-Griffin Act	60
d.	The 1974 Health Care Industry Amendments	61
e.	The Proposed Labor Reform Act of 1977, the Proposed Employee Free Choice Act, and Other Failed Legislative Bids	61
	Note: The Sharp Decline in Private Sector Unionism	62
2	The Jurisdiction, Structure, and Procedure of the NLRB	67
A.	A Brief Overview of NLRB Structure and Procedure	67
1.	The Board	67

2. The General Counsel	68
3. Unfair Labor Practice and Representation Proceedings	69
a. Unfair Labor Practice Proceedings	69
b. Representation Proceedings	70
4. Rulemaking Versus Adjudication	70
a. The Procedures Contrasted	70
b. NLRB Preference for Adjudication over Rulemaking	71
c. The NLRB's Recent Experience with Rulemaking	72
5. Delay at the NLRB	73
B. Scope of Review of NLRB Determinations	74
1. "Substantial Evidence" Review	74
2. Review of Questions of "Law" or "Policy"	75
C. Jurisdiction	76
1. The Commerce Requirement and Other Limitations on NLRB Jurisdiction	76
a. The Commerce Clause and the Board's Jurisdictional Self-Limitations	76
b. The Implied Religious Exemption: Avoiding First Amendment Issues	77
2. Statutory Exclusions	78
a. Independent Contractors	79
Note: <i>NLRB v. Hearst</i> and Congress' Reaction	79
<i>NLRB v. United Insurance Co.</i>	80
<i>Roadway Package System, Inc.</i>	82
Notes and Questions	85
b. Supervisory, Managerial, and Confidential Personnel	87
<i>NLRB v. Bell Aerospace Co.</i>	87
Notes and Questions	91
Note: The Tension Between Coverage of Professional Employees and Exclusion of Supervisors and Managers	95
<i>NLRB v. Kentucky River Community Care, Inc.</i>	97
Notes and Questions	103
Note: The Board's 2006 Rulings on Supervisory Status	104
Notes and Questions	106
c. Students/Trainees as Employees?	109
i. Medical Interns and Residents	109
ii. Graduate Teaching Assistants	109
Notes and Questions	111

3 | Protection of Concerted Activity 115

A.	The Concepts of Discrimination and of Interference, Restraint, or Coercion	115
1.	Violations Based on Employer (or Union) Motivation	115
	<i>Edward G. Budd Manufacturing Co. v. NLRB</i>	116
	Notes and Questions	118
	<i>NLRB v. Transportation Management Corp.</i>	119
	Notes and Questions	122
	Note: NLRA Remedies in Discharge and Failure to Hire Cases	124
2.	Violations Based on Impact of Employer (or Union) Actions	127
	<i>Radio Officers' Union v. NLRB</i>	127
	Notes and Questions	130
	<i>Republic Aviation Corp. v. NLRB</i>	131
	Notes and Questions	136
	Note: Restrictions on Workplace Solicitation and Distribution	137
B.	The Accommodation of §7 Rights and Employer Interests	143
1.	Interest in Maintaining Production and Discipline	143
2.	Interest in Excluding Non-Invitees: Employer Property Rights	143
	Note: <i>NLRB v. Babcock & Wilcox Co.</i>	143
	<i>Lechmere, Inc. v. NLRB</i>	144
	Notes and Questions	149
	Note: <i>NLRB v. Town & Country Electric, Inc.</i> and Paid Union Organizers as Protected Employees	154
	Notes and Questions	155
3.	Interest in Entrepreneurial Discretion	157
	<i>NLRB v. J.M. Lassing</i>	157
	Notes and Questions	159
	<i>Textile Workers Union v. Darlington Manufacturing Co.</i>	161
	Notes and Questions	166
C.	The Scope of Protected Employee Activity	169
1.	"Protected" Concerted Activity: Means Test	170
	<i>NLRB v. Washington Aluminum Co.</i>	170
	Note: Categorical Limitations on the Means Employed	173
	Notes and Questions	175
	<i>NLRB v. Local 1229, IBEW (Jefferson Standard)</i>	177

	Notes and Questions	180
2.	“Protected” Concerted Activity: Purpose or Object Test	183
	<i>Eastex, Inc. v. NLRB</i>	183
	Notes and Questions	188
3.	Individual Employee Action as “Concerted” Activity	192
	<i>NLRB v. City Disposal System, Inc.</i>	193
	Notes and Questions	198
	<i>NLRB v. J. Weingarten, Inc.</i>	202
	Notes and Questions	205
	Note: <i>Weingarten</i> Rights in the Nonunion Setting?	208
	Notes and Questions	209
D.	Union Waivers of Employee Rights to Engage in Protected Activity	210
	<i>NLRB v. Magnavox Co. of Tennessee</i>	210
	Notes and Questions	212
	<i>Metropolitan Edison Co. v. NLRB</i>	214
	Notes and Questions	217
E.	Employer “Support” or “Domination” of a “Labor Organization”	219
	<i>Crown Cork & Seal Co.</i>	220
	Notes and Questions	224
	Note: Amending §8(a)(2)?	230

4 | **NLRB Determination of Bargaining Authority** 231

A.	Obtaining Representative Status Through the NLRB’s Election Procedure	232
1.	Question Concerning Representation	232
2.	Appropriate Bargaining Units	233
a.	NLRB Unit Determinations	233
i.	Rulemaking vs. Adjudication	234
	<i>American Hospital Ass’n v. NLRB</i>	234
	Notes and Questions	238
ii.	Standards for An Appropriate Unit	240
	<i>Friendly Ice Cream Corp. v. NLRB</i>	240
	Notes and Questions	243
iii.	Craft vs. Industrial Units	247
iv.	Accretion	249
v.	Joint Employers, and Multiemployer Units	250