

Social Housing, Disadvantage and Neighbourhood Liveability

Ten years of change in social
housing neighbourhoods

Edited by
Michelle Norris



Housing and Society Series

SOCIAL HOUSING, DISADVANTAGE AND NEIGHBOURHOOD LIVEABILITY

Ten years of change in social
housing neighbourhoods

Edited by Michelle Norris

First edition published 2014
by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

and by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2014 selection and editorial material, Michelle Norris

The right of Michelle Norris to be identified as author of the editorial material, and of the individual authors as authors of their contributions, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Social housing, disadvantage, and neighbourhood liveability : ten years of change in social housing neighbourhoods / edited by Michelle Norris.

pages cm.—(Housing and society series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Public housing—Ireland. 2. Housing policy—Ireland. 3. Crime in public housing—Ireland. 4. Ireland—Social policy. I. Norris, Michelle.

HD7288.78.I73S658 2014

363.5'8509416—dc23

2013018106

ISBN13: 978-0-415-81639-7 (hbk)

ISBN13: 978-0-415-81640-3 (pbk)

ISBN13: 978-0-203-44085-8 (ebk)

Typeset in Bembo

by RefineCatch Limited, Bungay, Suffolk

SOCIAL HOUSING, DISADVANTAGE AND NEIGHBOURHOOD LIVEABILITY

In a groundbreaking study carried out in the late 1990s, researchers studied seven similar social housing neighbourhoods in Ireland to determine what factors affected their liveability. In this collection of essays, the same researchers return to these neighbourhoods ten years later to see what's changed. Are these neighbourhoods now more liveable or leaveable?

Social Housing, Disadvantage and Neighbourhood Liveability examines the major national and local developments that affected these neighbourhoods: the Celtic Tiger boom, area-based interventions, and reforms in social housing management. Additionally, the book examines changes in the culture of social housing through studies of crime within social housing, changes in public service delivery, and media reporting on social housing.

Michelle Norris is a Senior Lecturer in social policy at the School of Applied Social Science, University College Dublin. In 2010 she was appointed to the National Economic and Social Council, which advises the Irish government on social and economic policy, and in 2011 she was appointed as chair of the board of the Housing Finance Agency, which finances housing for low-income households in Ireland. She also convenes the Comparative Housing Working Group of the European Network for Housing Research (ENHR).

Housing and society series

Edited by Ray Forrest, School for Policy Studies,
University of Bristol

This series aims to situate housing within its wider social, political and economic context at both national and international level. In doing so it will draw on the full range of social science disciplines and on mainstream debate on the nature of contemporary social change. The books are intended to appeal to an international academic audience as well as to practitioners and policymakers – to be theoretically informed and policy relevant.

Housing Young People

Edited by Ray Forrest and Ngai-Ming Yip

Beyond Home Ownership

Edited by Richard Ronald and Marja Elsinga

Housing Disadvantaged People?

Jane Ball

Women and Housing

Edited by Patricia Kennett and Chan Kam Wah

Affluence, Mobility and Second Home Ownership

Chris Paris

Housing, Markets and Policy

Peter Malpass and Rob Rowlands

Housing and Health in Europe

Edited by David Ormandy

The Hidden Millions

Graham Tipple and Suzanne Speak

Housing, Care and Inheritance

Misa Izuhara

Housing and Social Transition in Japan

Edited by Yosuke Hirayama and Richard Ronald

Housing Transformations

Shaping the space of 21st century living

Bridget Franklin

Housing and Social Policy

Contemporary themes and critical perspectives

Edited by Peter Somerville with Nigel Sprigings

Housing and Social Change

East–West perspectives

Edited by Ray Forrest and James Lee

Urban Poverty, Housing and Social Change in China

Ya Ping Wang

Gentrification in a Global Context

Edited by Rowland Atkinson and Gary Bridge

FIGURES, IMAGES AND TABLES

Figures

1.1	Social housing output and sales to tenants in Ireland, 1996–2007	7
2.1	Irish GNI per capita based on purchasing power parity (PPP), 1996–2006	26
2.2	Distribution of absolute Pobal HP Deprivation Index scores, 1991, 1996, 2002, and 2006	27

Images

1.1	Locations of the seven case study neighbourhoods	13
2.1	Map of the electoral divisions in which the case study neighbourhoods are located	25
3.1	Fatima Mansions in 2004	42
3.2	A settled, well-kept part of Moyross in 2004	44
3.3	Fatima Mansions following its demolition and reconstruction in 2004–8	46
3.4	A section of Cranmore after its refurbishment in 2000–1	46
3.5	The ‘Bury my Heart in Fatima’ festival	50

Tables

1.1	Characteristics of the seven case study neighbourhoods	14
2.1	Relative Pobal HP Deprivation Index scores for the seven case study neighbourhoods and nationwide, 1996, 2002, and 2006	29
2.2	Population change in the seven case study neighbourhoods and nationwide, 1996, 2002, and 2006	32
2.3	Lone parent rate in the seven case study neighbourhoods and nationwide, 1996, 2002, and 2006	33

2.4	Proportion of adult population with primary education only in the seven case study neighbourhoods and nationwide, 1996, 2002, and 2006	35
2.5	Proportion of adult population with third-level education in the seven case study neighbourhoods and nationwide, 1996, 2002, and 2006	36
2.6	Male and female unemployment in the seven case study neighbourhoods and nationwide, 1996, 2002, and 2006	37
2.7	Social (local authority) and private (for profit) renting households in the seven case study neighbourhoods and nationwide, 1996, 2002, and 2006	38
4.1	Results of local authority housing service performance monitoring, 2004, 2006	77
6.1	Remit, implementation, and spatial targeting of area-based interventions, 1990–2006	105
6.2	Central government expenditure on area-based interventions, 1996, 2006	111
6.3	Targeting and impact of strongly spatially targeted area-based interventions, 1996–2006	117
7.1	Number and funding sources of area-based interventions by estate	131
7.2	Services funded by area-based interventions in Cranmore, 2006	132
7.3	Services funded by area-based interventions in Deanrock, 2006	134
7.4	Services funded by area-based interventions in Fatima Mansions, 2006	135
7.5	Services funded by area-based interventions in Moyross, 2006	137
7.6	Current public expenditure on area-based initiatives in four estates, 2006	142
8.1	Implementation arrangements for national drugs strategy	163
8.2	Drugs programme expenditure, 2006	167
9.1	Level of social order in the seven case study neighbourhoods 1997–8 and 2007–9	175

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the result of contributions made by numerous people over a long period. These contributors are too many to name individually but the authors would like to collectively thank all of the residents and service providers in the seven case study neighbourhoods who were interviewed during the 1997–8 and 2007–9 rounds of fieldwork and were so open and honest in your views and generous with your time. We hope that we have represented your views accurately in the book and painted a fair and balanced picture of life in the neighbourhoods where you live.

The authors would like to thank the following people who made a central contribution to the completion of the fieldwork on which the book draws:

- 1 Catherine Anne Field (University College Dublin) conducted fieldwork in Fettercairn and Fatima Mansions, Dublin and acted as project coordinator during the 2007–9 phase of the study; Jackie O'Toole (Institute of Technology, Sligo) conducted most of the fieldwork on Cranmore, Sligo; and Alan Egan conducted the fieldwork in Deanrock, Cork during this phase.
- 2 Kathleen O'Higgins (formerly of the Economic and Social Research Institute), Ruirá McAuliffe and Séamus Ó'Cinnéide (both formerly of NUI Maynooth) and Dónal Guerin (Cork City Council) who contributed to the fieldwork and write up of phase one of the study in 1997–8.
- 3 Joe Donoghue (Fatima Groups United) and John Whyte (Fatima Regeneration Board and F2 Centre) who provided us with information on Fatima Mansions during both phases of the study and helped us access interviewees in that neighbourhood during both rounds of fieldwork.
- 4 Paddy Flannery and Martin Sinnott (Moyross Community Enterprise Centre), Chris Sheridan (Health Service Executive), Anne Kavanagh and Helen Fitzgerald (Paul Partnership), and Kieran Lehane (Limerick City Council)

who provided us with information on Moyross and helped us access interviews there in 2007–9.

- 5 The following people who took the photos included in the book: Matt Kavanagh (3.1, 3.3), Brenda Fitzsimons (3.2), and Chris Maguire (3.5). Thanks also to Clúid Housing Association, which contributed Image 3.4.

In addition, we would like to acknowledge the contribution of the organisations that funded the research. The first phase of the research was undertaken on the initiative of the Katherine Howard Foundation, which also provided substantial funding. The Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government, the Combat Poverty Agency and Area Development Management also contributed funding for the first phase. By 2007–9 the Combat Poverty Agency had been amalgamated into the Department of Social Protection and Area Development Management had been renamed Pobal, but both organisations repeated their funding for the second phase of the research in their new guises, as did the Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government.

Parts of Chapter 4 were originally published in M. Norris and C. O'Connell (2010) 'Social Housing Management, Governance and Delivery in Ireland: Ten Years of Reform on Seven Estates', *Housing Studies*, 25 (3).

CONTRIBUTORS

Mary P. Corcoran is Professor of Sociology at the National University of Ireland, Maynooth, where she is also a research associate at the National Institute for Regional and Spatial Analysis (NIRSA). She is a graduate of Trinity College, Dublin and Columbia University, New York. Her research and teaching interests lie primarily in the fields of urban sociology, public culture, and the sociology of migration. The author of numerous scholarly articles and reports, in recent years she has co-authored *A Sociology of Ireland* (fourth edition, 2012, with Perry Share and Brian Conway) and *Suburban Affiliations: Social Relations in the Greater Dublin Area* (2010, co-author with Jane Gray and Michel Peillon) and co-edited *Reflections on crisis: the role of the public intellectual* (2012, with Kevin Lalor) and *Ireland of the Illusions: a sociological chronicle 2007–2008* (2010 with Perry Share).

Eoin Devereux is Senior Lecturer in Sociology at the University of Limerick. With research and teaching interests in both economic and cultural sociology, Eoin's work has focused on the theme of media representations of class and other social inequalities. He is the author of the academic bestseller *Understanding the Media* (second edition) and the editor of *Media studies: Key issues and debates*, both published by Sage in 2007. Other publications include the co-edited book *Morrissey: Fandom, representations and identities* (2011, co-authored with A. Dillane and M. Power) and 'Behind The Headlines: Media Coverage of Social Exclusion in Limerick city – The Case of Moyross' in N. Hourigan (ed.) *Understanding Limerick: Social Exclusion and Change* (2011, co-authored with A. Haynes and M. Power).

Tony Fahey is Professor of Social Policy at University College Dublin. His research deals with a range of issues connected to social policy in Ireland and the European Union, including family dynamics, housing, poverty, and spatial aspects

of disadvantage and of policy responses to disadvantage. Current projects include a detailed analysis of family well-being in Ireland based on the data from the Growing Up in Ireland survey and an international study on the impact of social inequalities on family patterns in European countries.

Catherine Anne Field is a Lecturer in public health in the National University of Ireland, Galway. She co-ordinated the 2007–2009 phase of this study and also conducted the fieldwork on a number of the case study neighbourhoods.

Trutz Haase has been an independent social and economic consultant since 1995. Previously, he worked for the Northern Ireland Economic Research Centre (Belfast), the Combat Poverty Agency (Dublin) and the Educational Research Centre at St. Patrick's College (Dublin). Throughout his work as a consultant, he has been responsible for the design and implementation of monitoring and evaluation frameworks for government programmes aimed at alleviating poverty, as well as developing resource allocation models to target social expenditure on the basis of objective need criteria. In this capacity, he has worked for a number of Irish government ministries, municipalities, and non-governmental agencies. He is best known for his work on the development of the Pobal HP Deprivation Index, which features in the National Spatial Strategy and the current Regional and Local Development Plans. Work outside the Republic of Ireland includes studies for the Northern Ireland Statistics and Research Agency, Special EU Programmes Body, International Fund for Ireland, OECD and European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction.

Amanda Haynes is a Lecturer in sociology at the University of Limerick. Her research interests centre on the analysis of discursive constructions as processes of exclusion and strategies for inclusion and include a particular interest in their relationship to inequalities in status, treatment, and material conditions on the basis of ethnicity, racism, citizenship, and social class. Her publications include 'Class Invisibility and Stigmatisation: Irish Media Coverage of a Public Housing Project in Limerick' in C. Pascale (ed.) *Social Inequality and the Politics of Representation: A Global Landscape* (2012, co-authored with M. Power and E. Devereux); 'Why Bother Seeing the World for Real? Google Street View and the Representation of a Stigmatised Neighbourhood' in *New Media and Society* (2013, co-authored with M.J. Power, P. Neville, E. Devereux, and C. Barnes); 'At the edge: Media constructions of a stigmatised Irish housing estate' in *Journal of Housing and the Built Environment* (2011, co-authored with E. Devereux and M.J. Power); and 'Mass Media Re-Presentations of the Social World: Ethnicity and "Race"' in E. Devereux (ed.) *Media Studies: Key Issues and Debates* (2007).

Eileen Humphreys is a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Institute for the Study of Knowledge in Society (ISKS) at the University of Limerick. She has worked in public policy research or consultancy since 1986 on social capital in local communities

of place (urban and rural); social aspects of urban regeneration (education, labour market); and health inequalities. Working within a neighbourhood-based analytical framework, current or recent research includes: outcomes for children and families; health inequalities in ageing populations in urban neighbourhoods; evaluation of area-based regeneration. She has worked extensively on programmes supported by EU Structural Funds, which adopt a local development approach.

Des McCafferty is Professor and Head of the Department of Geography in Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick, and a research associate of the National Institute for Regional and Spatial Analysis. His research interests lie in urban geography, with a particular focus on issues of residential segregation, urban poverty and disadvantage, and area-based measures to combat exclusion, and he has participated in both Irish and European research projects in these areas. Recent work includes a report (co-authored with Eileen Humphreys and Ann Higgins) on children and families in Limerick's regeneration estates, which was commissioned by Limerick city Children's Services Committee. He has served, on election, as President of the Geographical Society of Ireland and as Chairman of the Irish Branch of the Regional Studies Association.

Michelle Norris is a Senior Lecturer in social policy at the School of Applied Social Science, University College Dublin. Her research interests centre on social housing management and finance, urban regeneration in Ireland, and also on comparative analysis of these policy fields across the European Union. She has led over 20 research projects on these issues since 2000 and produced 50 publications on the results and her work had a significant impact on housing policy in Ireland. In 2010 she was appointed to the National Economic and Social Council, which advises the Irish government on social and economic policy, and in 2011 she was appointed as chair of the board of the Housing Finance Agency, which finances housing for low-income households in Ireland. She also convenes the Comparative Housing Working Group of the European Network for Housing Research (ENHR) with Professor Mark Stephens of Herriot Watt University, Edinburgh.

Cathal O'Connell is a Senior Lecturer in social policy at the School of Applied Social Studies, University College Cork. His research and teaching interests centre on the development of Irish social policy, housing policy, and social housing management. His recent publications include: *The State and Housing in Ireland* (2007, Nova Press); 'Citizenship and Social Exclusion in Limerick', in N. Hourigan (ed.) *Understanding Limerick: Social Exclusion and Change* (Cork University Press, 2011); and 'Social Housing Management, Governance and Delivery in Ireland: Ten Years of Reform on Seven Estates', *Housing Studies*, 25(10), 317–34 (with M. Norris).

Aileen O'Gorman is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow in the School of Applied Social Science, University College Dublin. Her research interests include drug use, drug markets, and drugs policy; inequality and spatialised social exclusion; community

development and community activism; the interplay between social, crime, drug, and urban policies; area-based initiatives and regeneration; research methodologies and community/participatory research. She is author of a number of commissioned research studies, has published in international journals and presented her work at national and international conferences. She has worked as a researcher in a variety of university, government, media, and community settings including the National Advisory Committee on Drugs, Ireland; the Centre for Urban and Community Research, Goldsmiths College, University of London; the Drug Indicators Project, Birkbeck College, University of London; *the Daily Telegraph*, London; and Fatima Mansions, Dublin. She is a member of the European Society for Social Drugs Research; has provided drugs research training programmes in Ireland and Europe; has participated in a number of expert working groups for the European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction; and is a member of the editorial board of the international journal *Drugs, Education, Prevention and Policy*.

Martin J. Power is a Lecturer in sociology at the University of Limerick, Ireland. With a specific focus on the sociology of urban regeneration, his research interests include social class, inequality and social exclusion, and neo-liberalism and the retraction of the welfare state. His publications include 'Tarring everyone with the same shorthand? Journalists, stigmatization & social exclusion' in *Journalism: Theory, Practice and Criticism* (2012, co-authored with E. Devereux and A. Haynes); 'Exploring the "learning careers" of Irish undergraduate Sociology students through the establishment of a Sociology Student Journal' in *Teaching Sociology* (2012, co-authored with P. Neville, A. Haynes, E. Devereux, and C. Barnes); and 'Internalising Discourses of Parental Blame: Voices from the Field' in *Studies in the Maternal – Special Edition on Austerity Parenting* (2012, co-authored with C. Barnes).

GLOSSARY

ABIs	Area-based interventions – publicly funded programmes aimed at combating disadvantage in neighbourhoods that are targeted on the basis that they are identified as disadvantaged.
ALMP	Active labour market programmes – measures to enable long-term benefit claimants to gain skills and network with potential employers, which will help them make the transition back into the mainstream labour market.
CCTV	Closed-circuit television.
CE	Community Employment – the principal ALMP in the seven case study neighbourhoods at the time of writing. It pays a small additional stipend to benefit recipients in return for part-time work on social projects and also provides training.
CLÁR	Ceantair Laga Árd-Riachtanais – Gaelic title, which translates as ‘impaired high-need areas’, this programme directs public expenditure to the most disadvantaged rural areas of Ireland.
DEIS	Delivering Equality of Opportunity in Schools – a public programme that aims to overcome educational disadvantage by additional investment in schools selected on the basis that they have a disadvantaged student body.
ED	Electoral Division – small areas into which census data can be disaggregated.
EOCP	Equal Opportunities Childcare Programme – a public programme to provide childcare to enable parents to return to education or employment. The programme ran from 2000 to 2006.

Garda (plural Gardaí)	Irish police force.
GDP	Gross Domestic Product.
GNI	Gross National Income.
Guards	Informal name for the Irish police force.
GYDP	Garda Youth Diversion Projects – community-based projects run by the Gardaí that aim to help young people move away from behaviour that might get them into trouble with the law.
LDSIP	Local Development and Social Inclusion Programme – funding programme for area-based initiatives in Ireland.
LDTFs	Local Drug Task Forces – area-based initiatives established in neighbourhoods where heroin use is most prevalent.
LES	Local Employment Service – area-based intervention that aims to promote the reintegration of long-term unemployed people into the workforce.
MABS	Money Advice and Budgeting Service – a state-funded debt and financial management advice service.
NDS	National Drugs Strategy – national strategy statement on illegal drug use first introduced to cover the period 2001–8 and renewed for 2009–16.
NESC	National Economic and Social Council – a national corporatist body that advises the Irish government on economic and social policy issues.
PHDI	Pobal Haase–Pratschke Deprivation Index – created by Trutz Haase and Jonathan Pratschke (Haase and Pratschke 2008).
POBAL	A not-for-profit company with charitable status set up by government for the purpose of managing programmes for government and the EU.
RAPID	Revitalising Areas by Planning, Investment and Development – a local development programme, targeting deprived urban neighbourhoods.
RDTFs	Regional Drug Task Forces – programmes with a similar structure and remit to the LDTFs, but covering larger areas (regions, rather than city neighbourhoods or towns).
RTÉ	Radio Telefís Éireann – Ireland's national television and radio broadcaster.
Social Partnership	The corporatist system of policy making that was influential in Ireland during the period under examination in this book.
Taoiseach	Irish prime minister.

CONTENTS

<i>Figures, images and tables</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Contributors</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Glossary</i>	<i>xix</i>

1 Introduction 1

Tony Fahey, Michelle Norris and Catherine Anne Field

Introduction 1

Themes 2

From original study to follow-up 5

International research context: differentiation and liveability 8

Research design 13

Structure of the book 19

References 19

2 Changing disadvantage in social housing: a multi-level analysis 23

Trutz Haase

Introduction 23

The Pobal HP Deprivation Index 23

The national context: unprecedented economic growth and social change 24

Disadvantage in the seven neighbourhoods 28

Interpreting changing disadvantage in the seven neighbourhoods 31

Conclusions 39

References 40