

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

*BAKER
LOGUE*

**INSURANCE LAW
AND POLICY**
Cases and Materials

*Fourth
Edition*



Wolters Kluwer



SUSTAINABLE
FORESTRY
INITIATIVE

Certified Sourcing

www.sfiprogram.org
SFI-00198

ISBN 978-1-4548-7491-1



9 781454 874911

90000



*BAKER
LOGUE*

INSURANCE
LAW AND
POLICY
Cases and
Materials

*Fourth
Edition*



ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

INSURANCE LAW AND POLICY

Cases and Materials

Fourth Edition

TOM BAKER

William Maul Measey Professor of Law and
Health Sciences
University of Pennsylvania Law School

KYLE D. LOGUE

Douglas A. Kahn Collegiate Professor of Law
University of Michigan Law School



Wolters Kluwer

Copyright © 2017 CCH Incorporated. All Rights Reserved.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S. serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.WKLegaledu.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.WKLegaledu.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-7491-1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Baker, Tom, 1959- author. | Logue, Kyle D., author.

Title: Insurance law and policy : cases and materials / Tom Baker, William Maul Measey Professor of Law and Health Sciences, University of Pennsylvania Law School; Kyle D. Logue, Douglas A. Kahn Collegiate Professor of Law, University of Michigan Law School.

Description: Fourth edition. | New York : Wolters Kluwer, [2017] | Series: Aspen casebook series

Identifiers: LCCN 2016056663 | ISBN 9781454874911

Subjects: LCSH: Insurance law—United States. | LCGFT: Casebooks

Classification: LCC KF1164 .B35 2017 | DDC 346.73/086—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016056663>

Insurance Law and Policy

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Rachel E. Barkow

Segal Family Professor of Regulatory Law and Policy
Faculty Director, Center on the Administration of Criminal Law
New York University School of Law

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
Raymond Pryke Professor of First Amendment Law
University of California, Irvine School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Senior Lecturer in Law
The University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Tracey L. Meares

Walton Hale Hamilton Professor of Law
Yale Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Maurice A. Deane School of Law at Hofstra University

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Stanley Morrison Professor of Law
Faculty Co-Director, Stanford Criminal Justice Center
Stanford Law School

About Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S. delivers expert content and solutions in the areas of law, corporate compliance, health compliance, reimbursement, and legal education. Its practical solutions help customers successfully navigate the demands of a changing environment to drive their daily activities, enhance decision quality and inspire confident outcomes.

Serving customers worldwide, its legal and regulatory portfolio includes products under the Aspen Publishers, CCH Incorporated, Kluwer Law International, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs names. They are regarded as exceptional and trusted resources for general legal and practice-specific knowledge, compliance and risk management, dynamic workflow solutions, and expert commentary.

*For Sharon, Matthew, Rachel, and Noa
and
For Ruth Ann, Hannah, Molly, Thomas, Caroline,
Mary Claire, and Feleke*

Insurance ideas and practices define central privileges and responsibilities within a society. In that sense, our insurance arrangements form a material constitution, one that operates through routine, mundane transactions that nevertheless define the contours of individual and social responsibility. For that reason, studying who is eligible to receive what insurance benefits, and who pays for them, is as good a guide to the social compact as any combination of Supreme Court opinions.

Tom Baker, *On the Genealogy of Moral Hazard*,
75 Tex. L. Rev. 236, 291 (1996)

Preface

This casebook invites students and teachers to reimagine the field of insurance law, reflecting the centrality of insurance to American law, business, and society.

Insurance is already in the mainstream of U.S. law and policy, as well it should be. Entire sectors of the U.S. economy depend on insurance: health care, the housing market, and the civil justice system, to mention just three with particular significance for new lawyers. A large share of federal tax payments goes toward funding government insurance of one form or another. The average American family pays almost as much to purchase the various forms of insurance that make up the private safety net. And for most organizations, insurance is a substantial budget item. As a result, tens of thousands of lawyers make decisions every working day that require a detailed understanding of one form of insurance or another.

Yet insurance remains very much on the margin of the curriculum in most law schools. This marginal status hurts law students by sending them out into practice without a broad, conceptual understanding of insurance law and institutions to help guide them in their work. Further, it deprives the legal profession of the depth of understanding that law teachers have brought to the fields of law at the core of the law school curriculum.

Courses like contracts, torts, civil procedure, property, and criminal and constitutional law are rich intellectual experiences largely because they have been taught by generations of law professors who labored in those fields. The U.S. legal system is among the few in the world that compensates law teachers well enough to free them from the demands of the active practice of law. What the system gets in return is not only well-educated new lawyers, but also legal scholarship and other forms of academic knowledge.

Insurance Law and Policy: Cases, Materials, and Problems aims to make insurance law enjoyable and interesting to teach and learn, so that professors who usually teach torts, contracts, business organizations, health law, civil procedure, and other law school courses will embark into an insurance course—and so that the students who go on that journey will have a worthwhile experience, too.

The goal is to encourage more people to think and write about insurance, risk, and responsibility, so that the field develops the depth of law school subjects traditionally understood to form the core of the curriculum.

So what does this casebook do differently? There are four main things.

First, the book pares down, and in some cases eliminates, some of the arcane aspects of insurance law in favor of presenting a broad and conceptual overview of the field. Lawyers can teach themselves the details when they need to know them. This book focuses on the essential institutional arrangements and enduring tensions that animate the field.

Second, the organization of the book locates insurance law in the law school curriculum. As the book makes clear, insurance is both an upper-level contracts course (see Chapter 2) and an upper-level torts course (see Chapters 4 and 5). Insurance is also an essential aspect of health law (see Chapter 3) and the regulation of financial services (see Chapter 6), as well as a challenging variation on the usual pattern of federalism (see Chapter 6). In addition, insurance provides a window on the distribution of benefits and responsibilities in the United States (see, especially, Chapter 1, but also Chapters 3 and 4). In that sense, an insurance law course has much in common with a tax law course. It is the rare social issue that cannot be seen through a tax or an insurance lens. The difference is, however, that insurance law is more accessible to teachers whose core expertise lies in an allied field.

Third, the book introduces into insurance law many successful innovations from other law school casebooks. There are carefully constructed problems throughout. There are fewer and longer cases, providing students better grounding in the art of extracting useful knowledge from judicial opinions. There are more extensive and pervasive statutory materials, presenting students with a more realistic understanding of the importance of statutes and more practice working with them. There are fresh, contemporary cases, reflecting the major insurance law controversies of the past thirty years, from asbestos litigation to the World Trade Center to the ever-evolving relationship between liability and insurance (as represented in this edition by the extensive use of materials from the ALI's new Principles of the Law of Liability Insurance, for which we are the Reporters).

Finally, although the book continues the trend in insurance law casebooks of organizing teaching units around lines of insurance (e.g., health, liability), it integrates topics to a greater extent. All first party insurance topics are addressed in a single Chapter, with separate sections for different lines of insurance and a single comprehensive subrogation unit at the end. Similarly, after introducing the main types of liability insurance in separate sections in Chapter 4, the book presents liability insurance relationship issues in an integrated fashion in Chapter 5.

Tom Baker and Kyle Logue

January 2017

Acknowledgments

As with any casebook in a developing field, this one stands on the shoulders of others. Two deserve special mention: *Cases and Materials on Insurance Law*, by Spencer Kimball, and *Insurance Law and Regulation*, by Kenneth Abraham. We have taught with both books and both undoubtedly have shaped our understanding and organization of the insurance field more pervasively than we are aware.

Thank you to all of the adopters of the earlier editions for their confidence and their feedback. Thank you, especially, to Rhonda Andrews, Jennifer Bard, Peter Carstensen, Seth Chandler, Stephen Gilles, Stephen Halpert, Robert Jerry, Peter Kochenburger, Jay Naftzger, Chaim Saiman, Adam Scales, Peter Siegelman, Kathryn Sampson, Anthony Sebok, Shauhin Talesh, Jeffrey Thomas, and Jennifer Wriggins for their suggestions and materials. Thank you to the many lawyers who have entrusted us with their insurance problems, keeping us anchored to insurance practice and providing the raw material for many of the topics and problems that (suitably disguised) appear in this book.

Thank you also to the following authors and copyright holders for permission to use their materials:

Adam Scales, Can This Pig Fly? How a Dentist Assaulted a Patient and Made a Million Dollars, http://writ.news.findlaw.com/commentary/20070815_scales.html, FindLaw August 15, 2007. Reprinted by permission. Originally appeared on FindLaw.com

American Law Institute, Principles of the Law of Liability Insurance © 2013 by the American Law Institute. All rights reserved. Reprinted with permission.

Chubb Specialty Insurance, Directors and Officers Liability Policy, Forms 1402-0941 (Ed. 1/92) and 14-02-0943 (Ed. 1/92). Reprinted by permission.

Daniel C. Eidsmore & Pamela K. Edwards, Home Liability Coverage: Does the Criminal Acts Exclusion Work Where the “Expected or Intended” Exclusion Failed?, 5 Conn. Ins. L.J. 707 (1998-1999). Reprinted by permission.

Insurance Services Office, Inc., CGL Declarations Form, CGL Occurrence Form (CG 00 01) and CGL Claims Made Form (CG 00 02). Includes copyrighted and proprietary materials of Insurance Services Office, Inc. or its affiliates with its permission.

Robert H. Jerry II, "Insurance," from *Oxford Companion to American Law*, edited by Kermit Hall, copyright by Oxford University Press, Inc. (2002). Used by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.

Kevin LaCroix, excerpt from *The D&O Diary*, <http://www.dandodiary.com>. Reprinted by permission of Kevin LaCroix.

John H. Langbein, *Trust Law as Regulatory Law: The Unum/Provident Scandal and Judicial Review of Benefit Denials Under ERISA*, 101 *Nw. U. L. Rev.* 1315 (2007). Reprinted by permission.

L. Charles Landgraf, John S. Pruitt & Tom Baker, *Modernizing Insurance Regulation in the United States*. (2011). Prepared for the Anthony T. Cluff Research Fund of the Financial Services Roundtable. © 2011 Dewey & LeBoeuf LLP.

Oxford Companion to American Law, edited by Kermit L. Hall (2002) c. 1,847 words from pp. 420-423. © by Oxford University Press, Inc. By permission of Oxford University Press USA.

Residual Markets. (2015, March). Insurance Information Institute. Retrieved from <http://www.iii.org/issue-update/residual-markets>.

Restatement of the Law Liability Insurance, Tentative Draft No. 1 (April 11, 2016) copyright © 2016 by The American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved. As of the date of publication, this Draft had not been considered by the members of The American Law Institute and therefore did not represent the position of the Institute on any of the issues with which it deals. The action taken by the members with respect to this Draft may be ascertained by consulting the Annual Proceedings of the Institute, which are published following each Annual Meeting.

Susan Randall, *Insurance Regulation in the United States: Regulatory Federalism and the National Association of Insurance Commissioners*, 26 *Fla. St. U. L. Rev.* 625 (1999). Reprinted by permission of the Florida State University Law Review.

Tom Baker & Jonathan Simon. (2002). *Embracing Risk: The Changing Culture of Insurance and Responsibility*. © 2002 by The University of Chicago. All rights reserved. Published 2002. Printed in the United States of America.