

SEVENTH EDITION

# POLITICS:

CANADA

PAUL W. FOX

GRAHAM WHITE

S E V E N T H   E D I T I O N

# POLITICS:

## C A N A D A

**PAUL W. FOX**

Victoria College  
University of Toronto

**GRAHAM WHITE**

Department of Political Science  
University of Toronto

**McGRAW-HILL RYERSON LIMITED**

Toronto Montreal New York Auckland Bogotá  
Caracas Hamburg Lisbon London Madrid Mexico  
Milan New Delhi Paris San Juan São Paulo  
Singapore Sydney Tokyo

POLITICS: CANADA, seventh edition

© McGraw Hill Ryerson Limited, 1991, 1987, 1982, 1977, 1970, 1966, 1962.  
All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted  
in any form or by any means, or stored in a data base or retrieval system,  
without prior written permission of McGraw-Hill Ryerson Limited.

ISBN: 0-07-551101-0

2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 W 0 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Printed and bound in Canada

Care has been taken to trace ownership of copyright material contained in this  
text. The publisher will gladly accept any information that will rectify any  
reference or credit in subsequent editions.

Sponsoring Editor: Catherine O'Toole  
Senior Supervising Editor: Rosalyn Steiner  
Copy Editor: Pat Banning  
Cover and text design: Carole Giguere  
Technical Artist: Carole Giguere  
Permissions Editor: Norma Christensen

**Canadian Cataloguing in Publication Data**

Main entry under title:

Politics : Canada  
7th ed.

Includes bibliographical references.  
ISBN 0-07-551101-0

1. Canada – Politics and government – 1963–1984.\*
  2. Canada – Politics and government – 1984– .\*
- I. Fox, Paul W., date – . II. White, Graham, date

JL11.P64 1991 320.971 C90-095598-8

**McGraw-Hill Ryerson Series in Canadian Politics**  
**General Editor Paul W. Fox**

**POLITICS AND THE MEDIA IN CANADA**

Arthur Siegel

**CANADA IN QUESTION: Federalism in the Eighties, Third Edition**

Donald V. Smiley

**THE REVISED CANADIAN CONSTITUTION: Politics as Law**

Ronald I. Cheffins and Patricia A. Johnson

**SOUTHERN EXPOSURE: Canadian Perspectives on the U.S.**

David Flaherty and William McKercher

**FEDERAL CONDITION IN CANADA**

Donald V. Smiley

**THE JUDICIARY IN CANADA: The Third Branch of Government**

Peter H. Russell

**POLITICAL PARTIES AND IDEOLOGIES IN CANADA, Third Edition**

William Christian and Colin Campbell

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN CANADA, Third Edition**

C. Richard Tindal and S. Nobes Tindal

Also Available

**THE CANADIAN POLITICAL SYSTEM, Fourth Edition**

Richard J. Van Loon and Michael S. Whittington

## PREFACE TO THE SEVENTH EDITION

Once again this new edition of *Politics: Canada* has a great deal of fresh material. About half of the contents consists of items that have not appeared in previous editions. All of these selections are drawn from very recent publications or are articles prepared especially for this edition of *Politics: Canada*.

Original material seems to be a growing feature in each successive edition. This time there are eleven articles that have been prepared particularly for the new edition. I am indebted greatly to the authors for their generosity and their labours and would like to thank them warmly for their contributions. My co-editor, Graham White, and our colleague, Nelson Wiseman, have each written two articles, while William Christian and Colin Campbell, John Eichmanis, Lawrence LeDuc, Evert Lindquist, Lorna Marsden, Paul Thomas, and Joseph Wearing have contributed one each.

I would like to express my gratitude also to the authors whose work has appeared in previous editions and who have been kind enough to revise their articles and bring them up to date for this edition. No one declined to take on the task and not one failed to meet the deadline, even when it was suddenly advanced. That is a double measure of co-operation, which only an editor can truly appreciate, but which should be acknowledged publicly. I am pleased to do so here, thanking Agar Adamson, Carl Baar, Brian Land, Evert Lindquist, John McMenemy, and Desmond Morton. Peter Russell should be thanked also for being willing to take on this job, though in the end he contributed two new articles with co-authors.

I should like to thank also those authors whose work has been reprinted here with their permission or by arrangement with their publisher. The contribution of each of these more than 40 individuals is significant and appreciated. None of them, by the way, should be held responsible for the title put on his or her material when it differs from the original. On occasion, I have taken the liberty of altering original titles in order to make them fit the pattern of the chapter in which they appear or to stimulate discussion among students by posing controversial assertions or questions. The desire to provide good argumentative matter is also the reason for juxtaposing contradictory articles wherever possible.

I should add that the freedom taken in designing titles has not been extended to distorting the contents of these articles. Although many selections have been edited rigorously, I have tried very hard to maintain the integrity of the authors' arguments and evidence.

The lengthy bibliographies that follow each chapter reflect the large amount of research and publication that continues to be done in the field of Canadian government and politics. Though the bibliographies are extensive, they are by no means exhaustive. In an effort to keep them to a reasonable length, the co-editor and I have deleted most items published before 1980, except for a few classics. For material published prior to 1980, a reader should consult the bibliographies in earlier editions of *Politics: Canada*. To save space, most

bibliographical references have been entered only once, usually in the chapter where the subject matter seemed most appropriate. However, since some items deal with more than one subject, we have made liberal use of cross-references. For reasons of economy, also, the names of most publishers and periodicals have been abbreviated. Full information is provided in the list of Bibliographical Abbreviations that follows this preface. Rose Antonio deserves great thanks for typing the bibliographies so expertly.

Finally, I would like to thank my co-editor, Professor Graham White, for his invaluable assistance and hard work. He joins me in thanking Catherine O'Toole, sponsoring editor, McGraw-Hill Ryerson, for her support and encouragement. A special word of appreciation goes to Rosalyn Steiner, supervising editor, for her painstaking care in shepherding the book through publication.

Victoria College  
University of Toronto

Paul Fox  
July 18, 1990

# BIBLIOGRAPHICAL ABBREVIATIONS

---

## Publications

A.R.C.S.	<i>American Review of Canadian Studies</i>
C.B.R.	<i>Canadian Bar Review</i>
C.H.R.	<i>Canadian Historical Review</i>
C.J.E.	<i>Canadian Journal of Economics</i>
C.J.E.P.S.	<i>Canadian Journal of Economics and Political Science</i>
C.J.I.S.	<i>Canadian Journal of Information Science</i>
C.J.P.S.	<i>Canadian Journal of Political Science</i>
C.J.S.	<i>Canadian Journal of Sociology</i>
C.P.A.	<i>Canadian Public Administration</i>
C.P.P.	<i>Canadian Public Policy</i>
C.P.R.	<i>Canadian Parliamentary Review</i>
C.R.S.A.	<i>Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology</i>
C.T.J.	<i>Canadian Tax Journal</i>
D.L.R.	<i>Dalhousie Law Review</i>
I.J.	<i>International Journal</i>
J.C.S.	<i>Journal of Canadian Studies</i>
McG.L.J.	<i>McGill Law Journal</i>
M.J.P.S.	<i>Midwest Journal of Political Science</i>
O.	<i>Optimum</i>
O.H.L.J.	<i>Osgoode Hall Law Journal</i>
O.L.R.	<i>Ottawa Law Review</i>
P.O.	<i>Policy Options</i>
Q.L.J.	<i>Queen's Law Journal</i>
Q.Q.	<i>Queen's Quarterly</i>
S.P.E.	<i>Studies in Political Economy</i>
U.T.F.L.R.	<i>University of Toronto Faculty of Law Review</i>
U.T.L.J.	<i>University of Toronto Law Journal</i>

## Publishing Companies, Associations, Councils, Institutes, Foundations.

Ampersand	Ampersand Communications Services Incorporated
B. and M.	Burns and MacEachern
C.B.C.	Canadian Broadcasting Corporation
C.E.L.A.	Canadian Environmental Law Association
C.I.I.A.	Canadian Institute of International Affairs
C.I.P.A.	Canadian Institute on Public Affairs
C.L.I.C.	Canadian Law Information Council
C.P.S.A.	Canadian Political Science Association

C.T.F.	Canadian Tax Foundation
C.M.H.C.	Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation
C.I.S.	Centre for International Studies
C.U.C.S.	Centre for Urban and Community Studies
C.-M.	Collier-Macmillan
C.P.A.	Community Planning Association
C.C.	Copp Clark
C.U.P.	Carleton University Press
D. and G.	Deneau and Greenberg
E.C.C.	Economic Council of Canada
F. and W.	Fitzhenry and Whiteside
H.R.W.	Holt Rinehart and Winston
H.M.	Houghton Mifflin
I.C.	Information Canada
I.R.P.P.	Institute for Research on Public Policy
I.I.R.	Institute of Intergovernmental Relations
I.P.A.C.	Institute for Public Administration of Canada
I.R.C.	Industrial Relations Centre
I.U.S.	Institute of Urban Studies
J.L.S.	James, Lewis and Samuel
K.P.	King's Printer
L. & O.	Lester and Orpen
L.&O.D	Lester & Orpen Dennys
M. & S.	McClelland and Stewart
McG.-Q.U.P.	McGill-Queen's University Press
McG.-H.	McGraw-Hill
McG.-H.R.	McGraw-Hill Ryerson
O.E.C.	Ontario Economic Council
O.I.S.E.	Ontario Institute for Studies in Education
O.U.P.	Oxford University Press
P.-H.	Prentice-Hall
P.U.L.	Les Presses de l'Université Laval
P.U.M.	Les Presses de l'Université de Montréal
P.U.Q.	Les Presses de l'Université du Québec
Q.P.	Queen's Printer
R.M.	Rand McNally
R.K.P.	Routledge, Kegan, Paul
S. and S.	Supply and Services
U.A.P.	University of Alberta Press
U.B.C.P.	University of British Columbia Press
U.O.P.	University of Ottawa Press
U.T.P.	University of Toronto Press
W.L.U.P.	Wilfrid Laurier University Press



# CONTENTS

---

Preface IX

Bibliographical Abbreviations XI

## 1 CULTURE AND CONSTITUTION

### 1 Socio-political Issues

The Essential Political Goods <i>Ronald Manzer</i>	3
Women and Politics—Many Participate But Few Are Selected <i>Janine Brodie</i>	9
An Indian Perspective on Canadian Politics <i>Marie Smallface Marule</i>	15
The Political Economy Tradition in Canada <i>Wallace Clement and Glen Williams</i>	23
Free Trade, Meech Lake, and the Future of Canada <i>Donald V. Smiley</i>	29
Bibliography	35

### 2 The Constitution

The Nature of Constitutions and Constitutionalism <i>Ronald I. Cheffins and Patricia A. Johnson</i>	49
Judging the Judges: The Supreme Court's First One Hundred Charter Decisions <i>F.L. Morton, Peter H. Russell, Michael J. Withey</i>	59
Shortcomings and Dangers in the Charter <i>Roy Romanow</i>	79
Quebec's Use of the Notwithstanding Clause Was Right <i>Reg Whitaker</i>	84
No, It Was Wrong <i>P.K. Kuruvilla</i>	91
Bibliography	95

### 3 Federalism

Background to Meech Lake <i>Graham Fraser</i>	101
The Meech Lake Accord	104
Objections to the Meech Lake Accord <i>Clyde K. Wells</i>	109
In Defence of the Accord <i>Robert L. Stanfield</i>	116
First Ministers' Communiqué and the Legal Opinion	120
Co-operative, Executive, and Intrastate Federalism <i>Garth Stevenson</i>	125
The Political Future of the Northwest Territories: A Test for Canadian Federalism <i>Graham White</i>	136
Bibliography	145

## **4 Regionalism**

The Different Dimensions of Regionalism in Canada	
<i>Peter McCormick</i>	151
Regional Economic Disparities—Causes and Remedies	
<i>Royal Commission on the Economic Union and Development Prospects for Canada</i>	163
Atlantic Canada: Hope Springs Eternal in a Troubled Climate	
<i>Agar Adamson</i>	171
Western Grievances—A Long History <i>David Elton</i>	178
Bibliography	192

## **5 French Canada**

Nationalism in Quebec: An Incomplete Secular Revolution	
<i>François-Pierre Gingras and Neil Nevitte</i>	197
Quebec Politics in the Eighties and Nineties <i>Nelson Wiseman</i>	205
French and English Minorities Are Declining <i>Luc Albert</i>	213
Bibliography	220

---

## **2 PROCESS**

### **6 Public Opinion**

The Perils of Polling—As Exemplified in the '88 Election	
<i>Alan Frizzell</i>	227
The Danger Is Private Polling <i>Paul Fox</i>	239
Government-Relations Firms Are Now Part of the System	
<i>James Rusk</i>	241
Pressure Groups at Work <i>A. Paul Pross</i>	244
The Media Still Need Improvement <i>Keith Davey</i>	254
Bibliography	260

### **7 Political Parties**

Cairns Revisited—The Electoral and Party System in Canada	
<i>Nelson Wiseman</i>	265
Middle-of-the-Road Parties Are the Canadian Tradition	
<i>Paul Fox</i>	275
Another Explanation—Class Differences Have Been Obscured	
<i>Janine Brodie and Jane Jenson</i>	280
The Ideological Tradition in Canadian Politics	
<i>William Christian and Colin Campbell</i>	286
Conservative Principles and Philosophy <i>Robert L. Stanfield</i>	297
A Definition of Liberalism <i>Robert F. Nixon</i>	301
Canadian Socialism: "The Society of Friends"	

<i>Desmond Morton</i> .....	<b>303</b>
Bibliography .....	<b>307</b>

## **8 Elections and Voting Behaviour**

Television and the 1988 Campaign; Did It Make a Difference? <i>Frederick J. Fletcher and Robert Everett</i> .....	<b>317</b>
Single Issue Politics: Is Abortion a Test Case? <i>Jeffrey Simpson</i> .....	<b>323</b>
Regulating Federal Election Spending <i>Joseph Wearing</i> .....	<b>324</b>
Recent Canadian Provincial Election Results <i>Paul Fox</i> .....	<b>338</b>
Canadian General Election Results, 1867–1988 <i>Table</i> .....	<b>342</b>
Results of Federal General Elections in 1988 and 1984 <i>Table</i> .....	<b>343</b>
Should Canada Adopt Proportional Representation? <i>Paul Fox</i> .....	<b>343</b>
Voting for Free Trade? The Canadian Voter and the 1988 Federal Election <i>Lawrence LeDuc</i> .....	<b>350</b>
Bibliography .....	<b>367</b>



## **3 PUBLIC POLICY MAKING**

### **9 The Executive: Crown, Prime Minister, Cabinet**

The Value of the Monarchy <i>Frank MacKinnon</i> .....	<b>373</b>
The Prime Minister <i>Marc Lalonde</i> .....	<b>377</b>
The Cabinet and Ministers <i>Timothy Plumptre</i> .....	<b>383</b>
The Cabinet Decision-Making System: A Process Without a Name <i>Evert A. Lindquist</i> .....	<b>390</b>
Who Is on Top? The Minister or the Mandarins? <i>Flora MacDonald</i> .....	<b>395</b>
A Reply From a Former Minister and Mandarin <i>Mitchell Sharp</i> .....	<b>400</b>
Bibliography .....	<b>405</b>

### **10 The House of Commons**

Functions of the House of Commons <i>Graham White</i> .....	<b>407</b>
Twenty-Five Fairy Tales About Parliamentary Government <i>Eugene Forsey and Graham Eglington</i> .....	<b>417</b>
Question Period and Debate in the House <i>C.E.S. Franks</i> .....	<b>422</b>
A Private Member Speaks Her Mind <i>Lise Bourgault</i> .....	<b>426</b>
Bibliography .....	<b>431</b>

### **11 The Senate**

Canada Needs a Triple E Senate <i>Peter McCormick</i> .....	<b>435</b>
No—More Than a Triple E Senate Is Needed <i>Eugene Forsey</i> .....	<b>440</b>
Doing Its Thing—Providing “Sober Second Thought”: The Canadian Senate, 1984–1990 <i>Lorna R. Marsden</i> .....	<b>446</b>

The Senate as an Instrument of Business and Party	
<i>John McMenemy</i>	454
Bibliography	464

## 12 The Administration

The Administrative Machine in Canada	<i>Paul Thomas</i>	465
The Budgetary Process	<i>Evert A. Lindquist</i>	475
Freedom of Information in Canada	<i>John Eichmanis</i>	483
The Essentials of Strategic Policy Making	<i>Thomas S. Axworthy</i>	487
Bibliography		497

## 13 The Judiciary

The Structure and Personnel of the Canadian Judiciary		
<i>Carl Baar</i>		509
Mulroney's Judicial Appointments and the New Judicial Advisory		
Committees	<i>Peter H. Russell and Jacob S. Ziegel</i>	517
Bibliography		525

## 14 Government Publications

A Description and Guide to the Use of Canadian Government		
Publications	<i>Brian Land</i>	527
Bibliography		551

## Appendix

Constitution Act, 1982		555
Constitution Act, 1867 (British North America Act, 1867),		
Sections 91-93		570

---

# 1

**CULTURE AND  
CONSTITUTION**

---



# 1

## **SOCIO-POLITICAL ISSUES**

---

### **THE ESSENTIAL POLITICAL GOODS**

*Ronald Manzer*

From the comparative perspective of Canadian history and the experience of other political communities, the people who live in Canada today enjoy very high standards of material prosperity, physical security, and human rights. Conventional measures of socio-political development—such as average income, rates of mortality and morbidity, incidence of political and criminal violence, equality of opportunity for education, and protection of civil liberties—indicate a relatively high and historically increasing level of well-being. Only a few other political communities can claim to provide for the basic needs of their citizens at a level comparable to that attained in Canada.

None the less, Canada's high average standard of living disguises serious and persistent maldistributions. For example, a hard core of 15 per cent, perhaps more, of the population endures material poverty in the midst of affluence. Racial and sexual inequalities deny sizable numbers of Canadians secure enjoyment of their dignity and self-respect. An upper-status group possessing position, expertise, and wealth is firmly in control of economic and political power, lessening the potential for an authentically democratic polity.

In addition to serious inadequacies in the present distribution of political

From *Public Policies and Political Development in Canada*, Toronto. Reprinted by permission of University of Toronto Press. © University of Toronto Press 1985. Ellipsis points indicate text omitted.

goods, Canadians face disquieting prospects for more severe shortfalls in the satisfaction of their basic needs. In one issue-area after another public policies seem to have reached an impasse. More than a decade of policy-making effort to cure weak economic growth, high unemployment, and persistent inflation has produced no convincing remedies for a stubborn "stagflation." Considerable scientific evidence and a popular awareness of the adverse impact of the industrial system on the natural environment have so far resulted only in weak and vacillating corrective regulation. A social order founded on bargaining among power élites verges on immobility when dominant organized socio-economic interests fail to agree, and veers toward injustice when agreement is obtained at the expense of weak, unorganized segments of society. The integrity of the Canadian political community is threatened by the internal strains of two linguistic-cultural communities and four or five economic regions and by the very mixed blessings of an American penetration that reinforces internal divisions and complicates their accommodation. Policies for cultural development and humanistic education that aim at the higher values of individual self-realization consistently are the last to be supported and the first to be eviscerated in disputes over collective priorities.

In the past, Canadians have benefitted from the richness of their physical resources and the general benignity of their external relationships, which have facilitated the growth of their well-being. On the whole, they also have been fortunate in the political choices they have made. A complex array of federal, provincial, and local public policies has been instrumental in achieving high levels of need satisfaction.

In the future, the challenge of remedying maldistributions of primary political goods and overcoming impasses in making essential public policies will continue to demand imaginative and sometimes difficult political choices. Making good choices will require a better core of policy knowledge, far-reaching institutional reform, and a new commitment to the principles of liberal democracy.

The challenge of public policy and political development in Canada is one involving policy knowledge and political institutions. Genuine puzzlement about the theoretical assumptions on which to base public policy inhibits the development of policies in such diverse issue-areas as economic stabilization, corrections, and public education. Grave doubts about the responsiveness and effectiveness of federal, provincial, and local political institutions cast a pall on our tentative attempts to create fresh formulations for old policy designs.

Underlying the questions of relevant policy knowledge and effective political institutions is a more basic question about the validity of contemporary political ideas and values. Ultimately, the challenge of public policy and political development in Canada is one of political principles and public purposes.

### **PUBLIC PURPOSE**

The usual justification for government in general and for public policies in particular is the satisfaction of human needs. In their eventual outcomes,



specific programs or particular actions to implement policies usually fall far short of their initial promise to serve human needs, and often they are deliberately perverted to satisfy the wants of a few rather than the needs of many. None the less, if we are to understand and evaluate the development of public policies we must have a concept of public purpose that can relate the satisfaction of human needs to the functions of good government.

The construction of a list of human needs is necessarily somewhat arbitrary, but for purposes of policy analysis the fivefold classification of basic needs suggested by Abraham Maslow is a useful schema. First, physiological needs are the requirements for physical survival and the relief of pain. People must have clean air to breathe and adequate food, drink, sleep, and shelter. Second, safety needs are needs for order, predictability, and dependability of the environment. People vary greatly in their capacities to cope with disorder or unpredictability in their personal lives and social relationships, but there are evident limits to go beyond which results in neurosis or psychosis. Third, people have basic needs for love, affection, and a sense of belongingness. The belongingness needs represent the deep, persistent desire of people to get together, to be together, and stay together. Fourth, people need esteem and respect from other people, and they need self-esteem and self-respect. "Satisfaction of the self-esteem need leads to feelings of self-confidence, worth, strength, capability, and adequacy, of being useful and necessary in the world. But thwarting of these needs produces feelings of inferiority, of weakness, and of helplessness." Fifth, self-development needs are the needs people have to actualize their full potential as human beings, not simply to survive in safety, with friends, respected, but to achieve to the fullest extent possible what they are capable of becoming.

According to Maslow, these five sets of needs are hierarchically ordered, with higher degrees of "gratification health" being achieved as higher levels of needs are satisfied. If all needs are unsatisfied, physiological needs will predominate. When physiological needs are satisfied, a concern for predictability and dependability of the environment grows. Then, as physiological and safety needs are satisfied, needs for belongingness, esteem, and self-development successively become predominant.

Maslow is ambiguous about the points at which individual priorities change from one set of needs to another. Basic needs will obviously persist, and subtle transformations express the increasing complexity of expanding desires. Sexual desire grows into love, and love required demands mutual respect and freedom for self-development. Food and drink prepared with skill and taken with friends become a means of self-expression and affection. In spite of this ambiguity, the higher the level of needs satisfied, the healthier and closer to realizing their human potential people will be. A person who is safe, loved, and respected, for example, will be healthier and closer to full human development than a person who is safe but rejected and unloved.

Each set of basic human needs may be satisfied by planned or spontaneous individual private action, collective private action, or collective public action.