

LIABILITY IN MEDICINE AND PUBLIC HEALTH

Marcia M. Boumil
David J. Sharpe

American Casebook Series®

THOMSON


WEST

LIABILITY IN MEDICINE AND PUBLIC HEALTH

By

Marcia M. Boumil, MA, MS, JD, LL.M.

*Assistant Professor of Family Medicine and Community Health
Tufts University School of Medicine*

David J. Sharpe, LL.B, LL.D

*Professor Emeritus
George Washington University School of Law*

AMERICAN CASEBOOK SERIES®

THOMSON
—★—™
WEST

West, a Thomson business, has created this publication to provide you with accurate and authoritative information concerning the subject matter covered. However, this publication was not necessarily prepared by persons licensed to practice law in a particular jurisdiction. West is not engaged in rendering legal or other professional advice, and this publication is not a substitute for the advice of an attorney. If you require legal or other expert advice, you should seek the services of a competent attorney or other professional.

American Casebook Series and West Group are trademarks registered in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

COPYRIGHT © 2000 By WEST GROUP

© 2004 West, a Thomson business

610 Opperman Drive
P.O. Box 64526
St. Paul, MN 55164-0526
1-800-328-9352

ISBN 0-314-15077-3



TEXT IS PRINTED ON 10% POST
CONSUMER RECYCLED PAPER



West's Law School Advisory Board

JESSE H. CHOPER

Professor of Law,
University of California, Berkeley

DAVID P. CURRIE

Professor of Law, University of Chicago

YALE KAMISAR

Professor of Law, University of Michigan
Professor of Law, University of San Diego

MARY KAY KANE

Chancellor, Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law,
University of California,
Hastings College of the Law

LARRY D. KRAMER

Dean and Professor of Law, Stanford Law School

WAYNE R. LaFAVE

Professor of Law, University of Illinois

ARTHUR R. MILLER

Professor of Law, Harvard University

GRANT S. NELSON

Professor of Law,
University of California, Los Angeles

JAMES J. WHITE

Professor of Law, University of Michigan

Preface

In 1991 the editors, with two colleagues, created a specialized casebook that they called *Medical Liability*. It was designed to support courses on medical malpractice taught by specialists in the field. Many teachers would be practicing lawyers bringing their trial expertise to the academic arena. The casebook supplemented the teachers' practical experience by providing up-to-date cases from every region of the United States. This new casebook, *Liability in Medicine and Public Health*, keeps the foundation and expands the coverage.

Part I, *Liability in Medicine*, retains the format and topics of *Medical Liability*, but more than 80% of the cases represent twenty-first century law. Part I maintains the practice orientation as it looks at medical liability through the eyes of litigators and clients rather than administrators and planners. As educators the editors are not oriented toward plaintiffs or defendants; rather the editors seek to demonstrate the interplay of the primary contenders, as the United States law of medical liability has evolved over the past 50 or more years.

Part II, *Public Health*, adds new materials to support public health law courses, whether in law schools, schools of public health, or other professional degree programs. Part II changes the orientation, from compensation and private law to compliance and public law. In most of the public health cases one antagonist is a city, municipality or governmental official, and the target of litigation is an ordinance, regulation or private nuisance. The cases show the competing concepts of judicial activism and restraint in the development of public health law.

For courses that offer a broad scope of health law, Part I contains traditional medical liability materials, including cases on ERISA and quality control regulation, and Part II contains materials on reproductive health, end-of-life issues, domestic violence, infectious disease, and public safety.

The editors caution users not to quote the casebook in place of actual law reports. Brackets indicate omitted citations. The editors have taken some liberties with editing the cases so as to enhance readability without altering meaning.

MARCIA M. BOUMIL
ANDOVER, MASSACHUSETTS

DAVID J. SHARPE
CLAVERACK, NEW YORK

*

Introduction to Liability in Medicine

In 1994 a landmark research effort, the Harvard Medical Practice Study (Leape, 1994), documented the large number of “adverse medical events” suffered by hospital patients. Error was documented throughout all areas of medical practice, with the largest number of errors resulting from drug complications. The Harvard Study suggested that 2.9% of hospitalizations resulted in an adverse event attributable to erroneous medical management. Nearly a decade later the Institute of Medicine issued its own alarming report, *“To Err is Human,”* which publicized the issue and unsettled the medical community. The IOM report suggested that as many as 98,000 preventable deaths per year are due to medical mishaps. Further, since most health care takes place in outpatient settings, it is reasonable to assume that the problem is substantially larger. Significant progress in eliminating the systemic issues that result in errors has been painfully slow.

Though neither the medical nor legal communities deny the gravity of the problem, they differ dramatically on proposed solutions. Most lawyers believe that the current liability system is necessary to keep physicians accountable for the quality of their practices. Under this theory, a system that divorces error from liability creates a disincentive for physicians to observe the highest standards of practice. Many physicians, on the other hand, believe that the key to resolving the problem of error in medicine is to implement an improved data collection system that documents mishaps and allows physicians to learn from their mistakes. They believe that fear of medical liability has hindered the reporting process and thus the ability to learn from errors. Their solution is to develop ways of unhinging medical liability from the reporting of adverse medical events. Only then can there be meaningful progress in reducing the error rate. They point to the dramatic improvement that other industries—most notably the airlines industry—have managed to achieve by implementing a confidential reporting system for “near misses” to benefit from mistakes.

Part One of this casebook focuses on medical liability. It addresses legal issues and theories, defenses, immunities and harms. It also addresses quality control and efforts toward malpractice reform. For the most part these are matters that few physicians and practicing lawyers will agree upon. Indeed, the terminology itself is a matter of contention: a physician would look at this material and see medical error, while a lawyer would see the same material and consider it medical malpractice. Is this merely a matter of semantics, or do the two professions genuinely disagree on the fundamental nature of medical liability? In medicine, an honest mistake still can be medical malpractice notwithstanding the good intentions of the physician.

Part Two of this casebook focuses on public health. It is noteworthy that these two subjects are contained under the same cover. In 2004, medical error was documented as the 8th leading cause of death in the United States. Clearly the sheer numbers of medical mistakes make it a matter of grave public health concern. Both medical error and medical liability truly result in issues affecting the health of the public, and it is good to see this matter finally cast as a serious public health issue.

A further complicating factor is the escalating medical malpractice insurance crisis, with premiums for some physicians in excess of \$200,000 per year. Once again, physicians and lawyers disagree as to the cause of the crisis. Many physicians believe that fear of malpractice lawsuits leads to the practice of so-called defensive medicine, which increases the cost of medical care. Additionally, it is intuitive that large malpractice judgments would increase the cost of medical practice, as physicians pass on the costs of exorbitant insurance premiums. Malpractice lawyers point out, however, that empirical data suggest that less than one per cent of total health care costs are directly attributable to malpractice judgments.

Nevertheless, reports of doctors leaving practice in states where insurance premiums have risen dramatically fill the newspapers. The public is rightfully concerned about access to needed care, as the supply of crucial primary care physicians and specialists dwindles. Although many states have tried to deal with the perceived medical liability crisis by reforming the tort system, the real issue—eliminating the errors that result in liability claims—remains largely untouched. Though several states have mandatory reporting of medical errors, physicians and lawyers agree that fear of provoking claims undermines the reporting of adverse events.

There are no obvious solutions to the problems of medical error in the United States or around the world. The incidence of malpractice and the collateral issues of exorbitant insurance premiums and scarcity of affordable care make medical error a true public health crisis. It is not entirely clear whether a meaningful reduction in errors can be achieved through various proposed tort reform measures, or whether a fault-based system is needed to maintain accountability. Compensation to victims must also be addressed. The purpose of this text is to train students of the law and other graduate disciplines to function within the parameters of the present legal system and at the same time search for strategies to improve the quality of health care delivery.

HARRIS A. BERMAN, M.D., DEAN
PUBLIC HEALTH AND PROFESSIONAL DEGREE PROGRAMS.
TUFTS UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF MEDICINE, BOSTON

Table of Cases

The principal cases are in bold type. Cases cited or discussed in the text are roman type. References are to pages. Cases cited in principal cases and within other quoted materials are not included.

- A.C., In re**, 573 A.2d 1235 (D.C.1990), **400**
Adoption of (see name of party)
Advincula v. United Blood Services, 176 Ill.2d 1, 223 Ill.Dec. 1, 678 N.E.2d 1009 (Ill.1996), **47**
Aetna Health Inc. v. Davila, — U.S. —, 124 S.Ct. 2488, 159 L.Ed.2d 312 (2004), **179**
Air Line Pilots Ass'n, Intern. v. Quesada, 276 F.2d 892 (2nd Cir.1960), **1029**
Alden v. Maine, 527 U.S. 706, 119 S.Ct. 2240, 144 L.Ed.2d 636 (1999), 319
Alexander v. Scheid, 726 N.E.2d 272 (Ind.2000), **259**
American Academy of Pediatrics v. Heckler, 561 F.Supp. 395 (D.D.C.1983), 940
American Bank & Trust Co. v. Community Hospital, 204 Cal.Rptr. 671, 683 P.2d 670 (Cal.1984), 568
Anderson v. Somberg, 67 N.J. 291, 338 A.2d 1 (N.J.1975), **473**
Anonymous v. Bureau of Professional Medical Conduct/State Bd. for Professional Medical Conduct, 768 N.Y.S.2d 591 (N.Y.A.D. 1 Dept.2003), 675
Ardisana v. Northwest Community Hosp., Inc., 342 Ill.App.3d 741, 277 Ill. Dec. 296, 795 N.E.2d 964 (Ill.App. 1 Dist.2003), **646**
Arrington v. Wong, 237 F.3d 1066 (9th Cir.2001), **14**
Ashe v. Radiation Oncology Associates, 9 S.W.3d 119 (Tenn.1999), **369**
A.Z. v. B.Z., 431 Mass. 150, 725 N.E.2d 1051 (Mass.2000), **869**
Baby Boy Doe v. Mother Doe, 260 Ill. App.3d 392, 198 Ill.Dec. 267, 632 N.E.2d 326 (Ill.App. 1 Dist.1994), **853**
Backlund v. Board of Com'rs of King County Hosp. Dist. 2, 106 Wash.2d 632, 724 P.2d 981 (Wash.1986), 535
Bader v. Johnson, 732 N.E.2d 1212 (Ind. 2000), **62**
Baker v. Sadick, 162 Cal.App.3d 618, 208 Cal.Rptr. 676 (Cal.App. 4 Dist.1984), 582
Baker v. Vanderbilt University, 616 F.Supp. 330 (M.D.Tenn.1985), 620
Behringer, Estate of v. Medical Center at Princeton, 249 N.J.Super. 597, 592 A.2d 1251 (N.J.Super.L.1991), 86, **799**
Benavidez v. United States, 177 F.3d 927 (10th Cir.1999), **68**
Benning v. Vermont, 161 Vt. 472, 641 A.2d 757 (Vt.1994), **1023**
Benson v. Tkach, 30 P.3d 402 (Okla.Civ. App. Div. 2 2001), **218**
Berthiaume's Estate v. Pratt, 365 A.2d 792 (Me.1976), **516**
Bird v. Saenz, 123 Cal.Rptr.2d 465, 51 P.3d 324 (Cal.2002), **264**
Birth Center v. St. Paul Companies, Inc., 567 Pa. 386, 787 A.2d 376 (Pa. 2001), **542**
Blanks v. Southwestern Bell Communications, Inc., 310 F.3d 398 (5th Cir. 2002), **810**
Blanton v. Morgan, 681 S.W.2d 876 (Tex. App.-El Paso 1984), 355
Board of Education of Independent School District No. 92 of Pottawatomie County v. Earls, 536 U.S. 822, 122 S.Ct. 2559, 153 L.Ed.2d 735 (2002), **739**
Bocci v. Key Pharmaceuticals, Inc., 189 Or.App. 349, 76 P.3d 669 (Or.App.2003), **289**
Boreali v. Axelrod, 523 N.Y.S.2d 464, 517 N.E.2d 1350 (N.Y.1987), **726**
Bowen v. American Hosp. Ass'n, 476 U.S. 610, 106 S.Ct. 2101, 90 L.Ed.2d 584 (1986), **898**
Boyd v. Bulala, 877 F.2d 1191 (4th Cir. 1989), 605
Bradshaw v. Daniel, 854 S.W.2d 865 (Tenn.1993), **20, 86**
Bragdon v. Abbott, 524 U.S. 624, 118 S.Ct. 2196, 141 L.Ed.2d 540 (1998), **786**

- Bragg v. Valdez, 3 Cal.Rptr.3d 804 (Cal. App. 2 Dist.2003), 104
- Brandt v. Boston Scientific Corp.**, 204 Ill.2d 640, 275 Ill.Dec. 65, 792 N.E.2d 296 (Ill.2003), 452
- Briarcliff Nursing Home, Inc. v. Turcotte**, 2004 WL 226087 (Ala.2004), 587
- Brown, In re, 294 Ill.App.3d 159, 228 Ill. Dec. 525, 689 N.E.2d 397 (Ill.App. 1 Dist.1997), 896
- Brown v. Stone**, 378 So.2d 218 (Miss. 1979), 767
- Brown v. Superior Court, 245 Cal.Rptr. 412, 751 P.2d 470 (Cal.1988), 478
- Bryant v. Adventist Health Systems/West**, 289 F.3d 1162 (9th Cir. 2002), 9
- Buckner v. Tamarin, 119 Cal.Rptr.2d 489 (Cal.App. 2 Dist.2002), 601
- Bull v. McCuskey, 96 Nev. 706, 615 P.2d 957 (Nev.1980), 355
- Caravaggio v. D'Agostini**, 166 N.J. 237, 765 A.2d 182 (N.J.2001), 323
- Carson v. Maurer, 120 N.H. 925, 424 A.2d 825 (N.H.1980), 563
- Cassim v. Bowen**, 824 F.2d 791 (9th Cir. 1987), 625
- Center for Legal Advocacy v. Earnest**, 320 F.3d 1107 (10th Cir.2003), 442
- Centman v. Cobb, 581 N.E.2d 1286 (Ind. App. 1 Dist.1991), 580
- Chamberland v. Roswell Osteopathic Clinic, Inc.**, 130 N.M. 532, 27 P.3d 1019 (N.M.App.2001), 254
- Charles Town General Hosp., State ex rel. v. Sanders, 210 W.Va. 118, 556 S.E.2d 85 (W.Va.2001), 658
- Chester v. Doig**, 842 So.2d 106 (Fla.2003), 616
- Cicio v. Does**, 321 F.3d 83 (2nd Cir.2003), 158
- Cipollone v. Liggett Group, Inc.**, 505 U.S. 504, 112 S.Ct. 2608, 120 L.Ed.2d 407 (1992), 704
- City of (see name of city)**
- Clark v. Columbia/HCA Information Services, Inc., 117 Nev. 468, 25 P.3d 215 (Nev.2001), 657
- Cobb County-Kennestone Hospital Authority v. Prince, 242 Ga. 139, 249 S.E.2d 581 (Ga.1978), 638
- Cohen v. Alliant Enterprises, Inc.**, 60 S.W.3d 536 (Ky.2001), 118
- Coira v. Florida Medical Ass'n, Inc., 429 So.2d 23 (Fla.App. 3 Dist.1983), 536
- Coleman v. Deno, 813 So.2d 303 (La.2002), 19
- Colorado State Bd. of Medical Examiners v. Johnson**, 68 P.3d 500 (Colo.App. 2002), 661
- Commonwealth v. _____ (see opposing party)**
- Compassion in Dying v. State of Washington, 850 F.Supp. 1454 (W.D.Wash.1994), 940
- Connecticut Dept. of Public Safety v. Doe**, 538 U.S. 1, 123 S.Ct. 1160, 155 L.Ed.2d 98 (2003), 967
- Conservatorship of Wendland**, 110 Cal. Rptr.2d 412, 28 P.3d 151 (Cal.2001), 927
- Cooper v. Eagle River Memorial Hosp., Inc.**, 270 F.3d 456 (7th Cir.2001), 189
- Costantino v. Herzog, M.D., P.C.**, 203 F.3d 164 (2nd Cir.2000), 224
- Cox ex rel. Cox v. Board of Hosp. Managers for City of Flint**, 467 Mich. 1, 651 N.W.2d 356 (Mich.2002), 137
- Craig v. Murphree**, 2002 WL 988175 (10th Cir.2002), 246
- Cruzan by Cruzan v. Director, Missouri Dept. of Health**, 497 U.S. 261, 110 S.Ct. 2841, 111 L.Ed.2d 224 (1990), 906
- Cryolife, Inc. v. Superior Court**, 2 Cal. Rptr.3d 396 (Cal.App. 6 Dist.2003), 458
- Curtis v. Jaskey**, 326 Ill.App.3d 90, 259 Ill.Dec. 901, 759 N.E.2d 962 (Ill.App. 2 Dist.2001), 396
- Custody of Vaughn**, 422 Mass. 590, 664 N.E.2d 434 (Mass.1996), 961
- Darling v. Charleston Community Memorial Hospital**, 33 Ill.2d 326, 211 N.E.2d 253 (Ill.1965), 121
- Davis v. Davis, 842 S.W.2d 588 (Tenn. 1992), 897
- DeLuna v. St. Elizabeth's Hosp., 184 Ill. App.3d 802, 132 Ill.Dec. 925, 540 N.E.2d 847 (Ill.App. 1 Dist.1989), 580
- Dias v. Brigham Medical Associates, Inc.**, 438 Mass. 317, 780 N.E.2d 447 (Mass.2002), 114
- Doran v. Priddy, 534 F.Supp. 30 (D.Kan. 1981), 621
- Drevenak v. Abendschein**, 773 A.2d 396 (D.C.2001), 207
- Duttry v. Patterson, 565 Pa. 130, 771 A.2d 1255 (Pa.2001), 515
- Ellis v. C.R. Bard, Inc., 311 F.3d 1272 (11th Cir.2002), 477
- Emory University v. Porubiansky**, 248 Ga. 391, 282 S.E.2d 903 (Ga.1981), 569
- Estate of (see name of party)**
- Etheridge v. Medical Center Hospitals**, 237 Va. 87, 376 S.E.2d 525 (Va.1989), 601
- Ex parte (see name of party)**
- Fairfax Nursing Home, Inc. v. United States Dept. of Health & Human Services**, 300 F.3d 835 (7th Cir.2002), 1045
- Fein v. Permanente Medical Group, 211 Cal.Rptr. 368, 695 P.2d 665 (Cal.1985), 568

- Feinstein v. Massachusetts General Hospital, 489 F.Supp. 419 (D.Mass.1979), 565
- Ferguson v. City of Charleston**, 532 U.S. 67, 121 S.Ct. 1281, 149 L.Ed.2d 205 (2001), 745
- Food and Drug Admin. v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp.**, 529 U.S. 120, 120 S.Ct. 1291, 146 L.Ed.2d 121 (2000), 715
- Forte v. Connerwood Healthcare, Inc.**, 745 N.E.2d 796 (Ind.2001), 287
- 44 Liquormart, Inc. v. Rhode Island**, 517 U.S. 484, 116 S.Ct. 1495, 134 L.Ed.2d 711 (1996), 683
- Friedl v. Airsource, Inc.**, 323 Ill.App.3d 1039, 257 Ill.Dec. 459, 753 N.E.2d 1085 (Ill.App. 1 Dist.2001), 470
- Galen, Adoption of**, 425 Mass. 201, 680 N.E.2d 70 (Mass.1997), 875
- Gammill v. United States**, 727 F.2d 950 (10th Cir.1984), 782
- Gilbert v. Medical Economics Co.**, 665 F.2d 305 (10th Cir.1981), 659
- Goodman v. United States**, 298 F.3d 1048 (9th Cir.2002), 415, 419
- Goodridge v. Department of Public Health**, 440 Mass. 309, 798 N.E.2d 941 (Mass.2003), 880
- Govar v. Chicago Ins. Co., 879 F.2d 1581 (8th Cir.1989), 538
- Gracey v. Eaker**, 837 So.2d 348 (Fla. 2002), 58
- Greene v. Edwards**, 164 W.Va. 326, 263 S.E.2d 661 (W.Va.1980), 775
- Grennan v. Children's Hosp.**, 104 Wash. App. 1016 (Wash.App. Div. 1 2001), 314
- Gross v. Recabaren, 206 Cal.App.3d 771, 253 Cal.Rptr. 820 (Cal.App. 2 Dist.1988), 582
- Grossman v. Baumgartner, 271 N.Y.S.2d 195, 218 N.E.2d 259 (N.Y.1966), 999
- Haceesa v. United States**, 309 F.3d 722 (10th Cir.2002), 269
- Hansen v. Virginia Mason Medical Center**, 113 Wash.App. 199, 53 P.3d 60 (Wash.App. Div. 1 2002), 484
- Hardi v. Mezzanotte**, 818 A.2d 974 (D.C. 2003), 273
- Harmon v. Texas**, 2003 WL 21665488 (Tex.App.-Hous. (1 Dist.) 2003), 524
- Harrison v. United States**, 284 F.3d 293 (1st Cir.2002), 363
- Harry v. Marchant**, 291 F.3d 767 (11th Cir.2002), 16
- Hason v. Medical Bd. of California**, 279 F.3d 1167 (9th Cir.2002), 670
- Hawes v. Chua**, 769 A.2d 797 (D.C.2001), 193
- Hein v. Cornwall Hosp.**, 302 A.D.2d 170, 753 N.Y.S.2d 71 (N.Y.A.D. 1 Dept.2003), 319
- Helling v. Carey**, 83 Wash.2d 514, 519 P.2d 981 (Wash.1974), 53
- Hoehn v. United States, 217 F.Supp.2d 39 (D.D.C.2002), 105
- Hoffman v. United States, 767 F.2d 1431 (9th Cir.1985), 568
- Howard v. University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey**, 172 N.J. 537, 800 A.2d 73 (N.J.2002), 505
- Humphrey, People v.**, 56 Cal.Rptr.2d 142, 921 P.2d 1 (Cal.1996), 953
- Hyman v. Jewish Chronic Disease Hospital, 21 A.D.2d 495, 251 N.Y.S.2d 818 (N.Y.A.D. 2 Dept.1964), INS.CH7
- Hymowitz v. Eli Lilly and Co., 541 N.Y.S.2d 941, 539 N.E.2d 1069 (N.Y.1989), 478
- Imbler v. PacifiCare of Cal., Inc., 126 Cal. Rptr.2d 715 (Cal.App. 4 Dist.2002), 600
- In re (see name of party)**
- Iowa, State of v. Hartog**, 440 N.W.2d 852 (Iowa 1989), 1016
- Jacobson v. Commonwealth of Massachusetts**, 197 U.S. 11, 25 S.Ct. 358, 49 L.Ed. 643 (1905), 762
- Jaffee v. Redmond**, 518 U.S. 1, 116 S.Ct. 1923, 135 L.Ed.2d 337 (1996), 430
- Jefferson v. Griffin Spalding County Hospital Authority, 247 Ga. 86, 274 S.E.2d 457 (Ga.1981), 896
- Jenkins v. Clark, 7 Ohio App.3d 93, 454 N.E.2d 541 (Ohio App. 2 Dist.1982), 580
- Jenkins v. Patel, 256 Mich.App. 112, 662 N.W.2d 453 (Mich.App.2003), 619
- Johnson v. Galen Health Care, Inc., 39 S.W.3d 828 (Ky.App.2001), 658
- Johnson v. LeBonheur Children's Medical Center**, 74 S.W.3d 338 (Tenn. 2002), 131
- Johnson v. State, 602 So.2d 1288 (Fla. 1992), 896
- Johnston v. Sisters of Charity of Nazareth Health Systems, Inc., 2003 WL 22681562 (Ky.App.2003), 141
- K.A.C. v. Benson**, 527 N.W.2d 553 (Minn. 1995), 78
- Kansas Malpractice Victims Coalition v. Bell, 243 Kan. 333, 757 P.2d 251 (Kan. 1988), 568
- Kass v. Kass, 235 A.D.2d 150, 663 N.Y.S.2d 581 (N.Y.A.D. 2 Dept.1997), 897
- Keene v. Brigham and Women's Hosp., Inc.**, 439 Mass. 223, 786 N.E.2d 824 (Mass.2003), 303
- Lambert v. Wicklund**, 520 U.S. 292, 117 S.Ct. 1169, 137 L.Ed.2d 464 (1997), 850
- Langley v. Mutual Fire, Marine and Inland Ins. Co.**, 512 So.2d 752 (Ala. 1987), 538
- Lazorko v. Pennsylvania Hosp.**, 237 F.3d 242 (3rd Cir.2000), 634
- LeMarbe v. Wisneski**, 266 F.3d 429 (6th Cir.2001), 309

- LePage v. State**, 18 P.3d 1177 (Wyo. 2001), **771**
- Lesley for Lesley v. Department of Social and Health Services**, 83 Wash. App. 263, 921 P.2d 1066 (Wash.App. Div. 1 1996), **970**
- Lewis v. Physicians Ins. Co. of Wisconsin**, 243 Wis.2d 648, 627 N.W.2d 484 (Wis.2001), **108**
- Lopez, United States v.**, 514 U.S. 549, 115 S.Ct. 1624, 131 L.Ed.2d 626 (1995), **1001**
- Lupinacci v. Medical Center of Delaware**, 805 A.2d 867 (Del.Supr.2002), **244**
- MacDonald v. Ortho Pharmaceutical Corp., 394 Mass. 131, 475 N.E.2d 65 (Mass. 1985), 477
- Marcus v. Liebman**, 59 Ill.App.3d 337, 16 Ill.Dec. 613, 375 N.E.2d 486 (Ill.App. 1 Dist.1978), **72**
- Markley v. Oak Health Care Investors of Coldwater, Inc.**, 255 Mich.App. 245, 660 N.W.2d 344 (Mich.App.2003), **278**
- Mathews v. Eldridge**, 424 U.S. 319, 96 S.Ct. 893, 47 L.Ed.2d 18 (1976), 675
- Mazza v. Huffaker**, 61 N.C.App. 170, 300 S.E.2d 833 (N.C.App.1983), 85
- Mazza v. Medical Mut. Ins. Co. of North Carolina**, 311 N.C. 621, 319 S.E.2d 217 (N.C.1984), **550**
- McKenzie v. Hawai'i Permanente Medical Group, Inc.**, 47 P.3d 1209 (Hawai'i 2002), **97**
- McKinstry v. Valley Obstetrics-Gynecology Clinic, P.C.**, 428 Mich. 167, 405 N.W.2d 88 (Mich.1987), 581
- McKnight, State v.**, 352 S.C. 635, 576 S.E.2d 168 (S.C.2003), **751**
- McKune v. Lile**, 536 U.S. 24, 122 S.Ct. 2017, 153 L.Ed.2d 47 (2002), **976**
- McNeil v. Middleton**, 344 F.3d 988 (9th Cir.2003), 984
- Merced v. Qazi**, 811 So.2d 702 (Fla.App. 5 Dist.2002), 296
- Meyers v. Columbia/HCA Healthcare Corp.**, 341 F.3d 461 (6th Cir.2003), **641**
- Middleton v. McNeil**, ___ U.S. ___, 124 S.Ct. 1830, 158 L.Ed.2d 701 (2004), 984
- Miller v. Jacoby**, 145 Wash.2d 65, 33 P.3d 68 (Wash.2001), **220**
- Miller v. Marrocco**, 28 Ohio St.3d 438, 504 N.E.2d 67 (Ohio 1986), 537
- Miller v. Rosenberg**, 196 Ill.2d 50, 255 Ill.Dec. 464, 749 N.E.2d 946 (Ill.2001), **345**
- Miller v. Willbanks**, 8 S.W.3d 607 (Tenn. 1999), **228**
- Miller ex rel. Miller v. HCA, Inc.**, 118 S.W.3d 758 (Tex.2003), **374**
- Mohr v. Williams**, 95 Minn. 261, 104 N.W. 12 (Minn.1905), **358**
- Moore v. Gunnison Valley Hosp.**, 310 F.3d 1315 (10th Cir.2002), **651**
- Moore v. Regents of University of California**, 271 Cal.Rptr. 146, 793 P.2d 479 (Cal.1990), **409**, 419, 423
- Morowitz v. Marvel**, 423 A.2d 196 (D.C. 1980), **351**
- Morra v. Harrop**, 791 A.2d 472 (R.I.2002), **237**
- Morris v. Metriyakool**, 418 Mich. 423, 344 N.W.2d 736 (Mich.1984), **582**
- Morrison, United States v.**, 529 U.S. 598, 120 S.Ct. 1740, 146 L.Ed.2d 658 (2000), **941**
- Muhl v. Magan**, 313 Md. 462, 545 A.2d 1321 (Md.1988), 536
- National Ass'n of Psychiatric Health Systems v. Shalala**, 120 F.Supp.2d 33 (D.D.C.2000), **1036**
- Nestorowich v. Ricotta**, 740 N.Y.S.2d 668, 767 N.E.2d 125 (N.Y.2002), **235**
- Nett v. Bellucci**, 437 Mass. 630, 774 N.E.2d 130 (Mass.2002), **329**
- Newell v. Ruiz**, 286 F.3d 166 (3rd Cir. 2002), **576**
- New York, City of v. Antoinette R.**, 165 Misc.2d 1014, 630 N.Y.S.2d 1008 (N.Y.Sup.1995), **777**
- New York, City of v. New St. Mark's Baths**, 130 Misc.2d 911, 497 N.Y.S.2d 979 (N.Y.Sup.1986), **985**
- Nguyen v. State, Department of Health Medical Quality Assurance Commission**, 144 Wash.2d 516, 29 P.3d 689 (Wash. 2001), 674
- Nold ex rel. Nold v. Binyon**, 272 Kan. 87, 31 P.3d 274 (Kan.2001), **25**
- Oakland Cannabis Buyers' Co-op., United States v.**, 532 U.S. 483, 121 S.Ct. 1711, 149 L.Ed.2d 722 (2001), **1032**
- Oliver v. Brock**, 342 So.2d 1 (Ala.1976), **3**
- Patel v. Midland Memorial Hosp. and Medical Center**, 298 F.3d 333 (5th Cir.2002), 657
- Patten v. Commonwealth**, 262 Va. 654, 553 S.E.2d 517 (Va.2001), **300**
- Payton v. Weaver**, 131 Cal.App.3d 38, 182 Cal.Rptr. 225 (Cal.App. 1 Dist.1982), **31**
- Pegram v. Herdrich**, 530 U.S. 211, 120 S.Ct. 2143, 147 L.Ed.2d 164 (2000), 142
- Pennsylvania Cas. Co. v. Chris Simopoulos, M.D., Ltd.**, 235 Va. 460, 369 S.E.2d 166 (Va.1988), 536
- People v. _____ (see opposing party)**
- Peterson v. Gray**, 137 N.H. 374, 628 A.2d 244 (N.H.1993), **251**
- Petrosky v. Brasner**, 279 A.D.2d 75, 718 N.Y.S.2d 340 (N.Y.A.D. 1 Dept.2001), 30
- Petzelt v. Tewes**, 260 Ga.App. 802, 581 S.E.2d 345 (Ga.App.2003), **511**
- Phillips v. Covenant Clinic**, 625 N.W.2d 714 (Iowa 2001), **199**

- Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey**, 505 U.S. 833, 112 S.Ct. 2791, 120 L.Ed.2d 674 (1992), **836**
- Primus v. Galgano**, 329 F.3d 236 (1st Cir.2003), **605**
- Printz v. United States**, 521 U.S. 898, 117 S.Ct. 2365, 138 L.Ed.2d 914 (1997), **1008**
- Prosis v. Foster**, 261 Va. 417, 544 S.E.2d 331 (Va.2001), **6**
- Pryzbowski v. United States Healthcare, Inc., 245 F.3d 266 (3rd Cir.2001), 178
- Public Health Trust of Dade County v. Wons**, 541 So.2d 96 (Fla.1989), **392**
- Quijano v. United States**, 325 F.3d 564 (5th Cir.2003), **197**
- Raiteri ex rel Cox v. NHC Healthcare/Knoxville, Inc.**, 2003 WL 23094413 (Tenn.Ct.App.2003), **592**
- Reed v. Bojarski**, 166 N.J. 89, 764 A.2d 433 (N.J.2001), **20**
- Reynolds v. McNichols**, 488 F.2d 1378 (10th Cir.1973), **988**
- Richardson v. Richardson-Merrell, Inc., 649 F.Supp. 799 (D.D.C.1986), 478
- Richardson v. Wesley Health Center**, 807 So.2d 1244 (Miss.2002), **204**
- Richardson-Merrell, Inc. Bendectin Products Liability Litigation, In re, 624 F.Supp. 1212 (S.D. Ohio 1985), 478
- Roberts v. Williamson**, 111 S.W.3d 113 (Tex.2003), **494**
- Robinson v. Health Midwest Development Group, 58 S.W.3d 519 (Mo.2001), 704
- Roe v. Wade**, 410 U.S. 113, 93 S.Ct. 705, 35 L.Ed.2d 147 (1973), **830**
- Runyon v. Smith**, 163 N.J. 439, 749 A.2d 852 (N.J.2000), **439**
- Rush Prudential HMO, Inc. v. Moran**, 536 U.S. 355, 122 S.Ct. 2151, 153 L.Ed.2d 375 (2002), **144**
- Sachs v. Innovative Healthcare, Inc.**, 799 So.2d 355 (Fla.App. 3 Dist.2001), **446**
- Safian v. Aetna Life Ins. Co., 260 A.D. 765, 24 N.Y.S.2d 92 (N.Y.A.D. 1 Dept.1940), 537
- Sahlolbei v. Providence Healthcare, Inc., 5 Cal.Rptr.3d 598 (Cal.App. 4 Dist.2003), 657
- Saint Agnes Medical Center v. PacificCare of California, 8 Cal.Rptr.3d 517, 82 P.3d 727 (Cal.2003), 601
- Sanders, State ex rel. Charles Town General Hosp. v., 210 W.Va. 118, 556 S.E.2d 85 (W.Va.2001), 658
- San Diego, City of v. Rider, 55 Cal.Rptr.2d 422 (Cal.App. 4 Dist.1996), 558
- Sarjoo v. New York City Health and Hospitals Corp., 309 A.D.2d 34, 763 N.Y.S.2d 306 (N.Y.A.D. 1 Dept.2003), 344
- Seminole Tribe of Florida v. Florida, 517 U.S. 44, 116 S.Ct. 1114, 134 L.Ed.2d 252 (1996), 318
- Senn v. Merrell-Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc., 305 Or. 256, 751 P.2d 215 (Or.1988), 478
- Sheriff, Washoe County, Nev. v. Encoe, 110 Nev. 1317, 885 P.2d 596 (Nev.1994), 896
- Simcusi v. Saeli**, 406 N.Y.S.2d 259, 377 N.E.2d 713 (N.Y.1978), **500**
- Simmons v. Tuomey Regional Medical Center**, 341 S.C. 32, 533 S.E.2d 312 (S.C.2000), **124**
- Sinoff v. Ohio Permanente Med. Group, Inc., 146 Ohio App.3d 732, 767 N.E.2d 1251 (Ohio App. 8 Dist.2002), 658
- Skinner v. Railway Labor Executives' Ass'n**, 489 U.S. 602, 109 S.Ct. 1402, 103 L.Ed.2d 639 (1989), **690**
- Smith, Commonwealth v.**, 58 Mass.App. Ct. 381, 790 N.E.2d 708 (Mass.App.Ct. 2003), **819**
- Smith v. Merritt**, 940 S.W.2d 602 (Tex. 1997), **698**
- South Carolina Medical Ass'n v. Thompson**, 327 F.3d 346 (4th Cir. 2003), **425**
- South Dakota v. Dole**, 483 U.S. 203, 107 S.Ct. 2793, 97 L.Ed.2d 171 (1987), **679**
- State v. _____ (see opposing party)**
- State ex rel. v. _____ (see opposing party and relator)**
- St. Germain v. Pfeifer**, 418 Mass. 511, 637 N.E.2d 848 (Mass.1994), **570**
- St. Joseph Hosp. v. Wolff, 94 S.W.3d 513 (Tex.2002), 142
- St. Mary's Hospital, Inc. v. Phillipe**, 769 So.2d 961 (Fla.2000), **610**
- St. Paul Fire and Marine Ins. Co. v. House, 315 Md. 328, 554 A.2d 404 (Md.1989), 562
- St. Paul Fire & Marine Ins. Co. v. Insurance Commissioner, 275 Md. 130, 339 A.2d 291 (Md.1975), 536
- Strachan v. John F. Kennedy Memorial Hosp.**, 109 N.J. 523, 538 A.2d 346 (N.J.1988), **527**
- Strunk v. Strunk**, 445 S.W.2d 145 (Ky. 1969), **381**
- Suesbury v. Caceres**, 840 A.2d 1285 (D.C. 2004), **520**
- Sullivan v. Commonwealth, Ins. Dept., 48 Pa.Cmwlth. 11, 408 A.2d 1174 (Pa. Cmwlth.1979), 536
- Sullivan v. O'Connor**, 363 Mass. 579, 296 N.E.2d 183 (Mass.1973), **480**
- Tarasoff v. Regents of University of California**, 131 Cal.Rptr. 14, 551 P.2d 334 (Cal.1976), **91**
- Tarpley, Ex parte, 293 Ala. 137, 300 So.2d 409 (Ala.1974), 567
- Tate ex rel. Estate of Hall v. Detroit Receiving Hosp.**, 249 Mich.App. 212, 642 N.W.2d 346 (Mich.App.2002), **214**

- Taylor v. Smithkline Beecham Corp.**, 468 Mich. 1, 658 N.W.2d 127 (Mich. 2003), **464**
- Telang v. Commonwealth Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs**, 561 Pa. 535, 751 A.2d 1147 (Pa. 2000), **1041**
- Thompson v. Sun City Community Hosp., Inc.**, 141 Ariz. 597, 688 P.2d 605 (Ariz.1984), **37**
- Tischler v. Dimenna**, 160 Misc.2d 525, 609 N.Y.S.2d 1002 (N.Y.Sup.1994), **821**
- Truman v. Thomas**, 165 Cal.Rptr. 308, 611 P.2d 902 (Cal.1980), **386**
- Tunkl v. Regents of University of California**, 60 Cal.2d 92, 32 Cal.Rptr. 33, 383 P.2d 441 (Cal.1963), 579
- United Auto Workers v. Johnson Controls, Inc.**, 499 U.S. 187, 111 S.Ct. 1196, 113 L.Ed.2d 158 (1991), **992**
- United States v. ———** (see opposing party)
- University Health Services, Inc. v. Long**, 274 Ga. 829, 561 S.E.2d 77 (Ga. 2002), **639**
- Upland Anesthesia Medical Group v. Doctors' Co.**, 123 Cal.Rptr.2d 94 (Cal. App. 4 Dist.2002), **557**
- Vacco v. Quill**, 521 U.S. 793, 117 S.Ct. 2293, 138 L.Ed.2d 834 (1997), 940
- Vassiliades v. Garfinckel's, Brooks Bros.**, 492 A.2d 580 (D.C.1985), **74**
- Velazquez ex rel. Velazquez v. Jiminez**, 172 N.J. 240, 798 A.2d 51 (N.J.2002), **338**
- Velazquez ex rel. Velazquez v. Portadin**, 163 N.J. 677, 751 A.2d 102 (N.J. 2000), **44**
- Verdicchio v. Ricca**, 179 N.J. 1, 843 A.2d 1042 (N.J.2004), 268
- Villazon v. Prudential Health Care Plan, Inc.**, 843 So.2d 842 (Fla.2003), **170**
- Waddell v. Valley Forge Dental Associates, Inc.**, 276 F.3d 1275 (11th Cir. 2001), **813**
- Waller v. Truck Ins. Exchange, Inc.**, 44 Cal.Rptr.2d 370, 900 P.2d 619 (Cal. 1995), 559
- Walls v. Shreck**, 265 Neb. 683, 658 N.W.2d 686 (Neb.2003), **359**
- Washington v. Glucksberg**, 521 U.S. 702, 117 S.Ct. 2258, 138 L.Ed.2d 772 (1997), **916**
- Wentling v. Medical Anesthesia Services, P.A.**, 237 Kan. 503, 701 P.2d 939 (Kan. 1985), 620
- Whalen v. Roe**, 429 U.S. 589, 97 S.Ct. 869, 51 L.Ed.2d 64 (1977), **734**
- Wheeler v. St. Joseph Hospital**, 63 Cal. App.3d 345, 133 Cal.Rptr. 775 (Cal.App. 4 Dist.1976), 581
- Wickline v. State of California**, 192 Cal. App.3d 1630, 239 Cal.Rptr. 810 (Cal. App. 2 Dist.1986), **628**
- Williams v. Hofmann**, 66 Wis.2d 145, 223 N.W.2d 844 (Wis.1974), 532
- Willis v. Mullett**, 263 Va. 653, 561 S.E.2d 705 (Va.2002), **334**
- Wilson v. Blue Cross of So. California**, 222 Cal.App.3d 660, 271 Cal.Rptr. 876 (Cal. App. 2 Dist.1990), 638
- Wisconsin v. Kruzicki**, 209 Wis.2d 112, 561 N.W.2d 729 (Wis.1997), **860**
- Wons v. Public Health Trust of Dade County**, 500 So.2d 679 (Fla.App. 3 Dist.1987), 393
- Wright v. Central Du Page Hospital Ass'n**, 63 Ill.2d 313, 347 N.E.2d 736 (Ill.1976), 563
- Yale Diagnostic Radiology v. Fountain**, 267 Conn. 351, 838 A.2d 179 (Conn. 2004), **489**
- Ybarra v. Spangard**, 25 Cal.2d 486, 154 P.2d 687 (Cal.1944), 107
- Zieber v. Bogert**, 565 Pa. 376, 773 A.2d 758 (Pa.2001), **283**

LIABILITY IN MEDICINE AND PUBLIC HEALTH

*

Summary of Contents

	Page
PREFACE	iii
INTRODUCTION	v
TABLE OF CASES	xvii
 PART I. LIABILITY IN MEDICINE	
Chapter 1. The Medical Professional Relationship	2
A. Commencement of the Professional Relationship	3
B. Emergency Circumstances	9
C. Professional Services That Harm Non-Patients	20
D. Terminating the Professional Relationship	31
Chapter 2. Negligence of the Health Care Provider	43
A. Defining Medical Due Care	44
B. Intentional Acts	68
C. Third Parties and Medical Negligence	86
Chapter 3. Claims Against Multiple Medical Defendants	106
A. Physician Liability Under <i>Respondeat Superior</i>	108
B. Medical Liability of Institutions	121
C. Liability of Managed Care Organizations	142
Chapter 4. Evidence of Medical Negligence	188
A. Medical Evidence	189
B. Expert Medical Testimony	204
C. Proof of Medical Negligence Without Experts	218
D. Medical Evidence and the Jury	235
Chapter 5. Causation, Harms and Damages	242
A. Causation of Harm by Medical Negligence	244
B. Harms	259
C. Damage Dollar Amounts	269
Chapter 6. Defending the Medical Negligence Case	299
A. Immunities	300
B. Affirmative Defenses	319
C. Countersuits	345
Chapter 7. Treatment Consent, Information and Refusal	356
A. Treatment Without Consent	358
B. Refused Services	386

	Page
C. Consent to Research	409
D. Patient Privacy	424
Chapter 8. Product-Related Medical Liability	451
Chapter 9. Non-Medical Acts	479
A. Promises and Damages	480
B. Misrepresentations	500
C. Tortious Conduct	516
D. Insurance Disputes	533
Chapter 10. Changing the Litigation System	563
A. Forestalling Claims	569
B. Litigation Alternatives and Hurdles	581
C. Damage Caps	601
Chapter 11. Access to High-Quality Health Services	623
A. Utilization Review	625
B. Peer Review and Staff Privileges	639
C. Licensure and Professionalism	659
PART II. PUBLIC HEALTH	
Chapter 12. Legal and Illegal Substances	678
A. Alcoholic Beverages	679
B. Tobacco and Tobacco Products	704
C. Legal and Illegal Drugs	734
Chapter 13. Infectious Disease: Prevention and Detention	761
A. Vaccinations	762
B. Quarantine	775
C. HIV and AIDS	786
Chapter 14. Privacy, Police Power and Protection	829
A. Family Planning	830
B. End of Life	898
C. Domestic and Sexual Violence	941
D. High Risk Activities	985
Chapter 15. Public Health and Safety	1000
A. Firearms	1001
B. Safety Devices	1016
C. Patient Care	1032
INDEX	1053

Table of Contents

	Page
PREFACE	iii
INTRODUCTION	v
TABLE OF CASES	xvii

PART I. LIABILITY IN MEDICINE

Chapter 1. The Medical Professional Relationship	2
Introductory Note	2
A. Commencement of the Professional Relationship	3
<i>Oliver v. Brock</i>	3
<i>Prosise v. Foster</i>	6
Notes	9
B. Emergency Circumstances	9
<i>Bryant v. Adventist-Redbud Hospital, Inc.</i>	9
<i>Arrington v. Wong</i>	14
<i>Harry v. Marchant</i>	16
Notes	19
C. Professional Services That Harm Non-Patients	20
<i>Bradshaw v. Daniel</i>	20
<i>Reed v. Bojarski</i>	20
<i>Nold v. Binyon</i>	25
Notes	30
D. Terminating the Professional Relationship	31
<i>Payton v. Weaver</i>	31
<i>Thompson v. Sun City Community Hospital</i>	37
Notes	42
Chapter 2. Negligence of the Health Care Provider	43
Introductory Note	43
A. Defining Medical Due Care	44
<i>Velazquez v. Portadin</i>	44
<i>Advincula v. United Blood Services</i>	47
<i>Helling v. Carey</i>	53
Note on the Aftermath of <i>Helling v. Carey</i>	56
<i>Gracey v. Eaker</i>	58
<i>Bader v. Johnson</i>	62
Notes	67
B. Intentional Acts	68
<i>Benavidez v. United States of America</i>	68
<i>Marcus v. Liebman</i>	72
<i>Vassiliades v. Garfinckel's</i>	74