

Law, Ethics and Governance Series



health workforce governance

improved access,
good regulatory practice,
safer patients

edited by

Stephanie D. Short
and Fiona McDonald

Health Workforce Governance

Improved Access, Good Regulatory Practice,
Safer Patients

Edited by

STEPHANIE D. SHORT

The University of Sydney, Australia

FIONA MCDONALD

Queensland University of Technology, Australia



ASHGATE

© Stephanie D. Short and Fiona McDonald 2012

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Stephanie D. Short and Fiona McDonald have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act, 1988, to be identified as the editors of this work.

Published by
Ashgate Publishing Limited
Wey Court East
Union Road
Farnham
Surrey, GU9 7PT
England

Ashgate Publishing Company
Suite 420
101 Cherry Street
Burlington
VT 05401-4405
USA

www.ashgate.com

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Health workforce governance : improved access, good regulatory practice, safer patients. -- (Law, ethics and governance)

1. Health services administration. 2. Medical personnel--Supply and demand. 3. Health services accessibility. 4. Medical personnel--Discipline. 5. Medical errors--Prevention. 6. Medical laws and legislation. I. Series II. Short, Stephanie D., 1956- III. McDonald, Fiona, LLB. 362.1'068-dc23

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Short, Stephanie D., 1956-

Health workforce governance: improved access, good regulatory practice, safer patients / by Stephanie D. Short and Fiona McDonald.

p. cm. -- (Law, ethics and governance)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4094-2921-0 (hardback) -- ISBN 978-1-4094-2922-7 (ebook)

(ebook) 1. Medical laws and legislation. 2. Medical personnel--Government policy. 3. Medical care--Law and legislation. 4. Medical personnel--Supply and demand--Government policy. 5. Medical personnel--Recruiting--Law and legislation. 6. Medical policy--Social aspects. 7. Occupational mobility--Social aspects. 8. Labor laws and legislation, International. I. McDonald, Fiona. II. Title. K4365.S56 2012 362.1068'3--dc23

ISBN 9781409429210 (hbk)

ISBN 9781409429227 (ebk)

2011052194



Printed and bound in Great Britain by the
MPG Books Group, UK.

List of Figures

2.1	Migration flows of health professionals in South Africa, 1988–2000	20
2.2	Rate of emigration of doctors for the 23 most seriously affected countries, 2000	23
8.1	Scope of regulation for individual and system competence	152
9.1	Kingdon’s framework for analysing policy processes	166
11.1	Pyramid of selected regulatory mechanisms	206
13.1	Application of a checklist to this case	255
13.2	The multiplicity of errors	257

List of Tables

3.1	Stakeholders involved in and affected by international health personnel recruitment	49
5.1	Number and density of general practitioners by region, 2006	81
5.2	Existing acts and regulations in Indonesia (to 2007)	82
5.3	Recommendations	89
9.1.	Major steps towards implementation of the National Registration and Accreditation Scheme	165
9.2	The Patel context: events and failures in regulatory control and clinical governance processes	172
9.3	Professions regulated under the Health Practitioner Regulation National Law Act 2009	176
11.1	Regulatory mechanisms: protecting professionals, protecting patients	210
11.2	Benefits of regulatory mechanisms to six groups	212
12.1	Scandals in the British National Health Service leading to inquiries 1980–2005	228
12.2	Scandals in Canadian Health Systems leading to inquiries 1980–2005	229

List of Abbreviations

ACCC	Australian Competition and Consumer Commission
ACGME	Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education (US)
AGA	Agenda for Global Action
AHMAC	Australian Health Ministers' Advisory Council
AHMC	Australian Health Ministers' Conference
AHPRA	Australian Health Practitioner Regulation Agency
AHWAC	Australian Health Workforce Advisory Council
AIDS	Acquired immune deficiency syndrome
AIHW	Australian Institute for Health and Welfare
AIIMS	All India Institute of Medical Sciences
AMA	Australian Medical Association
AMWAC	Australian Medical Workforce Advisory Committee
ANHWT	Australian National Health Workforce Taskforce
APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
CHPRE	Council on Health Professions Regulatory Excellence (proposed Canada)
CHRE	Council for Healthcare Regulatory Excellence (UK)
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CIHC	Canadian Interprofessional Health Collaborative
CJC	Criminal Justice Commission (Queensland, Australia)
COAG	Council of Australian Governments
CPSM	College of Physicians and Surgeons of Manitoba (Canada)
CPSO	College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario (Canada)
CSL	Critical Skills List
DFID	Department for International Development (UK)
EARC	Electoral and Administrative Review Commission
EU	European Union
FNAB	Fine needle aspiration biopsy
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GP	General Practitioner

GMC	General Medical Council
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
G-20	The Group of Twenty
HIV	Human immunodeficiency virus
HMO	Health Maintenance Organization (US)
HPRAC	Health Professions Regulatory Advisory Council (Canada)
HRH	Human Resources for Health
HRST	Human Resources for Science and Technology
HSC	Hospital for Sick Children (Toronto, Canada)
IAMRA	International Association of Medical Regulatory Authorities
ICR-GHW	International Consortium for Research on Governance of the Health Workforce
IGA	Intergovernmental Agreement
ILO	International Labour Organization
<i>Inpres</i>	<i>Instruction of the President</i> (Indonesia)
IOM	International Organization for Migration
JCAHO	Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations (US)
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MGTF	Medical Governance Task Force (proposed for Indonesia)
MIDA	Migration for Development in Africa
MRI	Medical resonance imaging
M&M	Mortality and morbidity
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NGO	Non-government organization
NHS	National Health Service (UK)
NPM	New Public Management
NS	Nova Scotia (Canada)
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PNS	Permanent civil service employment (Indonesia)
PTT	Contract civil service employment (Indonesia)
<i>RHPA</i>	<i>Regulated Health Professions Act</i> (Canada)
RLCH	Royal Liverpool Children's Hospital (UK)
SAMP	Southern African Migration Project
SSA	Sub-Saharan Africa

SSCSAT	Senate Standing Committee on Social Affairs, Science and Technology (Canada)
The Alliance	The Global Health Workforce Alliance
TI	Transparency International
TSAPP	Taskforce on Sexual Abuse of Patients by Physicians (Canada)
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
URT	United Republic of Tanzania
USA	United States of America
USD	United States dollars
WHO	World Health Organization
WHSC	Winnipeg Health Sciences Centre (Canada)
WTO	World Trade Organization

Contributors

Charles Sampford (BA, LLB, DPhil) was appointed Foundation Dean of Law at Griffith University in March 1991, Foundation Director of the Key Centre for Ethics, Law, Justice and Governance in 1999 and Foundation Director of the Institute for Ethics, Governance and Law (a joint initiative of the United Nations University, Griffith, Queensland University of Technology and Australian National University) in 2004. Professor Sampford has written over 90 articles and chapters in Australian and foreign journals and collections ranging through constitutional law, legal philosophy, legal education, politics, applied ethics and economics and has completed twenty-one books and edited collections for international publishers including OUP, Blackwell, Routledge, Cavendish and Ashgate. Foreign fellowships include the Visiting Senior Research Fellow at St John's College Oxford (1997) and a Fulbright Senior Award to Harvard University (2000) following which he was appointed a member of a task force co-chaired by Secretary Albright and Ambassador Geremek on Threats to Democracy.

Craig Veitch (BA Hons, DipAppSc Rad Ther, PhD) is Professor and Chair in Community Based Health Care in the Faculty of Health Sciences at the University of Sydney, and heads the jointly-funded Community Based Health Care Research Unit at the Royal Rehabilitation Centre Sydney. He is an epidemiologist and health services researcher, with a clinical background in radiation therapy and nuclear medicine. His key research interests include community based health care, community health services development, rural health, primary health care and health services evaluation.

Daniel Klass (MD.CM, FRCP(C), FACP) is Adjunct Professor and Senior Scholar in the Department of Medical Education, University of Manitoba Faculty of Medicine, Canada, and Adjunct Professor in the Department of Medicine, University of Toronto. He recently retired from the post of Associate Registrar, College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario, where he was the Director of the Quality Management and Registration Divisions from 2001 to 2009. He graduated from McGill University in 1967 with the degree of doctor of medicine, and obtained his specialty certifications in Internal Medicine and Respiratory Disease in 1973 from the Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada. Over his 45 year career in medicine, Daniel Klass has been an active researcher in medical education and respiratory physiology, a teacher and administrator in medical education, performance assessment and regulation, and has practised and

taught in the field of respiratory medicine. He currently is a consultant in the field of medical education.

Fiona McDonald (BA, LLB, LLM, JSD) is a Senior Lecturer at the School of Law at Queensland University of Technology in Australia and is a member of QUT's Health Law Research Group. Fiona's research focus is health governance, particularly the governance of health professionals, health institutions and health systems. Her recent book, with Ben White and Lindy Willmott (eds.), is *Health Law in Australia* (Thomson, 2010).

Fiona Pacey (BA (Soc Sci) Hons, Grad.Dip.Lab.St, MPP) is a PhD student in the Faculty of Health Sciences at The University of Sydney and a member of the Healthgov network. She was awarded a Master of Politics and Public Policy from Macquarie University in 2007, and has worked in management and policy roles in the field of medical education for over a decade.

Firman Lubis (MD, MPH) is a Professor in the Department of Community Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, University of Indonesia. His core specialisations are epidemiology, biostatistics, socio-anthropology and family medicine. Dr Lubis has collaborated with and served as consultant to key international organizations, including USAID, AusAID, UNFPA, Population Council, Family Health International, WHO, World Bank and ADB.

Hasbullah Thabrany (MD, Dr.PH) is Professor at the School of Public Health, University of Indonesia, Jakarta. He coordinates research and training, and advocates to the Ministry of Health and the Parliament on health policy. He served as the Secretary General of the Indonesian Medical Association and established the Indonesian Association of Health Insurance Managers, aiming at capacity building in health insurance fields. He has worked as a general practitioner and completed his graduate and doctoral studies in health policy and administration at the University of California at Berkeley USA.

Helen Turnbull (BA, LLB) was admitted to legal practice in New Zealand in 1983, in England in 1992 and in New South Wales, Australia in 1997. She is Special Counsel – Professional Conduct for Avant Mutual Group Limited, the largest indemnity organisation for medical practitioners in Australia. Her area of particular expertise and interest is professional regulatory law. She has multi-jurisdictional experience in litigation, health, insurance, disciplinary and medical indemnity law. She advocates on behalf of medical and allied health practitioners in professional conduct matters and appears before parliamentary and government inquiries. She is closely involved in the new National Registration and Accreditation Scheme in Australia.

Judith Healy (BA, MSW, PhD) is an Associate Professor in the Regulatory Institutions Network, Australian National University. She has worked in Australia, the United States and Europe for universities, policy think tanks and the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies and currently with the Asia Pacific Observatory on Health Systems and Policies. Her research interests include health sector regulation and the comparative analysis of health systems. Her books include, with Martin McKee (eds.) *Hospitals in a Changing Europe* (Open University Press, 2002), also with Martin McKee (eds.) *Health Care: Responding to Diversity* (Oxford University Press, 2004), with Paul Dugdale (eds.) *Patient Safety First: Responsive Regulation in Health Care* (Allen & Unwin, 2009), and her recent sole-authored book is *Improving Health Care Safety and Quality: Reluctant Regulators* (Ashgate 2011).

Kirsten Harley (BSc, BA(Hons), PhD) is a Postdoctoral Research Associate in the Faculty of Health Sciences and Honorary Associate in the Department of Sociology and Social Policy at the University of Sydney, Australia. She is a sociologist whose research interests include public and private health care systems and health care choice, and is a member of the HealthGov network. She received the University of Sydney's inaugural Rita and John Cornforth Medal for PhD Achievement in 2011.

Paul Dugdale (BMBS, MA, MPH, PhD, FAFPHM) is Director of Chronic Disease Management at Canberra Hospital and Health Services and Director of the Australian Centre for Health Stewardship at the Australian National University. He is a public health physician with first-hand governance experience in the health sector, including as ACT Chief Health Officer, Director of General Practice Finance in the Commonwealth Department of Health (Australia) and Medical Superintendent of Liverpool Hospital (NSW). He is the author of *Doing Health Policy in Australia* (Allen & Unwin, 2008) and editor (with Judith Healy) of *Patient Safety First: Responsive Regulation in Health Care* (Allen & Unwin, 2009).

Robyn R. Iredale (BA Hons, MA, PhD) is an Adjunct Associate Professor at the Australian Demographic and Social Research Institute at the Australian National University. She has undertaken a wide range of projects on labour migration (especially skilled migration), skills recognition, women migrants, refugees and related issues. She has wide experience in Asia and the Pacific. She has undertaken projects for a wide range of Australian and international agencies, including the International Labour Organization, the Association of South East Asian Nations, UNCTAD and the International Organization for Migration.

Stephanie D. Short (DipPthy, BA (Hons), MSc (Economics), PhD) is Professor and Associate Dean Postgraduate in the Faculty of Health Sciences at the University of Sydney, Australia. She is Convenor of the HealthGov Network of researchers, regulators and professionals. She is the author, with George Palmer,

of *Health Care and Public Policy: An Australian Analysis* (Palgrave Macmillan, 4th edition, 2010).

Suchaya Thongyoo (BAppSci, MPubHealth) has qualifications in Health Information Management and Public Health. She has worked as a research assistant in the Faculty of Health Sciences at the University of Sydney.

Toni Schofield (BA Hons, Dip.Ed., PhD) is Associate Professor in the Faculty of Health Sciences at the University of Sydney. Her research and teaching focus on sociology and public policy mainly in relation to health and health care. Specific areas of interest are gender and health, workplace health, the health workforce and alcohol use and harm minimization. Professor Schofield has served as a health policy and research consultant for numerous Australian and international organizations, most recently the Canadian Department of Health (2011) and the Swedish Secretariat for Gender Equality (2012)

Valentin D. Hadjiev (LLB, Dip H Ed) is a Senior Research Assistant in international law at the Law and Justice Research Centre, Queensland University of Technology, and Adjunct Research Fellow, Institute of Ethics, Governance and Law, Griffith University in Brisbane, Australia. He is a member of the HealthGov network. He has worked as an academic in international law at the Universities of Sofia and Sydney and been a Senior Fulbright Fellow to the University of Virginia Law School.

William Lahey (BA, BA (Jurisprudence), LLM) is an Associate Professor, Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Canada. He has qualifications in Arts, Jurisprudence and Law from Mount Allison, Oxford and Toronto. He teaches Public Law, Administrative Law and Health Systems Law and Policy. His research interests include law and health systems, administrative law, legal history, and regulatory governance in a range of sectors, including health and environment. He has served as Nova Scotia's Assistant Deputy Minister of Health and Deputy Minister of Environment and Labour and is past Director of the Dalhousie Health Law Institute.

William Ransome (BA Hons, PhD) is a research fellow in philosophical ethics at the Law and Justice Research Centre, Queensland University of Technology, and adjunct research fellow and program director for corporate governance and social responsibility at the Key Centre for Ethics, Law, Justice and Governance, Griffith University. His research interests include moral psychology, ancient Greek and Kantian ethics, virtue ethics, theories of wellbeing, the ethics of governance and corporate social responsibility. His recent books include *Moral Reflection* (2009) and *Ethics and Socially Responsible Investment: A Philosophical Approach* (2011, co-authored with Charles Sampford).

Yaslis Ilyas is a Senior Lecturer in the Graduate Program, School of Public Health, University of Indonesia. His health workforce and health services research has attracted support from the Ministry of Health, Indonesia; the Health Office of Provinces in Indonesia; Office of Human Resources Development, Province of Papua, Indonesia; the World Health Organization (WHO); the World Bank; the Asia Development Bank; and UNICEF.

Acknowledgements

Many colleagues have assisted with the production of this edited collection. We thank all our authors for their valuable contributions and forbearance in meeting tight deadlines. We are grateful to our publisher at Ashgate, Alison Kirk, for her advice and support, and we thank Professor Charles Sampford, the series editor for Law, Ethics and Governance, for his strategic advice at crucial stages of the project. Carmel Connors, Publications Manager in the Institute for Ethics, Governance and Law at Griffith University, provided wise counsel and advice on numerous occasions for which we are grateful. We thank also Professor Bill Duncan, former Director of the Law and Justice Research Centre at the Queensland University of Technology and Valentin Hadjiev for their ongoing support of HealthGov and this project. We thank also Professor Gwynnyth Llewellyn, Dean of the Faculty of Health Sciences, and the University of Sydney which has provided a congenial base for HealthGov and this project. We acknowledge support received from the Australian Research Council which funded the establishment of HealthGov as a division of the Governance Research Network, GovNet. Many of the ideas and evidence presented herein derive from work generated by members of HealthGov, a network of regulators, professionals and academics established in 2007 as a division of the Australian Research Council-funded Governance Network.

From the Faculty of Health Sciences at the University of Sydney, Dr Kirsten Harley provided invaluable intellectual and practical input to the project and manuscript. We are also grateful to Kanchan Marcus for her expert assistance with the manuscript. We thank our colleagues in HealthGov at the University of Sydney and nationally, the International Association of Medical Regulatory Authorities, and the International Consortium for Research on Governance of the Health Workforce, most notably Howard Adelman, Emeritus Professor of Philosophy at York University and Adjunct Professor Daniel Klass, former associate registrar of the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario. Indeed we dedicate this book to Howard Adelman and Daniel Klass for their pioneering work on the transnational regulation of the medical profession.

Stephanie Short and Fiona McDonald,
Sydney and Brisbane, April 2012

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Contributors</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xxi</i>

INTRODUCTION

1	The Health Workforce Governance Continuum: Improved Access, Good Regulatory Practice, Safer Patients <i>Stephanie D. Short and Fiona McDonald</i>	3
---	---	---

PART I IMPROVED ACCESS

2	Major Issues in the Global Mobility of Health Professionals <i>Robyn R. Iredale</i>	15
3	Building an Ethical and Sustainable Model for Health Professional Recruitment <i>William Ransome and Charles Sampford</i>	41
4	The Global Health Workforce ‘Crisis’ and Inequities in Health Care Access: Advancing a Gender and Organisations Approach to Policy, Research And Practice <i>Toni Schofield</i>	57
5	Good Doctors, Safer Patients, Improved Access: the Case of Indonesia <i>Stephanie D. Short, Hasbullah Thabrany, Valentin D. Hadjiev, Yaslis Ilyas, Robyn R. Iredale, Firman Lubis, Suchaya Thongyoo and Kirsten Harley</i>	77

PART II GOOD REGULATORY PRACTICE

- | | | |
|----|---|-----|
| 6 | Challenging the Regulatory Trinity: Global Trends
in Health Professional Regulation
<i>Fiona McDonald</i> | 97 |
| 7 | Interprofessionalism and Collaborative Self-
regulation in the Health Professions: two Variations
on an Emerging Canadian Theme
<i>William Lahey</i> | 113 |
| 8 | Saving Polly: Can Professional Self-regulation Play
an Ongoing Role in the Delivery of Medical Care?
<i>Daniel Klass</i> | 143 |
| 9 | A National Scheme for Health Practitioner
Registration and Accreditation: the Case of Australia
<i>Fiona Pacey, Kirsten Harley, Craig Veitch and
Stephanie D. Short</i> | 163 |
| 10 | Governance Challenges for Primary Health Care
<i>Paul Dugdale</i> | 183 |

PART III SAFER PATIENTS

- | | | |
|--------------|---|-----|
| 11 | Regulating the Health Professions: Protecting
Professionals or Protecting Patients?
<i>Judith Healy</i> | 205 |
| 12 | Scandals, Public Inquiries and Health Professional
Regulation
<i>Fiona McDonald</i> | 223 |
| 13 | The Perfect Storm: a Case of Wrong-sided Surgery
<i>Helen Turnbull</i> | 249 |
| <i>Index</i> | | 265 |

INTRODUCTION