

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW OF CANADA

Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms

THIRD EDITION

MAGNET

VOLUME 2

A CARSWELL STUDENT EDITION

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW OF CANADA

Cases, Notes and Materials

Third Edition

by

JOSEPH ELIOT MAGNET

B.A., LL.B., LL.M., PH.D.

of the Ontario Bar

Professor of Law

University of Ottawa

VOLUME 2

CARSWELL

Toronto • Calgary • Vancouver

1987

Canadian Cataloguing in Publication Data

Magnet, Joseph Eliot
Constitutional law of Canada

3rd ed.

Partial contents: v. 2. Canadian charter of rights and freedoms.

ISBN 0-459-30921-8 (v. 2. : bound)

ISBN 0-459-30931-5 (v. 2. : pbk.)

1. Canada — Constitutional law — Cases. I. Title.

KE4216.3.M33 1987

342.71

C87-094708-7

Books by Joseph Eliot Magnet

Constitutional Law of Canada: Cases, Notes and Materials, Volume 2, 3rd edition
(Toronto: Carswell, 1987)

Withholding Treatment from Defective Newborn Children (Montreal: Editions
Blais, 1985)

Constitutional Law of Canada: Cases, Notes and Materials, 2nd edition (Toronto:
Carswell, 1985)

Constitutional Law of Canada: Cases, Notes and Materials, Supplement (Toronto:
Carswell, 1984)

Constitutional Law of Canada: Cases, Notes and Materials (Toronto: Carswell, 1983)

Implementing Official Bilingualism in Manitoba: A Case Study (Winnipeg:
SFM, 1982)

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, or stored in any retrieval system of any nature, without the written permission of the copyright holder and the publisher, application for which shall be made to the publisher.

Copyright © 1987
The Carswell Company Limited

FOR

Calypso, Circe, Minerva, Penelope

מִיָּנָאת הַנְּשִׁקָּה בְּמִשְׁחַר יָפָה כְּלָבָה
בָּרָה בַּחֲמָה אִמָּה כְּנֻזְלוֹת:

— Song of Solomon

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author is grateful to the following persons and organizations for permission to reproduce materials from the sources indicated below. Every effort has been made to secure permission for the reproduction of copyright material in this text. If any acknowledgements have been inadvertently overlooked, the publishers will gladly rectify these oversights in subsequent editions.

Application of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms

in *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms: Commentary*

K. Swinton

Human Rights Research and Education Centre

Canada's System of Official Bilingualism: Constitutional Guarantees for the Legislative Process

Joseph E. Magnet

Ottawa Law Review

The Charter of Rights and Freedoms — An Introduction

W.W. Black

Comment

Kushner

Canadian Bar Review

The Constitution Act, 1982 and Aboriginal Peoples

D. Sanders

Constitutional Choices

Tribe

Harvard University Press

The Constitutional Guarantee of Aboriginal and Treaty Rights

B. Slattery

Queen's Law Journal

Employment Equality: A Systemic Approach

William R. Black

Human Rights Research and Education Centre, University of Ottawa

The Equality Rights in the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms

W. Tarnopolsky

Canadian Bar Review

Freedom of Association under the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms

M. Bendel

Groups and the Equal Protection Clause

O. Fiss

Philosophy and Public Affairs Review, Princeton University Press

Handbook of Free Speech and Free Press

J.A. Barron

C.T. Dienes

Little, Brown & Co.

Interpreting the Charter — Use of the Earlier Versions as an Aid

Robin Elliot

University of British Columbia Law Review

Intervention and Amicus Curiae Status in Charter Litigation

J. Swan (from *Charter Litigation*, R.J. Sharpe ed.)

Butterworths of Canada Ltd.

An Introduction to Mobility Rights

S. Rodgers

Is the Private Sector Affected by the Charter?

J.D. Whyte (from *Righting the Balance — Canada's New Equality Rights*, Smith ed.)

The Canadian Human Rights Reporter Inc.

The Law of the Charter: General Principles

Dale Gibson

Carswell Co. Ltd.

Mobility Rights — An Update

Sanda Rodgers

The Modernization of Quebec and the Legitimacy of the Canadian State

in *Modernization and the Canadian State*

H. Guindon

MacMillan of Canada

Monetary Redress for Charter Infringement

M.L. Pilkington (from *Charter Litigation*, R.J. Sharpe ed.)

Butterworths of Canada Ltd.

A Neighbour's Reflections on Equality Rights

in *Righting the Balance: Canada's New Equality Rights*

K. Greenawalt

Note on St. Jean v. R.

G.E. Sheiner

Lynch & Associates, Ottawa

Note on Washington v. Davies

W.W. Black

Obscenity and Censorship Re-examined under the Charter of Rights

C. Beckton
Manitoba Law Journal

Political Freedom

A. Meiklejohn

The Presumption of Constitutionality

Joseph E. Magnet
Osgoode Hall Law Journal

Reckless Disregard: Westmoreland v. C.B.C.; Sharon v. Time

Renata Adler
Dworkin (Book Review)
The New York Review of Books

The Rights of Assembly and Association (2nd ed.)

G. Abernathy
University of South Carolina Press

Self-Incrimination and the Charter

D.N. Paciocco

Speech and Crime

Kent Greenawalt
American Bar Foundation Research Journal

Standing and the Charter: Rights and Indemnity

W.A. Bogart (from *Charter Litigation*, R.J. Sharpe ed.)

The System of Freedom of Expression

T.I. Emerson
Random House

Toward a General Theory of the First Amendment

T.I. Emerson
Random House

I owe special debts of gratitude to my friends, **Jay Holsten, Marc Cousineau, Leslie Kelleher, Cheryl Emberly and Deborah Glendinning** for steady, imaginative and energetic research assistance. Many thanks.

Joseph E. Magnet
1987

TABLE OF CASES

Names of cases substantially reproduced in the text, with the corresponding page number, are set in bold face type

- Abate v. Mundt 476
 Abbate v. United States 766
 Abrams v. U.S. 294
 Adams v. United States 634
 Adams v. Williams 599
 Alta. Human Rights Comm. v. Alta. Blue Cross Plan 568
 Alta. Legislation, Ref re 295, **298**, 304, 366, 414
 Alliance des Professeurs de Montréal v. Québec (P.G.) 181
 Altun v. Germany 548
 Aluminum Co. of Canada Ltd. and R., Re; Dofasco Inc., Intervenor 832
 Amalgamated Food Employees Union Local 590 v. Logan Valley Plaza, Inc. 421, 422
 Amato v. R. 177
 Amax Potash Ltd. v. Government of Saskatchewan 4
 Amendment of Constitution of Canada (Nos. 1, 2 and 3), Reference re 951
 Amer. Cyanamid Co. v. Ethicon Ltd. 97, 464
 An Act to Amend the Education Act, Ref. re 9, **21**
Andrews v. Law Soc. of B.C. 812, 836
 Anti-Inflation Act, Re 41, 209
Apsit and Man. Human Rights Comm., Re 851
Argentina (Republic) v. Mellino 129, 549, **696**
 Arrowsmith v. U.K. 190
Assn. des Gens de l'Air du Qué. Inc. v. Lang 853, 905
 Assn. des Gens de l'Air du Qué. Inc. v. Min. of Transportation 853
 Attorney-General ex rel. Allen v. Colchester Borough Council 858
 A.G. Alta. v. A.G. Can. 882
 A.G. B.C. v. Smith 381
 Attorney General of Canada v. Canadian National Transportation Ltd. 42
 A.-G. Can. et al. v. Dupond et al. (sub nom. Dupond v. City of Montreal) 414
 A.G. Can. v. Lavell 820
 Attorney-General for Manitoba v. Attorney-General for Canada 525, 951
 A.G. Man. v. Forest 878
 A.-G. N.S. et al. v. MacIntyre 384, 390
 A.G. Ont. v. A.G. Can. 870, 896
 A.G. Ont. v. Reale 890
 A.-G. Que. et al. v. Farrah et al. 860
 A.G. Que. v. Que. Assn. of Protestant Sch. Bds. 98, 819, **942**, 968
 Authority of Parliament in relation to the Upper House, Re 42
 Avery v. Midland County, Tex. 470, 473, 474, 475, 476, 479
 Balderstone v. R. 529
 Balderstone and R., Re 179
 Baldwin v. G.A.F. Seelig 519
 Bank of Toronto v. Lambe 299
 Barker v. Wingo 109, 676, 688, 694
 Barr v. Mateo 346
 Bartkus v. Illinois 766
 Bater v. Bater 253
Bates v. State Bar of Arizona 333, 336
Batsos v. Laval 159
Beauharnais v. Illinois 361, 367
 Belgoma Tpt. Ltd. v. Dir. of Employment Standards 568
 Belhumeur v. Discipline Committee of Quebec Bar Ass'n et al. 659, 666
 Bell v. Hood 149
Bertram S. Miller Ltd. v. R. 157
 Bhindi v. B.C. Projectionists, Loc. 348 44, **72**, 76
 Bigelow v. Virginia 330
 Bird and Peebles and The Queen 118
Bivens v. Six Unknown Federal Narcotics Agents 149, 153
 Black v. Law Soc. of Alta. 439, **509**
Blaikie v. Quebec (A.G.) 871, 878
 Blainey, Re 836
 Blainey v. Ont. Hockey Assn. 67
 Bd. of Education v. Barnette 258
 Board of Regents of State Colleges v. Roth 530, 533, 540
 Bolling v. Sharpe 801
 Boucher v. R. 294, 366
 Boudreau v. R. 176
Branzberg v. Hayes 372
 B.C. Motor Vehicle Act, Re 541, 776
B.C.T.F. v. British Columbia (A.G.) 92
 Brodie v. R. 316
 Braunfeld v. Brown 260, 273
 Brownridge v. R. 636
 Buckley v. Valeo 304

- Burnette v. Davis 480
 Burns v. Richardson 478, 480, 484
 Butz v. Economou 153
 Byars v. United States 151

 C.A.E. Aircraft Ltd. v. Canadian Commercial Corp. 95
C.L.C. and Bhindi, Re 88
 Calder v. A.G. B.C. 972
 California v. Beheler 628
 California v. Westcott 838
 Canada v. Schmidt 696
C.N.R. v. Cdn. Human Rights Comm. 845
Can. Newspapers Co. v. Canada (A.G.) 90, 383
 Cantwell v. Connecticut 345, 362
Carlson v. Green 152
 Caron v. R. 299
Carter v. R. 686
 Cat Productions Ltd. v. Macedo 67
Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp. v. Public Service Comm. of New York 328, 338, 339
 Channel Seven T.V. Ltd. v. N.A.B.E.T. 295
 Chaplinsky v. New Hampshire 325
Cherneskey v. Armadale Publishers Ltd. 291
 Chesapeake & Ohio Ry. Co. v. Ball 97
 Christie v. Leachinsky 641
 Chromiak v. R. 164
 Cipriano v. City of Houma 474
Clarkson v. R. 106, 164, 632, 636
Cohen v. California 324, 401
 Colegrove v. Green 490
 Coleman v. MacLennan 346
 College v. Niagara Regional Police Comm'n 659
 Collin v. Chicago Park District 424
Collins v. R. 418
 Collymore v. A.G. Trinidad & Tobago 439, 446
 Commission du Salaire minimum v. Bell Telephone Co. of Canada 524
 Connelly v. Director of Public Prosecutions 179
 Consolidated Edison Co. v. Public Service Comm'n 406
 Connolly v. Director of Public Prosecutions 751
 Cox v. Louisiana 421
Cox v. New Hampshire 404, 406, 408, 409
 Crain (R.L.) Inc. v. Couture 90, 711
Crossman v. R. 156
 Cunningham v. Tomey Homma 512, 514, 516
 Curr v. The Queen 6

 Dallas County, Alabama v. Reese 478
 Damus et al. v. Board of Trustees of St. Boniface School Division No. 4 et al. 967
 Danson v. Ontario (A.G.) 90
 Davidson and Disciplinary Board of Prison for Women and King, Re 663
Delaware v. Prouse 595
Demaere v. Canada 506

 Dennis v. United States 806
Deutsch v. L.S.U.C. Legal Aid Fund 727
Dick v. R. 523
 Dickie v. Florida 689, 693
 Dillon et al. v. Municipal Court for Monterey-Carmel Judicial District of Monterey County 417
 Director of Public Prosecutions v. Humphrys 178
Dubois v. R. 703, 709, 732
 Dudgeon v. U.K. 188
 Duke v. The Queen 44, 534, 544
 Dupond v. City of Montreal 241
Dumas v. Leclerc Institute 652
 Duncan v. Louisiana 689
 Dusch v. Davis 478, 484

 Education Act of Ontario and Minority Language Education Rights, Ref. re, 246, **946**, 968
 Edwards v. Attorney-General for Canada 6, 381, 870
 Edwards v. South Carolina 419, 421
 Estelle v. Gamble 153

Family Benefits Act (N.S.), S. 5, Ref re 835
 Fed. Republic of Germany v. Rauca 242
 Federal Republic of Germany and Rauca, Re 527
Finlay v. Canada (Min. of Finance) 86
 Florida v. Royer 599
 Forest v. Registrar of Court of Appeal for Manitoba 864, 865, 888
 Fort Frances Pulp & Power Co. Ltd. v. Manitoba Free Press Co. Ltd. 299
 Fortson v. Dorsey 478, 480, 484
 Fortson v. Morris 478
 Fraser v. Nova Scotia (A.G.) 303
Fraser v. P.S.S.R.B. 300, 367
 Friedman v. Rogers 339
 Furman v. Georgia 776

Gaffney v. Cummings 487
 Gallagher v. Crown Kasher Super-Market of Mass. Inc. 261
 Gambino v. United States 150
 Garland v. Torre 373
 Garrison v. Louisiana 348
 Gay Alliance Toward Equality v. The Vancouver Sun 306
 General Medical Council v. Spackman 546
 Germain v. R. 319
 Germany and Rauca, Re 52, 131, **498**, 770
Gershman Produce Co. v. Motor Transport Bd. 568
 Gertz v. Robert Welsh, Inc. 347, 355
 Ginsberg v. State of New York 323
Global Communications Ltd. and Canada (A.G.), Re; Smith, Re 130, 388
 Goldfarb v. Virginia State Bar 337
 Gooding v. Wilson 327
 Gomillion v. Lightfoot 483, 487, **489**

- Goss v. Lopez 603
 Gosselin v. The King 41
 Gould v. A.G. Can. 98, 464
 Gray v. Sanders 483
 Grayned v. City of Rockford 406, 407, 411
 Great West Saddlery Co. v. R. 299, 525
 Griggs v. Duke Power Co. 800, 804, 806
- Hadley v. Junior College District 473, 474, 475, 476
 Handyside v. U.K. 189
 Hamel v. Joseph 876
 Harrison v. Schaefer 480
Haywood Securities Inc. v. Inter-Tech Resource Group Inc. 710
 Healy v. James 424
 Heath v. Arizona 763
Heffron v. Int. Soc. for Krishna Consciousness 405, 411
 Hernandez v. Texas 486
Hicklin v. Orbeck 517
Hinds and R., Re 734
 Hogan v. R. 176, 619
Hoogbruin v. British Columbia (A.G.) 466
Howard v. Stony Mountain Institution, Presiding Officer of Inmate Disciplinary Ct. 542
 Howard and Presiding Officer of Inmate Disciplinary Court of Stony Mountain Institution, Re 662
Human Rights Comm., Can. v. Taylor 363
 Hunter v. Pittsburgh 490
 Hunter v. Southam Inc. (sub nom. Dir. of Investigation & Research, Combines Investigation Branch v. Southam Inc.) 6, 7, 12, 15, 170, 212, 221, 223, 251, 271, 555, 556, 570, 572, 581, 582, 619, 633, 705
- Information Retailers Assn. of Metro. Toronto Inc. v. Metro. Toronto (Mun.) 321**
 Information Retailers Ass'n of Metropolitan Toronto Inc. and Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto, Re 250
 Insurance Corp. of B.C. v. Heerspink 25, 27
 I.C.B.C. v. Heerspink 805
 Investors Syndicate Ltd. v. Pro-Fund Distributors Ltd. et al. 95
 Issac v. Bedard 820
- Jabour v. Law Soc. of B.C. 133, 241**
Jack v. R. 277, 980
 James, Re 666
 Jeanette Rankin Brigade v. Chief of Capital Police 420
 Jeffrey v. Black 175
 Jhirad v. Ferrandina 550, 696
 Johnson v. Ontario 90, 91
 Jolivet v. R. in Right of Can. 462, 464
 Jones v. A.G. N.B. 862, 863, 868, 892, 901, 906
 Jones v. R. 83, 262, 269, 363
- Jones v. U.S. 616
 Joplin v. Chief Constable of Vancouver Police Dept. 545
 Jurama v. R. 175
- Kask v. Shimizu 818**
 Katz v. United States 566, 567, 574, 588
 Keyes v. School Dist. No. 1 801
 Kienapple v. R. 554, 560, 750
 Klass v. Fed. Republic of Germany 189
 Klein and Law Society of Upper Canada, Re 80, 305, 338, 459
 Klopfer v. North Carolina 689
Korponay v. Canada (A.G.) 102, 106, 108, 679, 781
Krug v. R. 560, 750, 753, 760
- Lane v. Wilson 490
Language Rights under S. 23 of Manitoba Act, 1870, Ref. re 17
Laurier v. Quebec (A.G.) 866, 878
 Lavigne and Ontario Public Service Employees Union et al., Re 73, 80, 92, 297, 456
 Law v. Canada (Solicitor Gen.) 111
 Law Society of Upper Canada v. Skapinker 7, 15, 16, 43, 46, 89, 181, 212, 256, 503, 536, 555, 556, 634
 Lawless v. Ireland (No. 3) 187
 Leach v. Money et al. 580
 Lefebvre and R., Re 883
Lehman v. Shaker Heights 409
 Les Terrasses Zarolega Inc. et al. v. Olympic Installations Board 858
 Letter Carriers' Union of Canada v. Canadian Union of Postal Workers 524
 Lucas v. Colorado General Assembly 480
 Lucas v. 44th Colorado General Assembly 478
Luscher v. Dep. M.N.R. (Customs & Excise) 247
 Luscher and Deputy Minister, Revenue Canada, Customs & Excise, Re 250
- M. and R., Re 809**
 M'Culloch v. Maryland 7, 46, 573
MacDonald v. Montreal 8, 9, 862, 864, 883, 900
 McDonald and R., Re 823, 832
 McGuigan v. R. 560, 754
 MacIntyre v. A.G. N.S. 378
 MacKay v. R. 740, 824
MacKay and Legal Aid Soc. of Alta., Re 724
McKinney v. Univ. of Guelph 78, 80
 McLaughlin v. Florida 801
 McNabb v. United States 557
 McNamara Construction (Western) Ltd. v. R. 833
 Malartic Hygrade Gold Mines (Que.) Ltd. v. Quebec 180
 Malone v. U.K. 189

- Manitoba (A.G.) v. Metro Stores (MTS) Ltd.** 55, 96
Manitoba Language Rights, Ref re 878, 902, 908
 Mann v. Can. (Min. of Employment & Immigration) 212
 Marbury v. Madison 896
 Marchand v. Simcoe County Bd. of Educ. 98, 968
Marshall and R., Re 158
 Martineau v. Matsqui Inst. Inmate Disciplinary Bd. (No. 2) 535, 662
 Mercure v. A.G. Sask. 894
 Metro Stores (MTS) Ltd. v. Man. Food & Commercial Wkrs. Loc. 832 92, 94
 Meyer v. State of Nebraska 530, 538, 540
 Milk Wagon Drivers Union of Chicago, Loc. 753 v. Meadowmoor Dairies Inc. 295
 Miller and Cockriell v. R. 772, 778
Mills v. R. 108, 114, 128, 130, 142, 144, 146, 674, 687
 Minimum Wage Act of Saskatchewan, Reference re 524
 Minister of Home Affairs v. Fisher 7, 894
 Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development v. Ranville 130
 Minister of National Revenue v. Coopers and Lybrand 575
 Minor v. United States 634
 Miranda v. Arizona 161, 628
 Moore v. Arizona 695
 Moore v. Illinois 764, 765
Morgan v. P.E.I. (A.G.) 513

 NAACP v. Button 351, 355, 422
 Nash and R., Re 111
National Bank of Can. v. R.C.U. 296
National Citizens' Coalition Inc. v. Canada (A.G.) 303
National Socialist White People's Party v. Ringers 423
 Nebraska Press Ass'n et al. v. Stuart, Judge, et al. 389
New Jersey v. T.L.O. 602
New York Times Co. v. Sullivan 344, 347, 350, 355
 Nixon v. Herndon 490
 Noah, Re 828
 North Coast Air Services Ltd. v. Canadian Transport Commission 876
 Northern Pipeline Agency as represented by A.-G. Can. v. Perehinec 74
 N.S. Bd. of Censors v. McNeill 240

Ohralik v. Ohio State Bar Assn. 336, 338
 Oil, Chemical & Atomic Workers Int'l Union, Local 16-601 v. Imperial Oil Ltd.; A.-G. B.C. Intervenant 458
 Ontario (A.G.) v. Winner 511

 Ontario Film and Video Appreciation Society and Ontario Board of Censors, Re 72, 246, 250, 322, 954
Ont. Film and Video Appreciation Soc. v. Ont. Bd. of Censors 239, 248
Ont. Human Rights Comm. v. Simpsons-Sears 805, 847
 Ont. Human Rights Comm. and Simpsons-Sears Ltd., Re 804
 Operation Dismantle v. R. 57, 73, 75, 273, 526, 547, 713, 769
 Oregon v. Mathiason 628
 Ortiz v. Hernandez Colon 477

PPG Industries Can. Ltd. v. Canada (A.G.) 741
P.S.A.C. v. Canada 194, 453
 Palmer v. Thompson 801
 Paquette v. Canada 883
 Paris Adult Theatre I v. Slaton 314
 Park v. The Queen 103
 Paul v. Virginia 518
Peltari v. Dir. of Lower Mainland Regional Correctional Centre 756
People v. Woody 279
 Personnel Administrator of Massachusetts v. Feeney 804
 Pett v. Greyhound Racing Association Ltd. 546
Philadelphia Newspapers Inc. v. Hepps 350
 Phoenix v. Kolodziejski 474
 Piche v. R. 176
 Play-All Ltd. v. A.G. Man. 529
 Powers v. Maine School Administrative Dist. No. 1 476
 Priape Enrg. v. Dep. M.N.R. 248
 Primus, Re 339
 Proc. Gén. Qué. v. Cronier 159
 Public Service Employees Relations Act (Alta.), Ref Re 8, 47, 48, 50, 83, 198, 199, 205, 206, 208, 436, 454
 Public Utilities Comm'n v. Pollak 410
Pugsley v. R. 737

 Que. Assn. of Protestant School Bds. v. Quebec (A.G.) (No. 2) 227, 242
Quebec (A.G.) v. Blaikie 866, 880, 886, 891
 Que. Protestant Sch. Bd. v. A.G. Que. (No. 2) 740
 Quong-Wing v. The King 517

R.W.D.S.U. v. Saskatchewan 205
 R.W.D.S.U., Loc. 580 v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd. 57, 66, 220, 293, 366, 402
 R. v. Allan 741
 R. v. Ameer and Lucas 175
R. v. Amway of Can. Ltd./Amway du Can. Ltée 664
 R. v. Anderson 637
 R. v. Antoine 675, 692

- R. v. Appleby 703, 732
R. v. Asselin 822
R. v. Bazinet 625
 R. v. Belton 179
 R. v. Big M Drug Mart Ltd. 6, 7, 51, 57, 85, **190**,
 194, 200, 212, 213, 221, **253**, 260, 268, 270,
 272, 284, 285, 297, 322, 449, 554, 556, 705,
 731, 732, 804, 813, 896
R. v. Bray 735
 R. v. Brixton Prison (Governor of) 696
R. v. Bryant 386, 739
 R. v. Burnshine 822
 R. v. Cadeddu 186, 555
 R. v. Cameron 314
 R. v. Campbell 415
 R. v. Capner 175
 R. v. Chin 312
 R. v. Ciglen 728
R. v. Collins 15, 167, 172, 412
 R. v. Compagnie Immobilière BCN Ltée 956
 R. v. Crate 741
R. v. Debot 585
 R. v. Dedman 611
 R. v. Derriksan 980
 R. v. Doyle 633
R. v. Duguay 610
 R. v. Duguay, Murphy and Sevigny 614
 R. v. Earle 756
R. v. Eatman 630
 R. v. Edwards Books & Art Ltd. 47, 52, 84, **211**,
 259, 363, **528**, 804
R. v. Elendiuk 762
R. v. Engler 413
 R. v. Esau 157
 R. v. Esposito 626
 R. v. Foulder 175
R. v. G. (J.M.) 628
 R. v. Gardiner 782
 R. v. Gladue 741
 R. v. Great West News Ltd. 313, 318
 R. v. Guberman 630
 R. v. Gushue 755
R. v. Hamill 165, 173, 581
R. v. Hamilton 822
 R. v. Harrison 753
 R. v. Hales 782
 R. v. Hare 980
 R. v. Heaslip 692, 781
R. v. Heit 672, 768
 R. v. Hicklin 311
 R. v. Hijazi 781
 R. v. Howard 657
 R. v. Innuksuk 828
 R. v. Ireland 633
 R. v. James Robinson 387
R. v. Jewitt 177
R. v. Jones 537
 R. v. Keegstra 369
R. v. Kelly 640
 R. v. Kirzner 176
R. v. Konechny 606
R. v. Ladouceur 612
 R. v. Langevin 753
 R. v. Langevin (No. 1) 753
 R. v. Langevin (No. 2) 753
 R. v. Lecky 756
 R. v. Lefebvre 883
R. v. Logan 771
R. v. Lucas 670
 R. v. MacLeod 734
R. v. Manninen 107, 174, 635, 641
R. v. Mannion 709
 R. v. Matheson 104
R. v. McCullagh 822
 R. v. McDonald 835
 R. v. Mercure 883
 R. v. Miller 526
 R. v. Mingo et al. 661, 662, 757
 R. v. Morgentaler 111
 R. v. Morgentaler, Smoling and Scott 250
 R. v. Nijhar 669
R. v. Noble 578
 R. v. Oakes 44, 83, 95, 191, 200, 207, 212, 223,
 252, 271, 364, 369, 540, **729**, 813, 818, 835
 R. v. Odeon Morton Theatres Ltd. and United Artists
 Corp. 316
 R. v. Operation Dismantle Inc. 530, 532, 545
 R. v. Ormerod 176
 R. v. O'Shannessy 175
R. v. Paquette (No. 2) 825
 R. v. Pere Jean Gregoire de la Trinite 756
 R. v. Perry 179
 R. v. Pethig 176
R. v. Petrovic 779
R. v. Pohoretsky 173
 R. v. Prairie Schooner News Ltd. and Powers 168
R. v. Prince 750, 770
R. v. Punch 827
 R. v. Quinn 736
 R. v. Quon 754
 R. v. R. (T.) 763
 R. v. Rahey 49, 73, **110, 128, 143, 687**
 R. v. Ramirez 741
 R. v. Rankine (Doug) Co. Ltd. 248, 312
 R. v. Rao 580
 R. v. Rauca 185
R. v. Red Hot Video Ltd. 319
R. v. Reed 410, 412
 R. v. Rothman 162
 R. v. Sadjade 780
 R. v. Sault Ste. Marie (City) 557
 R. v. Saxwell 564, 617
R. v. Schmidt 547, 767
 R. v. Talon 876

- Reg. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department,
Ex parte Tarrant 542
- R. v. Seo 620**
- R. v. Shelley 732
- R. v. Sieben 173
- R. v. Simmons 163
- R. v. Smith 772**
- R. v. Sophonow 385**
- R. v. Southam Inc. 377**
- R. v. Stipu 724**
- R. v. Sudbury News Service Ltd. 312
- R. v. Swain 561, 615**
- R. v. T.R. 758
- R. v. T.R. (No. 2) 760**
- R. v. Talbourdet 238
- R. v. Terlecki 755
- R. v. Therens 6, 45, **148, 160**, 168, 186, **237**, 618,
621, 625, 629, 630, 634
- R. v. Thomas Fuller Construction Co. (1958) Ltd. et
al. 133
- R. v. Toth 671
- Regina v. Vermette (No. 4) 156
- R. v. Videoflicks Ltd. 47, 52, 211, 259, 264, 268,
322
- R. v. Wagner 312
- R. v. White and Bob 525
- R. v. Whitfield 641
- R. v. Wigglesworth 666, 759
- R. v. Williams 637
- R. v. Wilson 613
- R. v. Wood 671
- R. v. Wray 176
- R. v. Young 179
- R. v. Zundel 185, **249**, 365
- Regina and Beason, Re 143, 144, 683, 692
- Reich v. Alta. College of Physicians & Surgeons 568
- Residential Tenancies Act, Re 42, 209, 633
- Resolution to Amend the Constitution, Re 951
- Rex v. Parke 386
- Reynolds v. British Columbia (A.G.) 462**
- Reynolds v. Sims 472, 478, 484
- Richardson, R. v. 121
- Richmond Newspapers Inc. v. Commonwealth of
Virginia 380
- Ritter et al. and R., Re 157
- Robertson v. R. 262
- Robertson v. Wegmann 155
- Robertson and Rosetanni v. R. 255, 278, 284, 285
- Robin v. Collège de St-Boniface 910**
- Roman Catholic Separate Schools for the City of
Ottawa v. Mackell 874, 944
- Roncarelli v. Duplessis 17, 18
- Rosenbloom v. Metromedia 353
- Roth v. United States 325
- Rourke v. R. 177
- Rowan v. Post Office Dept. 325
- Russell and Radley, Re 661**, 757
- Ryan, Re 768
- S.M.T. (Eastern) Ltd. v. Winner 511
- Sadjade v. R. 890
- Sailors v. Bd. of Education of Kent County 476
- St. Jean v. R. 970
- Saumur v. City of Quebec and A.-G. Que. 367, 414
- Salter Land Co. v. Tulare Lake Basin Water Stor-
age Dist. 472**
- Schofield and Min. of Consumer & Commercial
Rel., Re 89
- S. 94(2) of Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.), Ref. Re 4,
38, 41, 44, 49, 81, 223, 529, 552**
- Seminary of Chicoutimi v. Attorney-General and
Minister of Justice of Quebec et al. 861
- Service Employees Union, Locs. 204, 210 v. Broad-
way Manor Nursing Home 111, 439
- Shewchuk v. Ricard et al. 838
- Shuttleworth v. City of Birmingham 954
- Silver v. U.K. 188
- Singh v. Canada (Min. of Employment & Immigra-
tion) 25, 45, 82, 186, 192, 212, **225**, 530, 531,
540, 769
- Skoriotis v. Florida 764
- Smith v. Goguen 954
- Smith v. Maryland 565**
- Smith, Kline and French Laboratories Ltd. v.
Canada (A.G.) 37, 529**
- Société des Acadiens du N.B. Inc. v. Assn. of
Parents for Fairness in Education, Grand Falls
Dist. 50 Branch 862, 865, **898**, 968
- Société des Acadiens du Nouveau-Brunswick Inc.
v. Minority Language School Bd. No. 50 8,
960**
- Soenen v. Dir. of Edmonton Remand Centre 186
- Solem v. Helm 775
- Southam Inc. v. Dir. of Investigation & Research
Combines Investigation Branch 570
- Southam Inc. v. Hunter 570
- Southam Inc. and R., Re 389, 952
- Southam Inc. and R. (No. 1), Re 384, 956
- Sparrow v. R. 978**
- Speiser v. Randall 355
- Spence v. Washington 400**
- Spencer v. R. 65**, 767
- Sproule, Re 177
- Stanton v. Stanton 838
- Stein v. the Kathy K. 535
- Street v. New York 395**, 401
- Streng v. Winchester (Township) 830**
- Strickland v. Washington 642**
- Stromberg v. California 401
- Storey v. Zazelenchuk 468
- Sunday Times v. U.K. 188, **230**, 248
- Sweeney v. Patterson 345
- Switzman v. Elbling 294, 300, 366, 414
- Sylvain, R. v. 105

- Terminiello v. City of Chicago 422
 Terry v. Ohio 587, 597, 602, 604
 Thandi v. Can. (Min. of Employment & Immigration) 212
 Thornhill v. Alabama 295
 Thorson v. A.G. Can. 905
 Three Rivers Boatmen Ltd. v. Canada Labour Relations Board et al. 860
Tinker v. Des Moines Independent Community School District 392, 401, 408
 Toronto v. Outdoor Neon Displays Ltd. 531
 Towne Cinema Theatres Ltd. v. R. 168, 311, 319
 Trumbley v. Fleming 656
 Twinn v. U.K. 190
 Two Guys from Harrison-Allentown Inc. v. McGinley 260

 Union Colliery Co. v. Bryden 514, 516
 Unterreiner v. R. 890
 United States v. Allard 132, 551
 United States v. Cruikshank 766
 United States v. Ewell 689
U.S. v. Hensley 599
 United States v. Lanza 764
United States v. O'Brien 390, 422
 United States v. Standard Oil Co. 151
 United States v. Wheeler 765
 Upper Churchill Water Rights Reversion Act, Reference re 41, 42, 43

Valente v. R. 715
 Valin v. Langlois 133
 Van der Auwera, Ex parte 696
 Vanguard Coatings & Chemicals Ltd. v. M.N.R. 18, 19
 Village of Arlington Heights v. Metro. Housing Dev. Corp. 804
 Village of Hoffman Estates et al. v. Flipside, Hoffman Estates Inc. 250
Virginia State Bd. of Pharmacy v. Virginia Citizens Consumers Council 329, 333, 335, 338, 406

 Von Moltke v. Gillies 106, 634

 Walsh v. City of Montreal 884
 Walter v. Attorney General of Alberta 515
 Ward v. James 743
Warren, Re 668
 Wartime Leasehold Regulations, Reference re 41
Washington v. Davis 799, 804
 Weinstein v. Min. of Educ. for B.C. 813
 Wesberry v. Sanders 470
 West Virginia State Board of Educ. v. Barnette 278, 398, 401
 Whitcomb v. Chavis 478, 479, 485
 White v. Regester 478, 485
 White and R., Re 726
 Whitney v. California 345, 425
Winner v. S.M.T. (Eastern) Ltd. 511, 514
 Williamson v. Lee Optical Co. 214
 Wilson v. Esquimalt and Nanaimo Ry. Co. 876
Winnipeg School Division No. 1 v. Craton 26
Wisconsin v. Yoder 274, 804
 Wolfe v. Colorado 176
 Wolff v. McDonnell 543
 Woolmington v. Director of Public Prosecutions 731

 Yick Wo v. Hopkins 801
Yukon Election Residency Requirements, Ref. re 468

 Ziegler, Re 568
 Ziegler v. Hunter 568
 Ziegler v. Hunter, Dir. of Investigations & Research 568
 Zemel v. Rusk 372
Zutphen Bros. Construction Ltd. v. Dywidag Systems Inc. Can. Ltd. 833
Zylberberg v. Sudbury Bd. of Education 278

CONTENTS VOLUME 2

Acknowledgements	v
Table of Cases	xvii

PART V CANADIAN CHARTER OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS

1. Introduction	1
Black, <i>The Charter of Rights and Freedoms — Introduction</i>	1
2. Structure of the Charter	4
(a) Interpretation of the Charter	4
(i) Constitutional Adjudication and the Purposive Approach	4
<i>Ref. re s. 94(2) of Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.)</i>	4
<i>Hunter v. Southam Inc.</i>	6
<i>R. v. Big M. Drug Mart</i>	7
<i>Société des Acadiens du Nouveau-Brunswick Inc. v. Minority Language School Bd.</i>	
<i>No. 50</i>	8
<i>MacDonald v. Montreal (City)</i>	9
(ii) Systems Approach to the Charter	10
Magnet, "Canada's System of Official Bilingualism: Constitutional Guarantees	
for the Legislative Process"	10
(iii) Internal Aids	14
A. French and English Texts	14
<i>R. v. Collins</i>	15
B. Headings, Marginal Notes and the Preamble	15
<i>L.S.U.C. v. Skapinker</i>	16
<i>Ref. re Language Rights under s. 23 of Manitoba Act, 1870</i>	17
<i>Vanguard Coatings & Chemicals Ltd. v. M.N.R.</i>	19
C. Non-Abrogation, Non-Derogation Provisions: Sections 16(3), 21, 22, 25,	
29 and 31	19
Magnet, "Multiculturalism and Collective Rights: Approaches to Section 27" ..	20
<i>Ref. re An Act to Amend the Education Act</i>	21
D. Section 26	24
<i>Winnipeg School Division No. 1 v. Craton</i>	26
E. Multiculturalism: Section 27	27
Magnet, "Multiculturalism and Collective Rights: Approaches to Section 27" ..	27
F. Sexual Equality: Section 28	33
G. The Problem of Internal Modifiers	34
Gibson, <i>The Law of the Charter: General Principles</i>	35
<i>Smith, Kline and French Laboratories Ltd. v. Canada (A.G.)</i>	37
<i>Ref. re s. 94(2) of Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.)</i>	38
(iv) External Aids	38
A. Use of the Drafts	38
Elliot, "Interpreting the Charter — Use of the Earlier Versions as an Aid"	38
B. Constitutional Record	41
<i>Ref. re s. 94(2) of Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.)</i>	44
C. Bill of Rights	44
<i>Ref. re s. 94(2) of Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.)</i>	44
D. American Law	45
<i>L.S.U.C. v. Skapinker</i>	46
<i>Ref. re Public Service Employees Relations Act (Alta.)</i>	48
(v) Presumption of Constitutionality	52
Magnet, "The Presumption of Constitutionality"	53
<i>Manitoba (A.G.) v. Metro. Stores (MTS) Ltd.</i>	55

(b) Supremacy: Section 52(1)	56
(c) Application of the Charter	58
Swinton, "Application of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms"	58
Whyte, "Is the Private Sector Affected by the Charter?"	64
<i>Spencer v. R.</i>	65
<i>R.W.D.S.U. v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.</i>	66
<i>Bhindi v. B.C. Projectionists, Loc. 348</i>	72
<i>Lavigne v. O.P.S.E.U.</i>	73
<i>McKinney v. Univ. of Guelph</i>	78
(d) Constitutional Evidence: Section 1	81
<i>Ref. re Public Service Employees Relations Act (Alta.)</i>	83
(e) Constitutional Procedure	85
(i) Standing	85
Bogart, "Standing and the Charter: Rights and Identity"	85
<i>Finlay v. Canada (Min. of Finance)</i>	86
Swan, "Intervention and Amicus Curiae Status in Charter Litigation"	87
<i>Re C.L.C. and Bhindi</i>	88
(ii) The Originating Process	89
<i>Johnson v. Ontario</i>	91
(iii) The "Bifurcated Trial"	92
<i>B.C.T.F. v. British Columbia (A.G.)</i>	92
<i>Metro. Stores (MTS) Ltd. v. Man. Food & Commercial Wkrs. Loc. 832</i>	94
(iv) Obtaining an Interlocutory Stay of Proceedings	96
<i>Manitoba (A.G.) v. Metro. Stores (MTS) Ltd.</i>	96
(v) Waiver	102
<i>Korponay v. Canada (A.G.)</i>	102
<i>Clarkson v. R.</i>	106
<i>R. v. Manninen</i>	107
<i>Mills v. R.</i>	108
<i>R. v. Rahey</i>	110
(f) Enforcement	110
(i) "A Court of Competent Jurisdiction": Section 24(1)	110
Pilkington, "Monetary Redress for Charter Infringement"	111
<i>Mills v. R.</i>	114
<i>R. v. Rahey</i>	128
<i>Argentina (Republic) v. Mellino</i>	129
(ii) Choice of Forum	133
<i>Jabour v. Law Soc. of B.C.</i>	133
(iii) Remedies	135
Pilkington, "Monetary Redress for Charter Infringement"	135
<i>Mills v. R.</i>	142
<i>R. v. Rahey</i>	143
<i>R. v. Therens</i>	148
Note: Mandatory Injunctions to Compel Compliance with Educational Rights	149
<i>Bivens v. Six Unknown Federal Narcotics Agents</i>	149
<i>Carlson v. Green</i>	152
<i>Crossman v. R.</i>	156
<i>Bertram S. Miller Ltd. v. R.</i>	157
Note on Damages for Governmental Invasion of Charter Protected Rights	158
(iv) Costs	158
<i>Re Marshall and R.</i>	158
<i>Batsos v. Laval</i>	159
Note	160
(v) Exclusion of Evidence: Section 24(2)	160
<i>R. v. Therens</i>	160
<i>Clarkson v. R.</i>	164
<i>R. v. Hamill</i>	165

	<i>R. v. Collins</i>	167
	<i>R. v. Pohoretsky</i>	173
	<i>R. v. Manninen</i>	174
	Note on Entrapment and Exclusion of Evidence	175
	<i>R. v. Jewitt</i>	177
(vi)	Legislative Override: Section 33	180
	Submission of the Select Committee on the Constitution of Canada	180
	<i>Alliance des Professeurs de Montréal v. Québec (P.G.)</i>	181
3.	Guarantee of Rights and Freedoms (s. 1)	185
(a)	General	185
	Note on Section 1	185
	Note on the Limitations Clauses in the European Convention of Human Rights	187
(b)	Reasonable Limits	190
	<i>R. v. Big M Drug Mart</i>	190
	<i>R. v. Oakes</i>	191
	<i>P.S.A.C. v. Canada</i>	194
	<i>Ref. re Public Service Employees Relations Act (Alta.)</i>	199
	<i>R.W.D.S.U. v. Saskatchewan</i>	205
	<i>R. v. Edwards Books & Art Ltd.</i>	211
	<i>R.W.D.S.U. v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.</i>	220
	<i>Ref. re s. 94(2) of Motor Vehicle Act (B.C.)</i>	223
	<i>Singh v. Canada (Min. of Employment & Immigration)</i>	225
	<i>Que. Assn. of Protestant School Bds. v. Quebec (A.G.) (No. 2)</i>	227
	Note: The Distinction Between "Limiting" and "Denying" Charter-Protected Rights	230
(c)	Prescribed by Law	230
	<i>Sunday Times v. U.K.</i>	230
	<i>R. v. Therens</i>	237
	<i>Ont. Film and Video Appreciation Soc. v. Ont. Bd. of Censors</i>	239
	<i>Ref. re Education Act of Ontario and Minority Language Education Rights</i>	246
	<i>Luscher v. Dep. M.N.R. (Customs & Excise)</i>	247
(d)	Vagueness and Overbreadth	249
	<i>R. v. Zundel</i>	249
(e)	As Can be Demonstrably Justified in a Free and Democratic Society	251
	Note on "As Can be Demonstrably Justified in a Free and Democratic Society"	251
	<i>R. v. Oakes</i>	252
4.	Fundamental Freedoms	253
(a)	Freedom of Conscience and Religion: Section (2)(a)	253
	Constitution of the United States of America (1791)	253
	<i>R. v. Big M Drug Mart</i>	253
	<i>R. v. Edwards Books & Art Ltd.</i>	259
	<i>Jones v. R.</i>	269
	<i>Wisconsin v. Yoder</i>	274
	<i>Jack v. R.</i>	277
	<i>People v. Woody</i>	279
	<i>Zylberberg v. Sudbury Bd. of Education</i>	282
(b)	Freedom of Thought, Belief, Opinion and Expression: Section 2(b)	287
(i)	Basic Principles	287
	Greenawalt, "Speech and Crime"	287
	Meiklejohn, <i>Political Freedom</i>	289
	Emerson, <i>Toward a General Theory of the First Amendment</i>	290
	<i>Cherneskey v. Armadale Publishers Ltd.</i>	291
	<i>R.W.D.S.U. v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.</i>	293
	<i>National Bank of Can. v. R.C.U.</i>	296
(ii)	Political Censorship	298
	<i>Ref. re Alta. Legislation</i>	298
	Note	300
	<i>Fraser v. P.S.S.R.B.</i>	300