

EVIDENCE
IN
TRIALS AT COMMON LAW

by
JOHN HENRY WIGMORE

In Ten Volumes

VOLUME 9

Revised by
JAMES H. CHADBURN
Fessenden Professor of Law Emeritus, Harvard University

LITTLE, BROWN AND COMPANY
Boston *Toronto*

1981

COPYRIGHT © 1981 BY JAMES H. CHADBOURN

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. NO PART OF THIS BOOK MAY BE REPRODUCED IN ANY FORM OR BY ANY ELECTRONIC OR MECHANICAL MEANS INCLUDING INFORMATION STORAGE AND RETRIEVAL SYSTEMS WITHOUT PERMISSION IN WRITING FROM THE PUBLISHER, EXCEPT BY A REVIEWER WHO MAY QUOTE BRIEF PASSAGES IN A REVIEW.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOG CARD NO. 61-10756

MV

*Published simultaneously in Canada
by Little, Brown & Company (Canada) Limited*

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

EVIDENCE
IN
TRIALS AT COMMON LAW
VOLUME 9

Cite as 9 Wigmore, Evidence § ——— (Chadbourn rev. 1981)

Preface

In the revision of this volume, two chapters, i.e., Chapters 89 and 92, have been substantially enlarged and, to some extent, recast. Revisor's Notes at appropriate places indicate the form and tenor of the changes. In other respects the revision conforms in general to the guidelines stated in the Preface to Volume 3, the first of the several volumes which I have revised.*

I have received support and encouragement from Dean Albert Sacks of the Harvard Law School, for which I express my appreciation. I have also received special consideration and help from members of the publisher's staff, Timothy Robinson, Nancy Campbell, Thomas Lincoln, Marian Wolotkiewicz, and others. My thanks to them for making this revision feasible. I am also indebted to Walter Reiser for making his collection of recent cases available to me and to Bruce Reznik for his diligence in checking the accuracy of citations.

Harvard Law School
January 1, 1981

JAMES H. CHADBOURN

* 3 Wigmore, Evidence v (Chadbourn rev. 1970).

Acknowledgments

Bohlen, *The Effect of Rebuttable Presumptions of Law Upon the Burden of Proof*, 68 U. Pa. L. Rev. 307 (1920). Copyright © 1920 by the University of Pennsylvania Law Review. Reprinted by permission of the University of Pennsylvania Law Review and Fred B. Rothman & Company.

Cleary, *Foreword*, 1969 Law & Soc. Order (now Ariz. St. L.J.) 509-510. Copyright © 1969 by the Arizona State Law Journal. Reprinted by permission.

Cleary, *Presuming and Pleading: An Essay in Juristic Immaturity*, 12 Stan. L. Rev. 19-27 (1959). Copyright © 1959 by the Board of Trustees of the Leland Stanford Junior University. Reprinted by permission of Stanford Law Review and Fred B. Rothman & Company.

Davis, *Judicial Notice*, 55 Colum. L. Rev. 952-953 (1955). Copyright © 1955 by the Columbia Law Review. Reprinted by permission of the Columbia Law Review and the author.

Doniger, *Unburdening the Criminal Defendant: Mullaney v. Wilbur and the Reasonable Doubt Standard*, 11 Harv. C.R.-C.L.L. Rev. 398 (1976). Copyright © 1976 by the Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

Falknor, *Notes on Presumptions*, 15 Wash. L. Rev. 73, 83 (1940). Copyright © 1940 by the Washington Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

James, *Sufficiency of the Evidence and Jury-Control Devices Available Before Verdict*, 47 Va. L. Rev. 218, 220-222 (1961). Copyright © 1961 by the Virginia Law Review. Reprinted by permission of the Virginia Law Review and Fred B. Rothman & Company.

Laughlin, *In Support of the Thayer Theory of Presumptions*, 52 Mich. L. Rev. 216 (1953). Copyright © 1953 by the Michigan Law Review Association. Reprinted by permission.

Maguire, *Common Sense and Common Law* 188-189 (1947). Copyright © 1947 by The Foundation Press, Inc. Reprinted by permission.

McBaine, *Burden of Proof: Presumptions*, 2 U.C.L.A.L. Rev. 22, 26-28 (1954). Copyright © 1954 by the Regents of the University of California, Los Angeles. Reprinted by permission.

McCormick, *Hornbook on Evidence* §§214, 216, 317, 330 (1954). Copyright © 1954 by West Publishing Company. Reprinted by permission.

Morgan, *Instructing the Jury Upon Presumptions and Burden of Proof*, 47 Harv. L. Rev. 70, 82, 83 (1933). Copyright © 1933 by the Harvard Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Morgan, Judicial Notice, 57 Harv. L. Rev. 279-287 (1944). Copyright © 1944 by the Harvard Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

Morgan, Some Observations Concerning Presumptions, 44 Harv. L. Rev. 912-919, 922, 931-934 (1931). Copyright © 1931 by the Harvard Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

Morgan and Maguire, Looking Backward and Forward at Evidence, 50 Harv. L. Rev. 912-913 (1937). Copyright © by the Harvard Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

Ray, *Mullaney v. Wilbur*, The Supreme Court, and the Substantive Criminal Law — An Examination of the Limits of Legitimate Intervention, 55 Tex. L. Rev. 274-276 (1977). Copyright © 1977 by Texas Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

Underwood, The Thumb on the Scales of Justice: Burdens of Persuasion in Criminal Cases, 86 Yale L.J. 1309-1311 (1977). Copyright © 1977 by The Yale Law Journal Company. Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company, Fred B. Rothman & Company, and the author from The Yale Law Journal, Vol. 86, pp. 1309-1311.

Summary of Contents

VOLUME 9

88. Parol Evidence Rule (§§2400-2478)	1
89. General Theory (Burden of Proof; Presumption) (§§2483-2498a)	275
90. Burdens and Presumptions in Specific Issues (§§2499-2540)	451
91. To Whom Evidence Must Be Presented (§§2549-2559)	639
92. Judicial Notice (§§2565-2583)	693
93. Judicial Admissions (§§2588-2597)	821

Table of Contents

VOLUME 9

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Summary of Contents</i>	vii

BOOK I. ADMISSIBILITY (*continued*)

Chapter 88

Part IV. Parol Evidence Rule (Constitution of Jural Acts)

INTRODUCTORY

§2400. Parol evidence rule not a rule of evidence	3
§2401. Parol evidence rule, a group of rules defining constitution of jural acts; four subdivisions of the subject	7

A. CREATION OF JURAL ACTS (VOIDNESS AND VOIDABLENESS)

§2404. General principle; subject, terms, and delivery; intent and expression	10
§2405. History of the principle	11

1. SUBJECT, TENOR, DELIVERY

§2406. (a) Subject must concern jural relations; transactions of jest, friendship, charity, and pretense; illegalities	16
---	----

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§2407. (b) Terms must be definite; terms implied from conduct; document void for uncertainty	20
§2408. (c) Act must be final: (1) Delivery as applied to deeds; conditions precedent; escrows	20
§2409. — (2) Delivery as applied to negotiable instruments	28
§2410. — (3) Delivery as applied to contracts in general; conditions precedent and subsequent; assent of third persons; blanks; dates	30
§2411. — (4) Publication as applied to wills	37

2. INTENT AND MISTAKE AS APPLIED TO SUBJECT, TERMS, AND DELIVERY OF AN ACT

§2413. Intent and mistake in general; modern test of reasonable consequences applied to expressed intent	38
§2414. (A) Jural subject of an act; secret intent not to be bound	44
§2415. (B) Terms of an act; (a) Signing a completed document by mistake: (1) Individual mistake not known to or induced by the second party	45
§2416. — (2) Individual mistake known to or induced by the second party; release of a claim	51
§2417. — (3) Mutual mistake; general principle	59
§2418. — (3) Mutual mistake (continued), as affecting bona fide holders for value	62
§2419. (B) Terms of an act; (b) Signing a document having blanks or capable of alteration; writing one's name not as a signature	63
§2420. (C) Delivery of a document; deed or negotiable instrument delivered to bona fide holder contrary to intent of maker	66
§2421. Unilateral acts; foregoing principles applied to wills and ballots	68

3. VOIDABLE ACTS

§2423. Motive as making an act voidable; mistake, fraud, duress, infancy, insanity	72
--	----

B. INTEGRATION OF JURAL ACTS (VARYING THE TERMS OF A DOCUMENT)

§2425. General theory of the rule against varying the terms of a writing	75
§2426. History of the rule	81

1. INTEGRATION OF UNILATERAL ACTS

§2427. Official documents (surveys, appointments, assessments, etc.)	93
--	----

2. INTEGRATION OF BILATERAL ACTS

§2429. No integration at all; casual memoranda	96
§2430. Partial integration: General test for applying the rule; "collateral agreements"	97
§2431. — Incorrect tests: (a) "Varying the terms of the writing"; (b) "The writing is the sole criterion"; (c) Fraud in Pennsylvania	101
§2432. Receipts and releases; bills of lading	104

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§2433.	Recital of consideration in a deed	108
§2434.	Sales; Uniform Commercial Code; insurance warranties	113
§2434a.	Agent's authority to alter contract	117
§2435.	Agreements not to sue, or not to enforce, or to hold conditional only	118
§2436.	Agreements of counterclaim, set-off, renewal, or mode of payment	121
§2437.	Agreement to hold a deed absolute as security only; agreement to hold in trust	121
§2438.	Agreement to hold as surety or as agent only	125
§2439.	Fraud; illegality	128
§2440.	Trade usage and custom	131
§2441.	Novation, alteration, and waiver; subsequent agreements	135
§2442.	Miscellaneous applications of the rule to exclude or admit "collateral" agreements	138
§2443.	Rule applied to negotiable instruments: General principle	146
§2444.	— (a) Agreements affecting the express terms of the document	148
§2445.	— (b) Agreements affecting the implied terms of the instrument	154
§2446.	Rule binding upon the parties to the document only	156
§2447.	Burden of proof; who must produce the document	159
§2448.	Loss of the instrument; oral transaction is still immaterial	162
§2449.	Agreement to treat a specific copy as the "original"	162
 3. INTEGRATION REQUIRED BY LAW 		
§2450.	At common law: (1) Judicial records	163
§2451.	— (2) Corporate acts and records; (3) Negotiable instruments	170
§2452.	Under statutes: (1) Wills; (2) Ballots; (3) Insurance policies	173
§2453.	Conclusive certificates distinguished	177
 C. SOLEMNIZATION OF JURAL ACTS 		
§2454.	Writing as a formality: Statute of frauds	178
§2455.	— Discharge and lateration of specialities, etc.	182
§2456.	Other formalities than writing; signature, seal; attestation; registration; stamp	183
 D. INTERPRETATION OF JURAL ACTS 		
§2458.	General nature of interpretation: Standard and sources of interpretation	185
§2459.	— "Intention" and "meaning" distinguished	188
 1. STANDARD OF INTERPRETATION 		
§2460.	General principle; four standards — popular, local, mutual, individual	190
§2461.	Rule against "disturbing a clear meaning" or forbidding explanation except of ambiguities: history	193
§2462.	— Theory and policy of the rule	197
§2463.	— Application of the rule to wills, deeds, contracts, etc.	204
§2464.	Usage of trade or locality, when to apply	216
§2465.	Parties' mutual understanding; identifying a description	220
§2466.	Individual party's meaning: (1) Deeds and contracts	229
§2467.	— (2) Wills	231

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2. SOURCES OF INTERPRETATION

§2470. General principle: All extrinsic circumstances may be considered	234
§2471. Exception for declarations of intention	238
§2472. — (1) Exception for equivocation or latent ambiguity	243
§2473. — Blanks and patent ambiguities	250
§2474. — (2) Exception for erroneous description	253
§2475. — (3) Exception for "rebutting an equity" (legacies, advancements, and pretermitted heirs)	259
§2476. <i>Falsa demonstratio non nocet</i> : General principle	261
§2477. — Application to deeds and wills	265
§2478. Sundry rules; interpretation of statutes, ballots	273

BOOK II. BY WHOM EVIDENCE MUST BE PRESENTED (BURDEN OF PROOF; PRESUMPTION)

Chapter 89

Title I. General Theory

§2483. Production of evidence by the parties	276
§2484. Evidence sought by the judge <i>ex mero motu</i> ; questions to witnesses by the judge	276

A. BURDENS OF PROOF

<i>Revisor's note</i>	283
§2485. Burden of proof: (1) First meaning; risk of nonpersuasion of the jury	283
§2486. — Test for this burden; negative and affirmative allegations; facts peculiarly within a party's knowledge	287
§2487. Burden of proof: (2) Second meaning; duty of producing evidence to the judge	292
§2488. — Tests for ascertaining this burden	299
§2489. Shifting the burden of proof	300

B. PRESUMPTIONS: THE THAYER THEORY

<i>Revisor's note</i>	302
§2490. Presumptions; legal effects of a presumption	302
§2491. Presumptions of law and of fact	304
§2492. Conclusive presumptions	307
§2493. Conflicting presumptions; counterpresumptions	308

C. PRESUMPTIONS: ALTERNATIVES TO THE THAYER THEORY

<i>Revisor's note</i>	309
§2493a. Introduction	309
§2493b. Classifying presumptions	310

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§2493c. Shifting the burden of persuasion	314
§2493d. Imposing the burden of producing an equivalence of probability	319
§2493e. Replacing presumptions with pleading	323
§2493f. The American Law Institute Code of Evidence (1942); The Uniform Rules of Evidence (1953)	325
§2493g. Reconsideration of the Thayer Theory	333

D. PRESUMPTIONS: LEGISLATION AND COURT RULES

<i>Revisor's note</i>	337
§2493h. The Federal Rules of Evidence	337
§2493i. The California Evidence Code	341
§2493j. The Uniform Rules of Evidence (1974)	350
§2493k. Legislation and court rules in jurisdictions other than federal and California	352

E. SUFFICIENCY OF EVIDENCE

§2494. Prima facie evidence; sufficient evidence for the jury; scintilla of evidence	378
§2495. Direction of a verdict, motion for a nonsuit, and demurrer to evidence	388
§2496. Waiver of motion by subsequent introduction of evidence	402

F. MEASURE OF JURY'S PERSUASION

§2497. Measure of jury's persuasion: (1) Proof beyond a reasonable doubt; rule for criminal cases	404
§2497a. — (2) Proof beyond a reasonable doubt as a constitutional requirement; affirmative defenses	416
§2498. — (3) Proof by preponderance of evidence; rule for civil cases	419

G. PROPOSED COURT RULES FOR THIS SUBJECT

§2498a. A proposal for the future treatment of the rules for presumptions and burdens	433
---	-----

Chapter 90

Title II. Burdens and Presumptions in Specific Issues

§2499. Introductory	452
§2500. Sanity: (1) Testamentary and other civil causes; suicide	454

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§2501. — (2) Criminal causes	457
§2502. Undue influence and fraud: (1) Testamentary execution	467
§2503. — (2) Confidential relations of grantee or other beneficiary	468
§2504. — (3) Fraudulent conveyances against creditors	473
§2505. Marriage: (1) Consent, from cohabitation or ceremony	473
§2506. — (2) Capacity, as affected by intervening death, divorce, or marriage	475
§2507. Negligence and accident: (1) Contributory negligence	479
§2508. — (2) Loss by bailee	483
§2509. — (3) Defective machines, vehicles, and apparatus	487
§2510. — (4) Death by violence	513
§2511. — (5) Ownership and agency of vehicle	520
§2511. Crimes: (1) Innocence	530
§2511a. — (2) Malice, intent, etc.	536
§2512. — (3) Self-defense, alibi, etc.	536
§2513. — (4) Possession of stolen goods	547
§2514. — (5) Capacity (infancy, intoxication, coverture)	555
§2515. — Ownership: (1) Possession of land and personality	559
§2516. — (2) Possession of negotiable instrument	561
§2517. Payment: (1) Lapse of time	561
§2518. — (2) Possession of instrument or receipt	562
§2518a. — (3) Delivery of money	564
§2518b. — (4) Delivery of negotiable note	564
§2519. Execution and contents of document: (1) Letters and telegrams; presumption of arrival	564
§2520. — (2) Execution of documents (delivery, date, seal, consideration)	569
§2521. — (3) Ancient documents	573
§2522. — (4) Lost grant; lost documents in general	573
§2523. — (5) Will (execution and revocation)	574
§2524. — (6) Spoliation or suppression of documents	577
§2525. — (7) Alteration of documents	577
§2526. Gifts and trusts (wife's separate estate, child's advancement, child's services, etc.)	581
§2527. Legitimacy	584
§2528. Chastity: Sterility (childbearing); impotency	589
§2529. Identity of person (from name, etc.)	591
§2530. Continuity: (1) In general (ownership, possession, residence, insanity, etc.)	599
§2531. — (2) Continuance of life	602
§2531a. Death from disappearance	603
§2531b. — Replacing the presumption of death by a proceeding for distribution of an absentee's estate; Uniform Act	613
§2531c. — Devolution of life estate, etc.	616
§2531d. — Bigamous marriage	617
§2531e. — Loss of a vessel	618
§2532. Survivorship in a common disaster	619
§2532a. — Replacing the presumption by rules for disposition of estates; Uniform Act	621
§2533. Seaworthiness	624
§2534. Regularity: (1) Performance of official duty and regularity of proceedings	625
§2535. — (2) Appointment and authority of officers; incorporation	627
§2536. Similarity of foreign law	630
§2537. Contracts	635
§2538. Statute of limitations	636
§2539. Malicious prosecution	636
§2540. Sundry burdens and presumptions	637

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 91

BOOK III. TO WHOM EVIDENCE MUST BE PRESENTED (LAW AND FACT; JUDGE AND JURY)

§2549. Functions of judge and jury; general principles	639
§2550. Admissibility of evidence	640
§2551. Sufficiency of proof: Comment on evidence	664
§2551a. — Restoration of the judge's power to comment on evidence	670
§2552. Negligence	680
§2553. Reasonableness	681
§2554. — Malicious prosecution	683
§2555. Facts judicially noticed; trial by inspection; nuli tiel record; constitutional considerations	683
§2556. Construction of documents	684
§2557. Criminal intent	687
§2558. Foreign law	687
§2559. Local law	691

BOOK IV. OF WHAT PROPOSITIONS NO EVIDENCE NEED BE PRESENTED

Chapter 92

Title I. Judicial Notice

1. GENERAL PRINCIPLES

§2565. Theories of judicial notice: (a) Traditional view; (b) Professor Davis's view; (c) Recent legislation and court rules	693
§2566. Anomalous meanings of the term judicial notice	711
§2567. Effect of judicial notice; view that it is not conclusive	714
§2567a. Effect of judicial notice; view that it is conclusive	716
§2568. Whether judicial notice must be requested; whether notification is necessary	719
§2568a. Judge may seek or call for information	720
§2569. Judge's private knowledge; judge's knowledge of facts determinable by him	722
§2570. Judicial notice by the jury's own knowledge	726

2. SPECIFIC KINDS OF FACTS NOTICED

§2571. Scope of principle	731
§2572. Laws: (1) Domestic laws and ordinances	755

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§2573.	— (2) Foreign law	764
§2574.	Political facts: (1) International affairs; seals of state	778
§2575.	— (2) Domestic political organization; boundaries, capitals, etc.	778
§2576.	— (3) Domestic officials, their identity and authority; genuineness of official documents	782
§2577.	— (4) Official acts; elections, census, legislative proceedings, etc.	784
§2578.	Judicial proceedings: (1) Officers and rules of court	786
§2579.	— (2) Records of proceedings	789
§2580.	Notorious miscellaneous facts: (1) Commerce, industry, history, natural science, etc.	796
§2581.	— (2) Times and distances	807
§2582.	— (3) Meaning of words; names of intoxicating liquors	809
§2583.	Future of the doctrine of judicial notice	813

Chapter 93

Title II. Judicial Admissions

§2588.	Theory of judicial admissions	821
§2589.	Distinction between judicial admissions, pleadings, demurrers to evidence, estoppels, and discovery	822
§2590.	Effect of judicial admissions: (1) Conclusive upon the party making	822
§2591.	— (2) Prohibitive of evidence by the party benefiting	824
§2592.	— (3) Validity as a waiver of unconstitutionality or other illegality	827
§2593.	— (4) Effect on subsequent trials	829
§2594.	Form of the admission: Who is authorized	832
§2594a.	— Party's testimony as a conclusive admission	834
§2595.	Avoiding a continuance by judicial admission; testimony of an absent witness of the opponent	844
§2596.	Admissions of the genuineness of a document	850
§2597.	Future of the doctrine of judicial admissions; pretrial procedure	851