

Constitutional Law

National Power and Federalism

Seventh Edition

Christopher N. May

Allan Ides

Simona Grossi



Wolters Kluwer

EXAMPLES & EXPLANATIONS

Constitutional Law

National Power and Federalism

Seventh Edition

Christopher N. May

Professor Emeritus of Law
Loyola Law School, Los Angeles

Allan Ides

Christopher N. May Professor of Law
Loyola Law School, Los Angeles

Simona Grossi

Professor of Law & Theodore A. Bruinsma Fellow
Loyola Law School, Los Angeles



Wolters Kluwer

Copyright © 2016 CCH Incorporated.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory Solutions U.S. serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.WKLegaledu.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.WKLegaledu.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-6422-6

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: May, Christopher N., author. | Ides, Allan, 1949- author. | Grossi, Simona, author.

Title: Constitutional law : national power and federalism / Christopher N. May, Allan Ides, Simona Grossi.

Description: Seventh edition. | New York : Wolters Kluwer, [2016]

Identifiers: LCCN 2015046842 | ISBN 9781454864226

Subjects: LCSH: Constitutional law—United States. | Judicial review—United States. | Federal government—United States.

Classification: LCC KF4550 .M29 2016 | DDC 342.73 —dc23

LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015046842>



Constitutional Law

National Power and Federalism

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
Raymond Pryke Professor of First Amendment Law
University of California, Irvine School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Senior Lecturer in Law
The University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Maurice A. Deane School of Law at Hofstra University

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Stanley Morrison Professor of Law, Stanford Law School
Faculty Co-Director, Stanford Criminal Justice Center

About Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory Solutions U.S.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory Solutions U.S. delivers expert content and solutions in the areas of law, corporate compliance, health compliance, reimbursement, and legal education. Its practical solutions help customers successfully navigate the demands of a changing environment to drive their daily activities, enhance decision quality and inspire confident outcomes.

Serving customers worldwide, its legal and regulatory solutions portfolio includes products under the Aspen Publishers, CCH Incorporated, Kluwer Law International, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs names. They are regarded as exceptional and trusted resources for general legal and practice-specific knowledge, compliance and risk management, dynamic workflow solutions, and expert commentary.

For our parents
Robert and Virginia May
Albert and Frances Ides
Angelo and Daniela Grossi

Preface

Most of us arrive at law school with at least a minimal awareness of our constitutional system of government. We know generally that the national government is divided into three branches and that the Bill of Rights protects our fundamental freedoms. That awareness probably began with elementary school Thanksgiving Day pageants, developed substance through various American history and government classes in high school, and finally, for some of us, is topped by an undergraduate course in constitutional law. Outside the educational setting, constitutional law issues ripple through the popular media, with frequent references to abortion, free speech, religion, racial and gender discrimination, gay rights, and so forth.

As law students, however, we learn very quickly that the study of constitutional law is anything but a meditation on the commonplace. And therein lies the treachery. The familiar quickly blends with the arcane, and we are forced to grapple with a tumult of doctrines, distinctions, and qualifications. Indeed, the familiar may soon disappear as we trek through justiciability, the commerce power, state action, and various other subjects that never seem to make the headlines. Even those topics that strike a common chord are presented with a treatment that is most uncommon. Add to this a bevy of wavering doctrines, concurring or opposing opinions, and the changing personnel of the Supreme Court, and the complexity can become overwhelming.

We're here to help. We have written two volumes designed to give you a foundation in the doctrines and methods of constitutional law and constitutional argument. This volume, *National Power and Federalism*, covers the powers of the federal courts, Congress, and the President; the doctrines of separation of powers and federalism; and some of the limitations that the Constitution imposes on state power. The second, *Individual Rights*, covers the provisions of the Constitution that protect us against the government, including the Takings and Contracts Clauses; the Due Process and Equal Protection Clauses; and the Speech, Press, and Religion Clauses of the First Amendment.

These books try to provoke you into thinking about the larger issues of constitutional law with some depth and perception. They are not outlines. Nor are they research treatises on all the nuances of constitutional law. Rather, they present a problem-oriented guide through the principal doctrines of constitutional law—those covered in typical constitutional law courses—with an emphasis on how one might think about issues that

Preface

arise within the various contexts in which these doctrines operate. Lawyers, after all, are problem solvers. These books are tools for constitutional law problem solvers (and students confronted with the reality of final exams).

We must include the usual caveat. Our books are not a substitute for your constitutional law class or for a basic casebook. Nor are they a substitute for reading those cases. We hope, however, that they will make the classroom experience richer and more accessible. In fact, our experience is that students who have read these materials along with traditional cases have found the cases more understandable and more easily digested. They have also found that class participation is less threatening and more fruitful. We are confident that you will have the same experience.

The approach that we suggest is quite simple. As you begin a new topic in your constitutional law course, read the related chapter in either *National Power and Federalism* or *Individual Rights*. This will give you an overview of the area and a preliminary sense of how doctrines are applied within the area. In reading the chapters, however, don't just *read* the problems—*do them!* In other words, consider the problem and try to anticipate how it will be solved before you read the accompanying explanation. This will develop your analytical skills. Next, as you read your cases, refer back to the related chapters and chapter sections and assess how each case fits into the overall framework developed by the Court. See if the case comports with the problems and explanations. Be critical. Finally, when you complete the coverage of a topic, review the chapter again. This will give you confidence that you know the material. Students have also found these materials useful as study aids when preparing for their final exams. After all, finals are simply problems to be solved. In any event, don't just read these books; use them to develop your understanding and your skills.

Good luck in your studies and in your careers as problem-solving students of the Constitution.

Christopher N. May
Allan Ides
Simona Grossi

December 2015

Acknowledgments

We would like to express our appreciation to our student research assistants who assisted us in the preparation of the various editions of this book: Lilly Kim (LLS '98), Lauren Raskin (LLS '98), Eric Enson (LLS '99), James V. DeRossitt IV (W&L '96), Ashley DeMoss (W&L '97), Lawrence Striley (W&L '95), Kristen Strain (LLS '01), Kasha Arianne Harshaw (LLS '02), Jessica Levinson (LLS '05), Daniel Costa (UCLA '11), Mario Grimm (LLS '11), Mashashi Kawaguchi (LLS '11), Vanda Long (UNC '11), and Jacquelyn Mohr (LLS '11). Many thanks also to our secretaries, Ruth Busch, Liz Luk, and Diane Cochran.

Constitutional Law

National Power and Federalism

Summary of Contents

<i>Contents</i>		xi
<i>Preface</i>		xxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		xxiii
Chapter 1	Judicial Review	1
Chapter 2	Congressional Power to Limit the Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court and Inferior Federal Courts	63
Chapter 3	Justiciability	99
Chapter 4	Special Limitations on Judicial Review of State Laws	171
Chapter 5	The Powers of the National Government	229
Chapter 6	The Supremacy Clause	299
Chapter 7	The Separation of Powers	327
Chapter 8	The Dormant Commerce Clause	391
Chapter 9	The Privileges and Immunities Clause of Article IV	435
<i>Table of Cases</i>		459
<i>Index</i>		471

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxiii

Chapter 1	Judicial Review	1
§1.1	Introduction and Overview	1
§1.2	The Background of <i>Marbury v. Madison</i>	2
§1.2.1	Independence and the Articles of Confederation	2
§1.2.2	The First State Constitutions	3
§1.2.3	The Emergence of Judicial Review	5
§1.2.4	Creating a New National Government	6
§1.2.5	The Federalist Era, 1789-1801	7
§1.2.6	The Republican Assault on the Judiciary	8
§1.3	<i>Marbury v. Madison</i> : Judicial Review of the Coordinate Branches	10
§1.3.1	Judicial Review of Acts of Congress	10
§1.3.2	Judicial Review of Executive Conduct	12
§1.3.3	The Constitution as Paramount Law in Court	13
§1.3.4	Marshall's Textual Defense of Judicial Review	14
§1.3.5	The Legitimacy of Judicial Review	17
§1.4	Federal Judicial Review of State Conduct	18
§1.4.1	Challenges Initiated in Federal Court	19
§1.4.2	Supreme Court Review of State Judgments	19
§1.4.3	Adequate and Independent State Grounds	22
	What Constitutes an "Adequate" State Ground?	23
	What Constitutes an "Independent" State Ground?	26
	In Case of Doubt: <i>Michigan v. Long</i>	27
	Cases Filed in the Federal Courts	31
§1.5	The Role of Judicial Review in a Democratic Society	31
§1.6	The Debate over Constitutional Interpretation	34
§1.6.1	Interpretivism versus Noninterpretivism	34

Contents

§1.6.2	Textualism	36
§1.6.3	Originalism	37
§1.6.4	Nonoriginalism	39
§1.6.5	Approaching Consensus	40
§1.6.6	Sources and Levels of Generality	41
§1.7	The Techniques of Constitutional Interpretation	43
§1.7.1	Constitutional Text	44
§1.7.2	Original Intent	44
§1.7.3	Constitutional Structure	46
§1.7.4	History and Tradition	47
§1.7.5	Fairness and Justice	48
§1.7.6	Political Theory	48
§1.7.7	Social Policy	48
§1.7.8	Foreign, International, and State Law	49
§1.7.9	Supreme Court Precedent	50
§1.8	Authoritativeness of Judicial Interpretations	51
§1.8.1	The Supreme Court's Interpretations as Law	52
§1.8.2	Binding Effect on Other Courts	54
§1.8.3	Binding Effect on Nonjudicial Officials	55

Chapter 2 Congressional Power to Limit the Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court and Inferior Federal Courts 63

§2.1	Introduction and Overview	63
§2.2	The Power to Make Exceptions to the Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court	65
§2.2.1	Defining the Scope of the Exceptions Power	66
	The Traditional or Plenary Power View	66
	Mandatory Interpretations	66
	Historical Practice	67
	Precedent	69
§2.2.2	Structural Limits on Exercises of the Exceptions Power	70
§2.2.3	External Limits on Exercises of the Exceptions Power	75
§2.2.4	A Comment on Ambiguities in the Jurisprudence of the Exceptions Clause	77
§2.3	The Power to Create Article III Courts Inferior to the Supreme Court	77
§2.3.1	Defining the Power to Constitute Inferior Tribunals	78

Contents

§2.3.2	The Implicit Authority to Regulate Jurisdiction	80
§2.3.3	Structural Limits on the Power to Create Inferior Tribunals	82
§2.3.4	External Limits on the Power to Create Inferior Tribunals	86
§2.4	The Power to Create Non-Article III Courts	86
§2.4.1	The Argument Against Non-Article III Courts	86
§2.4.2	The Justification for Non-Article III Courts	87
§2.4.3	Territorial Courts	88
§2.4.4	Military Courts	89
§2.4.5	Adjunct Courts	89
§2.4.6	The Public Rights Exception: Original Form	93
§2.4.7	The Public Rights Exception: Modern Form	95

Chapter 3 Justiciability 99

§3.1	Introduction and Overview	99
§3.2	The Elements of a Case or Controversy	101
§3.2.1	Constitutional Minimum Applied: Advisory Opinions and Collusive Suits	102
§3.2.2	Constitutional Minimum Applied: Declaratory Relief	104
§3.2.3	Constitutional Minimum Applied: Supreme Court Review of State Decisions	105
§3.3	Prudential Considerations: Beyond the Constitutional Minimum	105
§3.4	The Standing Doctrine	107
§3.4.1	Injury-in-Fact	108
	The Problem of Future Harm	114
§3.4.2	Causation	118
§3.4.3	Redressability	121
	General Federal and State Taxpayer Standing	125
§3.4.4	The Prohibition Against Generalized Grievances	127
	Taxpayer Standing and the Establishment Clause	129
§3.4.5	The Rule Against Third-Party Standing	132
§3.4.6	The Zone of Interests Test	139
§3.4.7	Organizational Standing	141

Contents

§3.4.8	Legislative Standing	143
§3.4.9	The Curious Cases of <i>United States v. Windsor</i> and <i>Hollingsworth v. Perry</i>	145
§3.5	The Timeline of Justiciability: The Ripeness and Mootness Doctrines	149
§3.6	Ripeness Applied	151
§3.7	Mootness Applied, and Variations	154
§3.7.1	Collateral Consequences	156
§3.7.2	Wrongs Capable of Repetition yet Evading Review	158
§3.7.3	Voluntary Cessation	158
§3.7.4	Class Actions	160
§3.8	The Political Question Doctrine	161

Chapter 4 Special Limitations on Judicial Review of State Laws 171

§4.1	Introduction and Overview	171
§4.2	The Eleventh Amendment	171
§4.2.1	The Eleventh Amendment and Sovereign Immunity	171
§4.2.2	Suits Filed by the United States	175
§4.2.3	Suits Filed by Another State	176
§4.2.4	Bankruptcy Proceedings	177
§4.2.5	Supreme Court Review of State Court Decisions	177
§4.2.6	The Stripping Doctrine	178
	<i>Ex parte Young</i> and the Fiction of Stripping	178
	Designating the Proper Defendant	181
	Prospective versus Retroactive Relief	182
	Holding Officials Personally Liable in Damages	184
	No Stripping for State Law Claims	190
	Congressional Restriction of the Stripping Doctrine	191
§4.2.7	Suits Against Governmental Entities and Officials	193
	Classifying a Governmental Entity	194
	Stating a Cause of Action: §1983	196
	Suing Federal Officials	198
§4.2.8	Congressional Abrogation	199
§4.2.9	State Waiver by Consent to Suit	204
§4.2.10	The Eleventh Amendment Anomaly	206
§4.3	The Siler Doctrine	208
§4.4	The Pullman Doctrine	210

Contents

§4.5	The Younger Doctrine	213
§4.5.1	The Basic Doctrine	213
§4.5.2	“Pending” State Proceedings	215
§4.5.3	The Nature of the State Proceedings	218
	Proceedings of a Judicial Nature	219
	Implicating Important State Interests	220
§4.5.4	Opportunity to Raise the Federal Claim in the State Proceeding	222
§4.5.5	Exceptions to the Younger Doctrine	223
	Bad Faith or Harassment	223
	Patently Unconstitutional	224
	Extraordinary Circumstances	224
§4.5.6	Returning to Federal Court	224
§4.6	Common Law Immunity	226

Chapter 5 The Powers of the National Government 229

§5.1	Introduction and Overview	229
§5.2	The Necessary and Proper Clause	231
§5.3	The Power over Interstate Commerce	235
§5.3.1	A Brief History of Commerce Clause Jurisprudence	236
§5.3.2	The Modern Law of the Commerce Clause	241
§5.3.3	The Commerce Clause and Civil Rights	248
§5.3.4	Closer Judicial Scrutiny: <i>Lopez</i> and <i>Morrison</i>	250
§5.3.5	Regulating Commercial “Inactivity”	257
§5.4	The Power to Tax and Spend	261
§5.4.1	What Constitutes a Tax for Purposes of the Taxing Power?	262
	The “Some Revenue” Test	263
	Is the Law Penal or Prohibitory?	263
§5.4.2	Specific Limitations on the Power to Tax	267
	The Requirement of Uniformity	268
	Direct Taxes and Proportionality	268
	Prohibition on Taxes or Duties Laid on Exports	269
§5.4.3	What Constitutes an Expenditure for Purposes of the Spending Power?	269
	Regulatory Spending	270
	Unconstitutional Conditions	272
	Spending Directed Toward the States	274
	Regulatory Authority Over Third Parties	278
§5.5	The Power over Foreign Affairs	279