



Environmental Hazards from Offshore Methane Hydrate Operations

Civil Liability and Regulations for Efficient Governance

Roy Andrew Partain



Wolters Kluwer

Environmental Hazards from Offshore Methane Hydrate Operations

Civil Liability and Regulations for Efficient
Governance

Roy Andrew Partain



Wolters Kluwer

Published by:

Kluwer Law International B.V.
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.wolterskluwerlr.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@wolterskluwer.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Quadrant
Rockwood House
Haywards Heath
West Sussex
RH16 3DH
United Kingdom
Email: international-customerservice@wolterskluwer.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-8730-7

e-Book: ISBN 978-90-411-8731-4
web-PDF: ISBN 978-90-411-8732-1

© 2017 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S., 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Website: www.wolterskluwerlr.com

Printed in the United Kingdom.

Environmental Hazards from Offshore Methane Hydrate Operations

Energy and Environmental Law and Policy Series

VOLUME 32

Editor

General Editor: Professor Kurt Deketelaere, Professor of Law, University of Leuven, Belgium; Honorary Professor of Law, University of Dundee, UK; Honorary Chief of Staff, Flemish Government; Secretary-General, League of European Research Universities (LERU), Belgium. Kurt's CV – see www.kurtdeketelaere/en/kurt.

Introduction

Environmental protection and energy efficiency/security are important societal challenges. In order to tackle them, policy and legal frameworks are developed at national, regional and global level. Through study and best practices development, the challenges will prove to be solvable.

Contents/Subjects

Environment/Nature/Energy/Climate.

Objective

The aim of this series is to publish works of excellent quality that focus on the study of energy and environmental policy. Through this series the editors:

- contribute to the improvement of the quality of energy/environmental law and policy in general and environmental quality and energy efficiency in particular; increase the access to environmental and energy information for academics, non-governmental organizations, government institutions, and business; and
- facilitate cooperation between academic and non-academic communities in the field of energy and environmental law and policy throughout the world.

Readership

Academics and practitioners in environmental and energy matters.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

To Bokhee and Benjamin, for all the reasons.

Preface

This book introduces the legal questions facing policymakers as they begin to address the challenges of offshore methane hydrates, perhaps one of the largest known potential sources of fresh water and energy in the world today. This book develops a theoretical foundation for a model regulatory framework for those challenges and then provides a comparative legal analysis of existing laws and conventions to determine their fitness for offshore methane hydrates related activities. The book includes two executive summaries, one focused on the model framework and the second on the policy recommendations on updating existing laws and conventions to become more robust.

While most readers are familiar with the traditional trio of hydrocarbons, that of coal, crude oil, and natural gas, few are aware of the fourth hydrocarbon, that of methane hydrates. Further, most are surprised to learn that these fiery bits of ice may be more common in nature than oil or gas. It is even more surprising to realize how little has been written about these hydrate resources in environmental law and energy law literatures. This book aims to fill that lacuna, enabling a broader cross-section of legal scholars to engage in this fascinating late-arrival to the natural resource policy arena.

The issues surrounding offshore methane hydrates should be exciting to policy-makers. First, they present potential sources of energy and fresh water and may open new pathways to green energy. Furthermore, these resources are abundantly supplied in coastal areas around the globe, altering the geo-politics of energy supplies. However, there are certain novel harms and hazards presented by developing and producing offshore methane hydrates. Both cataclysmic, e.g. anthropogenic tsunami, and non-cataclysmic hazards, e.g. persistent ecological harms, must be integrated into policy planning prior to the onset of this new energy resource. Yet, these rewards and hazards have scarcely been addressed in the legal literature; thus, this book presents the first monograph treatment of the legal issues facing the future of offshore methane hydrates.

The study proceeds in four parts. The first part of the study provides an introduction to the scientific, engineering, and commercial characteristics of offshore

methane hydrate projects. It also provides reviews of both the potential benefits and the potential hazards of offshore methane hydrates.

The second part of the study provides a review of the law and economics theory of accident law as applied to environmental accidents. Rules of civil liability are reviewed to determine when strict liability or negligence might be efficiently employed in risk governance. Further, similar reviews are developed for public and private regulation. A scientific review of the circumstances of offshore methane hydrates finds that the optimal set of rules is a combination of a strict liability paradigm in complementary implementation of public regulations.

The third part examines existing laws and conventions to determine which might be applicable to offshore methane hydrates. The study also reviews if their risk governance strategies are in accordance with the recommendations from the second part of the study. It is found that most of the evaluated laws do follow a similar risk governance strategy of strict liability accompanied by public regulation, but that many of the current laws to address offshore oil and gas hazards would not interface with the particular circumstances of methane hydrates.

In the fourth part of the study, a summary of the three previous parts is presented and recommendations are made as how to update the existing legal frameworks to accommodate the onset of offshore methane hydrate development and production.

There are two executive summaries to be found in the book. Chapter 7 provides an executive summary of the model regulatory framework as supported by theoretical foundations drawn from the Law & Economics approach. The second, more practical, executive summary is contained in Chapter 12. That executive summary provides a road map to amending and revising existing laws and conventions so that policymakers can efficiently move forward to better ensure adequate environmental protections are in place.

It is hoped that this book will find an audience ready to learn about an important natural resource that has stunningly lain undiscovered during the industrial and post-industrial eras, a resource that could both deliver tremendous welfare benefits and bring calamitous harms. Its aims are to ignite policy debates and to bring more parties into the policy discussions that need to be undertaken.

If but one policy recommendation could be drawn out in advance of the book itself, it is that the deliberations to determine policy goals and standard-setting for offshore methane hydrates be undertaken in advance of their first licensing and development projects, and not in retrospect after an accident.

List of Abbreviations

AIST	Japan's National Institute of Advanced Industrial Science and Technology
ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
B.C.E.	Before common era; Before Christ
BHP	Benthic Hazard Planning
BP	formerly British Petroleum, now just BP
btu	British Thermal Unit
C	Celsius degrees, when not in the form Cn
Cn	An alkane; <i>e.g.s.</i> C1 is methane and C4 is butane
CAA	Clean Air Act
CCS	Carbon capture systems/sequestration
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism
CH ₄	Methane
CO ₂	Carbon dioxide
CLC	Civil Liability Convention of 1969
CERCLA	Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act
CRISTAL	Contract Regarding an Interim Supplement to Tanker Liability for Oil Pollution
CWA	Clean Water Act
DARPA	The U.S.'s Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency
DOE	U.S. Department of Energy
EC	European Community
ECO2	A proper name for an EU project to study offshore CCS injection
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone, from UNCLOS

EHR	Enhanced Hydrocarbon Recovery
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EIA	The DOE's Energy Information Administration
ELD	Environmental Liability Directive of the EU
EMSA	European Maritime Safety Agency
ENAA	Japan's Engineering Advancement Association of Japan
EU	European Union
FID	Financial Investment Decision
GHDO	Korea's Gas Hydrate Research and Development Organization
GHG	Greenhouse gas, as defined under the Kyoto Protocol
GTL	Gas-to-Liquids technology
GTS	Gas-to-Solids technology
GWP	Global warming potential
H ₂ O	Water
H ₂ SO ₄	Hydrogen sulfide
HSZ	Hydrate stability zone
IRCGH	The Indo-Russian Center for Gas Hydrates
ISA	International Seabed Authority
JMHEP	Japan Methane Hydrate Exploitation Program
JOGMEC	Japan's Oil, Gas and Metals National Corporation
KIGAM	Korea Institute of Geosciences and Mineral Resources
kJ	kilo-joule
KNOC	Korea National Oil Company
LNG	Liquefied Natural Gas
m ³	cubic meter, a volumetric reference
MARPOL	International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships, from the concept of marine pollution
Mcf	Million cubic feet
MH21	Japanese Research Consortium for Methane Hydrate Resources in Japan
MHHP	Methane Hydrate Hazard Planning
MMBtu	Million British Thermal Units
MOCIE	Korea's Ministry of Commerce, Industry, and Energy
NEPA	The U.S.'s National Environmental Protection Act
NGHP	India's National Gas Hydrate Program
NGL	Natural gas liquids, such as propane and butane
OCSLA	Outer Continental Shelf Lands Act
OPA	The U.S.'s Oil Pollution Act

OPRC	1990 International Convention on Oil Pollution Preparedness, Response and Co-operation
OSPAR	The Convention for the Protection of the marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic (the “OSPAR Convention”)
psia	Pounds per square inch absolute
RCRA	Resource Conservation and Recovery Act
SEA	Strategic Environment Assessment
sH	The most complex hydrate lattice
sI	The simple form of a methane hydrate lattice
sII	A methane hydrate lattice that can hold NGLs
SLP model	Shavell Landes Posner economic model of Tort Law
SUGAR	Submarine Gashydratlagerst_tten: Erkundung, Abbau und Transport
Tcf	Trillion cubic feet
Tcm	Trillion cubic meters
TOVALOP	Tanker Owners Voluntary Agreement Concerning Liability for Oil Pollution
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (1992)
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Seas
UNFCCC	United Nation’s Framework Convention on Climate Change
U.K.	The United Kingdom
U.S.A.	United States of America
USD	United States dollar
USGS	United States Geological Service
VAT	Value added tax
WFD	Water Framework Directive of the EU

List of Laws, Conventions, and Regulations

1. United Nations

- (i) 1982 United Nations Convention On The Law Of The Sea
- (ii) 2008 United Nations Convention On The Transboundary Effects Of Industrial Accidents
- (iii) United Nations Framework Convention On Climate Change
- (iv) The Kyoto Protocol To The UNFCCC
- (v) UNECE Convention On Access To Information, Public Participation In Decision-Making And Access To Justice In Environmental Matters
- (vi) UNECE Convention On Environmental Impact Assessment In A Transboundary Context
- (vii) Rio Declaration Of Principles

2. Regional Maritime Conventions

- (i) OSPAR Convention
- (ii) Convention For The Protection Of The Marine Environment And The Coastal Region Of The Mediterranean And Its Protocols. (Barcelona Convention.)
- (iii) Agreement For Cooperation In Dealing With Pollution Of The North Seas By Oil And Other Harmful Substances. (Bonn Agreement.)
- (iv) Convention On The Protection Of The Marine Environment Of The Baltic Sea Area, 1992. (Helsinki Convention).

3. International Oil Spill Conventions

- (i) International Convention For The Establishment Of An International Fund For Compensation For Oil Pollution Damage (Brussels, December 18, 1992)

- (ii) International Convention On Civil Liability For Oil Pollution Damage (Brussels, November 29, 1969). (CLC)
- (iii) The Tanker Owners' Voluntary Agreement Concerning Liability For Oil Pollution, (TOVALOP)
- (iv) The Contract Regarding An Interim Supplement To Tanker Liability For Oil Pollution, (CRISTAL)
- (v) International Convention For The Prevention Of Pollution From Ships, (MARPOL)
- (vi) 1990 International Convention On Oil Pollution Preparedness, Response And Co-Operation, (OPRC)

4. European Union Directives

- (i) Directive 2011/92/EU Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 13 December 2011 On The Assessment Of The Effects Of Certain Public And Private Projects On The Environment
- (ii) Directive 2001/42/EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 27 June 2001 On The Assessment Of The Effects Of Certain Plans And Programmes On The Environment
- (iii) Directive 2013/30/ EU Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 12 June 2013 On Safety Of Offshore Oil And Gas Operations And Amending Directive 2004/35/Ec
- (iv) Directive 2009/31/ EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 23 April 2009 On The Geological Storage Of Carbon Dioxide And Amending Council Directive 85/337/ EEC, European Parliament And Council Directives 2000/60/ EC, 2001/80/ EC, 2004/35/ EC, 2006/12/ EC, 2008/1/ EC And Regulation (EC) No 1013/2006
- (v) Directive 2008/56/ EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 17 June 2008 Establishing A Framework For Community Action In The Field Of Marine Environmental Policy (Marine Strategy Framework Directive)
- (vi) Directive 2006/11/ EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 15 February 2006 On Pollution Caused By Certain Dangerous Substances Discharged Into The Aquatic Environment Of The Community
- (vii) Directive 2000/60/ EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 23 October 2000 Establishing A Framework For Community Action In The Field Of Water Policy. (Water Framework Directive.)
- (viii) Directive 2004/35/Ce Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 21 April 2004 On Environmental Liability With Regard To The Prevention And Remedying Of Environmental Damage. (ELD)
- (ix) Directive 2009/147/ EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council On The Conservation Of Wild Birds. (Birds Directive)

- (x) Council Directive 92/43/EEC Of 21 May 1992 On The Conservation Of Natural Habitats And Of Wild Fauna And Flora (Habitats Directive)
- (xi) Directive 2012/18/ EU Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of 4 July 2012 On The Control Of Major-Accident Hazards Involving Dangerous Substances, Amending And Subsequently Repealing Council Directive 96/82/ EC Text With EEA Relevance (Seveso Iii)
- (xii) Directive 2000/60/ EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Establishing A Framework For Community Action In The Field Of Water Policy

5. European Union Decisions

- (i) 94/69/Ec: Council Decision Of 15 December 1993 Concerning The Conclusion Of The United Nations Framework Convention On Climate Change
- (ii) 2002/358/EC: Council Decision Of 25 April 2002 Concerning The Approval, On Behalf Of The European Community, Of The Kyoto Protocol To The United Nations Framework Convention On Climate Change And The Joint Fulfilment Of Commitments Thereunder

6. United States

- (i) National Environmental Protection Act (NEPA)
- (ii) Oil Pollution Act (OPA)
- (iii) National Oil And Hazardous Substances Pollution Contingency Plan
- (iv) Clean Air Act (CAA)
- (v) Clean Water Act (CWA)
- (vi) Outer Continental Shelf Lands Act (OCSLA)
- (vii) Methane Hydrate Research And Development Act (MHRDA)
- (viii) International Convention Relating To Intervention On The High Seas In Cases Of Oil Pollution Casualties

Table of Contents

Preface	xv
List of Abbreviations	xvii
List of Laws, Conventions, and Regulations	xxi
PART I	
Offshore Methane Hydrates	1
CHAPTER 1	
Introduction	3
1 The Dawn of Methane Hydrates as an Energy Source	4
2 Major Actors in Offshore Methane Hydrates	7
3 Goals of This Study and the Research Question	8
4 Structure of Study	9
5 A Survey of Previous Literature on Offshore Methane Hydrates	11
6 Summary of Introduction	12
CHAPTER 2	
Primer on Methane Hydrates	13
1 Non-technical Introduction to Methane Hydrates	13
2 Chemistry of Methane Hydrates	16
3 Scale of the Resource	19
4 Geology of Methane Hydrates	22
5 Location of Methane Hydrates	26
6 Summary and Conclusions	29
CHAPTER 3	
Methane Hydrates as an Energy Resource	31
1 Methane as a Green Energy Source	31

Table of Contents

2	Economics of Methane Hydrates Projects	33
2.1	Economics of Methane Hydrates	33
2.2	Time Sensitivity of Costs	34
3	Methane Hydrate Engineering	36
3.1	Methods of Extraction	36
3.2	Example Typical Installation	39
3.3	Recent Production Tests	40
4	National Research Programs and Agendas	42
4.1	Japan	43
4.2	South Korea	45
4.3	U.S.A and Canada	47
4.4	China	48
4.5	India	49
5	Other Benefits of Methane Hydrates	50
5.1	Carbon Capture and Sequestration (CCS)	50
5.2	Production of Hydrogen Fuel	51
5.3	Co-production of Fresh Water	51
5.4	Replacement of LNG with GTS Shipping	52
6	Summary and Conclusions	54
CHAPTER 4		
Hazards of Offshore Methane Hydrates		57
1	Impacted Communities	58
2	Life-Cycle Risk Analysis	61
2.1	Four Discernible Stages of Risk	61
2.1.1	Exploration	61
2.1.2	Development	61
2.1.3	Production	62
2.1.4	Abandonment and Sequestration	63
2.2	Other Risks and Considerations	64
2.2.1	Field Choice	64
2.2.2	High Ambient Risks	64
2.2.3	Sovereign Immune Actors and De Facto Externalized Costs	65
3	Non-cataclysmic Hazards	65
3.1	Venting of Methane to the Atmosphere	67
3.2	Damages from Methane Seepage and Ventings	69
3.3	Acts That Enable Seeping and Venting of Methane	72
3.3.1	Actions That Make Methane Available	73
3.3.2	Actions That Provide a Means of Leakage	74
4	Cataclysmic Methane Events	76
4.1	Sudden Massive Venting	76
4.2	Subsea Landslides, Tsunamis, and Earthquakes	78
5	Oil Spills and Deep Ocean Eruptions Are Distinguishable	80

5.1	Marine Oil Spills	81
5.2	Deep Ocean Eruptions	83
6	Summary and Conclusions	85
PART II		
	Governance of Accidental Risk	89
CHAPTER 5		
	Rules of Civil Liability	91
1	Rules of Civil Liability to Govern Accidental Harms	92
1.1	Prioritizing Accident Reduction over Compensation	93
1.2	Choice of Instrument: Strict Liability Versus Negligence	95
2	When Strict Liability Is Preferable	96
2.1	Unilateral Accidents: Strict Liability Efficiently Sets Both Precaution and Activity Levels	97
2.2	Abnormally Hazardous Activities	99
2.2.1	Controlling Tortfeasor with Strict Liability in Bilateral Accidents	99
2.2.2	Landes Posner Strict Liability Conditions	103
2.2.3	Disproportionate Risks to Benefits	103
2.3	Strict Liability Enables Decentralization	105
2.4	In the Face of Uncertainties	106
2.4.1	Uncertain <i>Ex Ante</i> Duty of Care	106
2.4.2	Incentives for Safety Innovation	106
2.4.3	Complex Interactions of Precaution and Activity Levels	106
2.5	When Transaction Costs of Justice Are Critical	108
3	When Negligence Is Preferable	109
3.1	Imperfect Tortfeasors	112
3.1.1	Actors with Risk Aversion or Incomplete Insurance	112
3.1.2	Insolvency	114
3.1.3	Strategic Avoidance Plus Precaution	114
3.1.4	Defects of Optimism and Pessimism	115
3.2	Imperfect or Inaccurate Damages	116
3.2.1	Complexity and Strict Liability	117
3.2.2	Complexity and Negligence	118
3.3	Need for Data Transparency	118
3.4	Balancing of Externalized Costs and Benefits	119
4	Summary and Conclusions	122
CHAPTER 6		
	Public and Private Regulation	125
1	On Regulation	126
2	Benefits of Positive Regulations	128