ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY LAW

PROBLEMS, CASES, AND READINGS

SIXTH EDITION

HOLLY DOREMUS

ALBERT C. LIN

RONALD H. ROSENBERG

FOUNDATION PRESS

PROBLEMS, CASES, AND READINGS

ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY LAW

SIXTH EDITION

by

HOLLY DOREMUS

Professor of Law University of California at Berkeley School of Law

ALBERT C. LIN

Professor of Law University of California at Davis School of Law

RONALD H. ROSENBERG

Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Chancellor Professor of Law William and Mary Law School College of William and Mary



This publication was created to provide you with accurate and authoritative information concerning the subject matter covered; however, this publication was not necessarily prepared by persons licensed to practice law in a particular jurisdiction. The publisher is not engaged in rendering legal or other professional advice and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

Nothing contained herein is intended or written to be used for the purposes of 1) avoiding penalties imposed under the federal Internal Revenue Code, or 2) promoting, marketing or recommending to another party any transaction or matter addressed herein.

- © 1982, 1985, 1991, 1996, 2002 FOUNDATION PRESS
- © 2008 By THOMSON REUTERS/FOUNDATION PRESS
- © 2012 By THOMSON REUTERS/FOUNDATION PRESS

1 New York Plaza, 34th Floor New York, NY 10004 Phone Toll Free 1–877–888–1330 Fax 646–424–5201 foundation–press.com Printed in the United States of America

ISBN 978-1-60930-173-6

Mat #41289913

UNIVERSITY CASEBOOK SERIES

EDITORIAL BOARD

ROBERT C. CLARK

DIRECTING EDITOR

Distinguished Service Professor and Austin Wakeman Scott Professor of Law and Former Dean of the Law School Harvard University

DANIEL A. FARBER

Sho Sato Professor of Law and Director, Environmental Law Program University of California at Berkeley

SAMUEL ISSACHAROFF

Bonnie and Richard Reiss Professor of Constitutional Law New York University

HERMA HILL KAY

Barbara Nachtrieb Armstrong Professor of Law and Former Dean of the School of Law University of California at Berkeley

SAUL LEVMORE

William B. Graham Distinguished Service Professor of Law and Former Dean of the Law School University of Chicago

THOMAS W. MERRILL

Charles Evans Hughes Professor of Law Columbia University

ROBERT L. RABIN

A. Calder Mackay Professor of Law Stanford University

CAROL M. ROSE

Gordon Bradford Tweedy Professor Emeritus of Law and Organization and Professorial Lecturer in Law Yale University Lohse Chair in Water and Natural Resources University of Arizona

PREFACE

Environmental law is no longer a new field. Few people today would be surprised to learn that the law addresses a variety of environmental problems. Many attorneys consider at least a portion of their practice to be "environmental" in some sense; personal injury litigation, real estate transactions, corporate counseling and other practices all raise environmental issues. Environmental law proved its staying power in the mid-1990s, when advocates of deregulation gained a majority in Congress but were unable to significantly relax federal environmental laws.

Although it has in some respects matured over the last two decades, environmental law remains an exciting and controversial field. Environmental problems typically share a number of characteristics that complicate attempts to find legal solutions to them. Human activities can affect the environment at great distances, crossing state and international boundaries. Environmental harms often result from the combination of a number of different actions, and even different types of action, none of which would be problematic in isolation. It is frequently difficult to predict the environmental consequences of action, or even to measure them. It is equally difficult to agree on the value of environmental harm, or how it should be compared with the economic costs of preventing it. Because of the threat of irreversible or catastrophic harm, environmentalists often argue for early, precautionary, responses. On the other hand, proposals for economically costly regulation face substantial resistance where their benefits cannot be clearly demonstrated.

We take a very broad view of environmental law, encompassing the regulation of private and public land use and protection of wildlife as well as pollution control and remediation. We believe that artificially separating pollution law from the regulation of natural resources can obscure important conceptual similarities. Each instructor, of course, must determine the appropriate scope of coverage for his or her class. This casebook is designed to facilitate that kind of selection. It provides sufficient breadth for any introductory environmental or natural resources law course.

Environmental law remains highly complex. Students who aspire to practice environmental law must gain a sense of that complexity, and the confidence to address it. They must learn something of the science, economics, and philosophy used to evaluate environmental controversies. They must become familiar with regulations and the basics of administrative law, as well as statutes and judicial opinions. They must understand that state and local law, although still not as important as federal law, plays an increasingly important role as the federal courts take an increasingly restrictive view of federal powers.

At the same time, environmental law remains subject to continual modification. Although there have been few amendments to the major federal environmental statutes in the last few years, judicial opinions and regulatory changes have continued apace. Since the details will surely change, we believe it is most productive for teachers and students to focus on the larger picture. We have struck a balance by focusing in detail on those portions of the statutes covered that raise particularly interesting or important conceptual issues. Throughout, we highlight perpetual controversies such as the nature of human relationships to nature, the appropriate extent of individual control over natural resource use, and the degree of certainty needed to support regulatory intervention.

We have included in each chapter a number of problems designed to provide a concrete focus for classroom discussion. These problems help students develop and test their facility with the materials in the text and the concepts underlying those materials.

The development of such a comprehensive set of materials necessarily reflects the combined efforts of many people. Berkeley Law, the University of California, Davis, School of Law, and the William and Mary Law School provided invaluable institutional and financial support. Finally, we owe a tremendous debt to Gordon Anthon, Linh Thai, and Yanfang Tang for their patience and support during the course of this project.

HOLLY DOREMUS
Berkeley, California
ALBERT C. LIN
Davis, California
RONALD H. ROSENBERG
Williamsburg, Virginia

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The following copyrighted material has been reproduced with permission of the copyright holder:

Adler, Robert W., Integrated Approaches to Water Pollution: Lessons from the Clean Air Act, 23 Harv. Envtl. L. Rev. 203, 228 (1999), reprinted with permission.

Andreen, William L., In Pursuit of NEPA's Promise: The Role of Executive Oversight in the Implementation of Environmental Policy, 64 Ind. L.J. 205, 245–247 (1989), reprinted with permission.

Andreen, William L., The Evolution of Water Pollution Control in the United States: State, Local and Federal Efforts, 1789–1972, Part I, 22 Stan. Envtl. L. J. 145, 161 (2003), reprinted with permission.

Andreen, William L., Water Quality Today—Has the Clean Water Act Been a Success?, 55 Ala. L. Rev. 537 (2004), reprinted with permission.

Andrews, Richard N.L., The Unfinished Business of National Environmental Policy, in Environmental Policy and NEPA: Past, Present, and Future, 85 (Ray Clark and Larry Canter eds, 1997), reprinted with permission.

Applegate, John S., Synthesizing TSCA and REACH: Practical Principles for Chemical Regulation Reform, 35 Ecology L.Q. 721 (2008), reprinted with permission of the Regents of the University of California.

Bachmann, John, Will the Circle Be Unbroken: A History of the U.S. National Ambient Air Quality Standards, 57 Journal of the Air and Waste Management Association 652 (2007), reprinted with permission.

Baxter, William F., People or Penguins: The Case for Optimal Pollution, 4–12 (Columbia University Press 1974), reprinted with permission.

Bear, Dinah, NEPA at 19: A Primer on an "Old" Law with Solutions to New Problems, 19 Envtl. L. Rep. 10060, 10061–10065 (1989). Copyright 1989, Environmental Law Institute, reprinted with permission.

Brunet, Edward, Debunking Wholesale Pivate Envorcement of Environmental Rights, 15 Harv. J.L. & Pub. Pol'y 311, 313–323 (1992), reprinted with permission.

Bryner, Gary C., Carbon Markets: Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions Through Emissions Trading, 17 Tul. Envtl. L. J. 267 (2004).

Cannon, Jonathan Z., Adaptive Management in Superfund: Thinking like a Contaminated Site, 13 N.Y.U. Envtl. L. J. 561 (2005), reprinted with permission.

Charnovitz, Steve, Free Trade, Fair Trade, Green Trade: Defogging the Debate, 27 Cornell Int'l L.J. 459, 462–65 (1994), reprinted with permission.

Cole, Luke W. and Caroline Farrell, Structural Racism, Structural Pollution and the Need for a New Paradigm, 20 Wash. U. J. L. & Pol'y 265, 268–273 (2006).

Commission for Racial Justice, United Church of Christ, Toxic Wastes and Race in the United States, 13 (1987), reprinted with permission.

Coquillette, Daniel R., Mosses from an Old Manse: Another Look at Some Historic Property Cases About the Environment, 64 Cornell L. Rev. 761, 792 (1979), reprinted with permission.

Cross, Frank B., Common Law Conceits: A Comment on Meiners & Yandle, 7 Geo. Mason L. Rev. 965, 966–981 (1999), reprinted with permission.

Doremus, Holly, Patching the Ark: Improving Legal Protection of Biological Diversity, 18 Ecology L.Q. 265, 269–281 (1991), reprinted with permission.

Driesen, David M., Is Emissions Trading an Economic Incentive Program?: Replacing the Command and Control/Economic Incentive Dichotomy, 55 Washington & Lee Law Review 289, 313–319, 324–338 (1998), reprinted with permission.

Drury, Richard Toshiyuki, Michael E. Belliveau, J. Scott Kuhn & Shipra Bansal, Pollution Trading and Environmental Injustice: Los Angeles' Failed Experiment in Air Quality Policy, 9 Duke Envtl. L. & Pol'y Forum 231 (1999).

Fine, James D. and Dave Owen, Technocracy and Democracy: Conflicts Between Models and Participation in Environmental Law and Planning, 56 Hastings L. J. 901, 949–965 (2005), reprinted with permission.

Fischman, Robert L., Cooperative Federalism and Natural Resources Law, 14 N.Y.U. Envtl L.J. 179 (2005), reprinted with permission.

Germany's Polluter Pays Concept Could Be Applied to U.S. Industry, 17 Int'l Env't Rptr. (BNA) 368 (1994), reproduced with permission from International Environment Reporter, Vol. 17, No. 8, p. 368 (April 20, 1994). Copyright 1994 by The Bureau of National Affairs, Inc. (800–372–1033) http://www.bna.com.

Hamilton, James T. & W. Kip Viscusi, Calculating Risks: The Spatial and Political Dimensions of Hazardous Waste Policy 240–43 (The MIT Press, 1999).

Hardin, Garrett, The Tragedy of the Commons, reprinted with permission from 162 Science 1243, 1244–1245, 1247 (1968). Copyright 1968 American Association for the Advancement of Science.

Heinzerling, Lisa, Discounting Our Future, 34 Land & Water L. Rev. 39, 44 (1999), reprinted with permission.

Hill, Randolph L., An Overview of RCRA: The "Mind-Numbing" Provisions of the Most Complicated Environmental Statute, 21 Envtl. L. Rep. 10254, 10268–10269 (1991), copyright © 1991 Environmental Law

Institute®, Washington, DC. Reprinted with permission from **ELR®** – **The Environmental Law Reporter**®. All rights reserved.

Houck, Oliver A. Houck, The Clean Water Act TMDL Program: Law, Policy, and Implementation, 2d ed., 87–92 (ELI Press 2002).

Hsu, Shi-Ling, Reducing Emissions from the Electricity Generation Industry: Can We Finally Do It?, 14 Tulane Envtl. L. J. 427 (2001), reprinted with permission.

Karkkainen, Bradley C., Information as Environmental Regulation: TRI and Performance Benchmarking, Precursor to a New Paradigm? 89 Geo. L.J. 257, 287–333 (2000), reprinted with permission. Reprinted with permission of the publisher, Georgetown Law Journal © 2000.

Krieger, Martin H., What's Wrong With Plastic Trees, reprinted with permission from 179 Science 446, 446–453 (1973). Copyright 1973 American Association for the Advancement of Science.

Lazarus, Richard J., Restoring What's Environmental About Environmental Law in the Supreme Court, 47 UCLA L. Rev. 703, 744–748 (2000), reprinted with permission.

Lazarus, Richard J., Meeting the Demands of Integration in the Evolution of Environmental Law: Reforming Environmental Criminal Law, 83 Geo. L.J. 2407, 2423–38 (1995), reprinted with permission of the publisher, Georgetown Law Journal © 1995.

Leopold, Aldo, A Sand County Almanac: with other Essays on Conservation from Round River, 218–240, copyright 1949, 1953, 1966, renewed 1977, 1981 by Oxford University Press. Used by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.

Lin, Albert C., Size Matters: Regulating Nanotechnology, 32 Harv. Envtl. L. Rev. 349 (2007), reprinted with permission.

McCauley, Douglas J., Selling Out on Nature, 443 Nature 27, 27–28 (2006). Reprinted by permission from Macmillan Publishers Ltd.: Nature 443:27, copyright 2006.

McGarity, Thomas O., Missing Milestones: A Critical Look at the Clean Air Act's VOC Emissions Reduction Program in Non–Attainment Areas, 18 Virginia Environmental Law Journal 41 (1999).

Meiners, Roger & Yandle, Bruce, Common Law and the Conceit of Modern Environmental Policy, 7 Geo. Mason L. Rev. 923, 946–959 (1999), reprinted with permission.

Meyer, Judy L., The Dance of Nature: New Concepts in Ecology, 69 Chi.–Kent L. Rev. 875, 875–886 (1994), reprinted with permission.

Noss, Reed F., Some Principles of Conservation Biology, As They Apply to Environmental Law, 69 Chi.–Kent L. Rev. 893, 895 (1994), reprinted with permission.

Pacala, S. and R. Socolow, Stabilization Wedges: Solving the Climate Problem for the Next 50 Years with Current Technologies, 305 Science 968–72 (2004).

Pedersen, William F. Pedersen, Jr., Turning the Tide on Water Quality, 15 Ecology L.Q. 69, 82–83 (1988), reprinted with permission.

Rechtschaffen, Clifford, The Warning Game: Evaluating Warnings Under California's Proposition 65, 23 Ecology L.Q. 303, 313–348 (1996), reprinted with permission.

Rechtschaffen, Clifford, Deterrence vs. Cooperation and the Evolving Theory of Environmental Enforcement, 71 S. Cal. L. Rev. 1181, 1186–89 (1998), reprinted with the permission of the Southern California Law Review.

Sagoff, Mark, We Have Met the Enemy and He Is Us or Conflict and Contradiction in Environmental Law, 12 Envtl. L. 283, 283–308 (1982), reprinted with permission.

Salzman, James, Sustainable Consumption and the Law, 27 Envtl. L. 1243, 1273 (1997), reprinted with permission.

Salzman, James, Thompson, Barton H. & Daily, Gretchen, Protecting Ecosystem Services: Science, Economics, and Law, 20 Stan. Envtl. L.J. 309, 312 (2001), reprinted with permission.

Sax, Joseph, Introduction to Symposium: Environmental Law: More Than Just a Passing Fad, 19 U. Mich. J.L. Ref. 797, 804 (1986), reprinted with permission.

Setear, John K., Ozone, Iteration, and International Law, 40 Va. J. Int'l L. 193, 195–216 (1999), reprinted with permission.

Shavell, Steven, Liability for Harm Versus Regulation of Safety, 13 J. Legal Stud. 357, 357–365 (1984). Copyright 1984 by The University of Chicago. All rights reserved.

Sigman, Hilary, The Pace of Progress at Superfund Sites: Policy Goals and Interest Group Influence, 44 J. L. & Econ. 315 (2001), reprinted with permission.

Slovic, Paul, The Risk Game, 86 J. Hazardous Materials 17 (2001), reprinted with permission from Elsevier.

Stavins, Robert N., Vintage Differentiated Environmental Regulation, 25 Stan. Envtl. L. J. 29, 30 (2006), reprinted with permission.

Stewart, Richard B., Pyramids of Sacrifice? Problems of Federalism in Mandating State Implementation of National Environmental Policy. Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company and William S. Hein Company from The Yale Law Journal, Vol. 86, pages 1196–1272.

Sunstein, Cass R., Of Montreal and Kyoto: A Tale of Two Protocols, 31 Harv. Envtl. L. Rev. 1 (2007), reprinted with permission.

Tarlock, A. Dan, Environmental Law: Ethics or Science? 7 Duke Envtl. L. & Pol'y F. 193, 194–195, 221–223 (1996).

Thornton, Robert D., Searching for Consensus and Predictability: Habitat Conservation Planning Under the Endangered Species Act of 1973, 21 Envtl. L. 605, 621–624 (1991), reprinted with permission.

Torres, Gerald, Introduction: Understanding Environmental Racism, 63 U. Colo. L. Rev. 839, 839–840 (1992), reprinted with permission.

Uhlmann, David M., Environmental Crime Comes of Age: The Evolution of Criminal Enforcement in the Environmental Regulatory Scheme, 2009 Utah L. Rev. 1223 (2009), reprinted with permission.

TABLE OF CASES

Principal cases are in bold type. Non-principal cases are in roman type. References are to Pages.

- Abbott Laboratories v. Gardner, 387 U.S. 136, 87 S.Ct. 1507, 18 L.Ed.2d 681 (1967), 109
- Abeyta, United States v., 632 F.Supp. 1301 (D.N.M.1986), 324
- Abilene, City of v. United States E.P.A., 325 F.3d 657 (5th Cir.2003), 205
- Abreu v. United States, 468 F.3d 20 (1st Cir.2006), 797
- Aceto Agr. Chemicals Corp., United States v., 872 F.2d 1373 (8th Cir.1989), 578
- ACORN v. Edwards, 81 F.3d 1387 (5th Cir. 1996), 205
- Action Mfg. Co., Inc. v. Simon Wrecking Co., 428 F.Supp.2d 288 (E.D.Pa.2006), 601
- Adams v. Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Co., 237 Mich.App. 51, 602 N.W.2d 215 (Mich.App. 1999), 43
- Agent Orange Product Liability Litigation, In re, 611 F.Supp. 1223 (E.D.N.Y. 1985), 58
- Air Pollution Variance Bd. of Colorado v. Western Alfalfa Corp., 416 U.S. 861, 94 S.Ct. 2114, 40 L.Ed.2d 607 (1974), 849
- Alabama v. North Carolina, ___ U.S. ___, 130 S.Ct. 2295, 176 L.Ed.2d 1070 (2010), 205
- Alabama ex rel. Siegelman, State of v. U.S. E.P.A., 911 F.2d 499 (11th Cir.1990), 256
- Alabama-Tombigbee Rivers Coalition v. Kempthorne, 477 F.3d 1250 (11th Cir. 2007), 195
- A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corporation v.
 United States, 295 U.S. 495, 55 S.Ct. 837,
 79 L.Ed. 1570 (1935), 103, 184
- **Alaska Dept. of Environmental Conservation v. E.P.A.**, 540 U.S. 461, 124 S.Ct. 983, 157 L.Ed.2d 967 (2004), **170**
- Alaska Sport Fishing Ass'n v. Exxon Corp., 34 F.3d 769 (9th Cir.1994), 616
- Albuquerque, City of v. Browner, 97 F.3d 415 (10th Cir.1996), 825
- Alcan Aluminum Corp., United States v., 964 F.2d 252 (3rd Cir.1992), **549**
- Alcan Aluminum Corp., United States v., 97 F.Supp.2d 248 (N.D.N.Y.2000), 561
- Alexander v. Choate, 469 U.S. 287, 105 S.Ct. 712, 83 L.Ed.2d 661 (1985), 525
- Alexander v. Sandoval, 532 U.S. 275, 121 S.Ct. 1511, 149 L.Ed.2d 517 (2001), 526

- Alexandria, Va., City of v. Slater, 198 F.3d 862 (D.C.Cir.1999), 289
- Allegheny Ludlum Corp., United States v., 366 F.3d 164 (3rd Cir.2004), 873
- Allen v. Wright, 468 U.S. 737, 104 S.Ct. 3315, 82 L.Ed.2d 556 (1984), 139
- Alliance for Bio-Integrity v. Shalala, 116 F.Supp.2d 166 (D.D.C.2000), 268
- Alliance for the Wild Rockies v. Cottrell, 632 F.3d 1127 (9th Cir.2011), 305, 306
- Allied Local and Regional Mfrs. Caucus v. United States E.P.A., 215 F.3d 61 (D.C.Cir.2000), 196
- American Airlines, Inc. v. Department of Transp., 202 F.3d 788 (5th Cir.2000), 257, 281
- American Chemistry Council v. E.P.A., 337 F.3d 1060 (D.C.Cir.2003), 500
- American Elec. Power Co., Inc. v. Connecticut, ___ U.S. ___, 131 S.Ct. 2527, 180 L.Ed.2d 435 (2011), 68, 149
- American Farm Bureau Federation v. E.P.A., 559 F.3d 512 (D.C.Cir.2009), 643, 659, 660, 661
- American Federation of Labor and Congress of Indus. Organizations v. Occupational Safety and Health Admin., United States Dept. of Labor, 965 F.2d 962 (11th Cir. 1992), 443
- American Hosp. Ass'n v. Bowen, 834 F.2d 1037 (D.C.Cir.1987), 99
- American Petroleum Institute v. United States E.P.A., 858 F.2d 261 (5th Cir. 1988), 809
- American Petroleum Institute v. United States E.P.A., 216 F.3d 50 (D.C.Cir. 2000), 484
- American Textile Mfrs. Institute, Inc. v. Donovan (The Cotton Dust Case), 452 U.S. 490, 101 S.Ct. 2478, 69 L.Ed.2d 185 (1981), 442
- American Trucking Associations, Inc. v. E.P.A., 283 F.3d 355 (D.C.Cir.2002), **649**, 661
- Amoco Production Co. v. Village of Gambell, AK, 480 U.S. 531, 107 S.Ct. 1396, 94 L.Ed.2d 542 (1987), 292
- Anacostia Watershed Soc. v. Babbitt, 871 F.Supp. 475 (D.D.C.1994), 281
- Anderson v. Evans, 371 F.3d 475 (9th Cir. 2004), 255

- Anglado v. Leaf River Forest Products, Inc., 716 So.2d 543 (Miss.1998), 58
- Appalachian Power Co. v. E.P.A., 208 F.3d 1015 (D.C.Cir.2000), 99
- Arcadia, City of v. State Water Resources Control Bd., 38 Cal.Rptr.3d 373 (Cal.App. 4 Dist.2006), 837
- ARC Ecology v. United States Dept. of Air Force, 411 F.3d 1092 (9th Cir.2005), 562 Arizona Public Service Co. v. E.P.A., 211
- Arkansas v. Oklahoma, 503 U.S. 91, 112 S.Ct. 1046, 117 L.Ed.2d 239 (1992), 180

F.3d 1280 (D.C.Cir.2000), 98

- Arlington Heights, Village of v. Metropolitan Housing Development Corp., 429 U.S. 252, 97 S.Ct. 555, 50 L.Ed.2d 450 (1977), 525
- ASARCO, Inc. v. Occupational Safety and Health Admin., 746 F.2d 483 (9th Cir. 1984), 443
- Association of Data Processing Service Organizations, Inc. v. Camp, 397 U.S. 150, 90 S.Ct. 827, 25 L.Ed.2d 184 (1970), 149
- Association of Pacific Fisheries v. E.P.A., 615 F.2d 794 (9th Cir.1980), 813
- Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Ry. Co. v. Brown & Bryant, Inc., 159 F.3d 358 (9th Cir.1997), 580
- Atlanta Coalition on Transp. Crisis, Inc. v. Atlanta Regional Commission, 599 F.2d 1333 (5th Cir.1979), 281
- Atlantic Research Corp., United States v., 551 U.S. 128, 127 S.Ct. 2331, 168 L.Ed.2d 28 (2007), 593
- Automotive Parts & Accessories Ass'n v. Boyd, 407 F.2d 330 (D.C.Cir.1968), 98
- Ayers v. Jackson Tp., 106 N.J. 557, 525 A.2d 287 (N.J.1987), 62
- Babbitt v. Sweet Home Chapter of Communities for a Great Oregon, 515 U.S. 687, 115 S.Ct. 2407, 132 L.Ed.2d 597 (1995), 353
- Bailey, United States v., 571 F.3d 791 (8th Cir.2009), 782
- Ball v. Joy Technologies, Inc., 958 F.2d 36 (4th Cir.1991), 67
- Baltimore Gas and Elec. Co. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc., 462 U.S. 87, 103 S.Ct. 2246, 76 L.Ed.2d 437 (1983), 116
- Bates v. Dow Agrosciences LLC, 544 U.S. 431, 125 S.Ct. 1788, 161 L.Ed.2d 687 (2005), 231, 461
- BCCA Appeal Group v. United States E.P.A., 355 F.3d 817 (5th Cir.2003), 685
- Bennett v. Spear, 520 U.S. 154, 117 S.Ct. 1154, 137 L.Ed.2d 281 (1997), **150**, 154
- Bensman v. United States Forest Service, 408 F.3d 945 (7th Cir.2005), 138
- Bersani v. United States E.P.A., 850 F.2d 36 (2nd Cir.1988), 398

- Bestfoods, United States v., 524 U.S. 51, 118 S.Ct. 1876, 141 L.Ed.2d 43 (1998), 563, 579
- Billie, United States v., 667 F.Supp. 1485 (S.D.Fla.1987), 324
- Block v. Community Nutrition Institute, 467 U.S. 340, 104 S.Ct. 2450, 81 L.Ed.2d 270 (1984), 109
- Booker, United States v., 543 U.S. 220, 125 S.Ct. 738, 160 L.Ed.2d 621 (2005), 894
- Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co., 26 N.Y.2d 219, 309 N.Y.S.2d 312, 257 N.E.2d 870 (N.Y.1970), 56
- Borden Ranch Partnership v. United States Army Corps of Engineers, 261 F.3d 810 (9th Cir.2001), 386
- Bradley v. American Smelting and Refining Co., 104 Wash.2d 677, 709 P.2d 782 (Wash.1985), 43
- Brock v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc., 884 F.2d 166 (5th Cir.1989), 64
- Browning-Ferris Industries of Illinois, Inc. v. Ter Maat, 195 F.3d 953 (7th Cir.1999), 579
- Buckingham v. Secretary of United States Dept. of Agr., 603 F.3d 1073 (9th Cir. 2010), 101
- Buckley, United States v., 934 F.2d 84 (6th Cir.1991), 889
- Burke v. Dow Chemical Co., 797 F.Supp. 1128 (E.D.N.Y.1992), 93
- Burlington, City of v. Dague, 505 U.S. 557, 112 S.Ct. 2638, 120 L.Ed.2d 449 (1992),
- Burlington Northern and Santa Fe Ry. Co. v. United States, 556 U.S. 599, 129 S.Ct. 1870, 173 L.Ed.2d 812 (2009), 561, 572
- Burlington Northern R. Co., United States v., 200 F.3d 679 (10th Cir.1999), 625
- Burnette v. Carothers, 192 F.3d 52 (2nd Cir. 1999), 581
- Calvert Cliffs' Coordinating Committee, Inc. v. United States Atomic Energy Commission, 449 F.2d 1109 (D.C.Cir. 1971), 239, 311
- Camp v. Pitts, 411 U.S. 138, 93 S.Ct. 1241, 36 L.Ed.2d 106 (1973), 115
- Carolina Transformer Co., United States v., 978 F.2d 832 (4th Cir.1992), 580
- Carson Harbor Village, Ltd. v. Unocal Corp., 270 F.3d 863 (9th Cir.2001), 564
- Carson-Truckee Water Conservancy Dist. v. Clark, 741 F.2d 257 (9th Cir.1984), 330 Carter v. Carter Coal Co., 298 U.S. 238, 56
- S.Ct. 855, 80 L.Ed. 1160 (1936), 103 Carter Jones Lumber Co. v. LTV Steel Co.,
- 237 F.3d 745 (6th Cir.2001), 579 Catskill Mountains Chapter of Trout Unlimited, Inc. v. City of New York, 273 F.3d 481 (2nd Cir.2001), 795
- Cello-Foil Products, Inc., United States v., 100 F.3d 1227 (6th Cir.1996), 578

- Central South Dakota Co-op. Grazing Dist. v. Secretary of United States Dept. of Agriculture, 266 F.3d 889 (8th Cir.2001), 150
- Central Valley Chrysler–Jeep, Inc. v. Goldstene, 529 F.Supp.2d 1151 (E.D.Cal.2007), 230, 724
- Cetacean Community v. Bush, 386 F.3d 1169 (9th Cir.2004), 138
- Chamber of Commerce of United States v. E.P.A., 642 F.3d 192 (D.C.Cir.2011), 724
- Chemical Mfrs. Ass'n v. United States E.P.A., 859 F.2d 977 (D.C.Cir.1988), 445
- Chemical Waste Management, Inc. v. Hunt, 504 U.S. 334, 112 S.Ct. 2009, 119 L.Ed.2d 121 (1992), 215
- Chemical Waste Management, Inc. v. United States E.P.A., 976 F.2d 2 (D.C.Cir.1992), 517
- Chemical Waste Management, Inc. v. United States E.P.A., 873 F.2d 1477 (D.C.Cir. 1989), 101
- Chemical Waste Management of Indiana, Inc., 6 E.A.D. 66 (1995), 531
- Chesapeake Bay Foundation, Inc. v. Gwaltney of Smithfield, Ltd., 844 F.2d 170 (4th Cir.1988), 906
- Chevron Pipe Line Co., United States v., 437 F.Supp.2d 605 (N.D.Tex.2006), 784
- Chevron, U.S.A., Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc., 467 U.S. 837, 104 S.Ct. 2778, 81 L.Ed.2d 694 (1984), 118, 735
- Chicago, City of v. Environmental Defense Fund, 511 U.S. 328, 114 S.Ct. 1588, 128 L.Ed.2d 302 (1994), 501
- Citigroup Global Markets, Inc. v. VCG Special Opportunities Master Fund Ltd., 598 F.3d 30 (2nd Cir.2010), 306
- Citizens Against Burlington, Inc. v. Busey, 938 F.2d 190 (D.C.Cir.1991), 284
- Citizens to Preserve Overton Park, Inc.
 v. Volpe, 401 U.S. 402, 91 S.Ct. 814, 28
 L.Ed.2d 136 (1971), 101, 109
- City of (see name of city)
- Clean Air Markets Group v. Pataki, 338 F.3d 82 (2nd Cir.2003), **217**
- Clinton County Com'rs v. United States E.P.A., 116 F.3d 1018 (3rd Cir.1997), 625
- Coeur Alaska, Inc. v. Southeast Alaska Conservation Council, 557 U.S. 261, 129 S.Ct.
 2458, 174 L.Ed.2d 193 (2009), 126, 405
- Colorado & Eastern R. Co., United States v., 50 F.3d 1530 (10th Cir.1995), 600
- Colorado Wild, Heartwood v. United States Forest Service, 435 F.3d 1204 (10th Cir. 2006), 257
- Commander Oil Corp. v. Barlo Equipment Corp., 215 F.3d 321 (2nd Cir.2000), 563
- Corp., 215 F.3d 321 (2nd Cir.2000), 563 Commonwealth of (see name of Commonwealth)
- Communities for a Better Environment v. California Resources Agency, 126 Cal. Rptr.2d 441 (Cal.App. 3 Dist.2002), 311

- Concerned Area Residents for Environment v. Southview Farm, 34 F.3d 114 (2nd Cir. 1994), 793
- Conservation Council of North Carolina v. Costanzo, 398 F.Supp. 653 (E.D.N.C. 1975), 381
- Cooper, United States v., 482 F.3d 658 (4th Cir.2007), 889
- Cooper Industries, Inc. v. Aviall Services, Inc., 543 U.S. 157, 125 S.Ct. 577, 160 L.Ed.2d 548 (2004), 588
- Cordiano v. Metacon Gun Club, Inc., 575 F.3d 199 (2nd Cir.2009), 489
- Corrosion Proof Fittings v. E.P.A., 947 F.2d 1201 (5th Cir.1991), 446
- Council Tree Communications, Inc. v. F.C.C., 619 F.3d 235 (3rd Cir.2010), 98
- Dague v. City of Burlington, 732 F.Supp. 458 (D.Vt.1989), 793
- DaimlerChrysler Corp. v. Cuno, 547 U.S. 332, 126 S.Ct. 1854, 164 L.Ed.2d 589 (2006), 150
- Darby v. Cisneros, 509 U.S. 137, 113 S.Ct. 2539, 125 L.Ed.2d 113 (1993), 156, 537
- Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals,Inc., 509 U.S. 579, 113 S.Ct. 2786, 125L.Ed.2d 469 (1993), 65
- Davis, United States v., 261 F.3d 1 (1st Cir. 2001), 580
- Defenders of Wildlife v. E.P.A., 882 F.2d 1294 (8th Cir.1989), 365
- **Defenders of Wildlife v. Bernal,** 204 F.3d 920 (9th Cir.2000), **359**
- DeLuca by DeLuca v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc., 911 F.2d 941 (3rd Cir. 1990), 64
- Department of Game of Washington v. Puyallup Tribe, 414 U.S. 44, 94 S.Ct. 330, 38 L.Ed.2d 254 (1973), 324
- Department of Transp. v. Public Citizen, 541 U.S. 752, 124 S.Ct. 2204, 159 L.Ed.2d 60 (2004), 257, **270**
- Dico, Inc., United States v., 266 F.3d 864 (8th Cir.2001), 560
- Dion, United States v., 476 U.S. 734, 106
 S.Ct. 2216, 90 L.Ed.2d 767 (1986), 324
 Dion, United States v., 752 F.2d 1261 (8th Cir.1985), 324
- Dithiocarbamate Task Force v. E.P.A., 98 F.3d 1394 (D.C.Cir.1996), 494
- Dominion Energy Brayton Point, LLC v. Johnson, 443 F.3d 12 (1st Cir.2006), 101
- Dow Chemical Co. v. United States, 476 U.S. 227, 106 S.Ct. 1819, 90 L.Ed.2d 226 (1986), 849
- Dubois v. United States Dept. of Agriculture, 102 F.3d 1273 (1st Cir.1996), 795
- Duke Energy Corporation, United States v., 278 F.Supp.2d 619 (M.D.N.C.2003), 872
- Earth Sciences, Inc., United States v., 599 F.2d 368 (10th Cir.1979), 793

- Edison Elec. Institute v. United States E.P.A., 2 F.3d 438 (D.C.Cir.1993), 492
- E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Co. v. Train, 430 U.S. 112, 97 S.Ct. 965, 51 L.Ed.2d 204 (1977), 803
- Elam v. Alcolac, Inc., 765 S.W.2d 42 (Mo.App. W.D.1988), 64
- Engine Mfrs. Ass'n v. South Coast Air Quality Management Dist., 498 F.3d 1031 (9th Cir.2007), 230
- Engine Mfrs. Ass'n v. South Coast Air Quality Management Dist., 541 U.S. 246, 124 S.Ct. 1756, 158 L.Ed.2d 529 (2004), 220
- Entergy Corp. v. Riverkeeper, Inc., 556 U.S. 208, 129 S.Ct. 1498, 173 L.Ed.2d 369 (2009), 814
- Environmental Defense v. Duke Energy Corp., 549 U.S. 561, 127 S.Ct. 1423, 167 L.Ed.2d 295 (2007), 728
- Environmental Defense Center, Inc. v. United States E.P.A., 344 F.3d 832 (9th Cir. 2003), 206
- Environmental Defense Fund, Inc. v. Massey, 986 F.2d 528 (D.C.Cir.1993), 268
- Environmental Integrity Project v. E.P.A., 425 F.3d 992 (D.C.Cir.2005), 98
- Ethyl Corp. v. E.P.A., 541 F.2d 1 (D.C.Cir. 1976), 117, 414
- Ethyl Corp. v. E.P.A., 306 F.3d 1144 (D.C.Cir.2002), 710
- Euclid, Ohio, Village of v. Ambler Realty Co., 272 U.S. 365, 47 S.Ct. 114, 71 L.Ed. 303 (1926), 42
- European Communities-Measures Affecting Asbestos and Asbestos-Containing Products, Report of the Appellate Body, WT/ DS135/AB/R, ¶¶ 101-02 (Mar. 12, 2001), 955
- Exxon Corp. v. Train, 554 F.2d 1310 (5th Cir.1977), 796
- Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker, 554 U.S. 471, 128 S.Ct. 2605, 171 L.Ed.2d 570 (2008), 57
- Exxon Valdez, In re, 490 F.3d 1066 (9th Cir.2007), 57
- Fairhurst v. Hagener, 422 F.3d 1146 (9th Cir.2005), 792
- FEC v. Akins, 524 U.S. 11, 118 S.Ct. 1777, 141 L.Ed.2d 10 (1998), 138
- Ferrin, United States v., 994 F.2d 658 (9th Cir.1993), 894
- Flast v. Cohen, 392 U.S. 83, 88 S.Ct. 1942, 20 L.Ed.2d 947 (1968), 150
- Fleet Factors Corp., United States v., 901 F.2d 1550 (11th Cir.1990), 583
- Flint Ridge Development Co. v. Scenic Rivers Ass'n of Oklahoma, 426 U.S. 776, 96 S.Ct. 2430, 49 L.Ed.2d 205 (1976), 256
- Florida Key Deer v. Paulison, 522 F.3d 1133 (11th Cir.2008), 350

- Food and Drug Admin. v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp., 529 U.S. 120, 120 S.Ct. 1291, 146 L.Ed.2d 121 (2000), 636
- Fort Gratiot Sanitary Landfill, Inc. v. Michigan Dept. of Natural Resources, 504 U.S. 353, 112 S.Ct. 2019, 119 L.Ed.2d 139 (1992), 215, 216
- Franklin County Convention Facilities Authority v. American Premier Underwriters, Inc., 240 F.3d 534 (6th Cir.2001), 560, 582
- Friends of Everglades v. South Florida Water Management Dist., 570 F.3d 1210 (11th Cir.2009), 796
- Friends of Milwaukee's Rivers v. Milwaukee Metropolitan Sewerage Dist., 382 F.3d 743 (7th Cir.2004), 901
- Friends of Pinto Creek v. United States E.P.A., 504 F.3d 1007 (9th Cir.2007), 831
- Friends of the Earth, Inc. v. Laidlaw Environmental Services (TOC), Inc., 528 U.S. 167, 120 S.Ct. 693, 145 L.Ed.2d 610 (2000), 139, 156
- Frothingham v. Mellon, 262 U.S. 447, 43 S.Ct. 597, 67 L.Ed. 1078 (1923), 150
- Frye v. United States, 293 F. 1013 (D.C.Cir. 1923), 65
- Galaxy Carpet Mills, Inc. v. Massengill, 255 Ga. 360, 338 S.E.2d 428 (Ga.1986), 68
- GDF Realty Investments, Ltd. v. Norton, 326 F.3d 622 (5th Cir.2003), 195
- Geer v. State of Conn., 161 U.S. 519, 16 S.Ct. 600, 40 L.Ed. 793 (1896), 322
- General Battery Corp., Inc., United States v., 423 F.3d 294 (3rd Cir.2005), 580
- General Elec. Co. v. Jackson, 610 F.3d 110 (D.C.Cir.2010), 851
- General Elec. Co. v. Litton Indus. Automation Systems, Inc., 920 F.2d 1415 (8th Cir.1990), 544
- Georgia, State of v. Tennessee Copper Co., 237 U.S. 474, 35 S.Ct. 631, 59 L.Ed. 1054 (1915), 55
- Georgia, State of v. Tennessee Copper Co., 206 U.S. 230, 27 S.Ct. 618, 51 L.Ed. 1038 (1907), 55
- Gerke Excavating, Inc., United States v., 464 F.3d 723 (7th Cir.2006), 782
- Gifford Pinchot Task Force v. United States Fish and Wildlife Service, 378 F.3d 1059 (9th Cir.2004), 351
- Gill v. LDI, 19 F.Supp.2d 1188 (W.D.Wash. 1998), 68
- Gonzales v. Raich, 545 U.S. 1, 125 S.Ct. 2195, 162 L.Ed.2d 1 (2005), 184
- Gonzales & Gonzales Bonds and Ins. Agency, Inc., United States v., 728 F.Supp.2d 1077 (N.D.Cal.2010), 99
- Grand Council of Crees (of Quebec) v. F.E.R.C., 198 F.3d 950 (D.C.Cir.2000), 149
- Great Lakes Chemical Corp. Main Plant El Dorado, Arkansas, In re., 1994 WL 372174 (E.P.A.1994), 537

- Green Mountain Chrysler Plymouth Dodge Jeep v. Crombie, 508 F.Supp.2d 295 (D.Vt. 2007), 230, 724
- Greenpeace Action v. Franklin, 14 F.3d 1324 (9th Cir.1992), 158
- Grimaud, United States v., 220 U.S. 506, 31 S.Ct. 480, 55 L.Ed. 563 (1911), 103
- Gwaltney of Smithfield, Ltd. v. Chesapeake Bay Foundation, Inc., 484 U.S. 49, 108 S.Ct. 376, 98 L.Ed.2d 306 (1987), 902
- Hagerty v. L & L Marine Services, Inc., 788 F.2d 315 (5th Cir.1986), 67
- Hallstrom v. Tillamook County, 493 U.S. 20, 110 S.Ct. 304, 107 L.Ed.2d 237 (1989), 897
- Hanousek, United States v., 176 F.3d 1116 (9th Cir.1999), 889
- Harmon Industries, Inc. v. Browner, 191 F.3d 894 (8th Cir.1999), **859**
- Hazardous Waste Treatment Council v. United States E.P.A., 886 F.2d 355 (D.C.Cir.1989), 509
- Headwaters, Inc. v. Talent Irrigation Dist., 243 F.3d 526 (9th Cir.2001), 792
- Heckler v. Chaney, 470 U.S. 821, 105 S.Ct. 1649, 84 L.Ed.2d 714 (1985), 109
- Herber v. Johns-Manville Corp., 785 F.2d 79 (3rd Cir.1986), 67
- Hercules, Inc., United States v., 247 F.3d 706 (8th Cir.2001), 561
- Hernandez v. Esso Standard Oil Co. (Puerto Rico), 599 F.Supp.2d 175 (D.Puerto Rico 2009), 796
- Hodel v. Virginia Surface Min. and Reclamation Ass'n, Inc., 452 U.S. 264, 101 S.Ct. 2352, 69 L.Ed.2d 1 (1981), 170, 184
- Hoffman Group, Inc. v. E.P.A., 902 F.2d 567 (7th Cir.1990), 852
- Hoffman Homes, Inc. v. Administrator, United States E.P.A., 999 F.2d 256 (7th Cir. 1993), 196
- Hoflin, United States v., 880 F.2d 1033 (9th Cir.1989), 889
- Holland, United States v., 373 F.Supp. 665 (M.D.Fla.1974), 381
- Hooker Chemicals & Plastics Corp., United States v., 850 F.Supp. 993 (W.D.N.Y. 1994), 542
- Hoosier Energy Rural Elec. Co-op., Inc. v. John Hancock Life Ins. Co., 582 F.3d 721 (7th Cir.2009), 306
- Houlton Citizens' Coalition v. Town of Houlton, 175 F.3d 178 (1st Cir.1999), 216
- Howmet Corp. v. E.P.A., 614 F.3d 544 (D.C.Cir.2010), 490
- Hughes v. Oklahoma, 441 U.S. 322, 99 S.Ct. 1727, 60 L.Ed.2d 250 (1979), 322
- Huish Detergents, Inc. v. Warren County, Kentucky, 214 F.3d 707 (6th Cir.2000), 216
- Humboldt Baykeeper v. Simpson Timber Co., 2006 WL 3545014 (N.D.Cal.2006), 893

- Hunt v. Washington State Apple Advertising Com'n, 432 U.S. 333, 97 S.Ct. 2434, 53 L.Ed.2d 383 (1977), 138
- Idaho Rural Council v. Bosma, 143 F.Supp.2d 1169 (D.Idaho 2001), 796
- ILCO, Inc., United States v., 996 F.2d 1126 (11th Cir.1993), 490
- 'Ilio'ulaokalani Coalition v. Rumsfeld, 464 F.3d 1083 (9th Cir.2006), 289
- Independent Equipment Dealers Ass'n v. E.P.A., 372 F.3d 420 (D.C.Cir.2004), 155
- Indiana Harbor Belt R. Co. v. American Cyanamid Co., 916 F.2d 1174 (7th Cir. 1990), 44
- Industrial Union Dept., AFL-CIO v. American Petroleum Institute (The Benzene Case), 448 U.S. 607, 100 S.Ct. 2844, 65 L.Ed.2d 1010 (1980), 104, 430
- In re (see name of party)
 International Harvester Co. v. Ruckelshaus,
 478 F.2d 615 (D.C.Cir.1973), 698, 707
- International Paper Co. v. Ouellette, 479 U.S. 481, 107 S.Ct. 805, 93 L.Ed.2d 883 (1987),
- International Shoe Co. v. State of Wash., Office of Unemployment Compensation and Placement, 326 U.S. 310, 66 S.Ct. 154, 90 L.Ed. 95 (1945), 914
- Iverson, United States v., 162 F.3d 1015 (9th Cir.1998), 890
- James City County, Va. v. E.P.A., 12 F.3d 1330 (4th Cir.1993), 404
- Jim, United States v., 888 F.Supp. 1058 (D.Or.1995), 324
- Johnson, United States v., 467 F.3d 56 (1st Cir.2006), 782
- Johnson & Towers, Inc., United States v., 741 F.2d 662 (3rd Cir.1984), 889
- Jones-Hamilton Co. v. Beazer Materials & Services, Inc., 973 F.2d 688 (9th Cir. 1992), 578
- Jon-T Chemicals, Inc., United States v., 768 F.2d 686 (5th Cir.1985), 579
- J.W. Hampton, Jr., & Co. v. United States, 276 U.S. 394, 48 S.Ct. 348, 72 L.Ed. 624 (1928), 103
- Ka Makani 'O Kohala Ohana Inc. v. County of Hawaii Department of Water Supply, 295 F.3d 955 (9th Cir.2002), 264
- **Karr v. Hefner,** 475 F.3d 1192 (10th Cir. 2007), **898**
- Kayser-Roth Corp., United States v., 272 F.3d 89 (1st Cir.2001), 579
- K.C.1986 Ltd. Partnership v. Reade Mfg., 472 F.3d 1009 (8th Cir.2007), 563
- Kelley v. E.P.A., 15 F.3d 1100 (D.C.Cir.1994), 583
- Kennecott v. E.P.A., 780 F.2d 445 (4th Cir. 1985), 813

Kennecott Utah Copper Corp. v. United States Dept. of Interior, 88 F.3d 1191 (D.C.Cir.1996), 617

Kennedy v. Southern California Edison Co., 268 F.3d 763 (9th Cir.2001), 65

Kennedy v. Southern California Edison Co., Nuclear Reg. Rep. P 20608, 219 F.3d 988 (9th Cir.2000), 64

Kentuckians for Commonwealth Inc. v. Rivenburgh, 317 F.3d 425 (4th Cir.2003), 405

Key Tronic Corp. v. United States, 511 U.S. 809, 114 S.Ct. 1960, 128 L.Ed.2d 797 (1994), 544

Kleppe v. New Mexico, 426 U.S. 529, 96 S.Ct. 2285, 49 L.Ed.2d 34 (1976), 197

Kleppe v. Sierra Club, 427 U.S. 390, 96 S.Ct. 2718, 49 L.Ed.2d 576 (1976), 245

Laguna Gatuna, Inc. v. Browner, 58 F.3d 564 (10th Cir.1995), 852

Leaf River Forest Products, Inc. v. Ferguson, 662 So.2d 648 (Miss.1995), 47

League of Wilderness Defenders/Blue Mountains Biodiversity Project v. Forsgren, 309 F.3d 1181 (9th Cir.2002), 792

Les v. Reilly, 968 F.2d 985 (9th Cir.1992), 466

Leslie Salt Co. v. United States, 896 F.2d 354 (9th Cir.1990), 196

Lloyd A. Fry Roofing Co. v. United States Environmental Protection Agency, 554 F.2d 885 (8th Cir.1977), 852

Locke, United States v., 529 U.S. 89, 120 S.Ct. 1135, 146 L.Ed.2d 69 (2000), 229

Loggerhead Turtle v. County Council of Volusia County, Florida, 92 F.Supp.2d 1296 (M.D.Fla.2000), 365

Londoner v. City and County of Denver, 210 U.S. 373, 28 S.Ct. 708, 52 L.Ed. 1103 (1908), 96

Lopez, United States v., 514 U.S. 549, 115 S.Ct. 1624, 131 L.Ed.2d 626 (1995), 184

Louisiana Energy Servs., L.P., LBP-97-8 (Atomic Safety and Licensing Board, May 1, 1997), 538

Louisiana Energy Services, L.P., Matter of (Claiborne Enrichment Center), 47 N.R.C. 77 (N.R.C.1998), 309, 538

LTV Steel Co., Inc., United States v., 118 F.Supp.2d 827 (N.D.Ohio 2000), 864

Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife, 504 U.S. 555, 112 S.Ct. 2130, 119 L.Ed.2d 351 (1992), **127**

Maine People's Alliance And Natural Resources Defense Council v. Mallinckrodt, Inc., 471 F.3d 277 (1st Cir.2006), 519

Marathon Oil Co. v. E.P.A., 830 F.2d 1346 (5th Cir.1987), 835

Marks v. United States, 430 U.S. 188, 97 S.Ct. 990, 51 L.Ed.2d 260 (1977), 781 Marsh v. Oregon Natural Resources Council, 490 U.S. 360, 109 S.Ct. 1851, 104 L.Ed.2d 377 (1989), 282

Marshall v. Barlow's, Inc., 436 U.S. 307, 98
S.Ct. 1816, 56 L.Ed.2d 305 (1978), 849
Marshall Field & Co. v. Clark, 143 U.S. 649,

12 S.Ct. 495, 36 L.Ed. 294 (1892), 103 Martin v. Waddell's Lessee, 41 U.S. 367, 16 Pet. 367, 10 L.Ed. 997 (1842), 322

Maryland Conservation Council, Inc. v. Gilchrist, 808 F.2d 1039 (4th Cir.1986), 268

Massachusetts v. E.P.A., 549 U.S. 497, 127 S.Ct. 1438, 167 L.Ed.2d 248 (2007), 139, 230, 349, 636, 658, 712

Matter of (see opposing party)

Mayaguezanos por la Salud y el Ambiente v. United States, Nuclear Reg. Rep. P 19267, 198 F.3d 297 (1st Cir.1999), 268

McAbee v. City of Fort Payne, 318 F.3d 1248 (11th Cir.2003), 901

McDonald v. Sun Oil Co., 423 F.Supp.2d 1114 (D.Or.2006), 582

Mead Corp., United States v., 533 U.S. 218, 121 S.Ct. 2164, 150 L.Ed.2d 292 (2001), 125

Meghrig v. KFC Western, Inc., 516 U.S. 479, 116 S.Ct. 1251, 134 L.Ed.2d 121 (1996), 519

Merrell v. Thomas, 807 F.2d 776 (9th Cir. 1986), 256

Metcalf v. Daley, 214 F.3d 1135 (9th Cir. 2000), 248

Mexico Feed and Seed Co., Inc., United States v., 980 F.2d 478 (8th Cir.1992), 580

Middlesex County Sewerage Authority v. National Sea Clammers Ass'n, 453 U.S. 1, 101 S.Ct. 2615, 69 L.Ed.2d 435 (1981), 81 Mills v. United States 36 F.3d 1052 (11th

Mills v. United States, 36 F.3d 1052 (11th Cir.1994), 103

Milwaukee, City of v. Illinois and Michigan, 451 U.S. 304, 101 S.Ct. 1784, 68 L.Ed.2d 114 (1981), 81

Minnesota Pesticide Information and Educ., Inc. v. Espy, 29 F.3d 442 (8th Cir.1994), 268

Missouri, State of v. Holland, 252 U.S. 416, 40 S.Ct. 382, 64 L.Ed. 641 (1920), 196, 323

Missouri, State of v. State of Illinois, 200 U.S. 496, 26 S.Ct. 268, 50 L.Ed. 572 (1906), 55 Mistretta v. United States, 488 U.S. 361, 109 S.Ct. 647, 102 L.Ed.2d 714 (1989), 104

Monsanto Co. v. Geertson Seed Farms, _____ U.S. ____, 130 S.Ct. 2743, 177 L.Ed.2d 461 (2010), 138, 306

Montana, State of v. United States E.P.A., 137 F.3d 1135 (9th Cir.1998), 825

Morrison, United States v., 529 U.S. 598, 120S.Ct. 1740, 146 L.Ed.2d 658 (2000), 184

Murphy Oil USA, Inc., United States v., 143 F.Supp.2d 1054 (W.D.Wis.2001), 864

Myers v. Bethlehem Shipbuilding Corp., 303 U.S. 41, 58 S.Ct. 459, 82 L.Ed. 638 (1938), 156